UNITED STATES
INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:	)	Investigation No.
CERTAIN OUTDOOR AND SEMI-OUTDOOR	)	337-TA-1331
ELECTRONIC DISPLAYS, PRODUCTS	)	
CONTAINING SAME, AND COMPONENTS	)	
THEREOF	)	

OPEN/CLOSED SESSIONS

Pages: 553 through 837

Place: Washington, D.C.

Date: June 28, 2023

HERITAGE REPORTING CORPORATION
Official Reporters
1220 L Street, N.W., Suite 206
Washington, D.C. 20005
(202) 628-4888
contracts@hrccourtreporters.com

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.001
IPR2023-00220

1 UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
2 Washington, D.C.
3 BEFORE THE HONORABLE MONICA BHATTACHARYYA
4 Administrative Law Judge
5 _____
6 In the Matter of:) Investigation No.
7 CERTAIN OUTDOOR AND SEMI-OUTDOOR) 337-TA-1331
8 ELECTRONIC DISPLAYS, PRODUCTS)
9 CONTAINING SAME, AND COMPONENTS)
10 THEREOF)
11 _____
12
13 International Trade Commission
14 500 E Street, S.W.
15 Washington, D.C.
16
17 Wednesday, June 28, 2023
18
19 EVIDENTIARY HEARING, VOLUME III
20
21 The Hearing commenced in Courtroom A, pursuant to the
22 notice of the Judge, at 9:30 a.m. Eastern.
23
24
25 Reported by: Karen Brynteson, FAPR, RMR, CRR

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.002
IPR2023-00220

1 APPEARANCES:

2

3 For Complainant Manufacturing Resources International,

4 Inc.:

5 AARTI SHAH, ESQ.

6 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton LLP

7 1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3700

8 Washington, D.C. 20005

9 202-508-5800

10

11 DARIO A. MACHLEIDT, ESQ.

12 KATHLEEN R. GEYER, ESQ.

13 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton LLP

14 1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3700

15 Seattle, WA 98101

16

17 RUSSELL A. KORN, ESQ.

18 DAVID A. REED, ESQ.

19 MITCHELL G. STOCKWELL, ESQ.

20 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton LLP

21 1100 Peachtree Street NE, Suite 2800

22 Atlanta, GA 30309

23

24

25

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.003
IPR2023-00220

1 APPEARANCES: (CONTINUED)

2

3 For Complainant (Continued):

4 CRAIG D. CANNON, ESQ.

5 ALTON L. ABSHER, III, ESQ.

6 ANDREA A. ANDERSON, ESQ.

7 JONATHAN E. HARRIS, ESQ.

8 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton LLP

9 1001 West Fourth Street

10 Winston-Salem, NC 27101

11

12 MATTHEW J. MEYER, ESQ.

13 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton LLP

14 1080 Marsh Road

15 Menlo Park, CA 94025

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.004
IPR2023-00220

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):

2 For Respondents Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd., Samsung
3 Electronics America, Inc., Samsung SDS Co. Ltd., and
4 Samsung SDS America, Inc.; Coates Signco Pty Limited and
5 Coates US Inc.; and Industrial Enclosures Corporation d/b/a
6 Palmer Digital Group:

7 PATRICK J. MCCARTHY, ESQ.
8 ANNAKA NAVA, ESQ.
9 JACQUELINE GENOVESE BOVA, ESQ.
10 JEREMY JONES, ESQ.
11 Goodwin Procter LLP
12 1900 N Street, N.W.
13 Washington, D.C. 20036
14
15 DARRYL M. WOO, ESQ.
16 Goodwin Procter LLP
17 Three Embarcadero Center
18 San Francisco, CA 94111
19
20 JESSE CHENG, ESQ.
21 ELIZABETH J. LOW, ESQ.
22 YOONA LEE, ESQ.
23 Goodwin Procter LLP
24 601 Marshall Street
25 Redwood City, CA 94063

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.005
IPR2023-00220

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):
2 For Respondents (continued):
3 DOUGLAS J. KLINE, ESQ.
4 SRIKANTH K. REDDY, ESQ.
5 CHRISTIE L. LAROCHELLE, ESQ.
6 HARRISON GUNN, ESQ.
7 KARA GROGAN, ESQ.
8 Goodwin Procter LLP
9 100 Northern Avenue
10 Boston, MA 02210
11
12 NAOMI L. BIRBACH, ESQ.
13 CHRISTINE POTKAY, ESQ.
14 CHRISTINA DENISE GO, ESQ.
15 Goodwin Procter LLP
16 The New York Times Building
17 620 Eighth Avenue
18 New York, New York 10018
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.006
IPR2023-00220

1 ATTORNEY ADVISOR:

2 ALTON HARE, ESQ.

3 Attorney-Advisor

4 U.S. International Trade Commission

5 500 E Street, S.W.

6 Washington, D.C. 20436

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.007
IPR2023-00220

1 A. [redacted]
2 Q. Does Samsung have any other large format OH
3 products [redacted]
4 [redacted]
5 A. [redacted]
6 Q. Mr. Smith, can we pull up CX-1786.
7 Mr. Lee, what is this document?
8 A. This is a material that has to do with review of
9 [redacted]
10 Q. [redacted]
11 A. [redacted]
12 Q. Is it normal, Mr. Lee, for Samsung to review
13 outdoor displays of other companies?
14 A. Yes, it's -- it takes place often. It's a
15 common practice.
16 Q. Is it common practice in the industry, Mr. Lee?
17 A. It is.
18 Q. What's the purpose of reviewing other companies'
19 products?
20 A. It is to understand what there is to learn by
21 reviewing these competitors' products, and also to identify
22 what we are better at.
23 Q. Is the date on page 1 of CX-1786 accurate,
24 Mr. Lee?
25 A. It is not.

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.008
IPR2023-00220

1 Q. How do you know that?
2 A. There is a label that is attached to the product
3 which would show the production date. And the date is --
4 comes later than the date that is indicated on this page.
5 That's how.
6 Q. Mr. Smith, can we turn to page 34. And zoom in
7 on the label on the top.
8 Mr. Lee, what was the manufacturing date of the
9 product that your team reviewed?
10 A. It is October 2016.
11 Q. Mr. Lee, by the end of 2016, was Samsung's large
12 format OH cooling scheme fully designed?
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. Can we turn to page 31, Mr. Smith.
15 Mr. Lee, what does this table tell you with
16 respect to the status of Samsung's large format OH cooling
17 design at the time this document was made?
18 JUDGE BHATTACHARYYA: Mr. Reed, do you have an
19 objection?
20 MR. REED: Yes, Your Honor. Yes. We'd just
21 like to see an English translation.
22 JUDGE BHATTACHARYYA: Mr. McCarthy?
23 Mr. McCarthy and Mr. Reed, it's actually time
24 for our morning break. Would it be all right to take that
25 now and then reask the question after we find a

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.009
IPR2023-00220

1 translation?
2 MR. McCARTHY: That would be great, Your Honor.
3 JUDGE BHATTACHARYYA: Thank you.
4 We're in recess for 15 minutes.
5 (A recess was taken at 11:05 a.m., after which
6 the proceedings resumed at 11:23 a.m.)
7 JUDGE BHATTACHARYYA: Please be seated.
8 We're still on the Samsung confidential record?
9 MR. McCARTHY: That's right, Your Honor. And I
10 can confirm that we are good on the Respondents' side.
11 MR. REED: Same from MRI's side, Your Honor.
12 JUDGE BHATTACHARYYA: Great. Thank you.
13 BY MR. McCARTHY:
14 Q. All right. Mr. Lee -- and Mr. Smith, can you
15 put up page 31 of CX-1786, which is the Korean version of
16 the document, and then an English translation, which is
17 found at page 65.
18 Mr. Lee, what does this table tell you about the
19 status of the large format OH cooling design at the time
20 this document was made?
21 A. In the document there is [redacted]
22 this large format display product, and there's also
23 [redacted], a lot of them, so I
24 can understand -- I understand this product has been
25 completed.

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.010
IPR2023-00220

Q. Can we turn, Mr. Smith, to CX-1787. Zoom in on the pictures, please, Mr. Smith.

Mr. Lee, what product is shown with its back removed here?

A. It's the [redacted].

Q. Which [redacted]?

A. [redacted]

Q. Mr. Lee, were you present when these pictures were taken?

A. Yes.

Q. Do you know the status of the large format OH cooling design at the time of these pictures?

A. They were already completed.

Q. Is there any part of this picture which confirms your understanding?

A. If you look at the back side on the right, there is our large format display product. It is pictured here as well. That's why.

Q. Mr. Smith, can we go to RX-1280.

Mr. Lee, what is shown here?

A. From the back side of the OH75 product, the cover rear is removed in the picture.

Q. Can you see the [redacted] in this picture?

A. Yes. [redacted]

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.011
IPR2023-00220

1 CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

2 TITLE: Certain Outdoor and Semi-Outdoor Electronic

3 Displays

4 INVESTIGATION NO: 337-TA-1331

5 HEARING DATE: June 28, 2023

6 LOCATION: Courtroom A

7 NATURE OF HEARING: Evidentiary Hearing

8 I hereby certify that the foregoing/attached transcript is a true, correct and complete record of the
9 above-referenced proceedings of the U.S. International Trade Commission.
10 Date: June 28, 2023

11 SIGNED: _____

12 Signature of the Contractor of the Authorized Contractor's Representative
13 1220 L Street, N.W., Suite 206
Washington, D.C. 20005

14

I hereby certify that I am not the Court
15 Reporter and that I have proofread the above-referenced transcript of the proceedings of the U.S. International
16 Trade Commission, against the aforementioned Court Reporter's notes and recordings, for accuracy in
17 transcription in the spelling, hyphenation, punctuation and speaker identification and did not make any changes of a
18 substantive nature. The foregoing/attached transcript is a true, correct and complete transcription of the
19 proceedings.

20 SIGNED: _____
Signature of Proofreader

21

I hereby certify that I reported the
22 above-referenced proceedings of the U.S. International Trade Commission and caused to be prepared from my tapes
23 and notes of the proceedings a true, correct and complete verbatim recording of the proceedings.

24

SIGNED: _____
25 Signature of the Court Reporter

SEC et al. v. MRI
SEC Exhibit 1051.012
IPR2023-00220