

UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C.

In the Matter of:)
)
CERTAIN OUTDOOR AND) Inv. No. 337-TA-1331
SEMI-OUTDOOR ELECTRONIC)
DISPLAYS, PRODUCTS CONTAINING)
SAME, AND COMPONENTS THEREOF)
_____)

*** [REDACTED] ***

VIDEO-RECORDED DEPOSITION OF
ROBERT SMITH-GILLESPIE

Goodwin Procter
680 Eighth Avenue
New York, New York
April 26, 2023
9:39 a.m. (EDT)

REPORTED BY: MONIQUE CABRERA

DIGITAL EVIDENCE GROUP
1730 M Street, NW, Suite 812
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 232-0646

1 04/26/2023

2 9:39 a.m. (EDT)

3

4

5 VIDEO-RECORDED DEPOSITION OF ROBERT

6 SMITH-GILLESPIE, held at the offices of Goodwin

7 Procter, 680 Eighth Avenue, New York, New York,

8 before Monique Cabrera, Shorthand Reporter, and

9 Notary Public of the State of New York.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1 A P P E A R A N C E S
ON BEHALF OF SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
2 SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., SAMSUNG SDS
CO., LTD., AND SAMSUNG SDS AMERICAN, INC.:

3 Douglas J. Kline, Esquire
Goodwin Procter, LLP
4 100 Northern Avenue
Boston, MA 02210
5 PHONE: +1.617.570.1209
E-MAIL: Dkline@goodwinlaw.com

6 -AND-
Christine Potkay, Esquire
7 Goodwin Procter LLP
620 Eighth Avenue
8 New York, New York
PHONE: +1 617 570 1209
9 E-MAIL: Cpotkay@goodwinlaw.com

10 ON BEHALF OF MANUFACTURING RESOURCES
INTERNATIONAL, INC.:

11 Matthew J. Meyer, Esquire
Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton
12 1080 Marsh Road
Menlo Park, CA USA 94025
13 PHONE: 650.614.6414
E-MAIL: Mmeyer@kilpatricktownsend.com

14 -AND-
Andie Anderson, Esquire
15 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton
1001 West Fourth Street
16 Winston Salem, North Carolina 27101
17 PHONE: 1.336.979.9835
18 E-MAIL: Andie.anderson@kilpatricktownsend.com

19
20 ALSO PRESENT:
21 Daniel Ortega, Legal Videographer - Digital
22 Evidence Group

1 I N D E X

2	WITNESS	EXAMINATION BY	PAGE
---	---------	----------------	------

3	ROBERT	MR. MEYER	7
---	--------	-----------	---

4	SMITH-GILLESPIE		
---	-----------------	--	--

5			
---	--	--	--

6 E X H I B I T S

7	EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
---	---------	-------------	------

8	Exhibit 1	Smith-Gillespie Report.....	12
---	-----------	-----------------------------	----

9	Exhibit 2	Document.....	34
---	-----------	---------------	----

10	Exhibit 3	Printout of Noren Website.....	36
----	-----------	--------------------------------	----

11	Exhibit 4	US Patent No. 5,748,269.....	38
----	-----------	------------------------------	----

12	Exhibit 5	US Patent No. 6,798,655.....	47
----	-----------	------------------------------	----

13	Exhibit 6	Kitamura Patent Publication H8-54934.....	56
----	-----------	---	----

14	Exhibit 7	Karppanen Patent Application PCT	
----	-----------	----------------------------------	--

15		FI/2006/050145.....	64
----	--	---------------------	----

16	Exhibit 8	'142 Patent.....	69
----	-----------	------------------	----

17	Exhibit 9	US Provisional Patent Application	
----	-----------	-----------------------------------	--

18		61/033064.....	72
----	--	----------------	----

19	Exhibit 10	Kimura Reference.....	77
----	------------	-----------------------	----

20	Exhibit 11	US Patent No. 9,173,322.....	101
----	------------	------------------------------	-----

21	Exhibit 12	Kim Reference.....	108
----	------------	--------------------	-----

22	Exhibit 13	US Patent No. 8,854,595.....	116
----	------------	------------------------------	-----

Page 5

1 E X H I B I T S, CON'T

2	EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
3	Exhibit 14	Hong Reference.....	121
4	Exhibit 15	Wellhofer.....	126
5	Exhibit 16	Yare Reference.....	133
6	Exhibit 17	Document Bates No. Gavel 000503.....	141

7

8 R E Q U E S T S

9	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
10	Read and Sign.....	145
11	[REDACTED]	
12	[REDACTED]	145

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are now on the
2 record. My name is Daniel Ortega and I am
3 the legal videographer for Digital Evidence
4 Group. Today's date is April 26, 2023 and
5 the time is 9:39 a.m.

6 This video deposition is being held
7 at 620 Eighth Avenue, New York, New York in
8 the matter of Certain Outdoor and
9 Semi-Outdoor Electronics Displays, et al.

10 The deponent today is Robert
11 Smith-Gillespie.

12 Counsel, please identify yourselves
13 for the record.

14 MR. MEYER: This is Matthew Meyer
15 for the law firm of Kilpatrick, Townsend here
16 on behalf of complainants, MRI, and with me
17 is my colleague Andie Anderson, also of
18 Kilpatrick, Townsend.

19 MR. KLINE: Doug Kline of Goodwin
20 for the respondent and for the witness. And
21 with me is my colleague, Christine Potkay.

22 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The court

1 reporter today is Monique Cabrera who will
2 now swear in the witness.

3 ROBERT SMITH-GILLESPIE, called as a witness,
4 having been first duly sworn by a Notary Public
5 of the State of New York, was examined and
6 testified as follows:

7 COURT REPORTER: Can you state your
8 name and address for the record.

9 THE WITNESS: Robert
10 Smith-Gillespie; address is 2790 Timberline
11 Drive, Eugene, Oregon 97405.

12 EXAMINATION

13 BY MR. MEYER:

14 Q. Mr. Smith-Gillespie, do you
15 understand that you are here testifying under
16 oath the same as if you were in court today?

17 A. I do.

18 Q. And is there any reason you're
19 unable to give complete, honest, and truthful
20 testimony today?

21 A. There is not.

22 Q. And you have had your deposition

1 in your report?

2 I can point you to paragraph 76
3 through 83.

4 A. Okay. Yes, that's where -- that is
5 the section I was looking for for support
6 relative to the system that is shown in Figure 9
7 of the '595 and '322 patents.

8 Q. What about the Samsung
9 LTI700HD01-001? Where are those opinions
10 disclosed?

11 A. Okay. Like I said, so with respect
12 to the previous display, it's the Vertigo and
13 Inova and is also discussed at paragraph 275 and
14 then with respect to the Samsung display,
15 paragraph 270, 271 and 272.

16 Q. Does the Samsung LTI700HD01-001
17 display disclose anything that is not disclosed
18 by the prior art of record during prosecution of
19 the '595 and '322 patents?

20 A. I believe it discloses a set of
21 brackets and the bars that they are mounted on at
22 the back of the display.

1 Q. And where -- I am sorry.

2 Was it conventional at the time of
3 the invention to include a set of brackets on the
4 back of a display?

5 A. I can't say that it was
6 conventional, no. I have never seen brackets
7 placed on the back of displays like this during
8 that time frame or before that time frame.

9 Q. You hadn't seen brackets on the back
10 of electronic displays before the time of
11 invention?

12 A. No, not like these.

13 Q. What about these are different?

14 A. There are a set of adapter bars that
15 are normally not included in a flat panel
16 display, which -- or an LCD display in
17 particular.

18 (Reporter clarification.)

19 A. A flat panel display or an LCD
20 display in particular. Generally, mounting
21 points would be provided on flanges along the
22 edges, not along the back.

1 BY MR. MEYER:

2 Q. And for MRI APC car wash, does MRI
3 APC car wash disclose something that no prior art
4 of record for the '595 or '322 patents disclosed?

5 A. I can't answer that question with
6 the information I have at hand or have looked at.

7 Q. What about the MRI APC pump top
8 display? Does that display disclose something
9 that no prior art of record for the asserted
10 patents disclosed?

11 A. Again, the same -- same thing.
12 These are integrated products that are made for
13 specific applications, so I was unaware of -- of
14 any prior art product that had features shown in
15 these.

16 Q. Which features are you referring to?

17 A. Things like the -- the deflectors,
18 the large heat sinks.

19 (Reporter clarification.)

20 A. Deflectors and the divider plates in
21 the pump top.

22 BY MR. MEYER:

1 CERTIFICATE OF SHORTHAND REPORTER-NOTARY PUBLIC

2 I, Monique Cabrera, the officer
3 before whom the foregoing deposition was
4 taken, do hereby certify that the foregoing
5 transcript is a true and correct record of
6 the testimony given; that said testimony was
7 taken by me stenographically and thereafter
8 reduced to typewriting under my direction;
9 and that I am neither counsel for, related
10 to, nor employed by any of the parties to
this case and have no interest, financial or
otherwise, in its outcome.

11 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
12 set my hand this 26th day of April, 2023.

13

14

15

16

17

18 _____
MONIQUE CABRERA

19 Notary Public in and for the State of New York

20 County of Suffolk

21 My Commission No. 01CA6043156

22 Expires: 06/12/2026