

UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C.

In the Matter of:)
)
CERTAIN OUTDOOR AND) Inv. No. 337-TA-1331
SEMI-OUTDOOR ELECTRONIC)
DISPLAYS, PRODUCTS CONTAINING)
SAME, AND COMPONENTS THEREOF)
_____)

*** [REDACTED] ***

VIDEO-RECORDED DEPOSITION OF
ROBERT SMITH-GILLESPIE

Goodwin Procter
680 Eighth Avenue
New York, New York
April 26, 2023
9:39 a.m. (EDT)

REPORTED BY: MONIQUE CABRERA

DIGITAL EVIDENCE GROUP
1730 M Street, NW, Suite 812
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 232-0646

1 04/26/2023

2 9:39 a.m. (EDT)

3

4

5 VIDEO-RECORDED DEPOSITION OF ROBERT

6 SMITH-GILLESPIE, held at the offices of Goodwin

7 Procter, 680 Eighth Avenue, New York, New York,

8 before Monique Cabrera, Shorthand Reporter, and

9 Notary Public of the State of New York.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1 A P P E A R A N C E S
ON BEHALF OF SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
2 SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., SAMSUNG SDS
CO., LTD., AND SAMSUNG SDS AMERICAN, INC.:

3 Douglas J. Kline, Esquire
Goodwin Procter, LLP
4 100 Northern Avenue
Boston, MA 02210
5 PHONE: +1.617.570.1209
E-MAIL: Dkline@goodwinlaw.com

6 -AND-
Christine Potkay, Esquire
7 Goodwin Procter LLP
620 Eighth Avenue
8 New York, New York
PHONE: +1 617 570 1209
9 E-MAIL: Cpotkay@goodwinlaw.com

10 ON BEHALF OF MANUFACTURING RESOURCES
INTERNATIONAL, INC.:

11 Matthew J. Meyer, Esquire
Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton
12 1080 Marsh Road
Menlo Park, CA USA 94025
13 PHONE: 650.614.6414
E-MAIL: Mmeyer@kilpatricktownsend.com

14 -AND-
Andie Anderson, Esquire
15 Kilpatrick Townsend & Stockton
1001 West Fourth Street
16 Winston Salem, North Carolina 27101
17 PHONE: 1.336.979.9835
18 E-MAIL: Andie.anderson@kilpatricktownsend.com

19
20 ALSO PRESENT:
21 Daniel Ortega, Legal Videographer - Digital
22 Evidence Group

1 I N D E X

2 WITNESS EXAMINATION BY PAGE

3 ROBERT MR. MEYER 7

4 SMITH-GILLESPIE

5

6 E X H I B I T S

7 EXHIBIT DESCRIPTION PAGE

8 Exhibit 1 Smith-Gillespie Report..... 12

9 Exhibit 2 Document..... 34

10 Exhibit 3 Printout of Noren Website..... 36

11 Exhibit 4 US Patent No. 5,748,269..... 38

12 Exhibit 5 US Patent No. 6,798,655..... 47

13 Exhibit 6 Kitamura Patent Publication H8-54934..... 56

14 Exhibit 7 Karppanen Patent Application PCT

15 FI/2006/050145..... 64

16 Exhibit 8 '142 Patent..... 69

17 Exhibit 9 US Provisional Patent Application

18 61/033064..... 72

19 Exhibit 10 Kimura Reference..... 77

20 Exhibit 11 US Patent No. 9,173,322..... 101

21 Exhibit 12 Kim Reference..... 108

22 Exhibit 13 US Patent No. 8,854,595..... 116

Page 5

1 E X H I B I T S, CON'T

2	EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
3	Exhibit 14	Hong Reference.....	121
4	Exhibit 15	Wellhofer.....	126
5	Exhibit 16	Yare Reference.....	133
6	Exhibit 17	Document Bates No. Gavel 000503.....	141

7

8 R E Q U E S T S

9	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
10	Read and Sign.....	145
11	[REDACTED]	
12	[REDACTED]	145

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1 Q. I would like to introduce another
2 exhibit that will be Exhibit 2.

3 (Whereupon, Exhibit 2, Document, was
4 marked for identification.)

5 BY MR. MEYER:

6 Q. In paragraph 1,365 of your report,
7 you cite this document. So let's turn -- it's on
8 page 512.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. So you cite this document in
11 Exhibit 2 at paragraph 1,365 of your report as
12 showing a heat exchanger; right?

13 A. Yes, there are other paragraphs as
14 well. Okay.

15 Q. What kind of heat exchanger is this
16 device?

17 A. I believe this is a counterflow or
18 cross-flow heat exchanger manufactured by Noren,
19 N-O-R-E-N.

20 Q. What do you mean by counterflow heat
21 exchanger?

22 A. That the air streams are opposed to

1 one another, they are flowing in opposite
2 directions.

3 Q. How is that different from a
4 cross-flow heat exchanger?

5 A. It would be just the difference
6 between the direction of the air flows between
7 the paths, and I am not sure. I mean, I -- I
8 can't quite characterize this from -- from the
9 drawing that I reviewed, but it's one of the two,
10 counterflow or cross-flow.

11 Q. But you cannot tell from this
12 exhibit whether is a cross-flow or counterflow
13 heat exchanger, right?

14 A. No, I can't.

15 Q. You said that you believe the
16 manufacturer of this device is Noren?

17 A. It's listed in the bill of
18 materials.

19 Q. Are you familiar with Noren?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Have you purchased devices from them
22 before?

1 A. No.

2 Q. And who is Noren?

3 A. I believe they are an American
4 company that builds small heat exchangers for
5 electronics applications.

6 Q. And how are you familiar with them?

7 A. I Googled them.

8 Q. Why did you Google them?

9 A. Because they are in the bill of
10 materials.

11 Q. Do you know if they manufacture
12 anything other than heat exchangers?

13 A. I didn't really go that deeply.

14 Q. I would like to introduce another
15 exhibit. This will be Exhibit 3.

16 (Whereupon, Exhibit 3, Printout of
17 Noren Website, was marked for
18 identification.)

19 BY MR. MEYER:

20 Q. Mr. Smith-Gillespie, have you
21 visited the Noren website before?

22 A. Yes.

1 Q. Does this exhibit appear to reflect
2 the Noren website?

3 MR. KLINE: Object to the form of
4 the question.

5 A. It does.

6 BY MR. MEYER:

7 Q. Do you see that under "Products," it
8 lists different product categories?

9 A. I see that, yes.

10 Q. You see that heat sinks, heat
11 exchangers, and heat plates are listed
12 separately?

13 A. I do.

14 Q. That's because these are different
15 categories of devices, right?

16 MR. KLINE: Object to the form of
17 the question.

18 A. Well, it would depend on how the
19 device is being used.

20 BY MR. MEYER:

21 Q. In your opinion, these are all the
22 same category of device?

1 A. I didn't say that.

2 MR. KLINE: Object to the form of
3 the question.

4 BY MR. MEYER:

5 Q. They are listed as different
6 categories, right?

7 MR. KLINE: Objection asked and
8 answered.

9 A. They list several categories. Heat
10 sinks is placed in a different category relative
11 to, say, heat exchanger air-to-air.

12 BY MR. MEYER:

13 Q. I would like to introduce another
14 exhibit. This will be Exhibit 4.

15 (Whereupon, Exhibit 4, US Patent No.
16 5,748,269, was marked for identification.)

17 BY MR. MEYER:

18 Q. This will be US Patent No. 5,748,269
19 to Harris.

20 Mr. Smith-Gillespie, you are
21 familiar with this patent, right?

22 A. I am, yes.

1 Q. Okay. Turning to page 5 of Yare, at
2 lines 15 to 20 of page 5, it states, "As air is
3 forced into the pressure zone, 85, existing air
4 in the pressure zone, 85, is forced through vents
5 in the rear portion, 35, of the display, 20. The
6 air circulates around the display, 20, aided by a
7 standard internal cooling system of the display,
8 20.

9 "In the illustrated embodiment, the
10 internal cooling system includes the fan, 25.
11 The air is heated by hot components as it
12 circulates and is drawn upwards by the fan, 25,
13 within the display unit and blown out of the rear
14 portion, 35, for the cycle to continue."

15 That passage describes a finished
16 display product with its own cooling system,
17 including fans, right?

18 A. Again, that -- that doesn't mean
19 anything more than there might be a small cooler
20 on a power component or something like that,
21 vents in a case to allow air to get into the
22 components. I don't see where it actually says

1 there's a fan in the display.

2 Q. So it refers the fact of the
3 internal cooling system of the display, 20,
4 includes the fans, 25, but you don't conclude
5 from that that the fans are internal to the
6 display?

7 A. Okay. I -- I see that now. Yes,
8 that -- that appears to imply that there's -- the
9 fan, 25, is part of this display that's not
10 really depicted in here.

11 Q. And you stated that display would
12 have a casing, right.

13 A. When did I state this about Yare,
14 about the LCD in Yare?

15 Q. Let's turn to page 3 of Yare,
16 line 17 -- or line 17 to 20 of page 3 of Yare.
17 Yare states, "The display cabinet may include a
18 display system, such as a plasma display, an LCD,
19 a TFT display, a CRT display, an LED display, a
20 protector or a rear projection display. It will
21 be appreciated that any display could be used and
22 the cabinet could also be adapted to cater for

1 new technologies as and when necessary."

2 Did you review this passage in
3 forming your opinion as to what display, 20,
4 refers to?

5 A. Yes, I did.

6 Q. And each of these types of display
7 systems has a different configuration, right?

8 A. That's correct.

9 Q. And each of these types of displays
10 has different cooling needs, right?

11 A. Somewhat, yes.

12 Q. And does a plasma panel have a
13 backlight?

14 A. It generates a lot of heat from the
15 electronics.

16 Q. Does the rear surface of a plasma
17 panel generate as much heat as an LCD backlight?

18 A. Yes.

19 MR. KLINE: Object to the form of
20 the question.

21 A. More so.

22 BY MR. MEYER:

1 CERTIFICATE OF SHORTHAND REPORTER-NOTARY PUBLIC

2 I, Monique Cabrera, the officer
3 before whom the foregoing deposition was
4 taken, do hereby certify that the foregoing
5 transcript is a true and correct record of
6 the testimony given; that said testimony was
7 taken by me stenographically and thereafter
8 reduced to typewriting under my direction;
9 and that I am neither counsel for, related
10 to, nor employed by any of the parties to
11 this case and have no interest, financial or
12 otherwise, in its outcome.

13
14
15
16
17
18 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
19 set my hand this 26th day of April, 2023.

20
21
22

23 MONIQUE CABRERA

24 Notary Public in and for the State of New York
25 County of Suffolk

26 My Commission No. 01CA6043156

27 Expires: 06/12/2026