

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

AMERICAN AIRLINES, INC.,  
AND  
HILTON DOMESTIC OPERATING COMPANY, INC.,  
Petitioners,

v.

R2 SOLUTIONS LLC,  
Patent Owner.

---

Case IPR2023-00666

Patent 8,341,157

---

**PETITIONERS' MOTION FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE OF**  
**DAVID E. FINKELSON**

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.10 and the Board’s authorization to file motions for *pro hac vice* admission in *Inter Partes* Review Case No. IPR2023-00666 (Paper No. 5), Petitioners request that the Board admit David E. Finkelson *pro hac vice* in this proceeding.<sup>1</sup>

The Board may recognize counsel *pro hac vice* during a proceeding on a showing of good cause. “[W]here lead counsel is a registered practitioner, a motion to appear *pro hac vice* may be granted upon a showing that counsel is an experienced litigation attorney and has an established familiarity with the subject matter at issue in the proceeding.” 37 C.F.R. § 42.10(c).

Here, lead counsel John Campbell is a registered practitioner (Reg. No. 54,665). Mr. Finkelson has over 20 years of patent litigation experience, and he is familiar with the subject matter at issue in this proceeding. U.S. Patent Nos. 7,698,329, 8,190,610, and 8,341,157 are currently asserted against Petitioner Hilton Domestic Operating Company Inc. (“Hilton”) in a co-pending litigation, *R2 Solutions LLC v. Hilton Domestic Operating Company Inc.*, Case No. 3:22-CV-2761 (N.D. Tex.) (the “District Court Litigation”). Mr. Finkelson is lead counsel for

---

<sup>1</sup> Pursuant to the Order Authorizing Motion for *Pro Hac Vice* Admission in IPR2013-00639, Paper No. 7 (PTAB Oct. 15, 2013), Petitioners are filing this motion no sooner than twenty one (21) days after service of the petition.

Hilton in the District Court Litigation, responsible for overseeing all aspects of Hilton's defense in the District Court Litigation. Mr. Finkelson is also a senior member of the team that prepared the following Petitions for *Inter Partes* Review: IPR2023-00666, IPR2023-00689 and IPR2023-00690 (the "Petitions"). In the foregoing capacities, Mr. Finkelson has overseen the review of the prior art references set forth in the Petitions, and is intimately familiar with the disclosures of these prior art references, the asserted grounds of invalidity, and the subject matter in this proceeding

Accompanying this motion is the Declaration of David E. Finkelson (Ex. A), where Mr. Finkelson attests to his aforementioned experience and established familiarity with the subject matter of this proceeding. Hilton already has expended significant resources in the District Court Litigation with Mr. Finkelson as lead counsel, and Petitioners wish to continue using Mr. Finkelson as counsel in this proceeding.

Therefore, Petitioners submit that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Mr. Finkelson as backup counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

Dated: April 25, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Kyle Smith

Kyle Smith

Reg. No. 78,579

ksmith@mcguirewoods.com

McGuireWoods LLP

501 Fayetteville St.

Raleigh, NC 27601

Telephone: (919) 755-6600

Facsimile: (919) 755-6699

*Counsel for Petitioners*

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.6, the undersigned certifies that on April 25, 2023, a true and correct copy of this Motion to Appear *Pro Hac Vice*, and all supporting exhibits, was served electronically on the following counsel of record for Patent Owner:

Carder W. Brooks  
Registration No. 75,456  
NELSON BUMGARDNER  
CONROY P.C.  
3131 W. 7th Street, Suite 300  
Fort Worth, Texas 76107  
Telephone: (817) 377-9111  
Email: [carder@nelbum.com](mailto:carder@nelbum.com)

Brent N. Bumgardner  
Registration No. 48,476  
NELSON BUMGARDNER  
CONROY P.C.  
3131 W. 7th Street, Suite 300  
Fort Worth, Texas 76107  
Telephone: (817) 377-9111  
Email: [brent@nelbum.com](mailto:brent@nelbum.com)

[R2Solutions-IPR@nelbum.com](mailto:R2Solutions-IPR@nelbum.com)

By: /s/Kyle Smith

Kyle Smith (Reg. No. 78,579)