

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SEMICONDUCTOR COMPONENTS INDUSTRIES, LLC,
Petitioner,

v.

GREENTHREAD, LLC,
Patent Owner.

IPR2023-01244
U.S. Patent No. 11,121,222

**PATENT OWNER'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO SEAL FILED
DECEMBER 14, 2023**

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit No.	Description	Submitted Previously?
Ex. 2001	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , No. 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 7 (summons returned executed) (W.D. Tex. Feb. 7, 2022)	X
Ex. 2002	Email communication from Petitioner’s counsel to Patent Owner’s counsel October 16, 2023	X
Ex. 2003	Presentation entitled “Accelerating the Journey Towards a Sustainable Ecosystem” (2023) available at Petitioner’s website at https://www.onsemi.com/site/pdf/2023_Analyst_Day_Presentation.pdf	X
Ex. 2004	“Clock Devices for Servers” (Aug. 2020) available at https://cdrdv2-public.intel.com/620306/620306_Clock_Devices_For_Server_Rv1p3.pdf	X
Ex. 2005	On Semiconductor Corporation Form 10-K filing with U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission for the fiscal year ended December 31, 2016	X
Ex. 2006	ON Semiconductor data sheet entitled “NCP81248 Three-Rail Controller with Intel Proprietary Interface for IMVP8 CPU Applications” (Feb. 2018) available at https://www.onsemi.com/pdf/datasheet/ncp81248-d.pdf	X
Ex. 2007	onsemi data sheet entitled “+ 1 Phase Output Controller with SVID Interface for Computer CPU Applications” (May 2023) available at https://www.onsemi.com/download/datasheet/pdf/ncp81566-d.pdf	X

Exhibit No.	Description	Submitted Previously?
Ex. 2008	Onsemi data sheet entitled “+ 2 Phase Output Controller with SVID Interface for Computer CPU Applications (May 2023) available at https://www.onsemi.com/download/data-sheet/pdf/ncp81567-d.pdf	X
Ex. 2009	Article entitled “If You Invested \$1000 in ON Semiconductor Corp. a Decade Ago, This is How Much It’d Be Worth Now,” May 8, 2023 available at https://finance.yahoo.com/news/invested-1000-semiconductor-corp-decade-123012312.html	X
Ex. 2010	Onsemi Standard Terms and Conditions of Sale, Rev.08102021 available at https://www.onsemi.com/site/pdf/ONSEMI_T&C.pdf	X
Ex. 2011	Plaintiff’s First Set of Common Interrogatories to Defendants ON Semiconductor Corporation and Monolithic Power Services, Inc., Et Al., <i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA (D. Del.) (served Sept. 27, 2023)	X
Ex. 2012	Plaintiff’s First Set of Common Requests for the Production of Documents to Defendants ON Semiconductor Corporation and Monolithic Power Services, Inc., Et Al., <i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA (D. Del.) (served Sept. 27, 2023)	X
Ex. 2013	Definition of “privity” in Black’s Law Dictionary (11 th ed. 2019) available from Westlaw at westlaw.com	X
Ex. 2014	Email communication from Petitioner’s counsel to Patent Owner’s counsel October 11, 2023	X
Ex. 2015	Plaintiff’s Identification of Accused Products and Asserted Patents, <i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA (D. Del.) (served Oct. 12, 2023)	X

Exhibit No.	Description	Submitted Previously?
Ex. 2016	Petition (Paper 2) in <i>Sony Group Corp. v. Greenthread, LLC</i> , IPR2023-00324	X
Ex. 2017	Petition (Paper 1) in <i>Sony Group Corp. v. Greenthread, LLC</i> , IPR2023-00376	X
Ex. 2018	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , No. 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 1 (Complaint) (W.D. Tex. Jan. 27, 2022)	X
Ex. 2019	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Dell Inc.</i> , No. 6:22-cv-105-ADA, Dkt. 120 (Second Amended Complaint)	X
Ex. 2020	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA, Dkt. 1 (Complaint with accompanying exhibits) (D. Del. Apr. 21, 2023)	X
Ex. 2021	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA, Dkt. 24 (Scheduling Order) (D. Del. Sept. 11, 2023)	X
Ex. 2022	Confidential agreement	X
Ex. 2023	Petition (Paper 1) in <i>Intel Corp. v. Greenthread LLC</i> , IPR2023-00308	X
Ex. 2024	Petition (Paper 1) in <i>Intel Corp. v. Greenthread LLC</i> , IPR2023-00420	X
Ex. 2025	Petition (Paper 1) in <i>Intel Corp. v. Greenthread LLC</i> , IPR2023-00552	X
Ex. 2026	Petition (Paper 1) in <i>Dell Techs. Inc. v. Greenthread LLC</i> , IPR2023-00506	X
Ex. 2027	Petition (Paper 1) in <i>Dell Techs. Inc. v. Greenthread LLC</i> , IPR2023-00509	X

Exhibit No.	Description	Submitted Previously?
Ex. 2028	Confidential declaration	X
Ex. 2029	Email communication from Patent Owner’s counsel to Petitioner’s counsel between May 26 to June 1, 2023	X
Ex. 2030	Web pages from websites of Onsemi (www.onsemi.com), Mouser Electronics, Inc. (www.mouser.com), Rochester Electronics (www.rocelec.com), and DigiKey Corporation (www.digikey.com) (URLs for web pages are indicated on respective pages)	X
Ex. 2031	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , No. 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 113 (Redacted Memorandum Opinion and Order) (W.D. Tex. Dec. 27, 2022)	X
Ex. 2032	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 38 (First Amended Complaint for Patent Infringement) (W.D. Tex., filed Apr. 29, 2022)	X
Ex. 2033	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 38-8 (Greenthread’s Amended Preliminary Infringement Contentions) (W.D. Tex., filed Apr. 29, 2022)	X
Ex. 2034	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 38-12 (Exs. D-1, D-2, D-3, D-6 to Greenthread’s Preliminary Infringement Contentions) (W.D. Tex., filed Apr. 29, 2022)	X
Ex. 2035	Plaintiff’s Supplemental Identification of Asserted Patents and Accused Products in <i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA (served to Petitioner’s counsel on Nov. 10, 2023)	X
Ex. 2036	Webpage regarding iFixIt, PlayStation 5 Teardown (https://www.ifixit.com/Teardown/PlayStation+5+Teardown/138280)	X

Exhibit No.	Description	Submitted Previously?
Ex. 2037	Webpage from Mouser Electronics, Inc. for NCP252160 (https://www.mouser.com/ProductDetail/onsemi/NCP252160MNTWG?qs=sPbYRqrBIVkc9klNZ2pXbg%3D%3D)	X
Ex. 2038	Webpage from DigiKey for NCP252160 (https://www.digikey.com/en/products/detail/onsemi/NCP252160MNTWG/15859992)	X
Ex. 2039	Webpage from Mouser Electronics, Inc. for NB3L202K (https://www.mouser.com/ProductDetail/onsemi/NB3L202KMNTXG?qs=z6PAvqrnkvrR8PcLN2EnUzg%3D%3D)	X
Ex. 2040	Webpage from DigiKey for NB3L202K (https://www.digikey.com/en/products/detail/onsemi/NB3L202KMNTXG/7220446)	X
Ex. 2041	Definition of “agent” in Black’s Law Dictionary (11 th ed. 2019) available from Westlaw at westlaw.com	X
Ex. 2042	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 135 (Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice of L. Popovski on Behalf of Sony) (W.D. Tex., filed January 30, 2023)	X
Ex. 2043	[RESERVED]	
Ex. 2044	Email communication from Patent Owner to Petitioner’s litigation counsel dated September 13, 2023	X
Ex. 2045	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 49 (Notice of Appearance of Additional Counsel) (W.D. Tex., filed June 9, 2022)	X
Ex. 2046	[RESERVED]	

Exhibit No.	Description	Submitted Previously?
Ex. 2047	[RESERVED]	
Ex. 2048	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. Intel Corp.</i> , 6:22-cv-00105-ADA, Dkt. 120-8 (Greenthread’s Amended Preliminary Infringement Contentions) (W.D. Tex., filed Jan. 23, 2023)	X
Ex. 2049	Email communications between Petitioner’s counsel and Patent Owner’s counsel, dated Oct. 31, 2023 - Nov. 1, 2023	X
Ex. 2050	Email communications between Petitioner’s counsel and Patent Owner’s counsel, dated Nov. 2-7, 2023	X
Ex. 2051	Email communications between Petitioner’s counsel and Patent Owner’s counsel, dated Nov. 14-15, 2023	X
Ex. 2052	Email communications between Petitioner’s counsel and Patent Owner’s counsel, dated Dec. 12-13, 2023	X
Ex. 2053	Web page from website of Onsemi (https://www.onsemi.com/products/custom-assp/soc-sip-custom-products)	X
Ex. 2054	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA, Dkt. 36 (Second Amended Complaint) (D. Del. Nov. 22, 2023)	X
Ex. 2055	<i>Greenthread, LLC v. ON Semiconductor Corp.</i> , No. 23-443-RGA, Dkt. 42 (Defendants’ Answer, Affirmative Defenses, and Counterclaims to Plaintiff’s Second Amended Complaint) (D. Del. Dec. 20, 2023)	X
Ex. 2056	Email communications between the Board, Petitioner’s counsel and Patent Owner’s counsel dated November 27, 2023	X

Patent Owner Greenthread, LLC (“Patent Owner” or “PO”) filed its motion to seal (“Motion,” Paper 24) *Petitioner’s Reply* to Patent Owner’s Preliminary Response because Petitioner’s Reply referenced certain documents that contain confidential licensing-related information of Patent Owner. As noted in the Motion, Petitioner, despite representing that its Reply brief contained confidential license information of Patent Owner, would not file a motion to seal and insisted that Patent Owner do so if Patent Owner wanted its information to remain confidential.

Now, Petitioner has filed an Opposition (Paper 29) to Patent Owner’s Motion, presenting arguments against a position that Patent Owner did not take. In Petitioner’s Opposition, Petitioner notes that it “*does oppose*” filing papers under seal “without proposing or filing any redacted versions that are available to the public.” Opposition, 1. This misrepresents the situation presented with Patent Owner’s Motion. Patent Owner’s Motion explicitly requests sealing Petitioner’s Reply, “subject to later filing of a redacted version.” Motion, 2.

At the time that Petitioner was preparing to file its Reply, Patent Owner could not have offered redactions to Petitioner’s own filing, so the only course of action that Patent Owner could have taken to protect its confidential information was to file a motion to seal Petitioner’s Reply in its entirety and offer to submit redactions at a later time. That is what Patent Owner did. Motion, 2.

Because neither Party opposes the submission of a redacted copy of Petitioner's Reply, Patent Owner requests that the Board grant Patent Owner the opportunity to file a redacted version of the Reply.

Petitioner separately opposes the entry of an amended Protective Order, which Patent Owner submitted as Attachment A to the Motion. Motion, Attachment A (clean copy of amended Protective Order) and Attachment B (redlined copy of amended Protective Order). The amended Protective Order largely tracks the language of the Default Protective Order, but adds an additional "Attorneys' Eyes Only" designation. *Compare* Motion, Attachment A, Paragraph 2 (identifying access to confidential information) *with* Motion, Attachment A, Paragraph 4 (identifying access to confidential information in the "Attorneys' Eyes Only" category).

This materials for which Patent Owner seeks to restrict access under an "Attorneys' Eyes Only" designation are documents that contain highly competitively sensitive information related to licensing, including precise license terms and rates that should only be accessible to persons that qualify under Paragraph 4 of the amended Protective Order. *See* Motion, Attachment A, 4-5. This is especially important in this instance because Petitioner indicated on the day that it filed its Reply to Patent Owner's Preliminary Response, Petitioner indicated via email that its goal was to make public the identity of a third-party who was involved

with Patent Owner's licenses. Ex. 2052 (December 13, 2023 email from Petitioner's counsel to Patent Owner's counsel).

As noted in the Motion, Petitioner did not provide a reason why that third-party's identity should be made public and Patent Owner noted to Petitioner that publicizing the third-party's identity could harm both it and Patent Owner. Therefore, good cause exists for the information to remain under seal. This information is truly sensitive to Patent Owner and the third-party.

For at least these reasons and those described in Patent Owner's Motion, Patent Owner requests entry of the amended Protective Order. Patent Owner further requests that it be permitted to file redacted copies of the Reply as originally proposed in its Motion.

Dated: February 16, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

/Alan L. Whitehurst/

Alan L. Whitehurst

Reg. No. 43,263

awhitehurst@mckoolsmith.com

Nicholas T. Matich

Reg. No. L1,373

nmatich@mckoolsmith.com

Arvind Jairam

Reg. No. 62,759

ajairam@mckoolsmith.com

Stuart McCommas
Reg. No. 71,834
smccommas@mckoolsmith.com
McKool SMITH, P.C.
1999 K St. NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: (202) 370-8300
Facsimile: (202) 370-8344

Archis "Neil" Ozarkar
Reg. No. 71,265
nozarkar@mckoolsmith.com
McKool SMITH, P.C.
600 Travis Street, Suite 600
Houston, TX 77002
Telephone: (713) 485-7300
Facsimile: (713) 485-7344

CERTIFICATION OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of this **PATENT OWNER'S
REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO SEAL FILED DECEMBER 14, 2023**

has been served on Petitioner via email on the following counsel of record for
Petitioner:

Roger Fulghum
Roger.Fulghum@BakerBotts.com
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.
One Shell Plaza
910 Louisiana Street
Houston, TX 77002
T.: (713) 229-1234

Mark Speegle
Mark.Speegle@BakerBotts.com
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.
401 South First Street, Suite 1300
Austin, TX 78704
T: (512) 322-2536

Daniel Anderson
Daniel.Anderson@andersonpatents.com
1930 S. Alma School Road, Suite A200
Mesa, AZ 85210
T: (602) 516-8265

dlgreenthreadvonsemi@bakerbotts.com

Dated: February 16, 2024

By: /Alan L. Whitehurst/
Alan L. Whitehurst, Reg. No. 43,263