

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

COLGATE-PALMOLIVE COMPANY,
Petitioner,

v.

NOBLE INNOVATIONS NC L.L.C.,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2023-01254
Patent 8,881,332 B2

Before RYAN H. FLAX, TIMOTHY G. MAJORS, and
MICHAEL A. VALEK, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

FLAX, *Administrative Patent Judge*.

ORDER

Granting Petitioner's
Motion to Withdraw and Substitute Counsel

37 C.F.R. § 42.10

Colgate-Palmolive Company (“Petitioner”) filed an Unopposed Motion to Substitute Counsel requesting authorization to withdraw lead counsel Amy E. LaValle, to substitute Keith D. Harden (Reg. No. 74,472) as lead counsel, and to substitute Daniel E. Venglarik (Reg. No. 39,409) as “first backup counsel.” Paper 6 (“Motion”). The Motion indicates that “[a]uthorization for this motion was granted by the Board via email on December 4, 2023,” and that “Patent Owner does not oppose this motion.” Motion 1.

Petitioner states that “Ms. LaValle has left the firm of Munck Wilson Mandala, LLP, and Petitioner wishes to substitute lead counsel in light of Ms. LaValle’s resignation.” *Id.* The Motion further indicates, “substitution of counsel will not have an adverse effect on Petitioner or Patent Owner, or otherwise delay this proceeding.” *Id.*

We note that an updated Power of Attorney and Updated Mandatory Notices have been filed. *See* Papers 7, 8. We also note that a previous Power of Attorney and previous Mandatory Notices listed Mr. Harden as “First Backup Counsel” but do not include Mr. Venglarik. *See* Papers 1, 1; 2, 1. The updated Power of Attorney and Updated Mandatory Notices, however, includes Mr. Venglarik as “First Backup Counsel.” *See* Papers 7, 1; 8, 1. We do not differentiate between “Backup Counsel” and “First Backup Counsel,” therefore, we deem Petitioner’s Motion as requesting that we add and designate Mr. Venglarik as back-up counsel.

In consideration of the foregoing, it is hereby:

ORDERED that the Motion is *granted* with respect to the withdrawal of Amy E. LaValle as lead counsel; and

FURTHER ORDERED that the Motion is *granted* with respect to the designations of Keith D. Harden as new lead counsel and Daniel E. Venglarik as new back-up counsel.

IPR2023-01254
Patent 8,881,332 B2

FOR PETITIONER:

Amy E. LaValle
Keith D. Harden
Michael C. Wilson
MUNCK WILSON MANDALA, LLP
alavalle@munckwilson.com
kharden@munckwilson.com
mwilson@munckwilson.com
InternalColgate-Noble@munckwilson.com

FOR PATENT OWNER:

Wier L. King
Ken Sheets
WHITESTONE LAW
wking@whitestone.law
ksheets@whitestone.law
litigation@whitestone.law