

Filed on behalf of Bazooka-Farmstar, LLC

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

BAZOOKA-FARMSTAR, LLC,
Petitioner,

v.

NUHN INDUSTRIES LTD.,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2024-00098
U.S. Patent No. 11,541,708

**PETITIONER'S OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 42.64**

Petitioner Bazooka-Farmstar, LLC (“Bazooka”) objects under 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1) and the Federal Rules of Evidence (“FRE”) to the admissibility of the following documents submitted by Patent Owner Nuhn Industries Ltd. (“Nuhn”) in its Response filed on August 14, 2024 (Paper No. 21): The Declaration of Douglas Prairie (EX2099, the “Prairie Declaration”) and The Declaration of Ian Nuhn (EX2083, the “Nuhn Declaration”).

Nuhn filed its response on August 14, 2024. Bazooka’s objections are timely filed under 37 C.F.R. § 42.64(b)(1). Bazooka serves Patent Owner with these Objections to provide notice that Bazooka will move to exclude the above-identified exhibits as improper evidence.

I. PATENT OWNER’S EVIDENCE

A. Prairie Declaration (EX2099)

Bazooka objects to the admissibility of the Prairie Declaration for at least the following reasons.

Dr. Prairie’s opinions in the Prairie Declaration are inadmissible under at least FRE 702 and 703 because they are conclusory, do not disclose underlying facts or data in support of his opinions, and are unreliable.

In addition, Dr. Prairie analyzes the claims of this patent through the wrong POSA lens, and is unqualified as an expert to provide technical opinions of a POSA under FRE 702 and 703, as he lacks any professional experience with marine

vehicles. *See, e.g.*, EX2087; *see also Kyocera Senco Indus. Tools Inc. v. Int'l Trade Comm'n*, 22 F.4th 1369, 1377 (Fed. Cir. 2022).

In addition, the opinions in the Prairie Declaration are irrelevant, confusing, prejudicial, and of minimal probative value under FRE 401, 402, and 403.

B. Nuhn Declaration (EX2083)

Petitioner objects to the admissibility of the Nuhn Declaration for at least the following reasons.

Ian Nuhn's testimony is irrelevant, confusing, prejudicial, and of minimal probative value. Additionally, Ian Nuhn's testimony is based on conduct or statements made during compromise negotiations. Ian Nuhn's testimony is based on matters that he lacks personal knowledge of. Ian Nuhn's testimony also includes impermissible opinion testimony. Ian Nuhn's testimony contains hearsay, as well as hearsay within hearsay, and is not properly authenticated. Ian Nuhn's testimony regarding alleged secondary considerations of non-obviousness fails to establish any nexus to the '708 Patent's claims.

Therefore, Ian Nuhn's testimony should be excluded under at least FRE 401, 402, 403, 408, 602, 603, 701, 702, 802, 805, 901, and/or 1002.

Respectfully submitted,

MERCHANT & GOULD P.C.

Date: August 21, 2024

/Thomas J. Leach/

Thomas J. Leach

Registration No. 53,188

Robert A. Kalinsky

Registration No. 50,471

Michael A. Erbele

(admitted *pro hac vice*)

Taylor R. Stemler

Registration No. 79,777

MERCHANT & GOULD P.C.

150 South Fifth Street, Suite 2200

Minneapolis, MN 55402

TLeach@merchantgould.com

RKalinsky@merchantgould.com

MErbele@merchantgould.com

TStemler@merchantgould.com

Jeffrey D. Blake

Registration No. 58,884

MERCHANT & GOULD P.C.

191 Peachtree Street NE, Suite

3800

Atlanta, GA 30303

JBlake@merchantgould.com

(Trial No. IPR2024-00098)

ATTORNEYS FOR PETITIONER

CERTIFICATION OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies, in accordance with 37 C.F.R. § 42.6(e), that service was made on Counsel for Patent Owner as detailed below.

Date of service:	August 21, 2024
Manner of service:	Electronic mail addressed to: bluchsinger@harnessip.com syackey@harnessip.com mcutler@harnessip.com
Documents served:	Petitioner's Objections to Evidence Under 37 C.F.R. § 42.64
Persons served:	James B. Luchsinger HARNESS, DICKEY & PIERCE P.L.C. 5445 Corporate Dr., Suite 200 Troy, MI 48098 Phone: 248-641-1600 Fax: 248-641-0270 bluchsinger@harnessip.com Scott E. Yackey HARNESS, DICKEY & PIERCE, P.L.C. 2801 Network Blvd., Suite 600 Frisco, TX 75034 syackey@harnessip.com Matthew L. Cutler HARNESS, DICKEY & PIERCE, P.L.C. 7700 Bonhomme, Suite 400 Clayton, MO 63105 mcutler@harnessip.com <u>/Thomas J. Leach/</u> Thomas J. Leach, Reg. No. 53,188