

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

BOE Technology Group Co., Ltd,
Petitioner,

v.

Optronic Sciences LLC
Patent Owner

IPR2024-01134
Patent No. 9,406,733

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE

I. Patent Owner's Preliminary Response

Patent Owner does not believe the Petition merits institution. Primary Examiner Ida Soward thoroughly examined the claims and allowed U.S. 9,406,733 over the art of record. Ex. 1001 at cover.

The technology in this case is similar to the technology in related IPR2024-01133 regarding U.S. Pat. 9,263,509. Patent Owner respectfully submits that Petitioners' arguments in these two cases should be evaluated for inconsistencies with each other. For example, in IPR2024-01133, the Petition argues on page 19 that a "bus line 430" is an electrode. In IPR2024-01134, the Petition at 19 appears to argue that a wire is an electrode. Then, in IPR2024-01134, the Petition at 35 argues that an "electrode pattern 45" is an electrode (the only argument that is plausible).

Patent Owner respectfully submits that Petitioner's arguments about wires and/or bus lines being electrodes have no likelihood of success, and Patent Owner requests that the Board's institution decision confirm this. Patent Owner requests that the Board thoroughly perform an independent evaluation of the remaining theory in the Petition and deny it on the merits, or if the Board decides to institute, that the Board's institution decision nonetheless clarify whether the Board believes Petitioner's argument that Hekmatshoar's wire is an electrode has any likelihood of success. If not, the parties can focus their subsequent efforts on Ground 2.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: October 29, 2024

/ Qi Tong /

Qi Tong (Reg. No. 74,292)
RUSS AUGUST & KABAT
4925 Greenville Avenue, Suite 200
Dallas, TX 75206
(310) 826-7474

Attorney for Patent Owner

CERTIFICATION REGARDING WORD COUNT

Pursuant to 37 C.F.R. §42.24(d), Patent Owner certifies that there are 223 words in the paper excluding the portions exempted under 37 C.F.R. §42.24(a)(1).

Dated: October 29, 2024

/ Qi Tong /
Qi Tong

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE (37 C.F.R. § 42.6(e)(1))

The undersigned hereby certifies that the above document was served on October 29, 2024, by filing this document through P-TACTS as well as delivering a copy via electronic mail upon the following attorneys of record for Petitioners:

Alan A. Limbach, Reg. No. 39749
Brian Erickson, Reg. No. 48895
DLA Piper LLP (US)
3203 Hanover Street, Suite 100
Palo Alto, CA 94304-1123
Phone: + 1 650 833 2433
Fax: + 1 650 687 1182
Alan.Limbach@us.dlapiper.com
Brian.Erickson@us.dlapiper.com
dla-boe-optronicsciences-IPR@us.dlapiper.com

Date: October 29, 2024

/ Qi Tong /

Qi Tong (Reg. No. 74,292)
RUSS AUGUST & KABAT
4925 Greenville Avenue, Suite 200
Dallas, TX 75206
(310) 826-7474

Attorney for Patent Owner