

**UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C.**

**Before the Honorable Monica Bhattacharyya
Administrative Law Judge**

In The Matter Of

**CERTAIN HIGH-STRENGTH
ALUMINUM OR ALUMINUM ALLOY-
COATED STEEL, AND AUTOMOTIVE
PRODUCTS AND AUTOMOBILES
CONTAINING SAME**

Investigation No. 337-TA-1402

**EXPERT REPORT OF DR. STUART B. BROWN REGARDING
INVALIDITY OF U.S. PATENTS 10,961,602 AND 11,326,227**

Dated: November 25, 2024.

Signed: 

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS	2
A.	Background and Qualifications.....	2
B.	Compensation and Prior Testimony.....	3
C.	Scope of Work	4
D.	Materials Considered	4
III.	SUMMARY OF OPINIONS	5
IV.	UNDERSTANDING OF APPLICABLE LEGAL STANDARDS.....	6
A.	Priority	7
B.	Patent Eligibility (35 U.S.C. § 101).....	7
C.	Anticipation (35 U.S.C. § 102).....	9
D.	Obviousness (35 U.S.C. § 103).....	11
E.	Indefiniteness (35 U.S.C. § 112).....	14
V.	STATE OF THE ART	15
A.	Hot-stamping of coated steel strips to obtain multi-layer coatings was well known.....	15
VI.	THE ASSERTED PATENTS	18
A.	Overview of '602 and '227 Patents	18
B.	Prosecution History of '227 and '602 Patents	20
VII.	PRIORITY DATES OF THE ASSERTED CLAIMS	21
VIII.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	22
IX.	OPINION AS TO THE LEVEL OF SKILL OF A PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	23
X.	OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART.....	24
A.	2006 Volkswagen Passat.....	24

B.	Engels.....	34
C.	Cornette.....	38
D.	Vaissiere.....	40
E.	Laurent	41
F.	Takagi	42
G.	Hein.....	44
H.	GMW14400	46
I.	Nishibata WO.....	47
J.	Nishibata US	48
K.	Suehiro II	48
L.	Lachmann.....	52
XI.	ANALYSIS OF THE '602 PATENT IN VIEW OF THE PRIOR ART	54
A.	Takagi in combination with Cornette	54
B.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Laurent	81
C.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Nishibata US	84
D.	Takagi in combination with Hein and GMW14400	88
E.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Laurent	111
F.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Nishibata WO	113
G.	Cornette.....	115
H.	Cornette in combination with Nishibata US	158
I.	Suehiro II alone or Suehiro II in combination with Cornette	160
J.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and GMW14400	190
K.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Laurent	192
L.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Nishibata US	196
M.	Engels.....	199

N.	Engels in combination with Cornette.....	222
O.	Engels in combination with Laurent	226
P.	Engels in combination with Nishibata WO	228
Q.	Engels in combination with Cornette and Nishibata WO.....	230
R.	Engels in combination with Cornette and Laurent	231
S.	Engels in combination with Takagi	231
T.	Passat 1049.....	234
U.	Lachman.....	262
V.	Lachmann in combination with Cornette.....	283
W.	Lachmann in combination with Laurent	289
X.	Lachmann in combination with Nishibata US.....	292
XII.	ANALYSIS OF THE '227 PATENT IN VIEW OF THE PRIOR ART	295
A.	Takagi in combination with Cornette	295
B.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Vaissiere.....	308
C.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Laurent	309
D.	Takagi in combination with Hein and GMW14400	310
E.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Vaissiere.....	322
F.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Laurent	323
G.	Cornette.....	324
H.	Cornette in combination with Nishibata US	342
I.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette	344
J.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Vaissiere.....	358
K.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Laurent	360
L.	Engels.....	360
M.	Engels in combination with Cornette.....	373

N.	Engels in combination with Takagi	376
O.	Engels in combination with Hein.....	379
P.	Engels in combination with Vaissiere.....	382
Q.	Engels in combination with Laurent	382
R.	Passat 1049.....	383
S.	Lachmann.....	401
T.	Lachmann in combination with Cornette.....	411
U.	Lachmann in combination with Vaissiere.....	412
V.	Lachmann in combination with Laurent	413
XIII.	NO SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS OF NONOBVIOUSNESS	414
XIV.	THE ASSERTED PATENTS ARE INVALID BECAUSE THE PREFERRED HOT STAMPING PROCESSES AND THE ALLEGED TECHNICAL DOMESTIC INDUSTRY HOT STAMPING PROCESSES OVERLAP WITH KNOWN PRIOR ART HOT STAMPING	420
A.	Prior Art Hot Stamping Processes Were Able to Create the Claimed Four-Layer Structure	422
B.	The Preferred Hot Stamping Processes of the Asserted Patents Overlaps With Prior Art Hot Stamping Processes	431
C.	The Hot Stamping Processes That Generate the Alleged Domestic Industry Products Overlap With Prior Art Hot Stamping Processes	437
D.	Magna Hot-Stamping of USIBOR 1500P in the United States in 2004.....	443
XV.	THE ASSERTED CLAIMS ARE INVALID UNDER SECTION 112	456
A.	The Asserted Claims Are Indefinite	456
XVI.	THE ASSERTED CLAIMS DO NOT RECITE PATENT ELIGIBLE SUBJECT MATTER	471
XVII.	RESERVATION OF RIGHTS AND CONCLUSION.....	473
	Appendix A: Materials Considered	1