

**UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C.**

**Before the Honorable Monica Bhattacharyya
Administrative Law Judge**

In The Matter Of

**CERTAIN HIGH-STRENGTH
ALUMINUM OR ALUMINUM ALLOY-
COATED STEEL, AND AUTOMOTIVE
PRODUCTS AND AUTOMOBILES
CONTAINING SAME**

Investigation No. 337-TA-1402

**REBUTTAL EXPERT REPORT OF DIERK RAABE, PROFESSOR DR.-ING.
REGARDING VALIDITY**

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
A.	Qualifications	1
B.	Compensation	4
C.	Materials Considered	4
D.	Summary of Opinions	4
II.	LEGAL STANDARDS	4
A.	Claim Construction	4
B.	Presumption of Validity	5
C.	Prior Art	6
D.	Earlier Conception Date	7
E.	Anticipation and Obviousness	7
F.	Secondary Considerations of Non-Obviousness	9
G.	Written Description	10
H.	Enablement	10
I.	Indefiniteness	10
J.	Claiming the Subject Matter the Applicants Regards as Their Invention	11
K.	Utility	11
III.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	11
IV.	REBUTTAL TO DR. BROWN’S STATE OF THE ART	12
A.	Overview of Hot-Stamping	13
B.	History of Hot-Stamping	16
V.	REBUTTAL TO DR. BROWN’S DESCRIPTION OF U.S. PATENT NOS. 10,961,602 AND 11,326,227	21
A.	Overview of the ’602 and ’227 Patents	21
B.	Prosecution Histories of the ’602 and ’227 Patents	25
1.	’602 Patent Prosecution History	25
a.	Information Disclosure Statements	25
b.	Takagi	27
c.	Laurent	28
d.	Notice of Allowance	34
2.	’227 Patent Prosecution History	34
a.	Information Disclosure Statements	35
b.	Cornette and Laurent	37

	(1)	Different Materials.....	37
	(2)	Mean Iron Composition	40
	(3)	Combination with Laurent	42
	c.	Notice of Allowance	44
VI.		CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	45
VII.		DR. BROWN FAILS TO ESTABLISH THAT CERTAIN PRIOR ART REFERENCES ARE PRIOR ART TO THE ASSERTED PATENTS.....	46
	A.	The Priority Date of the Asserted Patents.....	46
VIII.		REBUTTAL TO DR. BROWN’S OVERVIEW OF THE PRIOR ART	50
	A.	2006 Volkswagen Passat.....	50
	B.	Engels.....	53
	C.	Cornette.....	56
	D.	Vaissiere.....	62
	E.	Laurent	65
	F.	Takagi	66
	G.	Hein.....	67
	H.	GMW14400	68
	I.	Nishibata WO.....	69
	J.	Nishibata US	70
	K.	Suehiro II	71
	L.	Lachmann.....	71
IX.		ASSERTED ANTICIPATION AND OBVIOUSNESS GROUNDS FOR THE ’602 PATENT	72
	A.	Grounds Based on Takagi.....	72
	1.	There is no motivation to combine	72
	a.	Takagi in combination with Cornette	73
	b.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Laurent	82
	c.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Nishibata US	83
	d.	Takagi in combination with Hein and GMW14400	84
	e.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Laurent	90
	f.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Nishibata WO.....	90
	2.	General.....	90

3.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in view of Cornette	91
a.	Claim 1.....	91
b.	Claim 2.....	92
c.	Claim 5.....	92
d.	Claim 6.....	92
e.	Claim 9.....	92
f.	Claim 10.....	93
g.	Claim 12.....	95
h.	Claim 18.....	97
i.	Claim 20.....	97
j.	Claim 21.....	97
k.	Claim 22.....	97
l.	Claim 24.....	97
m.	Claim 25.....	98
n.	Claim 26.....	99
o.	Claim 28.....	99
4.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in view of Cornette and Laurent	99
a.	Claim 3.....	99
b.	Claim 4.....	100
c.	Claim 7.....	100
d.	Claim 8.....	100
5.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in view of Cornette and Nishibata US	100
a.	Claim 3.....	100
b.	Claim 4.....	101
c.	Claim 5.....	101
d.	Claim 6.....	101
6.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Hein and GMW14400	101
a.	Claim 1.....	101
b.	Claim 2.....	102
c.	Claim 3.....	102
d.	Claim 4.....	103
e.	Claim 5.....	103



	f.	Claim 6.....	104
	g.	Claim 7.....	104
	h.	Claim 8.....	105
	i.	Claim 9.....	105
	j.	Claim 10.....	105
	k.	Claim 12.....	105
	l.	Claim 18.....	106
	m.	Claim 20.....	106
	n.	Claim 21.....	106
	o.	Claim 22.....	106
	p.	Claim 24.....	106
	q.	Claim 25.....	106
	r.	Claim 26.....	107
	s.	Claim 28.....	107
7.		Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Laurent	107
	a.	Claim 3.....	107
	b.	Claim 4.....	108
	c.	Claim 7.....	108
	d.	Claim 8.....	108
8.		Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Nishibata WO	108
	a.	Claim 3.....	108
	b.	Claim 4.....	109
	c.	Claim 5.....	109
	d.	Claim 6.....	109
B.		Grounds Based on Cornette	109
	1.	There is no motivation to combine	110
		a. Cornette in combination with Nishibata US	110
	2.	General.....	110
	3.	Asserted Claims – Cornette	111
		a. Claim 1.....	111
		b. Claim 2.....	115



c.	Claim 3.....	116
d.	Claim 4.....	116
e.	Claim 5.....	116
f.	Claim 6.....	117
g.	Claim 7.....	117
h.	Claim 8.....	117
i.	Claim 9.....	117
j.	Claim 10.....	117
k.	Claim 18.....	118
l.	Claim 20.....	118
m.	Claim 21.....	118
n.	Claim 22.....	118
o.	Claim 24.....	118
p.	Claim 25.....	119
q.	Claim 26.....	119
r.	Claim 28.....	119
4.	Asserted Claims – Cornette in view of Nishibata US.....	119
a.	Claim 3.....	119
b.	Claim 4.....	120
c.	Claim 5.....	120
d.	Claim 6.....	121
C.	Grounds Based on Suehiro II.....	121
1.	There is no motivation to combine	121
a.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette	121
b.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and GMW14400	125
c.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Laurent	125
d.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Nishibata US	126
2.	General.....	127
3.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in view of Cornette	127
a.	Claim 1.....	127
b.	Claim 2.....	128
c.	Claim 3.....	128
d.	Claim 4.....	128



e.	Claim 5.....	128
f.	Claim 6.....	129
g.	Claim 9.....	129
h.	Claim 10.....	129
i.	Claim 12.....	132
j.	Claim 18.....	133
k.	Claim 20.....	133
l.	Claim 21.....	134
m.	Claim 22.....	134
n.	Claim 24.....	134
o.	Claim 25.....	134
p.	Claim 26.....	135
q.	Claim 28.....	135
4.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in view of Cornette and GMW14400	135
a.	Claim 3.....	135
b.	Claim 4.....	136
5.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in view of Cornette and Laurent.....	137
a.	Claim 3.....	137
b.	Claim 4.....	137
c.	Claim 7.....	138
d.	Claim 8.....	138
6.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in view of Cornette and Nishibata US	138
a.	Claim 3.....	138
b.	Claim 4.....	138
c.	Claim 5.....	138
d.	Claim 6.....	139
D.	Grounds Based on Engels	139
1.	There is no motivation to combine	139
a.	Engels in combination with Cornette.....	139
b.	Engels in combination with Laurent	142
c.	Engels in combination with Nishibata WO	142
d.	Engels in combination with Cornette and Nishibata WO	142
e.	Engels in combination with Cornette and Laurent	143

	f. Engels in combination with Takagi	143
2.	General.....	143
3.	Asserted Claims – Engels	144
	a. Claim 1.....	144
	b. Claim 2.....	144
	c. Claim 9.....	144
	d. Claim 10.....	145
	e. Claim 12.....	145
	f. Claim 18.....	146
	g. Claim 20.....	146
	h. Claim 21.....	146
	i. Claim 22.....	146
	j. Claim 24.....	147
	k. Claim 25.....	147
	l. Claim 26.....	147
	m. Claim 28.....	147
4.	Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Cornette	148
	a. Claim 2.....	148
	b. Claim 5.....	148
	c. Claim 6.....	148
5.	Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Laurent.....	148
	a. Claim 3.....	148
	b. Claim 4.....	148
	c. Claim 7.....	149
	d. Claim 8.....	149
6.	Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Nishibata WO	149
	a. Claim 3.....	149
	b. Claim 4.....	149
	c. Claim 5.....	149
	d. Claim 6.....	150
7.	Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Cornette and Nishibata WO.....	150
	a. Claim 6.....	150



8.	Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Cornette and Laurent	150
a.	Claim 8.....	150
9.	Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Takagi	150
a.	Claim 12.....	150
b.	Claim 25.....	151
c.	Claim 28.....	151
E.	Grounds Based on Passat	151
1.	Background	151
2.	General.....	159
3.	Asserted Claims – Passat 1049	160
a.	Claim 1.....	160
b.	Claim 2.....	162
c.	Claim 3.....	162
d.	Claim 4.....	162
e.	Claim 5.....	162
f.	Claim 6.....	163
g.	Claim 7.....	163
h.	Claim 8.....	163
i.	Claim 9.....	163
j.	Claim 10.....	163
k.	Claim 12.....	163
l.	Claim 18.....	164
m.	Claim 20.....	164
n.	Claim 21.....	164
o.	Claim 22.....	164
p.	Claim 24.....	164
q.	Claim 25.....	164
r.	Claim 26.....	164
s.	Claim 28.....	165
F.	Grounds Based on Lachmann	165
1.	There is no motivation to combine	165
a.	Lachmann in combination with Cornette.....	165

	b.	Lachmann in combination with Laurent	167
	c.	Lachmann in combination with Nishibata US	167
2.		General	168
3.		Asserted Claims – Lachmann	169
	a.	Claim 1.....	169
	b.	Claim 2.....	171
	c.	Claim 3.....	171
	d.	Claim 4.....	171
	e.	Claim 12.....	171
	f.	Claim 20.....	172
	g.	Claim 21.....	173
	h.	Claim 22.....	173
	i.	Claim 24.....	173
	j.	Claim 25.....	173
	k.	Claim 28.....	173
4.		Asserted Claims – Lachmann in combination with Cornette	173
	a.	Claim 5.....	173
	b.	Claim 6.....	174
	c.	Claim 9.....	174
	d.	Claim 10.....	174
	e.	Claim 18.....	177
	f.	Claim 26.....	177
5.		Asserted Claims – Lachmann in combination with Laurent.....	177
	a.	Claim 3.....	177
	b.	Claim 4.....	178
	c.	Claim 7.....	178
	d.	Claim 8.....	178
6.		Asserted Claims – Lachmann in combination with Nishibata US.....	179
	a.	Claim 3.....	179
	b.	Claim 4.....	179
	c.	Claim 5.....	180
	d.	Claim 6.....	180

X.	ASSERTED ANTICIPATION AND OBVIOUSNESS GROUNDS FOR THE	
	'227 PATENT	180
A.	Grounds Based on Takagi.....	180
1.	There is no motivation to combine	180
a.	Takagi in combination with Cornette	180
b.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Vaissiere.....	181
c.	Takagi in combination with Cornette and Laurent	182
d.	Takagi in combination with Hein and GMW14400	182
e.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Vaissiere.....	182
f.	Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Laurent	182
2.	General.....	183
3.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in view of Cornette	183
a.	Claim 1.....	183
b.	Claim 2.....	184
c.	Claim 4.....	184
d.	Claim 5.....	184
e.	Claim 6.....	184
f.	Claim 7.....	184
g.	Claim 8.....	185
h.	Claim 9.....	185
i.	Claim 10.....	185
j.	Claim 11.....	185
k.	Claim 13.....	186
l.	Claim 15.....	186
m.	Claim 22.....	186
n.	Claim 24.....	187
o.	Claim 25.....	188
4.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Cornette and Vaissiere.....	188
a.	Claim 15.....	188
5.	Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Cornette and Laurent	188



	a.	Claim 16.....	188
	b.	Claim 17.....	188
6.		Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Hein and GMW14400	189
	a.	Claim 1.....	189
	b.	Claim 2.....	189
	c.	Claim 4.....	189
	d.	Claim 5.....	189
	e.	Claim 6.....	189
	f.	Claim 7.....	190
	g.	Claim 8.....	190
	h.	Claim 9.....	190
	i.	Claim 10.....	190
	j.	Claim 11.....	191
	k.	Claim 13.....	191
	l.	Claim 15.....	191
	m.	Claim 16.....	192
	n.	Claim 17.....	192
	o.	Claim 22.....	192
	p.	Claim 24.....	192
	q.	Claim 25.....	193
7.		Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Vaissiere	193
	a.	Claim 15.....	193
8.		Asserted Claims – Takagi in combination with Hein, GMW14400, and Laurent	194
	a.	Claim 16.....	194
	b.	Claim 17.....	194
B.		Grounds Based on Cornette	194
	1.	There is no motivation to combine	194
		a. Cornette in combination with Nishibata US	194
	2.	General.....	195
	3.	Asserted Claims – Cornette	195



a.	Claim 1.....	195
b.	Claim 2.....	196
c.	Claim 4.....	196
d.	Claim 5.....	196
e.	Claim 6.....	196
f.	Claim 7.....	196
g.	Claim 8.....	197
h.	Claim 9.....	197
i.	Claim 10.....	197
j.	Claim 11.....	197
k.	Claim 13.....	197
l.	Claim 15.....	198
m.	Claim 16.....	198
n.	Claim 17.....	199
o.	Claim 24.....	199
p.	Claim 25.....	199
4.	Asserted Claims – Cornette in view of Nishibata US.....	199
a.	Claim 16.....	199
b.	Claim 17.....	200
C.	Grounds Based on Suehiro II.....	200
1.	There is no motivation to combine	200
a.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette	200
b.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Vaissiere.....	200
c.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Laurent	201
d.	Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Nishibata US	202
2.	General.....	202
3.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in combination with Cornette	202
a.	Claim 1.....	202
b.	Claim 2.....	203
c.	Claim 4.....	203
d.	Claim 5.....	203
e.	Claim 6.....	203
f.	Claim 7.....	203



g.	Claim 8.....	204
h.	Claim 9.....	204
i.	Claim 10.....	204
j.	Claim 11.....	204
k.	Claim 13.....	204
l.	Claim 15.....	204
m.	Claim 22.....	205
n.	Claim 24.....	205
o.	Claim 25.....	206
4.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Vaissiere.....	206
a.	Claim 15.....	206
5.	Asserted Claims – Suehiro II in combination with Cornette and Laurent	207
a.	Claim 16.....	207
b.	Claim 17.....	207
D.	Grounds Based on Engels	207
1.	There is no motivation to combine	207
a.	Engels in combination with Cornette.....	207
b.	Engels in combination with Takagi	208
c.	Engels in combination with Hein.....	208
d.	Engels in combination with Vaissiere.....	209
e.	Engels in combination with Laurent	209
2.	General.....	209
3.	Asserted Claims – Engels	210
a.	Claim 1.....	210
b.	Claim 2.....	210
c.	Claim 4.....	210
d.	Claim 5.....	210
e.	Claim 6.....	211
f.	Claim 7.....	211
g.	Claim 9.....	211
h.	Claim 10.....	211



	i.	Claim 15.....	211
	j.	Claim 22.....	212
	k.	Claim 24.....	212
	l.	Claim 25.....	212
4.		Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Cornette	212
	a.	Claim 8.....	212
	b.	Claim 11.....	213
	c.	Claim 13.....	213
	d.	Claim 24.....	213
	e.	Claim 25.....	213
5.		Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Takagi	213
	a.	Claim 8.....	213
	b.	Claim 9.....	214
	c.	Claim 10.....	214
	d.	Claim 11.....	214
	e.	Claim 22.....	214
6.		Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Hein	214
	a.	Claim 15.....	214
	b.	Claim 16.....	215
	c.	Claim 17.....	215
7.		Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Vaissiere	215
	a.	Claim 15.....	215
8.		Asserted Claims – Engels in combination with Laurent.....	215
	a.	Claim 16.....	215
	b.	Claim 17.....	216
E.		Grounds Based on Passat	216
	1.	Background	216
	2.	General	216
	3.	Asserted Claims – Passat 1049	217
	a.	Claim 1.....	217
	b.	Claim 2.....	217
	c.	Claim 4.....	217
	d.	Claim 5.....	218



e.	Claim 6.....	218
f.	Claim 7.....	218
g.	Claim 8.....	218
h.	Claim 9.....	218
i.	Claim 10.....	218
j.	Claim 11.....	218
k.	Claim 13.....	219
l.	Claim 15.....	219
m.	Claim 16.....	219
n.	Claim 17.....	219
o.	Claim 22.....	219
p.	Claim 24.....	220
F.	Grounds Based on Lachmann	220
1.	There is no motivation to combine	220
a.	Lachmann in combination with Cornette.....	220
b.	Lachmann in combination with Vaissiere.....	220
c.	Lachmann in combination with Laurent	221
2.	General.....	221
3.	Asserted Claims – Lachmann	222
a.	Claim 1.....	222
b.	Claim 2.....	222
c.	Claim 6.....	222
d.	Claim 7.....	222
e.	Claim 8.....	222
f.	Claim 9.....	222
g.	Claim 10.....	223
h.	Claim 11.....	223
i.	Claim 13.....	223
j.	Claim 15.....	223
k.	Claim 22.....	224
l.	Claim 24.....	224
m.	Claim 25.....	225
4.	Asserted Claims – Lachmann in combination with Cornette	225

	a.	Claim 4.....	225
	b.	Claim 5.....	226
5.		Asserted Claims – Lachmann in combination with Vaissiere	226
	a.	Claim 15.....	226
6.		Asserted Claims – Lachmann in combination with Laurent.....	226
	a.	Claim 16.....	226
	b.	Claim 17.....	226
XI.		THE ASSERTED PATENTS ARE NOT INVALID BASED ON A “PREFERRED HOT STAMPING PROCESS” OR “TECHNICAL DOMESTIC INDUSTRY”	227
XII.		SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS.....	231
XIII.		THE CLAIMS COVER WHAT THE INVENTOR REGARDS AS THE INVENTION.....	235
XIV.		DEFINITENESS.....	238
	A.	The Asserted Patents Inform a POSITA About the Scope of the Term “Layer” with Reasonable Certainty	239
	B.	The Asserted Patents Inform a POSITA About the Scope of the Term “Level” with Reasonable Certainty	246
XV.		THE ASSERTED PATENTS CLAIM A USEFUL INVENTION	248
XVI.		RESERVATION OF RIGHTS	250

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Description
'227	U.S. Patent No. 11,326,227
'602	U.S. Patent No. 10,961,602
Cornette	Cornette et al., "High Strength Steels for Automotive Safety Parts," SAE Technical Paper Series 2001-01-0078 (2001)
Engels	Engels et al., "Controlling and monitoring of the Hot-Stamping Process of Boron-Alloyed Heat-Treated Steels" (May 9, 2006)
GMW14400	GMW14400 Material Specification
Hein	Hein et al., "Hot Stamping of USIBOR 1500 P: Part and Process Analysis Based on Numerical Simulation" (May 9, 2006)
Lachmann	Carsten Lachmann, "Developments of High-Strength Sheet Steel Qualities and Joining Technology Aspects for Use in Automobiles" (2005)
Laurent	U.S. Patent No. 6,296,805
Maki	Japanese Patent Publication No. JP/2004/244704
Nishibata	U.S. Patent Publication No. 2006/0185774
POSITA	Person of ordinary skill in the art
Suehiro II	Suehiro et al., "Properties of Aluminum-Coated Steels for Hot-Forming" (2003)
Takagi	U.S. Patent Application Publication No. 2004/0009366
Vaissiere	Vaissiere et al., "Development of Pre-Coated Boron Steel for Applications on PSA Peugeot Citroën and RENAULT Bodies in White," SAE Technical Paper Series 2002-01-2048, reprinted from the Proceedings of the 2002 SAE International Body Engineering Conference and Automotive & Transportation Technology Conference (2002)
VW Passat	2006 Volkswagen Passat VIN# WVWAK73C66P041049