PATENT

# U.S. District Court [LIVE]
# Western District of Texas (Waco)
# CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 6:24-cv-00143-ADA

Proxense, LLC v. Apple, Inc.
Assigned to: Judge Alan D Albright
Related Cases: 6:23-cv-00319-ADA
6:23-cv-00320-ADA
6:24-cv-00283-ADA
6:24-cv-00302-ADA
Cause: 35:271 Patent Infringement

Date Filed: 03/18/2024
Jury Demand: Both
Nature of Suit: 830 Patent
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Proxense, LLC** represented by

**Brian D. Melton**
Susman Godfrey, LLP
1000 Louisiana St.
Suite 5100
Houston, TX 77002
713-653-7825
Fax: 713-654-6666
Email: bmelton@susmangodfrey.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lear Jiang**
Susman Godfrey L.L.P
1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 789-3100
Fax: (310) 789-3150
Email: ljiang@susmangodfrey.com
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**David L. Hecht**
Hecht Partners LLP
125 Park Avenue, 25th Floor
New York, NY 10017
(212) 851-6821
Fax: (646) 492-5111
Email: dhecht@hechtpartners.com
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Apple, Inc.** represented by

**Benjamin Yaghoubian**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
2000 Avenue Of The Stars, Ste. 400, N. Tower
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 595-3160
Fax: (310) 595-3360
Email: benjamin.yaghoubian@us.dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Erin P. Gibson**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Drive, Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92121-2133
858-677-1400
Fax: 858-677-1401
Email: erin.gibson@us.dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jessica Hannah**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
555 Mission Street, Suite 2400
San Francisco, CA 94105
415-836-2570
Fax: 415-659-7370
Email: jessica.hannah@us.dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Martin M. Ellison**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
2000 Avenue Of The Stars, Suite 400 N. Tower
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 595-3000
Fax: (310) 595-3300
Email: martin.ellison@us.dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Nandan R. Padmanabhan**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
2000 Avenue Of The Stars, Suite 400 North Tower
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 595-3082
Fax: (310) 595-3482
Email: nandan.padmanabhan@dlapiper.com

*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Peter Maggiore**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Dr., Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92121
(619) 699-2700
Fax: (619) 699-2701
Email: peter.maggiore@us.dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Robert Williams**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Drive, Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92121
858-677-1400
Fax: 858-677-1401
Email: robert.williams@us.dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean C. Cunningham**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Drive, Ste 1100
San Diego, CA 92121
858-677-1400
Fax: 858-677-1401
Email: sean.cunningham@dlapiper.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY*
*PRO HAC VICE*
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ahimsa E. Hodari**
DLA Piper LLP US
845 Texas Avenue, Suite 3800
Houston, TX 77002
713-425-8486
Fax: 713-300-6086
Email: ahimsa.hodari@us.dlapiper.com
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**John Michael Guaragna**
DLA Piper LLP (US)
303 Colorado Street
Suite 3000
Austin, TX 78701
(512) 457-7125
Fax: 512/457-7001
Email: john.guaragna@dlapiper.com


APPLE 1027

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Michael Saulnier**
DLA Piper LLP US
303 Colorado Street, Suite 3000
Austin, TX 78701-4653
512-457-7234
Fax: 512-721-2255
Email: michael.saulnier@us.dlapiper.com
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text |
|---|---|---|
| 03/18/2024 | 1 | COMPLAINT ( Filing fee $ 405 receipt number ATXWDC-18543098), filed by Proxense, LLC. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - U.S. Patent No. 9,298,905, # 2 Exhibit 2 - U.S. Patent No. 8,352,730, # 3 Exhibit 3 - U.S. Patent No. 8,886,954, # 4 Exhibit 4 - U.S. Patent No. 10,698,989, # 5 Exhibit 5 - U.S. Patent No. 9,049,188, # 6 Exhibit 6 - U.S. Patent No. 8,646,042, # 7 Exhibit 7 - Article, # 8 Exhibit 8 - Article, # 9 Exhibit 9 - Webpage, # 10 Exhibit 10 - Article, # 11 Exhibit 11 - Linkedin Page, # 12 Exhibit 12 - Linkedin Page, # 13 Exhibit 13 - Linkedin Page, # 14 Exhibit 14 - Article, # 15 Exhibit 15 - Webpage, # 16 Exhibit 16 - Webpage, # 17 Exhibit 17- Webpage, # 18 Exhibit 18 - Webpage, # 19 Exhibit 19 - Webpage, # 20 Exhibit 20 - Webpage, # 21 Exhibit 21 - Article, # 22 Exhibit 22 - Webpage, # 23 Exhibit 23 - Webpage, # 24 Exhibit 24 - Webpage, # 25 Exhibit 25 - Article, # 26 Exhibit 26 - Article, # 27 Exhibit 27 - Article, # 28 Exhibit 28 - Webpage, # 29 Exhibit 29 - Webpage, # 30 Exhibit 30 - Webpage, # 31 Exhibit 31 - Apple Platform Security Document, # 32 Exhibit 32 - Webpage, # 33 Exhibit 33 - Webpage, # 34 Exhibit 34 - EMV Payment Tokenization Primer Document, # 35 Exhibit 35 - Webpage, # 36 Exhibit 36 - Webpage, # 37 Exhibit 37 - Webpage, # 38 Exhibit 38 - Webpage, # 39 Exhibit 39 - Letter, # 40 Civil Cover Sheet)(Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/18/2024) |
| 03/18/2024 | 2 | Notice of Filing of Patent/Trademark Form (AO 120). AO 120 forwarded to the Director of the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/18/2024) |
| 03/18/2024 | 3 | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/18/2024) |
| 03/18/2024 | | Case directly assigned because of related cases to Judge Alan D Albright. CM WILL NOW REFLECT THE JUDGE INITIALS AS PART OF THE CASE NUMBER. PLEASE APPEND THESE JUDGE INITIALS TO THE CASE NUMBER ON EACH DOCUMENT THAT YOU FILE IN THIS CASE. (lad) (Entered: 03/19/2024) |
| 03/19/2024 | 4 | Summons Issued as to Apple, Inc.. (lad) (Entered: 03/19/2024) |
| 03/26/2024 | 5 | SUMMONS Returned Executed by Proxense, LLC. Apple, Inc. served on 3/21/2024, answer due 4/11/2024. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/26/2024) |
| 04/08/2024 | 6 | NOTICE *of Unopposed Extension of Deadline to Answer or Otherwise Respond* by Apple, Inc. re 1 Complaint,,,,, (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/08/2024) |
| 04/08/2024 | | Reset Deadlines: Apple, Inc. answer due 5/28/2024. (lad) (Entered: 05/17/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 7 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Sean C. Cunningham* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18666950) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 8 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Erin P. Gibson* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number BTXWDC-18667071) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | | John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 9 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Robert Williams* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667265) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 10 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Benjamin Yaghoubian* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667313) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 11 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Nandan R. Padmanabhan* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number CTXWDC-18667354) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 12 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Peter Maggiore* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667405) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 13 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Jessica Hannah* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667446) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/18/2024 | 14 | MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Martin M. Ellison* ( Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667478) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 15 | ORDER GRANTING 7 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Sean C. Cunningham. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 16 | ORDER GRANTING 8 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Erin P. Gibson. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 17 | ORDER GRANTING 9 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Robert Williams. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 18 | ORDER GRANTING 10 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Benjamin Yaghoubian. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 19 | ORDER GRANTING 11 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Nandan R. Padmanabhan. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | | Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 20 | ORDER GRANTING 12 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Peter Maggiore. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 21 | ORDER GRANTING 13 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Jessica Hannah. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/19/2024 | 22 | ORDER GRANTING 14 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Martin M. Ellison. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024) |
| 04/26/2024 | 23 | NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Brian D. Melton on behalf of Proxense, LLC. Attorney Brian D. Melton added to party Proxense, LLC(pty:pla) (Melton, Brian) (Entered: 04/26/2024) |
| 05/28/2024 | 24 | ANSWER to 1 Complaint,,,,, with Jury Demand by Apple, Inc..(Guaragna, John) (Entered: 05/28/2024) |
| 05/28/2024 | 25 | RULE 7 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT filed by Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 05/28/2024) |
| 05/31/2024 | 26 | NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Lear Jiang on behalf of Proxense, LLC. Attorney Lear Jiang added to party Proxense, LLC(pty:pla) (Jiang, Lear) (Entered: 05/31/2024) |
| 06/04/2024 | 27 | STATUS REPORT *as to Case Readiness* by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 06/04/2024) |
| 07/02/2024 | 28 | Joint MOTION for Entry of Scheduling Order Deadlines by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 07/02/2024) |
| 07/03/2024 | 29 | ORDER GRANTING 28 Motion for Entry of Scheduling Order. Markman Hearing set for 11/26/2024 09:00 AM before Judge Alan D Albright, Joinder of Parties due by 1/7/2025, Amended Pleadings due by 3/18/2025, Dispositive/Daubert Motions due by 9/2/2025, Consent to Trial by Magistrate due by 9/2/2025, Pretrial Conference set for 11/4/2025 before Judge Alan D Albright, Jury Selection set for 12/8/2025 before Judge Derek T. Gilliland, Jury Trial set for 12/8/2025 before Judge Alan D Albright. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (lad) (Entered: 07/03/2024) |
| 07/12/2024 | 30 | Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. (Attachments: # 1 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 2 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 3 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 4 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 5 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 6 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 7 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 8 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| | | SEALED DOCUMENT, # 9 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 10 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 11 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 12 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 13 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 14 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 15 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 16 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 17 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 18 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 19 Proposed Order SEALED DOCUMENT) (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/12/2024) |
| 07/12/2024 | 31 | ATTACHMENT *(Non-Confidential Exhibits)* to 30 Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. by Apple, Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Exhibit 7, # 8 Exhibit 8, # 9 Exhibit 9, # 10 Exhibit 10, # 11 Exhibit 11, # 12 Exhibit 12, # 13 Exhibit 13, # 14 Exhibit 14, # 15 Exhibit 15, # 16 Exhibit 16, # 17 Exhibit 17, # 18 Exhibit 18, # 19 Exhibit 19, # 20 Exhibit 20, # 21 Exhibit 21, # 22 Exhibit 22, # 23 Exhibit 23)(Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/12/2024) |
| 07/19/2024 | 32 | MOTION to Transfer Case *Redacted* by Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/19/2024) |
| 07/22/2024 | | DEFICIENCY NOTICE: re 32 MOTION to Transfer Case *Redacted*. As 32 is simply the redacted copy of active sealed motion 30 , it should be filed using the "Redacted Copy" event. Please refile. (lad) (Entered: 07/22/2024) |
| 07/22/2024 | 33 | Redacted Copy of 30 Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. by Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/22/2024) |
| 08/20/2024 | 34 | NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Ahimsa E. Hodari on behalf of Apple, Inc.. Attorney Ahimsa E. Hodari added to party Apple, Inc.(pty:dft) (Hodari, Ahimsa) (Entered: 08/20/2024) |
| 08/20/2024 | 35 | NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Michael Saulnier on behalf of Apple, Inc.. Attorney Michael Saulnier added to party Apple, Inc.(pty:dft) (Saulnier, Michael) (Entered: 08/20/2024) |

---


| PACER Service Center | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| Transaction Receipt | | | |
| 09/12/2024 09:58:37 | | | |
| **PACER Login:** | duanemorris | **Client Code:** | 99999-00092 |
| **Description:** | Docket Report | **Search Criteria:** | 6:24-cv-00143-ADA |
| **Billable Pages:** | 6 | **Cost:** | 0.60 |




APPLE 1027