PATENT

U.S. District Court [LIVE]
Western District of Texas (Waco)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 6:24-cv-00143-ADA

Proxense, LLC v. Apple, Inc.
Assigned to: Judge Alan D Albright
Related Cases: 6:23-cv-00319-ADA
6:23-cv-00320-ADA
6:24-cv-00283-ADA
6:24-cv-00302-ADA
Cause: 35:271 Patent Infringement

Date Filed: 03/18/2024
Jury Demand: Both
Nature of Suit: 830 Patent
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Proxense, LLC represented by **Brian D. Melton**
Susman Godfrey, LLP
1000 Louisiana St.
Suite 5100
Houston, TX 77002
713-653-7825
Fax: 713-654-6666
Email: bmelton@susmangodfrey.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Geoffrey L. Harrison
Susman & Godfrey, L.L.P.
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100
Houston, TX 77002-5096
(713) 653-7807
Email: gharrison@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lear Jiang
Susman Godfrey L.L.P
1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 789-3100
Fax: (310) 789-3150
Email: ljiang@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Meng Xi
Susman Godfrey LLP
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 5100
Houston, TX 77002
(713) 655-7851
Fax: (713) 654-6666

APPLE 1023

Email: mxi@susmangodfrey.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David L. Hecht
Hecht Partners LLP
125 Park Avenue, 25th Floor
New York, NY 10017
(212) 851-6821
Fax: (646) 492-5111
Email: dhecht@hechtpartners.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Apple, Inc. represented by

Benjamin Yaghoubian
DLA Piper LLP (US)
2000 Avenue Of The Stars, Ste. 400, N. Tower
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 595-3160
Fax: (310) 595-3360
Email: benjamin.yaghoubian@us.dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Erin P. Gibson
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Drive, Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92121-2133
858-677-1400
Fax: 858-677-1401
Email: erin.gibson@us.dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jessica Hannah
DLA Piper LLP (US)
555 Mission Street, Suite 2400
San Francisco, CA 94105
415-836-2570
Fax: 415-659-7370
Email: jessica.hannah@us.dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martin M. Ellison
DLA Piper LLP (US)
2000 Avenue Of The Stars, Suite 400 N.

APPLE 1023

Tower
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 595-3000
Fax: (310) 595-3300
Email: martin.ellison@us.dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nandan R. Padmanabhan
DLA Piper LLP (US)
2000 Avenue Of The Stars, Suite 400 North Tower
Los Angeles, CA 90067
(310) 595-3082
Fax: (310) 595-3482
Email: nandan.padmanabhan@dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Peter Maggiore
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Dr., Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92121
(619) 699-2700
Fax: (619) 699-2701
Email: peter.maggiore@us.dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Williams
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Drive, Suite 1100
San Diego, CA 92121
858-677-1400
Fax: 858-677-1401
Email: robert.williams@us.dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sean C. Cunningham
DLA Piper LLP (US)
4365 Executive Drive, Ste 1100
San Diego, CA 92121
858-677-1400
Fax: 858-677-1401
Email: sean.cunningham@dlapiper.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ahimsa E. Hodari

APPLE 1023

DLA Piper LLP US
845 Texas Avenue, Suite 3800
Houston, TX 77002
713-425-8486
Fax: 713-300-6086
Email: ahimsa.hodari@us.dlapiper.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Guaragna
DLA Piper LLP (US)
303 Colorado Street
Suite 3000
Austin, TX 78701
(512) 457-7125
Fax: 512/457-7001
Email: john.guaragna@dlapiper.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Saulnier
DLA Piper LLP US
303 Colorado Street, Suite 3000
Austin, TX 78701-4653
512-457-7234
Fax: 512-721-2255
Email: michael.saulnier@us.dlapiper.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
03/18/2024	1	COMPLAINT (Filing fee $ 405 receipt number ATXWDC-18543098), filed by Proxense, LLC. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - U.S. Patent No. 9,298,905, # 2 Exhibit 2 - U.S. Patent No. 8,352,730, # 3 Exhibit 3 - U.S. Patent No. 8,886,954, # 4 Exhibit 4 - U.S. Patent No. 10,698,989, # 5 Exhibit 5 - U.S. Patent No. 9,049,188, # 6 Exhibit 6 - U.S. Patent No. 8,646,042, # 7 Exhibit 7 - Article, # 8 Exhibit 8 - Article, # 9 Exhibit 9 - Webpage, # 10 Exhibit 10 - Article, # 11 Exhibit 11 - Linkedin Page, # 12 Exhibit 12 - Linkedin Page, # 13 Exhibit 13 - Linkedin Page, # 14 Exhibit 14 - Article, # 15 Exhibit 15 - Webpage, # 16 Exhibit 16 - Webpage, # 17 Exhibit 17- Webpage, # 18 Exhibit 18 - Webpage, # 19 Exhibit 19 - Webpage, # 20 Exhibit 20 - Webpage, # 21 Exhibit 21 - Article, # 22 Exhibit 22 - Webpage, # 23 Exhibit 23 - Webpage, # 24 Exhibit 24 - Webpage, # 25 Exhibit 25 - Article, # 26 Exhibit 26 - Article, # 27 Exhibit 27 - Article, # 28 Exhibit 28 - Webpage, # 29 Exhibit 29 - Webpage, # 30 Exhibit 30 - Webpage, # 31 Exhibit 31 - Apple Platform Security Document, # 32 Exhibit 32 - Webpage, # 33 Exhibit 33 - Webpage, # 34 Exhibit 34 - EMV Payment Tokenization Primer Document, # 35 Exhibit 35 - Webpage, # 36 Exhibit 36 - Webpage, # 37 Exhibit 37 - Webpage, # 38 Exhibit 38 - Webpage, # 39 Exhibit 39 - Letter, # 40 Civil Cover Sheet)(Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/18/2024)
03/18/2024	2	Notice of Filing of Patent/Trademark Form (AO 120). AO 120 forwarded to the Director of the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/18/2024)
03/18/2024	3	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/18/2024)
03/18/2024		Case directly assigned because of related cases to Judge Alan D Albright. CM WILL NOW REFLECT THE JUDGE INITIALS AS PART OF THE CASE NUMBER. PLEASE

APPLE 1023

		APPEND THESE JUDGE INITIALS TO THE CASE NUMBER ON EACH DOCUMENT THAT YOU FILE IN THIS CASE. (lad) (Entered: 03/19/2024)
03/19/2024	4	Summons Issued as to Apple, Inc.. (lad) (Entered: 03/19/2024)
03/26/2024	5	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Proxense, LLC. Apple, Inc. served on 3/21/2024, answer due 4/11/2024. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 03/26/2024)
04/08/2024	6	NOTICE *of Unopposed Extension of Deadline to Answer or Otherwise Respond* by Apple, Inc. re 1 Complaint,,,,, (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/08/2024)
04/08/2024		Reset Deadlines: Apple, Inc. answer due 5/28/2024. (lad) (Entered: 05/17/2024)
04/18/2024	7	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Sean C. Cunningham* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18666950) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	8	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Erin P. Gibson* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number BTXWDC-18667071) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	9	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Robert Williams* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667265) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	10	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Benjamin Yaghoubian* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667313) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	11	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Nandan R. Padmanabhan* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number CTXWDC-18667354) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	12	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Peter Maggiore* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667405) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	13	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Jessica Hannah* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667446) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/18/2024	14	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by John Michael Guaragna *for Martin M. Ellison* (Filing fee $ 100 receipt number ATXWDC-18667478) by on behalf of Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 04/18/2024)
04/19/2024	15	ORDER GRANTING 7 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Sean C. Cunningham. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/19/2024	16	ORDER GRANTING 8 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Erin P. Gibson. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)

APPLE 1023

04/19/2024	17	ORDER GRANTING 9 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Robert Williams. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/19/2024	18	ORDER GRANTING 10 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Benjamin Yaghoubian. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/19/2024	19	ORDER GRANTING 11 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Nandan R. Padmanabhan. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/19/2024	20	ORDER GRANTING 12 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Peter Maggiore. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/19/2024	21	ORDER GRANTING 13 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Jessica Hannah. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/19/2024	22	ORDER GRANTING 14 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Attorney Martin M. Ellison. Attorney added for Apple, Inc. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order, **if he/she has not previously done so for a prior case in this District**. Registration is managed by the PACER Service Center. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (bot1) (Entered: 04/19/2024)
04/26/2024	23	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Brian D. Melton on behalf of Proxense, LLC. Attorney Brian D. Melton added to party Proxense, LLC(pty:pla) (Melton, Brian) (Entered: 04/26/2024)
05/28/2024	24	ANSWER to 1 Complaint,,,,, with Jury Demand by Apple, Inc..(Guaragna, John) (Entered: 05/28/2024)
05/28/2024	25	RULE 7 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT filed by Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 05/28/2024)
05/31/2024	26	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Lear Jiang on behalf of Proxense, LLC. Attorney Lear Jiang added to party Proxense, LLC(pty:pla) (Jiang, Lear) (Entered: 05/31/2024)

APPLE 1023

06/04/2024	27	STATUS REPORT *as to Case Readiness* by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 06/04/2024)
07/02/2024	28	Joint MOTION for Entry of Scheduling Order Deadlines by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 07/02/2024)
07/03/2024	29	ORDER GRANTING 28 Motion for Entry of Scheduling Order. Markman Hearing set for 11/26/2024 09:00 AM before Judge Alan D Albright, Joinder of Parties due by 1/7/2025, Amended Pleadings due by 3/18/2025, Dispositive/Daubert Motions due by 9/2/2025, Consent to Trial by Magistrate due by 9/2/2025, Pretrial Conference set for 11/4/2025 before Judge Alan D Albright, Jury Selection set for 12/8/2025 before Judge Derek T. Gilliland, Jury Trial set for 12/8/2025 before Judge Alan D Albright. Signed by Judge Alan D Albright. (lad) (Entered: 07/03/2024)
07/12/2024	30	Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. (Attachments: # 1 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 2 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 3 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 4 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 5 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 6 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 7 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 8 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 9 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 10 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 11 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 12 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 13 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 14 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 15 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 16 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 17 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 18 SEALED DOCUMENT, # 19 Proposed Order SEALED DOCUMENT) (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/12/2024)
07/12/2024	31	ATTACHMENT *(Non-Confidential Exhibits)* to 30 Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. by Apple, Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Exhibit 7, # 8 Exhibit 8, # 9 Exhibit 9, # 10 Exhibit 10, # 11 Exhibit 11, # 12 Exhibit 12, # 13 Exhibit 13, # 14 Exhibit 14, # 15 Exhibit 15, # 16 Exhibit 16, # 17 Exhibit 17, # 18 Exhibit 18, # 19 Exhibit 19, # 20 Exhibit 20, # 21 Exhibit 21, # 22 Exhibit 22, # 23 Exhibit 23)(Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/12/2024)
07/19/2024	32	MOTION to Transfer Case *Redacted* by Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/19/2024)
07/22/2024		DEFICIENCY NOTICE: re 32 MOTION to Transfer Case *Redacted*. As 32 is simply the redacted copy of active sealed motion 30 , it should be filed using the "Redacted Copy" event. Please refile. (lad) (Entered: 07/22/2024)
07/22/2024	33	Redacted Copy of 30 Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. by Apple, Inc.. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 07/22/2024)
08/20/2024	34	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Ahimsa E. Hodari on behalf of Apple, Inc.. Attorney Ahimsa E. Hodari added to party Apple, Inc.(pty:dft) (Hodari, Ahimsa) (Entered: 08/20/2024)
08/20/2024	35	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Michael Saulnier on behalf of Apple, Inc.. Attorney Michael Saulnier added to party Apple, Inc.(pty:dft) (Saulnier, Michael) (Entered: 08/20/2024)
09/20/2024	36	NOTICE *TO EXTEND VENUE DISCOVERY DEADLINES* by Proxense, LLC (Hecht, David) (Entered: 09/20/2024)
09/24/2024	37	NOTICE *of Unopposed Extension of Deadline to File Opening Claim Construction Brief* by Apple, Inc. (Guaragna, John) (Entered: 09/24/2024)

APPLE 1023

09/26/2024	38	Agreed MOTION to Amend/Correct 29 Order on Motion for Entry of Scheduling Order,, , MOTION for Entry of Scheduling Order Deadlines by Apple, Inc.. (Attachments: # 1 Amended Scheduling Order)(Saulnier, Michael) (Entered: 09/26/2024)
09/26/2024		Text Order GRANTING 38 Motion to Amend/Correct Scheduling Order. Noting that the motion is joint, the Court amends the scheduling order to reflect the scheduling order attached as Attachment 1 in ECF No. 38. Entered by Judge Alan D Albright. (This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.) (cblc) (Entered: 09/26/2024)
09/26/2024		Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Amended Pleadings due by 4/29/2025, Consent to Trial by Magistrate due by 10/14/2025, Joinder of Parties due by 2/18/2025, Motions due by 10/14/2025, Jury Selection set for 1/19/2026 before Judge Derek T. Gilliland, Jury Trial set for 1/19/2026 before Judge Alan D Albright, Markman Hearing set for 1/7/2025 09:00 AM before Judge Alan D Albright, Pretrial Conference set for 12/15/2025 before Judge Alan D Albright, (lad) (Entered: 09/26/2024)
10/19/2024	39	Sealed Document: Opposition to Motion to Transfer of 30 Opposed Sealed Motion to Transfer Venue to the Northern District of California Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1404(a) by Apple, Inc. by Proxense, LLC (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of David L. Hecht, # 2 Exhibit 1 - Deposition Excerpts, # 3 Exhibit 2 - Deposition Excerpts, # 4 Exhibit 3 - Deposition Excerpts, # 5 Exhibit 4 - Deposition Excerpts, # 6 Exhibit 5 - Deposition Excerpts, # 7 Exhibit 6 - Deposition Excerpts, # 8 Exhibit 7 - Deposition Excerpts, # 9 Exhibit 8 - Deposition Excerpts, # 10 Exhibit 9 - Deposition Excerpts, # 11 Exhibit 10 - Deposition Excerpts, # 12 Exhibit 11 - Declaration of David Brown, # 13 Exhibit 12 - Statistics, # 14 Exhibit 13 - Brown LinkedIn, # 15 Exhibit 14 - Declaration of John Giobbi, # 16 Exhibit 15 - Chanda LinkedIn, # 17 Exhibit 16 - Sykora LinkedIn, # 18 Exhibit 17 - APL-PROXENSE_01158250, # 19 Exhibit 18 - Declaration of Greg Sueoka) (Hecht, David) (Entered: 10/19/2024)
10/25/2024	40	Redacted Copy *of Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Transfer* of 39 Sealed Document,,,, by Proxense, LLC. (Hecht, David) (Entered: 10/25/2024)
10/28/2024	41	Unopposed MOTION to Amend Complaint by Proxense, LLC. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - First Amended Complaint, # 2 Proposed Order)(Hecht, David) (Entered: 10/28/2024)
10/28/2024	42	Pro Hac Vice Letter to Maxim Price and Yi Wen Wu. (lad) (Entered: 10/28/2024)
10/31/2024		Text Order GRANTING 41 Motion to Amend Complaint entered by Judge Alan D Albright. Noting the early stages of this litigation and the unopposed nature, this motion is GRANTED. (This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.) (cblc) (Entered: 10/31/2024)
10/31/2024	43	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT against Apple, Inc. amending 1 Complaint., filed by Proxense, LLC.(cav) (Entered: 10/31/2024)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

11/01/2024 13:54:38

PACER Login:	duanemorris	**Client Code:**	99999-00091
Description:	Docket Report	**Search Criteria:**	6:24-cv-00143-ADA
Billable Pages:	7	**Cost:**	0.70

APPLE 1023