IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs

D2.0 Ballot Comment Tracker

doc.: IEEE 802.11-17/1682r13

Contents

- Title
- Revision History
- Comments

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1 of 1300

Title

	IEEE P802.11 Wireless LANs							
	Submission							
Designator:	doc.: IEEE 802.11-17/1682r13							
Venue Date:	June 2018							
First Author:	Robert Stacey							
Subject:	Comments on TGax/D2.0							
Full Date:	2018-06-01							
Author(s):	Robert Stacey							
	Company:	Intel						
	Address							
	Phone:							
	Fax:							
	email:	robert.stacey@intel.com						
Abstract:								

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 2 of 1300

Revision History

Revision	Date	Description
0	2017-11-04	Initial export from DB
1	2017-11-08	Part of No Vote corrected. Mostly assigned to initial categorizies.
2	2017-11-09	Addition comment classification and assignment. Around 147 technical remain uncategorized.
3	2017-11-15	Additional assignments. Resolutions drafted and adopted at the November 2017 session
4	2018-01-02	Some editorial resolutions drafted. Some reassignments.
5	2018-01-15	Some reassignements. Created Editorials in D2.1 tab.
6	2018-02-08	Following D2.2 editing
7	2018-02-15	Updates following D2.2 editing review
8	2018-04-11	Following D2.3 editing
9	2018-04-18	With an additional 270 editorials resolved (comment group = "Editorials in D2.3")
10	2018-04-19	With some corrections and reassignments.
11	2018-05-23	All comments have resolutions.
12	2018-05-25	Updated after editing D3.0
13	2018-06-01	Updated after D3.0 review

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 3 of 1300

Comments

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11000	Abhishek Patil	230	2	4.3.14a	37	65	T	Y	37.650001525878906	65	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	1857r2	470	The term 'Multi-BSSID' doesn't exist. Replace it with 'Multiple BSSID operation'	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:49:25Z) Revised Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17/1857r2 under CID 110	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:45:13Z - For consistency with other items in the list, kept the "mandatory support for X feature in YSTA" format (just renaming	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11001	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	10	T	Y	85.099998474211	10	9.3.1.23		V	Chitto Ghosh	11-18/0364r3	638	Random access for unassociated STAs is broken. In case of random access for unassociated STAs (AID12=2045), the most likely case is that an unassociat	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:47:20Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0364r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:33:39Z - Changed MMPDU to Mangement frame	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 4 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11002	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	10	T	Y	85.099998474 1211	10	9.3.1.23		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	Random access procedure is broken as it provides an unfair advantage to certain STAs. For instance, a STA having a strong transmit power to the AP is	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11003	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	47	T	Y	86.470001220 70312	47	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	To avoid any ambiguity with the MU Cascade operation (27.5.4), change the name of Cascade Indication field to something more directed towards operatio	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:18:32Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 11003. Also, please update	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 5 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11004	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	3	T	Y	89.029998779 29688	3	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Reference to Table 28-20 seems incorrect. The cited table doesn't have any information related to padding	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:21:48Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 11004	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11005	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.200	131	1	T	Y	131.00999450 683594	1	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The procedure for indicating validity of a TWT schedule is not well thought through. The mechansim uses 3-bits which can only signal up to 6 beacon in	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:52:29Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11005, see also CID 12036	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11006	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.200	125	15	T	Y	125.15000152 58789	15	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Add Wake TBTT Negotiation = 0 (along with Broadcast = 0) to indicate an Individual TWT	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:54:02Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11006	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 6 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11007	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.200	126	16	T	Y	126.16000366210938	16	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1894r6	508	The name 'Wake TBTT Negotiation' is misleading as the field is used in conjunction with Broadcast subfield to determine if the frame carrying the elem	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:55:02Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11007	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:27:17Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11008	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	42	T	Y	129.41999816 89453	42	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Assuming support on both sides, BQR can be a valid response when TWT Flow Identifier is 1. Same comment applies to the case where TWT Flow Identifier	Include reference to section 27.5.2 for TWT Flow ID = 1 & 2.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:56:08Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11008	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 7 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11009	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	4	T	Y	135.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	Update the text in 'Encoding' column to indicate that value in 'Trigger Frame MAC Padding Duration' applies only to non-AP HE STAs and that it is rese	Replace the text in the 'Encoding' column to: "If the STA is a non-AP STA: Set to 0 to indicate no additional processing time. Set to 1 to indicate	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:46:31Z) Agree with the comment. The row is updated to indicate that the subfield applies only to a non-AP STA and that the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:12:19Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11010	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	4	T	Y	135.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	The definition of 'Trigger Frame MAC Padding Duration' is not clear. What is meant by 'additional amount of time'?	Replace the text in 'Definition' column to: "Indicates the amount of time (defined as MinTrigProcTime in microseconds), from the end of the User Info	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:47:34Z) Agree with the comment. Revised text to provide additional clarification. Also referred to section 275.3.2.2 which	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:12:10Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 8 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11011	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	10	T	Y	135.10000610351562	10	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	105r3	469	With respect to the Multi-TID Aggregation Supported sub field, it doesn't help to know what is the transmitter side capability. Instead this field shou	Change the meaning of this field to indicate receiver side capability - i.e., "Indicates the number of TIDs minus 1 of QoS Data frames that an HE STA	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:34:18Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	see #12379	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11012	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	37	T	Y	135.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.237.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	UMRS Support field applies only to non-APHE STA	Replace the text in the 'Encoding' column to: "If the STA is a non-APSTA and +HTC-HE Support is 1: Set to 1 if the STA supports reception of the UMR	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:49:36Z) Agree with the comment. The row is updated to indicate that the subfield applies only to a non-AP STA and that the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:15:25Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 9 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11013	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	43	T	Y	135.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.237.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	It is up to the non-AP STA whether or not it support (and hence transmits) a frame with BSR A-Control field. As such this (BSR Support) subfield shoul	Replace the text in the 'Encoding' column to: "If the STA is an AP STA and +HTC-HE Support is 1: Set to 1 if the AP supports reception of the UMRS Co	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11014	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	39	T	Y	136.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793t1	603	Maximum A-MPDU Length Exponent subfield is missing Description and Encoding. Create a new section (called "A-MPDU Length Exponent Derivation") which c	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:48:29Z) Revised. Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 10 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11015	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	48	T	Y	136.47999572753906	48	9.4.2.237.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	380r1	555	Flexible TWT Schedule Support applies only if the STA supports one or more of TWT Requester Support or TWT Responder Support or Broadcast TWT Support	Replace text in 'Encoding' column to: "If TWT Responder Support, TWT Requester Support, or Broadcast TWT Support is 1 Set to 1 if the STA supports re	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:13:19Z) Rejected – Reception of a TWT Information frame with a nonzero value in the Next TWT field can also be possible	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 21:05:14Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11016	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	54	T	Y	136.53999328 61328	54	9.4.2.237.2		V	Abhishek Patil	1857r2	470	Rx Control Frame to MultiBSS applies only to non-AP STA. Also the description is incomplete - doesn't mention what it means when the field value is se	Replace text in 'Encoding' column to: "For a non-AP STA: Set to 1 if STA supports receiving a Control frame with TA set to the transmitted BSSID and	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:52:13Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Updated the text in the 'Encoding column TGax editor, please make changes as su	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:56:14Z - Does not clearly differentiate the settings for non-AP and AP. Inappropriate use of "when"; reword to clarify the condi	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 11 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11017	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	4	T	Y	137.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		V	Zhou Lan	369r4	541	BSRP BQRP A-MPDU Aggregation subfield applies only to non-AP STA	Replace text in 'Encoding' column to: "For a non-AP STA: Set to 1 if supported. Set to 0 otherwise. Reserved for an AP"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 02:49:04Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The row is updated to indicate that the sub field applies only to a non-AP STAan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:16:59Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11018	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	27	T	Y	137.27000427 246094	27	9.4.2.237.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0369r4	541	NDP Feedback Report Support subfield applies only to a non-AP STA.	Replace text in 'Encoding' column to: "For a non-AP STA: Set to 1 if supported. Set to 0 otherwise. Reserved for an AP"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:50:40Z) The ability for an AP to advertise its capabilities to support NDP feedback mechanism can be useful for a non-AP S	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:18:38Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 12 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11019	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	33	T	Y	137.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.237.2		V	Guoqing Li	768r5	650	OPS Support subfield applies only if the STA supports Broadcast TWT	Replace text in 'Encoding' column to: "If Broadcast TWT Support subfield is 1 Set to 1 if supported. Set to 0 otherwise. Reserved otherwise."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:17:35Z) Revised – OPS is currently using only the TWT element to determine when the TIM frame is sent. Support on STA or	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11020	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	51	T	Y	137.50999450 683594	51	9.4.2.237.2		J	Liwen Chu		657	Move the contents of the paragraph after Table 9-262z to a separate sub-section. Having a separate section facilitate making a reference from other se	Create a Create a new section called "A-MPDU Length Exponent Derivation" to capture details related to the derivation of the Max A-MPDU Length Exponen	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 13 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11021	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	138	11	T	Y	138.11000061035156	11	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793t1	603	Per baseline 2016 spec, the max value is 3 (not 7) for Maximum A-MPDU Length Exponent in HT Capabilities.	Change the text on P138L11 to: "... then the value in the Maximum A-MPDU Length Exponent subfield in the HT Capabilities element is 3 and the maximum	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:50:08Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11022	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	138	13	T	Y	138.13000488 28125	13	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793r1	603	Instead of reserved, a value of 3 in Maximum A-MPDU Length Exponent subfield can be used to indicate a larger A-MPDU size.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:51:00Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 14 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11023	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.238	149	25	T	Y	149.25	25	9.4.2.238		V	Abhishek Patil	1859r4	543	Since support for Multiple BSSID feature is mandatory for HE non-AP STAs, HE STAs can identify a beacon from transmitted BSSID by following the proced	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 05:11:23Z) Revised Agree with the comment. In a multiple BSSID set, only the transmitted BSSID beacons and carries the Mul	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11742	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11024	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.4.2.238	150	7	T	Y	150.07000732421875	7	9.4.2.238		A	Abhishek Patil	369r4	541	TWT Required subfield applies only to HE STAs that have declared support for TWT (see 27.7.1 P270L60)	Revise the sentence as follows: "The TWT Required subfield is set to 1 to indicate that the AP requires its associated non-AP HE STAs that have declar	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 02:50:27Z) Accept Agree with the comment. Revised text to clarify that TWT Required applies only for the STAs that have in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:32:12Z - Resolution should be revised since the actual change is different from the proposed change.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 15 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11025	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.6.30	167	36	T	Y	167.36000061035156	36	9.6.30		V	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	Incorrect section - Quiet Time Period Action frame is an HE Action frame (see Table 9-421z) and the section should be moved as a subsection under 9.6.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:33:47Z) Revised: Agree with the comment. 9.6.30 is moved to under 9.6.28.3 TGax editor, please make changes as shown i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:22:44Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11026	Abhishek Patil	230	2	9.6.30	167	36	T	Y	167.36000061035156	36	9.6.30		V	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	Provide section reference to the element and remove details about Quiet Time Period element. Also add a statement indicating that the frame does not c	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:34:38Z) Revised: Agree with the comments. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0443r3 under CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	returned		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:23:28Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 16 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11027	Abhishek Patil	230	2	10.43.1	208	62	T	Y	208.61999511 71875	62	10.43.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	337r1	546	A couple of sentences are missing at the beginning of the 2nd paragraph as compared to baseline spec. If the sentences are to be deleted, please indic	Add the missing sentences.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:57:08Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Missing sentences are added. Also added a note to the editor that	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11028	Abhishek Patil	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	36	T	Y	211.36000061 035156	36	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1847r0	483	The MaxBSSID Indicator field is present in the Multiple BSSID element carried in the mgmt frames of transmitted BSSID. There is no need to duplicate t	The paragraph (starting on line 36 on pg 211) should be removed from this section.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:11:45Z) Revised Agree with the comment Please see resolution for CIDs 11023 and 11355 TGax editor, please make changes	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:50:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 17 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11029	Abhishek Patil	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	40	T	Y	211.39999389648438	40	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1847r0	483	Since all non-AP HE STAs are multi-BSS capable, they can identify the TxBSS ID by following the procedure mentioned in this section (11.1.3.8) in the b	Remove the cited paragraph	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:13:28Z) Revised Agree with the comment Please see resolution for CID 11355 TGax editor, please make changes as suggest	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:00:01Z - see #11355	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11030	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	27	T	Y	246.27000427246094	27	27.5.3.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	Usage of MinTrigProcTime doesn't align with its definition in HE Cap.	Remove reference to MinTrigProcTime	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:59:26Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0075r3 under CID 11030	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11031	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.5.3.3	251	1	T	Y	251.00999450683594	1	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17-1857r2	470	Define a new sub-section that specifies the RA rules when responding to a trigger frame. Further, add a paragraph which specifies the RA rules when re	Define a new sub-section "RA Rules when responding to a Trigger frame" and move the content in the 1st paragraph (P251L1) and the note under this new	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:38:51Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17-1857r2 under CID 11031	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #13189	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 18 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11032	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.5.4	256	55	T	Y	256.54998779296875	55	27.5.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	Delete paragraph starting line 55 & 59. The 1st paragraph of this section already covers this.	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:49:18Z) Make changes as in doc 11-18/0707r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11033	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.5.5	257	12	T	Y	257.11999511 71875	12	27.5.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	A UORA STA needs to set the dot11OFDMARandomAccessOptionImlemented to true	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:07:08Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11033	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11034	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	24	T	Y	259.23999023 4375	24	27.5.5.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0360r2	542	The first sentence in this paragraph can be deleted. The language needs to be normative. A note or a sentence may be helpful to clarify reference to '	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:04:34Z) TGax editor, please make changes as showing doc 11-18/0360r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 15:45:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 19 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11035	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.2	272	45	T	Y	272.45001220703125	45	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	Clarify at the beginning of the section that TWT Request frame (TWT Response frame) corresponds to a TWT Setup frame carrying TWT element with Request	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:01:57Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes, clarifying these terms in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11036	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.2	273	37	T	Y	273.36999511 71875	37	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1861R1	473	The note only mentions TA being set to transmitted BSSID which applies only for the case of multiple BSSID. It should also cover a more general case w	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:19:47Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The note was updated to capture the single BSSID case where the TA field is set	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:32:59Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11037	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.3.1	274	24	T	Y	274.23999023 4375	24	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	739r1	608	The 2nd bullet needs to include Trigger sub field = 1 as one of the conditions	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:47:38Z) Revised Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as showing document 11-18/0739r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11038	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	59	T	Y	275.58999633 78906	59	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	The paragraph is missing description of the 'Last Broadcast Parameter Set' subfield. Delete reference to Implicit subfield.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:47:28Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. The Implicit subfield is not present in a broadcast TWT element, as it is used	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 21 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11039	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.3.2	276	8	T	Y	276.07998657 22656	8	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	The spec provides a mechanism to signal when to expect a change to the TWT Parameter set for a particular TWT session (Setup Command = Alternate along	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:48:34Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11040	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	10	T	Y	275.10000610 35156	10	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	662r1	618	Mixing two features into one figure can cause confusion. Update the figure to only show Broadcast TWT. Further, since Wake TBTT Negotiation is a separ	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 03:40:03Z) Revised – The presence of different features in a figure does not necessarily cause confusion, especially when	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 22 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11041	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.7.4.1	284	5	T	Y	284.04998779296875	5	27.7.4.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	Broadcast Reschedule = 1 reschedules all B-TWT schedules - this is too broad. AP/STA should have the ability to pause/resume a single B-TWT session. C	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:41:00Z) Rejected – This is easier said than done. Adding the ability to pause/resume a single B-TWT session would requi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11042	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.11.2	304	48	T	Y	304.48001098 63281	48	27.11.2		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0629r1	613	Replace 'all 1s' with UNSPECIFIED	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:35:49Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0629r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11043	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.11.4	305	14	T	Y	305.14001464 84375	14	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	The 1st sentence of this paragraph is way too long and confusing - consider splitting to multiple sentences to improve readibility	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:51:13Z) Revised- Agree in principle. As requested by the commenter, split the first sentence to multiple sentences. TG	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:08:35Z -	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 23 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11044	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.11.4	305	29	T	Y	305.29000854 49219	29	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	It is not clear from the paragraph that active color can either be the one advertised in HE Operation element or the one advertised in the BSS Color C	Change the paragraph as: "The TXVECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR is set to the active BSS color. The active BSS color is the value carried in the BSS Color	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:55:01Z) Revised- Agree in principle. To improve a readability, makes the sentence to the bullets. TGax editor makesch	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	returned		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11045	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.14.2	313	5	T	Y	313.04998779 296875	5	27.14.2		V	Jeongki Kim	11-17/1849r2	482	Since this section related to power save, the paragraph on unassociated STAs should be moved out of this section - perhaps to section 27.5.5 or to a n	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:14:10Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11045	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 24 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11046	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.14.3.1	313	50	T	Y	313.5	50	27.14.3.1		V	Guoqing Li	90r0	489	Add a sentence to indicate that an HE STA that supports OPS shall set dot11TIMBroadcastImplemented and dot11TIMBroadcastActivated to true and shall hav	Add a paragraph after the 2nd paragraph as follows: "An HE STA that sets the OPS Support subfield in HE Capabilities element to 1 shall: - shall set	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:21:22Z) Revised – An OPS STA can support OPS and not support TIM BC, so OPS STA does not need the dot11TIMBroadcastActiva	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:24:43Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11047	Abhishek Patil	230	2	27.14.3.1	314	15	T	Y	314.14999389 64844	15	27.14.3.1		V	Guoqing Li	90r0	489	What does 'also operates with Broadcast TIM' mean? An OPS AP needs to ensure that it transmits either a FD frame or a TIM frame at the beginning of an	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:22:12Z) Revised – the proposed description is true per the spec right now. The sentence mentioned in the comment is for A	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:25:01Z - see #11046	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 25 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11048	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	55	T	Y	196.55000030517578	55	10.22.2.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	The term "for the 5 GHz band or DIFS interval for an HE STA operating in the 2.4 GHz band " excludes the existing behaviour of an HT STA.	Modify the condition, such as "of duration 1) DIFS if transmitted by an HE STA operating in the 2.4 GHz band or 2) PIFS otherwise" (see my related co	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-07 00:00:36Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change, although pointing	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11049	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.7	197	58	T	Y	197.58000018310547	58	10.22.2.7		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0074r1	484	"A DL MU PPDU may carry MPDUs addressed to multiple recipients" -- unnecessary normative verb. This is clear from the definition of MU. There is no	Change "may" to "can"	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:24:25Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0074r1 under CID 11049	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 26 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11050	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.7	197	61	T	Y	197.61000061035156	61	10.22.2.7		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0074r1	484	"the rules in this subclause apply." What this is really saying is that the rules in the subclause do not apply in certain circumstances. That shoul	Create a clear statement of when the rules in the subclause apply to the top of the sub clause. Delete cited para. For example, consider "The rules	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:25:05Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0074r1 under CID 11050	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11051	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.8	199	48	T	Y	199.47999572753906	48	10.22.2.8		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	40r2	504	"thefragment is not a dynamic fragment" - how is this condition known? Is it a property of the frame?	Replace condition with specific values of specific fields in the frame, or a reference to the sub clause that describes the process of dynamic fragmen	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:31:11Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. A fragment that is generated using the procedure defined in 10.5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 27 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11052	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.8	200	8	T	Y	200.08000018310547	8	10.22.2.8		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0040r2	504	"where these fit within the TXOP limit and it is only the response" -- this is awkward. Use of "where" to establish a condition is something TGmc trie	Reword with indented list: "Transmission of one of the following sequences provided the sequence fits within the TXOP limit and it is only the respo	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:32:37Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0040r2 under all headings that include CID 11052.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11053	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.9	200	25	E	N	200.25	25	10.22.2.9		A			447	"when the MSDU/MMPDU is fragmented into 16 fragments" -- when is about time. The time is not relevant here. We spent time in REVmc making this kind	when -> if	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:06:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:06:39Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 28 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11054	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.9	200	47	E	Y	200.47000122070312	47	10.22.2.9		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"When the Duration field value in the MAC header of an HE TB PPDU is set to 0, the HE TB PPDU shall not include any frames that solicit acontrol respo	"An HE STA that transmites an HE TB PPDU containing a frame in which the Duration field is 0 shall not include in the HE TB PPDU a frame that solicit	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		EDITOR: The subclause on TXOP limits is an odd place to have an A-MPDU content requirement -- essentially a reponse rule. A rule like this belongs in	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11055	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.24	202	30	E	N	202.30000030517578	30	10.24		V			447	"is not greater than the value in the Buffer Size field of the ADDBA Response frame and is not greater than the value 64 if the sender of the ADDBA Re	Replace implicit list with a dashed list of things is is not greater than.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:57:29Z) - Change to read: "If the value in the Buffer Size field of the ADDBA Response frame is smaller than the value	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:58:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11056	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.24.6	202	44	G	Y	202.44 000244 140625	44	10.24.6		V	Tomoko Adachi	733r3	637	"The B2 bit of the BA Type subfield of the BA Control field shall be set to 1" -- this cries out for this bit to be named. Magic numbers in the text	Name bit 2 at the point of definition once, and refer to it here. Name bits 3-4 as a subfield at the point of definition and refer to the name here.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:37:22Z) Revised. In the past there were names for bit 2 and bits 3-4, but there was an agreement to change the encoding	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
11057	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.24.7.5	203	50	G	Y	203.5	50	10.24.7.5		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	" - BitmapLength + 1" -- while the definition of operator logic is unambiguous, it is best to reduce the probability your readers will get it wrong.	Consistently replace 63 with (BitmapLength-1) in this subclause. At the cited location this requires nested parens.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:44:13Z) Rejected - I am not able to see any inconsistency	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:00:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11058	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.24.3	207	52	E	Y	207.52 000427 246094	52	10.24.3		A			447	"HE STAs are assumed to not be capable of carrying" 1. Grammar (to not -> not to) 2. Passive voice 3. Anthropomorphic verb	"HE STAs do not carry"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 22:03:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 22:04:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 30 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11059	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.28.4	208	29	T	Y	208.28999328 61328	29	10.28.4		J	Jarkko Kneckt		657	The change to lower-case the "d" in "QoS Data" is wrong. This is a list of frame names, an QoS Data is one of the named frames in Table 9-1. The ch	Remove the markup leaving "QoS Data".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11060	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.28.4	208	35	E	Y	208.35000610 351562	35	10.28.4		V			447	"and when the RD initiator is an HE STA subject to the additional rules defined" -- the use of "when" as equivalent to "if" has been challenged in REV	Editor is to review all uses of "when" that are equivalent to "if" - i.e. establish a condition without the aspect of time being relevant - and replac	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 23:14:39Z) - Change "when" to "if" at the following locations: P179L37, P182L17, P200L19, P74L62, P78L58, P79L6, P79L17,	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 23:14:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 31 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11061	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.43	209	17	G	Y	209.16999816 89453	17	10.43		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	337r1	546	"Reject TWT transmitted by a responding STAas part of a negotiation for a new TWT agreement is used to indicate that the negotiation has ende	Put the enumeration value in quotes. You might do this consistently for all such names throughout this para. Or reword, with the benefit of removin	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:58:00Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Added quotes as suggested and moved the Reject TWT description at	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11062	Adrian Stephens	230	2	General			E	N			General		V			447	"is used" is a common phrase. Unless followed with "by", it hides the actor. As part of an event->action sentence, it obscures logic by not usin	Review all uses of "is used" and perform one of these actions: 1. Leave alone 2. Simplify to eliminate (e.g. at 79.07 "is used to indicate" -> "ind	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:58:41Z) - At P45L38, change "Set to 0 to indicate that HE single stream pilot HE LTF mode is used" to "Set to 0 to ind	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:36:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 32 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11063	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.4.1.64	114	29	E	Y	114.29000091552734	29	9.4.1.64		V			447	"is used by the ... frame" is incorrect. A frame is not capable of being an actor.	replace with " can be present in the ... frame" Ditto at 115.44	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:45:42Z) - Change the sentence to read: "The HE MU Exclusive Beamforming Report field carries explicit feedback in the f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:46:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11064	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.2.3.17	213	21	G	Y	213.21000671 38672	21	10.2.3.8		J	Guoqing Li		657	Congratulations to the group on upholding the fine tradition of past amendments and not resisting the temptation to add text to an already over-long a	Make it more complex. Embed more logic. Go on, you know you want to. After all - think of the childre n.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 33 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11065	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.2.3.8	213	23	G	Y	213.22999572753906	23	10.2.3.8		J			657	"the STA shall operate as if it received a TIM with its AID bit equal to 1" -- lazy specification	Reference the required behaviour here, i.e. point to the subclause. Even better, update the implied subclause/text describing operation on receipt o	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11066	Adrian Stephens	230	2		213	64	E	N	213.63999938964844	64			V			648	"included to a Beacon frame" -- grammar	to -> in	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:07:46Z) - Fixed with resolutions to other comments. No change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:08:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11067	Adrian Stephens	230	2	11.24.7.5	216	35	T	Y	216.35000610351562	35	11.24.7.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	41r1	505	"An HEAP should not change the value of the PlannedESS subfield within the lifetime of the BSS." -- this is, presumably, known at the time of the st	Change "should" -> "shall"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:43:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:07:00Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 34 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11068	Adrian Stephens	230	2	17.3.9.10	217	15	E	N	217.14999389648438	15	17.3.9.10		A			648	"TRIGGER_RESPONDING is true" -- this is absent for non-HESTAs. This should be allowed for.	Replace with: "TRIGGER_RESPONDING is present and true"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:14:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:14:46Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11069	Adrian Stephens	230	2	17.3.9.10	217	15	T	Y	217.14999389648438	15	17.3.9.10		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0688r0	617	"pre-compensate for carrier frequency offset (CFO) error with respect to the PPDU that carries the soliciting MU-RTS Trigger frame and symbol clocker	Add RXVECTOR parameter to indicate CFO. Add TXVECTOR parameter to control CFO. Add MAC operation description that contains the logic of when and how	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:52:32Z) We note that the cited texts is a counter part of the following texts in 28.3.14.3 Pre-correction accuracy requir	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:36:26Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11070	Adrian Stephens	230	2	17.3.9.10	217	25	T	Y	217.25	25	17.3.9.10		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0688r0	617	"A STA that transmits a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU where the TXVECTOR parameter TRIGGER_RESPONDING is true shall have timing accura	In the PHY, change to accuracy related to TXSTART.request or eliminate this requirement. Add MAC level accuracy requirement when trigger-responding t	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:53:56Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0688r0 under all headings that include CID 13133.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:51:11Z - see #13133	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 35 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11071	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.1	221	12	G	Y	221.11999511 71875	12	27.1		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"except when the functions in Clause 27 supersede the functions in Clause 10 or Clause 11." How do we know when this happens? 229.10: "NOTE 4--The	Describe here the method that indicates that behaviour supersedes an existing clause 10 or clause 11 function. Ensure that that method is used consis	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:48:25Z) Reject. The intention of this paragraph is that the HE STA supports clause 10, 11 and 27, and if there is a con	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11072	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.2.4	223	28	E	Y	223.27999877 929688	28	27.2.4		A			447	"in dense deployment scenarios where a STA" -- wrong conjunction.	where -> in which	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:35:12Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:35:16Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11073	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.2.4	223	33	G	Y	223.33000183 10547	33	27.2.4		V	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	351	"so that the NAV set by an inter-BSS PPDU can be considered the ULMU CS mechanism" -- deeply weird. Who is doing the considering? Either it is the	Replace it with something that makes sense.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:34:44Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. The intention is to describe that virtual CS can indicate busy	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:10Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 36 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11074	Adrian Stephens	230	2		224	59	E	Y	224.58999633789062	59			J			657	"The additional rules of NAV consideration for a STA that is solicited" -- what is NAV consideration.	Replace 'NAV consideration' with 'NAV operation'	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11075	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.2.5	225	8	T	Y	225.08000018310547	8	27.2.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0353r1	531	"permitted to reset the NAV which is updated" - grammatical error creates ambiguity.	Either "which" -> "that" if the following text is part of a condition, otherwise "which" -> ", which".	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:43:19Z) Agree in principle with the comment. We revise “which” with “that”. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:09:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11076	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.2.5.1	225	46	G	Y	225.46000671938672	46	27.2.5.1		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	The figure 27-1 shows an "Other" NAV (CTS). This implies that 3rd parties have decoded the MU CTS response to the AP. In the general case, I don't b	Remove the NAV(CTS) box, or add note about decodability of the uplink MU CTS.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:45:10Z) CTS response to MU-RTS is sent with non-HT PPDU format rather than HE TB PPD format. Further, rules have been des	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11077	Adrian Stephens	230	2		227	35	G	N	227.35000610351562	35	27.2.5.3		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	"The subfields of the Frame Control field of a Control frame are set as illustrated in Figure 9-19. The More Data subfield is set to 0 in a CTS frame (	Remove NOTE.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:46:04Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 11077.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:02:46Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11078	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.3.1	229	33	G	Y	229.33000183 10547	33	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"An HESTA shall follow the fragmentation procedures defined in 10.2.7 Fragmentation/defragmentation overview), 10.5 (Fragmentation), and 10.6 (Defrag	Modify the first statement today "shall follow 10.2.7 ..., except when performing dynamic fragmentation"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:13:24Z) Revised-Agree with comment in principle. Proposed resolution to avoid contradictory. TGax editor please make t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:07:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 38 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11079	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.3.1	229	41	G	Y	229.41000366210938	41	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"These fragments are not allowed to be included in a A-MPDU under HT-immediate block ack agreements" -- it is not clear whether this is intended to be	Replace with " These fragments are not included in a A-MPDU under HT-immediate block ack agreements"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:16:11Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:08:06Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11080	Adrian Stephens	230	2		229	59	G	Y	229.58999633789062	59	27.3.1		A	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"fragment is not required to be the " -- is is unclear whether this is intended to be normative because of the "required" verb	"fragment is not necessarily the "	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:18:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:09:26Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11081	Adrian Stephens	230	2		229	64	E	Y	229.63999938964844	64			V			648	"We call dynamic fragments the fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation" Who is the "we"? This is one context where passive voice shoul	"The fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation are known as dynamic fragments"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:19:30Z) - Fixed with resolution to other comments. No change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:19:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 39 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11082	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	24	G	Y	230.24000549316406	24	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"have explicitly failed" -- this is surprising until the list below is encountered.	Add "(see below for definition of this term)", or move the definition of explicit failure above its reference.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:26:55Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:00:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11083	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.3.2.2	230	49	G	Y	230.49000549316406	49	27.3.2.2		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"the conditions in the subclauses below" -- lazy & dangerous specification	List the subclauses rather than "below".	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:35:27Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution provides the specific subclauses TGax editor please make the c	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:53:23Z - Removed parenthasis around "that is not in an A-MPDU" because this is a condition on MPDU	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 40 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11084	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.3.3.2	233	55	T	Y	233.55000305 17578	55	27.3.3.2		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"The comparison of the two values is performed modulo 4096" -- this is not sufficient - i.e., the modulo 4096 values are not compared. The baseline	Insert "circular" before "modulo". Optionally, add "i.e., the sequence number spaceis considered divided into two parts, one of which is "old" and one	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:31:55Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11085	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.1	234	49	E	Y	234.49000549 316406	49	27.4.1		V			447	"Multi-STA BlockAckReq (MU-BAR)" Briefly - Why is the abbreviation not an abbreviated form of the phrase is it supposed to be an abbreviation of?	Change one of them to match the other.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:41:15Z) - Change to "MU-BAR Trigger frame" (the correct name for the frame)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:41:51Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 41 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11086	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.1	234	49	T	Y	234.49000549316406	49	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"Support for a Multi-STABlockAckReq (MU-BAR)" -- The other two list items are frames. Is this?	Add "frame" after cited text.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:09:09Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	Fixed with #11085		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11087	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.1	234	57	E	Y	234.57000732421875	57	27.4.1		A			447	"All-Ack, which uses a variant of Multi-STA BlockAck frame to acknowledge all MPDUs in the eliciting PPDU" -- keep the language simple. Also, missing	"All-Ack, which uses a variant of Multi-STA BlockAck frame to acknowledge all of the MPDUs in a PPDU"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:44:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:44:41Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 42 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11088	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.5	235	15	E	N	235.14999389648438	15	27.4.5		V			447	This para is a list of ways to set the Per AID TID field. As such it would benefit from visual structure.	Turn into a list or table.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:55:47Z) - The paragraph deals with two different aspects: the setting of the RA field and the setting of the AID11 fiel	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:56:55Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11089	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.2	236	33	T	Y	236.33000018310547	33	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If all MPDUs in the AMPDU are received successfully, then the recipient may follow the procedure described in the All Ack context. Otherwise,	Replace second sentence with "Otherwise, the recipient shall follow ..." Also, I'm not convinced that the "may generate a Multi-STA BlockAck frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:09:52Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 43 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11090	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.3	238	7	E	Y	238.07000732421875	7	27.4.3		V			447	This section uses, without defining, a convention related to square brackets.	You might consider one of the following, although I'm sure there are other ways to skin this particular cat: Define the convention here, or (better)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:15:12Z) - see #12693	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:15:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11091	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.3	238	58	T	Y	238.58000183 10547	58	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"NOTE--An HESTA can generate a BlockAck frame with variable length Block Ack Bitmap field in which case the STA ensures that the BlockAck frame respo	If this behavior is intended, add reference to normative text that describes this behavior. Alternatively remove NOTE.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:14:02Z) Revised - The TXOP holder is expected to adjust the PPDU size budgeting for corresponding Block Ack duration. Th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:26:19Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 44 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11092	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	6	G	Y	239.05999755859375	6	27.4.4.1		V	Yusuke Tanaka	18/0027r4	554	"sends a PPDU to an intended recipient" This is, of course, to distinguish the PPDU from one sent to an unintended recipient. Also, PPDUs are not add	Replace sentence with: "A STA that transmits a PPDU can solicit different immediate responses to the frames the PPDU contains by using the Ack Policy	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:33:42Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:50:25Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11093	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	14	E	N	241.13999938964844	14	27.4.4.6		A			447	List formatting of a single bullet is nugatory.	Remove Level 1 bullets and promote the others.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:57:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:57:55Z - see #12830	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11094	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.2	243	10	E	N	243.10000610351562	10	27.5.2		A			447	"eement" -- speling	"element" Suggest spell checking the entire document.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:00:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:00:31Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11095	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.2	243	64	G	Y	243.63999938964844	64	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	" the response A-MPDU shall contain MPDUs in the order described in Table 9-428 (A-MPDU contents MPDUs in the control response context)." -- there is	Turn into a NOTE and remove normative language.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 45 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11096	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	7	G	Y	244.07000732421875	7	27.5.3.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	" Non-AP HE STAs shall attempt to transmit" - how does "shall attempt" differ from " shall"?	Remove the word "attempt", or define what comprises an attempt.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:48:57Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0546r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:17:38Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11097	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	53	T	Y	244.52999877929688	53	27.5.3.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	"An HE AP shall finish configuration to its receiver module withthe parameters of TRIGVECTOR" -- There is no such thing as a receiver module.	Replace with a requirement in terms of PHY service primitives.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:25:06Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:31:44Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11098	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	246	6	G	Y	246.05999755859375	6	27.5.3.2.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"then the AP is recommended not to allocate 26-tone RU" -- this is a 'should'	Either delete note, or replace 'is recommended not to' with ' should not' and remove 'NOTE--' and promote to body text.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:47:52Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 11098 in 11-18/0807r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:47:29Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 46 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11099	Adrian Stephens	230	2		246	13	E	Y	246.13000048828125	13			J			657	"shall ensure" -- this language has caused issues in the past in REVmc. IEEE-SA editors are sensitive to "ensure" because it appears to provide a pr	Reword sentence as a constraint on the duration of the following PPDU. Ditto at line 23.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11100	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	247	32	G	N	247.32000732421875	32	27.5.3.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	This para is lousy with magic numbers. Magic numbers are inherently evil because: 1. They obscure the meaning of the value 2. They are occasionally w	De-louse	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:59:54Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0075r1 under CID 11100	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:37:23Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11101	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.2.4	250	30	G	Y	250.30000030517578	30	27.5.3.2.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	"parameter is set based on NSYM" -- lazy specification.	Add an equation or reference to a clause where the relationship is defined.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:32:04Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:03:12Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 47 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11102	Adrian Stephens	230	2		250	57	E	N	250.57000732421875	57			J			657	"4x HE-LTF" - these need to be multiply symbols.	Scrub draft for <digit>x and replace with <digit><space><multiply-symbol> where appropriate.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11103	Adrian Stephens	230	2		250	65	G	N	250.64999389648438	65	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	"is assumed to be 0" -- 1. passive voice 2. Anthopomorthic verb	Reword to avoid both of these evils.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:33:47Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:07:35Z- The resolution in 18/741r3 keeps the passive voice. Modifiy so that the actor is identified: "An HESTA transmitting an	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11104	Adrian Stephens	230	2	G.5	595	52	T	Y	595.52001953125	52	G.5		J			657	The annex G changes are incomplete. "dl-mu-sequence| ul-mu-sequence| cascading-mu-sequence" - these three terms are undefined. Also the purpose of the	Add definition for these non-terminals. Also remove the italics, which is reserved for attributes, not non-terminals. Add <non-terminal-name> t	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 48 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11105	Adrian Stephens	230	2	Editorial Notes	27	52	E	N	27.520000457763672	52	Editorial Notes		J			447	You might want to note that the Editorial Notes will be removed prior to publication. You might also consider moving them to the front matter, as the	As in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:35:18Z) - There is a statement at P27L52: "They will be removed before publication."	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EEDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:35:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11106	Adrian Stephens	230	2	Frontmatter	1	1	E	N	1.0099999904632568	1	Frontmatter		A			447	I don't think you need the list of dependencies and their version numbers in two places (page 1 and page 27), unless you are doing something clever w	Remove one of them.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:56:06Z) - Remove the statement on P27	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:56:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 49 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11107	Adrian Stephens	230	2	4.3.14a	37	16	G	Y	37.159999847 41211	16	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"In the 5 GHz band, the following apply: -- An HE STA is also a VHT STA -- An HE STA shall support operation in 20 MHz channel width" But a VHT STA i	Remove second dash item	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:37:07Z) Revised. The support of 20 MHz is mandatory for all HE STAs. Revised to add some clarification. TGax editor to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:45:15Z - No specific edits in 705r4 associated with the CID. Seems to be resolved with #11956	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11108	Adrian Stephens	230	2	4.3.14a	37	21	T	Y	37.209999084 472656	21	4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	604	"An HE STA shall support operation in 40 MHz and 80 MHz channel width unless the STA indicates that it only supports 20 MHz channel width" But an HE S	Do one of the following: 1. Make HE a strict superset of VHT operation - i.e. remove the 20 MHz-only mode. 2. Alternatively remove the inheritance of	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:38:46Z) Reject. Spec has specified rules how 20 MHz-only STA report its capability and how OMN is used to notify the pee	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 50 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11109	Adrian Stephens	230	2	6.3.11.2.3	42	20	G	Y	42.20000076293945	20	6.3.11.2.3		A	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	"The additional HE capabilities to be advertised for the BSS" - no they are not capabilities, but parameters that determine the operation of the HE	Replace with "Provides additional information for operating the HE BSS." - this follows the VHT language.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:24:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:29:58Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11110	Adrian Stephens	230	2	6.3.27.3.2	42	50	G	Y	42.5	50	6.3.27.3.2		V	Jae Seung		648	You might want to check with TGmd, but I believe they are about to obsolete DLS. I suspect DLS won't work without changes to 11.7, which are absent.	Don't update any DLS material, except to add a statement (e.g. in 11.7) to deny use of DLS by an HE STA.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:21:32Z) - DLS is obselete. Remove the changes to 6.3.27 and 9.6.4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:22:10Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11111	Adrian Stephens	230	2	11.23.1	214	48	T	Y	214.47999572753906	48	11.23.1		J	Liwen Chu		657	I don't believe the addition of a single sentence enables HE use of TDLS. And this line says "The HE Operation element shall be present" but says noth	Specify the contents of this element - is it that of the AP the STA is associated with? Specify the interaction of the TDLS off-channel and wider than	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11112	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.3.1.9	77	10	G	Y	77.099998474121 1	10	9.3.1.9		V	Tomoko Adachi	734r1	628	The BA Type is a field that holds an integer. The 802.11 style for the definition of such fields (with the exception of grandfathered fields) is to s	Remove "(B1 . . B4)". Replace 0000 with 0, Replace 0001 with 8, replace 0010 with 4, and so on. You might also consider reordering the rows to mat	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:22:18Z) Revised. Agree in principle with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc.s 11-18/0733r3 and	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 20:57:50Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 52 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11113	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.3.1.9	77	51	G	Y	77.51000213623047	51	9.3.1.9		V	Tomoko Adachi	734r1	628	"A GCR BlockAck frame is sent in response to a GCR BlockAckReq frame and a GLK-GCR BlockAck frame is sent in response to a GLK-GCR BlockAckReq frame"	Move to clause 10.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:23:19Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0734r1. The part being commented on is changed to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 20:57:57Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11114	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.3.1.9.3	78	25	G	Y	78.25	25	9.3.1.9.3		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	The Fragment Number subfield clearly doesn't hold a fragment number. It holds a fragmentation level and a length indication. Naming should follow pu	Rename the field in the generic description to something that encompasses this new function. Consider defining new named subfields of this renamed fie	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:06:14Z) Rejected. The Fragment Number subfield of a Block Ack frame is the same with that of a Block AckReq frame. By cha	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:15:50Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 53 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11115	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	19	G	Y	80.19000244140625	19	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"when the AID11 subfield is not 2045" -- UGH. This is repeated over and over again. It is defining a new mode or structure without naming it.	Define a named mode or structure equivalent to "when the AID11 subfield is not 2045" and use that name consistently throughout.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:46:04Z) Rejected. There are only 4 occurrences.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR
11116	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.3.1.20	83	9	E	N	83.08999633789062	9	9.3.1.20		V			447	"VHT/HE NDP Announcement frame format" -- there is no such frame.	Change to "VHT NDP Announcement frame and HE NDP Announcement frame formats"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 21:38:01Z) - Change the name of the frame in Table 9-1 to "VHT/HE NDP Announcement frame" Insert a new paragraph at the b	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 21:45:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 54 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11117	Adrian Stephens	230	2		83	14	G	Y	83.13999938964844	14			V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	"The HE NDP Announcement uses the same Frame Control subtype as the VHT NDP Announcement." As stated, this should be reflected in Table 9-1, but is n	Define common structure in 93.1.20. Add new levels for VHT variant VHT NDP Announcement frame and HE variant VHT NDP Announcement frame. Review all u	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:38:35Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 11117.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11118	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	13	G	Y	85.12999725341797	13	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	"The HE TB PPDU transmission starts SIFS after the PPDU that carries the Trigger frame." - this is not frame format	If cited text does not occur anywhere else, move cited text to clause 10. Otherwise delete it.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:16:00Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 11118	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11119	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9 Generally	62	14	G	Y	62.13999938964844	14	9 Generally		J			657	There are 9 instances of "shall" in clause 9, and 14 instances of "may".	Replace with declarative language if possible. If not possible, move text to clause 10 or 27.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 55 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11120	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.4.1.53	105	4	G	Y	105.04000091552734	4	9.4.1.53		J			657	" When the STA that transmits the Operating Control field (STA1) and the receiver of the Operating Control field (STA2) are not both HE STAs, " --thi	Replace with a condition based on the contents of the field in question.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11121	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.4.1.63	110	4	E	N	110.04000091552734	4	9.4.1.63		A			447	I spotted the deliberate editorial mistake to see if I was paying attention.	Make the "i" in the where inequality italic.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:36:10Z) - There are a few others that you didn't spot but since I fixed them you won't be able to spot them	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:36:31Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11122	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.4.2.139	123	5	E	N	123.05000305175781	5	9.4.2.139		A			447	This long dashed list is hard to read	Restructure as a table with a column for value, and a column each for meaning in Request and Response frames.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:29:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:29:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 56 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11123	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.4.2.200	124	56	G	Y	124.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	"when the Broadcast subfield is 1" -- this repeated condition begs for a name.	Describe format in two named variants and define condition that selects the variants. Perhaps as new 9.4.2.200.1 and 9.4.2.200.2 subclauses.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:57:08Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11123	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11124	Adrian Stephens	230	2		126	26	E	N	126.26000213623047	26			A			447	"(B4 from "Reserved" to "Trigger")" is both incomplete and unnecessary.	Delete cited text.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:38:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:38:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11125	Adrian Stephens	230	2		137	62	E	N	137.61999511 71875	62			A			447	The superscripted text needs more space above it.	Set framemaker paragraph style to auto line spacing. Also next para.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:57:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:58:00Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11126	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.4.2.237	149	22	E	N	149.22000122070312	22	9.4.2.237		V			447	"up to the next integer number of octets" - not what you actually mean. Because if the number of bits is divisible by 8, the "next integer" would ad	State "up to the least integer number of octets", and change "variable" in Figure 9-589co to "0 to 7".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:27:17Z) - Change figure as suggested. Change the sentence to "The number of bits in the PPE Pad field is the least numb	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:27:46Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 57 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11127	Adrian Stephens	230	2		151	40	E	Y	151.39999938 9648438	40			V			447	There is no magic that links the value of the EOCWmin variable with the value of the field of the same name.	Add "where EOCWmin is the value of the EOCWmin subfield". Consider using italics for names representing values, such as EOCWmin and OCWmin.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:37:02Z) - As suggested and using italics for OCWmin. Apply same change to OCWmax.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:37:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11128	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.16.2	321	28	G	N	321.27999877 92969	28	27.16.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	743r2	606	I believe the addition of the concept BSS color creates a new class of coexistence issues that require urgent attention. Specifically - color clash.	Add rules so that both BSS color collision and BSS color clash events are reported. Add a table of sympathetic (i.e. non-clashing) colors, and rules	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:33:23Z) Revised The spec does provide a mechanism for AP/STAs to determine whether there is a color collision and if so,	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 18:17:37Z - Reworded to remove some of the anthropomorphisms (When an HE AP decides) and also to use more appropriate terms (pendin	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 58 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11129	Adrian Stephens	230	2		169	7	G	N	169.07000732421875	7	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	The NOTE is well past its "best before" date - i.e. the relevance of "N" to HE is lost in the mists of time.	Deletable NOTE and reference to it at line 6.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:38:21Z) Revised. Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0425r4 under CID 11129	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11130	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.7.3	173	7	T	Y	173.07000732421875	7	9.7.3		A	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"except HE BSS" is not the converse of "between two HE STAs". It leaves unspecified what happens between a non-HE and an HE STA in an HE BSS.	Change "except HE BSS" to "except between two HE STAs".	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:58:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 59 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11131	Adrian Stephens	230	2		180	36	E	N	180.36000061035156	36			V			648	"TXOP_DURATION which is not set" - grammar	"TXOP_DURATION that is not set"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:34:14Z) - Agree that which should be that. Also, the RX VECTOR is not contained in the PPDU (it is not something sent oo	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:35:38Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11132	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.4	180	51	E	N	180.50999450683594	51	10.3.2.4		J			657	Now that we have two NAV timers, we need a new term, as setting and resetting is not sufficient.	I proposed "up setting" the NAV.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11133	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.4	181	10	E	N	181.10000610351562	10	10.3.2.4		A			447	"if and only if" - as Bill Marshall taught me in 2005, this does not mean what you think it means. "A if and only if B" means A and B are equivalen	Reword, e.g. "TXOP_DURATION if all of the following conditions are met, and shall not update the NAV otherwise: " Likewise line 21. Or you might w	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:20:57Z) - Edit using the first proposed change.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:21:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 60 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11134	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.3	181	41	G	N	181.41000366210938	41	10.3.2.3		A	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	469	"The exact time of updating the NAV is described as follows. " -- this is unnecessary. Also, " as follows" is usually followed by a list.	Delete cited text.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:38:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:46:11Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11135	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.3	181	60	E	Y	181.60000610351562	60	10.3.2.3		A			447	"When an RTS frame is used for the most recent NAV update" -- this is a grammatical error, one that REVmc spent some time fixing. When applies to a	Replace with: " If an RTS frame was used for the most recent NAVupdate". Ditto at line 63.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:23:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:23:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11136	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.10.1	182	14	T	Y	182.13999938964844	14	10.3.2.10.1		A	George Cherian	724r1	636	"VHT MU PPDU or an HE MU PPDU sent by an AP" -- operator precidence. Does "or" bind less strongly than "[that is] sent by an AP"?	Reword to: "that were transmitted by an AP within a VHT MU PPDU or an HE MU PPDU". Or, if only an AP can transmit these PPDU types, remove "sent by	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:02:09Z) Accepted. Delete the phrase "sent by an AP" from the newly added text "HE MU PPDU sent by an AP" at line-14, li	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:24:30Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11137	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.10.3	183	44	E	N	183.44000244140625	44	10.3.2.10.3		A			447	"Specifically, " -- meaningless qualification	Delete cited text	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:37:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:37:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11138	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	183	19	G	N	183.19000244140625	19	10.3.2.10.2		A	George Cherian	724r1	636	The "channel access" part of the figure goes unexplained. Also the level of detail of this and subsequent similar figures differs.	Label the three oblique lines: "EDCA channel access". Ditto the following similar figures. Add SIFS and TXOP labelling to Figure 10-12a.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:04:25Z) Accepted	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:46:26Z- These oblique lines in other figures are variously labeled "Backoff", "Backoff Slots", "Backoff Window", "Contention Win	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11139	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.5	185	39	T	Y	185.38999938964844	39	10.3.5		V	Yongho Seok	726r0	640	"When TXOP duration-based RTS is disabled" -- how is this condition known/established?	Relate this condition to observables, such as device capabilities, or MIB variable values. Ditto at line 41.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:50:07Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0726r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 62 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11140	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.3.5	185	52	G	Y	185.52000427246094	52	10.3.5		V	Yongho Seok	726r0	640	"is exempt from these requirements" - which requirements. The previous para has a single requirement, so presumably it is some unspecified number of	Define which requirements are included in this note, or delete the note.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:58:40Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0726r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11141	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.7.5.1	187	2	E	Y	187.02000427246094	2	10.7.5.1		A			447	"or a non-STBC Beacon frame shall be transmitted in a non-HT PPDU using one of the rates included in the BSSBasicRateSet parameter except for ER Beaco	or a non-STBC Beacon frame that is not an ER beacon (see 10.7.5.8 (Rate selection for ER Beacon frames and group addressed frames)) shall be transmitt	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:01:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:01:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 63 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11142	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.7.10	189	45	E	N	189.44999969482422	45	10.7.10		V			447	" The value 1 of the DCM of an HE PPDU has no influence when deciding the non-HT basic rate for the purpose of determine the rate of the responding fr	Change to a "NOTE--" and move after the lettered list. Or delete cited text.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:13:54Z) - Agree in principle. Move the statement to a NOTE following the paragraph and reword to the less awkward: "NOT	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:15:16Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11143	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.9	190	60	E	N	190.60000610351562	60	10.9		A			447	"A STA for which" -- grammar. REVmc corrected a lot of these misuses, where 'for' is used to establish a condition.	Replace with "A STA that has".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:16:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:16:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11144	Adrian Stephens	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	46	E	N	65.45999908447266	46	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu		648	"which the recommended HE-MCS is intended," -- bingo! This phrase manages to combine two passive verbs (hiding the actor) and an anthropomorphic verb.	Replace at least "intended" with a verb that does not obscure the actor making the decision.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:13:06Z) - Change "is intended" to "applies". Make the same change to similar statement on BW subfield.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:14:07Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 64 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11145	Adrian Stephens	230	2	General			G	Y			General		J			657	There's a lot of "intended". In some contexts this is OK, such as "intended receiver", which can be generally understood as the STA identified by t	In the cited example, change to something like " In order to solicit ..., the AP applies the following rules:" Review the use of "intended" not foll	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11146	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.9	191	20	E	N	191.19999694 82422	20	10.9		V			447	This dashed list is ugly and better represented as a table.	Turn the list into a table.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:31:08Z) - Turn the list into a table and use names rather than integer numbers.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:32:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11147	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.9	191	46	E	Y	191.46000671 38672	46	10.9		V			447	"If an A-Control subfield is present in a frame then it shall contain at least one Control subfield, and the Control subfield shall be present" -- sha	For example, this can be reworded as follows: "An HE STA that transmits a frame containing an A-Control subfield shall include a Control field that in	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:42:36Z) - Agree in principle. Reword the sentence as follows: "An HE STA that transmits a frame containing an A-Control	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:43:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 65 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11148	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.9	191	54	G	Y	191.53999328 61328	54	10.9		A	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	"NOTE--An A-Control field that is present in a frame cannot contain only the Padding subfield" This sounds like reassurance to some individual who wa	Delete cited note.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:26:21Z) Accepted-Agree in principle. Notes should be used to highlight non-obvious consequences.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 18:00:31Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11149	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.12	192	22	T	Y	192.22000122 070312	22	10.12		V	Ming Gan	98r2	477	"If a recipient has not indicatedsupport for the reception of fragmented A-MSDUs," -- this is lazy specification. Exactly what values of what fields	Replace with a reference to specific values of specific fields. Ditto at line 24. Also consider replacing "recipient" with something else, as this i	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:07:52Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggestes change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-08 15:26:11Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 66 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11150	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.13.1	192	60	E	N	192.60000610351562	60	10.13.1		V			447	"with equal value" -- grammar, missing article I dislike "with" used to establish a condition. I would prefer to see "that have an equal value" as I	"that have an equal value".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 20:00:25Z) - Sentence revised with resolution to #13822. Change "with" to "that have"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 20:01:39Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11151	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22	194	2	E	Y	194.02000427246094	2	10.22		V			447	"is the time (in microseconds) defined in the "Encoding" column of Table 9-163 for an HT STA and of Table 9-229 (Subfields of the A-MPDU Parameters su	Take the addition term (multiplication by 2**<variable>) out of the variable list and into the equation at 193.62., for example you might show	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 20:58:16Z) - Change the equation as suggested, adding the 2**MMSF term to the equation for HE TB PPDU. Define MMSF in the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 20:59:37Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 67 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11152	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.1	194	30	G	N	194.30000030517578	30	10.22.1		J	Yongho Seok	726r0	640	"HCCA is not used by DMG and HESTAs." This is too compact. In the HE case, an HE STA is by definition a QoS STA. So what constraints on the QoS ST	Add exceptions to the places that describe signalling of HCCA capability, and generation and response to HCCA frame sequences.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:59:48Z) Rejected- The HCCA has been explicitly described in clause 3. If a statement about the HCCA frame exchange seq	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11153	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.2	194	56	G	Y	194.55999755859375	56	10.22.2.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	"its local MIB variables related to CWmin and CWmax" -- lazy specification	Cite the specific variables or delete the note.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:29:04Z) Delete the note and apply the changes as proposed in doc 1828r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:38:03Z - The editing instructions in 17/1828r4 do not delete the note. They modify the note.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11154	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.4	195	25	T	Y	195.25	25	10.22.2.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	9r0	486	"During an EDCA TXOP, the Address 2 field excluding the Individual/Group bit of all control frames sent by a TXOP holder shall be set to the same addre	Limit the addition to HE STAs.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:07:58Z) Revised – The statement restricts the setting of the transmitter's address (TA) so that the same value of TXOP ho	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:54:58Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 68 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11155	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.5	195	54	E	N	195.53999328 61328	54	10.22.2.5		V			615	"per20 MHzbitmap" - ugly. The "secondary40" doesn't feel the need to embed units.	Globally change to "per20bitmap"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:54:43Z) - Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0604r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 19:15:59Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
11156	Adrian Stephens	230	2	10.22.2.6	196	11	T	Y	196.11000061 035156	11	10.22.2.6		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	39r1	502	"for the 5 GHz band or DIFS for an HE STA operating in the 2.4 GHz band " The addition removes the ability of a HT STA to transmit using this rule,	Reword something like: "was idle during an interval immediately preceding the start of the TXOP of duration 1) DIFS if transmitted by an HE STA opera t	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 05:56:26Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change, although p	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11157	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.3	251	6	G	Y	251.05999755859375	6	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	"The RA field of the Data frames and Management frames sent in response to a Trigger frame shall beset to the MAC address of the destination AP." --	Turn into a NOTE or delete.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:34:26Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:54:51Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11158	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.3	251	10	G	Y	251.10000610351562	10	27.5.3.3		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"The settings of the address fields of MPDUs within theA-MPDU depend on the type and subtype of the MPDU as defined in 9.3 (Format of individual frame	Delete cited sentence. (I'll comment on the first sentence in the next ballot round ; 0).	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11159	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	20	G	Y	251.19999469482422	20	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	"A STA that is the intended receiver of a Trigger frame" -- ug. I can live with "intended recipient/receiver" when talking about transmitter behavior	Reword "A STA that receives a Trigger frame that <condition that identifies it as the intended receiver> ..."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:38:44Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 11159.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 22:13:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11160	Adrian Stephens	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	13	T	Y	252.13000488 28125	13	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	"shall not exceed the TID aggregation limit" -- where is this limit defined?	Reference here how this limit is known to the STA. Ditto throughout this subclause.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:39:34Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 11160.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 23:30:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11161	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.16.4.2	324	5	T	Y	324.04998779296875	5	27.16.4.2		V	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	CCA rules are referred to once in the D2.0. A clause reference is missing of which rules to follow for HE STA during a Quiet Time Period.	Add a Note3 where CCA rules are defined for HE STA e.g., clause 27.16.4.2 and or other relevant clauses in the draft.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 00:00:28Z) Revised: Agree with the comment and the text is revised to make it more clear. TGax editor, please make changes	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 19:43:23Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 71 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11162	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.1.10	54	14	T	Y	54.13999938964844	14	9.2.4.1.10		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	+HTC / Order subfield lists 3 purposes but states only 2 purposes	Change two to three and number the bullet text to 1,2 and 3 respectively.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:07:48Z) Revised- The cited wording has been removed from the baseline specification (i.e., TGmd D1.0). TGax editor only	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11163	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	60	4	T	Y	60.040000915527344	4	9.2.4.6.4.2		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0740r1	639	BCC encoding is mandatory if the RU Allocation subfield indicates an RU that is less than 484-tone RU.	Change note to read: BCC encoding shall be used if the RU Allocation subfield. .....484-tone RU.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:51:21Z) Statements in clause 9 or any notes can't be normative. Also note, the cited text is being deleted as a resolutio	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 72 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11164	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.14.2	481	30	T	Y	481.29998779296875	30	28.3.14.2		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	Target RSSI states signal power is averaged over the AP's antenna connectors for the HE TB PPDU. It should state over the AP's receive antenna connect	Change as described in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:35:14Z) The text in the 11ax draft 2.0 is “TargetRSSI represents the target receive signal power averaged over the AP's	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11165	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	53	T	Y	80.52999877929688	53	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Clarify unique identifier 2045 in AID 11	Change A value 2045 to A value equal to 2045	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:59:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:21:29Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
11166	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	64	T	Y	329.64001464375	64	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	The text reads: the maximum number of spatial stream per user a non-AP-STA can receive in the DL-MU-MIMO transmission is a minimum of 4. The maximum n	Clarify the number of streams for supported for HE SU PPDUs. If they are equal, change " 4 and the maximum" to " 4 and is the maximum"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:49:55Z) The statement is correct and does not need further clarification. The maximum number of spatial streams support	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:13:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 73 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11167	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.7.2	272	60	T	Y	272.60 000610 35156	60	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	A mandatory requirement is stated - HE STA shall not transmit BAT, TACK and STACK frames. These frames are not defined in D2.0 or in the 802.11-2016 b	Just like other normative Notes in D2.0, add reference Note to .11ah clauses were these frames are described.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:57:51Z) Revised – Agree in principle. However, the reference need not be where the frames are defined but rather where t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 22:53:58Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11168	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.3.11.4	370	19	T	Y	370.19 000244 140625	19	28.3.3.11.4		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	In this clause it states that a STA supporting UL-MU-MIMO transmissions at full-bandwidth supports 4 space-time streams for HE SU PPDUs and later sta	Rewrite the sentence clarifying the number of space-time streams at full-bandwidth.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:47:02Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11168, 13594, 13443 and 13595 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 74 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11169	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.19.5	499	32	T	Y	499.32000732421875	32	28.3.19.5		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	The maximum input level at the receiver is in dBm. To be consistent with other clauses in the draft the input "signal" level is implied.	Change "input level" to "input signal level"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:39:53Z) It is conventional to use “input level” instead of “input signal level”. “maximum input level” has been used in	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11170	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.19.5	499	34	T	Y	499.33999633078906	34	28.3.19.5		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	Receiver maximum input level is measured at each antenna. Clarify type of antenna port	Change "each antenna" to "each receive antenna"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:40:04Z) It is conventional to use “antenna” instead of “receive antenna”. “antenna” has been used in all previous IEEE 8	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 75 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11171	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.19.1	496	31	T	Y	496.30999755859375	31	28.3.19.1		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	Input levels are measured at the antenna connectors as receive antennas. Input levels referenced in other clauses state "input signal levels". The us	Change "input levels" to "input signal levels" Change "Device Under Test" to "Device Under Test receiver."	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:39:38Z) Since the whole clause is about “receiver specification”, there is no ambiguity to use “Device under test”.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11172	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.14.2	481	43	T	Y	481.42999267578125	43	28.3.14.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	DLRSSI represents the measured received power from the non-HE portion of the HE PPDU. The received power is measured in dBm. It should state as suc	Change "received power" to "received power in dBm"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:35:39Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions for CID 11172 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0159r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:35:58Z - So DL_RSSI is in dBm units, but how is the averaging done? Average of log scale?	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 76 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11173	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	42	T	Y	134.41999816 89453	42	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	HE MAC Information Capabilities Field Table 9-262z exponent "Maximum Number Of F-MPDUs" not described in text.	Describe F-MPDUs exponent function	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:47:29Z) Revised-Proposed resolution to make Maximum Number Of Fragmented MSDUs clear TGax editor please make the chan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11174	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.1.62	106	11	T	Y	106.11000061 035156	11	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	HE MIMO Control Field bits (B0-B39) Figure 9-121d are not defined in Table 9-76a HE MIMO Control Field encoding. Assign bit locations in Table 9-76a.	Add bits (B0-B39) to corresponding entries by bit location in Description column Table 9-76a. For example "B0-B2: Indicates the number of ...."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 77 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11175	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.237.1	132	65	T	Y	132.64999389648438	65	9.4.2.237.1		J	Abhishek Patil	369r4	541	In Table 9-589cj (HE Capabilities element format) the Element ID, Length, and Element ID Extension fields are not defined and point to clause 9.4.2.1	Define each field and place in clause 9.4.2.1	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 02:45:45Z) Reject Section 9.4.2.1 provides the definition of each of these fields. All element formats are described in th	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:40:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11176	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.8.18.4.3	491	37	T	Y	491.36999511171875	37	28.3.18.4.3		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	The Note in Table 28-45(page 492 lines 37-40) regarding amplitude drift compensation is ambiguous. The note implies that amplitude drift compensation	More clarification and discussion are required.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:36:12Z) Please refer to the resolution of CID 13406 as in 11-18/0159r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:51:39Z - see #13406	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11177	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.4.3	238	36	E	Y	238.36000061035156	36	27.4.3		J			447	Style for "Notes": In the draft, some "Notes" are numbered, others are not.	Number each "Note" in the draft and reference in text if needed.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:32:04Z) - IEEE style only requires numbering on "multiple notes in sequence".	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:39:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 78 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11178	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	T	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	The same PerAID TID info subfield for unique identifier 2045 is use for the same Figure 9-38b.	Change Figure 9-38b to 9-38c and change. .. is not 2045... to ...is 2045. Remove...not	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:35:21Z) Accepted. It is already resolved by CIDs 12679 and 11060.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:16:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
11179	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	8	E	Y	476.07998657 22656	8	28.3.11.16		V			648	Missing brackets indicating Mma Data Symbols in figure 28-39 HE PPDU with midamble	Add brackets	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:33:41Z) - Corrected with #12064. No furher change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:33:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11180	Albert Petrick	230	2	3	33	7	E	Y	33.06999969482422	7	3		A			447	Missing hyphen	Change STAID to STA-ID	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:38Z - see #12968	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11181	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.11.1	304	13	E	Y	304.13000048828125	13	27.11.1		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0628r1	612	Missing hyphen	Change STAID to STA-ID	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:31:55Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0628r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0		There is a technical problem here. A STA-ID identifies a STA. But here is says that multiple STAIDs will refer to the same resource unit. A resource u	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:00:10Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 79 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11182	Albert Petrick	230	2	3	34	57	E	Y	34.569999969482422	57	3		A			447	Missing period	add period at end of sentence	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:49:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:49:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11183	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.158.3	123	53	E	Y	123.52999877929688	53	9.4.2.158.3		A			447	Use common text font style - Italicize "n" for the number of SS (spatial streams)	Change as commented	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:31:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:31:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11184	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.158.3	123	54	E	Y	123.54000091552734	54	9.4.2.158.3		V			447	Missing period	add period after " MCS 9).	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:32:53Z) - No period necessary since these are list items. In keeping with the baseline style, use lower case on first w	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:33:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11185	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.158.3	123	58	E	Y	123.58000183105469	58	9.4.2.158.3		J			447	Missing period	add period after "subfield))."	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:34:07Z) - No period needed on list item	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:34:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11186	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.3.1.9.3	78	18	E	Y	78.18000030517578	18	9.3.1.9.3		A			447	Missing period	add period after "variant)."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:34:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:34:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11187	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	23	E	Y	328.23001098 63281	23	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "11."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 80 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11188	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	6	E	Y	328.05999755859375	6	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "bandwidth."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11189	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	9	E	Y	328.08999633378906	9	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "bandwidth."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11190	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	27	E	Y	328.26998901 36719	27	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "MHz."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11191	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	30	E	Y	328.29998779296875	30	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "streams."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11192	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	32	E	Y	328.32000732421875	32	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "streams."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11193	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	35	E	Y	328.35000610 35156	35	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive)."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11194	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	36	E	Y	328.35998535 15625	36	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "to 5."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11195	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	39	E	Y	328.39001464 84375	39	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "PPDUs."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11196	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	42	E	Y	328.42001342 77344	42	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive)."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11197	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	45	E	Y	328.45001220703125	45	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "MIMO."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11198	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	51	E	Y	328.51000976 5625	51	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive)."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11199	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	51	E	Y	328.51000976 5625	51	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "PPDUs."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11200	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	55	E	Y	328.54998779296875	55	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive)."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11201	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1	328	65	E	Y	328.64999389 64844	65	28.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 81 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11202	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.20	505	28	E	Y	505.27999987792969	28	28.3.20		V			648	Extra spaces in Figure 28-53	Fix sentence format.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:42Z) - Remove the notes from transmit and receive procedure figures. The statement is already present in the text.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:47Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11203	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.20	503	32	E	Y	503.32000732421875	32	28.3.20		V			648	Extra spaces in Figure 28-50	Fix sentence format.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:44:31Z) - Remove the notes from transmit and receive procedure figures. The statement is already present in the text.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:14Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 82 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11204	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.20	504	28	E	Y	504.27999987792969	28	28.3.20		V			648	Extra spaces in Figure 28-51	Fix sentence format.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:24Z) - Remove the notes from transmit and receive procedure figures. The statement is already present in the text.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:30Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11205	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.20	504	64	E	Y	504.64001464375	64	28.3.20		V			648	Extra spaces in Figure 28-52	Fix sentence format.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:32Z) - Remove the notes from transmit and receive procedure figures. The statement is already present in the text.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:45:38Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11206	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.20	507	44	E	Y	507.44000244140625	44	28.3.20		J			648	No signal extension arrow misaligned from Signal Extension flow in Figure 28-54	Fix diagram	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 14:43:11Z) - Exact problem with arrow not apparent	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 14:43:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 83 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11207	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.6.8.36	162	44	E	Y	162.44000244140625	44	9.6.8.36		V			447	Mb/s and Mbps is used throughout draft text, figures and tables. Select a common style	Changeas described in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:55:11Z) - Change all instances of Mbps to Mb/s	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:55:24Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11208	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.3.1.9.6	80	61	E	Y	80.61000061035156	61	9.3.1.9.6		V			447	Spelling error	check spelling of the word acknowledgement through text, tables and figures	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:41:18Z) - "acknowledgment" is the spelling used in 802.11. Find all instances of "acknowledgement" and change them to "	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:54:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11209	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.3.123	88	6	E	Y	88.05999755859375	6	9.3.123		A			447	Spelling error	Change OF to Of	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:30:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:30:54Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11210	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.3.123	88	9	E	Y	88.08999633789062	9	9.3.123		A			447	Spelling error	Change OF to Of	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:30:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:31:01Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11211	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.5	373	56	E	Y	373.55999755859375	56	28.3.5		V			648	STBC encoder should in 1ss to align with transmit block diagram Figure 28-17	Add... for one spatial stream only	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:45:55Z) - append "…for one spatial stream"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:46:17Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 84 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11212	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.5	373	65	E	Y	373.64999938964844	65	28.3.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	Guard interval should include window to align with transmit block diagram Figure 28-17	add....(GI) Insertion and Window	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:52:13Z) -All figures have the block diagrme already.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	It probably requires that the terminology in the figures be updated to "GI insertion and windowing"	N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 23:25:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11213	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	53	53	E	Y	53.529998779296875	53	9.2.4.1.8		J			447	Extra parenthesis)	Remove extra)	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:19:26Z) - Opening and closing brackets match (one set is part of the auto generated hyperlink).	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:19:42Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11214	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	6	E	Y	65.05999755859375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	Spelling Error in Table 9-18c	change Uosolicited to Unsolicited	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:03:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:03:12Z - see #12983	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11215	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	54	4	E	Y	54.040000915527344	4	9.2.4.1.8		J			447	Extra parenthesis)	Remove extra) after CP	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:21:26Z) - Match	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:21:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11216	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	61	24	E	Y	61.240001678 4668	24	9.2.4.6.4.3		A			447	Spelling Error in title row of Table 9-18b	Change 160 MH to 160 MHz	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:46:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:46:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 85 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11217	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	146	36	E	Y	146.36000061035156	36	9.4.2.237.4		A			447	Spelling	Change "FFigure to "Figure" in Table 9-262ab	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:19:12Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:19:15Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11218	Albert Petrick	230	2	8.3.4.4	46	27	T	Y	46.27000045776367	27	8.3.4.4		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Doppler Rx in subfield is 1 indicating support to receive midamble and in Table 28-2 the TXVECTOR and RXVECTOR parameters "Doppler" is set to 1 indica	Change high doppler mode of transmission to 1, and otherwise to 0.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:42:24Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11219	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.2.3	350	6	T	Y	350.05999755859375	6	28.2.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	To be consistent with high Doppler mode in other clauses and tables, the Doppler TRIGVECTOR parameter in Table 28-2 should be set to 1.	In Table 28-2 change high doppler mode indication bit to 1, and otherwise to 0	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:46:35Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 86 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11220	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	40	T	Y	474.39999938964844	40	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	The Midamble is defined for Nsts < 4 and states the uses of midamble to compensate the channel estimation when its varying fast in channels with h	Change sentence: The recipient ....high doppler. to: "High Doppler is a result of fast changing time variances and frequency offsets in the transmiss	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:28:46Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:31:31Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11221	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.11.15	474	27	E	Y	474.26998901 36719	27	28.3.11.15		V			648	Grammar	Change "only applied" to "applied only"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:24:59Z) - Review all uses of "only applied" in relation to DCM and change to "applied only"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:25:27Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11222	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.11.9	465	6	E	Y	465.05999755859375	6	28.3.11.9		A			648	Grammar	Change "only applied" to "applied only"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:18:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:14:04Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11223	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.3.2	263	65	E	Y	263.64999389 64844	65	27.3.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	Grammar style: "a SU " and "an SU" used in several clauses in the draft	choice one style for consistency in the document	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. The term a (or an) SU feedback is not defined.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 87 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11224	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	1	E	Y	476.01000976 5625	1	28.3.11.16		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	Grammar style: "a HE " and "an HE" used in several clauses in the draft	choice one style for consistency in the document	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:54:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:08:54Z - 28.3.11.16 contain st MAC protocol descriptions that belong in Clause 27 (e.g., recipient capability restrictions for tr	I	Global search and replace	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11225	Albert Petrick	230	2	8.3.5.18.2	50	36	E	Y	50.360000610 35156	36	8.3.5.18.2		V			447	Grammar	change to (contents..... of a trig ger frame)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:10:27Z) - Not just grammer. The TRIGVECTOR doesn't represent anything - it carries information, in this case information	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:12:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11226	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	42	E	Y	366.42001342 77344	42	28.3.3.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	Missing comma	change to HE PPDU,	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:51:53Z) -20 MHz In 40 MHz HE PPDU In 2.4 GHz Band is a name of capability as a whole.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	See notes on #14052	N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 23:25:42Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 88 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11227	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	327	17	E	Y	327.17001342 77344	17	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "5 GHz band"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:16:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:16:48Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11228	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	327	21	E	Y	327.20999145 50781	21	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "5 GHz band"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:16:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:16:59Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11229	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	327	24	E	Y	327.23999023 4375	24	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "2.4 GHz band"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:17:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:17:07Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11230	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.6.3	61	2	E	Y	61.020000457 76367	2	9.2.4.6.3		J			447	Missing period	add period after "by the STA."	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:45:33Z) - Incomplete sentences forming a variable list	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:45:46Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11231	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.6.3	60	65	E	Y	60.650001525 878906	65	9.2.4.6.3		J			447	Missing period	add period after "by the STA"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:44:23Z) - Incomplete sentences forming a list	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:45:01Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11232	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.4.6.3	60	57	E	Y	60.569999694 82422	57	9.2.4.6.3		V			447	Missing semicolon	add semicolon after "Is defined as:"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:42:29Z) - Reference equation explicitly: "is defined in Equation (9-ax2)."	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:42:54Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 89 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11233	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.5.2	72	58	E	Y	72.580001831 05469	58	9.2.5.2		J			447	Missing period	add period after "Trigger frame."	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:32:01Z) - List, no period required	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:32:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11234	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.2.5.2	73	62	E	Y	73.620002746 58203	62	9.2.5.2		J			447	Missing period	add period after "HE TB PPDUs."	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:32:18Z) - List, no period required	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:32:26Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11235	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.2.1	221	49	E	Y	221.49000549 316406	49	27.2.1		J			447	Missing period	add period after "not 1023."	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:00:12Z) - Period not needed in a list	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:00:32Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11236	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.2.2	222	11	E	Y	222.11000061 035156	11	27.2.2		A			447	Extra period	remove period after "ber."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11237	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.2.2	222	27	E	Y	222.27000427 246094	27	27.2.2		A			447	Missing period	add period after "0."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:35Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11238	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.9.2	291	36	E	Y	291.35998535 15625	36	27.9.2		V		17/1852r8	474	Missing periods	add missing periods the end of all subbullet text in this clause	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:26:40Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes as in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 90 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11239	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	9	E	Y	290.08999633 78906	9	27.9.2.1		V		17/1852r8	474	Missing periods	add missing periods the end of all subbullet text in this clause	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:22:17Z) - agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11240	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	35	E	Y	290.35000610 35156	35	27.9.2.1		V		17/1852r8	474	Missing periods	add missing periods the end of all subbullet text in this clause	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:24:22Z) - agree with the commenter. Apply the proposed changes in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11241	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.242.4	156	6	E	Y	156.05999755 859375	6	9.4.2.242.4		A			648	Missing period	add period after "(Status Code)."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:12:17Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:12:21Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11242	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	5	E	Y	329.04998779 296875	5	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11243	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	7	E	Y	329.07000732 421875	7	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11244	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	11	E	Y	329.10998535 15625	11	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "to 4."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11245	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	13	E	Y	329.13000488 28125	13	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "to 4."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11246	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	16	E	Y	329.16000366 21094	16	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "PPDU."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 91 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11247	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	17	E	Y	329.17001342 77344	17	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after ")."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11248	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	30	E	Y	329.29998779296875	30	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "receive)."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11249	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	52	E	Y	329.51998901 36719	52	28.1.1		A			648	Missing period	add period after "puncturing."		EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11250	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	330	14	E	Y	330.14001464 84375	14	28.1.1		V			648	Missing comma	add comma after "2.4 GHz band,"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:41:03Z) - Statement modified with resolutions to other comments. No change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:41:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11251	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	50	E	Y	329.5	50	28.1.1		A			648	Grammar	Change "in 5 GHz band" to " in the 5 GHz band"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:38:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:39:02Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11252	Albert Petrick	230	2	28.1.1	329	38	E	Y	329.38000488 28125	38	28.1.1		V			648	Style for" UL MU vs Uplink MU". Uplink MU is used several places in the draft. It's defined in clause 3. For consistency in the draft use " UL MU".	Change as commented	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:37:48Z) - Replace uses of uplink and downlink with UL and DL, respectively	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:38:10Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 92 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11253	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.243.3	155	27	T	Y	155.27000427246094	27	9.4.2.243.3		J	ChaoChun Wang		657	The sentence describing the Quiet Period Duration field and timing resolution (32 usec) is ambiguous. Needs more clarity to be consistent with the Qui	Rewrite sentence and reference the description of the Quiet Period Duration field in subclause 9.4.2.243.2 (Quiet Time Period Setup) see pg 154 line 5	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11254	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.243.4	155	45	T	Y	155.44999694 82422	45	9.4.2.243.4		V	ChaoChun Wang	18/0443r3	534	Text states "If an AP decides to counter the request...." its unclear what is meant by counter the request, and what criteria is used by the AP to do	Clarify... ..	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:17:02Z) - The text is revised. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0443r3 under CID 11254	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:20:10Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 93 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11255	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.7.1	168	57	T	Y	168.57000732421875	57	9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	In Table 9-422-MPDU delimiter fields (non-DMG) the Reserved field is assigned 1 bit. Description is missing in the table in the text.	Add description "Reserved. Set to 1."	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:45:05Z) Rejected. Discussion: In 9.2.2, the following rule is defined about how to set Reserved field: “Reserved fields	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11256	Albert Petrick	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	9	T	Y	157.08999633789062	9	9.4.2.243		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Figure 9-589dd-(SR Control field format) the Reserved field shows bits (B5-57) as Reserved. Text is missing of logical default setting.	In the text define the default value of the (B3-B7) "Reserved. Set to 1."	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:15:43Z) In section 9.2.2, it is written that “reserved bits and fields are set to 0”	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11257	Albert Petrick	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	60	T	Y	290.60000061035156	60	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Text states "A STA that takes actions (a) or (b) under the conditions ...." Actions (a) or (b) not defined, need more clarity.	Sentence needs to be rewritten. What are actions (a) or (b)	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:06:16Z) as we now propose to define 2 sub clauses, we can find a new formulation. Apply the changes as in doc 1852r41852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 94 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11258	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	54	20	T	Y	54.20000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	If the Ack Policy set to HTP Ack can be carried in an HE SU PPDU as well then the rule here needs to be generalized. Say something like if the frame i	As in comment. Ensure the rule is consistent throughout.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:05:53Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:06:18Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11259	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.3.3.3	233	46	T	Y	233.46000067138672	46	27.3.3.3		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	The block ack record needs to be updated even if the fragment is sent in S-MPDU. Make this item as an independent statement. Same observation for dyna	Replace the last item with: " The STA shall/ should? update the corresponding block ack record only when an MSDU or A-MSDU that is received in fragments	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:31:05Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts the suggested change. TGax editor please make the cha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11260	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.2.5.3	226	64	T	Y	226.63999938964844	64	27.2.5.3		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	STA is not required to respond to MU RTS Trigger if it has set the ULMU Disable bit to 1. See 27.8.	Add the following item: "The STA has not disabled UL MU operation (see 27.8.3)."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:46:36Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 11260.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:02:11Z - when -> if	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11261	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	Since use of ER SUPPDUs may lead to low throughputs and other undesired effects enable the receiver to be able to disable its recepiton (similar to d	As in comment. Will submit a proposal.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:39:38Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with differen	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 19:21:53Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 96 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11262	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.15.4.3	318	11	T	Y	318.10998535 15625	11	27.15.4.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	14r0	493	Instead of an example it would be good to provide the full list of what is used and not used depending on these RX bit mask setting. Otherwise it is di	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:59:10Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. The issue is that having a list of rules and a table for examples	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 17:38:37Z - Part of the problem is the sentence structure. Reword along the following lines: "A STA shall not transmit a 20 MHz or	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11263	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	4.3.14a	37	2065	T	Y	57.650001525 878906	2065	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Cannot have normative description in clause 4. Suggest to re-word as declarative statements.	As in comment. Applies to both "shall" and "may" statements.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:46:59Z) Revised. Agree in principle. Reword as declarative statement. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:43:47Z - Keep the verb "may" - it is the verb used to indicate that support is optional (see style guide)	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11264	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	4.3.14a	37	48	T	Y	37.479999542 23633	48	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Features are not present for both AP and non-AP.	Remove "non-AP"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:42:30Z) Revised. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:46:15Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 97 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11265	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	4.3.18	38	18	E	Y	38.180000030517578	18	4.3.18		A			447	These are not names of fields. So use lower case letters.	Replace "Color Collision" with "color collision".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:06:45Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:06:48Z - see #12344	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11266	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.4.4	45	37	T	Y	45.369998931884766	37	8.3.4.4		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Not clear what "and not using 1x HE-LTF mode" means here.	Maybe relate it to the GI_HELTF TYPE: e.g., when the GI_HELTF TYPE is not 1xLTF +1.6....	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:40:37Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11267	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.4.4	45	37	T	Y	45.369998931884766	37	8.3.4.4		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	How many values are reserved?	Replace with "Values 5 to 7 are reserved".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:24:22Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 98 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11268	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.4.4	46	12	E	Y	46.119998931884766	12	8.3.4.4		J			447	PE DISAMBIGUITY. Does not say much as to what it is. Seem to be a flag.	Please replace "PE DISAMBIGUITY" with "PE DISAMBIGUITY FLAG" throughout. Similar for its lower case counterpart.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:00:04Z) - PE disambiguity is a technical term (the condition indicated by Equation 28-113)	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:01:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11269	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.4.4	46	19	E	Y	46.189998626708984	19	8.3.4.4		A			447	Remove the note as it creates confusion and is out of scope of this subclause anyways.	Remove "NOTE--For 20 MHz one SR field corresponding to entire 20 MHz (other 3 fields indicate identical values). For 40 MHz two SR fields for each 20	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:02:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:02:08Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11270	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.4.4	46	19	T	Y	46.189998626708984	19	8.3.4.4		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	The VECTOR list seems to not be complete. Please complete list. It should either contain only those additional parameters that show up in the HE-SIG-A	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:42:06Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 99 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11271	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.5.12.3	50	17	T	Y	50.16999816894531	17	8.3.5.12.3		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Any reason why this note that applies to VHT STAs is removed from changes introduced by an HE amendment?	Undo the changes to the note	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:44:26Z) Reason: It's a general introduction for the primitive PHY-CCA.indication. Thus, it's not appropriate to add a NO	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 18:41:51Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11272	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	8.3.5.18	50	19	E	Y	50.189998626708984	19	8.3.5.18		V			447	Missing instruction to the editor to insert a new set of subclauses.	Add instructions to the editor.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:04:09Z) - Add editing instruction "Insert a new subclause 8.3.5.18 at the end of 8.3.5:"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:04:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11273	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	52	T	Y	56.52000045776367	52	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	"may remain constant" normative text in clause 9 which is not correct. Replace with "can"	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 100 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11274	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.2.4.6.3	57	28	E	Y	57.279998779296875	28	9.2.4.6.3		V			447	First time the term appears so it is appropriate to define the term. Replace "Aggregated Control" with "Aggregated Control (A-Control)".	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:36:37Z) - Since it is a field name spelling out the abbreviation is not necessary. Field is called "A-Control". See #12	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:37:25Z - see #12353	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11275	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	59	26	E	Y	59.2599983215332	26	9.2.4.6.4.1		V			447	Inconsistent name. Replace "Command Control Indication" with "Command And Status (CAS)".	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:31:50Z) - As suggested by using lower case.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:32:02Z - see #12805	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11276	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	60	2	E	Y	60.020000045776367	2	9.2.4.6.4.2		V			447	Replace "is defined in" with ".The encoding of the RU Allocation subfield is defined in"	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:39:25Z) - Change "and is defined" to " and the encoding is defined"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:39:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11277	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	60	8	E	Y	60.080001831054 69	8	9.2.4.6.4.2		J			447	Replace "in dBm" with "in units of dBm"	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:40:23Z) - dBm is a well understood to be a unit for power	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:41:01Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 101 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11278	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.2	299	26	E	Y	299.26000976 5625	26	27.10.2		V			447	Sometimes these are called nonzero length A-MPDU subframes and sometimes "A-MPDU subframes with MPDU Length field set to 0". It would be good to use t	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 19:53:32Z) - all A-MPDU subframes are of nonzero length, even those that don't carry an MPDU. Use "A-MPDU subframe with a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:00:37Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11279	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	34	T	Y	300.33999633 78906	34	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	This is not an If statement, so the otherwise does not belong here. Use the same wording as the previous paragraph. Also please remove redundancy of c	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:09:54Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor ot make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11279	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	It is good practise to locate a subfield as precisely as possible the first time it is referenced. This helps the reader look it up. In this case the	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 102 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11280	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	44	E	Y	300.44000244140625	44	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu		657	Suggest rewriting the paragraph: "An ack-enabled A-MPDU is an A-MPDU that follows the rules in 9.7 (Aggregate MPDU (A-MPDU)) and 10.13 (A-MPDU operati	Rewrite as: "An ack-enabled A-MPDU is an A-MPDU that is constructed as defined in 9.7 (Aggregate MPDU (A-MPDU)) and 10.13 (A-MPDU operation) except th	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		There are issues here that need technical interpretation. The exceptions listed are not exceptions; they are consistent with the rules in 9.7 and 10.1	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11281	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	44	T	Y	300.44000244140625	44	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	The multi-TID A-MPDU is not even defined yet and it is already been forbidden. Please define first and then forbid it. Also what about Ack-enabled A-M	Move this sentence after defininig multi-TID A-MPDU. And determine the fate of Ack-enabled A-MPDUs as well.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:13:40Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11281	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 103 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11282	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	57	E	Y	300.57000732421875	57	27.10.4.1		J			657	Please add references to the subclauses that define these two types of multi-TID A-MPDUs (..4.2, and ..4.3). Same thing also for the sentence in P301L	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11283	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	6	E	Y	301.05999755859375	6	27.10.4.1		A			447	This is a duplicate sentence. Please see P300L28.	Delete it.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:28:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:28:30Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11284	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	10	T	Y	301.10000061035156	10	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	This rule is superceded by the rules in the last paragraph of P300. As such it is not needed.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:21:50Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11284	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 104 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11285	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	17	T	Y	301.17001342 77344	17	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	Table 9-426 (Data enabled no immediate response context) is not related to the multi-TID context. Please remove this reference as it is wrong.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:22:44Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11285	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11286	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	34	E	Y	301.33999633 78906	34	27.10.4.1		J			657	To be inline with the normative behavior maybe better to make ti a positive statement in this note.	Replace the first part of the note with "A QoS Null frame is only allowed in an A-MPDU only if its Ack Policy field is set to No Ack (as defined in...	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 105 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11287	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	42	T	Y	301.42001342 77344	42	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	Primary AC is defined in 10.22.2.8. Add a reference to it.	Replace "This AC is defined as the primary AC." with " The AC used to gain access to the medium is defined as the primary AC (see 10.2.2.28)."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:24:32Z) Revised TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11287.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11288	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	42	T	Y	301.42001342 77344	42	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	It may be obvious but better to clarify that this primary AC access rule is applicable for both non-ack enabled and for ack-enabled Multi-TID A-MPDU t	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:25:12Z) Rejected. Discussion: The text of primary AC rules in P301L42 already mentioned MPDUs from signle TID and multi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 106 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11289	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	42	T	Y	301.42001342 77344	42	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	I think the normative behavior specifying that the Multi-STA BlockAck shall be used to acknowledge MT A-MPDU is already covered in 27.4. So this state	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:25:57Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11289	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11290	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	62	T	Y	301.61999511 71875	62	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	There is some duplication between this paragraph and the one in P301L22. Please remove one and add the missing portion in the one of P301L22. The port	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:27:29Z) Revised. Discussion: the paragraph is covered by the following sentence in 27.5.3.4: The number of TIDs present	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 107 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11291	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	302	11	T	Y	302.10998535 15625	11	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	...of the Trigger Dependent User Info field " that is addressed to the STA". And not MPDUs in general but "QoS Data". Please add these clarifications.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:28:21Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 11291	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11292	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	302	23	T	Y	302.23001098 63281	23	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	I think this paragraph is saying the same thing that the previous paragraphs are saying. Refer to the paragraphs preceding it. Iff we want to keep thi	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:29:08Z) Revised Discussion: The previous paragraph is about A-MPDU solicited by Basic Trigger with AC except AC BK in Pr	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 108 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11293	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	302	23	E	Y	302.23001098 63281	23	27.10.4.1		J			657	Perhaps it is good to have one paragraph that covers as itemized list: Single TID case (this paragraph) and Multi-TID case (paragraph in P302L6-11).	Check if we can save some printer toner by merging the two paragraphs while preserving the technical content.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11294	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.1	302	39	T	Y	302.39001464 84375	39	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	This sentence is isolated and kind of out of concext at the end of this subclause. Suggest to have this sentence in the same paragraph (or adjacent) w	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:29:55Z) Rejected Discussion: The paragraphes before this one are about A-MPDU aggregation in HE SU, HE TB PPDU. This pa	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11295	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.2	302	46	E	Y	302.45999145 50781	46	27.10.4.2		J			657	Already stated once in P300L1 so stating it again is redundant. Delete this sentence.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 109 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11296	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.2	302	56	E	Y	302.55999755859375	56	27.10.4.2		J			447	Suggest to write as" " Does not contain any Management frame except for Action No Ack frames." or may be better to add the Action No Ack as part of the	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:43:35Z) - Commenter has not identified a problem with the draft	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:43:54Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11297	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.2	302	57	T	Y	302.57000732421875	57	27.10.4.2		V	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	Actually this rule is applicable in general. I.e. it has to state that does not contain any A-MPDU subframe with Length field that is greater than 0 a	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:34:35Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0796r2 under CID 11297	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 19:56:26Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11298	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	8	E	Y	303.07998657 22656	8	27.10.4.3		J			657	Already stated once in P300L1 so stating it again is redundant. Delete this sentence.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 110 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11299	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	17	T	Y	303.17001342 77344	17	27.10.4.3		V	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	replace "belonging to one or more block ack agreements each carried in" with " each of which belongs to a blockack agreement and is carried in". Apply	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:36:19Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter Gax editor to make changes in 11-18/0796r2 under CID 11299.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 20:16:50Z - apply the plural to the EOF-MPDU or non-EOF-MPDUs and then describe each in the singular	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11300	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	53	T	Y	303.52999877 92969	53	27.10.4.3		J	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	Isn't this covered by the rules listed in the above items? Seems like it. In which case this paragraph is redundant and can be deleted.	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:37:06Z) Rejected Discussion: the rules list in the above items are about A-MPDU content. L53 sentence defines how to so	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 111 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11301	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	40	T	Y	242.39999938 9648438	40	27.5.1.1		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/0054r0	499	Other parts of the spec allow this combination (i.e., with Ack Policy set to HTP Ack to be carried in HE SU PPDUs as well (see Ack policy subfield set	Clarify that this capability applies independently of the PPDU that carries this particular ack-enabled A-MPDU.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:20:43Z) The case that the commenter referred to is already clarified in section 27.10.4. Tgax editor makes no changes on	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:53:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11302	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.1.2	242	62	T	Y	242.61999511 71875	62	27.5.1.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/0054r0	499	Focus from the receive side of things. And the STA may discard all other RUs (not only broadcast) if it is the intended receiver of an RU as identifie	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:21:49Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/054r0 that are marked with CID 11302	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:55:45Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11303	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	11	T	Y	243.11000061 035156	11	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Typo: It is BQR Support. Replace BQRP Support with BQR Support.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:05:56Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11303	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 112 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11304	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	14	T	Y	243.13999938964844	14	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Some duplicate contents here. Remove the first paragraph of this subclause. Remove the first sentence in L14 and have the item as an independent sente	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:06:42Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11304	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11305	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	27	T	Y	243.27000427246094	27	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	I suggest putting this sentence as the first sentence of the subclause as it described both options. Suggest though to have it with can instead of may	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:08:45Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11305	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11306	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	34	T	Y	243.33999633789062	34	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Duplicate paragraph. Delete.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:09:20Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11306	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 113 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11307	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	43	T	Y	243.42999267578125	43	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Solicit what? Suggest saying "may solicit BQRs from one or more"	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:10:27Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11307	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:38:21Z - see #11710	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11308	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	54	T	Y	243.53999328 61328	54	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Say (in the text in parenthesis) instead that it will set the Ack Policy to No Ack for the frames it carries in the HE TB PPDU.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:11:06Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11308	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:43:22Z - There is a lot of redundency here	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11309	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	54	T	Y	245.53999328 61328	54	27.5.3.2.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	I don't think there can be a Trigger frame addressed to another STA and another MPDU with UMRS addressed to the STA. SO the rule should be more generic	Replace this paragraph with: " An A-MPDU shall not carry both a Trigger frame and an MPDU that contains an UMRS Control subfield"	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:25:54Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:31:52Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11310	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	54	T	Y	245.53999328 61328	54	27.5.3.2.1		V	George Cherian	741r3	616	I think we can simplify this paragraph. Giving it a try in the proposed change.	Replace the paragraph with: "A Trigger frame, if any is present in an A-MPDU, shall be the first MPDU of the A-MPDU except when the A-MPDU also carrie	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:31:41Z) Revised The paragraph has been updated as suggested in the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as shown i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:59:21Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11311	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	56	T	Y	245.55999755 859375	56	27.5.3.2.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	Some commas are missing in this sentence. Spell check.	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:46:41Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11311 and 13914 in 11-18/0807r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	There is no "proposed text for 11311 or 13914, so using the text under heading "Proposed Text Updates: CIDs 11418, 12580, 12796, 13764". There are tech	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 115 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11312	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	2335	T	Y	269.35000061035156	2335	27.5.3.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	The wording of these two paragraphs has to be inline with that of the first paragraph. For it to be so the MinTrigProcTIme should refer to the duratio	Use the same terminology that is used in the first paragraph in these two paragraphs as well.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:00:37Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0075r3 under CID 11312	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11313	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	247		T	Y	247		27.5.3.2.2		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	A user info field is addressed to one STA. Replace STAs with STA. Also it is obvious the UMRS Control is carried in HE variant etc. So remove "in an H	as in comment.	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:53:17Z) Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0546r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:17:06Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11314	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	247		T	Y	247		27.5.3.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0794r1	604	Organize these paragraphs as a bulleted list (technical content to remain the same): One for TID aggregation limit set to 0, one for TID Aggregation L	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 07:46:01Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-18/0794r1 under 11314	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11315	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	248	1	T	Y	248.00999450683594	1	27.5.3.2.3		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	This paragraph is not related to the settings of the fields of the Trigger frame but rather of what can carry the TF. As such it belongs to the genera	Move the paragraph to 27.5.3.2.1.	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:54:29Z) Agree with the comment TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0546r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:13:43Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 117 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11316	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	248	8	T	Y	248.08000183 10547	8	27.5.3.2.3		V	Jing Ma	11-18/0429r0	562	Logically the third paragraph should be the first paragraph. And the first and second paragraph should be one paragraph that covers: An AP that sends	Organize these three paragraphs as suggested in the comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:56:24Z) Discussion: generally agree with the commenter. Subclause 27.5.3.2.4 is rewritten per CID 13916. No change is need	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11317	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	31	T	Y	248.30999755 859375	31	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0367r1	540	UMRS Control is obviously soliciting an immediate response. So this is redundant. Remove "that solicits an immediate resonnse."	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:39:48Z) Agree with the comment. Removed the cited text. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0367r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:41:50Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 118 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11318	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	33	T	Y	248.33000183 10547	33	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0367r1	540	Some commas are missing in this sentence. "Check the spell".	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:40:23Z) Agree with the comment. Rewrote the paragraph to clearly state the conditions and dependencies under which a STA s	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:53:20Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11319	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	13	T	Y	249.13000488 28125	13	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0367r1	540	Condition on the ULMU Disable bit is missing. Add it. With a reference to 27.8.3.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:41:06Z) Agree with the comment. Added a condition to cover the case where STA has not disabled ULMU via OM Control. Also	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:06:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 119 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11320	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	5	T	Y	249.05000030517578	5	27.5.3.3		V	Yusuke Tanaka	155r2	649	Data frames cannot be aggregated together with BloCkAck frames in response to GCR MU BAR. Clarify what this means. Was it intended to the QoS Nullsan	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:12:17Z) Revised - Agree in principle. BlockAck frames in resposne to GCR MU BAR cannot be aggregated together with Data	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 18:46:47Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11321	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.4	249	5	T	Y	249.05000030517578	5	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	This note seems out of place. None of the paragraphs preceding it talks about unassociated STAs. Remove it or clarify the relation to the paragraph.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:40:04Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 11321.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 22:42:24Z - Some rewording required so that the subject of the conditions is clear. Working from outermost to innermost: "An APm	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 120 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11322	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	44	T	Y	251.44000244140625	44	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	The STA includes at least one CBF and CQI frame in the A-MPDU if the AP actually allocates sufficient resources for the STA to do so. If the AP does n	Replace "The STA includes at least one Compressed Beamforming And CQI frame in the A-MPDU as defined in 27.6 (HE sounding protocol)." with "The STA in	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:40:40Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 11322.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 22:20:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11323	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	44	T	Y	255.44000244140625	44	27.5.3.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0108r2	503	The statement is confusing. Is it either, or both? Does it apply to all values? And should it be a note?	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:26:58Z) Agree in principal. Similar to unsolicited BSR, QoS Control field and the BSR HE Control field can be included in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 20:25:53Z - The QoS Control field is always present in a QoS Null frame so I don't see how the STA can choose to include it. Also,	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 121 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11324	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	44	T	Y	255.44000244140625	44	27.5.3.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0108r2	503	What does the STA that sets the UL MU Disable bit to 1? Does it still send BSRs?	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:27:23Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0108r2 under 11324.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 20:17:02Z - The change made has grammer issues and does not identify the location of the "UL Disable bit"	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11325	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	58	T	Y	255.58000183 10547	58	27.5.3.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0108r2	503	Same observation. The statement is confusing. Is it either, or both? Does it apply to all values?.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:28:00Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0108r2 under 11325.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 20:39:11Z - There numerous problems here that will need to be resolved. There are 3 subfields that could be covered by "Queue Sizes	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11326	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.2	243	54	T	Y	243.53999328 61328	54	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Too generic to say MPDUs. Explicitly call out what the MPDUs are.	Replace "MPDUs" with "QoS Data or QoS Null frames" and and replace the other MPDUs with frames.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:13:38Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 11326	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:44:22Z- The resolution document contains no editing instructions associated with this CID. This comment should have been rejecte		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 122 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11327	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.5.3.5	243	29	T	Y	243.28 99932861328	29	27.5.3.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0424r4	631	What about the other Trigger frames? This rule should apply to all Triggers except for the ones stated below.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:35:35Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0424r4 under 11327	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 22:10:23Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11328	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	168	35	T	Y	168.35 000610351562	35	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	"The maximum length of an A-MPDU pre-EOF padding in an HE PPDU is 4 194 303 octets." Is this number correct?	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:46:00Z) Revised. Generally agree with the commenter. The maximum length of an A-MPDU pre-EOF padding in an HE PPDU is 8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11329	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	168	54	T	Y	168.53 999328 61328	54	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	It may be a good idea to try and differentiate these types (thinking acronym wise): S-MPDU, A-MPDU, AE A-MPDU, MT A-MPDU, AEMT A-MPDU?	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:46:51Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0425r4 under 11329	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	Not implemented. These acronyms unnecessarily obfuscate their meaning. There are not that many uses of the full term that they deserve an acronym.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 123 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11330	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	174	9	T	Y	174.08999633789062	9	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Even with one TID would be something explicitly added here. So replace "with multiple" with "one or more"	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:49:35Z) Revised Discussion: The CID should be related to P173L9. TGas editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11331	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	174	9	T	Y	174.08999633789062	9	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	This should be different. Since the above statement covers the same TID. So replace "with multiple" with "different"	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:50:27Z) Discussion: The CID should be related to P173L9. TGas editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 11331	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 124 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11332	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	174	7	T	Y	174.07000732421875	7	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Add "in an HE BSS" for everything that is new in this table and the others below for backward compatibility.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:51:14Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID should be related to P17 3L7. TGas editor to make changes in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11333	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	174	60	T	Y	174.60000610351562	60	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Also BQRP can be present similar to the BSRP (same thing for the next table). But MU BAR is not supposed to be allowed in the A-MPDU context. Remove M	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:52:03Z) Revised Discussion: Agree with the commentr that BQRP should be present which si similar to BSRP. However, MU BA	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 125 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11334	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	174	30	T	Y	174.30000030517578	30	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	This can be present only in the Ack enabled A-MPDU context. Suggest to add another context that covers the case of this row, separate from the good ol	As in comment. Preference is to simplify the table and only rely on the new additions in the normative subclauses in 27.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:52:48Z) Revised Discussion: The inconsistency between 27 and the table here are addressed in this document. Also the pre	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11335	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	175	16	T	Y	175.16000366210938	16	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	There cannot be both Ack and Block Ack. Only one can be present. Please fix it.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:58:20Z) Revised TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 11335	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11336	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	175	20	T	Y	175.19999969482422	20	9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Similar observation here. Instead of listing all possible cases again it is easier to refer to the normative sublcause(s) where this M-BA frame is gen	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 03:02:45Z) Rejected See the discussion of CID 11334	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 126 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11337	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.1	324	48	T	Y	324.48 00109863281	48	9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu		657	Rules seem to be missing here. Ensure that rules from both AP side and STA side are clear.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11338	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.1	270	60	T	Y	270.60 00061035156	60	27.7.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	Actually all STAs (not only HE) that are associated with the AP support TWT for this to be the case. In addition the AP can set the Responder PM Mode	Clarify. Here and in 27.3.3.2.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:50:20Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Clarified that the rule applies when all STAs (not only HE) have declared support	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11339	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.3.1	270	48	T	Y	270.48 00109863281	48	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1861R1	473	How does broadcast TWT joining, leaving work with the multiple BSSID stuff? Is the MAC address that of the VAP or that of the transmitted BSSID?	Clarify.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:18:47Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The current spec doesn't provide guidance on how TWT element is advertised in ca	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:32:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 127 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11340	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.2	271	52	T	Y	271.51 998901 36719	52	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	Calling this field Wake TBTT Negotiation field now is ambiguous. Find a better name for it given the generalization of its functionality.	Clarify.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:05:56Z) These two bits were already renamed as Negotiation Type. Proposed resolution is to use the same terminology in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:06:50Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11341	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.2	271	52	T	Y	271.51 998901 36719	52	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	611r2	611	THe AP can actually send a trigger frame to poll the STA for indicating its wake state. This case is missnig in the list. Add it.	Specify that the AP may include the STA in the list if it intends to poll the STA for declaring its wake state.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:00:32Z) Rejected – The comment refers to P271L52 that discussed the setting of the fields in the TWT setup exchanges an	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 128 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11342	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.2	273	52	T	Y	273.51998901 36719	52	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	611r2	611	The case of unannouced TWT is not covered. Specify that in the case of unannounced TWT the STA shall be in awake state at the start of the TWT SP and	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:01:35Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to add a declarative statement to the note to clarify this	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11343	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.1	270	32	T	Y	270.32000732 421875	32	27.7.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	The two procedures are independ nd so no need to say that individual TWT agreements are required. Remove that portion of the sentence. And in next par	Delete ", without requiring that an individual TWT agreement has been established between them," Specify that STAs need not be aware of other STAs me	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:52:01Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes, clarifying the portions th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 129 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11344	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.2	270	50	T	Y	270.5	50	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	611r2	611	Sentence is not clear. A STA clearly supports TWT if it transmits the TWT element. Suggest rephrasing. Also specify the difference between these comma	Replace "An HE STA that supports TWT shall set the" with "An HE STA that transmits a TWT setup frame shall set the". And add clarification as per comm	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:02:56Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to specify that the STA that intends to setup an individual	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 22:54:12Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11345	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.2	273	16	T	Y	273.16000036621094	16	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	61r2	611	Actually the TWT responding STA will not schedule rather than might not schedule since the STA has not disabled responding to Trigger frames.	Replace "might not" with "does not".	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:04:21Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 130 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11346	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.2	274	1	T	Y	274.01000976 5625	1	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	This sentence and the note that follows is redundant. It is obvious (from baseline) that a STA can transmit to another ST A in Active mode at any time.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:05:08Z) Revised – Deleting note and keeping sentence, while adding a reference to the baseline subclause that states thi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11347	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.3.1	274	19	T	Y	274.19000244 140625	19	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	739r1	608	This paragraph and the one in L33 are essentially saying the same. Merge them and if needed add the classifier related to the MIB variable only to cov	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:45:48Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The two paragraphs are consolidated to one. TGax editor, please make changes as	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11348	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.3.2	277	16	T	Y	277.16000366 21094	16	27.7.3.2		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	This is not an or. It is an "And" condition. Replace "or" with " and".	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:51:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:52:05Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11349	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	53	T	Y	278.52999877 92969	53	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	Value of Wake TBTT Negotiation is 0 for an announcment. Replace 1 with 0 in both columns of the first row. Also check throughout this subclause the re	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:52:25Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. To avoid ambiguity, the proposed resolution is to remove this por	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	Associated with a non-actionable instruction in 18/663r2 and changes to Table 27-3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11350	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.4.2	284	34	T	Y	284.33999633 78906	34	27.7.4.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	The TWT may not be present. See above. Add ", if any is indicated" after "at the specified TWT". Same observation for the broadcast TWT case in the ne	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:41:49Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution adds clarification as suggested. TGax editor to make the chan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 21:15:58Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 132 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11351	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.4.3	284		T	Y	284		27.7.4.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	For TWT Information frame usage in broadcast TWT need to clarify that the TWT SPs are resumed at their pre-scheduled times (at or after the next TWTp	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:42:56Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution adds clarification as suggested. No need to mention for indivi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11352	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.4.1	283	63	T	Y	283.63000048828125	63	27.7.4.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	Are TWT Information frames always individually addressed?	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:44:37Z) Rejected – Yes. TWT Information frames are Action frames that solicit an immediate response from the intended r	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 133 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11353	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.5	286	11	T	Y	286.10998535 15625	11	27.7.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	660r1	610	Clearly state that the frame in this case (with EOSP) can be either individually addressed or broadcast. Saying frame in general leaves space to ambig	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:53:47Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. The propos	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 23:22:54Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11354	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.7.3.2	276	18	T	Y	276.17999267 578125	18	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	633r2	647	How does the STA know what the new values will be? If the STA knows then it can decide whether to continue being a member or not. Easiest way is that	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:53:21Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 134 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11355	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	27	T	Y	211.27000427246094	27	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1847r0	483	What is the purpose of these new rules? I thought the whole point was to use baseline multiple BSSID operation.	Delete those paragraphs that make the procedure non-backwards compatible.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:10:41Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Baseline spec already defines the AP/STA behavior when the BSS is part of a mul	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:49:11Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11356	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	9.7.3	175	31	T	Y	175.30999755859375	31	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	in Table 9-428: Action NO Ack frames can be any type for HE STAS. Either specify in the table or in any of the occurrences of it in the normative refe	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 03:02:03Z) Revised TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 11356	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 135 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11357	Alfred Asterjadhi	230	2	27.9	289	54	T	Y	289.54000854 49219	54	27.9		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	It is still difficult to understand what values of the SIG-A related to which of the features. Similar for the terminologies, in certain cases they ar	As in comment.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:15:55Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11357, with a note to the comment e	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11358	Allert Van Zelst	230	2	28.3.18.1	489	58	T	Y	489.57998657 22656	58	28.3.18.1		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0476r1	527	Preamble puncturing doesn't make much sense with the current spectral mask definitions, because puncturing is not garanteed with these masks	Remove preamble puncturing from the draft, or define spectral mask requirements for preamble puncturing.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:00:39Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions for CID 11358 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0476r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:39:14Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 136 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11359	Andrew Myles	230	2				T	Y					J	Ron Porat		657	802.11ax is currently designed to use PD/ED mechanisms and thresholds similar to 802.11ac. In particular, it uses an ED threshold of -62 dBm and a PD	If the people who believe LBT with only a ED threshold (using the European thresholds) works better than the PD/ED mechanism (and is fair) are correct	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11360	Andrew Myles	230	2	27.9	289		T	Y	289		27.9		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	802.11ax includes two spatial resue methods. Both methods are relatively complex and there are doubts about how well they work. It appears both are i	The 802.11ax draft should be modified to remove at least one of the SR mechanisms. The TG should be confident that the remaiing mechanism actually wor	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:15:09Z) - There is no doubt that the SRP SR mechanism is effective when an opportunity to use it is identified. The SRP me	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 137 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11361	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	27.16.4.2	323	27	T	Y	323.26998901 36719	27	27.16.4.2		V	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	Fix references to different Quiet Time Period elements. There is only one element (call Quiet Time Period Setup) and the Control field identifies if t	Fix all instances in this section (including fig 27-13) to refer to the correct element and frame name. Add spec text to make reference to the Control	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 00:01:28Z) Revised: The text is revised accordingly TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/444r2 unde	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 19:42:36Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11362	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	6.3.3.2	39	1	T	Y	39.009998321 5332	1	6.3.3.2		J	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-SCAN.request should include HT/VHT/HE Capabilities since the Probe Request frames can carry these capabilities elements	Add HT/VHT/HE Capabilities to MLME-SCAN.request section	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:21:10Z) CID 3003 for D1.0 during the last round proposed the same change, but it has been rejected by the group and th	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:30:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11363	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	6.3.3.2	39	22	T	Y	39.220001220 703125	22	6.3.3.2		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	Table should include other IEs (e.g., MU EDCA etc) which are present in Probe Response frame	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:21:28Z) - Agree with the commenter. See the proposed text change in 11-17/1766r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:31:01Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 138 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11364	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	10	T	Y	85.099998474 1211	10	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	A Trigger frame can be sent in non-HE format. However, TB PPDU is an HE PPDU with the SIG-A field carrying the BSS Color information. In case of rando	Define a mechansim which allows an AP to provide BSS Color information when the TF includes at least one RU with AID12=2045	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:11:23Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11364	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11365	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.4.2.237	120	63	T	Y	120.62999725 341797	63	9.4.2.237		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1850R1	471	Optional Subelements may include HE Operation element (Subelement ID 194). Description text related to HE sub field should mention HE Operation element	Revise the sentence as follows: "The High Efficiency subfield is set to 1 to indicate that the AP represented by this BSSID is an HE AP and that the H	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:07:07Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The text in the paragraphs cited in the comment is updated to capture HT/VHT/HE	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 139 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11366	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.4.2.37	121	21	T	Y	121.20999908447266	21	9.4.2.37		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1850R1	471	Reference to HE Cap and HE Op needs to be added in the Subelement section (see 802.11-2016 spec for examples of HT/VHT Cap and Op (pg 920 & pg 923	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:08:43Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Added sentences to cover the description for HE Capabilities and HE Operations	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11367	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	12	T	Y	128.11999511 71875	12	9.4.2.200		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Since row 3 (TWT Grouping) applies only for an S1G device, add Broadcast = 0 as another condition.	Revise the text in the 'Description' column for row 3 as: This command is valid if the TWT Request field is 0, Broadcast subfield is 0 and Wake TBTT N	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:57:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 19:59:17Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 140 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11368	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	39	T	Y	128.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Rows 6 & 7 are valid for an S1G STA and (under certain conditions) for an HE STA. They should not be N/A - provide a short description along with	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:58:40Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11368	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11369	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	19	T	Y	129.19000244140625	19	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Wake TBTT procedure as described in section 27.7.3.4 does not make any reference to Flow Identifier. Remove the exception from the sentence to indicat	Change the sentence "The TWT Flow Identifier is reserved when transmitted by a TWT scheduled STA except when used as defined in 27.7.3.4 (Negotiation	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:59:47Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11369	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 141 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11370	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	4.3.14a	38	1	T	Y	38.009998321 5332	1	4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Random access is a key feature introduced by TGax. It should be mentioned in the paragraph describing new features belonging to an HESTA.	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:45:30Z) Reject. There are many features that can be described. However, this is a general description section and there	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11371	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	47	T	Y	86.470001220 70312	47	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Since Cascade Indication applies only for the case when the Trigger frame is sent within a TWT SP, rename to something more representative of it's in	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:19:07Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 11371	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 142 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11372	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	43	T	Y	86.430000030517578	43	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	Several fields in the Common Info field of the TF indicate the property of the response frame (i.e., HE TB PPDU) and not the property of the TF itself	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:12:12Z) Agree with the comment. TGax editor please update the sub field names as indicated in doc 11-18/0366r2 for Figure	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:11:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11373	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.3.1.23	93	9	T	Y	93.089996337890625	9	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	Provide reference to section Table 9-262z (in section 9.4.2.237.2) where MinTrigProcTime is defined and remove reference to section 27 where rules for	Replace sentence as: "For a non-HT PPDU, HT PPDU and VHT PPDU, the length of the Padding field (in octets)), which depends on the MinTrigProcTime (see	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:48:24Z) Agree with the comment. Replaced reference for MinTrigProcTime to table 9-262z instead of 27.5.3.2.2. TGax editor	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:40:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 143 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11374	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	9.4.2.238	149	25	T	Y	149.25	25	9.4.2.238		V	Abhishek Patil	68R0	475	BSS Color, Partial BSS Color and BSS Color Disabled subfields can be combined and moved out of HE Op Parameters and specified under a new 1 octet fiel	Define a new field called BSS Color Information which includes a 6-bit BSS Color subfield, a 1-bit Partial BSS Color subfield and a 1-bit BSS Color Di	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:30:54Z) Revised Consolidated the 3 BSS Color related fields in to a single 1-octet field. Reduced size of HE Operation P	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:37:46Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11375	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	10.43.1	209	62	T	Y	209.61999511871875	62	10.43.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	337r1	546	Section 10.43.1 of 11ax D2.0 indicates changing the 2nd paragraph in the baseline spec. However, upon reviewing the corresponding paragraph in 802.11a	Add the missing sentences from baseline spec as pointed by the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:58:59Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Missing sentences are added. Also added a note to the editor that	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 144 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11376	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	10.43.1	201	33	T	Y	201.33000018310547	33	10.43.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	337r1	546	Section 10.43.1 applies to individual TWT. Move this sentence to the beginning of this section and mention that this section describes individual TWT.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:59:59Z) Revised – Seems the page number is wrong. It should be P210 for the commnet to make sense. Agree in principle wi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11377	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	27.7	270	16	T	Y	270.16000366621094	16	27.7		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	Column titles for all of the tables in section 27.7 can be kept short by adding some of the repeating description to the title of the table. Also the	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:52:47Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes, clarifying the settings in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 145 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11378	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	27.8.1	287	8	T	Y	287.07998657 22656	8	27.8.1		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	This section applies only to STAs that support OM Control operation. Move the sentences that indicate OM Control support (for AP/STA) to the beginning	Move the sentence "An HE STA with dot11. ..." and the next paragraph "An HE AP shall set dot 11..." to the beginning of this (27.8.1) section	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:34:28Z) Revised. Agree in principle. Make the changes shown in this 11-17-0035r5 submission and identified for the CID 1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:57:29Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11379	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	27.14.2	312	33	T	Y	312.32998657 22656	33	27.14.2		V	Jeongki Kim	11-17/1849r2	482	B-TWT element can carry indication of one or more B-TWT sessions. The current sentence doesn't capture this correctly (i.e., "... one or more start ti	Reword sentence as: "An HE AP may indicate start time(s) for broadcast TWT SP(s) containing Trigger frames ..."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:15:16Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11379	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 146 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11380	Bibhu Mohanty	230	2	27.16.4.1	323	14	T	Y	323.14001464 84375	14	27.16.4.1		J	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	The second sentence in the 1st paragraph of section 27.16.4.1 is redundant and can be removed. It captures the same information as the preceding sent	Delete the 2nd sentence in the 1st paragraph of 27.16.4.1	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 23:57:44Z) Rejected: The two sentences are trying to describe the behaviors of two types of STAs. The first sentence is to	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:06:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11381	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.8	390	40	E	N	390.39999389 64844	40	28.3.8		A			648	Move THE-SIG-B definition after the THE-SIG_A_R to be aligned with the order of each field in HE PPDU	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:54:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:54:24Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11382	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.9	396	11	T	Y	396.10998535 15625	11	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	In equation (28-3) N_Norm should be N_Norm,r	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:23:24Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11382 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:59:44Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 147 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11383	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.9	397	13	T	Y	397.13000048828125	13	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	Remove "and HE TB PPDU" since alpha_r doesn't apply to TB PPDU in eq 28-4	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:24:34Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11383 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:14:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11384	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.9	397	23	T	Y	397.23001098 63281	23	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	In equation (28-5), it should be |Kr Field| instead of Kr Field	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:25:04Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11384 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:15:07Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11385	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.9	398	43	T	Y	398.42999267578125	43	28.3.9		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0109r3	516	It's better to add a subscript r (i.e. RU id) to the spatial mapping matrix Q_k_(iseg) and Q_k,u_(iseg) since its dimension depends on Nsts_r,total wh	as in the comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-05 22:49:49Z) Reason: subcarrier index k is a function of RU index r. RU index r can be inferred from subcarrier index k.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:27:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 148 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11386	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.18.3	491	11	T	Y	491.10998535 15625	11	28.3.18.3		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	To be ailgned with previous amendments, change the clock and center frequency accuracy maximum tolerance to be +/-20ppm for 5GHz, +/-25ppm for 2.4 GHz	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:35:54Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 11386 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0159r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:38:35Z - This is a transmit side spec so why tolerance (tolerance is something you can accept)? " in 2.4 GHz" and "in 5 GHz" is v	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11387	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	493	54	T	Y	493.54000854 49219	54	28.3.18.4.4		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	i_f =1 is missing from the bottom of the outmost summation (sum over i_f from 1 to Nf)	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:38:06Z) 11ax editor, please add if= 1 at the bottom of the outmost summation.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:53:35Z - Editorial issue: the equation box was clipping text at the bottom.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11388	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	494	6	T	Y	494.05999755 859375	6	28.3.18.4.4		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	"NOTE 1--In the case the transmit modulation accuracy test is performed simultaneously for the two frequency segments of the 80+80 MHz transmissions w	Add "NSD in Equation (28-120) represents the total number of subcarriers of both 80 MHz frequency segments.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:38:35Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 11388 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0159r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:55:10Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 149 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11389	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	494	20	T	Y	494.20001220703125	20	28.3.18.4.4		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	Remove "except that for non contiguous transmissions, only the frequency segment with occupied subcarriers is tested." TB PPDU doesn't support noncont	as in the comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:38:46Z) Noncontiguous transmission is for TB PPDU in 80+80 MHz cases.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11390	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	494	57	E	Y	494.57000732421875	57	28.3.18.4.4		V			648	"and OFDM symbol is of frame if". Grammar error. Remove "is"	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:22:25Z) - should be the variable i_s.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:22:37Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11391	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	495	3	T	Y	495.02999877792969	3	28.3.18.4.4		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	In Eq 122, Ps should be normalized by N_SD instead of N_ST	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:38:58Z) 11ax editor, please change NST to NSD in equaltion (28-122).	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:56:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 150 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11392	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	508	7	T	Y	508.07000732421875	7	28.3.21		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	"The PHY has also been configured with BSS identification information and STA identification information (i.e., BSS Color value and STA ID in the cell	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:18:12Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 11392.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:04:55Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11393	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	511	12	T	Y	511.11999511 71875	12	28.3.21		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	"Detect SIG for non-HT, HT, and VHT" after BPSK detection of the 1st symbol after L-SIG is incorrect. HT shouldn't apprear in this branch since its 1	as in the comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:19:34Z) Determine BPSK or not is after L-LTF not L-SIG as in the figure.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 151 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11394	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	511	62	E	Y	511.61999511 71875	62	28.3.21		V		18/0463r2	529	"as an initial indication of reception of a signal as specified in 21.3.18.5 (CCA sensitivity).". Change the reference to clause 28	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:00:14Z) - As suggested. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 1139	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:06:52Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11395	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	512	9	T	Y	512.09002685 54688	9	28.3.21		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	"The PHY includes the measured RSSI and RSSI_LEGACY value ..". In the previous text and figures 28-56 to 58 doesn't differentiate the RSSI and RSSI_Le	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:20:15Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 11395.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:57:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 152 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11396	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	512	59	E	Y	512.59002685 54688	59	28.3.21		V		18/0463r2	529	"or any other VHT-SIG-A field bit combinations that do not correspond to modes of PHY operation defined in Clause 28". Should be HE-SIG-A instead of V	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:01:20Z) - As suggested. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 1139	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:07:51Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11397	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	513	28	E	Y	513.28002929 6875	28	28.3.21		V		18/0463r2	529	"or any other VHT-SIG-A field bit combinations that do not correspond to modes of PHY operation defined in Clause 28". Should be HE-SIG-A instead of V	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:01:48Z) - As suggested. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 1139	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:08:25Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 153 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11398	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.21	514	2	E	Y	514.02001953125	2	28.3.21		V		18/0463r2	529	"or any other VHT-SIG-A field bit combinations that do not correspond to modes of PHY operation defined in Clause 28". Should be HE-SIG-A instead of V	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:02:19Z) - As suggested. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 1139	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:09:02Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11399	Bin Tian	230	2	28.4.3	520	20	E	Y	520.20001220703 12	20	28.4.3		A			648	Add ",N_SYM", after " the total number of OFDM symbols in the Data filed", to be clear and consistent with following statements	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:25:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:25:24Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11400	Bin Tian	230	2	B.4.27.2	564	50	T	Y	564.5	50	B.4.27.2		V	Edward Au	17/1775r0	445	HEP5 and HEP 11 both list STBC. Need to remove one	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:05:11Z) - Agree in principle that HEP5 and HEP11 are duplicate. Remove HEP11 and update the numbering of the succeedin	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:07:03Z	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11401	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.2.1	400	7	T	Y	400.07000732421875	7	28.3.10.2.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"the cyclic shift value for the L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HE-SIG-A fields of the PPDU". CSD is also applied to the HE-SIGB for MU PPDU	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:49:40Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11401 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:12:18Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11402	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.2.2.	400	26	E	Y	400.26000976 5625	26	28.3.10.2.2.		A			648	"The same cyclic shift is". Should be " The same cyclic shifts are"	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:58:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:58:43Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 155 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11403	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	45	T	Y	404.45001220703125	45	28.3.10.6		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	w_T_L-SIG (t) should be w_T_RL-SIG (t)	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:29:40Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11403 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11404	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	59	T	Y	404.58999633 78906	59	28.3.10.6		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	w_T_L-SIG (t) should be w_T_RL-SIG (t)	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:31:09Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11404 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11405	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	406	26	T	Y	406.26000976 5625	26	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	"Set to the value of the SPATIAL_REUSE parameter of the TXVECTOR, which contains a value from Table 28-21 (Spatial Reuse subfield encoding for an HES	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:07:43Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18/0006r4. (There's a typo on the CID number which shoul	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:47:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 156 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11406	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	411	57	T	Y	411.57000732421875	57	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	"STBC is not applied in MU-MIMO RUs." and "STBC is not applied in RUs that are used for MUMIMO allocation" are duplicated. Remove the 2nd statement	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:10:49Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0006r4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:50:19Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11407	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.7.3	418	33	T	Y	418.32998657 22656	33	28.3.10.7.3		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	Add the defintion of m sequence	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:11:02Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0006r4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:50:47Z - statement added to variable list, not location in editing instruction	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11408	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	1	T	Y	423.01000976 5625	1	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0324r1	520	"HE-SIG-B content channel 1 occupies the tones [-500:-259]". The statement is incorrect, it confuse the HE-SIGB content channel location (1st and 2rd	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:37:58Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0324-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:42:11Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 157 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11409	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	29	T	Y	423.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0051r1	463	"last User field in the The User Specific field of an HE-SIG-B content channel consists of one or more ..". Wrong sentence with grammar errror	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:11:06Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0051-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11410	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	54	T	Y	423.54000854 49219	54	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0324r1	520	"HE-SIG-B content channel 1 occupies subcarriers [-1012:-771]". The statement is incorrect, it confuse the HE-SIGB content channel location (1st and	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:38:14Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0324-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:42:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11411	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	426	47	E	Y	426.47000122 07031	47	28.3.10.8.5		J			648	Remove the blank line before "Use the same .."	as in the comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:41:38Z) - Issue no longer exists following resolution to other comments.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:41:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 158 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11412	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	431	4	T	Y	431.04000854 49219	4	28.3.10.8.6		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	NSTS is the number of space-time stream instead of spatial streams.	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:12:54Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:16:24Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11413	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.9	434	7	T	Y	434.07000732 421875	7	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"and extra coefficients selected out of or at tone indices which are null but shall have the HE-STF coefficients after mapping M sequences to each 20	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:45:57Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1413 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:55:32Z - see #13480	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11414	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	49	T	Y	435.48999023 4375	49	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Please use more accurate description of alpha_r in P397L8	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:53:15Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1414 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:55:54Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 159 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11415	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.10	437	12	T	Y	437.11999511 71875	12	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	For TB PPDU, 2x LTF + 0.8us support is not mandatory.	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:58:09Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11415 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:54:18Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11416	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.10	437	24	T	Y	437.23999023 4375	24	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	The end of Line 24 to Line 28 is exact duplication of Line 1 to line 5	remode the duplication in line 24 to 28	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:58:22Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11416 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:59:13Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11417	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.10.10	446	23	T	Y	446.23001098 63281	23	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	What's the definition of m? Change to "corresponding to the mth spatial time stream..."	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:58:33Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11417 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 19:48:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 160 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11418	Bin Tian	230	2	28.3.3.2	363	40	T	Y	363.39999938964844	40	28.3.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0934r1	596	In HE80 tone plan, the boundary of RU242s is not aligned with the 20MHz physical channel boundary. If a RU has a few tones into the 20 MHz channel of p	Need to add RU transmission and/or tone puncutring rules for preamble puncturing	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:52:37Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11418, 12580, 12796 and 13764 in 11-18/0934r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11419	Bo Sun	230	2	28.1.1	328	28	E	Y	328.27999877992969	28	28.1.1		V			648	The description is redundant, combine description of the transmitter and receiver behavior for more than 4 spatial stream of LDPC.	change"---LDPC coding (transmit) in all supported HE PPDU types, RU sizes, and number of spatial streams if the STA declares support for transmitting	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:33:31Z) - Resolved as suggested with #13992. No further change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:33:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 161 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11420	Bo Sun	230	2	28.1.1	330	28	T	Y	330.27999987792969	28	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	The description for "20 MHz operating STA" in "may" part is not in consistence with what's described in "shall" part nor in consistence with the defi	Modify the description with correct conception of "20 MHz operating STA".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:50:53Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID11420 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:17:23Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11421	Bo Sun	230	2	28.1.1	330	25	T	Y	330.25	25	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	In line 13, it states the 20 MHz-only STA shall suppport 26-, 52-, 106-tone RU and 242-tone RU sizes and locations in 40MHz channel width in the 2.4 GHz band" to "For a 20	change" For a 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA, 26-, 52-, 106-, and 242-tone RU sizes and locations in 40 MHz channel width in the 2.4 GHz band" to "For a 20	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:50:35Z) Comment 11421 is similar in nature to CID11420 and the resolution of CID11420 applies here as well.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:17:50Z - see #11420	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 162 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11422	Bo Sun	230	2	28.2.1	332	7	T	Y	332.07000732421875	7	28.2.1		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	The vector TRIGVECTOR is defined in D2.0 for receiving HE TB PPDU. It should be introduced in section 28.2.1.	change "The interface includes TXVECTOR, RXVECTOR, and PHYCONFIG_VECTOR." to "The interface includes TXVECTOR, RXVECTOR, TRIGVECTOR and PHYCONFIG_VECT	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:45:10Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11423	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.4	372	54	T	Y	372.54000854 49219	54	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	In 80Mhz PPDU frequency segment of Figure 28-12, there is no null sub carrier between 242RU tone in one side of 40Mhz bandwidth	Re-figure 80MHz bandwidth part of Figure28-12	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:57:00Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 11423) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:40:56Z - Manual edit to figure	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 163 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11424	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.5	377	39	G	Y	377.39001464 84375	39	28.3.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	There is no transmit block diagram for DL MU-MIMO with BCC	Add transmit block diagram for DL MU-MIMO with BCC. If that's the same as in 11ac, add a note to refer to the counterpart in 11ac.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:16:55Z) It's good to see every possible combination but it would make this section bulky if we exaust all diagrams. We a	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:08:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11425	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.6.10.1	386	61	T	Y	386.60998535 15625	61	28.3.6.10.1		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	QPSK DCM,BPSK DCM and 16QAM DCM are missing in mapping step i);	change i) step to "Constellation mapper: Map to BPSK,BPSK DCM, QPSK, QPSK DCM, 16-QAM,16-QAM DCM, 64-QAM, or 256-QAM constellation points as described	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:28:50Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:44:08Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 164 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11426	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.6.10.2	387	40	G	Y	387.39999938964844	40	28.3.6.10.2		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	QPSK DCM,BPSK DCM and 16QAM DCM are missing in mapping step h);	change h) step to "Constellation mapper: Map to BPSK,BPSK DCM, QPSK,QPSK DCM, 16-QAM,16-QAM DCM, 64-QAM, or 256-QAM constellation points as described	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:30:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:45:36Z - Leave 1024 QAM listed	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11427	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	407	4	E	N	407.04000085449219	4	28.3.10.7.2		V			648	The subscript of Nsts should be in capital form	change"N_{sts}" to "N_{STS}"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:02:36Z) - Change name to "NSTS And Midamble Periodicity" for consistency with other field names that include subscripte	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:03:26Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11428	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	432	30	E	N	432.29998779296875	30	28.3.10.8.6		A			648	The subscript of Nsts should be in capital form	change"N_{sts}" to "N_{STS}"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:53:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:54:01Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11429	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	432	44	E	N	432.44000244140625	44	28.3.10.8.6		A			648	The subscript of Nsts should be in capital form	change"N_{sts}" to "N_{STS}"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:54:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:54:31Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 165 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11430	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	433	3	E	N	433.02999987792969	3	28.3.10.8.6		A			648	The subscript of Nsts should be in capital form	change"N_{sts}" to "N_{STS}"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:54:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:54:51Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11431	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	424	60	E	N	424.60000061035156	60	28.3.10.8.4		V			648	Rate should be R=1/2.	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:35:53Z) - Consistently use "R = 1/2"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:36:20Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11432	Bo Sun	230	2	27.6.3	256	43	T	Y	256.42999267578125	43	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"BRP trigger" that BRP is short for Beam Refinement Protocol in 11ad of 802.11-2016. There is confilict between two abbreviations.	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:41:41Z) Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to replace “BRP” with “BFRP” throughout the draft. TGax editor to make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 166 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11433	Bo Sun	230	2	27.6.3	256	45	T	Y	256.45001220703125	45	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"BRP trigger" that BRP is short for Beam Refienement Protocol in 11ad of 802.11-2016.	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:42:19Z) Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to replace “BRP” with “BFRP” throughout the draft. TGax editor to make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11434	Bo Sun	230	2	27.6.5	269	28	T	Y	269.27999877792969	28	27.6.5		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0630r0	614	Besides the mentioned parameters, there're still some parameters in the TXVECTOR to form the HE-SIG-A of an HE NDP such as MCS,DCM.	Clarify how other parameters are set, or clarify these are only part of the TXVECTOR parameters for an HE NDP.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:39:42Z) Setting of the other parameters are an implementation specific. The spec just mentions interoperability requireme	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 19:56:20Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 167 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11435	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	14	T	Y	367.14001464 84375	14	28.3.3.6		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	Since a 20 MHz operating STA shall operate on the primary 20 MHz, it's not necessary to list RUs on secondary channels that are not allowed to alloc at	Remove RUs on secondary channels.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:32:52Z) A 20 MHz operating STA with dot11HESubchannelSelectiveTransmissionImplemented equal to true may now operate in a	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11436	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	422	36	G	Y	422.35998535 15625	36	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	In Figure28-26 the note "[-112:112]" at the left side of the figure is misleading. The 20 MHz symbol carrying HE-SIG-B only has only 64 sub-carriers.	Remove the note "[-112:112]"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:08:48Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:38:20Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 168 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11437	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	422	53	G	Y	422.52999877 92969	53	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	In Fgure28-27 the note"[-244:-3][3:244]" at the left side of the figure is misleading. The 20 MHz symbol carrying HE-SIG-B only has only 64 sub-carrie	Remove the note at the left side of the figure	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:09:03Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:38:26Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11438	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	34	G	Y	423.33999633 78906	34	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	In Fgure28-28 the note"[-500:-259][-258:-17][-16:-4,4:16][17:258][259:500] " at the left side of the figure is misleading. The 20 MHz symbol carrying	Remove the note at the left side of the figure	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:11:30Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:39:27Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11439	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	434	10	G	Y	434.10000610 35156	10	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	In Fgure28-28 the note"[-1012:-771]...[771:1012] " at the left side of the figure is misleading. The 20 MHz symbol carrying HE-SIG-B only has only 64	Remove the note at the left side of the figure	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:13:28Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:48:38Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 169 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11440	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.4	372	65	T	Y	372.64999938964844	65	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	The figure 28-12 describes the tone plan for HE PPDU data field, not matching the figure's title or its purpose.	provide a corresponding figure to match the description in the paragraph above the figure.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:58:53Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 11440) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:41:39Z title changed	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11441	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	368	62	T	Y	368.61999511171875	62	28.3.3.9.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	It's the first time the term "HE-SIG-B content channel" is used. It's supposed a brief definition or explanation is introduced for better understandin	Add a brief or definition to "HE-SIG-B content channel" at the first time it's used.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:44:53Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 11441 in 11-18/0508r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:05:02Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 170 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11442	Bo Sun	230	2	28.2.3	349	34	T	Y	349.33999633 78906	34	28.2.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	The parameter "MIDAMBLE_PERIODICIT" should be included in TRIGVECTOR	as per comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:45:58Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11443	Bo Sun	230	2	28.3.20	502	58	T	Y	502.57998657 22656	58	28.3.20		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	In case of transmitting a triger frame and receiving HE TB PPDU, the spec should specify the procecess that MAC indicates the receiving parameter to P	In section 28.3.20 or section 28.3.21, adding description for the process as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:11:51Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 11443.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:41:34Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 171 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11444	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	32		G	N	32		3.2		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	definition has bad/confusing grammar	Original: A non-AP HESTA that indicates in the Channel Width Set subfield in the HE PHY Capabilities Information field of the HE Capabilities element	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:21:56Z) The current text as if is both technically and grammatically sound. The comment appears to be a personal prefere	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11445	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	34	12	E	N	34.119998931884766	12	3.2		A			447	bad grammar	should be "STA that supports"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:24:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:24:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11446	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	34	16	E	N	34.159999847 41211	16	3.2		A			447	bad grammar	should be "AP that supports"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:25:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:25:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11447	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	34	19	E	N	34.189998626708984	19	3.2		V			447	bad grammar	Original: An OFDM-based multiple access scheme that different group of subcarriers are allocated to different users of the channel Updated: An OFDM-b	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:31:01Z) - that different group -> in which groups	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:31:06Z - see #12973	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11448	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	34	38	E	N	34.380001068115234	38	3.2		A			447	wrong word	should be "spatial reuse (SR)"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:38:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:38:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 172 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11449	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	34	43	E	N	34.430000030517578	43	3.2		A			447	wrong word	should be "spatial reuse (SR)"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:38:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:38:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11450	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.2	34	50	E	N	34.5	50	3.2		A			447	wrong word	should be "spatial reuse (SR)"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:39:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:39:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11451	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.4	35		G	N	35		3.4		J			648	ER as extended range needed in 3.4 Acronyms	include ER Extended Range in acronym list	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:18:44Z) - Unnessary since ER as an acronym is only used in terms such as HE ER SU PPDU and not by itself.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:19:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11452	Carol Ansley	230	2	8.3.4.4	45	27	E	N	45.270000457763 67	27	8.3.4.4		A			447	missing new line	add new line to separate "CBW160 for 160 MHz" from "CBW80+80 for 80+80 MHz"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:35:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:35:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11453	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	9	E	N	56.090000152 58789	9	9.2.4.5.6		A			447	add comma	add comma between " an HE AP" and "the Queue Size subfield"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:22:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:23:00Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 173 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11454	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	33	E	N	56.330001831 05469	33	9.2.4.5.6		A			447	add "the"	add "the": "the actual value of queue size" becomes "the actual value of the queue size"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:29:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:29:31Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11455	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	62	18	E	N	62.180000305 17578	18	9.2.4.6.4.3		V			447	missing punctuation	Original: "Max VHT NSS is at the BW indicated by VHT Capabilities element, for all allowed MCS values the Max VHT NSS values are same, but the support	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:00:11Z) - As suggested but use bandwidth, not BW.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:00:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11456	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	6	E	N	65.059997558 59375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	Misspelling	"Uosolicited MFB" should be "Unsolicited MFB"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:02:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:02:59Z - see #12983	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 174 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11457	Carol Ansley	230	2	3.4	35	29	G	N	35.290000915527344	29	3.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	HLA for HE Link Adaptation needed in Acronyms	HLA isn't in the acronym list	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 19:54:08Z) Revised. Add HLA, HE link adaptation, to section Abbreviations and Acronyms. TGax editor adds the following abb	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11458	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	50	E	N	65.5	50	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	global search/replace for sub filed needed	one example is line 50, but I found 3 or 4 more in the document when I searched for them	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:11:39Z) - Replace the 3 or 4 subfiled with subfield.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:12:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11459	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	35	E	N	66.349998474121211	35	9.2.4.6.4.4		V			447	missing Figure number	referenced figure is XXX	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:31Z) - Figure 9-15f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:45Z - see #14152	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11460	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	65	E	N	79.650001525878 9	65	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	wrong figure reference	figure reference should be Figure 9-38c	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:19Z - see #12679	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 175 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11461	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.3.1.9.8	80	34	G	N	80.339996337 89062	34	9.3.1.9.8		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	sentence fragment	lines 34 and 35 are a sentence fragment. Not sure what was meant there. Complete sentence or delete.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:57:53Z) Revised. The part pointed out is resolved by CID 12595.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:17:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
11462	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.1.17	103	47	E	N	103.47 000122 070312	47	9.4.1.17		A			447	stray parenthesis	parenthesis doesn't have a mate and should be removed	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:52:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:52:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11463	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	5	E	N	136.05 000305 17578	5	9.4.2.237.2		A			447	consistent use of Support	Should be "MU Cascading Support" instead of "MU Cascading Supported" for consistency	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:53:17Z) - This is the only incorrect instance.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:53:29Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11464	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	32	E	N	136.32 000732 421875	32	9.4.2.237.2		A			447	consistent use of Support	Should be "OFDMA RA Support" instead of "OFDMA RA Supports" for consistency	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:53:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:53:38Z - see #12666	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11465	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	39	G	N	136.38 999938 964844	39	9.4.2.237.2		J	Liwen Chu		657	Blank entries for Max S-MPDU Length Exponent	either fill in information or delete entry from table	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 176 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11466	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	139	44	T	N	139.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.237.2		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0046r0	453	Is Dual Band supportbit needed?	seems to be unnecessary given that the Channel Width Set explicitly separates 2.4 and 5 GHz support, so the information can be derived from that field	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:36:34Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID11466 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0046r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:50:05Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11467	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	146	36	E	N	146.36000061035156	36	9.4.2.237.4		A			447	extra F in Ffigure	correct FFigure to Figure	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:19:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:19:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11468	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	147	8	E	N	147.08000183 10547	8	9.4.2.237.4		A			447	bad grammar	Original: The maximum HE NSS in receive for a given MCS is equal to the smaller of:" Updated: "The maximum received HE NSS for a given MCS is equal t	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:20:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:20:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 177 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11469	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	147	22	E	N	147.22000122070312	22	9.4.2.237.4		A			447	bad grammar	Original: The maximum HE NSS in transmit for a given MCS is equal to the smaller of:" Updated: " The maximum transmitted HE NSS for a given MCS is equ	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:21:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:21:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11470	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	46	E	N	157.46000671 38672	46	9.4.2.243		V		17/1852r8	474	missing word	missing "during" before " SRP-based SR transmissions."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:21:05Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11471	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.4.2.244	158	47	E	N	158.47000122070312	47	9.4.2.244		V		18/0149r3	565	misspelling "Ressource"	"Resource" in exponent should be "Resource"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:46:14Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11472	Carol Ansley	230	2	9.7.3	170	38	E	N	170.38000488 28125	38	9.7.3		A			447	extra closing parenthesis	Should be 2 parentheses after HCCA: "(HCCA))"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 23:01:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 23:01:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 178 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11473	Carol Ansley	230	2	11.2.3.17	213	64	E	N	213.63999938964844	64	11.2.3.17		A			447	poor wording	Original: "the element is included to a Beacon frame." Updated: "the element is included in a Beacon frame."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:48:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:48:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11474	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.2.2	222	37	E	N	222.36999511171875	37	27.2.2		A			447	Stray ")"	Stray parenthesis at end of line - delete parenthesis	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11475	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.2.4	223	40	T	N	223.39999389648438	40	27.2.4		A	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	make wording less ambiguous	Original: "if one of the two NAV timers is non zero," Updated: "if at least one of the NAV timers is non zero," Change in text addresses the case of w	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:36:30Z) Accepted – The suggested editorial revision has been incorporated by the editor in D2.2. See D2.2 and the resol	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 179 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11476	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.3.1	229	64	E	N	229.63999938964844	64	27.3.1		V			447	confusing grammar	original: "We call dynamic fragments the fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation." Updated: "We call the fragments generated with dynamic frag	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:14:41Z) - see #14241	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:14:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11477	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	41	E	N	230.41000366210938	41	27.3.2.1		V			447	confusing grammar	Original: "A Multi-STA BlockAck frame with a BA Information field corresponding to the TID of the transmitted fragments is not present" Updated: "A M	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:11:53Z) - See #13165	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:12:04Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11478	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.3.2.1	231	43	E	N	230.42999267578125	43	27.3.2.1		V			447	confusing grammar	Original: "A BlockAck or Multi-STA BlockAck frame with a BA Information field that corresponds to the TID of the transmitted fragments is present and	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:21:38Z) - see #13165	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:21:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 180 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11479	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	61	E	N	231.61000061035156	61	27.3.2.4		A			447	missing apostrophe	Updated: "reducing the fragments' transmission delay"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:23:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:23:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11480	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.4.2	236	32	E	N	236.32000732421875	32	27.4.2		A			447	missing article	Should be "The recipient of a single-TID A-MPDU"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:06:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:06:49Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11481	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.4.2	236	37	E	N	236.36999511 71875	37	27.4.2		A			447	missing article	Should be: "The recipient of a multi-TID A-MPDU"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:07:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:07:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11482	Carol Ansley	230	2	27.4.2	236	48	E	N	236.47999572753906	48	27.4.2		A			447	needs plural and article	Should be:"different acknowledgment contexts for generating a Multi-STA BlockAck frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:10:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:10:43Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11483	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		221	19	T	N	221.19000244140625	19	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	The dot11TXOPDurationRTSThreshold is sent to associated STAs in HE operation element either individually or to all associated STAs. There shoul d be a	commenter will submit contribution to propose a solution.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:21:19Z) Revised- See the discussion part of 11-18/0455r2. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:22:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11484	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		221	26	E	N	221.25999450683594	26			A			648	"HE operation elements". There is only one HE operation element.	delete the "s'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:16:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:16:05Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11485	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		222	7	E	N	222.07000732421875	7			V			648	"UL_-FLAG". Typo	change to "UL_UPLINK"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:18:48Z) - "UPLINK_FLAG"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:18:59Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11486	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		179	28	E	N	179.27999877929688	28			J			648	dot11RTSThreshold shows up four times in the spec but there is no definition about it. Is this a typo?	Revised the text	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:27:21Z) - Part of baseline MIB	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:27:47Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11487	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		179	30	E	N	179.30000030517578	30			J			648	".. Threshold is 1023 or it is not present". What is "not present" means and should it be "not 1023"?. If the MIB parameter is not configured, an STA	revised the test. "... Threshold is not 1023".	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:30:19Z) - The intent is that dot11RTSThreshold applies if dot11TXOPDurationRTSThreshold is either not present or is pr	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:31:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 182 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11488	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		222	51	T	N	222.50999450683594	51	27.2.2		V	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	"If the received frame does . ." . Is this paragraph really necessary? Does it say actually anything?	Delete the paragraph	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:36:43Z) Revised – Agree in general with the comment. We put the description as a note since this is already described i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11489	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		223	21	T	N	223.21000671 38672	21	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	HE STA shall maintain .. Two NAVs	Is it necessary to make it a "shall"? There is no way to enforce it and it is almost impossible to verify. It serves no real purpose by saying HE STA	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:42:06Z) Rejected- The purpose of maintaitng two NAV timers is described in the second paragraph of 27.2.4. Verifing t	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:39:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11490	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		242	31	E	N	242.30999755859375	31			J			657	"A STA shall not ....". DL NU-MIMO is for AP to transmit,	Change STA to AP	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 183 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11491	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		243	19	T	N	243.19000244140625	19	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	If AP do not indicate its support BQR, why will an STA send its BQR report to AP. The "otherwise ...." sentence is not necessary.	Delete "otherwise ...." sentence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11492	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		243	27	E	N	243.27000427246094	27			J			657	The whole paragraph from ll27-31 is redundant. It just repeating the similar statement is this clause.	Delete the paragraph	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11493	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		245	53	T	N	245.52999877929688	53	27.5.3.2.1		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"A non-AP STA ...". There is no reason to limited an non-AP STA that is capable of receiving UL MU OFDM frames from not being able to send trigger fra	Add the following sentence. "A non-AP STA shall not send a Trigger frame or a frame with a UMRS Control field when operate in infrastructure mode. An	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 184 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11494	Chao Chun Wang	230	2		255	8	E	N	255.08000018310547	8			J			657	If AP do not indicate its support BSR, why will an STA send its BSR report to AP. The "otherwise ...." sentence is not necessary.	Delete "otherwise ...." sentence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11495	Chittabrata Ghosh	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	N	314.58999633378906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	In the text "An HE STA may transmit a 242-tone HE ER SU PPDU to a peer HE STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the	Define Full Bandwidth Extended Range field in the HE Capabilities element and link to the transmission of 242-tone HE ER SU PPDU.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:40:33Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11496	Chunyu Hu	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	432	32	T	Y	432.32000732421875	32	28.3.10.8.6		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	There is no definition of load balancing before usage. Load balancing is a general term in network, but is complete new in this new context of HE SIG-	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:06:52Z) Editor please make changes shown in document 11-18-0118r6 under comment 11496	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:08:04Z - see #12639	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 185 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11497	Chunyu Hu	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	67	17	T	Y	67.16999816894531	17	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	The Queue size High and Queue Size All in the BSR Control is poorly designed. The range as well as granularity doesn't serve well the purpose of predi	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11498	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.3.1.8	75	54	T	Y	75.54000091552734	54	9.3.1.8		J	Tomoko Adachi	733r3	637	A mechanism is needed which allows the transmitter to request the receiver(s) to flush outstanding fragamented frames RX buffer. The idea/motivation/n	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:34:50Z) Rejected. To make the recipient flush the imcomplete MSDUs up to the intended sequence number, the originator	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 23:44:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 186 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11499	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.5.3.6	254	49	T	Y	254.49000549316406	49	27.5.3.6		J	Abhishek Patil		657	The Queue size High and Queue Size All in the BSR Control is poorly designed. It doesn't provide sufficient information of UL OFDMA/MIMO scheduling. N	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11500	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.3.1.23.3	95	25	T	Y	95.25	25	9.3.1.23.3		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	A transmitter-commanded RX buffer flushing mechanism is needed for MU-BAR. It is selective in that the recipient only flushes in complete MSDUs up to	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:06:56Z) Rejected - This is a new feature that requires significant change to the draft with minimal gains in broad scen	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 187 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11501	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.2.2	221	52	T	Y	221.52000427246094	52	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	726r0	640	TXOP duration-based RTS/CTS mechanism is very clear. E.g. if txop is 10 ms and it is big enough to hold 5 DATA/ACK exchange -- is the STA required to	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:01:46Z) Rejected- In the TXOP duration-based RTS/CTS mechanism, RTS/CTS frame exchange is occurred at the beginning of	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11502	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.7.1	168	42	T	Y	168.41999816 89453	42	9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	It is highly possible that multiple MPDU delimiter may be inserted between MPDUs. Usefull information such as color, can be inserted into HE MPDU deli	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:47:33Z) Rejected. Discussion: Changing MPDU Delimiter may provide some benefit. However the complexity introduced can't	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 188 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11503	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.2.5.2	226	30	T	Y	226.30000030517578	30	27.2.5.2		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0353r1	577	MU-RTS procedure doesn't provide sufficient support for range extension mode operation. A near edge STA after receive MU-RTS frame from AP may not be	as in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:07:30Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0353r1 under all headings that include CID 14328.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #14328	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11504	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.15.2	315	32	T	Y	315.32000732421875	32	27.15.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"If a Control frame is sent as a response to a soliciting HE ER SU PPDU the frame shall be carried in an HE ER SU PPDU except when the most recent suc	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:41:19Z) Rejected – An HE TB PPDU cannot be solicited with an HE ER SU PPDU (please refer to the multiple subclauses tha	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 189 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11505	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.5.3.2	245	53	T	Y	245.52999877929688	53	27.5.3.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"A non-AP STA shall not send a Trigger frame or a frame with a UMRS Control field." is too restrictive. A non-AP STA should be given the flexiblity of	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11506	Chunyu Hu	230	2	10.22.2.5	195	56	T	Y	195.55999755859375	56	10.22.2.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	per20MHzbitmap is too restrictive. In many case the interference appear as a narrow band signal. Small granularity is more useful for the AP to make c	as in the comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:25:52Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 190 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11507	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.5.2	243	1	T	Y	243.00999450683594	1	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	per20MHzbitmap is too restrictive. In many case the interference appear as a narrowband signal. Small granularity is more useful for the AP to make c	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11508	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.6.1	263	8	T	Y	263.07998657 22656	8	27.6.1		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/0043r0	495	"As with the VHT sounding protocol," doesn't provide much technical vlaue here. Clarify otherwise remove it.	as in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:02:21Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0043r0 under all headings that include CID 11508	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 16:50:07Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 191 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11509	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.3.1.20	83	39	T	Y	83.389999389 64844	39	9.3.1.20		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	When RA is set to broadcast address, the only way to differentiate the HE trigger based sounding procedure from VHT sounding procedure is the Dis ambig	as in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:39:18Z) The differentiation between the two sounding sequences is based on the presence of the HE field of value 1 in the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11510	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	43	T	Y	79.430000305 17578	43	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	In "An HE AP that transmits a Multi-STA BlockAck frame with different values of the AID11 subfield in Per AID TID Info subfields sets the RA field to	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:10:36Z) Rejected. As normative requirements are not allowed in clause 9, “should” cannot be used here.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 192 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11511	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	Y	55.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.4		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	"When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ack, Block Ack, or Multi-STA BlockAck fram	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:07:48Z) Rejected – Allowing HTP Ack in a non-HE PPDU has limited technical merits.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:08:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11512	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	16	T	Y	56.159999847 41211	16	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	By adoping the current scaling factor, during the range of 17408 to 148480, the granularity is bigger than 2K bytes, meaning under most of pratcialus	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11513	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	46	T	Y	59.459999084 472656	46	9.2.4.6.4.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	If the DL data is sent in ERSU PPDU soliciting TB PPDU for ACK. DCM should be allowed on ACK/BA/M-BA.	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 193 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11514	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	22	T	Y	85.220001220703 12	22	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	In response to a basic trigger frame, the non-AP STA can put not only acknowledge frame (ACK/BA/MBA) in HE_TB, but also DATA frame if the duration is	as in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:09:11Z) The Trigger Dependent User Info field of Basic Trigger carries TID Aggregation Limit subfield which already provi	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:10:44Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11515	Chunyu Hu	230	2	9.6.30	167	39	T	Y	167.38999938964844	39	9.6.30		J	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	To enhance with 11ax feature, propose to add a field /option to indicate during the Quiet Time Period, only trigger based UL OFDMA access is allowed. A	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:37:33Z) Rejected: The comment should submit a proposal for the change.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 194 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11516	Chunyu Hu	230	2	27.2.5	225	14	T	Y	225.13999938964844	14	27.2.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0353r1	577	The MU-RTS/CTS procedure has a flaw here: if all non-AP STAs are far away from the AP, then none of the CTS can reach AP. However, the DL HE_MU can ac	as in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:08:01Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0353r1 under all headings that include CID 14328.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #14328	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11517	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	419	25	T	Y	419.25	25	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:38:00Z) It is not necessary to have a separate equation for UL MU. is defined as the set of 20MHz channels on which L-S	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 195 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11518	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	419	64	T	Y	419.64001464 84375	64	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:38:20Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11519	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	420	3	T	Y	420.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS seems undefined in Table 28-15 for HE TB PPDU and HE ER SU PPDU. Is it per-user or total over all users with HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:39:53Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1519 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #1 1615	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 196 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11520	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	420	3	T	Y	420.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: " In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:40:10Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE TB PPDU format.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11521	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	420	3	T	Y	420.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:40:27Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11521 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:44:54Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11522	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	420	3	T	Y	420.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	how is preamble puncturing performed? i_BW is a series, not part of a set as in BEAM_CHANGE=1 equation.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:40:46Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE MU or HE TB PPDU format. Preamble puncturing only applies to HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 197 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11523	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	421	3	T	Y	421.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:41:29Z) Equations (28-18) and (28-19) are extensions of equation (28-16) and (28-17), describing HEER PPU HE-SIG-A field	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11524	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	421	3	T	Y	421.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	instead of defining N_20MHz=1, remove i_BW and K_shift from the equation	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:41:45Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11524 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:06:48Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11525	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	421	22	T	Y	421.22000122 07031	22	28.3.10.7.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS seems undefined in Table 28-15 for HEER SUPPDU.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:42:05Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11525 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11615	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 198 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11526	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	421	22	T	Y	421.22000122 07031	22	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:42:24Z) Equations (28-18) and (28-19) are extensions of equation (28-16) and (28-17), describing HEER PPU HE-SIG-A field	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11527	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	421	22	T	Y	421.22000122 07031	22	28.3.10.7.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	instead of defining N_20MHz=1, remove i_BW and K_shift from the equation	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:42:35Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11527 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:54:20Z- see #11524	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11528	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	425	41	T	Y	425.41000366 21094	41	28.3.10.8.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	what is N_SR? Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:44:48Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11528 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:13:03Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 199 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11529	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	425	58	T	Y	425.57998657 22656	58	28.3.10.8.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	I don't see N_20MHz used in Eq. 28-20.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:44:59Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11529 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:13:11Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11530	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	426	48	T	Y	426.48001098 63281	48	28.3.10.8.5		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	something is weird with the formatting. Its seems like "Use the same value in both HE-SIG-B content channels." should be part of the 80 MHz descripti	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:01:07Z) Editor instruction: implement the proposed resolution to CID 11530 as in 11-18/0118r6	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:52:54Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11531	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	428	1	T	Y	428.01000976 5625	1	28.3.10.8.5		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	What does "Number of entries" mean for cases that are "Reserved" in Table 28-24?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:02:58Z) It simply means the number of reserved entries	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:53:14Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 200 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11532	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	428	41	T	Y	428.41000366 21094	41	28.3.10.8.5		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Table 28-24, Regarding "10y2y1y0z2z1z0", how do you multiplex 64 users together in three RUs?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:03:22Z) The number 64 indicates the total combinatorial options of multiplexing up to 8 users on each 106RU using DL MU-	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:53:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11533	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	434	15	T	Y	434.14999389 64844	15	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Eq 28-22 is not clear. Both equations have a value at HES_0. The top equation has the value (1+j)/sqrt(2), but bottom equation has the value 0. Wh	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:46:30Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1533 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 201 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11534	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	434	64	T	Y	434.64001464 84375	64	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Eq 28-28 is not clear. Both equations have a value at HES_248 and HES_-248. The top equation has the value (1+j)/sqrt(2) and (-1-j)/sqrt(2), but bo	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:46:40Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11534 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11535	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	1	T	Y	435.01000976 5625	1	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Eq 28-29 is not clear. Both equations have a value at HES_504 and HES_-504. Which is it?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:46:49Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11535 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11536	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	3.2	34	27	T	Y	34.270000457 76367	27	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	What is the difference between definitions of SRP PPDU and DSRP PPDU?	They seem identical, so just use one.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:48:10Z) TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11536. Commenter should read the res	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 202 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11537	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	20	T	Y	56.20000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	It looks like there is a strike through in Eq 9-ax1. Is is supposed to be an underline?	as in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11538	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	43	T	Y	86.43000030517578	43	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	include a reference to how to calculate Length	as in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:13:01Z) An HE AP determines the length of the HE TB PPDU and indicates the value in the Length field. Responding STAs set	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:11:31Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11539	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	14	T	Y	88.13999938964844	14	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	18/0483r2	513	I can't find a definition or equation for N_STS,total. And include a reference to how to specifically calculate the number of HE-LTF symbols.	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:15:08Z) See changes proposed in document 802.11-18/0483r2. Text has been moved to the HE-LTF clause. The term N_STS,total	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:50:21Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 203 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11540	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	18	T	Y	88.180000305 17578	18	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	18/0483r2	513	"...the number of HE-LTF symbols is greater than or equal to the maximum...", can be misinterpreted as any value greater.	Better to say " the number of HE-LTF symbols is a function of the total number of space-time streams, NSTS,total and the encoding of the Number Of HE-L	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:51:19Z) - See changes proposed in document 802.11-18/0483r2. Text has been moved to the HE-LTF clause. Wording was chan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3				I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:51:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11541	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	18	T	Y	88.180000305 17578	18	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	18/0483r2	513	I can't find a definition or equation for N_STS,total. And include a reference to how to specifically calculate the number of HE-LTF symbols.	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:16:40Z) See changes proposed in document 802.11-18/0483r2. Text has been moved to the HE-LTF clause. The term N_STS,total	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3				I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:51:00Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11542	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	25	T	Y	97.25	25	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	Is "User Info field" for the NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame meant to replace the "User Info" field in the Trigger frame? Or is this really th	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:12:56Z) make this clarification. Apply the changes in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:13:06Z - This is not really a satisfactory resolution. All the Trigger frame variants have a common format for the User Info fie	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11543	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	19	T	Y	108.19000244140625	19	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	definition for "Sounding Dialog Token Number" seems incorrect, as it is the same as RU End Index	as in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11544	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	19	T	Y	135.19000244140625	19	9.4.2.237.2		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	what is the definition of "HEMFB"?	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 19:55:22Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies the definition as suggested. TGax editor to make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 205 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11545	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	47	T	Y	142.47000122070312	47	9.4.2.237.3		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0109r1	465	I can't find a definition or equation for N_STS,total	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:52:35Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID 11545 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:54:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11546	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	56	T	Y	142.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.237.3		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0109r1	465	I can't find a definition or equation for N_STS,total	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:53:00Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID 11546 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:54:53Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11547	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.238	150	43	T	Y	150.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.238		V	Abhishek Patil	365r1	536	What do you set BSS Color to in the HE Operation element if the "BSS Color Disabled" is set to 1.	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:42:29Z) Revised Agree with the comment that there is an ambiguity in the spec. Added spec text to clarify that BSS Color	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:54:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 206 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11548	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.243	156	48	T	Y	156.47999572753906	48	9.4.2.243		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Regarding, "The Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element provides information needed by STAs when performing OBSS_PD-based spatial reuse", what about SRP D	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:16:32Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11549	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	25	T	Y	157.25	25	9.4.2.243		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	what is "Non-OBSS_PD SR Disallowed"?	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:17:05Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11550	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	44	T	Y	157.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.243		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	what are the values of HESIGA_Spatial_reuse_value15_allowed?	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:17:36Z) Reference normative text for clarification. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 207 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11551	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	9.4.2.245	159	39	T	Y	159.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.245		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	66R0	472	In Table 9-262ag. 0-62 does not match -100 dBm to -37 dBm. Need to change to -38	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:11:22Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Replaced -37 with -38 in Table 9-262ag to make the range consistent TGax edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:57:30Z - see #13182	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11552	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.5.6.2.2	261	64	T	Y	261.64001464 84375	64	27.5.6.2.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	what is the definition for "RU_TONE_SET"?	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:22:31Z) RU_TONE_SET is replaced by RU_TONE_SET_INDEX. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11553	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.5.6.2.2	262	2	T	Y	262.01998901 36719	2	27.5.6.2.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	what is the definition for "RU_TONE_SET"?	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:24:26Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 208 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11554	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.5.6.4.1	262	38	T	Y	262.38000048828125	38	27.5.6.4.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	what is the definition for "RU_TONE_SET"?	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:25:49Z) RU_TONE_SET is replaced by RU_TONE_SET_INDEX. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11555	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.5.6.4.1	262	38	T	Y	262.38000048828125	38	27.5.6.4.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	why is RU_TONE_SET listed twice?	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:26:23Z) remove one iteration. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11556	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	40	T	Y	290.39999938964844	40	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	regarding "or the received PPDU contains a CTS and a PHY-CCA.indication transition from BUSY to IDLE occurred within the PIFS time immediately prec edi	as in comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:03:28Z) Disagree in principle. it is saying that you can ignore RTS/CTS, but not CTS alone.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 209 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11557	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	12	T	Y	293.11999951171875	12	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Table 27-6, what is "OBSS_PD SR Disallowed"?	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:46:12Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11558	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	56	T	Y	293.55999755859375	56	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	regarding "shall not perform SRP-based SR transmissions", why is this in the OBSS_PD-based section?	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:50:21Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11559	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	3	T	Y	294.02999877992969	3	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	the grammar in the paragraph is undecipherable	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:50:54Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 210 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11560	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	50	T	Y	296.5	50	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	what is difference between RX VECTOR BSS_COLOR and BSS color of the DSRP_PPDU? They seem like they would be derived from the same PPDU	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:31:49Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11560	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11561	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	37	T	Y	297.36999511871875	37	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	what is the correct Eq number?	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:15:59Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11561	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11562	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.9.4	298	53	T	Y	298.52999877992969	53	27.9.4		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	regarding "may use a value of positive infinity", why is the HE STA allowed to use positive infinity for OBSS_PD_level?	as in comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:21:28Z) - – positive infinity effectively disables OBSS_PD. Note that SRP SR is a mechanism that uses measured path inform	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 211 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11563	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.15.2	314	60	T	Y	314.60000061035156	60	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	Regarding "An HE STA may transmit a 242-tone HE ERSU PPDU to a peer HE STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the D	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:42:16Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11564	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	27.16.5	324	52	T	Y	324.51998901036719	52	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	what is "P20"?	as in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11565	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.2.2	342	39	T	Y	342.39001464375	39	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	"Set to 1 to indicate that either the midamble is present for the PPDU or that the channel is with high Doppler." Does this mean that the value is se	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:26:41Z) Reason: the current spec text follows HE-SIG-A's corresponding explanation.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:02:32Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 212 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11566	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.4	370	64	T	Y	370.64001464 84375	64	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	I count six PPDU formats: HE SU PPDU, HE MU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, HE TB PPDU, HE TB NDP feedback PPDU, and HE NDP PPDU. Please correct.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:15:04Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 11566) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:01:17Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11567	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.5	376	26	T	Y	376.26000976 5625	26	28.3.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	the transmitter block diagrams for the Data fields are essentially the same as 802.11ac. It would be more informative to provide diagrams for UL OFDM	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:15:47Z) UL OFDMA and UL MUMIMO are the same as SU PPDU as mentioned above Figure 28-18	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:07:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 213 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11568	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.2	381	61	T	Y	381.60998535 15625	61	28.3.6.2		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:19:04Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11568.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:36:08Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11569	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.2	381	64	T	Y	381.64001464 84375	64	28.3.6.2		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how do we determine Spatial Mapping for HE MU PPDU or	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:19:22Z) BEAM_CHANGE doesn't affect the spatial mapping for MU PPDU and TB PPDU. Spatial mapping will be the same as the	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 214 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11570	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.2	382	3	T	Y	382.02999877 92969	3	28.3.6.2		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HEMU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:19:38Z) Tgax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11570.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	See #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11571	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.3	382	25	T	Y	382.25	25	28.3.6.3		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HEMU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:19:56Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11571.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	See #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 215 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11572	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.3	382	29	T	Y	382.29000854 49219	29	28.3.6.3		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how do we determine Spatial Mapping for HE MU PPDU or	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:20:12Z) BEAM_CHANGE doesn't affect the spatial mapping for MU PPDU and TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11573	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.3	382	33	T	Y	382.32998657 22656	33	28.3.6.3		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:20:24Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11573.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	See #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 216 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11574	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.4	383	1	T	Y	383.01000976 5625	1	28.3.6.4		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:21:20Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11574.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	See #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11575	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.4	383	5	T	Y	383.04998779 296875	5	28.3.6.4		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how do we determine Spatial Mapping for HE MU PPDU or	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:21:35Z) BEAM_CHANGE doesn't affect the spatial mapping for MU PPDU and TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 217 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11576	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.4	383	9	T	Y	383.08999633 78906	9	28.3.6.4		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:21:46Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11576.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	See #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11577	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.5	383	44	T	Y	383.44000244 140625	44	28.3.6.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:22:33Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11577.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:38:12Z - see #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 218 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11578	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.5	383	48	T	Y	383.48001098 63281	48	28.3.6.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how do we determine Spatial Mapping for HE MU PPDU or	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:22:46Z) BEAM_CHANGE doesn't affect the spatial mapping for MU PPDU and TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11579	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.5	383	52	T	Y	383.51998901 36719	52	28.3.6.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:22:58Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11579.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:38:25Z - see #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 219 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11580	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	19	T	Y	384.19000244140625	19	28.3.6.6		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:24:01Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11580.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:39:07Z - see #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11581	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	23	T	Y	384.23001098 63281	23	28.3.6.6		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how do we determine Spatial Mapping for HE MU PPDU or	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:24:13Z) BEAM_CHANGE doesn't affect the spatial mapping for MU PPDU and TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 220 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11582	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	28	T	Y	384.27999987792969	28	28.3.6.6		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HEMU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:24:25Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11582.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:39:17Z - see #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11583	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.7	385	34	T	Y	385.33999633978906	34	28.3.6.7		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HEMU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:26:20Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11583.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:41:14Z - see #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 221 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11584	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.7	385	38	T	Y	385.38000048828125	38	28.3.6.7		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how do we determine Spatial Mapping for HE MU PPDU or	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:26:31Z) BEAM_CHANGE doesn't affect the spatial mapping for MU PPDU and TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:41:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11585	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.7	385	42	T	Y	385.42001342 77344	42	28.3.6.7		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So what CSD is applied for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:26:44Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 11585	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:41:42Z - see #11568	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 222 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11586	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.8	385	53	T	Y	385.52999987792969	53	28.3.6.8		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Describe the per-user component with UL MU.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:26:57Z) After further clarification from the commenter, the commenter suggest to add the per user procedure, e.g. how to	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11587	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.9	386	10	T	Y	386.10000061035156	10	28.3.6.9		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Describe the per-user component with UL MU.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:27:16Z) After further clarification from the commenter, the commenter suggest to add the per user procedure, e.g. how to	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 223 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11588	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.10.1	386	39	T	Y	386.39001464 84375	39	28.3.6.10.1		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Describe the per-user component with HE TB PPDU.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:28:13Z) After further clarification from the commenter, the commenter suggest to add the per user procedure, e.g. how to	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11589	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.6.10.2	387	20	T	Y	387.20001220 703125	20	28.3.6.10.2		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Describe the per-user component with HE TB PPDU.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:29:28Z) After further clarification from the commenter, the commenter suggest to add the per user procedure, e.g. how to	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 224 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11590	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.8	392	52	T	Y	392.51998901 36719	52	28.3.8		J	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	for an HE MU PPDU, N_STS is a function of N_STS,r,total. But then on pg 393, line 12 N_STS,r,total is equal to N_STS. Somethin g seems wrong with thi	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:22:56Z) on pg 393, line 12 N_STS,r,total is equal to N_STS which only applies pre-HE modulated fields when BEAM_CHANGE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:56:49Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11591	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.8	393	12	T	Y	393.11999511 71875	12	28.3.8		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is N_STS,r,total determined for HE MU PPDU or HE T	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:23:09Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1591 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:58:02Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 225 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11592	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.9	396	37	T	Y	396.36999511 71875	37	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is total power determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:23:39Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1592 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:05:52Z - global change (NOTE--I don't think this global change is correct. In some instances, the change has been applied to HE	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11593	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.9	396	42	T	Y	396.42001342 77344	42	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:23:49Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1593 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:09:34Z - see #11592	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 226 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11594	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.9	396	44	T	Y	396.44000244140625	44	28.3.9		J	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:24:08Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU, there is no need to determine for pre-HE modu	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:09:44Z - see #11592	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11595	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.9	396	53	T	Y	396.52999877792969	53	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	I went to Table 28-13 and the title is "Tone allocation related constants for the Data field in a non-OFDMA HE PPDU". This does not apply to non-Data	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:24:20Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11595 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:12:20Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11596	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.9	398	47	T	Y	398.47000012207031	47	28.3.9		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:25:34Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1596 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:15:59Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11597	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.2.1	400	6	T	Y	400.05999755859375	6	28.3.10.2.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:49:27Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1597 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:12:41Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 228 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11598	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.2.1	400	12	T	Y	400.11999511 71875	12	28.3.10.2.1		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:50:05Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11599	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.2.2	400	21	T	Y	400.20999145 50781	21	28.3.10.2.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:50:20Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1599 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:13:32Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 229 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11600	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	400	34	T	Y	400.33999963378906	34	28.3.10.3		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:50:37Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11600 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:15:44Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11601	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	400	40	T	Y	400.39999938964844	40	28.3.10.3		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:50:56Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11601 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:23:51Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11602	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	400	40	T	Y	400.39999938964844	40	28.3.10.3		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	its not clear in an HE TB PPDU for a user with an RU <=242 in a 40, 80, or 160/80+80 MHz bandwidth, whether L-STF is transmitted in the user's 20 MH	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:51:12Z) In Clause 28.3.4 , it states that " In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11603	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	400	40	T	Y	400.39999938964844	40	28.3.10.3		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	some of the variables are defined below Eq 28-6, and some are not. Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:51:31Z) The variables are not defined below Equation (28-6) are defined in 28.3.9 below equation (28-4). Doc IEEE802.11-	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11604	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	400	63	T	Y	400.63000488128125	63	28.3.10.3		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"N20MHz" is not defined for 20 MHz.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:51:44Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1604 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:25:40Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 231 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11605	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	401	16	T	Y	401.16000036621094	16	28.3.10.3		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:52:15Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11606	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	401	25	T	Y	401.25	25	28.3.10.3		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS seems undefined in Table 28-15 for HE TB PPDU and HE ERSU PPDU. Is it per-user or total over all users with HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:55:01Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11606 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:48:50Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 232 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11607	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	401	25	T	Y	401.25	25	28.3.10.3		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:55:22Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE TB PPDU format.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11608	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	401	25	T	Y	401.25	25	28.3.10.3		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:55:44Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1 1608 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #1 1634	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11609	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.3	401	25	T	Y	401.25	25	28.3.10.3		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	how is preamble puncturing performed? i_BW is a series, not part of a set as in BEAM_CHANGE=1 equation.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:54:39Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE MU or HE TB PPDU format. Preamble puncturing only applies to HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 233 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11610	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	401	47	T	Y	401.47000122 07031	47	28.3.10.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:56:06Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11610 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:16:59Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11611	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	401	53	T	Y	401.52999877 92969	53	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	its not clear in an HE TB PPDU for a user with an RU <=242 in a 40, 80, or 160/80+80 MHz bandwidth, whether L-LTF is transmitted in the user's 20 MH	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:56:52Z) In Clause 28.3.4 , it states that " In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 234 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11612	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	401	53	T	Y	401.52999877 92969	53	28.3.10.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	some of the variables are defined below Eq 28-9, and some are not. Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:57:12Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11612 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:36:02Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11613	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	401	53	T	Y	401.52999877 92969	53	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:57:26Z) It is not necessary to have a separate equation for UL MU. is defined as the set of 20MHz channels on which L-S	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 235 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11614	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	402	12	T	Y	402.11999511 71875	12	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:57:50Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11615	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	402	20	T	Y	402.20001220 703125	20	28.3.10.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS seems undefined in Table 28-15 for HE TB PPDU and HE ER SU PPDU. Is it per-user or total over all users with HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:59:31Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11615 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:28:18Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 236 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11616	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	402	20	T	Y	402.20001220703125	20	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:58:44Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE TB PPDU format.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11617	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	402	20	T	Y	402.20001220703125	20	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:58:11Z) It is defined under Equation (28-8). Doc IEEE 802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable definiti	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 237 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11618	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.4	402	20	T	Y	402.20001220703125	20	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	how is preamble puncturing performed? i_BW is a series, not part of a set as in BEAM_CHANGE=1 equation.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:59:07Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE MU or HE TB PPDU format. Preamble puncturing only applies to HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11619	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	403	21	T	Y	403.20999145 50781	21	28.3.10.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:24:06Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11619 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:18:05Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 238 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11620	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	403	27	T	Y	403.2699890136719	27	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	its not clear in an HE TB PPDU for a user with an RU <=242 in a 40, 80, or 160/80+80 MHz bandwidth, whether L-SIG is transmitted in the user's 20 MH	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:25:44Z) In Clause 28.3.4 , it states that " In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11621	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	403	27	T	Y	403.2699890136719	27	28.3.10.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	some of the variables are defined below Eq 28-12, and some are not. Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:25:19Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11621 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:37:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 239 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11622	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	403	27	T	Y	403.26 998901 36719	27	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:25:03Z) It is not necessary to have a separate equation for UL MU. is defined as the set of 20MHz channels on which L-S	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11623	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	404	11	T	Y	404.10 998535 15625	11	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:26:06Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 240 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11624	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	404	16	T	Y	404.16000036621094	16	28.3.10.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS seems undefined in Table 28-15 for HE TB PPDU and HE ERSU PPDU. Is it per-user or total over all users with HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:27:29Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11624 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11615	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11625	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	404	16	T	Y	404.16000036621094	16	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:26:57Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE TB PPDU format.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 241 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11626	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	404	16	T	Y	404.16000036621094	16	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:26:31Z) It is defined under Equation (28-8). Doc IEEE 802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable definiti	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11627	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.5	404	16	T	Y	404.16000036621094	16	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	how is preamble puncturing performed? i_BW is a series, not part of a set as in BEAM_CHANGE=1 equation.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:27:51Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HEMU or HE TB PPDU format. Preamble puncturing only applies to HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 242 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11628	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	40	T	Y	404.39999938964844	40	28.3.10.6		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:28:51Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11628 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:18:59Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11629	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	45	T	Y	404.45001220703125	45	28.3.10.6		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	its not clear in an HE TB PPDU for a user with an RU <=242 in a 40, 80, or 160/80+80 MHz bandwidth, whether L-SIG is transmitted in the user's 20 MH	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:30:06Z) In Clause 28.3.4 , it states that "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 243 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11630	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	45	T	Y	404.45001220703125	45	28.3.10.6		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:29:23Z) It is not necessary to have a separate equation for UL MU. is defined as the set of 20MHz channels on which L-S	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11631	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	53	T	Y	404.52999877 92969	53	28.3.10.6		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:30:28Z) BEAM_CHANGE set to 0 does not apply to HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 244 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11632	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	59	T	Y	404.58999633 78906	59	28.3.10.6		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS seems undefined in Table 28-15 for HE TB PPDU and HE ER SU PPDU. Is it per-user or total over all users with HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:31:26Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11632 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11615	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11633	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	59	T	Y	404.58999633 78906	59	28.3.10.6		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	In Clause 28.3.4 says: "In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L-SIG, RL-SIG and HESIGA fields, are sent only on	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:31:45Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE TB PPDU format.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11634	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	59	T	Y	404.58999633 78906	59	28.3.10.6		V	Ross	11-18/0230r0	467	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:04:50Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0230r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:22:29Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 245 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11635	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	59	T	Y	404.58999633 78906	59	28.3.10.6		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	how is preamble puncturing performed? i_BW is a series, not part of a set as in BEAM_CHANGE=1 equation.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:30:51Z) BEAM_CHANGE value set to 0 does not apply to HE MU or HE TB PPDU format. Preamble puncturing only applies to HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11636	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	405	25	T	Y	405.25	25	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	The title of Table 28-18 is "HE-SIG-A field of an HE SU PPDU and HE ER SU PPDU", so why would B0 of HE-SIG-A1 ever be "set to 0 for HE TB PPDU"? You	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:55:47Z) Editor please make changes shown in document 11-18-0118r6 under comment 11636	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:27:40Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 246 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11637	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	407	8	T	Y	407.07998657 22656	8	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	Consider the case of HE ER SU PPDU, Doppler=0, DCM=1 and STBC=1. What do I set "Nsts And Midamble Periodicity" to if I have one space-time stream? "	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:09:36Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0006r4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:48:11Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11638	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	407	20	T	Y	407.20001220 703125	20	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	Consider the case of HE ER SU PPDU, Doppler=1, DCM=1 and STBC=1. What do I set "Nsts And Midamble Periodicity" to if I have one space-time stream? "	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:09:55Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0006r4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:49:16Z - see #11637	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 247 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11639	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	412	47	T	Y	412.47000122 07031	47	28.3.10.7.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	The title of Table 28-18 is "HE-SIG-A field of an HE TB PPDU", so why would B0 of HE-SIG-A1 ever be "set to 0 for HE SU PPDU"? You probably just want	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:32:22Z) Refer to CID #11636 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0118r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11636	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11640	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	419	19	T	Y	419.19000244 140625	19	28.3.10.7.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	On Pg 346, line 56, BEAM_CHANGE is "Not present" for formats other than HE_SU or HE_EXT_SU. So how is this determined for HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:32:48Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11640 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:21:12Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11641	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	419	25	T	Y	419.25	25	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	its not clear in an HE TB PPDU for a user with an RU <=242 in a 40, 80, or 160/80+80 MHz bandwidth, whether HE-SIG-A is transmitted in the user's 20	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:34:56Z) In Clause 28.3.4 , it states that " In the HE TB PPDU, the pre-HE modulated fields, which include L-STF, L-LTF, L	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11642	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	14	T	Y	435.14001464 84375	14	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Eq 28-30 is not clear. Both equations have a value at HES_1016 and HES_-1016 and HES_8 and HES_-8. Which is it?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:47:02Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11642 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11643	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	27	T	Y	435.26998901 36719	27	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Eq 28-31 is not clear. Both equations have a value at HES_504 and HES_-504. Which is it?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:47:24Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11643 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 249 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11644	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	31	T	Y	435.30999755859375	31	28.3.10.9		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Regarding "For an OFDMA transmission, the coefficients in Equation (28-22) to Equation (28-31) are set to zero if those values are corresponding to to	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:47:45Z) The main purpose of the HE-STF field is to improve automatic gain control estimation in a MIMO transmission. The	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11645	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	48	T	Y	435.48001098 63281	48	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:48:00Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11645 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11646	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	63	T	Y	435.63000488 28125	63	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	What is the difference between K_r and K_r^HE-STF?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:53:53Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11646 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:51:01Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 250 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11647	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	436	15	T	Y	436.14999389 64844	15	28.3.10.9		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Provide an equation to compute N_STS,r,total based on information from the Trigger.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:54:07Z) The caluculation of N_STS,r,total is provided in Table 28-15. The equation applies to both HE MU PPDU and HE TB P	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11648	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.9	436	21	T	Y	436.20999145 50781	21	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:54:48Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11648 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11649	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	436	36	T	Y	436.35998535 15625	36	28.3.10.10		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"In an HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU and HE MU PPDU, the transmitter provides training for NSTS,r,total space-time streams (spatial mapper inputs) used fo	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:55:32Z) This sentence means that the transmitter use HELTF as training sequence to facilitate receiver to estimate the M	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 251 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11650	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	436	39	T	Y	436.39001464 84375	39	28.3.10.10		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"In an HE TB PPDU, the transmitter of user u in the r-th RU provides training for NSTS,r,u space-time streams used for the transmission of the PSDU."	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:56:26Z) This sentence means that the transmitter use HELTF as training sequence to facilitate receiver to estimate the M	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11651	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	436	55	T	Y	436.54998779 296875	55	28.3.10.10		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"In an HE MU PPDU with more than one RU and in an HE TB PPDU, NHE-LTF may take any..." there needs to be a shall and a specific equation on how to cal	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:57:29Z) The text clearly states that “In an HE MU PPDU with more than one RU and in an HE TB PPDU, NHE-LTF may take any	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 252 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11652	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	449	38	T	Y	449.38000048828125	38	28.3.10.10		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	How are HE-LTF symbols generated for HE NDP PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:59:35Z) In 28.3.16, it is stated that “The HE NDP PPDU has the following properties: — Uses the HE SU PPDU format but wi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11653	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	34	T	Y	451.33999633078906	34	28.3.10.10		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Which equation is used for HE NDP PPDU?	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:00:40Z) Reason is the same as above. There is no need to have a separate HE LTF equation for HE NDP PPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 253 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11654	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	39	T	Y	451.39001464 84375	39	28.3.10.10		J	Ross	11-18/0230r0	467	Provide definitions or references for all variables in Eq 28-53.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:12:22Z) The varial bes are defined either in the frequently used parameters table or in the descriptions of previuos equa	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:34:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11655	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	39	T	Y	451.39001464 84375	39	28.3.10.10		J	Ross	11-18/0230r0	467	what is the difference between K_r^HE-LTF and K_r.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:12:11Z) The varial bes are defined either in the frequently used parameters table or in the descriptions of previuos equa	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:34:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11656	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	55	T	Y	451.54998779 296875	55	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Provide definitions or references for all variables in Eq 28-54.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:01:13Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11656 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 19:52:39Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 254 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11657	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	452	16	T	Y	452.16000366 21094	16	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N^Tone_HE-LTF is not used in the equation. I believe N_HE-LTF is used, which has a completely different meaning	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:01:28Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11657 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 19:54:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11658	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.10.10	452	28	T	Y	452.27999877 92969	28	28.3.10.10		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	the reference for K_r is to 28.3.9. I went to 28.3.9 and the description for K_r say "For HE modulated fields in a non-OFDMA HE PPDU, Kr is the seto	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:26:05Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11658 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:16:25Z - see #11595	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11659	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.1	452	40	T	Y	452.39999389 64844	40	28.3.11.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"Data symbols in an HE PPDU shall support guard interval durations...". I think it should be something like "HE STAs shall support Data symbols in an	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:09:17Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11659 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 22:43:34Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 255 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11660	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.2	452	56	T	Y	452.55999755859375	56	28.3.11.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"A two-step padding process is applied an HE PPDU."	fix grammar	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:09:48Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11660 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 22:45:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11661	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.2	453	41	T	Y	453.41000366621094	41	28.3.11.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:10:03Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11661 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 22:49:08Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11662	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.2	455	1	T	Y	455.01000976625	1	28.3.11.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	If N_PAD,Pre-FEC,MAC is PSDU_LENGTH - APEP_LENGTH, then why do we need the equation in 28-59? Its confusing to have two equations for the same variab	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:11:18Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11662 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:03:05Z - see #11663	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11663	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.2	455	1	T	Y	455.01000976 5625	1	28.3.11.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	N_PAD, Pre-FEC,MACis in bits and PSDU_LENGTH and APEP_LENGTH are in bytes. Need to correct this	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:10:48Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1663 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:02:23Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11664	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.13	468	50	T	Y	468.5	50	28.3.11.13		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	using slashes with numbers are confused with divide in Table 28-33	Change ## to {#,#}	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:16:04Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1664 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 20:30:01Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11665	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.14	473	29	T	Y	473.29000854 49219	29	28.3.11.14		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables, e.g. K_r, M_r,u, etc.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:16:31Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID1665 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 20:46:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 257 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11666	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.14	473	62	T	Y	473.61999511 71875	62	28.3.11.14		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Are we using N_SR or N_SR,r?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:17:01Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11666 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 20:49:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11667	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.14	473	63	T	Y	473.63000488 28125	63	28.3.11.14		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Is N_SD,r defined anywhere?	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:17:17Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11667 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 20:49:29Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11668	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.14	474	10	T	Y	474.10000610 35156	10	28.3.11.14		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Looks like part of the Equation 28-108 is cut off.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:17:39Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID11668 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 20:50:59Z- Nothing to change - just ensure equation is not trucated.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11669	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.14	474	18	T	Y	474.17999267578125	18	28.3.11.14		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Lets define or provide references to definitions of all the variables, e.g. K_r, N_STS, r,u, etc.	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:17:58Z) It is already defined in previous subclause. Doc IEEE802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11670	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	2	T	Y	476.01998901 36719	2	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"At the end of a HE PPDU, if mod(NSYM, MMA) = 1, there is also no midamble inserted before the last OFDM symbol, as shown in Figure 28-40", but I thin	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:31:12Z) Resolved as in resolution to CID 12064	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:30:09Z - see #12064	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 259 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11671	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.12	478	60	T	Y	478.60000061035156	60	28.3.12		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"There are multiple options for computing...". This is confusing to me. Are we saying that there are different equations, but they yield the same re	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:33:24Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:56:51Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11672	Dorothy Stanley	230	2	28.3.12	480	17	T	Y	480.17001342 77344	17	28.3.12		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"N_MA may be computed by multiple methods..." This is confusing to me. Are we saying that there are different equations, but they yield the same resu	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:33:45Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:56:56Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11673	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	65	T	Y	231.64999389 648438	65	27.3.2.4		A	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"otherwise 1 bit per MSDU or A-MSDU". Note the addition of "or A-MSDU".	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:04:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 260 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11674	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	65	T	Y	231.64999389648438	65	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Use the same terminology as level 2 (the way it is written right now is not correct).	Replace the first sentence with: "Using level 3 dynamic fragmentation, an originator STA may transmit to a recipient STA the following:"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:04:59Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11675	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.3.3	232	24	E	Y	232.24000549316406	24	27.3.3		A			447	Rename "Defragmentation" to "Dynamic defragmentation".	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:24:22Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:24:25Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11676	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.3.3	232	24	E	Y	232.24000549316406	24	27.3.3		J	Ming Gan		657	Rephrase sentence to make it clearer	Replace with: "An HE STA shall set dot11HEDynamicFragmentationLevel to the same dynamic fragmentation level that it indicates in the Fragmentation Sup	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical: Is the condition " if it supports reception of dynamic fragments" necessary? What happens if the condition is not true: can the STA set the	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 261 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11677	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.3.3.1	233	6	T	Y	233.05999755859375	6	27.3.3.1		J	Ming Gan	764r1	601	Need to cover all the cases, when ADDBA Extension element is present or not. See the rules that are defined at the fragmentation side and ensure that	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:19:23Z) Rejected – Agree in principle. But the case when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element was	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11678	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.3	231	18	T	Y	231.17999267578125	18	27.3		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	Normative text for when the ADDBA Extension element shows sporadically in this sub clause. Please cover all use cases. Based on the spec we have it sho	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:36:53Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Add a case when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element TGaxed	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:06:39Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11679	Duncan Ho	230	2	9.3.2.2.1	691	40	T	Y	691.40002441406625	40	9.3.2.2.1		J			648	A-MSDU when Mesh Control field is present has other information, which parsing would be complicated if fragmented.	Add a statement that A-MSDU for Mesh Data are not fragmented.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:26:14Z) - Reference is not to 11ax D2.0	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:26:23Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 262 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11680	Duncan Ho	230	2	9.3.2.1	689	50	T	Y	689.5	50	9.3.2.1		J			648	Replace "The A-MSDU and a security header" with "The A-MSDU (or a fragment thereof)".	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:25:49Z) - Reference not to 11ax D2.0	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:26:04Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11681	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.8.1	286	60	E	Y	286.60000610 35156	60	27.8.1		A			447	opering => operating	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:24:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:24:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11682	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.8.1	286	55	E	Y	286.54998779 296875	55	27.8.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	557r1	563	The first 5 paragraphs of this subclause are somewhat redundant and have concepts that are sparsely defined. Suggest rephrasing so that the definition	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:50:41Z) Revised. Agree in principle with the commenter. Please implement the changes as shown in submission 11-18-557r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	returned		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 00:24:24Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11683	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.8.1	287	31	T	Y	287.30999755 859375	31	27.8.1		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	The NSS now depends on the BW vs NSS formula. Add a reference to it. Ensure that this reference is properly applied throughout the subclause so that t	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:35:11Z) Revised. Agree in principle. Make the changes shown in this 11-17-0035r5 submission and identified for the CID 1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:38:03Z - Bandwidht by itself is meaningless. I assume this refers to PPDU bandwidth so "for PPDU bandwidths less than or equal t	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 263 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11684	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.8.1	287	49	E	Y	287.48999902343375	49	27.8.1		J			447	NOTE2 supposes there is a NOTE1. But there is not. Shift note numbering (NOTE1, NOTE2).	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:30:56Z) - There is a NOTE 2 (and NOTE 3) later in the subclause	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:31:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11685	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.8.2	288	16	T	Y	288.16000366621094	16	27.8.2		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"only" is missing in the second item. Also what is the difference between the first item (receiving the acknowledgment) and second item (expecting to	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:36:04Z) Revised add word only to the second item. Make the changes shown in this 11-17-0035r5 submission and identified f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 20:58:08Z - The resolution fails to justify the addition of only. The resolution fails to address the commenters other point. Crapp	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11686	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.8.3	289	2	T	Y	289.01998901036719	2	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	Replace "TxNSS" with "TxNSTS".	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:36:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:09:05Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 264 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11687	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.2	314	51	T	Y	314.51000976 5625	51	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"A STA may transmit a Control frame in a non-HT PPDU." is redundant and actually adds ambiguity. non-HT PPDU is the go to format. See 10.7.6. Also alr	1) Remove "A STA may transmit a Control frame in a non-HT PPDU.". 2) Move "A first STA shall not transmit a Control frame in an HE ER SU PPDU to a sec	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:43:04Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes. TGax editor to make t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	For the NOTE 2 at the end of the sub clause I have removed the reference to the same sub clause.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11688	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.2	314	56	E	Y	314.55999755 859375	56	27.15.2		J			648	To make it clearer for the reader. Add a reference to the UL MU disablement exception.	Replace "A non-AP HE STA transmits HE TB PPDUs as defined in 27.5.3 (UL MU operation)." with "A non-AP HE STA transmits HE TB PPDUs as defined in 27.5	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:57:59Z) - A reference to diablement is not relavant to PPDU format selection.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:58:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 265 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11689	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.2	315	6	T	Y	315.05999755859375	6	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	Make the note more precise since when the frame is sent to another non-AP STA the flag is set to 0. Also generalize the second sentence as well.	Replace "UPLINK_FLAG to 1 (see 27.11.2 (UPLINK_FLAG)" with "UPLINK_FLAG to 1 when the PPDU is intended to the AP and to 0 when the PPDU is intended to	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:43:59Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes except tha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11690	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.2	315	13	T	Y	315.13000488 28125	13	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	ER SU PPDUs do not use STBC. So this condition never applies to these PPDU types. Remove ER SU PPDU from the item.	Delete "HE ER SU PPDU or".	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:44:50Z) Rejected – ER SU PPDUs are allowed to use STBC. Please refer to TXVECTOR and RXVECTOR parameter table that speci	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11691	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.2	315	21	E	Y	315.20999145 50781	21	27.15.2		V			648	Comma location makes it ambiguous. Suggest to make it clearer.	Replace "A Control frame sent as a response to a PPDU, containing a Trigger frame that is not an MU-RTS Trigger frame or a frame containing a UMRS Con	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:00:22Z) - Fixed with resolutions to other comments. No furher change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:00:38Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11692	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.2	315	32	E	Y	315.32000732 421875	32	27.15.2		V			648	This item uses different wording w.r.t. previous ones. Suggest harmonizing and some editorials as well.	Replace" If a Control frame is sent as a response to a soliciting HE ER SU PPDU the frame shall be carried in an HE ER SU PPDU except when the most re	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:08:21Z) - Agree in principle. Change the first part of the sentence to read "A Control frame sent as a response to an H	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:10:02Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 267 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11693	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.4.2	317	45	T	Y	317.45001220703125	45	27.15.4.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	14r0	493	NSTS field of OM control field has some impact here.	Specify that the reception of the OM Control field controls the NSS in Tx of the STA as well, according to the instructions provided in the TX NSTS f	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:59:59Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution adds a clarification that points to the norma	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 17:35:07Z - The inserted sentence has a grammer error. I assume the word "number" should be plural.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11694	Duncan Ho	230	2	27.15.4.3	317	60	E	Y	317.60000610 35156	60	27.15.4.3		V			648	VHT MCS. Is this a typo? Looks like it. Please fix it.	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:12:00Z) - It is a type. Fixed with resolition to #11262. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:12:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11695	Erik Lindskog	230	2	28.1.1	328	1	T	Y	328.01000976 5625	1	28.1.1		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	We are here referring to the regulatory requirements of VHT.	Add a separate section for regulatory requirements under Clause 28.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:53:29Z) No need to repeat the same text twice	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:02:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11696	Eugene Baik	230	2	28.2.2	334	12	T	Y	334.11999511 71875	12	28.2.2		A	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	N_TX is in TXVECTOR	Change "N" to "Y" for N_TX in TXVECTOR	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:21:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:54:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 268 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11697	Eugene Baik	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	9	T	Y	246.08999633789062	9	27.5.3.2.2		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	Don't add MAC level padding to Trigger frames because it increases the overhead and reduces the efficiency of UL MU operation.	Delete section 27.5.3.2.2	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:01:18Z) Discussion: the group believe that SIFS after the PPDU which carries Trigger frame may not be enough for a STA to	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:36:42Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11698	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	2	E	N	89.0199966430664	2	9.3.1.23		A			447	space is missing after ")"	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:48:18Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:48:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11699	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.7.3.3	280	55	E	N	280.54998779296875	55	27.7.3.3		A			447	Rename TWT scheduling STA to TWT scheduling AP	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:10:50Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:10:53Z - see #12094	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11700	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	58	E	N	129.58000183105 47	58	9.4.2.200		A			447	Replace ".." with "."	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:41:00Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:41:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11701	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	3.2	34	12	E	N	34.119998931884766	12	3.2		A			447	A non-AP HE STA that support the opportunistic power save mechanism.	Replace support with supports	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:25:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:25:06Z - see #11445	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 269 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11702	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	3.2	34	16	E	N	34.159999847 41211	16	3.2		A			447	An HEAP that support the opportunistic power save mechanism.	Replace support with supports	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:26:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:26:42Z - see #11446	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11703	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	N	34.569999694 82422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	SRP PPDU: a PPDU that is a DSRP_PPDU	Improve unclear definition	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:55:06Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11703	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11704	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	3.2	34	19	E	N	34.189998626 708984	19	3.2		V			447	An OFDM-based multiple access scheme that different group of subcarriers are allocated	Replace with " An OFDM-based multiple access scheme in which various groups of subcarriers are allocated"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:30:01Z) - that different group -> in which groups	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:30:20Z - see #12973	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11705	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	67	45	E	N	67.449996948 24219	45	9.2.4.6.4.5		A			447	That should be removed in " to indicate that the buffer status of the corresponding AC"	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:23:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:23:14Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11706	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	3.4	36	1	E	N	36.009998321 5332	1	3.4		J			657	UMTA used in 10.2.1 is not defined	define: UL MU TB Access	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 270 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11707	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	9.4.2.245	159	39	T	N	159.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.245		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	66R0	472	Unequal number of values	Replace -37 dBm with -38dBm	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:12:16Z) Revised Replaced -37 with -38 in Table 9-262ag to make the range consistent TGax editor, please make changes as	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:57:54Z - see #13182	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11708	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.3.4	223	40	E	N	223.39999389648438	40	27.3.4		A			447	"If one of the two NAV timers is non zero..." The obvious case with two nonzero NAVs is excluded	Replace with " if at least one of the two NAV timers is non zero"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:36:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:36:55Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11709	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.5.2	243	13	E	N	243.13000488 28125	13	27.5.2		A			447	Misprint: eemen t	replace with elemen t	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:00:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:01:17Z - see #11094	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11710	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.5.2	243	46	E	N	243.46000671 38672	46	27.5.2		A			447	An HEAP may solicit one or more non-APHEST As that support generating BQRs	Replace with " An HEAP may solicit BQR(s) from one or more non-APHEST As that support generating BQRs"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:03:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:03:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 271 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11711	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.5.3.2.4	248	52	T	N	248.52000427246094	52	27.5.3.2.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	the duration of Immediate response is not define	Specify the time needed to receive immediate response. For example, " If an AP does not receive an immediate response within aSIFSTime + aSlotTime + a	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:27:52Z) D2.3 already covers this. See 27.5.3.2.4 (D2.3 P278L59) and 10.22.2.2 (D2.3 P216L1) TGax editor: No further chang	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:02:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11712	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.5.4	257	5	T	N	257.04998779296875	5	27.5.4		J	Abhishek Patil	18/0707r2	654	It is possible to change communicating STAs during TXOP. So, similar rule shall be applied in the middle of TXOP if the response is not obtained from	As in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:50:52Z) The error happened in the middle of TXOP has been described in clause 10.22.2.7. There is no difference in MU Cas	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 16:47:47Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 272 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11713	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.5.5	257	15	T	N	257.14999938964844	15	27.5.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0742r3	609	Add a method to send PS-Polls with UORA	Add a dedicated value of AID12 which allows sending only PS-polls. Specify the procedure of sending buffered data in downlink	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:04:34Z) The spec allows STAs to send a PS-Polls as a response to a trigger frame when the TID Aggregation limit is set to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 19:49:39Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11714	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.16.4.3	324	30	E	N	324.29998779296875	30	27.16.4.3		A			648	misprint: can not	replace with cannot	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:48:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:48:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11715	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.16.4.3	324	30	E	N	324.29998779296875	30	27.16.4.3		J			657	"Countered" should have the same style as REJECTED and SUCCESS	Change style to UPPER CASE	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	The MLME interface for QPT has not been defined. Thus the status codes are not defined. Passing to MAC ad-hoc for resolution. The task group can expec		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 273 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11716	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	27.16.4.3	324	33	E	N	324.32998657 22656	33	27.16.4.3		J			657	Upon receiving the Countered,	Change to "Upon receiving a Quiet Time Peiod Rspons e frame with status code COUNTERED. .."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	The MLME interface for QPT has not been defined. Thus the status codes are not defined. Passing to MAC ad-hoc for resolution. The task group can expec		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11717	Evgeny Khorov	230	2	28.3.21	511	37	T	N	511.36999511 71875	37	28.3.21		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	The current PHY receive state machine forbids looking for the new preamble while receiving a frame. This can decrease performance in dense networks, s	Correct figure 28-59 to allow parallel reception	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:19:55Z) The state machine focuses on the flow of PPDU reception. Parrelell processing is implementation issue. It doesn’	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11718	Fei Tong	230	2	28.1.1	328	33	E	Y	328.32998657 22656	33	28.1.1		A			648	To be consistent, it should read "LDPC coding (transmit and receive)"	To be consistent, it should read "LDPC coding (transmit and receive)"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:34:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:34:57Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 274 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11719	Fei Tong	230	2	28.1.1	376	65	G	Y	376.64999938964844	65	28.1.1		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Option support for Mid-amble should be included in the list HE STA may support	Add mid-amble to the optional support list	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:54:58Z) Editor: Refer to the resolution of CID 13622 in 11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:59:48Z - see #13622	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11720	Fei Tong	230	2	28.1.1	378	21	G	Y	378.20999145050781	21	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	why a "20MHz-only non-AP HESTA" shall support clause is included in HE STA shall support list	Remove this item from "Shall support" list	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:53:43Z) The page and line numbers are incorrect for CID11720.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:19:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11721	Fei Tong	230	2	28.3.4	371	28	G	Y	371.27999877092969	28	28.3.4		J	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	It is desireable to describe the allowed PHY paramters (MCS, RU size etc) for HE ER SU PPDU in one place; current the limitions are scattered in the s	Add description of what constraints are for HE ER SU PPDU	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:55:27Z) The constraints on MCS, Nsts, RU size etc are already described together in table 28-18 HE-SIG-A field of an HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:01:32Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 275 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11722	Fei Tong	230	2	28.3.3.1	357	2	G	Y	357.01998901 36719	2	28.3.3.1		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	Allocating different transmit powers to different sub channels may violate transmit spectrum flatness requirement; need to explain why this does not vi	either add text explain why this will not violate the flatness requirement or remove it	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:32:20Z) Spectral flatness measurement is done with the RU power boosting (different transmit power per RU) not used. He	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11723	Fei Tong	230	2	28.3.3.2	358	44	G	Y	358.44000244 140625	44	28.3.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	For Table 28-6 to 28-8, it is good to add note explaining the most negative indices refer to the lowest frequency.	Add note to explain what negative index mean in terms of frequency position	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:40:35Z) Instruction to editor: Add the following at the end of the bottom row of Tables 28-6, 28-7 and 28-8. “A tone ind	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:56:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 276 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11724	Fei Tong	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	424	56	E	Y	424.55999755859375	56	28.3.10.8.4		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	The section title <Time domain encoding> is confusing; the content in this section is anything but time domain coding. What is the reference of	Change to a more appropriate name	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:52:30Z) - Suggest the editor to append the content of clause 28.3.10.8.4 (Time domain encoding) after the content of 28.3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	It seems to me that the content here could be moved to 28.3.10.8.2. Moving to PHY ad-hoc.	I	I'll take the suggestion as an instruction	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11725	Fei Tong	230	2	28.3.10.8	421	34	G	Y	421.33999633 78906	34	28.3.10.8		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	The HE-SIG-B signaling specification is very complicated; and it will be helpful to provide examples to illustrate how the resource allocation is sign	Add examples to illustrate the meaning of these signaling fields	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:34:04Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 11725) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0352r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 277 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11726	Geert Awater	230	2	27.12.2.2	291		E	Y	291		27.12.2.2		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	OBSSPD, OBSSPD and PBSS_PD are used interchangeably.	Uniformize	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:50:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	Passing to SR ad-hoc. Fix terminology.	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:19:52Z- OK. So the SR ad-hoc has effectively passed it back to the editor with an ACCEPTED resolution. I guess that means I can	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11727	Geert Awater	230	2	28.3.11.15	474		T	Y	474		28.3.11.15		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0799r0	584	It is unclear to me how Dual Carrier Modulation can provide extra robustness due to diversity and repetition code compared to adopting new coding rate	Add DCM modes by introducing new coding rates and interleaving modes.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:26:08Z) The commentor does not provide details for the new coding.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11728	Geert Awater	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	425	10	E	Y	425.10000061035156	10	28.3.10.8.4		A			648	"code rate" is used instead of "coding rate", as is used lelsewhere	change to "coding rate"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:39:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:39:45Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 278 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11729	Geert Awater	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	494	22	E	Y	494.22000122 07031	22	28.3.18.4.4		A			648	"code rate" is used instead of "coding rate", as is used lelsewhere	change to "coding rate"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:21:08Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:21:11Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11730	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	33	T	Y	249.33000183 10547	33	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0367r1	540	When the AP announced the BSS Color Change, for STAs that failed to receive a Beacon frame at the BSS color change TBTT, the value of the BSS Color su	If the Trigger frame was received in a non-HE PPDU, then the BSS_COLOR shall be set to the active BSS color.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:41:38Z) Agree with the comment. Revised text to indicate that the responding STA shall use the active color as defined in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:59:40Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11731	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	35	T	Y	249.35000610 351562	35	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	There is no BSS_COLOR setting rule when the Trigger frame is in a non-HE PPDU and the STA is an unassociated STA.	Use the active BSS color, use an HE PPDU when soliciting unassociated STAs, or define the BSS Color field in the Trigger frame format	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:12:30Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11731	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 279 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11732	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.5.5.1	258	6	T	Y	258.05999755859375	6	27.5.5.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	For the faster channel access, an unassociated STA can participate in the UORA using the default values of OCWmin and OCWmax without receiving the UOR	As in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:12:58Z) 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11732. Also, please see resolution for CID 11364	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11733	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.2.2	222	19	T	Y	222.19000244140625	19	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	When a STA has not received the MAC header yet (and received the RXVECTOR), the STA is not able to determine the PPDU as an intra-BSS frame because of	Remove "Otherwise" and resolve the situation when both intra-BSS and inter-BSS conditions are met. If the received frame satisfies both intra-BSS and	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 280 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11734	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.11.4	305	25	T	Y	305.25	25	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	Sometimes there is a conflict on two BSS_COLOR setting rules of line 25 and line 52. For example, when an AP transmits an HE SU PPDU to a STA not in i	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:53:15Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Allow to use the BSS_COLOR 0. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specif	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11735	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.2.2	222	22	T	Y	222.22000122070312	22	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	While the subclause 27.2.2 in the current spec instructs the PPDU with the BSS_COLOR of 0 to be classified as an intra-BSS frame, the TXVECTOR paramet	Change the sentence as below. "The RXVECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR of the PPDU carrying the frame is the BSS color of the BSS of which the STA is a membe	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:44:54Z) Rejected – The classification is there to have conservative behavior. The STA can still decode the MAC header t	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 281 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11736	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	37	T	Y	291.36999511 71875	37	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	According to the subclass 27.11.6 (SPATIAL_REUSE), when a STA transmits a Trigger frame, it is recommended to set the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_REUSE	Add "If the PHY-CCARESET.request primitive is issued before the end of the PPDU, and a TXOP is initiated within the duration of the PPDU, then the TXO	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:34:43Z) Agree with the commenter. For a trigger carried in VHT, it is true that a STA can classify it as inter-BSS PPDU bas	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11737	Geonjung Ko	230	2	27.2.2	222	17	T	Y	222.16999816 89453	17	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	For the HE MU PPDU intended for an AP, the STA-ID field includes the transmitter STA's AID. Thus, when an AP receives an UL HE MU PPDU and there is no	Add the inter-BSS frame condition "The PPDU is an HE MU PPDU with the RXVECTOR parameter UL_FLAG equal to 1, the STA is an AP, and there is no STA, of	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:37:51Z) Rejected In most cases, BSS color in HE-SIG-A can determine the intra-BSS or inter-BSS frame. If the BSS color	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 282 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11738	Geonjung Ko	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	26	T	Y	91.26002136 23047	26	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	When the value of the AID12 field is 0 or 2045, the spec does not mention the encoding of the RU Allocation subfield. So it is unclear if it follows t	As in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:20:37Z) Agree with the comment. Reorganized the text to clarify that the RU allocation for RA-RU case is the same as a dir	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:14:11Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11739	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	3.2	29	36	E	Y	29.360000610 351562	36	3.2		A			447	Typo. Remove repeated 'with': "A high efficiency (HE) PPDU with with TXVECTOR parameter"	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:35Z - see #12149	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11740	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	20	T	Y	239.19999694 82422	20	27.4.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	There is an ambiguity in terminology between S-MPDU (where there is only one MPDU in a PPDU) Vs "a single MPDU (i.e., MPDU in an A-MPDU subframe with	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:39:28Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 20:31:25Z - Split the ifst bullet into two for clarity	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 283 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11741	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.9.2	291	30	T	Y	291.29998779296875	30	27.9.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Currently, SR_DELAY and SR_RESTRICTED is applicable for both SRP & OBSS-PD. Remove the applicability of SR_DELAY and SR_RESTRICTED for OBSS-PD	As in the comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:31:31Z) SR_delay and SR_restricted are also useful for OBSS_PD SR.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11742	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	38	T	Y	290.38000048828125	38	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1859r4	543	When an AP hosts multiple BSSs, but does not support Multi-BSSID feature (for various reasons), the STAs that are associated to one of the BSS of the	As in the comment. May need some indication from the AP.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-05 18:35:19Z) Agree with the comment. In a multiple BSSID set, only the transmitted BSSID beacons and carries the Multiple	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 18:35:43Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11743	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	3.4	35		T	Y	35		3.4	11457	V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	Add HLA to the 3.4 Abbreviations and acronyms	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 19:56:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 284 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11744	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	3.4	35		T	Y	35		3.4		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Add OBSSPD to the 3.4 Abbreviations and acronyms, or change OBSSPD to OBSS-PD	As in the comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:02:37Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11744.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:01:06Z - #11726 changes this to "OBSS PD" so we will stick with that.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11745	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	9.3.1.9.1	76	42	T	Y	76.41999816894531	42	9.3.1.9.1		J	Tomoko Adachi	734r1	628	Need a corresponding normative text for the following in clause 27: "An HE STA does not send a Multi-STA BlockAck frame under Delayed and HT-delayed a	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:21:29Z) Rejected. It is already covered in clause 27. In 27.4.1 Overview, it says “The HE acknowledgment procedure(#13	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 20:57:41Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11746	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	39	T	Y	79.38999938964844	39	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Need to cover the case for MPDUs sent in HE TB PPDU in the following sentence: "The Multi-STA BlockAck frame is supported if either UL MU or multi-TID	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:09:08Z) Revised. Agree in principal with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:21:06Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 285 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11747	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	T	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Wrong reference. Change to Figure 9-38c (from Figure 9-38b)	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:36:23Z) Accepted. It is already resolved by CIDs 12679 and 11060.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:16:01Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
11748	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	T	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	This paragraph refers to the case when AID is 2045. Remove "not" from the sentence: "Per AID TID Info subfield format when the AID11 subfield is not	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:37:56Z) Accepted. It is already resolved by CIDs 12679 and 11060.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:16:10Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
11749	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	34	T	Y	80.33999633789062	34	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Incomplete sentence. Move it to the previous paragraph. " Where Block Ack Starting Sequence Control subfield is set to 0 and RA subfield indicates the	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:47:58Z) Revised. The part pointed out is resolved by CID 12595.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:17:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 286 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11750	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	29	T	Y	81.29000091552734	29	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Table 9-24b. All-ack context: Current text doesn't cover the Multi-TID case. It is not clear if A-MPDU covers Multi-TID A-MPDU also.	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:03:26Z) Revised. Agree in principal with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:22:28Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
11751	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.1	234	45	E	Y	234.44999694 82422	45	27.4.1		A			447	change "acknowledge" to "acknowledgement"	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:39:41Z) - Use American spelling (acknowledgment)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:40:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11752	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.1	235	48	E	Y	235.47999572 753906	48	27.4.1		A			447	Add if as shown below: Change from: "If the Ack Type field is 0, the AID field is set to 2045." to "If the Ack Type field is 0, and if the AID fiel	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:00:22Z) -	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:00:35Z-	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 287 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11753	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.1	235	62	T	Y	235.61999511 71875	62	27.4.1		J	George Cherian	1861R1	473	Add the condition as shown below. Change from: " An AP that transmits a Multi-STA BlockAck frame addressed to HE STAs shall set the TA field of the fra	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:16:24Z) Reject The previous paragraph in this section (D2.0, pg 235, ln 55) already covers the case for AP to determine	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:12:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11754	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.1	236	18	T	Y	236.17999267 578125	18	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Circular sentence. Rephrase: " An HE STA that transmits a BlockAckReq frame carried in an HE TB PPDU contains the TID Values of the Per TID Info subfie	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:14:48Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 288 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11755	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.2	236	29	T	Y	236.28999328 61328	29	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This is meant for S-MPDU received in HE TB PPDU. Change the sentence from: "An HE AP that receives an S-MPDU" To: "An HE AP that receives an S-MPDU in	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:15:31Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11756	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.2	236	29	T	Y	236.28999328 61328	29	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Need to add the general case of post-associated STAs as well to the following case of S-MPDU: "An HE AP that receives an S-MPDU prior to association m	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:16:17Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 20:49:51Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 289 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11757	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	16	T	Y	239.16000366210938	16	27.4.4.2		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HE SU PPDU carries an S-MPD	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:40:20Z) Withdraw S-MPDU allows QoS Null with Ack required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11758	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	20	T	Y	239.19999969482422	20	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HE SU PPDU carries a single	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:41:25Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 290 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11759	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	27	T	Y	239.27000427246094	27	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HESU PPDU carries a multi-	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:07:09Z) Revised - Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11760	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	45	T	Y	239.44999694 82422	45	27.4.4.3		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "A non-APSTA that receives an HE M	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:08:25Z) Rejected - QoS Null frame is allowed in the case of S-MPDU	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 291 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11761	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	49	T	Y	239.49000549316406	49	27.4.4.3		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HEMU PPDU carries an S-MPD	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:11:18Z) Rejected - S-MPDU allows QoS Null with Ack required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11762	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	53	T	Y	239.52999877929688	53	27.4.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HEMU PPDU carries a single	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:12:48Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 292 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11763	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	59	T	Y	239.58999633789062	59	27.4.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HE MU PPDU carries a multi-	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:13:35Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11764	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.6.1	263	22	T	Y	263.22000122207031	22	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	Make this normative: "Otherwise, the HE beamforming feedback is segmented and each segment is carried in an HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI Report f	Make it normative	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:03:10Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0043r0 under all headings that include CID 11764	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 19:43:07Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11765	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.6.1	263	24	T	Y	263.23999023 4375	24	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	Make this normative: "For CQI-type feedback the HE compressed beamforming feedback is never segmented since the resulting MPDU size will always be les	Make it normative	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:03:41Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0043r0 under all headings that include CID 11765.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 19:43:21Z - "CQI-type feedback" changed to "CQI feedback" (term as defined earlier in document)	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11766	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.6.3	264	52	T	Y	264.51998901 36719	52	27.6.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Please clarify how a TB soundng is done with a single STA. If not possible, please clarify that too: "An HE beamformer initiates an HE triger-based (	As in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:43:24Z) HE TB sounding with a single STA is not possible since TB sounding is intended to be performed with multiple STAs	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11767	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.6.3	265	29	T	Y	265.29000854 49219	29	27.6.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Make it clear that the HE Beamformer is an AP in the following sentence: "An HE beamformer that transmits an HE NDP Announcement frame to one or more	As in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:43:56Z) The statement as currently is covers the case fo the HE beamformer being an AP and also a TDLS STA. As such it is	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11768	GEORGE CHERIAN	230	2	27.6.3	265	3	T	Y	265.02999877 92969	3	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Add normative requirement to cpature the following: "The HE sounding sequence is a non-TB sounding sequence if the HE NDP Announcement frame is an ind	As in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:44:35Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution converts the declarative statement into a normative state	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 295 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11769	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.1	289	64	E	Y	289.64001464 84375	64	27.9.1		J		17/1852r8	474	"There are two independent spatial reuse modes, one called OBSS_PD-based spatial reuse and the other called SRP-based spatial reuse." Bad wording, rep	Replace ""There are two independent spatial reuse modes, one called OBSS_PD-based spatial reuse and the other called SRP-based spatial reuse." with "	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:21:31Z) - OBSPD and SRP don't define the SR mode, but a threshold and a parameter field. The name of the SR mode has	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11770	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.1	290	1	T	Y	290.01000976 5625	1	27.9.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	What a long winded way to describe a possible way to find out the Color of neighboring APs and of APs that are hidden form the originating AP. I can	Delete P290 L1 to L16.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 21:48:00Z) - beacon reports are also used in this context to collect information to define SRG and SRG OBSSPD parameters. The	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 296 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11771	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.1	290	21	T	Y	290.20999145 50781	21	27.9.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"A non-AP HESTA that performs spatial reuse operation shall respond to a Beacon request from its associated AP with a Beacon report as described in 1	Delete cited text	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 21:58:11Z) there is a requirement for the HE STA to respond to the beacon request. The AP is obviously free to use this mecha	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11772	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	65	E	Y	291.64999389 64844	65	27.9.2.1		J		17/1852r8	474	"PHY-CCARE-SET.request" should be "PHY-CCARESET.request"	Replace "PHY-CCARE-SET.request" with "PHY-CCARESET.request"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:28:05Z) - Rejected – can't find any PHY-CCARE-set Revised – agree with the comment on the harmonization issue, but pr	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 297 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11773	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	60	T	Y	290.60000061035156	60	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"PHY-CCARE-SET.request" should be "PHY-CCARESET.request" A STA that takes actions (a) or (b) under the conditions of the previous paragraph is deemed t	Please clarify	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:24:28Z) clarify the spec for this sentence. The second procedure describe SRG-OBSS_PD-based spatial reuse, the spec does n	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11774	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	41	T	Y	291.41000366621094	41	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"Adjusting the OBSS_PD level and transmit power can improve the system level performance and the utilization of the spectrum." It has been shown that	Delete "Adjusting the OBSS_PD level and transmit power can improve the system level performance and the utilization of the spectrum."	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:36:50Z) disagree with the statement of the commenter. It has been shown in many presentations that this can improve this (e	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 298 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11775	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	39	T	Y	291.39001464 84375	39	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	27.9.2.2. Adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power. 17/0582 clearly shows problems wit hj this method and in reality no-one would or should implement	Adopt text in 17/1003	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:35:31Z) Current OBSS_PD protocol does not describe how a STA chooses its TxPower and OBSS_PD level and leaves that to the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11776	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	47	E	Y	291.47000122 07031	47	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	"...and shall respect the condition defined in Equation". I can't find any other use of this expression in 11md or this document. Replace	Replace cited text with "in accordance with Equation"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:27:40Z) - agree with the comment. Make the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 299 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11777	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	47	T	Y	291.47000122 07031	47	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Equation 27-3 indicates that the TX power may be less than the simple rule and could, in fact, be set to zero. Seems pretty dumb to me to have the &	Replace ■δ± with =	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:39:14Z) one must ask and answer the following question: what are the consequences of a STA using a TXP value less than wha	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11778	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	6	T	Y	292.05999755 859375	6	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Figure 27-9 indicates that the TX power may be less than the simple rule and could, in fact, be set to zero. Seems pretty dumb to me t as it is bad	Delete the shading and change the arrow on "Allowable OBSS_Pdlevel" to point at the edge.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:39:58Z) see CID 11777.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11779	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	45	T	Y	292.45001220 703125	45	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"output of the antenna connector" What about printed antennas?	Replace cited text with "at the input to the antenna" or better still check with 11md where this has come up.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:42:50Z) output of the antenna connector is used throughout 802.11 2016.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 300 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11780	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	4	E	Y	294.04000854 49219	4	27.9.2.3		V		17/1852r8	474	"If a STA ignores an inter-BSS PPDU following the procedure in 27.9.2.1 (General), using a chosen SRG OBSS_PD level, or a chosen non-SRG OBSS_PD level	Replace cited text with "If a STA ignores an inter-BSS PPDU following the procedure in 27.9.2.1 (General), using a chosen SRG OBSS_PD level, or a chos	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:30:33Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11781	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	11	T	Y	294.10998535 15625	11	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"TXP-Wrmax" should not have the "-"	Delete "-"	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:54:29Z) Harmonize to TX_PWRmax. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11782	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.3	295	62	T	Y	295.61999511 71875	62	27.9.3		A	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"When the conditions specified in 27.9.3 (SRP-based spatial reuse operation) are met that allow the transmission of an SR PPDU, an HE STA may transmit	Delete cited text	ACCEPTED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:21:15Z) - commenter to note that the same requirement is formally stated in 27.9.3.4	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 22:08:16Z- Deleted with resolution to other comments.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 301 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11783	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.3	296	3	T	Y	296.02999877 92969	3	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"using an adjusted transmit power level for the duration of an ongoing PPDU" What adjusted powe levels? Any level or tied to the OBSS_PD formula? M	As per comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:20:45Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11783, which adds a reference to t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11784	Graham Smith	230	2	27.9.3	296	11	E	Y	296.10998535 15625	11	27.9.3		A			648	"An HE-STA supporting SRP-based SR operation indicates support for SRP-based SR operation by setting the SR Responder subfield to 1 in the HE MAC Capa	Move cited text to beginning of clause 27.9.3	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:43:45Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:43:50Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 302 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11785	Graham Smith	230	2	4.3.1.4 a	37	21	T	Y	37.209999084472656	21	4.3.1.4 a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"An HE STA shall support operation in 40 MHz and 80 MHz channel width unless the STA indicates that it only supports 20 MHz channel width" Hmm... does	Replace cited text with "An HE STA may support operation in 40 MHz and 80 MHz channel width"	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:39:33Z) Reject. May support 40 and 80MHz will make 40 and 80 completely optional for all STAs. However, non 20 MHz-only	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11786	Graham Smith	230	2	10.2.5a	178	45	T	Y	178.44999694 82422	45	10.2.5a		V			648	"An HE non-AP STA also implements one or two UL multi-user access methods.". 'Also' to what, everything? Reword	Replace cited text with "There are two UL multi-user access methods for use with an HE non-AP STA."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:39:33Z) - Subclause revised with resolution to #13042. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:39:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11787	Graham Smith	230	2	10.2.3.4	181	42	T	Y	181.41999816 89453	42	10.2.3.4		A	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	"The exact time of updating the NAV is described as follows." I can't see the point of this sentence. One would expect a colon and a definition but	Delete " The exact time of updating the NAV is described as follows."	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:39:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:46:25Z - see #11134	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 303 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11788	Graham Smith	230	2	27.1	221	10	T	Y	221.10000610351562	10	27.1		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"An HE STA supports the MAC and MLME functions defined in Clause 27 in addition to the MAC functions defined in Clause 10 and the MLME functions defin	Replace cited text with "An HE STA supports the MAC and MLME functions defined in Clause 10 and the MLME functions defined in Clause 11, except when t	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:49:05Z) Reject. The intention of this paragraph is that the HE STA supports clause 10, 11 and 27, and if there is a con	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11789	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.1	221	21	T	Y	221.21000671138672	21	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	"In dense environments, management by an AP of RTS usage can help mitigate interference since the AP might have a better view of the interrefrence situ	Replace cited text with "In dense environments, an AP may use RTS to help mitigate interference."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:22:47Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Simplify the introduction paragraph. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:22:49Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 304 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11790	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.1	221	22	T	Y	221.22000122070312	22	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	"To improve spectrum utilization, RTS usage should be TXOP duration-based, rather than PSDU length-based." This is a bold statement, especially with n	Replace cited text with "The use of RTS can be TXOP duration-based or PSDU length-based, TXOP duration-based has been shown to improve spectrum utiliz	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:23:46Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Remove an uncertain wording. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specifi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:23:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11791	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.1	221	26	T	Y	221.25999450683594	26	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	"An HE AP may set the TXOP Duration RTS Threshold subfield of HE Operation elements it transmits to a value less than 1023 to require the use of dot11	Replace cited text with " To enable RTS/CTS exchanges and to require the use of dot11TXOPDurationRTSThreshold by its associated STAs, an HE AP sets th	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:24:41Z) Revised- The following wording makes some confusion about the use of may. Remove it. “to require the use of dot	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:23:29Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 305 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11792	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.2	221	54	T	Y	221.53999328 61328	54	27.2.2		V	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	"A STA that obtains at least the RXVECTOR for a PPDU..." Why "at least"? Is this needed why? Delete	Delete "at least" from cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:38:44Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We have revised the sentence to avoid ambiguity. TGax editor p	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11793	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.4	223	20	T	Y	223.19999694 82422	20	27.2.4		V	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	"A non-AP HE STA shall maintain and an HE AP may maintain two NAVs, one referred to as intra-BSS NAV and the other as basic NAV." Rephrase correctly/	Replace cited text with "A non-AP HE STA shall maintain and an HE AP may maintain two NAVs: intra-BSS NAV and basic NAV."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:43:51Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We revise with the suggestion with minor editoral change. TGax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 19:53:34Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 306 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11794	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.4	223	22	E	Y	223.22000122070312	22	27.2.4		V			447	"Intra-BSS NAV is used to store NAV value, if needed, from a PPDU identified as intra-BSS.", 'if needed'? Why is that here just keep it simple.	Delete " if needed" from cited text	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:31:16Z) - Agree in principle, the "if needed" is not needed. The update mechanism is described elsewhere, all that is ne	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:33:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11795	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.4	223	23	E	Y	223.22999572753906	23	27.2.4		V			447	"Basic NAV is used to store NAV value, if needed, from a PPDU classified.." 'if needed' is not needed	Delete " if needed" from cited text	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:33:37Z) - See #11794	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:33:46Z - See #11794	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11796	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.4	224	52	E	Y	224.52000427246094	52	27.2.4		A			447	"NOTE 1 - If a PS-Poll frame is received carried in a received HE SU PPDU, HEER SU PPDU, or HE MU PPDU, then..."The text ' is received, carried in a	Replace cited text with "If a PS-Poll frame is received in a HE SU PPDU, HEER SU PPDU, or HE MU PPDU, then..."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:41:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:41:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 307 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11797	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.4	225	3	E	Y	225.02999877929688	3	27.2.4		V	Po-Kai Huang		531	"The exact time of updating the NAVs uses the same rule as defined in 10.3.2.4". Is this really the 'exact time' or is it simply update the NAV?	Replace cited text with "The NAVs are updated using the rule as defined in 10.3.2.4..."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-18 19:39:29Z) - The intention is about the timing of performing NAV update operation, which is described in 10.3.2.4 as the f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Technical - Po-Kai indicated that the intent was to reference a specific sentence in 10.3.2.4: the sentence about that update being made when RXEND.in	I	EDITOR: 2018-04-18 19:40:56Z-	2.3	2018-04-18	EDITOR
11798	Graham Smith	230	2	27.2.6	228	40	T	Y	228.39999389648438	40	27.2.6		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	"A STA that has not received an MU EDCA Parameter Set element from the AP to which it is associated does not follow the procedure described in this su	Replace cited text with "A STA that has received an MU EDCA Parameter Set element from the AP to which it is associated follows the procedure describe	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:30:52Z) Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1828r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:40:41Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11799	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.1	229	35	E	Y	229.35000610351562	35	27.3.1		A			447	"defined in this subclause),". A spurious). Or should it be a reference (27.3)?	Replace cited text with "defined in this subclause (27.3 Fragmentation and defragmentation),"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:57:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:57:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 308 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11800	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.1	229	50	T	Y	229.5	50	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"Level 2: allows transmission or reception of multiple fragments at a time, up to one per MSDU or AMSDU," Hmm... "Multiple fragments...up to one per..	Rephrase to make it clear. Is it "Level 2: allows transmission or reception of one fragment per MSDU or AMSDU,"?	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:17:45Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change and make it clear. This para	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:08:22Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11801	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.1	229	58	E	Y	229.58000183 10547	58	27.3.1		V			447	"...the procedure that generate non-uniformly fragmented MSDU..." generates	add an 's' to 'generate'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:00:17Z) - Change "that generate non-uniformly fragmented MSDU, A-MSDU or MMPDU" to " for generating non-uniformly fragme	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:01:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 309 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11802	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.1	229	64	E	Y	229.63999938964844	64	27.3.1		V			447	"We call dynamic fragments the fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation." Do we? God job we did not think of something else to call them. Ne	Replace cited text with "Fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation are referred to as dynamic fragments."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:14:19Z) - See #14241	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:14:31Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11803	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.1	230	1	T	Y	230.00999450683594	1	27.3.1		A	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"In addition, these procedures allow the inclusion..." In addition to what, everything above. No need	Delete " In addition" from cited text.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:19:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:11:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11804	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.2	230	7	T	Y	230.07000732421875	7	27.3.2		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	Dynamic Fragmentation - general comment here that asks if this dynamic fragmentation has been shown to add to the High Efficiency concept that this st	I don't get it. I would like to see some sort of explanation as to why this is worthwhile and what it solves. Consider deleting the feature.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:21:52Z) Rejected- The benefit is provded in the first paragraph of subsection 27.3.1. The benefit is to provide furth	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:00:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 310 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11805	Graham Smith	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	36	T	Y	230.36000061035156	36	27.3.2.1		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"A fragment has explicitly failed at the receiving STA if the originator STA successfully receives an immediate response that contains..." What does	Replace text starting at cited text with "A fragment has explicitly failed at the receiving STA if the originator STA does not successfully receives	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:29:25Z) Rejected- Immediate response means it comes within SIFS. The original sentence is clear.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:02:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11806	Graham Smith	230	2	27.4.1	234	44	E	Y	234.44000244140625	44	27.4.1		V			447	"builds on the features defined for HT-immediate block ack" Needs a reference.	Add a reference afrer "block ack".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:34:05Z) - Add reference to 10.24.7	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:34:18Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11807	Graham Smith	230	2	27.4.1	234	53	T	Y	234.52999877929688	53	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"Additionally, the HE-immediate block acknowledgment procedure also added features such as" Additionally added? How many times was it added? And is	Replace citedf text with " HE-immediate block acknowledgment procedure adds the following features:"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:16:59Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	No editing instructions in cited doc. There was a related chagne made with #13251		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 311 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11808	Graham Smith	230	2	27.4.1	235	11	E	Y	235.11000061035156	11	27.4.1		A			447	"MAC address of the intended recipient.A non-APHE STA..." Space missing after full stop	Add space after full stop	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:46:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:46:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11809	Graham Smith	230	2	27.4.1	235	18	E	Y	235.17999267578125	18	27.4.1		A			447	"the recipient STA or the broadcast address." Insert "to" after "or"	Insert " to" after "or"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:57:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:58:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11810	Graham Smith	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	6	T	Y	239.05999755859375	6	27.4.4.1		V	Yusuke Tanaka	18/0027r4	554	A STA that sends a PPDU to an intended recipient can solicit different immediate responses by using the Ack Policy field of QoS Data or QoS Null frame	Replace with" A STA that sends a PPDU to an intended recipient can solicit different immediate responses by using the Ack Policy field of the transmitt	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:14:31Z) Revised - Updated the text Note that PPDU doesn't contain the Ack Policy. It is the MPDU that indicates the Ack	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:50:32Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11811	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	60	T	Y	290.60000061035156	60	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	There is listed action (a) or (b).	Clarify	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:24:57Z) agree with the commenter. Apply the changes as in doc 1852r4 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 312 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11812	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	29	T	Y	294.29000854 49219	29	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Note 1 is unnecessary. STA should be allowed to decrease its OBSS_PD level to be more conservative. This restriction does not not seem necessary.	Remove NOTE 1.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:09:30Z) Agree that the note is confusing. Normative text seems clear enough. TGax editor to make changes identified by CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11813	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.4	295	40	T	Y	295.39999389 64844	40	27.9.2.4		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In this figure It is more reasonable that the S2 max TX PWR is equal to min (...), not max (...). The STA should honor the power constraint calculated o	change max (...) to min (...)	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:12:21Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11814	Guoqing Li	230	2	3.2	33	11	T	Y	33.11000061035156	11	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	DSRP_PPDU and SRP PPDU are defined interchangably. It's better to use one terminology throughout the spec	Use only one of the terminlogy througout the spec	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:46:56Z) Gax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11814, commenter to forgive the autho	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 20:45:49Z - Removed underscore to keep with generally observed style of not using underscore in technical terms.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11815	Guoqing Li	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	Y	34.56999969482422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	DSRP_PPDU and SRP PPDU are defined interchangably. It's better to use one terminology throughout the spec	Use only one of the terminlogy througout the spec	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:55:40Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11815	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11816	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3	296	18	T	Y	296.17999267578125	18	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	According to definition of SRP PPDU, it is the PPDU that contains trigger frame, so it has to be a DL PPDU. However, in this sentence "ensuing uplink	change to "trigger-based PPDU"	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:22:24Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11816	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 314 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11817	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	28	T	Y	296.27999877 92969	28	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"SR-PPDU is queue" sounds like there is a special type of PHY PPDU format called SR-PPDU. However, I think this is only meant the PPDU to be transmitt	change "SR_PPDU" to "PPDU" or clarify what is qualified as "SR_PPDU".	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:25:12Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11817, which more clearly define t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11818	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	43	E	Y	296.42999267 578125	43	27.9.3.1		J			648	The word "eschew" is not consistent with the spec language.	modify the sentence to follow the normative text style	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:48:14Z) - The comment fails to identify a problem with the draft.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:49:21Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11819	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	50	T	Y	296.5	50	27.9.3.1		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Shouldn't it be "does not match the BSS color		REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:33:43Z) - the HE TB PPDU color has to match the trigger color, otherwise, the SRP information obtained from the trigger co	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 315 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11820	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	32	T	Y	296.32000732421875	32	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	This paragraph is confusing. First, it refers to use the SRP value in Table 28-21 which is the SRP value in HE SU/ER SU/MU PPDU. And then it says this	Clarify	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:28:46Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11820, which corrects the table re	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11821	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.8	70	21	E	Y	70.20999908447266	21	9.2.4.6.4.8		J	Matt Fischer		657	SR PPDU is used in this section including this figure. However, in section SR_PPDU is used. Need to be consistent on the terminlogy	Chane the SR PPDU to SR_PPDU in this section	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11822	Guoqing Li	230	2	3	34	50	T	Y	34.5	50	3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Line 50 and 54 defined the same thing. Please remove one of them	Remove one of the definitions	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:51:22Z) TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11822	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 316 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11823	Guoqing Li	230	2	3	34	54	T	Y	34.540000915527344	54	3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Line 50 and 54 defined the same thing. Please remove one of them	Remove one of the definitions	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:52:51Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11823	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11824	Guoqing Li	230	2	3	34	57	T	Y	34.569999969482422	57	3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	If SRP PPDU is DSRP_PPDU, the spec should just use one terminlolgy	Use only one of the terminologies (either SRP PPDU or DSRP_PPDU) throughput the spec	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:56:06Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11824	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11825	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	22	T	Y	297.22000122007031	22	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"another SRP_PPDU" seem to indicate that there is some tag on the particular PPDU that qualifies it as "SRP_PPDU". However, I think what this sentence	Change to "another PPDU".	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:38:31Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11825	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 317 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11826	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	36	T	Y	297.35998535 15625	36	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The restriction of TXPWRmax here should be effective only before the transmission power restriction period.	Add the wording to say that the power restriction is effect before the transmission power restrcition period.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:45:25Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11826. Commenter to note that the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11827	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	51	T	Y	297.51000976 5625	51	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	This paragraph specifies the value for the trigger frame SR field which is used in TB PPDU. Therefore, the values for this field should be Table 28-22	Change "Table 28-21" to "Table 28-22"	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:17:25Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11827	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 318 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11828	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	15	T	Y	293.14999938964844	15	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	InTable 27-6, the use of "Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element not received" set to 0 is not a natural way to say this parameter set is receive. Chang	Change the wording to "Spatial Reuse parameter set element received" and change the "0" and "1" in this table accordingly.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:47:27Z) the value 0 or 1 is for the Non-SRG OBSS_PD SR disallowed field. Clarify by modifying the title of the column. Appl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11829	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	41	T	Y	293.41000366211094	41	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Table 27-7, The use of "Spatial Reuse Paraeter Set element not received" set to 0 is not a natural way to say this parameter set is receive. Chan	Change the wording to "Spatial Reuse parameter set element received" and change the "0" and "1" in this table accordingly.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:49:06Z) agree with the comment. Clarify the title of the column. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 319 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11830	Guoqing Li	230	2	10.22.1	194	21	T	Y	194.21000671 38672	21	10.22.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0660r1	610	As 11ax is transitioning into a scheduling-based system, there is a need for AP to collect more info on STA's traffic and QoS requirement for efficient	Modify the text on TSPEC to make sure that HESTA can use it efficiently and correctly.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-22 23:05:41Z) - This CID is a duplicate of CID 18555 which was already resolved in 11-18/182r5. Proposed resolution is the sa	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 23:14:18Z- Referenced CID is wrong (should be #11855). Changes already implemented.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11831	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	15	T	Y	293.14999389 64844	15	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Table 27-6, the use of 0 and 1 is understood, but this is not setting a value for a particular field. Change 0 and 1 to "yes" or "no".	Change 0 and 1 to "yes" or "no".	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:48:00Z) agree with the comment. Modify the title of the column to make the 0 and 1 values applicable. Apply the changes pro	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 320 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11832	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	41	T	Y	293.41000366 21094	41	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Table 27-7, the use of 0 and 1 is understood, but this is not setting a value for a particular field. Change 0 and 1 to "yes" or "no".	Change 0 and 1 to "yes" or "no".	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:49:43Z) agree with the comment. Clarify by modifying the title of the column. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11833	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.1	270	36	E	Y	270.35998535 15625	36	27.7.1		A			447	does need not-->does not need	does need not-->does not need	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:54:50Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:54:53Z - see #13777	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11834	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.1	270	30	T	Y	270.29998779 296875	30	27.7.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0107r3	566	The spec should allow the TWT channel to be negotiated between AP and the STA	The spec should allow the TWT channel to be negotiated between AP and the STA	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:30:00Z) Revised-Agree in principle. By allowing the TWT channel to be negotiated between an AP and a STA, we can enabl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 321 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11835	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.20	128	44	T	Y	128.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	372r1	550	Why "Reject TWT" is N/A. Does it mean a STA cannot reject a TWT setup?	Clarify	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:45:49Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. There has been an incidental removal of that portion of the text	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 21:34:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11836	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.20	129	57	E	Y	129.57000732421875	57	9.4.2.20		A			447	remove the extra period at the end of the sentence.	remove the extra period at the end of the sentence.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:40:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:40:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11837	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.20	131	39	T	Y	131.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0107r3	566	Different channels should be allowed to maximize the utlization of the medium and reducing the power consumption for the STAs	Remove the contstraint that HE STA cannot use TWT channel field	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:31:18Z) Revised-Agree in principle. By allowing the TWT channel to be negotiated between an AP and a STA, we can enabl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 322 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11838	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.2	274	3	T	Y	274.02999877 92969	3	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	regarding "to indicate that it is in awake state", Active mode can not be in awake state even though it is available to recevie frames.	change to "to indicate that it is in Active mode" or "it is available to receive frames"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:05:51Z) Revised – Deleting the note and providing a reference to the sub clause that defines the Active mode which clearl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11839	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.2	275	60	T	Y	275.60000610 35156	60	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	633r2	647	Regarding "...the Responder PM Mode sugfield to 0". As specified in 27.7.2, an AP is allowed to set Responder PM Mode to 1 for individtual TWT, it sh	Remove "and the Responder PM Mode subfield to 0" in this sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:54:12Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to specify that the field may be set to 1. TGax editor to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 323 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11840	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.2	271	57	T	Y	271.57000732421875	57	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	Table 27-2, there are other frame exchange possibilites that are not included in this table. For example, when an unsolicated TWT is received, a STA c	Please state that this table listed some frame exchange possibilities, not all.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:01:12Z) Rejected – The intention is to give an exhaustive list of the possible sequences since it is beneficial to list	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11841	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	4	T	Y	278.04000854 49219	4	27.7.3.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	regarding "to indicate that it is in awake state", Active mode can not be in awake state even though it is available to recevie frames.	change to "to indicate that it is in Active mode" or "it is available to receive frames"	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 22:59:17Z) Rejected – STAs that are in Active mode are in awake state. Please refer to 11.2.3.2 (STA power management mode	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:52:08Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11842	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	22	E	Y	278.22000122 07031	22	27.7.3.2		V			447	There is no Table 27aa. Please correct the cross reference.	Please correct the reference Table number	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:06:58Z) - Table 27-5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:07:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 324 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11843	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	37	T	Y	278.36999511 71875	37	27.7.3.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	When AP sets up unsolicted broadcast or individual TWT, it is requiring the STAs to be awake during those TWT SPs. However, there may be times that ST	Please add statement that unsolicited TWT, broadcast or individual, can only be announced TWT.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:00:16Z) Rejected – A STA that has timing issues due to coexistence or overlapping activities have multiple options to s	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:50:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11844	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	42	T	Y	279.42001342 77344	42	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	The STA may have individual TWT agreement with the AP in addition to broadcast TWT, therefore asking the STA "should not transmit outside of broadcast	Add the condition that". .if the STA does not have other TWT agreements"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:53:31Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution adds clarification text inline with the sugge	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11845	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.3	280	46	E	Y	280.45999145 50781	46	27.7.3.3		A			447	"might entertain the creation..." is not spec language. Change to "might create..."	Change to "might creat. .."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:10:00Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:10:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 325 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11846	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	34	T	Y	281.33999633 78906	34	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	Even if the STA has established membership in the broadcast TWT, if this is an announced TWT, the STA does not need to be in awake state.	Please include the condition that this is for unannounced TWT	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:54:26Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11847	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	52	T	Y	281.51998901 36719	52	27.7.3.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	The first sentence in this paragraph adds no value because a STA transmits TB PPDU as response to trigger regardless of TWT status. ULMU response beh	Remove the first sentence in this paragraph.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:55:09Z) Rejected – This is a declarative statement that provides a reference to the normative behavior the STA is requi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 326 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11848	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	60	T	Y	281.60000061035156	60	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	662r1	618	An AP cannot demand a STA to be in awake state during a particular period of time because the awake/doze transision should be decided by the STA ultim	An AP cannot demand a STA to be in awake state during a particular period of time because the awake/doze transision should be decided by the STA ultim	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 03:44:41Z) Revised – Generally agree with the comment. Proposed resolution is to add similar statements that were added to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11849	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	47	T	Y	282.47000122 07031	47	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	As stated in line 20 on the same page, all other fields in TWT element are reserved and thus there is no nominal TWT Wake duration and thus there is n	Clarify	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:50:44Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that the Nominal Minimum TWT Wake D	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 327 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11850	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	47	T	Y	282.47000122 07031	47	27.7.3.4		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	What is the purpsose of staying awake for adjusteminimumTWTWake Duration? If there is multicast traffic to receiver the STA has traffic to send and	Clarify	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:51:52Z) Rejected – The STA needs to stay awake to receive the Beacon at the negotiated TBTT. The adjusteminimumTWTwake	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11851	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	55	E	Y	282.54998779 296875	55	27.7.3.4		A			447	There is no Table 27ab. Seem like the Table number should be Table 27-5 in the next page.	Fix the cross reference.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:14:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:14:06Z - see #12096	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11852	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	7	T	Y	282.07000732 421875	7	27.7.3.4		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	When STA negotiates a TBTT, does it need to wake up for DTIM Beacon to receive multicast?	Clarify	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:52:44Z) Rejected – The STA is expected to follow whichever multicast delivery procedure it has negotiated with the AP (	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 328 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11853	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.3.4	284	64	T	Y	284.64001464 84375	64	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	Since broadcast TWT is meant for multiple STAs, the resumption as indicated by TWT information frame from a particular STA shall select a TWT value fr	Clarify that when a STA resumes its activity in a broadcast TWT, the Next TWT value shall be selected from existing TWT values of this Broadcast TWT	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:41:06Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution adds clarification as suggested. TGax editor to make the chan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11854	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.7.5	286	41	T	Y	286.41000366 21094	41	27.7.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	370r2	548	The use of Cascase indication as a means to early terminate TWT SP is confusing. According to this paragraph, when a STA receives a trig ger that is in	Delete this paragraph.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:15:45Z) Revised – Agree in principle to removing the paragraph but not for the reasons in the comment. Removal of the p	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 329 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11855	Guoqing Li	230	2	10.22.1	194	21	T	Y	194.21000671 38672	21	10.22.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0182	506	As 11ax is transitioning into a scheduling-based system, there is a need for AP to collect more info on STA's traffic and QoS requirement for efficient	Modify the text on TSPEC to make sure that HE STA can use it efficiently and correctly.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-09 21:03:21Z) Agree in principle. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/182r5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-09 22:05:08Z - Added the behavior text as 27.5.7 - at the end of the MU operation subclause.	2.2	2018-03-04	EDITOR
11856	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	Y	81.459999084 47266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	The table above says that ACK type=0 and TID=15 is reserved, but the text in this paragraph says that this combination is for unassociated STAs. Plea	Clarify	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:07:40Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that Table 9-24b is for the case wh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:20:25Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 330 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11857	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	49	T	Y	134.49000549316406	49	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	The minimum fragment size is the min size that is capable of transmitting or receiving? Please clarify	Clarify.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:48:21Z) Revised- It is for receiver, proposed resolution clarifies it. TGax editor please make the changes as shown in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11858	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	10	T	Y	135.10000610351562	10	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	105r3	469	The "multi-TID aggregation support". Is this the capalibility of transmitting or receiving? Usually it's a capability of receiver, but the text seems	Clarify.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:35:10Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	see #12379	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11859	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	39	T	Y	136.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793r1	603	Some text needs to be provided for this capability field.	Specifiy this field.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:51:49Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 331 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11860	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	49	T	Y	136.49000549316406	49	9.4.2.237.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	380r1	555	Should it be " any nonzero value" in the third column to be consistent with the definition of this field? If there is word of "any", then the TWT valu	Clarify	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:14:03Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that it can be any nonzero value si	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 21:07:04Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11861	Guoqing Li	230	2	10.3.2.10.1	182	27	T	Y	182.27000427246094	27	10.3.2.10.1		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Multi-STA BlockACK can also be used by the AP in this case	change to "to explicit BlockAckReq or Multi-STA BlockAckReq.."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:08:42Z) BlockAckReq covers both compressed block ack req and multi-TID block ack req. So, no need to call it out explicit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:24:47Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 332 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11862	Guoqing Li	230	2	10.22.2.7	197	58	E	Y	197.58000183 10547	58	10.22.2.7		V			648	should be "DL HE MU PPDU"	change to "DL HE MU PPDU"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:00:57Z) - Changed to HE DL MU PPDU with resolution to other comments, but this is incorrect. Should be DL HE MU PPDU (D	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Technical: undefined term. I believe the intent was for it to include both HE MU PPDU and VHT MU PPDU.	I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:01:45Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11863	Guoqing Li	230	2	9.4.2.200	131	33	T	Y	131.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	It is unreasonable to ask all STAs to be awake during the Broadcast TWT periods when TWT ID=0 because the STA may be in doze or doing other activities	Either change this to be dependent on OPS operation, i.e., only when AP/STA supports OPS, then allows it, or this Broadcast TWT has to be announced.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:01:11Z) Revise – TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 11863	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 333 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11864	Guoqing Li	230	2	28.1.4	331	60	T	Y	331.60000061035156	60	28.1.4		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Support of HE MU PPDU is mandatory in DL, but optional in UL. Please clarify.	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:54:24Z) Editor instruction: please add at the end of line 61 the following: for transmission for AP and reception for Non	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:21:21Z - With resolution to #14013 the statement is deleted so the change has not been made.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11865	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.11.4	305	20	E	Y	305.20001220703125	20	27.11.4		A			447	An non-AP-->A non-AP	An non-AP-->A non-AP	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:52:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:52:41Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11866	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.11.4	305	65	E	Y	305.64999389 64844	65	27.11.4		A			447	Bettert o use " BSS color collision" to be consistent with other part of the spec	BSS color overlap-->BSS color collision	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:53:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:53:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11867	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.11.4	306	2	T	Y	306.01998901 36719	2	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	365r1	536	Though obvious, there should be a statement that states when BSS color is disabled, the STA shall set the BSS color field in SIG-A to 0 in HE PPDU.	Add a sentence that specifies a STA shall set BSS color in SIG-A to 0 if the BSS color disable subefiels in the most recently received HE Operation IE	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:45:36Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Please see resolution for CID 11547 TGax editor, please make changes as shown i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:55:16Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 334 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11868	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.11.6	307	59	T	Y	307.58999633 78906	59	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	There should be a reference section for the " other conditions".	Either add a section number as a reference for the "other conditions", or list the conditions when this field is set to SRP_AND_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIB	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:00:57Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11868	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11869	Guoqing Li	230	2	27.11.6	308	19	E	Y	308.19000244 140625	19	27.11.6		A			447	The description in this section can be further clarified. For example, line 19 and line 27 are rules for HE MU PPDU, these two can be listed togher. L	Categorize these rules based on PPDU type and AP/non-AP.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:07:27Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:07:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 335 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11870	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	27.16.4.1	323	21	T	Y	323.20999145 50781	21	27.16.4.1		A	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	Reference to field name is not consistent in this section. It should be QTP Support	As in comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 23:58:51Z) Accept: The “field” is not necessary and is deleted. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 19:31:35Z - Do not remove "field" -- see section 2.9.3 in the 802.11 style guide (11-09-1034r12) ("Do not miss out the “noun” part	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11871	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	27.16.4.2	324	45	T	Y	324.45001220 703125	45	27.16.4.2		A	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	Repetitive use of a word in the same sentence	Reword the 2nd sentence in the note as: "The interference mitigation protocol is to provide an AP a tool to manage and avoid interference."	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 00:02:08Z) Accepted: TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/444r2 under CID 11871	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:05:52Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 336 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11872	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	47	T	Y	275.47000122 07031	47	27.7.3.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	662r1	618	What is the need to differentiate the case where b-TWT element is carried in a broadcast mgmt frame versus an individually addressed mgmt frame to neg	Delete this paragraph	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 03:41:03Z) Rejected – The presence of separate bits in the element ensures that the two functionalities are kept separate,	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion failed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 20:56:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11873	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	19	T	Y	278.19000244 140625	19	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	What is the need to differentiate the case where b-TWT element is carried in a broadcast mgmt frame versus an individually addressed mgmt frame to neg	Delete the referenced paragraphs. Simplify the procedure - AP/STA can exchange individually addressed mgmt frames containing B-TWT element (Broadcast	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:01:19Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. The comment resolution for CID 11007 that was approved last F2F r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:50:48Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 337 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11874	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	33	T	Y	278.32998657 22656	33	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	Update the note to remove any dependency on Wake TBTT subfield. It shouldn't matter if the b-TWT element is carried in negotiation frame (individually	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:02:07Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. The comment resolution for CID 11007 that was approved last F2F r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:50:03Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11875	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	44	T	Y	278.44000244 140625	44	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	633r2	647	Remove reference to Wake TBTT Negotiation subfield from the table. B-TWT element carried in a unicast negotiation frames doesn't require a separate in	Remove reference to Wake TBTT Negotiation subfield from the table. Also, shorten the column titles by removing any reference to the Broadcast and Wake	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:03:08Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. The comment resolution for CID 11007 that was approved last F2F r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:55:38Z - Appears to be part of a general set of changes to Table 27-6	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 338 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11876	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.238	149	25	T	Y	149.25	25	9.4.2.238		V	Abhishek Patil	1859r4	543	Per baseline spec, only the transmitted BSSID beacons in a multiple BSSID set. Therefore, 11ax spec doesn't need to define an alternate (or redundant)	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 05:12:26Z) Revised Agree with the comment. HE Operations element doesn't need to advertise multi-BSSAP and whether or not	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11742	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11877	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	36	T	Y	211.36000061035156	36	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1847r0	483	What is the need to advertise MaxBSSID Indicator field in HE Operations element? The mgmt frame carrying this element shall also be carrying the Multi	Delete cited paragraph	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:12:36Z) Revised Agree with the comment Please see resolution for CIDs 11023 and 11355 TGax editor, please make changes	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:59:49Z - see #11355	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 339 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11878	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	40	T	Y	211.39999389648438	40	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1847r0	483	This paragraph assumes a nontransmitted BSSID would beacon which is not the case by definition. There should not be any ambiguity regarding identifyin	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:15:31Z) Revised Agree with the comment Please see resolution for CID 11355 TGax editor, please make changes as suggest	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:49:23Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11879	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	3.2	34	24	E	Y	34.240001678 4668	24	3.2		A			447	Replace HE non-AP STA with non-AP HE STA. The comment applies to all the sections throughout the draft	Replace all reference of HE non-AP STA with non-AP HE STA thorough out the draft	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:31:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:31:28Z - see #14217	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11880	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	12	E	Y	56.119998931884766	12	9.2.4.5.6		A			447	Incorrect Table number	Change to Table reference to 9-18f	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:26:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:26:51Z - see #12215	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11881	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.3	119	10	E	Y	119.09999984741211	10	9.4.2.3		V			447	Value 126 is already in use in Table 9-78 (in baseline spec)	Please use the next available value	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:14:00Z) - 802.11-2016 uses 127, 126. 11k adds 125 and 124. Change to 123.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:14:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 340 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11882	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	4	E	Y	136.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		A			447	Incorrect section reference	Fix section reference to 27.5.4	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:52:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:52:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11883	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.238	150	25	E	Y	150.25	25	9.4.2.238		A			447	Change 'field' to 'subfield'	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:28:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:28:43Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11884	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.239	151	45	E	Y	151.44999694 82422	45	9.4.2.239		A			447	Typo - missing 'and'	Replace text as: "... attempts of ULOFDMA-based random access and is derived from ..."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:38:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:38:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11885	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.241	152	49	E	Y	152.49000549 316406	49	9.4.2.241		A			447	Don't capitalize c in BSS color when it is not referring to the field BSS Color	Replace text as: "... advertise a BSS color change and ..."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:52:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:52:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11886	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.4.2.244	158	45	E	Y	158.44999694 82422	45	9.4.2.244		V		18/0149r3	565	Incorrect section reference	Fix section reference to 27.5.6	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:45:44Z) - make the changes as proposed as doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11887	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.6.16.3.2	165	11	E	Y	165.11000061 035156	11	9.6.16.3.2		A			447	Incorrect Table title	Change table title to 'Mesh Peering Confirm frame Action field format'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:57:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:57:49Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 341 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11888	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.6.28.2	166	19	E	Y	166.19000244140625	19	9.6.28.2		A			447	Missing section reference	Provide section reference for HE MIMO Control field (9.4.1.62)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:58:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:58:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11889	Hemanth Sampath	230	2	9.6.30	167	37	E	Y	167.36999511871875	37	9.6.30		A			648	Quiet Time Period Action frame details should be under 9.6.28.3	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:15:17Z) - Fixed with #11025. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:15:27Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11890	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.18.3	491	10	T	Y	491.10000061035156	10	28.3.18.3		V	Jianhan Liu	11-17/1730r1	441	In 11ac similar subclause, the following sentences were used to describe the possible LO usage for 80+80 MHz or 160MHz, the same sentences should be ad	Add similar sentences as quoted in the comment into clause 28.3.18.3	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:47:06Z) - Change to as in doc IEEE802.11-17/1730r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 22:29:55Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 342 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11891	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.11.6	476	4	E	Y	476.04000854 49219	4	28.3.11.6		V			648	In Figure 28-39 and Figure 28-40, need to indicate the range of each "M_MA Data Symbols" using blacket signs. This should be an copy error, because th	Correct these two figures following doc 17/995r4, the orignal Viso files were already emailed to editors.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:33:18Z) - Corrected with #12064. No further change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:33:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11892	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.17	485	9	T	Y	485.08999633 78906	9	28.3.17		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	In Figure 28-44, the duration of HE-STF should be 8us instead of 4us.	Revise the figure as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:04:55Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 11892) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:04:09Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 343 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11893	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.7	485	1	T	Y	485.01000976 5625	1	28.3.7		J	Bin Tian	11-18/0806r0	592	How to set the HE-SIG-A fields in HE TB NDP feedback PPDUs?	Add descriptions on how to set different subfields in HE TB NDP feedback PPDUs	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:01:54Z) HE TB NDP feedback is a special type of TB PPDU so its HE-SIG-A bit setting follows the same rule as TB PPDU	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:37:51Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11894	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	96	62	T	Y	96.62000274658203	62	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	For NDP Feedback Report Poll, how to set the Spatial Reuse field in Common Info field, should it be reserved like STBC, Doppler, etc?	Add description on how to set Spatial Reuse field	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:08:49Z) agree with the commenter. Make the SR field reserved in trigger frame, and set the TX VECTOR value to SRP_DISALLOW	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:04:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 344 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11895	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	248	1	T	Y	248.00999450683594	1	27.5.3.2.3		V	Hongyuan Zhang	17/1731r3	446	For accurate timing synchronization at each STA responding a trigger frame, the legacy part preamble (L-STF, L-LTF, ...) of the PPDU carrying a trigger	Add a note: "Beamforming the non-HT preamble of the PPDU carrying a Trigger Frame is not recommended"	With motion 590: REVISED. The comment has been resolved by CID 14256, ax editor already made changes in D2.3, but on comment spreadsheet, status is no	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Resolved with motion 446. Revisited with motion 590.	N	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:15:20Z		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11896	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.18.4.3	491	45	T	Y	491.45001220703125	45	28.3.18.4.3		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0478r1	526	"... In the test, NSS=NSTS (no STBC) shall be used". How about beamforming? Nowadays all the actual EVM measurements shall disable beamforming, due to	Add "and no beamforming shall be used" after the quoted sentence	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 04:58:58Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions for CID 11896 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0478r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:25:34Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 345 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11897	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	493	35	T	Y	493.35000610 35156	35	28.3.18.4.4		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0753r0	580	In Step g), may want to mention that in the presence of midamble, the test equipment shall bypass midamble and only measure the data symbols, and mayb	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:29:23Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 11897 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0753r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:20:56Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11898	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	9.4.2.237.5	147	65	T	Y	147.64999389 648438	65	9.4.2.237.5		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	In Table 9-262ad (RU Allocation Index), RUs that are smaller than RU242 is not present, this means that PE shall always be 0 for these smaller RUs?	Add a note saying "No PE is required for RUs smaller than 242 subcarriers".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:49:48Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0469r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13342	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11899	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.3.12	476	64	E	N	476.64001464 84375	64	28.3.12		J			648	"Table 28-42 (Nominal TPE Values)", "PE" should be subscript.	Make "PE" subscript	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:29:34Z) - The bracketed title is there to help check the accuracy of the references.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:30:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 346 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11900	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.1.1	329	21	T	Y	329.20999145 50781	21	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0409r1	524	"Transmission of an HE MU PPDU where none of the RUs utilize MU-MIMO (DL OFDMA)", what if an AP only supports one user DL-OFDMA? May add some lower bo	Add "and is able to transmit an HE MU PPDU with at least 4 RUs"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:57:39Z) IEEE 802.11ax defines procedures enabling OFDMA (DL and UL). The decision to support 1 or more users should left	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:21:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11901	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	28.1.1	329	23	T	Y	329.23001098 63281	23	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0409r1	524	"Reception of an HE TB PPDU where none of the RUs utilize MU-MIMO (UL OFDMA)", what if an AP only supports one user UL-OFDMA? May add some lower bound	Add "and is able to trigger and receive an HE TB PPDU with at least 4 RUs"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:57:57Z) IEEE 802.11ax defines procedures enabling OFDMA (DL and UL). The decision to support 1 or more users should left	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:21:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 347 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11902	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"An HE STA may transmit a 242-tone HE ER SU PPDU to a per HE STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the DCM Rx fiel	Remove the sentence "An HE STA may transmit a 242-tone HE ER SU PPDU to a peer HE STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:45:36Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11903	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	6	T	Y	141.05999755 859375	6	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"LDPC Coding in Payload", LDPC is mandatory for >20 MHz, and/or >4SS, need to add conditions with which LDPC is optional	Add conditions when this field is meaningful, i.e. when LDPC is optional.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:47:07Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID11903 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:47:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 348 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11904	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	53	T	Y	141.52999877929688	53	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0409r1	524	If a device claims DCM up to 1SS and up to BPSK, it may not get much additional benefit by doing DCM for wider bandwidth (RU size).	Add additoial capabilties for max RU size supported for DCM Tx and Rx	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:57:24Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID11904 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0409r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:19:46Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11905	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	35	T	Y	143.35000610351562	35	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	For "Triggered SU Beamforming Feedback" field, the interpretation does not mention anything related to Triggered feedback, same issue for MU and CQI i	Clarify these capabilities are for triggered feedbacks	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:52:11Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12680 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:48:00Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 349 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11906	Hongyuan Zhang	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	6	T	Y	144.05999755859375	6	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"PPE Threshold Present"--if this field is 0, then does it mean all rates do NOT require PE?	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:53:01Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID11906 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:48:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11907	Huizhao Wang	230	2	6.3.3.3.2	39	52	T	Y	39.52000045776367	52	6.3.3.3.2		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	No reason is given why "UORA Parameter-ter Set" is added into BSSDescriptionSet table of MLME-SCAN.request.	Please add text to explain why it is added into MLME-SCAN.request	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:21:44Z) - UORA Parameter Set is included in BSSDescriptionSet table of MLME-SCAN.confirm. D2.0 only describes when it	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:31:32Z - see #11363	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 350 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11908	Huizhao Wang	230	2	6.3.4.2	40	16	T	Y	40.159999847 41211	16	6.3.4.2		J	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	Missing "HE Operation" element in MLME-JOIN.request. The Basic HE-MCS and NSS field is in HE Operation element, so to check them at the "Effect of rec	Add "HE Operation" into MLME-JOIN.request	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:32:00Z) - MLME-JOIN.request is used by a non-AP STA and HE Operation is not included in it. The HE Operation parameter	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:32:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11909	Huizhao Wang	230	2	8.3.4.4	45	29	T	Y	45.290000915 527344	29	8.3.4.4		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	The enumerated types of "GI_HELTF TYPE" in TRIGVECTOR are missing the mandatory type of: 2xHE-LTF + 0.8us, specified in clause 28.3.10.10	Add the type of 2xHE-LTF + 0.8us GI into the enumerated types	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:14:00Z) Reason: The TRIGVECTOR is used to support the receiving of HE_TB PPDU. In current spec, HE_TB PPDU doesn't suppo	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 18:42:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11910	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	12	T	Y	56.119998931 884766	12	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	The Figure 9-18d is missing	Please add Figure 9-18d	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11911	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	35	E	Y	66.349998474 1211	35	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	Change "Figure XXX" to "Figure 9-15f" In the Definition of "MSI/PPDU Type" field	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:13Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:15Z - see #14152	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 351 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11912	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	65	T	Y	79.650001525 8789	65	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Wrong Figure 9-38b is indicated for the Per AID TID Info subfield when AID11 is 2045	Change the "Figure 9-38b (Per AID TID Info subfield format when AID11 subfield is not 2045)", to "Figure 9-38c (Per AID TID Info subfield format when	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:45:02Z) Accepted. It is already resolved by CIDs 12679 and 11060.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:16:16Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
11913	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	34	T	Y	81.339996337 89062	34	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Ack Type = 0, TID = 15 in Per AID TID Info is no longer as reserved. This combination is defined as acknowldge a management frame sent by unassociated	Remove "Reserved", and add the text to describe that this combination is for acknowldge a management frame sent by an unassociated STA	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:04:14Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that Table 9-24b is for the case wh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 352 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11914	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.3.1.20	83	31	T	Y	83.30999755859375	31	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	Need to update the Figure 9-50, to define bit 1 set to 1 to indicate HE NDPA	Update the Figure 9-50 in base document to define bit 1 as indication of HE NDPA: 0 -- VHT NDPA, 1 -- HE NDPA	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:40:05Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 11914.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11915	Huizhao Wang	230	2	93.1.23	90	18	T	Y	90.18000030517578	18	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	missing the indication of "RU Allocation field", when describing the bit 12	Change to "The first bit of RU Allocation field"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:19:28Z) Agree with the comment. Added the missing description at the beginning of the paragraph TGax editor, please make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:13:42Z - Restructured sentence	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11916	Huizhao Wang	230	2	93.1.23	91	13	T	Y	91.12999725341797	13	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1878r1	479	Please define how to set bit 12 for RU size of 2x996 tones in RU Allocation field	Please add "set bit 12 to 0"	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:49:49Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 12165.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:03:15Z - see #12165	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 353 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11917	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.3.1.23.1	94	28	T	Y	94.27999887792968 8	28	9.3.1.23.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r3	500	Preferred AC field values should follow the ACI-to-AC coding defined in Table 9-136.	Instead of redefine the Preferred AC subfield coding in Table 9-25j, please just change it to: "The Preferred AC subfield coding is use the same ACI-	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:23:54Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r3 that are marked with CID 11917	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:11:43Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11918	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.3.3.7	99	31	T	Y	99.30999755859375	31	9.3.3.7		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	TWT element order is different in Associate Response than in Beacon	Change the TWT element order to after HE Operation element, so that the order is consistent with Beacon. The same change should be applied to the Tabl	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:23:53Z) Rejected – The order is different because of backward compliance. TWT element in the Assoc. Response was alread	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11919	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.4.1.17	103	47	E	Y	103.47000122070312	47	9.4.1.17		A			447	Remove '(' from the sentence	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:52:11Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:52:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 354 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11920	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.4.1.65	117	2	E	Y	117.01999664 30664	2	9.4.1.65		V			447	Change "twos" to "two's"	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:54:06Z) - Change "twos complement" to "2s compliment", for consistency with other uses in 802.11.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:54:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11921	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	145	47	E	Y	145.47000122 070312	47	9.4.2.237.4		J			447	Change "Figure 9-589cm" to " Figure 9-589cn"	as in the comment, and apply the same fix to line 57, page 146, line 5, 15, 25 & 35	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:17:36Z) - Figure numbering is automated and correct in this instance	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:18:04Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11922	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.4.2.242.1	154	1	T	Y	154.00999450 683594	1	9.4.2.242.1		J	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	Missing a Figure to depict the bitmap of A Control field of the Quiet Time Period element	This subclause is poorly written, please rewrite this subclause, and add a figure to depict the bit map of the "A Control" field.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:27:32Z) Rejected: The comment is similar to CID 12568. The resolution is the same.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 355 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11923	Huizhao Wang	230	2	9.7.3	172		T	Y	172		9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	If there are one ACK and one Block ACK or M-STA Block ACK inside the A-MPDU data enabled immediate response context, the order is not clear	Need to add the text in the Table 9-425, to define the order of there is one ACK and one Block ACK or M-STA Block ACK inside an A-MPDU	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:57:25Z) Rejected Discussion: Among Ack, Block Ack and Multi-STA BA, there is at least one of them in an A-MPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11924	Ian Sherlock	230	2	9.3.1.23 Trigger frame format	85	35	T	Y	85.349998474211	35	9.3.1.23 Trigger frame format		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	The trigger frame is a control frame and as such should use control frame PHY rates. There is no limitation on using HR/DSSS PHY rates for control fra	Add explicit text prohibiting the usage of HR/DSSS PHY rates for 11ax trigger frames	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:11:02Z) Agree with the comment – however, this already specified in section 27.5.3.2.3. Tgax editor: No further changes a	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:11:09Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 356 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11925	Ian Sherlock	230	2	27.7.2 Individual TWT agreements	272	39	T	Y	272.39001464 84375	39	27.7.2 Individual TWT agreements		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	"An HESTA that successfully sets up an individual TWT agreement ... is exempt from the requirements for receiving Beacon frames". There is no clear	Add reference to one of the mechanisms that ensure the AP will buffer broadcast frames for the STA while it is in doze mode.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:06:38Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution adds a reference for this purpose. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11926	Jae Seung Lee	230	2	6.3.7	40	48	T	N	40.479999542 23633	48	6.3.7		J	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-ASSOCIATE.request should include 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities.	Add 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities to MLME-ASSOCIATE.request	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:32:31Z) - The association process is triggered when the MLME-JOIN.request primitive is issued by the local SME. HE rel	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:32:35Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11927	Jae Seung Lee	230	2	6.3.7	40	48	T	N	40.479999542 23633	48	6.3.7		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-ASSOCIATE.confirm should include 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities.	Add 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities to MLME-ASSOCIATE.confirm	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 04:02:08Z) -Agree with the commenter. See the proposed text change in 11-17/1766r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 04:02:16Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 357 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11928	Jae Seung Lee	230	2	6.3.7	40	48	T	N	40.479999542 23633	48	6.3.7		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-ASSOCIATE.response should include 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities.	Add 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities to MLME-ASSOCIATE.response	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:32:48Z) - Agree with the commenter. See the proposed text change in 11-17/1766r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:33:13Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11929	Jae Seung Lee	230	2	6.3.8	41	18	T	N	41.180000305 17578	18	6.3.8		J	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-REASSOCIATE.request should include 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities.	Add 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities to MLME-REASSOCIATE.request	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:34:00Z) - The association process is triggered when the MLME-JOIN.request primitive is issued by the local SME. HE rel	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:34:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11930	Jae Seung Lee	230	2	6.3.8	41	18	T	N	41.180000305 17578	18	6.3.8		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-REASSOCIATE.confirm should include 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities.	Add 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities to MLME-REASSOCIATE.confirm	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:34:23Z) - Agree with the commenter. See the proposed text change in 11-17/1766r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:33:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 358 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11931	Jae Seung Lee	230	2	6.3.8	41	18	T	N	41.18000030517578	18	6.3.8		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	MLME-REASSOCIATE.response should include 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities.	Add 11ax related parameters such as HE Capabilities to MLME-REASSOCIATE.response	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:34:39Z) - Agree with the commenter. See the proposed text change in 11-17/1766r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:33:18Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11932	James June Wang	230	2	27.11.6	307	58	T	N	307.57998657 22656	58	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	1852r8	474	"when permitted by other conditions," is vague	provide references such as "as permitted by other conditions in ... subclauses."	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:41:33Z) not certain exactly what the commenter is requesting, but the term bandwidth has no reference, so formalizaing that	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11933	James June Wang	230	2	27.11.6	308	15	T	N	308.14999389 64844	15	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"An HESTA that transmits an HE SU PPDU or an HE ER SU PPDU that contains a Trigger frame should set the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_REUSE to SR_DELAY.	provide reference such as 27.9.2.1.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:03:41Z) - this subclause is the one that sets out the rules and limitations for the value of the SPATIAL_REUSE parameter w	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 359 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11934	James June Wang	230	2	27.11.6	308	18	T	N	308.17999267578125	18	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"An HESTA that transmits an HE MU PPDU that contains a Trigger frame should set the TXVECTOR SPATIAL_REUSE to SR_RESTRICTED" It is not clear when to	provide reference such as 27.9.2.1.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:04:17Z) - this subclause is the one that sets out the rules and limitations for the value of the SPATIAL_REUSE parameter w	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11935	James June Wang	230	2	27.11.6	308	50	T	N	308.5	50	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	... if the STA is an HE non-AP STA and the SR Disallowed subfield of the SR Control field of the most recently received Spatial Reuse Parameter Set el	as indicated	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:07:17Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 11935	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 360 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11936	James June Wang	230	2	27.11.6	308	50	T	N	308.5	50	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"or, if permitted, to SRP_AND-NON-SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED," this is reduda nt since the condition for setting SRP_AND-NON-SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED is alre	delete "or, if permitted, to SRP_AND-NON-SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED,"	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:07:44Z) - the condition is not redundant, but additive. The paragraph at L39-48 offers an option of setting which remains	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11937	James June Wang	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	10	E	N	291.10000061035156	10	27.9.2.1		V		17/1852r8	474	Parameter names in Figure 29-9 not consistent with (27-3)	Change "OBSS_PDmax" to "OBSSPDmax", "OBSS_PDmin" to "OBSSPDmin", ... in Figure 27-9 to be consistent with parameters in (27-3)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:26:10Z) - agree in principal with the comment. Modify OBSSPDmax and OBSSPDmin to OBSS_PDmax and OBSS_PDmin. Apply the c	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 361 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11938	James June Wang	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	63	T	N	292.63000048828125	63	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Why do we have this condition "Non-SRG OBSS PD Max Offset ■δ± SRG OBSS PD Max Offset" ? It is not clear they are related.	Please clarify or remove	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:45:35Z) Agree with the commenter. Some more flexibility can be obtained by removing this condition, while no issues seem to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11939	James June Wang	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	31	T	N	292.30999755859375	31	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	RSSI_LEGACY is a relative value with value 0 to 277. It is not clear that it can be used to compare with OBSS_PD.	Please clarify it.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:40:54Z) agree with the commenter. Suppress the mention to RSSI_legacy and mention receive signal strength, which is used in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 362 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11940	James June Wang	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	7	T	N	294.07000732421875	7	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Note 1 and Note 2 should be nomative text.	Change to nomative text	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:54:02Z) this is a note because the normative text above covers these conditions. These notes are just to clarify the norma	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11941	James June Wang	230	2	27.9.2.3	295	10	T	N	295.10000061035156	10	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Figure 27-10 "S2 max TXPWR is equal to max (..." should be change to "min (... "	as indicated	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:11:17Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:36:31Z - see #12070	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11942	James June Wang	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	6	T	N	294.05999755859375	6	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Should have a maximum value (such as maximum allowable TXOP duration) for OBSS_PD SR transmit power restriction period regardless when STA gains TXOP	Recommend to change to --- This OBSS_PD SR transmit power restriction period shall be terminated at the end of the TXOP that the STA gains once its ba	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:53:25Z) this is not considered as the Tx OP duration is not always available and in order to push the STA to use a static o	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 363 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11943	James Lepp	230	2	27.11.4	306	2	E	Y	306.01 998901 36719	2	27.11.4		A			447	Change STA to HE STA	Change STA to HE STA	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:55:17Z) - Because only associated HE STAs will be able to parse this element.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:55:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11944	James Lepp	230	2	27.11.4	306	2	E	Y	306.01 998901 36719	2	27.11.4		A			447	Change AP to HE AP	Change AP to HE AP	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:54:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:54:14Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11945	James Lepp	230	2	27.13	309	46	E	Y	309.45 999145 50781	46	27.13		J			447	Change "the HLA Control field" to "the HE Link Adaptation Control field"	Change "the HLA Control field" to "the HE Link Adaptation Control field"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:10:10Z) - Referred to as the HLA Control field	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:10:38Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11946	James Lepp	230	2	27.14.2	312	29	E	Y	312.29 000854 49219	29	27.14.2		J			447	Don't start a subclause with "This subclause illustrates"		REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:14:35Z) - Commenter has not identified a problem with the draft.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:14:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 364 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11947	James Lepp	230	2	9.4.1.62	107	25	E	Y	107.25	25	9.4.1.62		J			447	The acronym BW is quite inconsistent throughout the document. Sometimes its described as Channel Width, Band Width and Channel Bandwidth, and also som	Change "channel width" to "channel bandwidth" at this location. There may be other places to fix this for consistency	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:58:28Z) - The acronym in this case is a field name. BW is as good as anything for a field name.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:59:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11948	James Lepp	230	2	9.4.1.53	106	5	E	Y	106.05000305175781	5	9.4.1.53		V			447	Replace "BWs" with "channel bandwidths"	Replace "BWs" with "channel bandwidths"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:54:21Z) - Change "at BWs that is the same as or narrower than 80 MHz" to "at channel widths less than or equal to 80 MH	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:54:52Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11949	James Lepp	230	2	9.3.1.23.4	96	20	T	Y	96.19999694824219	20	9.3.1.23.4		A	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	Change "BW field" to "BW subfield" to match the rest of this clause.	Change "BW field" to "BW subfield"	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:47:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:01:19Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 365 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11950	James Lepp	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	7	E	Y	84.069999969482422	7	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0378r1	533	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth". This is not a field name so the acronym just makes this sentence less readable.	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:46:22Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution defines the bandwidth (BW) relating it to the TXVECTOR pa	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Technical: there are significant issues with the discription here beyond the use of the acronym BW. "RU1 is encoded" does not make sense. A field is e	I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11951	James Lepp	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	12	E	Y	84.120002746582203	12	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0378r1	533	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth". This is not a field name so the acronym just makes this sentence less readable.	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:47:58Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution defines the bandwidth (BW) relating it to the TXVECTOR pa	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 366 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11952	James Lepp	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	16	E	Y	84.160003662 10938	16	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0378r1	533	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth". This is not a field name so the acronym just makes this sentence less readable.	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:48:34Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0378r1 under all headings that include CID 11952.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11953	James Lepp	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	21	E	Y	84.209999084 47266	21	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0378r1	533	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth". This is not a field name so the acronym just makes this sentence less readable.	Change the acronym "BW" to the word "bandwidth"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:49:41Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0378r1 under all headings that include CID 11953.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11954	James Lepp	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	62	18	T	Y	62.180000305 17578	18	9.2.4.6.4.3		J	Zhou Lan		657	"is at the BW" doesn't make sense		Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11955	James Lepp	230	2	27.7.5	285	33	E	Y	285.32998657 22656	33	27.7.5		A			447	Change "PS" to "Power Save" in the title	Change "PS" to "Power Save" in the title	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:20:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:20:24Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 367 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11956	James Lepp	230	2	4.3.14a	37	21	T	Y	37.209999084472656	21	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	I see the term "20MHz-only non-AP STA" defined later on in the document which might help clarify this otherwise confusing list of requirements. As it	An 20MHz-only HE STA shall support operation in 20 MHz channel width. All other HE STA shall support operation in 20, 40 and 80 MHz channel widths.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:40:18Z) Revised. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:42:10Z - Keep the "shall" verb -- it's the verb we use to indicate that support is mandatory.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11957	James Lepp	230	2	4.3.14a	37	17	T	Y	37.16999816894531	17	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Change to 5 GHz and 6 GHz bands	In the 5 GHz and 6 Ghz bands, the following apply:	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:37:55Z) Revised Modified to "In the 5 to 7.125 GHz" to be consistent with PAR. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:37:51Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 368 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11958	James Lepp	230	2	4.3.14a	37	12	T	Y	37.119998931884766	12	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Raise the upper limit	The IEEE 802.11 HE STA operates in frequency bands between 1 GHz and 8 GHz.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:31:24Z) Revised. Modified 6GHz to 7.125GHz as specified in PAR. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12205	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11959	James Lepp	230	2	4	37	1	T	Y	37.0099983215332	1	4		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Instead of changing the term "5 GHz Band" throughout the document add a sentence in the beginning of section 4 (in one of the base document clauses no		REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:27:44Z) Revised. Added clarification on the supported band. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12205	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11960	James Lepp	230	2	1	4	12	T	Y	4.119999885559082	12	1		V		18/0397r2	574	Update the introduction to match the updated PAR by raising the 6 GHz top end.		agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 18/0397r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #12302	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11961	James Lepp	230	2	28.5	523	49	E	Y	523.48999023375	49	28.5		A			648	Hyphen missing in non OFDMA	non-OFDMA	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 04:04:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 04:04:31Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11962	James Lepp	230	2	28.5	452	4	E	N	452.04000854 49219	4	28.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	Why not just rename "non-OFDMA" to "OFDM" or "regular"? OFDMA is the strange new option.		REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:52:50Z) Non-OFDMA doesn't have ambiguity. Why OFDMA is strange and new?	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	The editor agrees. Non-OFDMA is weird. Passing to PHY ad-hoc to discuss.	N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 23:31:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11963	James Lepp	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	10	E	Y	85.099998474 1211	10	9.3.1.23		J			447	Need to better indicate that subclause 9.3.1.23 is only applicable to the HE PHY as there are a number of HE specific terms in this clause that don't	HE Trigger frame format	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 21:53:58Z) - Excessive use of HE in the field and frame names is not necessary.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 21:55:32Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11964	James Yee	230	2	4.3.14a	37	10	G	Y	37.099998474 121094	10	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	959r1	651	The stated scope in the axPAR of "at least one mode of operation capable of supporting at least four times improvement in the average throughput per	As suggested.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:24:23Z) Revised. TGax editor to adopt the proposed text changes in 18/959r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 370 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11965	James Yee	230	2	3.2	33	6	E	Y	33.060001373291016	6	3.2		A			447	"value 0" should be changed to "values 0"; "STAID" should be changed to "STA-ID"	As suggested.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11966	James Yee	230	2	3.4	35	35	E	Y	35.349998474121094	35	3.4		J			648	"MUEDCATimer" should be changed to "MU-EDCATimer"	As suggested.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:23:04Z) - Consistently use MUEDCATimer	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:23:32Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11967	James Yee	230	2	8.3.4.4	45	29	E	Y	45.290000915527344	29	8.3.4.4		V			447	"the coming HE TB PPDU" here and elsewhere should be consistently replaced with " the solicited HE TB PPDU"	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:47:20Z) - For the scalar parameters refer to " the expected HE TB PPDUs" (there can be more than one). And for the array	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:59:28Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11968	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	31	E	Y	56.310001373291016	31	9.2.4.5.6		J			447	Equation (9-ax1) seems to have been deleted. The reference to Equation (9-ax1) should be deleted.	As suggested.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:27:19Z) - Unline markup not strikethrough markup	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:27:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 371 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11969	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	59	25	T	Y	59.25	25	9.2.4.6.4.1		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	In the "Meaning" column of Table 9-18a, "Command Control Indication" should be replaced with "Command and Status (CAS)".	As suggested.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:13:13Z) Revised- Agree in principle. This is an editorial comment and was already fixed by CID12805. TGax editor does	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
11970	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	39	T	Y	59.389999389 64844	39	9.2.4.6.4.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	"HE TB PPDU that follows" is ambiguous and should be replaced with "HE TB PPDU solicited by"	As suggested.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:52:18Z) Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0369r1 for CID 11970	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:36:24Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11971	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	53	E	Y	59.529998779 296875	53	9.2.4.6.4.2		V			447	The title of Figure 9-15c and other Figures in 9.2.4.6.4 "Control Information subfield format when Control ID subfield is n" should be updated to be m	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:37:16Z) - Agree in principle. Change figure titles to "Control Information subfield for <name>"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:38:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 372 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11972	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	67	14	E	Y	67.139999938964844	14	9.2.4.6.4.5		V			447	rephrase the initial description using 9.2.4.6.4.1 thru 4 as a template for clarity and consistency.	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:20:28Z) - Move to a separate subclause and reword as defined in #12027.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:20:59Z - see #12027	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11973	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	67	14	T	Y	67.139999938964844	14	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	the sub field does not contain "buffer status information used for UL MU operations", that is what is contained in the BSRs. The subfield contains "inf	As suggested.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11974	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	67	45	T	Y	67.449996948242219	45	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	Delete this last sentence which begins with " When the ACI". There is no need to highlight this case when all cases are described in Table 9-18e.	As suggested.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 373 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11975	James Yee	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	68	45	E	Y	68.449996948 24219	45	9.2.4.6.4.5		J			447	In Table 9-18f, "2 048" and "3 2 768" should be "2048" and "32768".	As suggested.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:28:33Z) - 802.11 style requires a space as a thousands separator	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:29:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11976	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	13	E	Y	85.129997253 41797	13	9.3.1.23		V			447	"The Trigger frame" should be "A Trigger frame"; "The HE TB PPDU" should be "The solicited HE TB PPDU"	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:00:12Z) - There is no precedent, so an indefinite article is appropriate with the first use of "Trigger frame". Also, "	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:02:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11977	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	38	E	Y	85.379997253 41797	38	9.3.1.23		V			447	For brevity, "containing the 12 LSBs of the AID of the STA in the AID12 field" should be just "containing the AID12 subfield of the User Info field" i	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:11:43Z) - Correct the issue identified, but also break the sentence up to clarify the conditions for each of the RA fie	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:14:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 374 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11978	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	30	T	Y	89.300003051 75781	30	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Reference to Table 28-19 should be to Table 28-20 instead.	As suggested.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:23:25Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 11978	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	See #14222	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11979	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	50	E	Y	89.5	50	9.3.1.23		V			447	For brevity and clarity, change "correspond" to "correspondsequentially" and delete the text "with B54 ... and so on".	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:00:35Z) Agree in principle. Change to read: "Bits B54 to B62 of the Common Info field are set to 1 and correspond to th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:01:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11980	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	29	E	Y	91.290000915 52734	29	9.3.1.23		A			447	missing comma after "Further". "all the sub fields" should be "all the remaining subfields"	As suggested.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:12:36Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:12:39Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 375 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11981	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	33	T	Y	91.33000183105469	33	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	For clarity, change "code type" to "FEC encoding code type"	As suggested.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:20:06Z) Agree with the comment. TGax editor please update the sub field names as indicated doc 11-18/0366r2 for Figure 9-5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3				I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:14:29Z - see #11372	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11982	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	10	T	Y	92.09999847411211	10	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	Reference to "Figure 9-52h" should be to "Figure 9-52i"	As suggested.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:21:52Z) Agree with the comment. The incorrect reference was fixed in D2.2. TGax editor: No further changes are needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change				N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:14:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
11983	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	32	E	Y	92.31999969482422	32	9.3.1.23		V			648	"No Further RARU" is an ugly name. Consider "Fixed RA Allocation" instead.	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:25:34Z) - Change name to "No More RA-RU". See #12875	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3				I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:25:58Z - see #12875	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 376 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11984	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.23.2	94	55	E	Y	94.550003051 75781	55	9.3.1.23.2		J			657	add reference to (9.4.1.62 HE MIMO Control field) after "HE MIMO Control field".	As suggested.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11985	James Yee	230	2	9.3.3.3	98	42	E	Y	98.419998168 94531	42	9.3.3.3		A			447	Here and elsewhere in the draft, dot11OFDMARandomAccessOptionImlemented should be dot11OFDMARandomAccessOptionImplemented.	As suggested.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:04:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:04:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11986	James Yee	230	2	9.4.2.37	121	1	T	Y	121.01000213 623047	1	9.4.2.37		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1850R1	471	The ERBSS subfield is identically set as the High Efficiency subfield. There should be additional conditions associated to justify its presence.	Please clarify.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:07:57Z) Revised The description of ERBSS subfield is updated to clarify that the bit represents an HEAP operating as a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 377 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11987	James Yee	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	56	T	Y	128.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.200		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The referenced clause 10.43 does not describe Trigger field related behavior. Should refer to 27.7 instead.	As suggested.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:03:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
11988	James Yee	230	2	10.43.1	209	22	T	Y	209.22000122070312	22	10.43.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0337r1	546	The Dictate TWT description of "but one is likely to be created. .. with those parameters" should be "and it will not accept any other TWT agreement ot	As suggested.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:00:50Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution specifies that the set up is likely to be acce	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11989	James Yee	230	2	27.2.6	228	46	E	Y	228.46000671338672	46	27.2.6		V			447	"HEMUEDCATimer" should be "HEMUEDCATimer"	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:51:36Z) - MUEDCATimer is defined term and used in one other place. HEMUEDCATimer is used in this subclause. The HE pref	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:54:53Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 378 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11990	James Yee	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	15	E	Y	249.14999389648438	15	27.5.3.3		V			447	Delete paragraph starting with "If the either condition is not met". Change earlier " shall commence" to " shall only commence".	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:16:03Z) - The commenter has not identified a problem with the draft. However, the sentence could be improved to maketh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:16:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11991	James Yee	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	22	E	Y	257.22000122 07031	22	27.5.5.1		A			447	delete " soliciting" since it is not used elsewhere to describe Trigger frames.	As suggested.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:38:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:38:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11992	James Yee	230	2	27.5.5.1	258	6	T	Y	258.05999755859375	6	27.5.5.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	"the intended HE AP" is ambiguous and should be changed to " an HE AP it wishes to communicate with".	As suggested.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:08:21Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 11992	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 379 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11993	James Yee	230	2	27.7.1	270	36	E	Y	270.35998535 15625	36	27.7.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	typo in " does not need to be", but since it is already stated in10.43 that " STAs need not be made aware of the TWT values of other STAs", these first	As suggested.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:53:28Z) Rejected – Agree that this is already stated in 10.43. However, since in the past rounds of resolutions certain	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11994	James Yee	230	2	27.7.2	271	40	T	Y	271.39999389 64844	40	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	6111	The TWT operation description here is quite confusing and potentially conflict with existing TWT operation, exemplified by the statement here: "all th	Please further consolidate and simplify the rules related to TWT operations.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:07:49Z) Rejected – These statements are added to be consistent with the editorial style guide wherein the editor instru	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 23:03:41Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 380 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11995	James Yee	230	2	27.7.2	272	62	T	Y	272.61999511 71875	62	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	611r2	611	The TWT mechanism schedules tx opportunities for a STA for more efficient operation. Specifying that "A TWT requesting STA should not transmit frames	Please more clearly describe the TWT operation.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:08:30Z) Rejected – The intent is to specify that the STA is recommended to not transmit outside of the service periods	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11996	James Yee	230	2	27.7.3.2	275	54	E	Y	275.54000854 49219	54	27.7.3.2		A			447	Replace "transmit a broadcast TWT advertisement by including" with "include" since it is undefined what a TWT advertisement is.	As suggested.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:00:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:00:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
11997	James Yee	230	2	27.8.1	286	22	T	Y	286.22000122 07031	22	27.8.1		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	It is unnecessary to include this last sentence starting with "When a first STA transmit" since the latter received field will take precedence any way	As suggested.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:37:53Z) Revised. The sentence is deleted. The resolution is shown in submission 11-18-0035r5.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:49:21Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 381 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
11998	James Yee	230	2	27.8.1	287	1	E	Y	287.01000976 5625	1	27.8.1		J	Jarkko Kneckt		657	Change "a STA" to "an associated STA" and delete ", after association,"	As suggested.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Points to a technical problem. Which STA (subject or object) does the " after association" apply?	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
11999	James Yee	230	2	27.8.1	287	12	T	Y	287.11999511 71875	12	27.8.1		J	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	OM Control is optional. but this says it is mandatory for AP. Change the sentence to "An HE AP with dot11.... set to true shall implement"	As suggested.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:39:01Z) Rejected. The suggested text would allow the AP to set the dot11OMIOptionImplemented to other value than true. T	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12000	James Yee	230	2	27.14.2	313	38	T	Y	313.38000488 28125	38	27.14.2		V	Jeongki Kim	11-18/0063r1	490	Not clear what "remain awake for random access in the cascaded Trigger frame" means. IS it supposed to be "remain awake for the subsequent Trigger fra	Please clarify.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:46:04Z) Makes the changes as show in the 18/0063r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:04:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 382 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12001	James Yee	230	2	27.16.1	320	64	E	Y	320.64001464 84375	64	27.16.1		J			657	"Partial Band Extended Range" should be "Partial Bandwidth Extended Range"	As suggested.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	Has to do with ER BSS. Neither capability bit exists. The way the field is referenced is not correct (should refer to a field setting). Passing to MAC		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12002	James Yee	230	2	27.16.5	324	55	T	Y	324.54998779 296875	55	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	More details are needed to describe ER Beacon generation and ER BSS operation. What does "operate independent of the non-HT BSS" mean and why would o	As suggested.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 383 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12003	James Yee	230	2	27.15.2	314	60	T	Y	314.60000061035156	60	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	The "DCM Rx field" is undefined. Probably should replace with the "DCM Max Constellation Rx" subfield in the HE PHY Capabilities Information field.	As suggested.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:46:18Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution fixes the issue. TGax editor to make the cha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12004	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	Y	81.45999908447266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	The paragraph is not clear if the associated AID11 is 2045 or not.	Please clarity.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:08:23Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that Table 9-24b is for the case wh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 384 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12005	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	38	T	Y	80.379997253 41797	38	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	It is not clear or not described in text what the Ack Type in the AID TID Info subfield means. Is it just randomly selected in Table 9-24b to fit spec	As in the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:58:51Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Please see the description after Table 9	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12006	James Yee	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	34	T	Y	80.339996337 89062	34	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	This paragraph is supposed to describe the subfield meanings when the AID11 subfield is 2045, but there is no text which specifies that.	Add some text or relocate the paragraph	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:49:00Z) Revised. The part pointed out is resolved by CID 12595.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:17:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
12007	James Yee	230	2	27.3.1	229	47	T	Y	229.47000122 070312	47	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	In 27.3.2.2 and 27.3.2.3, level 1 and level 2 dynamic fragmentation also allow to operate without BA agreement. This general discription does not stat	Either delete the general description here or make it complete.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:16:56Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. This paragraph is harmonize	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:08:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 385 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12008	James Yee	230	2	27.3.1	229	58	E	Y	229.58000018310547	58	27.3.1		V			447	"generate" should be "generates"	Please fix it.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:10:47Z) - See #11801	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:11:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12009	James Yee	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	25	T	Y	231.25	25	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	It is not clear here what are the prerequisites for "Using the level 2 dynamic fragmentation". It is supposed to operate under a BA agreement.	Change the text to "Using level 2 dynamic fragmentation under a block ack agreement, "	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 16:56:35Z) Revised- Agree that level 2 dynamic fragmentation is used with BA agreement, however, the first bullet is using	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12010	James Yee	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	45	T	Y	231.44999694 82422	45	27.3.2.4		J	Ming Gan	811r2	657	Limit the fragmentation support to either level 1/2 or level 1/3 does not fully utilize the potential efficiency improvement of dynamic fragmentation.	Please provide a mechanism enabling coexistence of level 2/3 dynamic fragmentation.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-24 16:03:46Z) - Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 16:04:16Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 386 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12011	James Yee	230	2	27.3.2.4	232	1	T	Y	232.00999450683594	1	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	5544	It is not clear here what are the prerequisites of the following operations.	Change the text to "Using level 3 dynamic fragmenation under a block ack agreement, an originator STA may..."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:05:50Z) Revised- Agree that level 3 dynamic fragmentation is used with BA agreement, however, the first bullet is using	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12012	James Yee	230	2	27.3	229	28	T	Y	229.27999877929688	28	27.3		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	There are no rules defined for dynamic fragmentation level change or for not allowing the level change after the association in the spec.	Please add rules for chaning dynamic fragmenation level change.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:14:18Z) Rejected- Dynamic fragmentation level change can be done through Block ack agreement negotiation, but shall mai	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:54:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 387 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12013	James Yee	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	36	T	Y	230.36000061035156	36	27.3.2.1		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	Procedures to be followed if a fragment is not explicitly failed are not clear. For example, the originator STA does not receive ack for the fragment.	Please add rules to follow if a fragment is not explicited failed.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:30:13Z) Rejected- There is rule for the case where a fragment is not explicitly failed, it is that ". The frame body le	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:01:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12014	James Yee	230	2	28.3.19.6.2	500	13	T	Y	500.13000048828125	13	28.3.19.6.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0819r1	588	"non-primary 20MHz channel" here is not clear. Does it mean each non-primary 20MHz channel as the counterpart in the HE TB PPDU transmission?	Please clarify.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:04:27Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 12014 in doc 11-18/0819r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:26:21Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 388 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12015	James Yee	230	2	27.4.1	236	18	T	Y	236.17999267578125	18	27.4.1		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This paragraph contains similar and somehow duplicated information as the previous paragraph.	Revise the paragraph and the previous one. Make the procedures more compact.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:17:38Z) 12015 James Yee 236.18 This paragraph contains similar and somehow duplicated information as the previous parag r	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12016	James Yee	230	2	9.4.2	118	1	T	Y	118.01000213623047	1	9.4.2		V			626	With the introduction of new features such as OFDMA and UL MU MIMO, the existing BSS load elements (9.4.2.160 & 9.4.2.28), which address STA numbe	Add a new information element or element extension to define 11ax BSS Load. The new IE shall address utilization status of OFDMA as well as UL/DL MU M	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 15:03:24Z) - Agree in principal. The proposed resolution is to provide a spatial/frequency underutilization to solve load	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 15:03:36Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 389 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12017	James Yee	230	2	27.9.1	290	3	E	Y	290.02999877 92969	3	27.9.1		V		17/1852r8	474	In the sentence "An HE AP shall not set a measurement mode in a Beacon request to an associated STA to a mode that the STA has not explicitly indicate	As provided in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:21:50Z) - Agree with the comment. Apply the changes as in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12018	James Yee	230	2	27.9.2.l	290	38	T	Y	290.38000488 28125	38	27.9.2.l		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In the bullet " The received PPDU is an inter-BSS PPDU (see 27.2.2 (Intra-BSS and inter-BSS frame determination)) and the received PPDU is not a non-HT	Please clarify.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:01:18Z) Disagree in principle with the comment. This defines that if you receive both the RTS and the CTS, you can still do	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 390 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12019	James Yee	230	2	27.9.2.l	291	30	T	Y	291.29998779296875	30	27.9.2.l		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	P. 290 line 30-61 are defining NON_SRG_OBSS_PD-based spatial reuses, here the spec should also require the PPDU received is not from a SRG STA.	As provided in comment.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:32:06Z) even if the PPDU is an SRG PPDU, the STA can decide to apply NON-SRG OBSS_PD spatial reuse. Therefore, the conditi	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12020	James Yee	230	2	27.9.3	295	60	E	Y	295.60000061035156	60	27.9.3		A			648	Change "When the conditions specified in 27.9.3 (SRP-based spatial reuse operation) are met that allow the transmission of an SR PPDU" to "When the co	As provided in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:39:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:39:35Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 391 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12021	James Yee	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	46	E	Y	291.45999914550781	46	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	In Equation (27-3), replace "OBSSPDmin" with "OBSS_PDmin" and "OBSSPDmax" with "OBSS_PDmax" since these are the right terms used in other parts of the	As provided in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:27:06Z) - agree with the comment. Make the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12022	James Yee	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	57	T	Y	292.57000732421875	57	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Throughout the spec, it is never explained how the SRG indicated by a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set elementan is formed by an HE AP STA. The spec should	Please clarify.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:44:59Z) the requested change is to insert text that is outside of the scope of the standard.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12023	James Yee	230	2	3.2	33	11	E	Y	33.11000061035156	11	3.2		A			447	"(Delayed SRPPPDU)." at the end of the sentence is redundant and should be removed.	As provided in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:22:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:22:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 392 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12024	James Yee	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	Y	34.569999969482422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	It is counter intuitive to say SRP PPDU and Delayed SRP PPDU are the same. If this is the case why we need both terms?	Please clarify.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:56:35Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12024. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12025	James Yee	230	2	3.2	34	57	E	Y	34.569999969482422	57	3.2		J			657	It should be "SRP_PPDU" not "SRP PPDU"	Please clarify.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12026	James Yee	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	40	E	Y	297.39999938964844	40	27.9.3.2		A			648	In "After a STA has identified the start of an SRP Opportunity, and until the SRP Opportunity Endpoint is reached", change "Opportunity" to "opportun	As provided in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:57:55Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:57:58Z - see #14296	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 393 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12027	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	58	6	E	N	58.060001373291016	6	9.2.4.6.4.1		V			447	The header levels of the A-Control subfield clauses exceed the maximum.	Change the rule for the maximum header levels to allow six levels of headers, or reduce the header level to five.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:18:10Z) - Aggree in principle. Move the control variants to a new subclause 9.2.4.6a (Control subfield variants of an A	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:19:54	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12028	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	60	63	T	N	60.630001068115234	63	9.2.4.6.4.3		J	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	Currently, the maximum number of spatial streams a STA is configured to receive depends on the BW of the PPDU. In DL MU PPDU the STA receives only the	In DL MU PPDU, please allow a receiver to use RX NSS based on the BW of the RU the STA is receiving.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:39:55Z) Rejected. The current rules for RX NSS settings allows STAs to configure the number of NSS it is capable to use	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 394 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12029	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.7.2	273	13	T	Y	273.13000048828125	13	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	The Cascade Indication is used in UORA and in TWT power save. This makes the Cascade Indication difficult to use. The Cascade Indication should not b	Please, simplify the Cascade Indication use and use it only to control whether the AP transmits triggers allocating RUs for the UL OFDMA random access	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:09:18Z) Rejected – The comment fails to identify a technical issue. If an AP does not want STAs that are not the intend	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12030	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.7.2	273	13	T	Y	273.13000048828125	13	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	The Cascade Indication set to 0 can terminate many unannounced TWT SPs. The Cascade Indication requires good understanding the state of the all ongoin	The Cascade Indication should control only will AP allocates more UL random access opportunities. This ensures simple and timely power save for UORA.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:10:14Z) Rejected – The comment fails to identify a technical issue. If an AP does not want STAs that are not the intend	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 395 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12031	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.7.3.2	314	37	T	Y	314.36999511 71875	37	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	The Announced TWT should be the mechanism how TWT SPs are initiated in ID 0 TWT Flows. When TWT ID 0 is used, the AP should receive a UL data / null	Reduce the TWT types that can be used after TWT ID 0 to announced or OPS TWT. Require that in these cases the TWT SP shall be initiated as in announce	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:05:06Z) Revised – Agree in principle that the rules between the broadcast ID of 0 and the rules for non zero should be cl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:52:26Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12032	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.6	119	44	T	N	119.44000244 140625	44	9.4.2.6		V	Guoqing Li	768r5	650	Please ensure that TIM element used in TIM frame or FILS Discovery frame also describes "traditional TIM bit setting rule" that is used for non-OPS ST	Add the folllowing bulleted text to line 44:" Bit Number N that corresponds to non-OPS STA with AID N is 1 to indicate that AP has buffered frames for	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:18:19Z) Revised – agree with the commenter. Apply the changes in doc 768r5.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12033	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	125	6	E	N	125.05999755 859375	6	9.4.2.200		J			447	The Control field format should start from B0, not from B1. The following bit numbers should be adjusted accordingly.	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:36:44Z) - This is a change to a baseline figure. Renumbering the bits may have technical implication.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:37:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 396 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12034	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.14.3.2	314	8	T	Y	314.07998657 22656	8	27.14.3.2		V	Guoqing Li	90r0	489	The power saving STAs should not be required to wakeup only to receive the OPS TWT, unless they desire to use the TWT SP to transmit data. The OPS is	Allow the STA to skip waking up for the OPS TWT SP, if it desires not to receive DL data or trigger frame during the OPS TWT SP.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:23:02Z) Revised – agree with the commenter. This is the intention, but is not clear enough. Make the change as proposed i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:11:48Z - Reword sentence to read " An OPS STA with AID N that is in the awake state and that receives from the OPS AP with which	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12035	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	130	43	T	Y	130.42999267 578125	43	9.4.2.200		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The TWT interval should be the time between successive TWT SP start times. The time between successive TWT SPs may variate.	Change to:" ... STA expects to elapse between successive TWT SP start times."	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:04:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 19:58:27Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12036	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	131	17	T	N	131.16999816 89453	17	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The interval between broadcast TWT SPs may be longer than a beacon interval. When a TWT SP interval is longer than a beacon interval, no broadcast TWT	Please clarify how Broadcast TWT Persistent field is set, if no TWT SP will be present in the coming/current beacon intervals. Please add text to expl	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:05:31Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12036, which generally ind	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 397 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12037	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	44	T	N	128.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.200		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The Table 9-262k shows that Reject TWT is N/A. However, this value is present in other tables and the value is needed to signal the termination of the	Please add description of Reject TWT to Table 9-262k.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:06:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 20:00:01Z - Should be revised -- followed instructions in 17/1893r6	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12038	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	38	T	N	129.38000048828125	38	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Please clarify whether AP allocates RUs for OFDMA random access if an AP has a TWT SP with TWT Flow Identifier value 1 tthat overlaps with TWT SP wit	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:08:00Z) Reject – even though two SPs might overlap, the scheduling STA can meet both conditions, as each trigger transmi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 398 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12039	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	127	14	T	N	127.13999938964844	14	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The "Request TWT" TWT Setup Command Value says that requesting STA does not specify target wake time. To which value the Target Wake Time value is set	Please clarify to which value the STA sets the Target Wake Time value when Request TWT TWT Command value is used. One possibility would be to set the	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:08:51Z) Reject – the setting of Target Wake Time is already specified as 0 when the command is Request within the baseli	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12040	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.200	124	29	T	Y	124.29000091552734	29	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Currently, the AP does not get information of the times that are not suitable for the TWT requesting STA to have a TWT SP. The AP needs the informatio	Allow the non-AP STA to signal by using TWT Setup signaling the times that are not suitable for it to have TWT SPs. This information is only available	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:09:43Z) Reject – a proposal for such functionality was presented and a straw poll showed insufficient support to add the	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 399 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12041	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.240	152	11	T	N	152.11000061035156	11	9.4.2.240		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	The MU QoS Info field contains EDCA Parameter Update Count field that is also present in the QoS Info field of the EDCA parameter set element. The QoS	Please clarify whether EDCA Parameter set update count keeps a record for both the EDCA and MU EDCA, or are EDCA and MU EDCA having separate update co	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:32:00Z) Make the changes as proposed in doc 1828r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:20:34Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12042	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.16.4.2	323	65	T	N	323.64999389 64844	65	27.16.4.2		J	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	Is a quiet period established when the status code of the Quiet Time Period Response element indicates value COUNTER? Please clarify what operations a	Please clarify the use of the status code value COUNTER.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 00:02:57Z) Rejected: The operation of counter is stated as following in the specification, ".. AP counters the request wit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 19:42:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 400 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12043	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	11.2.3.6	212	46	T	N	212.46000671 38672	46	11.2.3.6		J	Guoqing Li		657	An HE AP may also set the More Data field in block ack to 1 to be able to continue Trigger frames transmissions to the STA in TWT SP and not to termin	Please add guidance that HE AP may transmit more data field set to 1 to a STA in TWT SP to be able to send more trigger frames to the STA.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12044	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	9.4.2.243	156	56	T	Y	156.55999755 859375	56	9.4.2.243		J	Matt Fischer		657	The SRG OBSS PD Min Offset can allow associated STAs to transmit with full transmission power even when they detect WLAN signal from an SRG BSS at -62	Please delete all instances of the SRG OBSS PD Min Offset and its use in the spec. Please allow only to control the OBSS PD Max Offset.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 401 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12045	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.7.2	272	36	T	N	272.35998535 15625	36	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	The note underneath the table 27-2 and table in clause 10-43 do not define whether other response frame settings are allowed to the requests. For some	Change the note to: Request and response frame settings not listed in the table are not allowed."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:00:26Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Since there are different tables covering different combinations	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12046	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	26.8.36	161	19	T	N	161.19000244 140625	19	26.8.36		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	10r0	487	There is only TWT element, no broadcast TWT element.	Change Broadcast TWT element to TWT element, or clarify that it is a TWT elemetn with Broadcast subfield set to 1.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:10:48Z) Revised – Agree with comment. Proposed resolution clarifies the condition as suggested by the proposed change (i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-12 19:47:12Z	2.2	2018-03-04	EDITOR
12047	Jarkko Kneckt	230	2	27.4.1	235	22	E	N	235.22000122 070312	22	27.4.1		A			447	Duplicated and the articles	Please, delete the duplicates.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:58:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:58:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 402 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12048	Jeongki Kim	230	2	27.11.2	304	51	T	Y	304.51000976 5625	51	27.11.2		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0629r1	613	"A STA transmitting an HE PPDU to a DLS or TDLS peer STA, IBSS member STA, mesh STA, or another non-AP STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter UPLINK_FLA	Replace it with the following text. "A STA transmitting an HE PPDU to a DLS or TDLS peer STA, IBSS member STA, mesh STA, or another non-AP STA shall	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:37:50Z) When first non-AP STA transmits an HE MU PPDU to second non-AP STA, the STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter UPLIN	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:10:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12049	Jeongki Kim	230	2	27.14.1	311	41	T	Y	311.41000366 21094	41	27.14.1		J	Guoqing Li		657	The texts for HE MU PPDU should be updated considering peer STA operations (e.g., UPLINK_FLAG (27.11.2), PPDU format selection (27.15.4))	Please update the related texts considering texts about peer STAs operations described in 27.11.2 and 27.15.4	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 403 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12050	Jeongki Kim	230	2	27.14.2	313	28	T	Y	313.27999877 92969	28	27.14.2		A	Jeongki Kim	11-18/0063r1	490	A part of resolutions of 17/1060r6 is not implemented in D2.0 correctly.	Change from " When the No Further RA RU subfield is set to 1, an AP shall not allocate the random access RUs assigned to 2045 in the subsequent Trigger	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:46:55Z) A resolution of 17/1060r6 which motion passed at the September meeting 2017 is not implemented in 11ax D2.0. The	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:04:37Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12051	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	28.3.12	437	48	T	N	437.48001098 63281	48	28.3.12		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	In formula 28-109, the bPE-Disambiguity is excrated from Packet Extension subfield of the Common Info field of the Trigger frame. It should be availab	Add PE-Disambiguity in TXVector	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:37:12Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12051 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:27Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12052	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	28.3.10.3	400	51	E	N	400.51000976 5625	51	28.3.10.3		A			648	In definition of power scaling factor, the sub-scripts (Tonet L-XXX) of N have been permuted	"superscript ""Tone"" and subscript ""L-LTF"" should be swapped superscript ""Tone"" and subscript ""L-SIG"" should be swapped"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:00:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:00:36Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 404 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12053	Jerome Vanthourout	230	2	28.2.3	350	6	T	N	350.05999755859375	6	28.2.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	"Inconsistancy between Doppler field definition in TX Vector and TRIGVector. In TXVECTOR, Dopplebit set to 1 indicates a high Doppler mode of transmis	"Proposed to change the DOPPLER parameter of TRIGVECTOR as follow : ""Indicates a high Doppler mode of transmission. Set to 1 to indicate a high Doppl	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:46:47Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12054	Jerome Vanthourout	230	2	28.2.3	350	40	G	N	350.39999389064844	40	28.2.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	MIDAMBLE_PERIODICITY is missing in TRIGVECTOR table.	Add the MIDAMBLE_PERIODICITY in table 28.2 and use the same description than in table 28.1	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:47:33Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 405 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12055	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	21	T	N	249.21000067138672	21	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	Setting of Doppler bit in TX Vector for a non-AP HE STA transmitting an HE TB PPDU in response to a Trigger frame.	"Proposed to add : " "The DOPPLER parameter is set to the value indicated by the Doppler subfield of the User Info subfield of the Trigger frame"""	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:29:39Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:41:00Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12056	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	21	T	N	249.21000067138672	21	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	Setting of Doppler bit in TX Vector for a non-AP HE STA transmitting an HE TB PPDU in response to a Trigger frame.	"Proposed to add : " "The MIDAMBLE_PERIODICITY parameter is set to the value indicated by the Midamble Periodicity subfield of the User Info subfield o	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:30:12Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:40:55Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 406 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12057	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	27.5.3.3	250	24	T	N	250.24000549316406	24	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	How to set Doppler and Midamble bits in TX Vector for a non-AP HE STA transmitting an HE TB PPDU in response to a frame containing a UMRS Control fiel	The Doppler and Midamble periodicity of the HE TB PPDU could be the same than in the RX VECTOR of the frame containing the UMRS Control field	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:31:32Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:47:56Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12058	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	27.5.3.3	250	63	T	N	250.63000488 28125	63	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	What is the value of Num of HE-LTF in TXVector for HE TB PPDU responds to a frame contiaining a UMRS Control field?	"Proposed to add : " "The num of HE_LTF field is set to 0""""	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:33:14Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0741r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 20:48:02Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 407 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12059	Jerome Vanthournout	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	411	42	E	N	411.42001342 77344	42	28.3.10.7.2		V			648	"Typo in Table 28-19, Number of HE-LTF Symbols And Midamble Periodicity description : ""B10 is set to 0 if the TXVECTOR parameter MIDAMBLE_PERIODICITY	"Proposed to change to : ""B10 is set to 0 if the TXVECTOR parameter MIDAMBLE_PERIODICITY is 10 and set to 1 if the TXVECTOR parameter MIDAMBLE_PERIOD	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:11:06Z) - Fixed with resolution to #13771. No further change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:11:24Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12060	Jia Jia	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	410	20	T	Y	410.20001220 703125	20	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ming Gan	11-18/0162r3	528	In table 28-17, We only have 4 bits (B18-B21) in HE-SIG-A1 field to incated the total number of SIGB symbols. Howerver, the required SIG-B symbols wi	Modify HE-SIG-A to allow the number of SIG-B can be greater than 16.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:01:59Z) TGax editor please make the changes as shown in 11-18/0162 r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:56:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 408 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12061	Jian Yu	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	HE ER 242 is a mandaotry mode and shall not depend on other featrures like DCM or ER 106	Fix the bugs	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:46:57Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different prefe rences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12062	Jianhan Liu	230	2	28.3.17	485		T	N	485		28.3.17		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	Since HE TB NDP Feedback PPDU will be transmitted simultaneously from multiple-STAs (kind of UL MU), HE-ST Fshould be 8us instead of 4us.	Change the duration of HE-STF from 4us to 8us in the Figure 28-44	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:01:25Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 12062) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:03:04Z - see #11892	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 409 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12063	Jianhan Liu	230	2	27.5.6.4.1	262		T	N	262		27.5.6.4.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	What if a STA has zero buffer bytes (no data)? Does that means that the STA does not send back HE TB NDP feedback response? Please clarify this case.	Add some sences to clarify the case when a STA has no data.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-18 22:15:21Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-18 22:15:38Z-	2.3	2018-04-18	EDITOR
12064	Jianhan Liu	230	2	28.3.11.16	476		T	N	476		28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	The range (bracket) of "M_MA Data Symbols" is missing in the Figure 28-39 and 28-40	Add bracket of "M_MA Data Symbols" in the Figure 28-39 and Figure 28-40	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:30:56Z) Editor instruction: Changeas in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:28:10Z - Hmm… Bug in Viso that seems to affect the display o this type of brace. Replaced the brace. Also, change M_MA Data Symb	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 410 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12065	Jianhan Liu	230	2	28.3.6.7	385		T	N	385		28.3.6.7		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	There is no beam-change for HEMU PPDU. During the Construction of HE-SIG-B, there is no need to specify the beam-change scenarios.	Rewrite the item g) and h) to without beam-change.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:25:16Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 12065	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:40:08Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12066	Jianhan Liu	230	2	9.4.1.65	116		T	N	116		9.4.1.65		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	Note that CQI calculation is according to 26-tone RU index, but the BF feedback for 26-Tone RU has different index. For example, the index for 26-tone	Clarify the 26-tone index for CQI only report is according the tone plan shown in table 28-6, table 28-7 and table 28-8	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 04:51:04Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12066 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0725r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 411 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12067	Jianhan Liu	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97		T	N	97		9.3.1.23.8		J	Laurent Cariou		657	11ax introduced HE TB NDP PPDU and HE TB NDP feedback PPDU, but these PPDUs just for one kind of use, the resource request. More feedback types should	Add extra feedback types to NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame and HE TB NDP feedback PPDU to further exploit these modes and enhance the performa	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12068	Jianhan Liu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143		T	N	143		9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma		565	For 80+80MHz and 80x2MHz BW, sounding feedback for Ng=4 takes a lot of BW and therefore reduce the efficiency of the WLAN. Make Ng=4 grouping for 80+8	Make Ng=4 sounding feedback for 80+80 MHz and 80x2 MHz BW as optional instead of mandaotry. Add one capability in Figure 9-589cl and Table 9-262aa to in	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-18 22:09:54Z) - 11ax allows two Ng (Tone Grouping Factor) values, 4 and 16. Regardless of BW, support of Ng = 16 is optiona	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-18 22:09:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 412 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12069	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.2.4	295	57	T	N	295.57000732421875	57	27.9.2.4		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	The MAC may not be able to determine whether continue backoff countdown because the MAC may not get the clear BUSY/IDLE indication about the medium fr	Please add specification about how the MAC determines whether continue back off countdown based on the IPI values provided by the PHY after issue PHY-C	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:13:57Z) section 27.9.2.4 already clarifies this point	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12070	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.2.3	295		E	N	295		27.9.2.3		V		17/1852r8	474	It is a little confusing by "Inter-BSS S1" and "Inter-BSS D1" in the figure. Cause "Inter-BSS Intra-SRG S1" and "Inter-BSS Intra-SRG D1" are used in	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:13:34Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:36:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 413 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12071	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.3.1	296		T	N	296		27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	What does "RPL" represent? Please clarify it somewhere in the draft	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:19:58Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12071, commenter to note that RPL	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12072	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.3	296	10	E	N	296.10000061035156	10	27.9.3		A			648	Please delete the hyphen of "HE-STA" here for keep consistent	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:41:22Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:41:25Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12073	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	32	E	N	297.32000732421875	32	27.9.3.2		A			648	Please delete the hyphen of "HE-STA" here for keep consistent	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:51:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:52:28Z - see #12072	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12074	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.3.5	298	34	T	N	298.33999633978906	34	27.9.3.5		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	It is not clear about what the SR_PPDU response transmission requirements exactly are by only saying " if all outstanding SRP and OBSS_PD transmit pow	as in the comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:19:49Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12074	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 414 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12075	Jing Ma	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	21	T	N	297.20999914550781	21	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Even an HE STA identifies an SRP opportunity, SRP_PPDU-based SR transmission may not work because of the specification of the interaction between the	Add the specification that the MAC issues PHY-CCARESET.request to make the PHY recheck the status of the medium which is similar with OBSS-based SR op	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:36:32Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12075 which effectively change the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12076	Jinjing Jiang	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	E	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		V			447	The reference figure 9.38b is wrong	please update accordingly	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:02:36Z) - Figure 9-38c	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:02:50Z -see #12679	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12077	Jinjing Jiang	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	54	T	Y	80.54000091552734	54	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	If the AID 2045 is used for unassociated STA, what is the reason we need to set ACK type B11 and TID field to the fixed value? It seems redundant	Delete "The Ack Type subfield and TID subfield are set to 0 and 15, respectively"	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:00:27Z) Rejected. They are set to 0 and 15, respectively, in the course of nature. In other words, the Ack Type subfiel	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 415 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12078	Jinjing Jiang	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	31	E	Y	89.309997558 59375	31	9.3.1.23		A			447	The table cited here should be Table 28-20 (HE-SIG-A field of an HE TB PPDU)	change as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:51:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:51:49Z - see #14222	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12079	Jinjing Jiang	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	32	T	Y	227.32000732 421875	32	27.2.5.3		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	why need to set PM bit in CTS response? PM bit is useful only when it is sent from the initiator.	Delete "The Power Management subfield in a CTS frame sent in response to an MU-RTS Trigger frame shall be set to 0."	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:48:26Z) PM bit setting in the CTS frame needs to be the same to make sure that the simultaneous CTS responses can be deco	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12080	Jinjing Jiang	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	20	T	Y	291.20001220 703125	20	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Public Action frame includes the FTM frame, duplicate items in the bullets?	Remove "or an FTM frame"	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:30:57Z) Modify the typo for SRG section where we only consider group addressed public action frames, and not all public act	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 416 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12081	Jinjing Jiang	230	2	27.9.1	289	59	T	Y	289.58999633 78906	59	27.9.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Is there a mode on SRP_AND_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED?	Please clarify	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 21:41:36Z) - the commenter failed to identify an issue	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12082	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	N	81.459999084 47266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	The 'Per AID TID Info' should be changed to 'AID TID Info'	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:10:33Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that Table 9-24b is for the case wh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12083	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	N	81.459999084 47266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	It says ' If the ACK Type subfield is 0 and the TID value of the Per AID TID Info subfield is 15, then the Block Ack Starting Sequence Control, 2 octet	Move the sentence to P80L55	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:11:24Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that Table 9-24b is for the case wh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 417 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12084	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	9.4.2.200	131	33	T	Y	131.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	What is the 'special broadcast TWT'?	Define the term or change to TWT with OPS	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:10:36Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12084, which simply delete	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12085	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	9.4.2.240	152	33	T	N	152.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.240		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	AIFSN is a value of number of slots and MU EDCA Timer field is a value of number of 8TUs. "a value 0 of the AIFSN field indicates that the AIFSN is eq	In "a value 0 of the AIFSN field indicates that the AIFSN is equal to the value of the MU EDCA Timer, i.e., EDCA is disabled for the duration specifie	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:32:40Z) Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1828r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:21:02Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 418 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12086	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	10.22.2.9	200	57	T	N	200.57000732421875	57	10.22.2.9		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	40r2	504	"the most recent NAV update was due to an inter-BSS frame", Actually "regular NAV" is defined and it includes more NAVs than the NAV set by inter-BSS	If the words are used intentionally, define the case that the NAV is set by a frame that cannot be idenfied as intra-BSS or inter-BSS. If it is not int	Originally resolved with motion 504: REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:33:33Z) The HE STA only supports two NAVs, intra-BSS NAV and regular NAV (frames th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12087	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.2.1	221	42	T	Y	221.41999816 89453	42	27.2.1		J	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	Trigger Frame NAV is not truncated unless the AP transmits CF-END frame after trigger frame failure. Of course, NAV can be truncated by CF-END frame b	Add transmitting CF-END frame procedure without back-off after trigger failure. It means that PIFS recovery shall be applied to a trigger frame which	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:25:29Z) Rejected- What the comment is saying is always happened whenever a transmission of a frame initiating a TX OP is	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:21:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 419 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12088	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.2.4	223	46	T	N	223.46000671 38672	46	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	A CTS frame transmitted by AP is not considered as intra-BSS frame, so that STAs set regular NAV after receiving the CTS frame. It means the NAV set b	Use AP address as a RA value to prevent HE STAs from setting regular NAV instead of intra NAV.(Aggressive method) Or if an HE STA receave a CTS frame	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:45:33Z) Rejected – Based on the following rule in 27.2.2, STA can compare RA with the BSSID of its own BSS. As a result	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:30Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12089	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.2.6	228	58	T	Y	228.58000183 10547	58	27.2.6		J	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	For special use of 11ax(For wireless devices controlled cetrally with real time traffic), make an option for UL MU EDCA only channel access	If the value of MU EDCA timer is 255, STA shall not decrease MU EDCA timer value. If MU EDCA timer is 255 and AIFSN is set to identical value, it mean	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:33:12Z) the protocol has been defined to always provide a fallback to SU EDCA parameters. See16/998r3 and 1368r2 for bac	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 420 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12090	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.2	272	2	T	N	272.01998901 36719	2	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	The row 'Accept TWT with Broadcast subfield set to 1 and with an individual address in the RA field of the MPDU.' is for Broadcast TWT. It is duplicat	Delete the row from the Table 27-2	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:11:13Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. This sequence is already present in Table 27-6. Removed. TGax editor to make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12091	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.2	273	7	T	N	273.07000732 421875	7	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	It says ' The TWT responding STA should solicit buffer status reports from the TWT requesting STA at the start of the TWT SP following the procedure de	Make the presence check is preceded to the transmission of buffer status report	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:12:01Z) Rejected – The normative behavior for inclusion of frames in the HE TB PPDU that is sent in response to a BSRP	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 421 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12092	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	34	E	N	275.33999633 78906	34	27.7.3.1		A			447	The period should be included. 'in response to the Trigger frame STA 1 and STA 2'->'in response to the Trigger frame. STA 1 and STA 2'	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:58:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:58:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12093	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	60	E	N	279.60000610 35156	60	27.7.3.3		A			447	Accept->Accept TWT	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:08:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:09:00Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12094	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.3.3	280	55	E	N	280.54998779 296875	55	27.7.3.3		A			447	Change 'TWT scheduling STA' into ' TWT scheduling AP'	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:10:43Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:10:46Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12095	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	27	T	N	282.26998901 36719	27	27.7.3.4		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	TWT scheduling AP may respond with TWT element with Alternate TWT in the TWT Command field, as described in Table 27-5	Change 'either Accept TWT or Reject TWT' to 'Accept TWT, Alternate TWT, or Reject TWT'	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:53:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12096	Jinsoo Ahn	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	55	E	N	282.54998779 296875	55	27.7.3.4		A			447	Change "Table 27ab' to 'Table 27-5'	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:13:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:13:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 422 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12097	John Coffey	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	21	E	Y	89.20999908447266	21	9.3.1.23		A			447	Comma splice: "... is met, otherwise it is set to 0". While the meaning is clear enough and so no significant harm is done, why not do it right?	Change comma to semicolon, here and in the dozen or so other places this construction appears in the draft.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:49:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:49:30Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12098	John Coffey	230	2	10.9	191	19	E	Y	191.19000244140625	19	10.9		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	432r1	546	Anthropomorphism: "the TWT requesting STA expects". The STA is an object and does not "expect" anything.	Reword to remove the anthoropomorphism, here and in the half a dozen or so other places that this appears in the draft. In some places the "expect" is	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:03:48Z) Rejected – The comment fails to identify a technical issue. The term “expects” is consistently used in the base	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 21:56:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions. There is a technical issue here. Expectation is not clearly defined. Wh		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 423 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12099	John Coffey	230	2	28.1.4	331	55	T	Y	331.54998779296875	55	28.1.4		J	Tianyu Wu	18/0012r3	569	"HE ER SU PPDU format (HE_EXT_SU) ... is similar to the HE SU PPDU format". Yes, that's a fair summary: it's very similar indeed; in fact so similar t	Remove the HE ER SU PPDU format and all references to it in the draft.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:46:42Z) - There are some differences between HE ER SU PPDU and HE SU PPDU as listed below: (i) HE-SIG-A is 16 us in H	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12100	John Coffey	230	2	28.1.4	331	57	T	Y	331.57000732421875	57	28.1.4		J	Tianyu Wu	18/0012r3	569	"Support for the HE ER SU PPDU format is mandatory." No persuasive justification for this requirement has ever been provided. The benefits provided by	Change "mandatory" to "optional" in this sentence.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:46:23Z) - Keep HE ER SU PPDU mandatory but allow STA to disable it using OM control field.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 424 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12101	John Coffey	230	2	27.16.4	323	7	T	Y	323.07000732421875	7	27.16.4		J	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	The entire quiet time period mechanism is odd and unconvincing. Legacy devices will not understand, and will not remain quiet. Even for HE STAs, it is	Delete the "quiet time period" and all references to it in the draft.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 23:56:56Z) Rejected: This is the same comment submitted in D 1.0 and was rejected for the following reason, “Rejected: Th	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:06:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12102	John Coffey	230	2	28.3.11.15	474	23	T	Y	474.23001098281	23	28.3.11.15		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0799r0	584	In a severely bloated amendment, we should look for ways to simplify the text and to focus on the central goals of the project. One way is to remove m	Delete DCM and all references to it in the draft.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:26:49Z) DCM mode is introduced also for enhancing reliability of transmissions with narrow band interferences that are c	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 425 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12103	John Coffey	230	2	27.5.3	244	1	T	Y	244.00999450683594	1	27.5.3		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	How does coexistence with deployed legacy devices, especially those in OBSSs, work? Here it seems that the HE AP transmits an initial trigger frame, w	Provide specifications for recommended behavior for APs that use this mode, that will have the effect of allowing fair access to the medium by legacy	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:24:19Z) The proposed resolution lacks details. In general, trigger-based access will facilitate managed access for multip	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12104	John Coffey	230	2	28.3.19	496	31	T	Y	496.30999755859375	31	28.3.19		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0819r1	588	"For tests in this subclause ...". This is mysterious. There are many *normative statements* in this subclause; are we supposed to understand that eac	Clarify. At minimum, add at the beginning of the clause " Except for the CCA sensitivity subclause (28.3.19.6) ...".	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:03:50Z) There is no need to clarify. The description of the subclasue is similar to 11ac and the description does not ca	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:20:30Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 426 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12105	John Coffey	230	2	28.3.19.1	496	34	T	Y	496.33999633 78906	34	28.3.19.1		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0819r1	588	"Each output port of the transmitting STA shall be connected through a cable to the Device Under Test". If this means that the CCA sensitivity require	Clarify. At minimum, add at the beginning of the clause or of the sentence " Except for the CCA sensitivity subclause (28.3.19.6) ...".	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:04:11Z) There is no need to clarify. The exact description is in 11md for previous version 802.11 standards. Change caus	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:20:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12106	John Coffey	230	2	28.3.19.6.3	500	26	T	Y	500.26000976 5625	26	28.3.19.6.3		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0819r1	588	"in an otherise idle": what does this mean? Does it mean that CCA has not already been declared? Or does it mean that there are no other transmissions	Clarify.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:05:00Z) The condition specified for setting behavior requirements is one condition of many that are possible. Clearly, t	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:26:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 427 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12107	John Coffey	230	2	C.3	580	19	T	Y	580.19000024414062	19	C.3		V	Edward Au	17/1774r1	444	Unresolved "TBD".	Resolve it.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:02:43Z) - Agree that the TBD needs to be resolved. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 22:58:49Z	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12108	Joseph Levy	230	2		12	35	E	N	12.350000381469727	35			V			447	ToC has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:29:54Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow. Align tabbing with REVmd	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:30:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12109	Joseph Levy	230	2		17	9	E	N	17.090000015258789	9			V			447	ToC has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:30:38Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow. Align tabbing with REVmd	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:30:43Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 428 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12110	Joseph Levy	230	2		19	37	E	N	19.370000839 2334	37			J			447	Table of figures has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:31:50Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:32:31Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12111	Joseph Levy	230	2		19	62	E	N	19.620000839 2334	62			J			447	Table of figures has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:32:41Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:32:54Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12112	Joseph Levy	230	2		20	36	E	N	20.360000610 351562	36			J			447	Table of figures has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:33:03Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:33:16Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12113	Joseph Levy	230	2		21	7	E	N	21.069999694 82422	7			J			447	Table of figures has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:33:38Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:33:42Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 429 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12114	Joseph Levy	230	2		25	27	E	N	25.270000457763672	27			J			447	Table of tables has formatting error	Clean up the formatting, line overflow, location of Page number	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:34:08Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:47:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12115	Joseph Levy	230	2	3.2			T	Y			3.2		J			657	Define what a High Efficacy (HE) non-AP STA is, as this term is used throughout the amendment. This is a key term for the amendment and defining it i	Provide a definition	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12116	Joseph Levy	230	2	3.2			T	Y			3.2		J			657	Define what a High Efficacy (HE) AP is, as this term is used throughout the amendment	Provide a definition	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 430 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12117	Joseph Levy	230	2	3.4			T	Y			3.4		J			648	The base line specification uses HE to mean: Homogenous extended in HESSID. This is confusing, given the introduction of HE as High Efficacy.	Change the Abbreviation of HESSID to be H-ESSID Note this change also be made in all places HESSID is currently used in the base line specifications.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:28:51Z) - It is "high efficiency" and not easily confused with HESSID	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:30:10Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12118	Joseph Levy	230	2	C.3	580	19	T	Y	580.19000244 14062	19	C.3		V	Edward Au	17/1774r1	444	There should be no "TBD"s in the draft - remove the "TBD" from the description of "dot11HEPunctuedPreambleRXActivated" and replace it with a meaningfu	Proved a meaningful description of "dot11HEPunctuedPreambleRXActivated" MIB variable	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:03:07Z) - Agree that the TBD needs to be resolved. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	Tagged as #12107	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 431 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12119	Joseph Levy	230	2	4.3.14a	37		T	Y	37		4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	959r1	651	The 802.11ax amendment provides new capabilities/features that warrant a more explanative introduction then simply stating a list of the "new" phy/mac	Provide a useful and clear introduction to the new capabilities provided by 802.11ax features, including: 1) the benefits of the of capability (e.g. p	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:23:42Z) Revised. TGax editor to adopt the proposed text changes in 18/959r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12120	Joseph Levy	230	2	4.3.14a	37		T	Y	37		4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	The 802.11ax amendment provides new capabilities/features that warrant a more explanative introduction then simply stating a list of the "new" phy/mac	Provide a introduction to the new PHY and MAC features without stating if they are Mandatory or Optional.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:11:57Z) Reject. The description of feature benefits is beyond the scope of IEEE specification. The specific feature is d	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12121	Joseph Levy	230	2	4.3.14a	37		T	Y	37		4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	the description of the new MAC features do not clearly state why these features were introduce, the text simply implies it. It would be clearer to st	Insert a paragraph introducing the need/purpose of the new MAC features.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:26:51Z) Reject. The description of feature benefits is beyond the scope of IEEE specification.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 432 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12122	Joseph Levy	230	2		49	60	T	Y	49.599998474121094	60			V			648	The use of the work "overloaded" does not make sense in this note and does not seem to be necessary. Simply stating that in this table the term HT ST	Remove the word "overloaded" also correct the note to read: "In this table the Term HT STA refers to an HT STA that is ...", also do the same for the	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:35:46Z)- It is a really bad idea to have a term mean something in one context and something else elsewhere. Remove the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:38:02Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12123	Joseph Levy	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	53	35	E	N	53.349998474121094	35	9.2.4.1.8		J			447	Remove the word "sent", the style of surrounding paragraphs do not use the word sent to indicate a sent frame, it simply "frames to a xxx" consistentl	Remove the word "sent"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:17:54Z)- There are only two uses of "frames to a STA" in this subclause and both are modified to "frames sent to a ST	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:18:35Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 433 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12124	Joseph Levy	230	2	5			T	Y			5		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	I find it hard to believe that given the significant MAC features added in this amendment that there are no changes to clause 5. Are there additions	Insert required changes to clause 5	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:47:44Z) Reject. No specific suggestions provided in the comment.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12125	Joseph Levy	230	2	6			T	Y			6		J	George Cherian		648	A BlockAck Frame by definition is not a Multi-STA BlockAck frame. Hence the behavior related to a Multi-STA BlockAck frame should not complicate the		REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:40:16Z) - The comment does not identify a problem with the draft. The statement is incorrect; a Multi-STA BlockAck fra	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:41:23Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 434 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12126	Joseph Levy	230	2	9.2.1.4.18	53	35	T	Y	53.349998474121094	35	9.2.1.4.18		J	Guoqing Li		657	Why is it necessary to restrict the optional AP behavior of setting the More Data subfield to 1 in Ack frames to a non-HE STA. If an HE STA receives	Remove the following text: "non-HE" and "and in Ack, BlockAck and Multi-STA BlockAck frames sent to an HE STA."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12127	Joseph Levy	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	53	37	T	Y	53.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.1.8		J	Guoqing Li		657	There is no need to specify the behavior of an HE AP regarding the use of the more data subfield in the frame format section on the More Data subfiel	Remove/relocate the text: "An HE AP indicates that it supports setting the More Data subfield to 1 in these control response frames by setting he More	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 435 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12128	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	39	T	Y	196.38999938964844	39	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:59:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12129	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	45	T	Y	196.44999694 82422	45	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:59:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 436 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12130	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.8	199	53	T	Y	199.52999877929688	53	10.22.2.8		J	Ming Gan	432r1	545	In dynamic fragment, why is the Upper limit 16? If the dynamic fragment can be up to 16, it will be too complicated to respond the BlockAck. In BlockAc	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:48:20Z) Rejected- If the MSDU is only fragmented into 4 parts, the last one is not allowed to be as exception to exceed	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12131	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.8	200	30	T	Y	200.30000030517578	30	10.22.2.8		J	Ming Gan	432r1	545	In dynamic fragment, why is the Upper limit 16? If the dynamic fragment can be up to 16, it will be too complicated to respond the BlockAck. In BlockAc	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:49:59Z) Rejected- If the MSDU is only fragmented into 4 parts, the last one is not allowed to be as exception to exceed	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 437 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12132	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	221	60	T	Y	221.60000610351562	60	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	There is another case: when two HE STAs are associated with a non-HE AP, there is a TDLS link between the two HE STAs. If the color is not 0 using by	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:45:34Z) Rejected – The classification of BSS color 0 to be Intra-BSS is there to have conservative behavior. The STA ca	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12133	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	222	6	T	Y	222.05999755859375	6	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	When the PPDU is a VHT MU PPDU,there is no UL_FLAG in RXVECTOR. Please clarify it	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:40:16Z) Rejected - We clarify that the UL_FLAG is only for HE MU PPDU. Hence, no change is required for the sentence.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12134	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	222	28	T	Y	222.27999877929688	28	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	Partial BSS color collision could happen. The STA can get the information from OBSS, but the AP with which the STA is associated may not get the infor	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12135	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	222	37	E	Y	222.36999511171875	37	27.2.2		A			447	delete ")"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:10:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12136	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.4	224	9	E	Y	224.08999633789062	9	27.2.4		A			447	Two "STA" here. Please detele one.	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12137	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	1	E	Y	227.00999450683594	1	27.2.5.3		A			447	Change "associated with" to "associated"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:48:43Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:48:47Z - see #12272	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12138	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.6	229	20	E	Y	229.19999694 82422	20	27.2.6		A			447	Change "sent by the AP to which the STA is associated" to "sent by the AP with which the STA is associated"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:56:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:56:20Z - see #12210	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12139	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.4.1	236	5	E	Y	236.05000305 17578	5	27.4.1		A			447	Change "an MU BAR Control frame" to "an MU BAR Trigger frame"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:03:11Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:03:15Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12140	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.4.1	236	5	E	Y	236.05000305 17578	5	27.4.1		A			447	Change "response to an MU-BAR Trigger frame" to "response to the MU-BAR Trigger frame"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:05:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:05:11Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12141	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.4.2	236	42	E	Y	236.41999816 89453	42	27.4.2		A			447	Change "EOF delimiter field" to "EOF subfield"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:09:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:09:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12142	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.4.2	236	45	E	Y	236.44999694 82422	45	27.4.2		A			447	Change "EOF delimiter field" to "EOF subfield"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:09:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:09:55Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12143	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	59	T	Y	240.58999633 789062	59	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Miss a case that the immediate response is a Multi-STA BlockAck with the ACK Type field set to 1 and the TID field set to 14. Change the sentence to "	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:15:27Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 440 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12144	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	24	T	Y	251.24000549316406	24	27.5.3.4		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	Please change "9.3.1.23.8 NDP Feedback Report Poll variant" to "9.3.1.23.8 NDP Feedback Report Poll(NFRP) variant".	as comment	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:41:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 23:32:00Z - see #13318	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12145	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	61	E	Y	255.61000061035156	61	27.5.3.6		A			447	Change "the BSRPA-MPDU Aggregation field" to "BSRP BQRP A-MPDU Aggregation field"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:34:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:34:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12146	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	49	E	Y	257.48999023 4375	49	27.5.5.1		A			447	Change "(Re)Association frames" to "(Re)Association response frames"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:38:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:38:52Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12147	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	28	E	Y	300.27999877 92969	28	27.10.4.1		A			447	Change "dot11MultipleTIDAMPDUOptionImplemented" to "dot11AMPDUwithMultipleTIDOptionImplemented "	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:03:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:03:55Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 441 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12148	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.11.4	305	20	T	Y	305.20001220703125	20	27.11.4		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	When two HE STAs are associated with a non-HE AP, there might be a TDLS link between the two HE STAs. How to select the BSS color? Please clarify it	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:52:15Z) Rejected- The first sentence of this paragraph already covers an HE STA that is associated with a non-HE AP. T	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:09:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12149	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	29	35	E	Y	29.350000381469727	35	3.2		A			447	There are two "with". Please delete one.	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12150	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	31	22	G	Y	31.219999313354492	22	3.2		A			447	The full name of Clause 21 is missing. Please add the full name.	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:10:27Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:10:30Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12151	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	33	7	E	Y	33.069999694 82422	7	3.2		A			447	Change STAID to STA-ID	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:13Z - see #12968	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12152	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	33	30	T	Y	33.299999237 06055	30	3.2		J			657	There are two different difinitions of HE ER PPDU.	Please clarify it	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12153	kaiying Lv	230	2	4.3.14a	37	12	E	Y	37.119998931884766	12	4.3.14a		A			447	Change 6GHz to 7.125GHz	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:03:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:03:36Z - see #12205	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 442 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12154	kaiying Lv	230	2	8.3.5.3.2	48	18	T	Y	48.18000030517578	18	8.3.5.3.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	There are two different difinitions of STA_INDEX parameter.	Please clarify it	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:43:12Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12155	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	54	4	E	Y	54.040000915527344	4	9.2.4.1.8		A			447	Change 11.2.2.6 to 11.2.3.6	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:21:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:21:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12156	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	Y	55.20000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	HE ER SU PPDU should also follow the rule. Change "a DL HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU" to "a DL HE MU PPDU , HE SU PPDU or HE ER SU PPDU"	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:09:46Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 443 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12157	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	Y	55.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Change "a DL HE MU PPDU" to "a DL HE MU PPDU,HE SU PPDU or HE ER SU PPDU"	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:10:50Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #11258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12158	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	12	E	Y	56.119998931884766	12	9.2.4.5.6		V			447	Change Figure 9-18d to Figure 9-18f	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:26:17Z) - Add hyperlink to Table 9-18f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:26:31Z - see #12215	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12159	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	68	34	E	Y	68.339996337890 62	34	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	The ACI to AC mapping is not shown in Tabled 9-18d(ACI Bitmap subfield encoding). The ACI to AC mapping is shown in Table 9-136(ACI-to-AC coding).	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical: the commenter is correct - the ACI to AC mapping is in Table 9-136. The thing referenced is a figure showing the field format and not some	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12160	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	69	10	T	Y	69.099998474 1211	10	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	It should be 253 not 254	Please clarify it	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 444 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12161	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	E	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	Change Figure 9-38b (Per AID TID Info subfield format when the AID11 subfield is not 2045) to Figure 9-38c --Per AID TID Info subfield format when the	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:10Z - see #12679	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12162	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	24	E	Y	91.23999786376953	24	9.3.1.23		A			447	Change "B19-B13 are 1000100" to "the value 68"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:11:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:11:18Z - see #12223	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12163	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	10	E	Y	92.09999847411211	10	9.3.1.23		A			447	Change "Figure 9-52h (SS Allocation/Random Access RU Information subfield format (AID12 subfield is neither 0 nor 2045))" to "Figure 9-52i(SS Allocati	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:15:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:16:00Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 445 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12164	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23.1	94	8	T	Y	94.08000183105469	8	9.3.1.23.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	The HE Capabilities element should be transmitted by the STA. Change "the AP" to " the STA"	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:25:11Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 12164	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12165	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23.4	95	54	T	Y	95.54000091552734	54	9.3.1.23.4		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	For 160 MHz and 80+80 MHz indication, B12 of the RU Allocation subfield is set to 1 or 0. Change "1" to " 1 or 0"	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:49:11Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 12165.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:03:24Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12166	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	40	T	Y	134.39999938 9648438	40	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	A-MSDUs can also be used in dynamic fragmentation.The first fragement of A-MSDUs should support the Maximum Number Of Fragmented MSDUs field. Change "	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:41:16Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 446 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12167	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	40	T	Y	134.39999389648438	40	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	F-MPDUs means Fragmented MPDUs. It is better to change F-MPDUs to F-MSDUs	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:42:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12168	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	50	T	Y	134.5	50	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	A-MSDUs can be used in dynamic fragementation. The first fragement of A-MSDUs should support the Minimum Fragment Size field. Change "an MSDU" to "an MS	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:45:24Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12169	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.239	151	35	T	Y	151.35000610351562	35	9.4.2.239		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	The minimum value of OCW can be used for for an initial transmission or following a successful HETB PPDU transmission.The second sentence describes a	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 447 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12170	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.240	152	37	E	Y	152.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.240		J			447	Change Figure 9-263 to Figure 9-264	as comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:51:00Z) - The commenter has not identified a problem with the draft	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:51:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12171	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	182	62	T	Y	182.61999511 71875	62	10.3.2.10.2		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Please clarify which type of trigger frame can be carried in an HE MU PPDU when a QoS Data frame or QoS Null frame with ack policy HTP ACK.	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:11:58Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:05:02Z - reword	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12172	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.3.2.10.3	184	31	T	Y	184.30999755 859375	31	10.3.2.10.3		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Please add HER SU PPDU to the list.	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:12:48Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:47:	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12173	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	29	T	Y	196.28999328 61328	29	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:59:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12174	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	33	T	Y	196.33000183 10547	33	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:59:50Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12175	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.14.1	311	64	T	Y	311.64001464 84375	64	27.14.1		V	Guoqing Li	1861R1	473	Miss the case of Multiple BSSID.	Please clarify it	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:22:19Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The text in this section is updated to cover multiple BSSID case. TGax editor,	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:33:42Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12176	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.14.2	313	28	T	Y	313.27999877 92969	28	27.14.2		V	Chitto Ghosh	11-18/0063r1	490	When the No Further RA RU subfield is set to 1, an AP shall not allocate the random access RUs assigned to 0 either.	Please clarify it	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:48:10Z) TGax editor makes the following. Change from " When the No Further RA RU subfield is set to 1, an AP shall not all	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:05:34Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12177	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.4	223	18	T	Y	223.17999267578125	18	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	688r0	617	When a HE STA is not associated with a AP, which NAV is updated by a received PPDU? .	Please clarify it	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 02:55:47Z) Rejected – Currently, when a STA receives a frame with Duration field in the MAC header indicating 0, the STA d	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12178	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	33	T	Y	249.33000183 10547	33	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	Miss a case that at the STA is an unassociated STA. Change the sentence to "If the Trigger frame was received in a non-HE PPDU, then set to the value of	Please clarify it	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:12:00Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 12178	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 451 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12179	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	31	T	Y	257.30999755859375	31	27.5.5.1		V	Chitto Ghosh	11-17/1849r2	482	It is better to clarify how to set the TA field of a trigger frame allocating random access RUs for multiple BSSID case. Please change the sentence to	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:13:36Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17/1849r2 under CID 12179	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12180	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	221	51	T	Y	221.50999450683594	51	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	When an HE STA is not associated with any AP, how to classify a PPDU as an inter-BSS frame or an intra-BSS frame	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:41:44Z) Rejected – When an HE STA is not associated with any AP, no conditions for intra-BSS or inter-BSS are satisfied	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12181	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23	90	17	E	Y	90.16999816894531	17	9.3.1.23		V			447	Delete "then"	As comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:02:54Z) - Change "When" to "If". Also clarify how the "not" applies. Change to read: "If the value of the AID12 subfiel	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:03:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12182	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	26	E	Y	91.26000213623047	26	9.3.1.23		V			447	Delete "then"	As comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:11:29Z) - Change "When to "If"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:11:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12183	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.1	270	55	E	Y	270.54998779296875	55	27.7.1		A			447	Change "subfields" to "subfield"	As comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:56:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:56:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12184	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	42	T	Y	279.42001342 77344	42	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	Change to "within trigger-enabled broadcast TWT"	Please clarify it	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:56:02Z) Revised – Agree with comment and incorporated the changes. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0664r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 453 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12185	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.8.3	288	60	T	Y	288.60000061035156	60	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	Change "may use in response to a Trigger frame"to "will use for an HE TB PPDU sent in response to a Trigger frame"	As comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:40:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:06:39Z - Resolution doc does not accurately reflect the approved resolution	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12186	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.8.3	288	62	T	Y	288.61999511171875	62	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	Change "indicates" to " to"	As comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:41:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:07:19Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12187	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.8.3	289	2	E	Y	289.01998901136719	2	27.8.3		A			447	Change "UL MU Disallow" to "UL MU Disable"	As comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:33:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:34:01Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12188	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	51	T	Y	290.51000976625	51	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	An HE STA with dot11HESRPOptionImplemented should follow the OBSS_PD level based on 27.9.4	Change the following condition to "(defined in 27.9.2.2 (Adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power) or 27.9.4 (Interaction of OBSS_PD and SRP-based sp	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:04:36Z) agree with the commenter. make the changes as proposed in doc 1852r41852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 454 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12189	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	15	T	Y	291.14999938964844	15	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	An HESTA with dot11HESRPOptionImplemented should follow the OBSS_PD level based on 27.9.4	Change the following condition to "(defined in 27.9.2.2 (Adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power) or 27.9.4 (Interaction of OBSS_PD and SRP-based sp	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:29:07Z) agree with the comment. Make the changes as proposed by doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12190	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3	295	60	T	Y	295.60000061035156	60	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Make it consistent by changing "SRP_PPDU-based spatial reuse" to "DSRP_PPDU-based spatial reuse " or vice versa.	As comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:20:33Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12190	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12191	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	33	12	E	Y	33.119998931884766	12	3.2		A			447	Remove the last " (Delayed SRP PPDU). "	As comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:22:11Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:22:14Z - see #12023	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 455 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12192	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3	296	18	T	Y	296.17999267578125	18	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Only HE SU or HE EXT SU PPDU can set the SPATIAL_REUSE field in HE SIGA to SR_DELAY. Is it necessary to specify that the SR field in the Common Info f	Remove the sentence "An AP sending a trigger frame shall not set the SR field in the Common Info field of the trigger frame to SR_DELAY."	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:22:55Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12192	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12193	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.3	298	7	T	Y	298.07000732421875	7	27.9.3.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Suggest to say " the max SNR margin"	Please clarify it	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:17:50Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12193	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12194	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3	295	60	T	Y	295.60000610035156	60	27.9.3		J	Kaiying Lv		657	Multiple SR PPDUs from different STAs may interfere the reception of SRP PPDU. Mechanism to reduce the interference needs to be considered.	Please clarify it	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 456 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12195	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	298	43	T	Y	298.42999926757812 5	43	27.9.4		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Should be an HE TB PPDU instead of a PPDU?	Please clarify	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:20:41Z) - correct as worded. At this point, any PPDU can be received, because the condition further includes “failed to id	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12196	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	298	53	T	Y	298.52999877929 69	53	27.9.4		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The OBSS_PD level should be set to positive infinity when an SRP opportunity is identified based on the reception of the PPDU. Remove "or lower".	As comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:22:01Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12196, note that a STA may choose	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12197	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	29	35	E	Y	29.350000038146 9727	35	3.2		A			447	There are two "with". Please delete one.	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:19Z - see #12149	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 457 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12198	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	298	65	T	Y	298.64999938964844	65	27.9.4		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	SR_DELAY is not a value in the Common Info field SPATIAL_REUSE of a Trigger frame	Remove "or SR_DELAY"	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:22:59Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12198	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12199	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	31	22	G	Y	31.219999313354492	22	3.2		A			447	The full name of Clause 21 is missing. Please add the full name.	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:10:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:10:11Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12200	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	299	2	T	Y	299.01998901736719	2	27.9.4		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Remove "or lower"	As comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:23:25Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12200, which modify the applicabil	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12201	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	33	7	E	Y	33.069999694082422	7	3.2		A			447	Change STAID to STA-ID	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:20:26Z - see #12968	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 458 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12202	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	299	3	T	Y	299.02999987792969	3	27.9.4		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Add the following sentence at the end of the paragraph "and may use a value equal to the receive power of the HE TB PPDU plus 1 dB for the ED level fo	As comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:23:54Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12202 which remove the phrase wher	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12203	kaiying Lv	230	2	3.2	33	30	T	Y	33.29999923706055	30	3.2		J	Kiseon		657	There are two different definitions of HE ER PPDU.	Please clarify it	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:25:31Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12204	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	299	9	T	Y	299.08999633378906	9	27.9.4		A	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Remove "and shall use a value equal to the receive power of this PPDU minus 1 dB for the ED level for the duration of this PPDU"	As comment	ACCEPTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:24:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 22:09:18Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12205	kaiying Lv	230	2	4.3.14a	37	12	E	Y	37.119998931884766	12	4.3.14a		A			447	Change 6GHz to 7.125GHz	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:03:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:03:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 459 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12206	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	58	17	T	Y	58.16999816894531	17	9.2.4.6.4.1		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	A-control subfield does not has length of 4	Change" 4 or more" to "variable"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:11:59Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0627r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12207	kaiying Lv	230	2	8.3.5.3.2	48	18	T	Y	48.18000030517578	18	8.3.5.3.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	There are two different difinitions of STA_INDEX parameter.	Please clarify it	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:42:57Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 460 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12208	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.242.2	154	56	T	Y	154.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.242.2		J	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	Value for the Service Specific Identifier is defined no where.	Value for the Service Specific Identifier should be defined ,or should be clarified where this definition is defined.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:28:28Z) Rejected: The definition of the Service Specific Identifier is not in the scope of IEEE specification. The spec	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12209	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	54	4	E	Y	54.040000915527344	4	9.2.4.1.8		A			447	Change 11.2.2.6 to 11.2.3.6	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:21:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:21:47Z - see #12155	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12210	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.6	229	20	E	Y	229.19999969482422	20	27.2.6		A			447	Typo.	Chagne to " in the most recently received EDCA Parameter Set element sent by the AP with which theSTA is associated"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:56:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:56:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 461 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12211	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	Y	55.20000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	HE ER SU PPDU should also follow the rule. Change "a DL HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU" to "a DL HE MU PPDU , HE SU PPDU or HE ER SU PPDU"	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:13:34Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12212	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.16.4.1	323	18	T	Y	323.17999267578125	18	27.16.4.1		V	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	" high priority" is ambiguous.	Suggest to explain which AC could participate in contention.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 23:59:39Z) Revised: Agree with the comment. The “if ..” sentene is redundant and is deleted. TGax editor, please make chan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 19:29:55Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12213	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	Y	55.36999893188476	37	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Change "a DL HE MU PPDU" to "a DL HE MU PPDU,HE SU PPDU or HE ER SU PPDU"	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:14:36Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #11258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 462 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12214	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.17	325	6	E	Y	325.05999755859375	6	27.17		V			648	Missing the word "the".	Change to"Otherwise the 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA shall set...."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:41:51Z) - 27.17 removed with resolutions to other comments. No furhter change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:42:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12215	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	12	E	Y	56.119998931884766	12	9.2.4.5.6		V			447	Change Figure 9-18d to Figure 9-18f	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:25:33Z) - Add hyperlink to Table 9-18f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:25:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12216	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.15.2	315	18	E	Y	315.17999267578125	18	27.15.2		A			447	Change "MU RTS" to "MU-RTS"	Change as comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-01-02 21:38:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-02 21:38:30Z - see #13317	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12217	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	68	34	E	Y	68.33999633789062	34	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	The ACI to AC mapping is not shown in Tabled 9-18d(ACI Bitmap subfield encoding). The ACI to AC mapping is shown in Table 9-136(ACI-to-AC coding).	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical: the commenter is correct - the ACI to AC mapping is in Table 9-136. The thing referenced is a figure showing the field format and not some	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 463 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12218	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.10.2	299	26	G	Y	299.26000976 5625	26	27.10.2		V	Liwen Chu	427r2	630	"EOF"shoulde "EOF field"	Change as comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:27:32Z) Revised No Change is needed. D2.1 already makes the asked change.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 22:59:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12219	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	69	10	T	Y	69.099998474 1211	10	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	It should be 253 not 254	Please clarify it	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12220	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.8.3	288	45	T	Y	288.45001220 703125	45	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	TOM indication can be used to indicate suspend or resume responding to any variant of the Trigger frame and UMRS Control sub fields.	Change to "The TOM indication allows the OMI initiator to suspend or resume responding to any variant of the Trigger frame and UMRS Control sub fields"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:42:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:04:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 464 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12221	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	E	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	Change Figure 9-38b (Per AID TID Info subfield format when the AID11 subfield is not 2045) to Figure 9-38c --Per AID TID Info subfield format when the	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:02:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:01Z - see #12679	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12222	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	65	T	Y	257.64999938964844	65	27.5.5.1		V	Chitto Ghosh	11-17/1861r1	473	What OCW Range value a non-AP STA with dot11MultiBSSIDActivated set to true should use if it has received UORA Parameter Set element from both transmi	Please clarify it.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:41:55Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17/1861r1 under CID 12222	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:32:40Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12223	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	24	E	Y	91.23999786376953	24	9.3.1.23		A			447	Change "B19-B13 are 1000100" to "the value 68"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:11:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:11:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 465 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12224	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.5.1	258	10	T	Y	258.10000061035156	10	27.5.5.1		V	Chitto Ghosh	11-17/1849r2	482	It is talking about unassociated STAs, so remove the case for RU with an AID12 subfield equal to 0	Change as comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:09:33Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 12224 Also, please see CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12225	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	10	E	Y	92.099998474211	10	9.3.1.23		A			447	Change "Figure 9-52h (SS Allocation/Random Access RU Information subfield format (AID12 subfield is neither 0 nor 2045))" to "Figure 9-52i(SS Allocati	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:16:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:16:09Z - see #12163	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 466 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12226	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	247	32	T	Y	247.32000732421875	32	27.5.3.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0076r3	507	An AID 12 subfield with a value of 2046 may be used to indicate the unassigned RUs in a trigger frame. How to set the other subfields of User Info fiel	Need to clarify.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:41:46Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0076r3 under 12226.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:28:16Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12227	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23.1	94	8	T	Y	94.08000183105469	8	9.3.1.23.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	The HE Capabilities element should be transmitted by the STA. Change "the AP" to " the STA"	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:26:10Z) Please see resolution for CID 12164	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12228	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.1.60	106	16	T	Y	106.16000366210938	16	9.4.1.60		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	A definition of the TWT Flow identifier should be given when the Broadcast Reschedule subfield is set to 1.	Add "The TWT Flow identifier subfield is reserved when the Broadcast Reschedule subfield is set to 1"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:38:57Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution adds clarification as suggested that the TWT flow identifier i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 467 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12229	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.3.1.23.4	95	54	T	Y	95.540000915 52734	54	9.3.1.23.4		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	For 160 MHz and 80+80 MHz indication, B12 of the RU Allocation subfield is set to 1 or 0. Change "1" to "1 or 0"	as comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:52:26Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 12165.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:57:32Z - see #12165	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12230	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.200	125	21	T	Y	125.20999908 447266	21	9.4.2.200		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The setting of "The Last Broadcast Parameter Set subfield" is described in page 129. Delete the sentence here "The Last Broadcast Parameter Set subfiel	as comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:11:27Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 468 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12231	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	40	T	Y	134.39999389648438	40	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	A-MSDUs can also be used in dynamic fragementation.The first fragement of A-MSDUs should support the Maximum Number Of Fragmented MSDUs field. Change "	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:43:38Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12232	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	46	G	Y	157.46000671 38672	46	9.4.2.243		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Change "SRP_AND_NON-SRG-OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED " to "SRP_AND_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED "	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:18:11Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12233	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	40	T	Y	134.39999389648438	40	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	F-MPDUs means Fragmented MPDUs. It is better to change F-MPDUs to F-MSDUs	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:44:33Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. It is duplicate one of CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 469 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12234	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7	270	36	E	Y	270.35998535 15625	36	27.7		A			447	Change "does need not" to " does not need"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:55:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:55:55Z - see #13777	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12235	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	50	T	Y	134.5	50	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	A-MSDUs can be used in dynamic fragementation. The first fragment of A-MSDUs should support the Minimum Fragment Size field. Change "an MSDU" to " an MS	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:46:26Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. It is duplicate one of CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12236	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.3.2	278	22	E	Y	278.22000122 07031	22	27.7.3.2		V			447	Change "Table 27aa " to "Table 27-4"	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:07:11Z) - Table 27-5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:07:21Z - see #11842	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12237	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.239	151	35	T	Y	151.35000610 351562	35	9.4.2.239		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	The minimum value of OCW can be used for for an initial transmission or following a successful HETB PPDU transmission.The second sentence describes a	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 470 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12238	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	16	T	Y	281.16000366 21094	16	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	The discription of "Alternate TWT" is inconsistent with Table 27-3. It should be permitted to be transmitted by a TWT scheduling AP.	Delete " or a TWT schedulin g AP."And add a sentence such as :" When transmitted by a TWT scheduling AP, the...."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:56:48Z) Revised – Agree with comment and incorporated the changes. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0664r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12239	kaiying Lv	230	2	9.4.2.240	152	37	E	Y	152.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.240		J			447	Change Figure 9-263 to Figure 9-264	as comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:50:38Z) - The commenter has not identified a problem with the draft	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:50:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12240	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	43	E	Y	281.42999267 578125	43	27.7.3.3		A			447	Change "act is if " to " act as if"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:12:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:12:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 471 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12241	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	182	62	T	Y	182.61999511 71875	62	10.3.2.10.2		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Please clarify which type of trigger frame can be carried in an HE MU PPDU when a QoS Data frame or QoS Null frame with ack policy HTP ACK.	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:15:16Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:05:46Z - see #12171	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12242	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	55	E	Y	282.54998779 296875	55	27.7.3.4		A			447	Change "Table 27ab " to "Table 27-5"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:13:37Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:13:42Z - see #12096	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12243	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.3.2.10.3	184	31	T	Y	184.30999755 859375	31	10.3.2.10.3		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	Please add HE ER SU PPDU to the list.	as comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:16:04Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:46:47Z - see #12171	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12244	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.4.1	283	1	E	Y	283.01000976 5625	1	27.7.4.1		V			447	Move the Table 27-5 to 27.7.3.4	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:14:47Z) - Anchor table to first reference for commenting purposes. Table will float with publication editing.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:15:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12245	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	29	T	Y	196.28999328 61328	29	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:59:55Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 473 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12246	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.7.4.1	283	20	T	Y	283.20001220703125	20	27.7.4.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	It is better to differentiate the use of Demand TWT and Suggest TWT. Otherwise just use Demand TWT or Suggest TWT.	Please clarify it	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:17:05Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change by clarifyi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12247	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	12	E	Y	293.11999511 71875	12	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	Change "OBSS_PD SR Disallowed" to "Non-SRG OBSS_PD SR Disallowed"	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:29:52Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12248	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	33	T	Y	196.33000183 10547	33	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-07 00:00:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 474 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12249	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	23	T	Y	294.23001098 63281	23	27.9.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	17/1852r8	474	Change to "including HE Trigger-Based PPDU, except when the HE TB PPDU is triggered by a Trigger frame having the CS Required subfield set	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:56:48Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12250	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.2.3	295	46	T	Y	295.45999145 50781	46	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Change the "max (NON SRG TXPWRmax1, NON SRG TXPWRmax2, SRG TXPWRmax3)" in the figure to "min (NON SRG TXPWRmax1, NON SRG TXPWRmax2, SRG TXPWRmax	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:12:53Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12251	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3	296	13	E	Y	296.13000048828125	13	27.9.3		A	Abhishek Patil		648	change" Table 9-262aa (Subfields of the HE PHY Capabilities Information field ■+δ to " Table 9-262z(Subfields of the HE MAC Capabilities Information fi	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:44:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:45:03Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12252	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	39	T	Y	196.38999938964844	39	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-07 00:00:17Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12253	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	28	G	Y	296.27999877992969	28	27.9.3.1		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	change the "SR_PPDU " to " SR PPDU"	as comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:25:42Z) - SR_PPDU is a defined term from 3.2 and includes the underscore	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 476 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12254	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	32	T	Y	296.32000732421875	32	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Change "Table 28-21 (Spatial Reuse subfield encoding for an HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, and HE MU PPDU) " to "Table 28-22 (Spatial Reuse subfield encoded	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:29:26Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12254	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12255	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	45	T	Y	196.44999694 82422	45	10.22.2.5		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0039r1	502	When a STA is permitted to begin a TXOP, the STA has completed the backoff procedure on primary 20MHz channel. There is no need to describe the idles	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-07 00:00:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12256	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	38	E	Y	296.38000488 28125	38	27.9.3.1		A			648	Change "SIGA SRP filed " to " the Spatial Reuse field in HE-SIG-A"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:47:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:47:39Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 477 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12257	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.8	199	53	T	Y	199.52999877929688	53	10.22.2.8		J	Ming Gan	432r1	545	In dynamic fragment, why is the Upper limit 16? If the dynamic fragment can be up to 16, it will be too complicated to respond the BlockAck. In BlockAc	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:49:11Z) Rejected- If the MSDU is only fragmented into 4 parts, the last one is not allowed to be as exception to exced	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12258	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	33	G	Y	297.32998657 22656	33	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	There are "SRP_PPDU" and "SRP PPDU" in the draft. Please choose one to use	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:44:15Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12258	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:31:28Z - Use SRP PPDU since we (mostly) do not use underscore in technical terms.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12259	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	33	G	Y	297.32998657 22656	33	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The SRP PPDU is a PPDU that is a DSRP_PPDU.	Replace "SRP PPDU" by "DSRP_PPDU"	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:44:58Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12259	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 478 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12260	kaiying Lv	230	2	10.22.2.8	200	30	T	Y	200.30000030517578	30	10.22.2.8		J	Ming Gan	432r1	545	In dynamic fragment, why is the Upper limit 16? If the dynamic fragment can be up to 16, it will be too complicated to respond the BlockAck. In BlockAc	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:50:45Z) Rejected- If the MSDU is only fragmented into 4 parts, the last one is not allowed to be as exception to exceed	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12261	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	32	T	Y	297.32000732421875	32	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	If the HE-STA is already executing its backoff procedure employing OBSS_PDlevel as a threshold for determination of an IDLE medium condition prior to	please clarify it	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:39:15Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12261	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12262	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	221	60	T	Y	221.60000610351562	60	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	There is another case: when two HE STAs are associated with a non-HE AP, there is a TDLS link between the two HE STAs. If the color is not 0 using by	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:43:29Z) Rejected – The classification of BSS color 0 to be Intra-BSS is there to have conservative behavior. The STA ca	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12263	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	37	E	Y	297.36999511871875	37	27.9.3.2		V			648	change "(25-1)" to (27-4)	as comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:55:41Z) - Probably 27-5. It is TXPWR_max that is being recalculated	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:56:29Z - see #14295	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12264	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	222	6	T	Y	222.05999755859375	6	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	When the PPDU is a VHT MU PPDU,there is no UL_FLAG in RXVECTOR. Please clarify it	as comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:41:04Z) Rejected - We clarify that the UL_FLAG is only for HE MU PPDU. Hence, no change is required for the sentence.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 480 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12265	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.3.4	298	31	E	Y	298.30999755859375	31	27.9.3.4		A			648	change "SR_PPDU Indcation " to "SRPPDU Indication"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:06:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:06:10Z - see #13512	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12266	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	222	28	T	Y	222.27999877929688	28	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	Partial BSS color collision could happen. The STA can get the information from OBSS, but the AP with which the STA is associated may not get the infor	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12267	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.9.4	298	45	E	Y	298.45001220703125	45	27.9.4		J			657	add "or SRP_AND_NON-SRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED " after the "SRP_DISALLOW"	as comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	Technical		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12268	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.2	222	37	E	Y	222.36999511 71875	37	27.2.2		A			447	delete ")"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 481 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12269	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.11.6	307	58	T	Y	307.57998657 22656	58	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The HESIGA_Spatial_reuse_value15_allowed subfield in the SR Control field indicates whether non-AP STAs that are associated with the AP that transmitt	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:26:53Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12269	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12270	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.4	224	9	E	Y	224.08999633 789062	9	27.2.4		A			447	Two "STA" here. Please detele one.	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:37:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:37:35Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12271	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.11.6	307	59	T	Y	307.58999633 78906	59	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	change "when permitted by other conditions" to "when the HESIGA_Spatial_reuse_value15_allowed sub- field of the SR Control field of the most recent	as comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:01:28Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12271	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12272	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	1	E	Y	227.00999450 683594	1	27.2.5.3		A			447	Change "associated with" to "associated"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:48:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:48:38Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 482 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12273	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.11.6	308	50	T	Y	308.5	50	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	There is no " SR Disallowed subfield " in the SR control field. The SRP Disallowed subfield in the SR Control field indicates whether SRP-based SR tran	please clarify it	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:24:25Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12273	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12274	kaiying Lv	230	2	27.2.6	229	20	E	Y	229.19999969482422	20	27.2.6		A			447	Change "sent by the AP to which the STA is associated" to "sent by the AP with which the STA is associated"	as comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:56:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:56:39Z - see #12210	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12275	Kazuto Yano	230	2	3.2	29	36	E	N	29.360000610351562	36	3.2		A			447	"PPDU with with TXVECTOR" must be "PPDU with TXVECTOR".	Please remove one of duplicated "with".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:50Z - see #12149	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12276	Kazuto Yano	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	35	E	N	66.349998474121 1	35	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	In the definition of MSI/PPDU Type in Table 9-18c, there is a phrase "Figure XXX".	Please specify the number of Figure.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:24Z - see #14152	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 483 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12277	Kazuto Yano	230	2	10.22.2.5	196	45	E	N	196.44999969482422	45	10.22.2.5		A			447	"if the primary 20 MHZ channel" must be "if the primary 20 MHz channel".	Please change "MHZ" to "MHz".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:00:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:00:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12278	Kazuto Yano	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	39	T	N	136.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793r1	603	In Table 9-262z, the definition and encoding of Maximum A-MPDU Length Exponent subfield are blank.	Please specify the definition and encoding of Maximum A-MPDU Length Exponent subfield.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:52:42Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12279	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	10.2.1	177	40	E	N	177.39999389648438	40	10.2.1		V			648	In Figure 10-1, it is not clear where MUUA is positioned in accordance with UMTA and UORA.	Add what MUUA covers in Figure 10-1.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:26:25Z) - MUUA removed with resolution to #13042.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:26:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12280	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	3.4	35	33	E	N	35.33000183105469	33	3.4		V			648	MUUA is missing in subclause 3.4 abbreviations and acronyms	Add entry for MUUA (multi-user uplink access)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:21:59Z) - MUUA removed with resolution to other comments. No change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:22:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 484 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12281	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	27.7	270	17	T	N	270.17001342 77344	17	27.7		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	There is no mentioning of HE TWT application to mesh STAs. TWT is a nice feature for better power saving. It should be used for MBSS, too.	Please define a set of rules how HE mesh STAs can leverage TWT.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:55:38Z) Rejected – There are no restrictions that forbid mesh STAs to deploy TWT. But there is also no need to define a	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12282	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	4.3.14a	37	14	T	N	37.139999389 64844	14	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"An HE STA that is a mesh STA does not transmit and does not receive HE MU PPDUs or HE TB PPDUs." sounds to be too restrictive. Some features based on	Please consider to allow use of HE MU PPDUs and some of the HE TB PPDUs for mesh STAs.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:35:39Z) Revised. HE MU PPDU can be sent from non-AP STA and should be allowed for mesh STAs. However, HE TB PPDU current	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:40:49Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12283	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	27.16.1	318	52	T	N	318.51998901 36719	52	27.16.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	Subclause 27.16.1 (Basic HE BSS functionality) does not have any information how HE mesh STA operates MBSS.	Please clarify how the basic HE mesh BSS opearti on would look like.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 485 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12284	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	27.2.5	225	14	T	N	225.13999938964844	14	27.2.5		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	MU-RTS/CTS procuedre should be useful for a frame exchange sequence initiated by non-AP STA, i.e., STAs in IBSS or in MBSS. However, the current spec	Please consider to allow use of MU-RTS/CTS proceudre for STAs in IBSS and in MBSS.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:31:14Z) In the current spec, any variants of Trigger frame can only be transmitted by the AP because the STA info field r	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12285	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	27.4	234	40	T	N	234.39999389648438	40	27.4		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	HE block acknowledgement, MU-BAR, should be useful for STAs in IBSS or in MBSS. However, the current spec only assumes that the procedure is only used	Please consider to allow use of HE block acknowledgement proceudre for STAs in IBSS and in MBSS.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:18:25Z) Rejected - MU operation is not defined for IBSS or MBSS.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 486 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12286	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	27.5.1	242	15	T	N	242.14999389648438	15	27.5.1		J	Zhou Lan	11-18/0054r0	499	HE DL MU operation should be useful for MBSS as well.	Please consider to allow similar operation to HE DL MU to mesh STAs. It is possible to accommodate HE DL MU operation to mesh STAs, if mesh STA perfor	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:18:36Z) Mesh operation is out of scope of 11ax PAR. TGax makes no changes to the draft on CID 12286.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:55:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12287	Kazuyuki Sakoda	230	2	27.2.2	221	54	T	N	221.5399932861328	54	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	Is BSS_COLOR only for infrastructure BSS?	Please clarify. It should be useful for other type of BSS.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12288	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	10.3.2.10	182	1	T	Y	182.00999450683594	1	10.3.2.10		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	Regarding MU acknowledgement procedure defined in 10.3.2.10, some of text related to HE MU acknowledgement are redundant and duplicate with 27.4 HE bl	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:16:51Z) Rejected - All the HE block ack procedure is defined in Section 27.4. Section 10 defines the use of HE Block Ac	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 487 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12289	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	27.14	314	32	T	Y	314.32000732421875	32	27.14		J	Guoqing Li		657	A STA may enter the Doze state for the TXOP duration when it receives a frame which is not intended to it in 11ac Spec. However, if a STA enters the D	As in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12290	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	27.11.6	308	44	T	Y	308.44000244140625	44	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	If an AP does not include the Spatial Reuse Parameter Set (SRPS) element in a Beacon, Probe Response and Association Response frame, the associated ST	Delete the following text: "or if STA has not received a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element from its associated AP,"	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:05:48Z) - the group has agreed that the default state should be SR enabled on a per-PPDU basis.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 488 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12291	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	27.11.6	308	50	T	Y	308.5	50	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	One more condition to set the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_REUSE to SRP_AND_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED should be added.	Modify the text as: A STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_REUSE of an HE PPDU to SRP_DISALLOW or, if permitted, to SRP_AND-NON-SRG_OBSS_PD_PR	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:08:45Z) - the default condition is that the STA has a choice on the setting, and is only restricted in its choice if the A	EDITOR	Approved No Change				N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12292	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	N	55.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	7724r1	636	HTP Ack can be used not only for HE MU PPDU but also for HE SU PPDU.	Modify the text as: When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU or an HE SU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ack,	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:17:40Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #11258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 489 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12293	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	10.3.2.4	181	18	T	Y	181.17999267578125	18	10.3.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	688r0	617	When a TXOP holder intends to truncate the TXOP, it sets the TXVECTOR parameter TXOP_DURATION to 0. A STA receiving the HE PPDU containing the RXVECTO	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 02:57:45Z) Rejected – If a STA is not associated with an AP, then based on the condition described in 27.2.2, the frameca	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12294	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	11	T	Y	97.11000061035156	11	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1837r3	497	CS Required bit in the NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame shall be set to 1. If it is set to 0, a STA with non-zero NAV value responding to an NDP	Replace the text The CS Required subfield of the NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame may be set to 0. with The CS Required subfield of the NDP Feed	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 06:23:57Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-17/1837r3 under 12294	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 20:48:21Z - A statement "The X field can be set to 0 or 1" adds nothing to the meaning. Any bit can be set to 0 or 1; the purpose o	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 490 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12295	Kiseon Ryu	230	2	27.5.5	257	9	T	Y	257.08999633 78906	9	27.5.5		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	To increase the UL transmission coverage, a non-AP STA uses the narrow bandwidth transmission such as using an OFDMA 26 RU, 52 RU scheduled by a Trigg	Define a mechanism of UL MU only access when the UL transmission coverage is needed to be increased.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12296	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.6.2.2	261	57	T	Y	261.57000732 421875	57	27.5.6.2.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	this subsection is describing PHY processing for the modulation of assigned tones. This should be moved to section 28.	Remove the modulation of the assigned tones paragraph in section 27 and make sure that this behavior is clearly described in section 28	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:21:56Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:37:53Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12297	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.6.2.1	261	23	T	Y	261.23001098 63281	23	27.5.6.2.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	Clarify spatial reuse TxVector for NDP feedback report	No spatial reuse should be possible on top of NDP feedback report, spatial reuse should probably be set to SR_delay.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:20:52Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 491 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12298	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.6.2	261	1	T	Y	261.01000976 5625	1	27.5.6.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	It is not clear in the spec that if a STA does not have a resource request to make or any buffer status to report, it does not respond to the NDP repor	Add a note that clarify this point	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:17:17Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12299	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.6.4	262	23	T	Y	262.23001098 63281	23	27.5.6.4		J	Laurent Cariou		657	NDP feedback report should also be used to report an indication that the STA is in the awake state and is ready to receive data in downlink and/or to	Add a new type of feedback for NDP feedback report. This type can allow a STA to report that it is awake and, as we have 2 different possible response	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 492 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12300	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.6	260	30	T	Y	260.29998779296875	30	27.5.6		J	Laurent Cariou		657	NDP feedback report triggers are meant to be sent regularly with predefined intervals and at predetermined transmission times. This way, the STA can k	Add a mechanism for the AP to indicate to the STAs the target transmission times and periodicity of the NDP feedback reports trigger frames. This shou	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12301	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.6.2	260	49	T	Y	260.48999023 4375	49	27.5.6.2		J	Laurent Cariou		657	NDP feedback reports can currently be sent only by associated STA. In order to reduce the use of EDCA for transmissions of unassociated STAs to the AP	Modify the NDP feedback report poll trigger frame and the NDP feedback procedure to allow unassociated STAs to send an NDP feedback report. The proced	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12302	Laurent Cariou	230	2				T	Y					V		18/0397r2	574	The PAR was recently modified to allow 11ax to operate in the 6-7 GHz band. 11ax operation needs to be defined.	Include at least the channelization for 11ax operation in the 6G Hz band.	agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 18/0397r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:14:16Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 493 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12303	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.2.6	228	37	T	Y	228.36999511 71875	37	27.2.6		J	Laurent Cariou		657	The use of MU disable bit may be used by STAs to not respect all the rules related to the MU EDCA parameters defined in this section, especially when	Define a solution to prevent a STA from abusing the rules. A possible solution is to transform a trigger-enabled TWT agreement to a non-trigger-enable	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12304	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.9.2	290	25	T	Y	290.25	25	27.9.2		J	Matt Fischer		657	OBSS_PD based spatial reuse operation is defining specific rules and equations when applied to an SRG (SR group). In some managed environments, the de	Define the protocol and frame exchanges needed to establish an SRG among neighboring APs.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 494 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12305	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	7	T	Y	282.07000732421875	7	27.7.3.4		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	Negotiation of wake TBTT and wake interval was designed when the concept of grouping with TWT ID was not in place. Now that broadcast TWT has evolved,	Clarify how to use this mechanism or remove it.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:54:17Z) Rejected – The procedure helps the STA to negotiate the TBTT, and the periodicity at which it plans to wake and	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12306	Laurent Cariou	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	27	T	Y	129.27000427246094	27	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	TWT flow identifier is used for broadcast TWT to indicate the target transmission time of specific frames, like TIM element, or OFDMA random access. T	Modify the TWT flow identifier for broadcast TWT table to define an explicit way to schedule NDP feedback report triggers. The simplest solution is to	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:02:27Z) Rejected – Already allowed in Flow Identifier value 2.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12307	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.7.2	272	25	T	Y	272.25	25	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	In Table 27-2 - HE individual TWT setup exchange command interpretation, Accept TWT with Broadcast subfield set to 1 and with an individual address in	This entry shall be deleted as it belongs to Broadcast TWT Agreement (the table delas with Individual TWT setup) and should be move to the broadcast t	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:13:00Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. This sequence is already present in Table 27-6. Removed. TGax editor to make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12308	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.7.2	273	24	T	Y	273.23999023 4375	24	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	A TWT requesting STA that is in PS mode and is awake shall include a PS-Poll frame or an APSD trigger frame in the HE TB PPDU if the TWT is an announc	Clarify what is any other indication. An NDP feedback report sent in response to an NDP feedback report poll trigger frame should be explicitly part	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:13:50Z) Revised – This addition was added purposefully to specify any other indication, since it can be a response to an	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 496 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12309	Laurent Cariou	230	2				T	Y					J			657	Document EN 301 893 is defining new rules for 5GHz operation in Europe. Some of these rules may open the door to improvements for 802.11ax. Some adapt	Adapt 11ax rules to benefit from new rules defined in EN 301 893, if this is shown to be beneficial.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12310	Laurent Cariou	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	67	11	T	Y	67.11000061035156	11	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	There has been several attemps to harmonize QoS-control BSR with A-control BSR that failed. Because of this, A-control BSR does not provide benefits a	Harmonize A-control with QoS control BSR, or remove A-control BSR from the spec.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 497 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12311	Laurent Cariou	230	2	28.3.18.4.3	491	51	T	Y	491.51000976 5625	51	28.3.18.4.3		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	It is important for the AP to know the Max Power for MCS7 or to derive the target RSSI for max power for MCS 7 as this is the threshold between 2 diff	Ensure that the spec defines efficient operation around Max power for MCS7 to allow the AP to force STAs to operate with good EVM	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:35:38Z) Since it is for HE TB PPDU, the transmit power of each STA is controlled the AP. And different implementations	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:00:33Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12312	Laurent Cariou	230	2	4.3.14a	37	10	T	Y	37.099998474 121094	10	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	The list of PHY and MAC features is not complete and should be extended.	Extend the list of PHY and MAC features. For instance, NDP feedback report is not indicated.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:28:50Z) Revised. Agree in principle. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:46:46Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12313	Laurent Cariou	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	38	T	Y	129.38000488 28125	38	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	In the TWT flow identifier table for BCST TWT, for value 1 and 2, feedbacks can also be contained in an NDP feedback report	Add NDP feedback report in the containers for feedbacks, and reference the NDP feedback report procedure	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:12:19Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12313	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 498 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12314	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.5.3.6	254	48	T	Y	254.47999572753906	48	27.5.3.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0108r2	503	The section on buffer status feedback operation for ULMU should describe the possibility to use NDP feedback report procedure to make a resource requ	Add the option of NDP feedback report with resource request type as an additional complementary solution for buffer status report.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:29:42Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0108r2 under 12314	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 20:19:13Z - Kind of vague and missing a few details don't you think?	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12315	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.7.2	272	45	T	Y	272.45001220703125	45	27.7.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	Unsolicited TWT response frames should not be allowed for certain modes. For instance, a periodic announced TWT should not be allowed.	Exclude some TWT modes when used with the unsolicited TWT response frames	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:14:46Z) Rejected – The comment fails to identify a technical issue. It is up to the AP to decide which mode to enable d	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12316	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.14	311	26	T	Y	311.260009765625	26	27.14		J	Guoqing Li		657	Describe the power management mechanism for NDP feedback report protocol	Define a section for the power management protocol with NDP feedback report poll protocol	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 499 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12317	Laurent Cariou	230	2	27.7	270	16	T	Y	270.16000036621094	16	27.7		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	TWT requesting STAs and TWT scheduled STA have rules and operation which is described when they are in PS mode. TWT requesting and TWT scheduled STAs	Modify the definition of TWT requesting STA and TWT scheduled STAs to add the condition of being PS STAs.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:56:32Z) Rejected – TWT operation contains a subset of rules that apply to the STAs when in PS mode, however there is a	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12318	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	29	36	E	N	29.360000610351562	36	3.2		A			447	"A high efficiency (HE) PPDU with with TXVECTOR parameter CH_BANDWIDTH" should be changed to "A high efficiency (HE) PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:57:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:58:04Z - see #12149	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12319	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	29	42	T	N	29.420000076293945	42	3.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	the definitions of 20MHz mask PPDU for i), j) and k) are unnecessary since they are covered by b), c), and d), respectively.	delete bulletins i), j) and k)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:31:54Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 12319 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0475r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:48:00Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12320	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	30	44	T	N	30.440000534057617	44	3.2		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	the definitions of 40MHz mask PPDU for k) and l) are unnecessary since they are covered by a) and f), respectively.	delete bulletins k) and l)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:32:08Z) In D2.2, item k) and l) specify the HESTA, they are different from a) and f).	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:49:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12321	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	31	21	T	N	31.209999084472656	21	3.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	the definitions of 80MHz mask PPDU for f) and g) are unnecessary since they are covered by a) and b), respectively.	delete bulletins f) and g).	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:32:23Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 12321 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0475r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:50:24Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 501 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12322	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	31	64	T	N	31.639999389648438	64	3.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	the definitions of 160 MHz mask PPDU for g) and h) are unnecessary since they are covered by a) and b), respectively.	delete bulletins g) and h)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:32:37Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 12322 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0475r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:51:09Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12323	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	32	31	T	N	32.310001373291016	31	3.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	the definitions of 80+80MHz mask PPDU for d) and e) are unnecessary since they are covered by a) and b), respectively.	delete bulletins d) and e)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:32:51Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 12323 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0475r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:51:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12324	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	33	36	T	N	33.360000610 35156	36	3.2		J			657	the definition of HE ER SU PPDU is redundant since it has been defined in P33L31. please delete it	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 502 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12325	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	33	50	T	N	33.5	50	3.2		J			657	The current definitions on HE PPDU, HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU are not unified.	Change the definition of HE MU PPDU to "A Clause 28 (High Efficiency (HE) PHY specification PPDU) PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter FORMAT equal to HE_	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12326	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	33	55	T	N	33.549999237 06055	55	3.2		J			657	The current definitions on HE PPDU, HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU are not unified.	change the definition of HE PPDU to "A Clause 28 (High Efficiency (HE) PHY specification PPDU) PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter FORMAT equal to HE_EXT	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 503 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12327	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	33	64	T	N	33.639999389 64844	64	3.2		J			657	The current definitions on HE PPDU, HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU are not unified.	change the definition on HE SU PPDU to "A Clause 28 (High Efficiency (HE) PHY specification PPDU) PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter FORMAT equal to HE_	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12328	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	34	1	T	N	34.009998321 5332	1	3.2		J			657	The current definitions on HE PPDU, HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU are not unified.	change the definition on HE TB PPDU to "A Clause 28 (High Efficiency (HE) PHY specification PPDU) PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter FORMAT equal to HE_	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12329	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	34	12	E	N	34.119998931 884766	12	3.2		A			447	"support" should be changed to "supports"	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:24:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:24:52Z - see #11445	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12330	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	34	16	E	N	34.159999847 41211	16	3.2		A			447	"support" should be changed to "supports"	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:26:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:26:33Z - see #11446	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 504 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12331	Lei Huang	230	2	3.2	34	54	T	N	34.540000915527344	54	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	the definition on SR_PPDU is redundant since it has been defined in P34L50. please delete it	as in the comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:53:30Z) - Gax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12331	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12332	Lei Huang	230	2	3.4	35	13	T	N	35.130001068115234	13	3.4		A			648	The acronym "BRP" has been defined in 802.11-2016 as "beam refinement protocol"	change "BRP" to "BFRP"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:20:18Z) - see #11432	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:20:31Z - see #11432	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12333	Lei Huang	230	2	3.4	35	26	T	N	35.2599983215332	26	3.4		A			648	The acronyms "DL OFDMA" and "UL OFDMA" are unnecessary since the acronyms "DL", "UL" and "OFDMA" have been defined. Please delete them.	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:22:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:22:47Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12334	Lei Huang	230	2	4.3.18.8	38	18	E	N	38.180000305017578	18	4.3.18.8		A			447	"BSS Color Collision" should be changed to "BSS color collision"	as in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:06:11Z) Unnecessary capitalization	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:06:15Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 505 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12335	Lei Huang	230	2	6.3.11.2.4	42	34	T	N	42.340000152 58789	34	6.3.11.2.4		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	"MLME-JOIN.request" should be changed to "MLME-START.request"	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:24:38Z) - The current text is just copied text from MLME-JOIN.request. The text should be modified. See the proposed t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:30:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12336	Lei Huang	230	2	6.3.11.2.4	42	36	T	N	42.360000610 35156	36	6.3.11.2.4		V	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	"MLME-JOIN.confirm" should be changed to "MLME-START.confirm"	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:25:03Z) - The current text is just copied text from MLME-JOIN.request. The text should be modified. See the proposed t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:30:35Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 506 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12337	Lei Huang	230	2	8.3.4.4	46	33	T	N	46.330001831 05469	33	8.3.4.4		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	"AIDLIST" should be changed to "AID12 LIST"	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:42:41Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12338	Lei Huang	230	2	8.3.5.3.2	48	18	T	N	48.180000305 17578	18	8.3.5.3.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	delete the redundant statement that "The STA_INDEX parameter is present for an HE TB PPDU and indicates the index of the user in the RXVECTOR to which	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:43:25Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12339	Lei Huang	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	N	55.20000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	HE ER SU PPDU is missing	change "DL HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU" to "DL HE MU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU or HE SU PPDU"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:18:30Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12340	Lei Huang	230	2	9.2.4.1.10	54	14	T	N	54.13999938964844	14	9.2.4.1.10		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	"two purposes" should be changed to "three purposes"	as in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:09:07Z) Revised- The cited wording has been removed from the baseline specification (i.e., TGmd D1.0). TGax editor only	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12341	Lei Huang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	59	25	E	N	59.25	25	9.2.4.6.4.1		V			447	"Command Control Indication" should be changed to "Command control indication" like other control subfields	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:30:52Z) - Change to "Command and status (CAS)" to align with abbreviation used as the subfield name.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:31:36Z - see #12805	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 508 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12342	Li-Hsiang Sun	230	2	3.2	33	31	E	N	33.310001373291016	31	3.2		J			657	high efficiency (HE) extended range (ER) single user (SU) physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU) has 2 definitions	remove the definition starting from line 35	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Both appear to be completely useless as definitions. I would remove both.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12343	Li-Hsiang Sun	230	2	9.7.3	174	7	T	N	174.07000732421875	7	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"NOTE 1--The MPDUs from the same TID all have the Ack Policy field equal to the same value, which is either Implicit Block Ack Request, Normal Ack, HT	remove Normal Ack	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:53:47Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12343	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 509 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12344	Li-Hsiang Sun	230	2	9.7.3	173	22	T	N	173.22000122070312	22	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	In a single TIDA-MPDU context between two HE STAs at most one of the following is present: -- One or more QoS Data frames with a single TID value wit	Make clarifications for the case described	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:59:27Z) Revised Discussion: a STA can send an A-MPDU with QoS Data frames whose Ack Policy fields are equal to Block Ack	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12345	Liwen Chu	230	2	3.2	32	56	T	Y	32.560001373291016	56	3.2		J			657	BSS Color needs to be combined with AID in HE SIG B.	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12346	Liwen Chu	230	2	3.2	33	11	T	Y	33.11000061035156	11	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Add another spatial reuse value SRP_AND_NON-SRG-OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED	As in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:47:34Z) TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12346	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 510 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12347	Liwen Chu	230	2	3.2	33	65	T	Y	33.650001525878906	65	3.2		V			648	Change to ".. For one user or multiple users"	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:42:32Z) - The issue is that the PSDU may be broadcast, in which case it is for more than one user. " for one or multiple	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:51:01Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12348	Liwen Chu	230	2	4.3.14a	37	14	T	Y	37.139999389 64844	14	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	HE MU PPDU should be able to be transmitted in mesh link since HE MU PPDU can be from non-AP STA to AP, from STA to STA, from AP to STAs.	Remove the restriction of HE MU PPDU here.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:36:27Z) Revised. Agree in principle. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	returned		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:40:34Z - see #12282	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12349	Liwen Chu	230	2	4.3.14a	37	39	T	Y	37.389999389 64844	39	4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Add "when MU-MIMO is done on the entire PPDU bandwidth"	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:40:59Z) Reject Current text is accurate on the spec requirement on DL MU MIMO.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 511 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12350	Liwen Chu	230	2	4.3.14a	37	57	T	Y	37.569999694 82422	57	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Broadcast TWT is optional to AP	Change the bullet per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:44:46Z) Revised. Added “individual’ to clarify and optional support for broadcast TWT. TGax editor to make changes shown	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:36:55Z - And split into separate items for AP and non-AP	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12351	Liwen Chu	230	2	6.3.7.4.2	40	53	T	Y	40.529998779 296875	53	6.3.7.4.2		J	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	TWT element is missing.	Add it for TWT negotiation. Add it also for reassociation	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:33:13Z) - 802.11ah already included TWT element in MLME-ASSOCIATE.indication and it Is not necessary to update it.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:33:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 512 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12352	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	37	E	Y	56.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	this operation is not suitable for buffer size>1008 and <1023 or size >17152 and <17408. Similar consideration to SF being 2, 3, 0	Change the text per the comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12353	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.4.6.1	57	14	E	Y	57.13999938964844	14	9.2.4.6.1		V			447	Change "Aggregation Control to "A-Control"	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:35:43Z) - Here and at L38	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:35:58Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12354	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	59	25	E	Y	59.25	25	9.2.4.6.4.1		V			447	Harmonize the name through the draft		REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:29:20Z) - Use "Command and status (CAS)" and refer to as CAS Control subfield"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:30:14Z - see #12805	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 513 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12355	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	60	16	T	Y	60.159999847412 11	16	9.2.4.6.4.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	it should be Normolized to 20 MHz.	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:23:26Z) Please see resolution for CID 12377. Added text to clarify that the Target RSSI is expected signal level for the a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:10:41Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12356	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.7	70	7	T	Y	70.069999694824 22	7	9.2.4.6.4.7		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	NAV should also be considered when decidin g whether 20MHz channel is idle.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:14:14Z) Revised- Agree in principle. The NAV on the primary channel is only considered when the STA decides to report t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 514 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12357	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.5.2	72	59	T	Y	72.589996337 89062	59	9.2.5.2		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	HE NDPA and BRP Trigger can't be treated as VHT NDPA and Beamforming Report Poll frame since HE sounding protocol is different from VHT sounding proto	Change to "HE NDP Announcement frame or HE NDP Announcement frame and BRP Trigger frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:31:47Z) The description does not imply any specific sounding procedure. It simply says that a STA always uses multiple pr	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:40:26Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12358	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.5.2	73	6	T	Y	73.059997558 59375	6	9.2.5.2		J	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	DL MU case is missing, also UL MU frame exchange is not correctly defined	Change the bullet per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:33:17Z) Rejected – The commenter refers to the description for the single protection setting of MU-RTS. We note that DL	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:40:37Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 515 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12359	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.5.2	73	59	T	Y	73.589996337890 62	59	9.2.5.2		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	PPDUs should not appear here. Another observation is that these PPDUs include pending MPDUs of the AC.	Change the bullet per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:34:29Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. In 11ax, other ACs are allowed to be transmitted together with	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:41:03Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12360	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.5.2	73	50	T	Y	73.5	50	9.2.5.2		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	BRP Trigger is missing.	Add it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:36:19Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. In 11ax, other ACs are allowed to be transmitted together with	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:41:23Z - see #12359	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12361	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.2.5.7	74	48	T	Y	74.480003569336	48	9.2.5.7		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	BA solicited by HE TN PPDU in single protection is missing	Add it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:37:26Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We revise the texts in 9.2.5.7. TGax editor to make the change	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:43:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12362	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.3	79	7	T	Y	79.06999969482422	7	9.3.1.9.3		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	it should be "MSDUs and/or AMSDUs". In whole subclause make similar changes.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:06:57Z) Revised. Agree in principle with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:20:48Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12363	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	40	T	Y	79.400001525 8789	40	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	single STA, single TID in HE TB PPDU is missing.	Add it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:09:53Z) Revised. Agree in principal with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:21:18Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 517 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12364	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	65	E	Y	79.650001525 8789	65	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	change 9-38b to 9-38c	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:03:27Z - see #12679	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12365	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	34	T	Y	80.339996337 89062	34	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	This is not a complete sentence.	Change it to a complete sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:50:14Z) Revised. The part pointed out is resolved by CID 12595.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:17:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
12366	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	37	T	Y	81.370002746 58203	37	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Action can also be in S-MPDU	Change per the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:05:28Z) Revised. Agree in principal with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:22:59Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12367	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	59	T	Y	81.589996337 89062	59	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"The responding STA determines that all the MPDUs carried in the eliciting A-MPDU are successfully received if the all the MPDUs that precede the firs	Change the text per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:15:22Z) Rejected. The cited sentence explains how to determine that all the MPDUs carried in the eliciting A-MPDU are s	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR
12368	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	51	E	Y	81.510002136 23047	51	9.3.1.9.7		V			447	Change "the TID value of the AID TID Info subfield" to " the TID value in the TID subfield of the AID TID Info subfield" through the paragraph.	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:59:50Z) - Both the Ack Type subfield and the TID subfield are in the AID TID Info subfield. Since the context is clear	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 18:01:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 519 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12369	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	82	42	T	Y	82.419998168 94531	42	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Level 2 fragment is missing from the paragraph.	Add the missed case.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:17:49Z) Revised. Agree in principle with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:23:20Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12370	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	35	T	Y	80.349998474 1211	35	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Change "Per STA Info" to "Per AID TID Info"	As in comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:56:02Z) Accepted.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:17:36Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12371	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	18	T	Y	81.180000305 17578	18	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Change "MPDUs" to "QoS frames"	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:01:28Z) Revised. Agree in principal with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:21:55Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 520 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12372	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	82	6	T	Y	82.059997558 59375	6	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	Change to "If Ack Type subfield is 0 and TID subfield is less than 8,"	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:17:03Z) Rejected. It will work without adding the suggested condition.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR
12373	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	30	T	Y	84.300003051 75781	30	9.3.1.20		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	When SU sounding feedback is solicited, these fields are reserved.	Change the paragraph per the comment.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:40:49Z) The fields are reserved only when the SU sounding feedback is being solicited with a non-TB sounding sequence. Ot	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12374	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	15	T	Y	88.150001525 8789	15	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Cahnge Table 21-13 to 28-19	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:20:51Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 12374	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 521 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12375	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	30	T	Y	89.300003051 75781	30	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Change to "Table 28-20 (HE-SIG-A field of an HE TB PPDU)."	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:24:12Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 12375	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	See #14222	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12376	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23	90	19	T	Y	90.190002441 40625	19	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0944r0	632	B12 when RU is 2x996 is missing.	Add the following text in proper place: The first bit, B12, is set to 1 to indicate that the allocated RU is located within both the primary 80 MHz an	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:37:25Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0944r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 22:39:54Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12377	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	31	T	Y	92.309997558 59375	31	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	The target RSSI should also be normalized to 20MHz.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:22:38Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0366r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:19:39Z - The text doesn't make sense. An assigned RU does not have signal power. Changed to read " The UL Target RSSI subfield of	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 522 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12378	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23	93	3	T	Y	93.029998779 29688	3	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	Change "an exampleof how to compute the length, LPAD,MAC, of the Padding field (if present) to meet the duration requirements is given below" to " the	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:24:44Z) Agree with the comment. Revised text to indicate that if Padding field is present in Trigger frame, the length is	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:23:57Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12379	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23.1	94	6	T	Y	94.059997558 59375	6	9.3.1.23.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/105r3	469	Remove the paragraph since it contradicts with the rules in subclause 27.5.3.2.3	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:32:45Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 19:13:52Z - To accommodate the additional subfield the HE MAC Capabalities Info field is increased by 1 octet. Also, the new field	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 523 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12380	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	16	T	Y	97.160003662 10938	16	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	First of all there is Number of HE LTF subfield. Secondly the Number of HE LTF andSymbols And Midamble Periodicity subfield of the Common Info field i	Change the text according to the comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:11:27Z) make the change as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:06:05Z - It is SET to the number of symbols minus 1 but it INDICATES the number of symbols.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12381	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.3.3	98	56	T	Y	98.559997558 59375	56	9.3.3.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	ESS Support should also based on other capabilities, e.g. Partial Bandwidth Extended Range.	Change the text per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:24:41Z) Rejected – The details on when the ESS is implemented are specified in subclause 11.24.7.5 (Planned ESS). This	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 524 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12382	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.3.6	99	4	T	Y	99.040000915 52734	4	9.3.3.6		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	TWT element can be in Association Request frame.	Change the table per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:25:28Z) Rejected – The TWT element is already present in the Association Request frame. Please refer to P801L21 of IEEE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12383	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.3.7	99	35	T	Y	99.349998474 1211	35	9.3.3.7		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	Change to "The TWT element is optionally present if dot11TWTOptionActivated is true, TWT element is not presented in the Association Request frame tha	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:26:18Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change accounting	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 17:13:03Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 525 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12384	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.3.7	99	63	T	Y	99.629997253 41797	63	9.3.3.7		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	ESS Support should also based on other capabilities, e.g. Partial Bandwidth Extended Range.	Change the text per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:27:12Z) Rejected – The details on when the ESS is implemented are specified in subclause 11.24.7.5 (Planned ESS). This	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12385	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.3.11	102	21	T	Y	102.20999908 447266	21	9.3.3.11		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	Broadcast TWT Support equal to 1 is the condition htat TWT in broadcast Probe Response.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:27:59Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changeaccounting	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 17:12:49Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 526 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12386	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.139	123	38	T	Y	123.37999725341797	38	9.4.2.139		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	This is not in line with subclause 27 about dynamic fragmentation.	harmonize this with subclause 27	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:36:50Z) Revised-Proposed resolution to harmonize the meaning of Fragmentation Support field in HE MAC Capabilities Info	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12387	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	125	34	T	Y	125.33999633789062	34	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The description in column TWT Wake Time field is not accurate. It should be the start time of	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:13:08Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12387, which are in genera	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12388	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	11	T	Y	97.11000061035156	11	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	"may" can't be in subcalause 9. Change "may" to can.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:09:44Z) make the change as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	Resolved with #12294		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 527 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12389	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.1.27	103	48	T	Y	103.48000033569336	48	9.4.1.27		A	Guoqing Li	720r2	642	change "...(Ack frames with the More Data bit in the Frame Control field equal to 1 and remain in the awake state" to "...Ack, BA frames with the More	As in comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:08:54Z) Acpet. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-17/720r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 19:49:29Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12390	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	18	T	Y	108.18000030517578	18	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	Sounding Dialog Token has no thing to do with RU.	Add the meaning of Sounding Dialog Token	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12391	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.6	119	33	T	Y	119.33000183105469	33	9.4.2.6		J			657	The first and second bullets are duplicate with 4th paragraph.	Remove the duplication	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12392	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.46	121	50	T	Y	121.5	50	9.4.2.46		J	Abhishek Patil	1857r2	470	"BSS Color Change Announcement" should be removed since it always be same as the related element in transmitted BSSID beacon.	Change the text per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:51:15Z) Reject The text in 9.4.2.46 already mentions that BSS Color Change Announcement is not included in the nontrans	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:48:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 528 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12393	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.139	123	3	T	Y	123.02999877929688	3	9.4.2.139		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	Change to "...as a transmitter or a recipient..."	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:19:35Z) Revised Agree in principle. Change it to “under the negotiation”. The following bullets provides the settings fo	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 21:55:17Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12394	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	125	44	T	Y	125.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Add "or Individual TWT announcement by TWT responder" under Description column	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:13:56Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12394, which are in genera	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 529 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12395	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	126	30	T	Y	126.30000030517578 1	30	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1983r6	508	The TWT Request is not needed since the TWT Command clearly tell whether the command is from requester/scheduled STA or rresponder/scheduling STA.	Make TWT Request reserved.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:14:41Z) Reject – the bit exists in the baseline with this interpretation, so if such a change were to be adopted, it wou	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:57:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12396	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	127	21	T	Y	127.20999908447266	21	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	In description column, make it clear when the TWT parameters other than TWT Wake Time are not satisfied, whether Accept can be responded.	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:15:27Z) Reject – the baseline language uses the phrase “that differs from”. By definition, if any of the parameters has	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 530 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12397	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	127	34	T	Y	127.33999633789062	34	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	TBTT negotiation is missing from description column	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:16:31Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12397	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12398	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	127	54	T	Y	127.54000091552734	54	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	TBTT negotiation is missing from description column	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:17:30Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12398	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12399	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	47	T	Y	128.47000122070312	47	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The following are not defined: TWT Wake Interval, TWT.	Coorect them.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:18:21Z) Reject – TWT is Target Wake Time and is defined in clause 3. TWT Wake Interval is defined in 9.4.2.200 TWT eleme	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12400	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	38	T	Y	128.38000048828125	38	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	You think Dictate TWT is N/A?	Add the description of it	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:19:11Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12400	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12401	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	43	T	Y	128.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	You think Reject TWT is N/A?	Add the description of it	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:19:57Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12401	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12402	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	33	T	Y	128.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Why is a scheduling AP not albe to provide alternate broadcast TWT parameters to a scheduled STA?	Add such usage in Description column	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:20:50Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12402	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12403	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	128	55	T	Y	128.55000305 17578	55	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Change "Trigger frame" in the paragraph to " Trigger or UMRS"	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:21:49Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12403	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12404	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	20	T	Y	129.19999694 82422	20	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	You didn't read 27.7.3.4 or the author who wrote 27.7.3.4 didn't read this sentence.	Remove the sentence or add in 27.7.3.4 about how to use TWT Flow Identifier	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:22:33Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12404, which removes the s	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12405	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	27	T	Y	129.27000427 246094	27	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The field name is misleading	Change the field name when Broadcast subfleid is 1 so that the field name correctly reflect the definition of the field in broadcast TWT.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:23:26Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12405	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 533 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12406	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	45	T	Y	129.44999969482422	45	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Can you find HE variant HT Control in 27.5.1?	Remove 27.5.1 (HE DL MU operation) since the related description is in 27.5.3.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:24:07Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12406, which removes the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12407	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	45	T	Y	129.44999969482422	45	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	BQR is missing	Add the subclause related BQR	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:25:08Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12407.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12408	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	130	14	T	Y	130.13999938964844	14	9.4.2.200		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	Combining sounding feedback with random RU makes the sounding protocol complicated	Remove the bullet related to sounding feedback.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:25:56Z) Reject – the AP is generally in charge of what responses will be elicited, so there is no need to make any rules	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12409	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	129	41	E	Y	129.41000366210938	41	9.4.2.200		A			447	Change HT TB NDP PPDUs to HE TB NDP PPDUs	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:40:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:40:43Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12410	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	130	44	T	Y	130.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	You can't indicate broadcast TWT in this case.	Removing "that indicates a broadcast TWT" from the sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:27:23Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12410.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 535 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12411	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	130	52	T	Y	130.52000427246094	52	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	change to "When transmitted by a TWT requesting STA or a TWT scheduled STA, the Target Wake Time field which is not in TWT element with TWT Setup Comm	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:28:13Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12411.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12412	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	130	58	T	Y	130.58000183 10547	58	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	A TWT scheduling AP will not transmit TWT element to TWT requesting STA.	Change the text to fix the issue in the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:29:00Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12412.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12413	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.200	130	61	T	Y	130.61000061035156	61	9.4.2.200		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1893r6	508	The TWT responding STA will not request TWT rscheduled STA to wake up.	Change the text to fix the issue in the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 07:29:41Z) Revise - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1893r6 that are marked with CID 12413.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12414	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	25	T	Y	134.25	25	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	Change to "Set to 2 for support for one dynamic fragment that is contained within an MPDU or S-MPDU..."	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:38:46Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 21:55:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12415	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	31	T	Y	134.30999755859375	31	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	Change to "Set to 3 for support for one dynamic fragment that is contained within an MPDU or S-MPDU..."	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:39:32Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12416	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	31	T	Y	134.30999755859375	31	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	IF a STA support dynamic fragmentation level 3, the STA shouldbe able to support dynamic fragmentation level 2. This help inter-op of dynamic fragment	Change per th comment or change the dynamic capabilities to a bitmap to allow a STA announce both level 2 and level 3.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:40:28Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. Supporting for up to 4 dyna	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 21:55:55Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12417	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	24	T	Y	136.24000549316406	24	9.4.2.237.2		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	Change to: If +HTC-HE Support is 1 in a non-AP STA: Set to 1 if the non-AP STA supports reception of the OM Control field. Set to 0 otherwise. Reserve	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:42:46Z) Revised. Make the changes as shown in 11-18-0035r5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:48:12Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12418	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	16	T	Y	137.16000366210938	16	9.4.2.237.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	Change to: For an AP, indicates support for receiving an MPDU that contains a BQR Control field. For a non-AP STA, indicates support for generating an	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12419	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	43	T	Y	137.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.237.2		J	Liwen Chu		657	A-MSDU in A-MPDU Support ahould be removed from the draft.	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 539 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12420	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	44	T	Y	141.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Change to "For an AP, indicates support for the MU MIMO reception.."	As in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:48:22Z) The comment is unclear. The current text description of “Full Bandwidth UL MU-MIMO” capability: “For an AP, ind	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:06:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12421	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	9	T	Y	144.08999633789062	9	9.4.2.237.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0660r1	610	This field is never used in other place.	Remove it or add normative behavior of it.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-22 23:07:13Z) - Agree in principle. The comment refers to the capability field SRP-based SR Support”. The proposed resolution	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 23:05:05Z- Modified sentence is deleted with #13157		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 540 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12422	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	12	E	Y	144.11999511 71875	12	9.4.2.237.3		V			447	either use Power Boost Factor +ar Support or Power Boost Factor Support through the draft	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:11:48Z) - Agree in principle. Minimize the use of variables in field names and call it "Power Boost Factor Support" thr	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:12:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12423	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	15	E	Y	144.14999389 648438	15	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	This subfield is set to 1 if the HE ER SU PPDU With 4x HE-LTF And 0.8 ++sGI subfield is 1. Per this sentence, the two subfields can be combined to o	Fixed the issue.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:53:27Z) HE ER SU PPDU is not tested as part of WFA 11ax wave-1. Hence, the HE ER SU PPDU is explicitly given a capabilit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions. There are two issues identified. The first is not necessarily true (if		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12424	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	34	E	Y	144.33999633 789062	34	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	This subfield is not used by other place in the draft.	Fixed the issue.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:53:39Z) This field is used in HE PHY Introduction (Section 28.1.1)	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions. Technical comment		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 541 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12425	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	145	41	T	Y	145.41000366210938	41	9.4.2.237.4		J	Ron Porat		657	This field is not harmonized with HE BW support capabilities.	Harmonize them.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12426	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.238	150	42	T	Y	150.41999816 89453	42	9.4.2.238		V	Abhishek Patil	365r1	536	BSS Color Disable should be used in IBSS etc. also.	Change the definition of the subfield according to the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:41:37Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Revised spec language in 9.4.2.238, 27.11.4 & 27.16.2.1 to cover IBSS, TDLS	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:54:26Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12427	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.241	153	3	T	Y	153.02999877929688	3	9.4.2.241		J	Abhishek Patil	365r1	536	It should not be the current TBTT when Beacon is used to transmit the element.	change to after the transmission of the Beacon that carries BSS Color Change Announcement element.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:43:39Z) Reject The Color Switch Countdown field is indicating the number of TBTT remaining before the BSS starts using	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:54:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 542 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12428	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.240	151	50	T	Y	151.5	50	9.4.2.240		J	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	It is better to allow an AP announce the new TXOP limit for MU EDCA since the AP may decrease the TXOP limit to give AP more chance for MU transmissio	As in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:33:44Z) current assumption is that MU EDCA parameters are used to lower probability to access the medium but once the med	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12429	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.243	156	43	T	Y	156.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.243		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	The definition of Non-SRG OBSS_PD SR Disallowed is just used for Tx control. However it seems the field is used for setting HE SIG-A also in clause 27	make two places consistent.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:19:19Z) agree with the commenter. Modify section 27.9.2.1 to include the condition in the general Non-SRG OBSS_PD operation	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:11:51Z - see #14312	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 543 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12430	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.4.2.245	159	19	E	Y	159.19000244140625	19	9.4.2.245		A			648	Change to "Recommended BSS Transition Threshold Within The ESS" to "Recommended BSS Transition Threshold Within ESS"	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:13:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:13:09Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12431	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.6.8.36	161	19	T	Y	161.19000244140625	19	9.6.8.36		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	379r2	552	The present of TWT element should also be decided by whether Broadcast TWT Support subfield.	Change the note according to the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:28:46Z) Revised -- Agree with the comment. The same issue was solved in the past F2F and the proposed change is the same	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 17:13:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12432	Liwen Chu	230	2	9.6.13	163	10	T	Y	163.10000610351562	10	9.6.13		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	660r1	610	TWT element should be able to be added to TDLS Setup frames	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:55:12Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution adds the TWT element in the TDLS Setup reques	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 23:10:22Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12433	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.3.2.4	181	30	T	Y	181.30000030517578	30	10.3.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang		657	change the bullet to " The RX VECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR is not equal to the BSS Color of the HEAP or The RX VECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR is not equal to	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12434	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.3.2.4	181	61	T	Y	181.61000061035156	61	10.3.2.4		A	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	"used for the most recent NAV update was received." in L61 and L62 should not be removed.	Change the sentence per the comment.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:40:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:47:42Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 545 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12435	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.3.4	185	30	T	Y	185.30000030517578	30	10.3.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	The MPDU with Normal Ack which his not correctly acknoeledged in a HE TB frame exchange can't be solicited through BAR or multi-TID BAR.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:19:09Z) 12435 Liwen Chu 185.30 The MPDU with Normal Ack which his not correctly acknoeledged in a HE TB frame exchange ca	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:00:48Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12436	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.9	190	61	T	Y	190.61000061035156	61	10.9		V	Frank Hsu	881r3	480	There is no normative behavior related to "dot11HEMCSFeedbackOptionImplemented". Remove it or add it in HE link adaptation subclause.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 19:57:38Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution completes relevant behaviors in the HLA subclause and MIB a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 546 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12437	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.9	190	62	T	Y	190.61999951171875	62	10.9		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	There is no normative behavior related to "dot11HEUPHControlActivated". Another observation is that UPH Control is mandatory feature. Remove it	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:22:07Z) Revised-Agree in principle. dot11HEUPHControlActivated is a control MIB variable. But, dot11HEControlFieldOpt	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12438	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.9	190	62	T	Y	190.61999951171875	62	10.9		J	Zhou Lan		657	There is no normative behavior related to "dot11HEBSRControlImplemented". Remove it or add it in HE BSR subclause.	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12439	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.9	191	36	T	Y	191.36000061035156	36	10.9		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	Change to "A value of 6 in the Control ID subfield when the transmitting STA follows the reverse direction protocol procedure as described in 10.28 (R	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:24:43Z) Revised-Agree in principle. The SRP procedure can use the CAS Contol field. TGax editor makes changes as show	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 547 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12440	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.9	191	50	T	Y	191.5	50	10.9		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	Change the sentence to "If there are more than one Control subfield in the A-Control subfield of QoS Data, QoS Null, or Management frames carried in	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:25:28Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Change the wording for more clarification. TGax editor makes changes as shown in t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12441	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.12	192	42	T	Y	192.41999816 89453	42	10.12		J	Liwen Chu		657	This is not necessary. Once the reeiver supports the ack-enabled (multi-TID)A-MPDU and the negotiated BA agreement allows A-MSDU in A-MPDU, A-MSDU ask	Delate the sentence	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12442	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.13.1	192	57	T	Y	192.57000732421875	57	10.13.1		V	Liwen Chu	792r1	597	Change to "When an A-MPDU contains multiple QoS Control fields, bits 4 of these QoS Control fields shall..."	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 17:40:09Z) Revised Discusion: 11axD2.3 already does the request change. No further change is needed.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12443	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.13.1	192	57	T	Y	192.57000732421875	57	10.13.1		J	Liwen Chu		657	Add the following text at the end of second paragraph "bits 5 to 6 of these QoS Control fields shall be identical across all MPDUs with equal value of	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12444	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.13.1	193	12	T	Y	193.11999511871875	12	10.13.1		A	Liwen Chu	792r1	597	change to "...in 9.4.2.237 (HE Capabilities element) for an HE PPDU."	As in comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 17:41:37Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 549 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12445	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.22.2.4	195	25	T	Y	195.25	25	10.22.2.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	9r0	486	Change to "During an EDCA TXOP, the Address 2 field excluding the Individual/Group bit of all control frames in an SU PPDU sent by a TXOP holder shall	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:08:51Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter since the AP can transmit an DL MU PPDU that contains A-MPDUs th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:55:02Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12446	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.22.2.7	197	52	T	Y	197.52000427246094	52	10.22.2.7		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0074r1	484	If HE NDPA and NDP is defined as a frame exchange, the following issues exist: 1, it contradict with the previous bullet. 2, if the following BRP Trig	Change to "-- an HE NDP Announcement frame followed after SIFS by an HE NDP where HE NDP is followed after SIFS by a BRP Trigger frame, and the BRP Tr	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:25:41Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0074r1 under CID 12446 The TG also approved a resolution to the CID (motion	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 23:55:57Z - Try to combine edits from 18/0074r1 and 18/0040r2	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12447	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.22.2.7	197	62	T	Y	197.61999511871875	62	10.22.2.7		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0074r1	484	the rules in this subclause can't be applied to HE DL MU without changes. 11ax defines additional rules.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:26:13Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0074r1 under CID 12447	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 550 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12448	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.22.2.8	199	1	T	Y	199.00999450683594	1	10.22.2.8		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	40r2	504	Add the following bullet "Any required response"	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:37:34Z) Rejected – This is already covered by bullet b) in P199L14: b) any required acknowledgments	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:01:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12449	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.22.2.8	200	5	T	Y	200.05000305 17578	5	10.22.2.8		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0040r2	504	the HE sounding is allowed in same TXOP. So change the last bullet to: Transmission of an HE NDP Announcement frame and NDP or transmission of an HE N	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:06:52Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change while merging the pro	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 551 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12450	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.22.2.9	200	51	T	Y	200.50999450683594	51	10.22.2.9		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0040r2	504	Two issues with the text: 1, this is not approprite normative behavior description. 2, When it applies to single-TID STA, additionalrequirement to NA	Change the text per the comment.	Originally resolved with motion 504: REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:08:10Z) - Agree in principle with the first issue of the comment (resolving it by	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 20:02:52Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12451	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.28.4	208	7	T	Y	208.07000732421875	7	10.28.4		J	Jarkko Kneckt		657	Add Trigger frame as the frames allowed by an HE RD responder.	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12452	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.43.1	209	20	T	Y	209.19999694 82422	20	10.43.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	337r1	546	these two commands (Alternate and Dictate) are not clear enough. Possible clrification is that Alternate means that other parameters can be accepted b	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:01:35Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution specifies that the set up is likely to be acce	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 552 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12453	Liwen Chu	230	2	10.43.1	209	50	T	Y	209.5	50	10.43.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0337r1	546	why the Dictate as the response of Demand and the Dictate as the response of Suggest are different. Make them same.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:02:56Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes. TGax edi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12454	Liwen Chu	230	2	11.2.3.6	212	44	T	Y	212.44000244140625	44	11.2.3.6		J	Guoqing Li		657	BlockAck frame includes Basic BlockAck, Compressed BlockAck, Multi-TID BlockAck, Multi-STA BlockAck. You should say compressed BlockAck and Multi-STA	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12455	Liwen Chu	230	2	11.24.2	214	62	T	Y	214.61999511 71875	62	11.24.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	41r1	505	IF the Event Type is BSS Color Collision, the log content of a STA is missing.	Add the related rules about log ocnt ent of BSS Color collision.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 06:44:33Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution provides the log rules for the cases when the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:06:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12456	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.2	222	55	T	Y	222.55000305 17578	55	27.2.2		V	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	The sentence is not well writen. MPDUs in an A-MPDU all belong to either intra-BSS or inter-BSS.	Rewirte the sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:42:29Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. The frame has been revised with PPDU. Hence, the sentence is no	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12457	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.2	222	51	T	Y	222.50999450 683594	51	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	the paragraph duplicate the paragraph in L45. remove one of them.	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 554 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12458	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.3	223	8	T	Y	223.08000018310547	8	27.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	So a frame with 2 address fields in MAC header can't be identified as SRG PPDU. The decision of two-address frame may be added like inter-BSS/intra-BS	As in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:12:30Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12458	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12459	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.2	222	21	T	Y	222.21000671 38672	21	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	The PPDU with RXVECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR being 0 should not be identify as intra-BSS PPDU.	Change the text per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:44:12Z) Rejected – The classification is there to have conservative behavior. The STA can still decode the MAC header t	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12460	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.4	224	21	T	Y	224.21000671 38672	21	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang		657	A TXOP holder may receive intra-BSS HE PPDU, e.g. when the STA is doing backoff recovery wthin a TXOP.	Change the text per the comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 555 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12461	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	31	T	Y	227.30999755859375	31	27.2.5.3		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	The paragraph should be removed since the Power Management field addressed to AP is always ignored. See P1999 L45 in 11md D0.3 "NOTE 2--The Power Mang	As in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:32:19Z) We note that the cited texts by the commenter only specifies that the power management bit is ignored in the CTS	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12462	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.2.6	229	13	T	Y	229.13000488 28125	13	27.2.6		J	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	It seems the sentence can be removed.	Remove it.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:34:29Z) this is a recommendation to raise awareness of the issue for P2P traffic.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12463	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3	229	28	T	Y	229.27999877929688	28	27.3		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	The negotiated fragment level and the fragment level annoucned by the capabilities have different meaning.	The text should be clear on it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:12:26Z) Revised- Agree with comment in principle. Proposed resolution to harmonize them. TGax editor please make the ch	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:07:15Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 556 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12464	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	16	T	Y	230.16000366210938	16	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	Level 3 is also based on order of every 4 continuous fragments starting from 0.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:25:14Z) Revised-Disagree with the comment. Level 3 does not have this restriction and the fragments sent under level 3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:55:57Z - No instructions associated with this resolution, however, I assume the intent was to apply the edits tagged #CID 12464	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12465	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	38	T	Y	230.38000488 28125	38	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	Even if the first bullet is true, you can't sany that the fragment is clearly failed.	Change the text per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:30:59Z) Revised-Disagree with comment, this bullet is true and can be used to identify if a fragments is explicitly fai	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:03:18Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 557 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12466	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	9	T	Y	231.08999633789062	9	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	using fragment level 2 for a MDU under no BA agreement is not possible.	Remove "and Level 2" from the sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:12:01Z) Revised-Agree in principle. The STA with HE Fragmentation Support subfield in the HE MAC Capabilities Informati	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12467	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	9	T	Y	230.08999633789062	9	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	The behavior of "Maximum Number of Fragment" is not defined for TX.	Add the normative behavior	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:22:55Z) Revised-Agree with comment in principle. Proposed resolution to add it. TGax editor please make the changes as	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:58:52Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 558 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12468	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	9	T	Y	231.08999633789062	9	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Change to "The HE Fragmentation Support field in the HE Capabilities element received from the STA is 2 or 3"	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:13:15Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change and make interoperability amo	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12469	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	32	T	Y	231.32000732421875	32	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	What does "if supported by the recipient" mean in the sentence? Level 2 means the recipient support it.	Remove "if supported by the recipient" from the sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 16:57:23Z) Revised- " if supported by the recipient" is aim for "A-MSDU" because it has another capability, Put a bracket to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 559 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12470	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	45	T	Y	231.44999694 82422	45	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	using fragment level 3 for a MDU under no BA agreement is not possible.	Remove "and Level 3" from the sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:00:45Z) Revised- Agree in principle. The STA with HE Fragmentation Support subfield in the HE MAC Capabilities Informati	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12471	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	62	T	Y	231.61999511 71875	62	27.3.2.4		J	Ming Gan	433r1	544	In level 3's BA bitmap, 1 per MSDU is never allowed.	Remove "if at least one MPDU's Fragment Number field is of nonzero value that solicits the immediate response in the received AMPDU, otherwise 1 bit p	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:02:35Z) Rejected- During the BA section, when all MPDUs in the received A-MPDU are of zero fragment number value, 1 bit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 560 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12472	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.4	232	1	T	Y	232.00999450683594	1	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	An originator STA can't transmit to a recipient STA just based on the value 3 in the HE Fragmentation Support field of the recipient per level 3 fragm	Change the sentence per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:06:40Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12473	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.2.4	232	18	T	Y	232.17999267578125	18	27.3.2.4		J	Ming Gan	433r1	544	When a MSDU/A-MSDU has fragments more than 4, the following condition is not enough:the Sequence Number subfields does not exceed BL/4, where BL is th	Change the sentence per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:09:04Z) Rejected- The comment failed to provide the reason why the related condition is not enough. So far, the conditi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 20:03:35Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 561 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12474	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.3.1	233	6	T	Y	233.05999755859375	6	27.3.3.1		J	Ming Gan	764r1	601	This paragraph is not in line with the fragmentation level definition	Harmonize them.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:21:15Z) Rejected- The cited sentence allows the receiver to choose the lower level than that in received ADDBA request	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12475	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.3.3	233	29	T	Y	233.28999328061328	29	27.3.3.3		J	Ming Gan	764r1	601	Ack is also possible as defined in 27.4. The comment can also be applied to other subclauses of fragmentation.	Change the sentence per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:27:58Z) Rejected- Although 27.4 section contains All-Ack, Pre-Association acknowledgment and Acknowledgment for single	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 562 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12476	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.3.2	233	17	T	Y	233.16999816 89453	17	27.3.3.2		J	Ming Gan	764r1	601	Ack is also possible as defined in 27.4.The comment can also be applied to other subclauses of fragmentation.	Change the sentence per the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:26:13Z) Rejected- Although 27.4 section contains All-Ack, Pre-Association acknowledgment and Acknowledgment for single	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12477	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.3.3.3	233	36	T	Y	233.36000061 035156	36	27.3.3.3		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	BockAck includes Multi-STA BA. Ciarify what exactly Block Ack is. The comment can also be applied to other subclauses of fragmentation.	Change the sentence per the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:29:31Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 563 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12478	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.1	235	17	T	Y	235.16999816 89453	17	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Change the sentnece to " An HE AP that sends a Multi-STA BlockAck frame where the Per AID TID Info fields are all addressed to a single recipient STA	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:19:06Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:39:52Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12479	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.1	236	9	T	Y	236.08999633 789062	9	27.4.1		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This paragraph is not in line with the multi-TID A-MPDU rules.	Fix the issue.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:19:50Z) Rejected - Commentor doesn't identify the discrepancy. The text seems to be inline with the multi-TID AMPDU rul	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 564 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12480	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.2	236	32	T	Y	236.32000732421875	32	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	717r1	625	All Ack is not allowed in HE SU/MU PPDU scenario 27.4.4.	Harmonize them.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:22:26Z) Revised - Agree with the comment. However it is already addressed in D2.3. So, no further change is needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:02:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12481	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.2	237	7	T	Y	237.07000732421875	7	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	One MPDU with EoF of MPDU delimiter equal to 1 doesn't need mulple Per AID TID Info fields with Ack Type equal to1.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:20:30Z) 12481 Liwen Chu 237.07 One MPDU with EoF of MPDU delimiter equal to 1 doesn't need mulple Per AID TID Info fields	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 565 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12482	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.2	237	16	T	Y	237.16000366210938	16	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Management frame can also be sent by devices other than unassociated STA, e.g. DisAssociation by AP.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:21:13Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12483	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.2	237	23	T	Y	237.22999572753906	23	27.4.2		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	the multiple Per AID TID Info fields for same AID shall be put together without Per AID TID Info with othe AID value in between	Add the restriction mentioned in the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:22:03Z) Rejected - The restriction looks artificial	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12484	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.3	238	27	T	Y	238.27000427246094	27	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This neds to be a shall statement.with this change the note in L58 is not needed	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:22:44Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:25:57Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 566 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12485	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.3	238	46	T	Y	238.46000067138672	46	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	BlockAckBitmap is undefined. "where the Bitmap Length is the largest value for the BlockAckBitmap that is supported by the recipient" is problematic s	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:23:21Z) Revised - Typo, BlockAckBitmap to BlockAck Bitmap, which is defined TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:16:32Z - Using an undefined capitalized term (BlockAck Bitmap or BlockAck Bitmap). Rephrase as " the largest Block Ack Bitmap fiel	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12486	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	21	T	Y	240.21000067138672	21	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Managemenrt frame is missing from the bullet	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:16:19Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:49:48Z- Modified text removed with #12852		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 567 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12487	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	26	T	Y	240.25999450683594	26	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	the bullet is not in line with the all Ack context definition in 27.4.2..	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:17:14Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12488	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	34	T	Y	240.33999633789062	34	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	QoS Null in multi-TID A-MPDU can't request Ack.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:18:19Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12489	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	28	T	Y	241.27999877929688	28	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"Group Addressed Multi-STA BlockAck In DL MU Support in DL MU Support subfield" What are you talking about? Change it to the correct subfield name.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:18:59Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12490	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	5	T	Y	241.05000305 17578	5	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	554r0	578	Broadcast M-BA in multiple broadcast Rus should be mandatory for virtual APs defiend by Multi-BSS element.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 22:42:28Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The case for broadcast M-BA is missing. Further, spec doesn't need a bit in HE C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:46:39Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 569 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12491	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.4.5	241	51	T	Y	241.50999450683594	51	27.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This is not in line with all Ack context.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:24:02Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12492	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.2	243	10	T	Y	243.10000610351562	10	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Wrong subfield name	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 06:27:17Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 12492	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:48:45Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12493	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.2	243	17	T	Y	243.16999816 89453	17	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	Dulicate with 1st paragraph. Remove one of them	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:08:02Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 12493	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 570 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12494	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.2	243	30	T	Y	243.30 000305 17578	30	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/0 53r2	498	BQR can't be in any frame.	Change to in QoS Data, QoS Null, Management frame.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:12:20Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 12494	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:36:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12495	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.2	243	33	T	Y	243.33 000183 10547	33	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/0 53r2	498	Duplicate with L14. Remove one of them	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:13:00Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 12495	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12496	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.2	243	52	T	Y	243.52 000427 246094	52	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	Add the following text at the end of the sentence: and the STA wants to report the channel available information	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 571 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12497	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.2	243	60	T	Y	243.60 000610 351562	60	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	CS Required for BQRP and the solicited acknowledge contradict with each other. Solution: BQRP's CS required can be 0, however the idle channel report	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12498	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	245	22	T	Y	245.22 000122 070312	22	27.5.3.2		J	George Cherian	717r1	635	All Ack context is missing if referd to clause 10	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:23:40Z) Rejected - All Ack is part of the M-BA that is already covered	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:07:23Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12499	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	246	24	T	Y	246.24 000549 316406	24	27.5.3.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	MinTrigProcTime is not defined.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:52:43Z) Agree with the comment that the reference to definition was not clearly specified in this section. Doc 11-18/369h	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:16:44Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 572 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12500	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	246	58	T	Y	246.58000183 10547	58	27.5.3.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	When UMRS and Trigger in same PPDU, TX Power and TB PPDU Length in UMRS and related fields in Trigger are missing.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:27:20Z) D2.3 P277 L7 addresses this. TGax editor: No further changes are needed	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:02:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12501	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	246	65	T	Y	246.64999389 648438	65	27.5.3.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	contradict with Spatial Reuse field setting rules in spatial reuse subclause: only when AP allows it through Spatial Reuse Parameter element, this val	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12502	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	247	1	E	Y	247.00999450 683594	1	27.5.3.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	HE_LTF_TYPE values are not right. Use the correct ones.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. Would also benefit from some rewording.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12503	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	247	4	T	Y	247.03999328 61328	4	27.5.3.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	this is not necessary: Trigger may solicit QoS Null.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:26:38Z) The bullet cited by the comment is no longer present in D2.3. TGax editor: No further changes are needed	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:02:44Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12504	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	247	27	T	Y	247.27000427 246094	27	27.5.3.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	the Use Info fields with 2046 in AID12 shall appear after the User Info fields with AID12 values other than 2046 and before User Info fields with 4095	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:53:54Z) Agree with the comment. The proposed change was added as a resolution to CIDs 12226 and 13716 and appears in D2.2	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:17:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 574 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12505	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	248	13	T	Y	248.13000488 28125	13	27.5.3.2		V	Jing Ma	11-18/0429r0	562	if the Trigger solicits the first responding frames in the TXOP. Otherwise PIFS or backoff recovery is applied.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:57:10Z) Discussion: generally agree with the commenter. Subclause 27.5.3.2.4 is rewritten per CID 13916 and PIFS recovery	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12506	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.2	248	18	T	Y	248.17999267 578125	18	27.5.3.2		V	Jing Ma	11-18/0429r0	562	primary AC is defined when the backoff is successful. Trigger frame transmission can be transmitted in an A-MPDU with any primary AC.	Change to "the primary AC rules are applied"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:57:47Z) Discussion: generally agree with the commenter. Subclause 27.5.3.2.4 is rewritten per CID 13916 and the rules in s	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 575 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12507	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.3.3	250	14	T	Y	250.13999938964844	14	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0367r1	540	"Transmit Power Control" is undefined.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:42:53Z) Agree with the comment. The text in the bullet is not related to TPC procedure. Removed reference to Transmit Powe	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:01:41Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12508	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.4	268	48	T	Y	268.48001098 63281	48	27.6.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0078r4	557	It should be 11454 instead of HE beamformer's maximum MPDU length capability.	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:20:21Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0078r4 under CID 12508	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:04:43Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12509	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.4	256	45	T	Y	256.45001220703125	45	27.5.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	UMRS can't be used in MU cascade if there is no Trigger in DL MU.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:47:55Z) Make changes as in doc 11-18/0707r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12510	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.5.4	256	1	T	Y	256.01000976 5625	1	27.5.4		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	A MU cascade exchange in a TXOP can be starting with Trigger + UL MU + DL MU...	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:45:47Z) This has been discussed in the previous contribution 11-16/1457r3. Trigger+UL MU is a typical UL MU transmission.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 16:47:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12511	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.2	263	50	T	Y	263.5	50	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	570	it should be described per STA's BW capability.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:34:05Z) In the context of the sounding protocol, the “bandwidth” in Bandwidth STS <= 80 MHz and Bandwidth STS > 80 M	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 577 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12512	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.2	264	9	T	Y	264.08999633 78906	9	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0042r1	496	the name " Triggered MU Beamforming Feedback" should be changed to reflect partial BW sounding.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:09:05Z) Agree with the comment. TGax Editor: Replace “Triggered MU Beamforming Feedback” with “Triggered MU Beamforming P	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 22:57:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12513	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.3	264	41	T	Y	264.41000366 21094	41	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	The parameters of SU sounding is decided by beamforme e.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:45:23Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 12513.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12514	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.3	264	45	E	Y	264.45001220 703125	45	27.6.3		A			447	change to 27.6.2	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:33:22Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:33:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 578 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12515	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.3	264	30	T	Y	264.29998779296875	30	27.6.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	TB based sounding is in one TXOP. The SU sounding is not clearly say this. Make SU sounding clear that the sounding feedback is in one TXOP.	As in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:45:54Z) We have multiple instances that mention that the sounding sequences are within the same TXOP. As such there is no	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12516	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.6.3	267	5	T	Y	267.04998779296875	5	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Partial BW Info should also be reserved since full BW sounding is always required for SU sounding.	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:46:27Z) Agree in principle. Added the Partial BW Info subfield as part of the fields that are ignored by the STA that is t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 579 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12517	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.2	272	8	T	Y	272.07998657 22656	8	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	Add that the STA is recommanded to join the broadcast TWT	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:15:45Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. Incorporated the suggested change. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12518	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.2	272	8	T	Y	272.07998657 22656	8	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	Why can't Suggest, Demand TWT be used like Request TWT	Clarify it	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:16:25Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to specify that this command can be sent in response to Sug	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 580 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12519	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.2	272	8	T	Y	272.07998657 22656	8	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	contradict with Broadcast vs Wake TBTT Negotiation Table. Broadcast=1, Wake TBTT Negotiation =0 is in broadcast frame.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:17:29Z) Revised – Proposed resolution clarifies that the Negotiation Type is 3 (which is not the one that would conflict	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12520	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.2	272	30	T	Y	272.29998779 296875	30	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	Contradict with the Table name	Fix the table name or move the row to another table.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:18:24Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution proposes a name for the Table that reflects the intended u	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 581 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12521	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.2	272	45	T	Y	272.45001220703125	45	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	661r2	611	TWT response in association response should be allowed also.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 01:19:11Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. The “frame” is causing the issue since it gives the impression th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12522	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.2	279	1	T	Y	279.01000976 5625	1	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	Condition parts of Alternae TWT and Reject TWT don't consider persistent field.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:06:14Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies the relation with the persistence f	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:50:26Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 582 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12523	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	42	T	Y	279.42001342 77344	42	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	what if the TWT STA is also individual TWT requesting STA	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:57:37Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution is to clarifiy that the STA can transmit fram	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12524	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	43	T	Y	279.42999267 578125	43	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	"...within trigger-enabled TWT SPs." Make it clear that if not scheduled, the STA should not transmit ... in Trigger-enabled TWT SPs.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:58:20Z) Revised – The STA should not transmit frames especially if it was not scheduled to transmit during that TWT SP.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 583 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12525	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	50	T	Y	279.5	50	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	The combination of Demand TWT and Alternate TWT is allowed by individual TWT negotiation. Why it is disallowed by broadcast TWT negotiation?	Allow it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:59:10Z) Revised – The intention is to limit the possible combinations. In this case proposal is to simply allow Alternat	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12526	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	16	T	Y	281.16000366 21094	16	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	It is allowed by scheduling AP.	Allow it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:59:57Z) Revised – Agree with comment. Accounted for the suggested change. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 584 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12527	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	19	T	Y	281.19000244140625	19	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	It is allowed by scheduling AP.	Allow it.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:00:44Z) Revised – Agree with comment. Accounted for the suggested change. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12528	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	46	T	Y	282.45999145 50781	46	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	ontradict with all other fields are reserved.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:55:11Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that the Nominal Minimum TWT Wake D	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 585 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12529	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	50	T	Y	282.5	50	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	add an indication field or use reject commend to do the teardown.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:56:15Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12530	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.4	283	1	T	Y	283.01000976 5625	1	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	The table should clarify the difference between Demand and Suggest TWT.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:16:11Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 586 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12531	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	59	T	Y	282.58999633 78906	59	27.7.3.4		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	TWT Information frame is not applicable to broadcast TWT.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:40:12Z) Rejected – This CID is related to subclause 27.7.4. The TWT Information frame is applicable to broadcast TWT.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12532	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.2	315	5	T	Y	315.04998779 296875	5	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	This is not true for HE MU PPDU in TDLS link.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:47:43Z) Revised—Agree in principle with te comment. Proposed resolution clarifies this aspect, following the suggestion	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 587 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12533	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	The mentioed capability bits have nothing to do with 242-tone ER SU	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:48:25Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12534	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.3	316	6	T	Y	316.05999755 859375	6	27.15.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	it is not clear about how to figure out as such.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:52:26Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Not that it is not clear how to figure out as such but perhaps we	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 00:40:08Z - The resolution creates cumbersome text where the causality is not clear. Reword, combining the first and second sentenc	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 588 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12535	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.3	316	26	T	Y	316.26000976 5625	26	27.15.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	L16 and L26 paragraphes define similar things.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:53:24Z) Rejected – The two paragraph define substantially different rules. The paragraph starting in L16 defines the ch	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12536	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.3	316	35	T	Y	316.35000610 35156	35	27.15.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	"DCM Rx subfield" is not defined.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:54:14Z) Revised – Agree with comment. Names keep changing from one draft to another. Proposed resolution is to keep fol l	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 16:49:57Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12537	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.3	316	34	T	Y	316.33999633 78906	34	27.15.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	This parageaph is not needed since the general rule about a PPDU format shall not be sent to s receiver if the receiver doesn't support it	Remove the sentence.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:55:04Z) Rejected – The paragraph defines the optionality of transmitting a PPDU with DCM to another STA if the other ST	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12538	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.4.2	284	9	T	Y	284.08999633 78906	9	27.7.4.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	The behavior of TWT requesting STA sending TWT Information is undefined. Also it is dangeous for a TWT requesting STA to send TWT Information with new	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:42:07Z) Revised – The behavior defined in this subclause is also for the TWT requesting STA. Please refer to the descrip	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 21:15:54Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 590 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12539	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.7.5	285	41	T	Y	285.41000366 21094	41	27.7.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	370r2	548	"Idenfitied by TWT requesting STA" TWT requesting STA itself can't identify a TWT SP start time. TWT flow ID has to be used.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:18:08Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies further this aspect by specifying h	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12540	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	27	T	Y	294.26998901 36719	27	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	the notes are too weak. Transferring them to normative requirement.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:08:23Z) this is a note because the normative text above covers these conditions. These notes are just to clarify the norma	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 591 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12541	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	8	T	Y	291.07998657 22656	8	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	I assume that AP also follows trhe same rules.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:28:20Z) this is covered in 27.2.3 and doc 26rx is covering the rules for AP and non-AP STAs. Apply the changes as in doc 18	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12542	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.9.2.4	303	1	T	Y	303.01000976 5625	1	27.9.2.4		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Add the rule that the AIFS rule still needs to be respected.	As in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:14:34Z) AIFS does not need to be explicitly mentioned because it is implicit when naming the “EDCAF” which is always gated	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12543	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.9.4	299	8	T	Y	299.07998657 22656	8	27.9.4		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	a value of negative infinity for the OBSS_Pdlevel contradicts with	As in comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:24:30Z) - the reader has failed to notice the additional qualifier of “as it applies to this PPDU”	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12544	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.9.4	298	53	T	Y	298.52999877 92969	53	27.9.4		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"positive infinity or lower" change "positive infinity or lower" to "positive or higher"??? This contradict with the further detecting DSRP frame dur	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:22:31Z) - the reader has failed to notice the additional qualifier of “as it applies to this PPDU”	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12545	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.11.6	307	36	T	Y	307.35998535 15625	36	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	why OBSS PD is excluded?	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:25:33Z) - the condition is HESRP implemented, so this only relates to the SRP case.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 593 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12546	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.11.6	307	39	T	Y	307.39 00146484375	39	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	HE MU, HE SU have no array of four values?	Clarify it	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:26:07Z) - see the definition of the HE-SIGA for each of the HE PPDU types.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12547	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.11.6	308	1	T	Y	308.01 0009765625	1	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	even if the SRP Disallowed announced by the AP is 0???	Clarify it	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:02:31Z) - yes, the AP is free to do what it desires, despite any instructions it might have given to the associated STAs.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12548	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.16.2.1	321	38	T	Y	321.38 00048828125	38	27.16.2.1		V	Abhishek Patil	365r1	536	Change shall to may or add other condition for shall	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:47:35Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Clarified spec language to say that it is conditionally mandatory (i.e., whence	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:54:12Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 594 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12549	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.11.6	308	39	T	Y	308.39001464 84375	39	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	ontradict with L34. Contradict with FTM, NDP, NDPA setting rules in L7, L11. SR Disallowed is undefined.	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:05:22Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 12549	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12550	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.11.6	309	56	T	Y	309.55999755 859375	56	27.11.6		J	Frank Hsu		657	the rules about how to select valid MCS, NSS are missing. Resolution could be referring to Supported TX HE-MCS, NSS set	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12551	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.11.6	310	38	T	Y	310.38000488 28125	38	27.11.6		J	Frank Hsu		657	This is not needed.	Remove the bullet	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 595 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12552	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.14.1	311	44	T	Y	311.44 000244 140625	44	27.14.1		J	Guoqing Li	365r1	536	"and the BSS Color Disabled subfield is 0 in the most recently received HE Operation element from the AP to which it is associated" This can be remov	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:46:27Z) Reject When BSS Color is disabled Intra-PPDU power save and other features related to color should be disabled.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:55:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12553	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58 999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	The capbility bits are not related to 242 ER SU	Remove the sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:49:52Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12554	Liwen Chu	230	2	27.15.2	315	5	T	Y	315.04 998779 296875	5	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	This is not true for TDLS	Fix the issue mentioned in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:50:34Z) Revised—Agree in principle with te comment. Proposed resolution clarifies this aspect, following the suggestion	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12555	Lochan Verma	230	2	9.4.2.237	144	45	T	Y	144.44 999694 82422	45	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Field name "20 MHz In 160/80+80 MHz HE PPDU" can be improved	As in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:54:17Z) The commenter did not provide any suggestion. Current field name is appropriate.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12556	Lochan Verma	230	2	9.4.2.237	144	53	T	Y	144.52 999877 929688	53	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Field name "80 MHz In 160/80+80 MHz HE PPDU" can be improved	As in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:55:03Z) The commenter did not provide any suggestion. Current field name is appropriate.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 597 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12557	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.3.5	367	27	T	Y	367.26998901 36719	27	28.3.3.5		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	52-tone RU 5 and 12 of the lower 80 MHz or upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 and 160 MHz HE TB PPDU is missing	Add "52-tone RU 5 and 12 of the lower 80 MHz or upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz and 160 MHz HE TB PPDU"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:58:26Z) - Commenter is correct that RU restriction on UL OFDMA portion is omited by mistake, so it is required to add	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12558	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.3.5	367	44	T	Y	367.44000244 140625	44	28.3.3.5		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	20 MHz-only devices operate in P20 channel. In that case why we need "All" in the following sentence "It is optional whether all 242-tone RUs of non-A	Delete "All" from the sentence	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:33:36Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12558 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:17:10Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 598 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12559	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	428	34	T	Y	428.33999633 78906	34	28.3.10.8.5		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0755r1	582	2x996-Tone RU with no User fields in the HE-SIG-B content channel containing this RU allocation subfield' is missing in Table 28-24. Without it, sign a	Create am entry in the RU allocation table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:23:37Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:20:07Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12560	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.1.1	327	10	T	Y	327.10000061035156	10	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma		657	According to 11ax PAR, the 11ax PHY shall support operation in 6 GHz frequency band, in addition to the unlicensed 2.4/5 GHz bands. However, the D2.0	As in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:34Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12561	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.12	477	1	T	Y	477.01000976 5625	1	28.3.12		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	The text can be made more readable by use of brackets. E.g., T_PE,nominal=max_u(T_PE,nominal,u)	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:37:59Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12561 and 12872 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:33Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 599 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12562	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.20	509	40	T	Y	509.39999938964844	40	28.3.20		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	RSSI is also measured over HE Training Symbols and indicated by PHY to MAC. It is not shown in Fig.28-57. (Please refer to Fig. 28-56, second 'measure	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:18:35Z) Sloved in 11395	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:41:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12563	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.20	510	10	T	Y	510.10000610035156	10	28.3.20		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	RSSI is also measured over HE Training Symbols and indicated by PHY to MAC. It is not shown in Fig.28-58. (Please refer to Fig. 28-56, second 'measure	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:18:48Z) Sloved in 11395	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:42:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12564	Lochan Verma	230	2	Annex B	565	21	T	Y	565.21 00219726562	21	B		A	Edward Au	18/0763r1	645	For an HE operation with 20 MHz only (CFHE20) the support of LDPC with more than 4 spatial streams is Mandatory and not Optional. Also 1024 QAM + LDPC	Change CFHE20:O to CFHE20:M	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:07:10Z) - TGax Editor: Change CFHE:M to CFHE:O in 621.21 of P802.11ax D2.3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:08:46Z - instruction in resolution is wrong. Implemented proposed change	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12565	Lochan Verma	230	2	28.3.10.8	428	28	T	Y	428.27 99987792969	28	28.3.10.8		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	When '242-tone Empty' is signaled by RU Allocation Table in the Common Field of HE-SIG-B, no User field is present corresponding to this RU Allocation	As in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:45:20Z) “242-tone Empty” indicates no transmission signal in this 242-tone RU in case of HE MU preamble puncturing.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12566	Mark Hamilton	230	2	9.4.2.242.2	154	56	T	Y	154.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.242.2		V	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	What does it mean that the "HE STA supporting it can transmit frames"? This is completely unclear. From 9.4.2.242.3, it seems this identifier indica	Change the explanatory text (second sentence of the similar paragraph) in 9.4.2.242.3 to, "The Service Specific Identifier field indicates a peer-to-p	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:29:19Z) Revised: Accept the suggestion with minor updates. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	returned		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:12:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12567	Mark Hamilton	230	2	9.4.2.242.2	154	57	T	Y	154.57000732421875	57	9.4.2.242.2		J	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	These identifiers are assigned where (in what body/process)? They need to be globally unique, to avoid collision between peer-to-peer operations defi	If this is intended to be assigned by ANA, then change the language to "assigned _to_ the operation" instead of assigned _by_ the operation. If it is	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:30:07Z) Rejected: The definition of the Service Specific Identifier is not in the scope of IEEE specification. The spec	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 602 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12568	Mark Hamilton	230	2	9.4.2.232.1	154	1	T	Y	154.00999450683594	1	9.4.2.232.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	443r3	534	"The first two-bits defines the value and are referred to as Quiet Time Period Subtype field. The remaining 6 bits are reserved." There is no clear de	Delete the cited sentences. This leaves the Control field as a simple 1 octet field, with the values shown in 9-262ae.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:25:36Z) Rejected: The table follows the convention in the specification.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12569	Mark Hamilton	230	2	28.3.11.2	453	41	E	Y	453.41000366621094	41	28.3.11.2		J			648	Multiplication has an agreed convention, with a more easily read glyph.	Replace (dot) with multiplication glyph ("x"-like), throughout the draft.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:09:58Z) dot is just as good	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:10:08Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12570	Mark Hamilton	230	2	9.3.1.23	93	13	E	Y	93.129997253 41797	13	9.3.1.23		J			447	I think this equation is indicating multiplication by adjacent terms (?)	Insert multiplication glyph ("x"-like) in equations which multiplication is implied by adjacent terms, throughout the draft.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:22:27Z) - There is significant precendent in 802.11 for no multiplication sign between multiplied terms.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:23:00Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 603 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12571	Mark Hamilton	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	64	E	Y	92.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.23		V			447	Proper wording	Replace "to prepare a response SIFS after" with " to prepare a response within a SIFS after"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:19:14Z) - "...to prepare a response for transmission a SIFS after the frame is received" The time used in preparation i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:20:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12572	Mark Hamilton	230	2	27.2.4	223	30	T	Y	223.30000030517578	30	27.2.4		V	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	Use normative verbs. Is this really an example, or is the prescribed behavior?	Delete " For example". Change "can" to "shall" on lines 31 and 34.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:52:25Z) Revised – The description of the paragraph is an example. We revised the workding by removing “can” and “will”.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:40:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 604 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12573	Mark Hamilton	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	38	E	Y	231.38000488 28125	38	27.3.2.3		V			447	Use normative verbs.	Change "can" to "might" or "may" (or "shall"?)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:15:18Z) - Move the sub-bullet to on this and the previous bullet to a NOTE: "NOTE—The originator STA follows the rules	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1				I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:16:21Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12574	Mark Hamilton	230	2	27.4.2	237	34	E	Y	237.33999633 789062	34	27.4.2		V	George Cherian		635	Use normative verbs.	Change "can" to "may"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:52:42Z) - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0717-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0		Agree, but it is not clear what a variable bitmap length is and what it would mean to include such a beast.	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:53:01Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12575	Mark RISON	230	2				G	Y					J	Osama Aboul-Magd		657	All the comments "resolved" as "REJECTED in the interest of releasing D2.0" or similar (about 500 of them!) were not in fact resolved	Resolve all D1.0 comments that were not resolved	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 605 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12576	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J	Liwen Chu		657	"single MPDU" is confusing (it's not clear whether it means "S-MPDU" or whether it means "one MPDU")	Change "a single MPDU" to "the MPDU" in 9.3.1.9.7, to "exactly one MPDU" in 10.22.2.8 (2x). Change "single MPDUs (i.e., MPDU in an A-MPDU subframe wi	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12577	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	Y	81.45999908447266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	If the ACK Type subfield is 0 and the TID value of the Per AID TID Info subfield is 15, then the Block Ack Starting Sequence Control, 2 octets reser	At 81.46 change "If" to "If the AID11 subfield is 2045,". At 81.50 add a para "The remainder of this subclause only applies to the case where the AID	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:12:11Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. By deleting the cited paragraph, it is n	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12578	Mark RISON	230	2	28.1.1	329	20	T	Y	329.20001220703125	20	28.1.1		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	It is not clear that HEAPs shall support (at least) 2SS	At the end of the list "An HEAP shall support the following features:" add "Transmission and reception of PPDUs with two spatial streams"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:53:55Z) There are mobile AP that don't need to support 2SS. That decision is best left to WFA	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:20:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12579	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	410	17	T	Y	410.17 00134277344	17	28.3.10.7.2		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	"Set to 7 for preamble puncturing in 160 MHz or 80+80 MHz, where in the primary 80 MHz of the preamble the primary 40 MHz is present." -- huh? This i	Change the cited text to "The value 7 is reserved."	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:58:20Z) the presence/absence of 20 MHz sub-channels in the secondary 40 MHz is indicated in the HE-SIG-B content channel	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12580	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	424	54	T	Y	424.54 00085449219	54	28.3.10.8.3		V	Youhan	11-18/0934r1	596	It should be made clear that when preamble puncturing is used no RU is allocated in "punctured" subchannels so that the data is also "punctured" too	At the end of the referenced subclause add a para " When preamble puncturing is present, no RU shall be allocated that overlaps with any 20 MHz sub-cha	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:35:41Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11418, 12580, 12796 and 13764 in 11-18/0934r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 607 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12581	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.1	320	27	T	Y	320.26998901 36719	27	27.16.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	338r2	547	"An 80 MHz, 160 MHz or 80+80 MHz HE DL MU PPDU with preamble puncture may be transmitted if either the primary 20 MHz or the pr	Changed cited text to "An 80 MHz, 160 MHz or 80+80 MHz DL HE MU PPDU with preamble puncturing may be transmitted if permitted by the rules, as if t	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:10:50Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Accounted for the suggestions. TGax editor to make the changes s	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 20:35:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12582	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.14.3	481	61	T	Y	481.60998535 15625	61	28.3.14.3		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	The first para of 17.3.9.10 Pre-correction accuracy requirements is inconsistent with the penultimate non-NOTE para of 28.3.14.3 Pre-correction accura	Put these paras in the same subclause (suggest 28.3.14.3), state that one is for transmissions that solicit a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU (e.g. MU	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:33:07Z) The Pre-correction accuracy requirements for non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU should be different from the requir	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:01:16Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 608 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12583	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	37	T	Y	81.370027465820 3	37	9.3.1.9.7		A	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"an Action frame carried in an A-MPDU, or PS-Poll frame in an S-MPDU that solicits an immediate acknowledgment" -- Action and PS-Poll frames always so	Delete " that solicits an immediate acknowledgment" in the cited text	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:06:12Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:22:35Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12584	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4	239	1	E	Y	239.00999450683594	1	27.4.4		A			447	There is no such thing as an "Action Ack frame" or an "Action-Ack frame"	Delete "Ack" and "-Ack" in all 4 instances of the cited text	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:47:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:47:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12585	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.5	374	19	T	Y	374.19000244140625	19	28.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	"repeated HE-SIG-A" is not accurate as the HE-SIG-A is not repeated (see Figure 28-10); it's just longer with repeated information. Ditto "repeated H	Change "the repeated HE-SIG-A symbols (i.e. the 2nd and the 4th OFDM symbols of HE-SIG-A field)" to " the 2nd and the 4th OFDM symbols of the	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:15:16Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0024r1 under all headings that include CID 12585.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:02:07Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 609 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12586	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	25	E	Y	86.25	25	9.3.1.23		A			447	"Table 9-25b---Trigger Type subfield encoding" should not include "Basic Trigger" as this would then be a Basic Trigger Trigger Type	Delete the "Trigger" at the referenced location	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:24:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:24:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12587	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.14.3	481	61	E	Y	481.60998535 15625	61	28.3.14.3		V			648	The first para of 17.3.9.10 Pre-correction accuracy requirements is editorially inconsistent with the penultimate non-NOTE para of 28.3.14.3 Pre-corre	Align the two wordings as indicated	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:34:21Z) - Agree in principle. Align the statements and remove the shall for the first sentence since the normative requ	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:40:58Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 610 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12588	Mark RISON	230	2	17.3.9.10	217	14	E	Y	217.13999938964844	14	17.3.9.10		J			657	What is "A STA that transmits a PPDU where the TXVECTOR parameter TRIGGER_RESPONDING is true shall pre-compensate for carrier frequency offset (CFO)e	Move to Clause 27	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12589	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.1	319	49	T	Y	319.48999023 4375	49	27.16.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	The VHT Operation Information field is not needed as a VHT Operation element will always be present in the same frame (Beacon etc.), per "A STA that	Delete all the text and figure components related to "VHT Operation Information" (16 instances)	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 611 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12590	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.12	477	59	T	Y	477.58999633 78906	59	28.3.12		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	Figure 28-41 was called "PE field when maximum PE duration is 8 us (non STBC)" in D1.0 but its content is otherwise unchanged. So it seems the STBC c	Add analogues of F28-41 and F28-42 for STBC	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:38:49Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12590 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:47Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12591	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	32	E	Y	246.32000732 421875	32	27.5.3.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	"An AID 12 subfield set to 4095 is reserved to indicate start of Padding field", "The Padding field of the Trigger frame, if present, is at least two o	Delete the statement in Clause 27 and the one of the statements in Clause 9	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:01:55Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0075r1 under CID 12591	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		The commenter makes a valid point. Repeating the same thing multiple times is unecessary and a potential source of error and inconsistency. The shall	I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:37:14Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12592	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.3	268	28	E	Y	268.27999877 92969	28	27.6.3		A			447	"all ones" is not the baseline form	Change the cited text to "all 1s"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:53:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:53:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12593	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.5	324	48	T	Y	324.48001098 63281	48	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	ER beacons don't work for the same reason they didn't work with STBC (and got obsoleted): the AP typically has higher tx power so the AP can reach STA	Delete Subclause 27.16.5	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12594	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	E	Y	81.459999084 47266	46	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	"ACK Type subfield" -- there is no such subfield	Change "ACK" to "Ack" at the referenced location	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:55:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:55:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12595	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	34	E	Y	80.339996337 89062	34	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	"Where Block Ack Starting Sequence Control subfield is set to 0 and RA subfield indicates the MAC address of an unassociated STA for which the Per STA	Delete the cited text and change the previous sentence to "The Per AID TID Info subfield when the AID11 subfield of the AID TID Info subfield is 2045	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:11:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:12:00Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12596	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	34	T	Y	80.339996337 89062	34	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"Where Block Ack Starting Sequence Control subfield is set to 0 and RA subfield indicates the MAC address of an unassociated STA for which the Per STA	Delete " Block Ack Starting Sequence Control subfield is set to 0 and" in the cited text, and delete the " Block Ack Starting Sequence Control (0)" and	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:56:58Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that the intention is to keep the b	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:16:47Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12597	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	$x frame where $x is management, data or control, should have a leading capital	As it says in the comment (I find 8 for "management", 3 for "control" and 2 for "data") but there are additionally lists to be covered (e.g. "data or	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:18:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:19:02Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 614 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12598	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	51	T	Y	81.51000213623047	51	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	This para and the next one seem to duplicate Table 9-24b	Delete the paras in question. Move behavioural information (e.g. "acknowledges successful reception of a single MPDU indicated by the TID of the AID	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:14:29Z) Rejected. The 2 paragraphs are there to help the interpretation of Table 9-24b. They are explaining the frame f	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR
12599	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	The terminology is inconsistent: HE ER SU PPDU, HE ER PPDU, HE EXT PPDU, HE EXT SU	Change the PPDU wording to "HE ER SU PPDU" throughout (not "HE ER PPDU" (2x), not "HE_ER_SU PPDU" (4x), not "HE extended range SU PPDU" (1x), not "HE	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:49:51Z) - Change HE_ER_SU PPDU to HE ER SU PPDU (2x)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:50:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 615 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12600	Mark RISON	230	2	3.2	33	30	T	Y	33.29999923706055	30	3.2		J			657	There are two definitions of "high efficiency (HE) extended range (ER) single user (SU) physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU)"	Have only one, and make sure it matches the baseline style	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12601	Mark RISON	230	2				G	Y					J			657	It is not clear whether an HE ER SU PPDU is a type of HE SU PPDU, i.e. whether rules that apply to HE SU PPDUs also apply to HE ER SU PPDUs	State that all rules that apply to HE SU PPDUs apply to HE ER SU PPDUs except where explicitly so indicated	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12602	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	The terminology is inconsistent: HE ER SU PPDU v. HE_EXT_SU; HE TB PPDU v. HE_TRIG	Change "HE_EXT_SU" to "HE_ER_SU" throughout and change "HE_TRIG" to "HE_TB" throughout	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:47:47Z) - Change HE_EXT_SU to HE_ER_SU and HE_TRIG to HE_TB	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:48:12Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 616 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12603	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.20	503	1	E	Y	503.01 0009765625	1	28.3.20		V		18/0463r2	529	It says "HT_TRIG"	Change to "HE_TB" (not HE_TRIG; see other comment)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-03-29 23:03:12Z) - As suggested. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 1260	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:09:51Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12604	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	The terminology is inconsistent: HE TB PPDU, HE_TB PPDU	Change the PPDU wording to "HE TB PPDU" throughout (not "HE_TB PPDU" (6x), not "TB PPDU" without the "HE" (1x))	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:32:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:32:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12605	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	The terminology is inconsistent: HE TB NDP PPDU, HE TB NDP feedback PPDU	Change the PPDU wording to "HE TB NDP feedback PPDU" throughout (not "HT TB NDP PPDU" (1x), not "HE TB NDP feedback report PPDU" (1x), not "HE TB NDP	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:27:13Z) - Consistently use "HE TB NDP feedback PPDU"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:27:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 617 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12606	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	44	E	Y	157.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.243		V		17/1852r8	474	" set the TXVECTOR parameter SPA-TIAL_REUSE to SRP_AND_NON-SRG-OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED SRP-based SR transmissions." -- garbled	Deleted "SRP-based SR transmissions" in the cited text	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:20:08Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12607	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			447	There should be a (non-break) space between "MCS" and the number (or "n")	Add a non-break space in 9.2.4.6.4.2 (2x), 27.15.3, Table 28-1 (4x+6x), Table 28-18 (6x), Table 28-19 (4x), Table 28-25, Table 28-26, 28.3.11.5 (2x),	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:35:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:35:41Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 618 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12608	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	59	T	Y	245.58999633789062	59	27.5.3.2.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	"if the AP has received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame in which any of the following are true" -- there needs to be some kind of ti	Add "within 32 beacon intervals, as indicated in the frame" before " in which any" in the cited text	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:51:38Z) Agree with the comment. Please see resolution to CID 13970 TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:13:01Z - see #13970	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12609	Mark RISON	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	35	E	Y	290.35000610 35156	35	27.9.2.1		A		17/1852r8	474	There is no such value SRP_and_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED	Change _and_ to _AND_	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:25:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12610	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			447	It's sometimes SRP_AND_NON-SRG-OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED, sometimes SRP_AND_NONSRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED, sometimes SRP_AND_NON-SRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED etc.	Change to use SRP_AND_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED everywhere	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:50:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:50:38Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 619 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12611	Mark RISON	230	2	4.3.14a	37	11	T	Y	37.110000610 35156	11	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	With the recent PAR change, the upper operating range is now 7.125 GHz	Change "6 GHz" to "7.125 GHz" on pages 2, 4 and 37	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:29:43Z) Revised. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12205	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12612	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			648	There are about a dozen instances of wording referring to transmission of a $something "MHz TB PPDU" (T9-262aa (3x), 28.1.1, 28.3.3.2 (3x), 28.3.3.6 (	Change the wording to say something like "an HE TB PPDU transmitted over an operating channel width of $something MHz"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:21:37Z) - The term refers to PPDUs that are transmitted with CH_BANDWIDTH set to indicate that value. It would be cumb	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:22:49Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12613	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	There are a few references to "HE-SIG-B-MCS", with claims it's a compact representation. It's nothing of the sort, it's just an HE-MCS	In 28.3.5 change "The HE-SIG-B-MCS is a compact representation of the modulation and coding used in the HE-SIG-B field of the PPDU. For an HE MU PPDU,	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:15:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:15:27Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 620 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12614	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	409	12	E	Y	409.11999951171875	12	28.3.10.7.2		J			648	There are fields called "SIGB MCS" and "SIGB DCM"	Change "SIGB" to "HE-SIG-B" in each of the fields	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:09:05Z) - Comment does not identify a problem with the draft	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:09:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12615	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			648	Theere is a field called "SIGB Compression"	Change all instances to "HE-SIG-B Compression"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:20:37Z) - The comment does not identify a problem with the current name	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:20:54Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12616	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	60	T	Y	141.60000610351562	60	9.4.2.237.3		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	DCM Max NSS Tx/Rx should be reserved when DCM Max Constellation Tx/Rx indicates no DCM support	At the bottom of the rightmost cell of the DCM Max NSS Tx row add "Reserved if the DCM Max Constellation Tx subfield is 0". At the bottom of the right	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:49:11Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:09:35Z - Also indicate that the 0 or 1 setting only applies if the subfield is not 0.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 621 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12617	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	53	T	Y	141.52999877929688	53	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"B0-B1" followed by a list containing "01" and "10" is confusing	Change the rightmost cell of the DCM Max Constellation Tx and DCM Max Constellation Rx rows to use a decimal rather than a binary before the colon	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:48:44Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12627 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:49:20Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12618	Mark RISON	230	2				G	Y					J			657	Field values should not be expressed as binary numbers unless it is clear which bit of the binary number is the msb and which is the lsb	Either express such field values as decimal or put them in a table where each bit has its own explicitly numbered column (see baseline)	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12619	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	171	25	T	Y	171.25	25	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	The insertion in "The A-MPDU is transmitted by a STA that is neither a TXOP holder nor an RD responder or the A-MPDU is transmitted by AP in an HE BSS	Changed cited text to "The A-MPDU is transmitted by a STA that is neither a TXOP holder nor an RD responder or the A-MPDU is transmitted by AP in a	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:52:38Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12619.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12620	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	171	1	T	Y	171.00999450683594	1	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	462r6	656	The changes made in Tables 9-424 to 9-428 allow new transmissions to/from legacy devices that might not be understood by other legacy devices. Just a	Precede all 11ax insertions with "When transmitted by an HE STA to an HE STA:"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:54:06Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12620	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12621	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	6	T	Y	173.05999755859375	6	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"Data frames without HT-immediate block ack agreement" breaks non-11ax implementations	Delete this row	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:16:33Z) Rejected. Discussion: The third column about condition clrarly says that Data frame without HT-immeidate block	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12622	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	6	T	Y	173.05999755859375	6	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"QoS Data frames with multiple TIDs which have no HT-immediate blok ack agreement" -- why is it necessary to have more than one QoS Data frame of thi	Change "QoS Data frames with multiple TIDs" to "One or more QoS Data frames"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:17:26Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12622	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 624 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12623	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	37	T	Y	173.36999951171875	37	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"In multi-TID A-MPDU context" -- there is no such context (see Table 9-424)	Change to "Between two HE STAs". At line 31 change "In a single TID A-MPDU context, at" to " At"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:38:43Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12623	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12624	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	42	E	Y	173.41999816989453	42	9.7.3		A			648	It says "block Ack"	Change to "block ack"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:21:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:21:18Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12625	Mark RISON	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	Y	55.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	"When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ack, Block Ack, or Multi-STA BlockAck fram	Change the cited text to "When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ack, BlockAck, o	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:19:57Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:08:08Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 625 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12626	Mark RISON	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	18	T	Y	55.18000030517578	18	9.2.4.5.4		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	We need to look at the PPDU type to decide whether to respond to a DLMU PPDU anyway (because Action frames are allowed and do not have an ack policy)	Delete the references to HTP Ack throughout the draft and instead state that the rules previously described as pertaining to that ack policy instead p	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:20:44Z) Rejected - The assertion is not true. The HTP-Ack is used (section 27.4) when the eliciting PPDU is an HE SU PP	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:06:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12627	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.2	315	1	T	Y	315.01000976 5625	1	27.15.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	Transmission of MU PPDUs by a non-AP STA has no appreciable value	Delete the RxHE MU PPDU From Non-AP STA subfield in the HE PHY Capabilities Information field (Figure 9-589cl and Table 9-262aa) and "to a per STAu	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:51:16Z) Rejected – Transmission of MU PPDUs from a non-AP STA has the appreciable value that, compared to the SU and ER	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 626 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12628	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	174	8	T	Y	174.08000018310547	8	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"An AP including a Trigger frame and BlockAck frame is not required to include QoS Data in that A-MPDU" is unclear. An AP is never required to includ	Delete NOTE 2 in T9-425 and NOTE 1 in T9-426	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:54:36Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12628	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12629	Mark RISON	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	182	60	T	Y	182.60000610351562	60	10.3.2.10.2		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	"an MMPDU that solicits an immediate response" -- it is not clear what this means	Change the cited text to "a Management frame other than an Action No Ack frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:21:34Z) Revised - Agree in principle. No need to call out Action No Ack frame, since the text already contains "that sol	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:03:59Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 627 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12630	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	41	T	Y	239.41000366210938	41	27.4.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" an Action frame or an MMPDU that solicits a response." -- these overlap	Changed cited text to "a Management frame other than an Action No Ack frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:19:51Z) Revised - Agree in principle. No need to explictly mention Action/Action No Ack, since it is a type of maangemen	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12631	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	7	T	Y	240.07000732421875	7	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" an Action frame or an MMPDU that solicits an immediate acknowledgement" -- these overlap	Changed cited text to "a Management frame other than an Action No Ack frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:20:32Z) Revised - Agree in principle. No need to explictly mention Action/Action No Ack, since it is a type of maangemen	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12632	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	174	42	E	Y	174.41999816 89453	42	9.7.3		A			648	It says " Zero of more"	Changed cited text to "Zero or more"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:24:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:24:39Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12633	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	175	33	E	Y	175.33000183 10547	33	9.7.3		A			648	It says " Zero of more"	Changed cited text to "Zero or more"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:25:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:25:56Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 628 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12634	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	174	42	T	Y	174.41999816 89453	42	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"Zero of more", but all the items in the A-MPDU context tables are implicitly zero or more unless stated otherwise	Deleted the cited text	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:55:31Z) Rejected Discussion: with aero or more, it is more clear.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12635	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	175	33	T	Y	175.33000183 10547	33	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"Zero of more", but all the items in the A-MPDU context tables are implicitly zero or more unless stated otherwise	Deleted the cited text	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 03:00:13Z) Rejected Discussion: with aero or more, it is more clear.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12636	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.2	236	33	T	Y	236.33000183 10547	33	27.4.2		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	A Multi-TID BlockAck should be used in response to a multi-TID A-MPDU rather than a Multi-STA BlockAck, if there is only one STA to respond to (e.g. w	Change "If all MPDUs in the A-MPDU are received successfully, then the recipient may follow the procedure described in the All Ack context. Oth	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:24:42Z) Rejected - This point was discussed during the time when the group eventually decided to use M-BA. The reason w	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 629 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12637	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.10	465	45	E	Y	465.45001220703125	45	28.3.11.10		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	The fact that STBC is not to be used with >1SS or DCM is repeated a million times (T28-1, "The STBC block may be applied only for single spatial st	Say it in 28.3.11.10 and nowhere else	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:53:14Z) -Tgax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0771r1 under all headings that include CID 12637.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	This is repeated frequently. Passing to PHY ad-hoc for discussion.	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 13:59:52Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12638	Mark RISON	230	2	10.13.3	193	54	T	Y	193.5399932861328	54	10.13.3		J	Liwen Chu	792r1	597	The purpose of the Minimum MPDU start spacing is to space MPDUs sufficiently apart, for implementations that cannot accept them back-to-back. Therefo	Revert all the changes made in the first para of the referenced sub clause	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 17:42:57Z) Rejected Discussion: 11ax TG agreed that the processing of frame other than QoS Data, QoS Null and Management f	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:57:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 630 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12639	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	432	31	T	Y	432.30999755859375	31	28.3.10.8.6		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	"In the case of load balancing for RUs of size greater than 242 subcarriers where user fields corresponding to the same MU-MIMO allocations are split	Deleted cited text	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:05:27Z) Editor please make changes shown in document 11-18-0118r6 under comment 12639	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:06:56Z - Editing not clear, but I've done what I think was intended	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12640	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	429	8	T	Y	429.07998657 22656	8	28.3.10.8.5		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	"In the case of load balancing for RUs of size greater than 242-tone RU, y2y1y0 = 000-111 indicates number of User fields in the HE-SIG-B content chan	Deleted cited text	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:03:49Z) Editor instruction: implement the proposed resolution to CID 12640 as in 11-18/0118r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:00:50Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12641	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	4	E	Y	135.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		J			657	MinTrigProcTime is only used in 3 places and hardly seems worth defining	Replace all instances with "Trigger frame MAC padding duration"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 631 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12642	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	30	T	Y	245.30000030517578	30	27.5.3.2.1		J	Youhan Kim		657	"More than one Trigger frame may be aggregated in an A-MPDU. If more than one Trigger frame is aggregated in an A-MPDU, all of them shall have the sam	Delete the cited text	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:08Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12643	Mark RISON	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	55	61	T	Y	55.61000061035156	61	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	Addition of "and QoS Null" in "The Queue Size subfield is present in QoS Data and QoS Null frames sent by non-AP STAs with bit 4 of the QoS Control fi	Change the cited sentence to "The Queue Size subfield is present in QoS Data and (for HE STAs only) QoS Null frames sent by non-AP STAs with bit 4 of	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12644	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	4	T	Y	134.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	"Indicates if the STA supports the reception of an HE variant HT Control field carried in a QoS Data, QoS Null, or Management frame." from the cited text	Delete " carried in a QoS Data, QoS Null, or Management frame" from the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:16:56Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0627r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12645	Mark RISON	230	2	28.2.6.1	352		E	Y	352		28.2.6.1		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	There are 4 instances of "20 MHz-only non-AP STA", and one instance of "A non-AP STA with 20 MHz-only capability"	Add "HE" before "STA" in each of the instances	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:38:21Z) - As proposed change but cannot find the one instance of "A non-AP STA with 20 MHz-only capability" TGax edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:38:26Z - See #13623, #13624 and #13625	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12646	Mark RISON	230	2	3.2	32	62	E	Y	32.619998931 884766	62	3.2		A			447	"non-AP" needs to be expanded in the definition	Change "non-AP" to "non-access-point (non-AP)" before the colon at the cited location	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:16:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:16:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 633 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12647	Mark RISON	230	2	3.2	33	1	E	Y	33.009998321 5332	1	3.2		A			447	"non-AP" needs to be expanded in the definition	Change "non-AP" to "non-access-point (non-AP)" before the colon at the cited location	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:16:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:16:24Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12648	Mark RISON	230	2	C	569	1	T	Y	569.01000976 5625	1	C		V	Edward Au	17/781r1	646	"SYNTAX BITS" is not valid	Make sure the MIB compiles	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 15:55:48Z) - Agree in principle. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0781r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 16:55:04Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12649	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.2	314	51	T	Y	314.51000976 5625	51	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"A first STA shall not transmit a Control frame in an HE ER SU PPDU to a second STA unless the second STA indicates the reception of HE ER SU PPDU." -	Add an explicit HE PHY Capabilities bit to indicate support for HE ER PPDU rx	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:51:50Z) Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, mandatory et	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12650	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.2	314	58	T	Y	314.57998657 22656	58	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"An HESTA may transmit a 242-tone HEER SU PPDU to a peer HESTA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the DCM	Add an explicit HE PHY Capabilities bit to indicate support for RU242 HE ER PPDU rx	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:49:55Z) - Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, mandato	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12651	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	54	T	Y	474.54000854 49219	54	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"Otherwise it shall not be sent." is not stated for the following paragraphs	Add the cited sentence after the first sentence of each of the next two paras	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:29:23Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:00:54Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12652	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.5.5	459	60	T	Y	459.60000610 35156	60	28.3.11.5.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"The AP indicates the common NSYM, pre-FEC padding factor, STBC indication and LDPC Extra Symbol Segment fields in the Trigger frame." --no, it indic	Change "NSYM" to "L-SIG Length" in the cited text; add a sentence "In the UMRS Control field it indicates N_SYM rather than the L-SIG Length." after;	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:14:26Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID12652 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:46:15Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 635 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12653	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.3	316	44	T	Y	316.44000244140625	44	27.15.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	"An HESTA that sends a Control frame in an HEER SU PPDU format shall use: --- DCM encoding if the most recent successfully received PPDU sent by the	Change the bullet to "DCM encoding if the Control frame is sent in response to a PPDU sent using DCM encoding; otherwise [...]". Ditto next bullet	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:55:53Z) Revised – The soliciting STA is the STA that solicits the control frame (provided this clarification in the comm	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 16:49:42Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12654	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.5	324	65	T	Y	324.64999389064844	65	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	"Protection of transmission in ERBSS is out of scope of this specification." is a cop-out and violates coexistence assurances	Delete this subclause	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12655	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	6	E	Y	157.05999755859375	6	9.4.2.243		J		17/1852r8	474	"HESIGA_Spatial_reuse_value15_allowed" is a very odd field name	Change to "SRP_AND_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED Allowed" throughout	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:19:12Z this field is set by the AP to allow its STAs to set the bit in SIG-A for their PPDU to the value 15 which is S	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12656	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.2	314	60	T	Y	314.60000061035156	60	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"DCM Rx field" -- there is no such field	Changed cited text to "DCM Max Constellation Rx subfield in the HE PHY Capabilities Information field"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:58:17Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution fixes the issue. TGax editor to make the cha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12657	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.3	316	35	T	Y	316.35000061035156	35	27.15.3		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	"DCM Rx subfield" -- there is no such subfield	Changed cited text to "DCM Max Constellation Rx subfield"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:56:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 16:50:30Z - see #12536	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12658	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	138	15	T	Y	138.14999389648438	15	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	There are DCM Max Constellation Rx and DCM Max NSS Tx/Rx capability fields, but no normative behaviour associated with them	Add normative behavioural requirements in Clause 27 (see other comment on "DCM Rx" field in Clause 27)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:45:20Z) Please refer to Section 27.15.3 in D2.2	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:03:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 637 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12659	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	138	15	T	Y	138.14999389648438	15	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0409r1	524	There are DCM Max Constellation Rx and DCM Max NSS Tx/Rx capability fields, but no normative behaviour associated with them	Delete these fields from the referenced subclause (table and figure)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:57:07Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12659 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0409r1	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:21:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12660	Mark RISON	230	2	C.3	574	49	T	Y	574.48999023 4375	49	C.3		J	Edward Au	17/781r1	646	27.5.2.3 indicates a STA is generally required to include an UPH Control for TB PPDUs (The STA shall include an HE Control field containing the UPH Co	Delete dot11HEUPDControlActivated	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 15:54:15Z) - This control variable is applied for both APs and non-AP STAs.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 16:13:21Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12661	Mark RISON	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	183	6	E	Y	183.05999755859375	6	10.3.2.10.2		V			447	"HE DL MU Data" -- the "Data" is spurious	Delete "Data" in the cited text	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:33:55Z) - Change "HE DL MU Data" to "HE MU PPDU" to match description	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:34:31Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 638 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12662	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	58	T	Y	173.58000183 10547	58	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Why are the only types of Trigger frame allowed in an A-MPDU Basic, MU-BAR and BSRP? You might wish to include e.g. an MU-RTS, to protect the subsequ	Add MU-RTS to the list of permissible Trigger frame types	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:40:06Z) Revised Discussion: MU-RTS is not allowed to be in A-MPDU sine the purpose of MU-RTS is used for TXOP protection	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12663	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	58	T	Y	173.58000183 10547	58	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Only Basic, MU-BAR and BSRP Trigger frames are allowed here, but the rightmost column mentions other types	Add GCR MU-BAR, BQRP to the list of permissible Trigger frame types	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:40:50Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12663	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 639 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12664	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	It is not clear whether a GCR MU-BAR is a type of MU-BAR (cf. BlockAckReqv. Basic BlockAckReqv. Compressed BlockAckReq); see also constructs like "a	Prefix "MU-BAR" with "Basic" throughout, where not prefixed with "GCR"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12665	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.5	253	27	E	Y	253.27000427246094	27	27.5.3.5		A			447	There are 5 references to "HE Control field" but there is no such field	Change each instance of the cited text to "HE-variant HT Control field"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:25:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:26:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12666	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	133	37	E	Y	133.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.237.2		A			447	The subfield OFDMA RA Support / OFDMA RA Supports / UL OFDMA RA Support should have a single name	Call it "OFDMA RA Support" everywhere (no "UL", no "s"; fix on pp. 136, 257 (2x))	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:45:36Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:45:39Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 640 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12667	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	35	T	Y	143.35000610351562	35	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	The descriptions of the Triggered SU/MU/CQI Beamforming Feedback" subfields are not clear in that they miss the key ingredient that the feedback is tr	Add "trigger-based" after "indicates support for the" in the three rows referred to (6 changes in total)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:51:58Z) Resolution of CID 11905 applies.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:31Z - see #11905	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12668	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.2	263	26	T	Y	263.26000976 5625	26	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	There is no normative behaviour associated with the SU/MU Beamformee and Triggered SU/MU/CQI fields	Add at the end of 27.6.2 (or in 27.6.3?) wording like "A STA shall not request non-trigger-based SU-type feedback from another STA unless it has recei	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:09:38Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 12688. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 641 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12669	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	26	T	Y	142.25999450683594	26	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"Set to 1 if supported or if sent by an AP with support for 4 or more spatial streams." is confusing as it suggests an AP with support for >= 4SS m	Changed cited text to "Set to 1 if supported. NOTE---Set to 1 by an AP with support for 4 or more spatial streams." Also add the NOTE to the MU Be	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:50:18Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12669 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:49:50Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12670	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	That an AP with >= 4SS needs to support DL MU-MIMO is stated too many times	Delete in at least one of 4.13.4a, T9-262aa, 27.6.2, 28.1.1, 28.3.3.9.2	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12671	Mark RISON	230	2	B.4	557	13	T	Y	557.13000488 28125	13	B.4		V	Edward Au	18/0763r1	645	Many reference cells are blank	Add the missing references	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:12:29Z) - Agree in principle the references of some cells are missing. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicat	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:12:35Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 642 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12672	Mark RISON	230	2	B.5	565	15	T	Y	565.15 00244140625	15	B.5		A	Edward Au	17/1775r0	445	28.1.1 says BCC is not used for an "HESU PPDU with number of spatial streams greater than 4" and 28.3.11.5 says "Support of BCC code is limited to le	Change the Protocol Capability to "BCC with 4 or fewer spatial streams". Also change HEP10.3 to "LDPC with 4 or fewer spatial streams "	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-16 23:12:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:09:28Z	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12673	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	35	T	Y	142.35 000610351562	35	9.4.2.237.3		J	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	The MU Beamformer subfield has no associated behaviour	Delete from 9.4.2.237.3 (figure and table) and from 27.6.2 (last sentence first bullet, and second bullet)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:03:00Z) For less then 4SS, support of MU-MIMO is optional for AP.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:47:14Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12674	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	51	E	Y	142.50 999450683594	51	9.4.2.237.3		A			447	The four "Reserved if the SU Beamformee field is 0." are in the wrong cell	Move each of them to the end of the rightmost cell	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:09:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:09:17Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12675	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	10	T	Y	143.10 000610351562	10	9.4.2.237.3		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"Reserved if the SU Beamformee field is 0." refers to the wrong fielf	Change "Beamformee" to "Beamformer" in the cited text	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:50:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:12:32Z - Update the set statement to correspond	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 643 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12676	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	17	T	Y	143.16999816 89453	17	9.4.2.237.3		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"Reserved if the SU Beamformee field is 0." refers to the wrong fielf	Change "Beamformee" to "Beamformer" in the cited text	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:51:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:16:47Z - Updated set statement to correspond	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12677	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	"HT MCS" and "VHT MCS" should have a hyphen	Change the space to a (non-break) hyphen in all instances of the cited terms	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:34:20Z) - The baseline is inconsistent here. It seems to be mostly "HT MCS" but "VHT-MCS", although there are instances	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:36:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12678	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	23	E	Y	141.22999572 753906	23	9.4.2.237.3		A			447	The "STBC Tx/Rx <= 80 MHz" field descipticons have different wording from the "> 80 MHz" ones. Also the font for the "80 MHz" is weird	Make the font of the "80 MHz" in the <= ones the same as the surrounding text Change the wording of the <= ones to end "80 MHz and is using STBC	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:07:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 22:07:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 644 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12679	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	63	E	Y	79.62999725341797	63	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	"The Per AID TID Info subfield when the AID11 subfield of the AID TID Info subfield is 2045 is shown in Figure 9-38b (Per AID TID Info subfield format	Change "9-38b" to "9-38c" in the cited text	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:00:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:00:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12680	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	139	45	T	Y	139.44999694082422	45	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0046r0	453	"Indicates support of both 2.4 GHz and 5 GHz frequency bands" -- a STA only operates in one band. And the Dual Band Support field has no behaviour at	Delete the "Dual Band Support" field (table and figure)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:36:53Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12680 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/00467r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:50:26Z - see #11466	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12681	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	"intended for" is vague	Change to "addressed to" throughout when an address is present (see REVmd)	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12682	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	An S-MPDU is a type of MPDU, so "MPDU or S-MPDU" is pleonastic	Delete "or S-MPDU" in "MPDU or S-MPDU" throughout	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12683	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	113	34	T	Y	113.33999633789062	34	9.4.1.63		J	Kome Oteri	11-18/0080r2	457	Pilot subcarriers should not be included in the list of subcarriers for which BF feedback is given (they were not included for ac either)	Delete the pilot subcarrier indices from Table 9-76e	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:17:59Z) Pilot subcarriers are skipped only in the case that Ng = 1 (see Table 9-70—Subcarriers for which a Compressed Bea	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:21:55Z- EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:21:55Z-EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:21:54Z- EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:21:53Z-EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:21:53Z-	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12684	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	114	1	E	Y	114.01000213623047	1	9.4.1.63		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0080r2	457	There are behavioural requirements in 9.4.1.63, which is a subclause about format not behaviour and it's about what the BFee can't ask for, not what t	Move the last 3 paras of 9.4.1.63 to 27.6.3	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:19:10Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0080r2 under all headings that include CID 12684	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:22:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 646 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12685	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	93	24	E	Y	93.23999786376953	24	9.3.1.23		V			447	"NDBPS is defined in Table 28-13" -- no it isn't	Fix the cross-reference (the tables in Subclause 28.5?)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:24:10Z) - It is defined in Table 28-15	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:24:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12686	Mark RISON	230	2	28.4.3	521	26	T	Y	521.26000976 5625	26	28.4.3		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r0	460	"NDBPS is defined in Table 28-15 (Frequently used parameters)" -- yes, but that table says it's N_DBPS,0, which is not defined		REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:19:33Z) NDBPS,0 is the NDBPSU,u for the user u=0. And NDBPS,u is defined in the same row of Table 28-15 as NDBPS.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:55:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12687	Mark RISON	230	2	28.4.3	521	26	T	Y	521.26000976 5625	26	28.4.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	Equations (28-129) and (28-130) refer to N_DBPS,u but the "where" below refers to N_DBPS,last,u and N_DBPS,last,init,u not N_DBPS,u	Add a cross-reference to N_DBPS,u in the "where" below	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:40:03Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12687 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:19:13Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 647 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12688	Mark RISON	230	2	9	62	14	E	Y	62.13999938964844	14	9		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	There are 9 "shall"s in Clause 9 (including one in a NOTE!)	Move the shalls to later clauses, except for the NOTE, where it should be changed from "shall support" to "supports"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:50:06Z) The “shall” in the NOTE has been removed in D2.3. Not necessary to move all other shalls to later clauses.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	There is one "shall" statement in Clause 9 that was added with the "Longer Than 16 HE SIG-B OFDM Symbols Support" capability. Passing to PHY ad-hoc to	N	Well, the PHY ad-hoc has come back with a REJECTED. That resolution will make Mark happy.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12689	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.5	324	52	E	Y	324.51998901 36719	52	27.16.5		J			657	"in P20" is not a defined term	Change "high frequency 106-tone RU in P20" to "the higher frequency 106-tone RU of the primary 20 MHz channel"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		It is not clear why we need the bracketed qualification on HE ER SU PPDU. Are there other variants of the HE ER SU PPDU and, if so, can they be used?	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12690	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	109	52	T	Y	109.51999664 30664	52	9.4.1.63		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0080r2	457	"A beamformee may choose to reduce Ns by using a method referred to as grouping" -- in HE the BFer gets to choose sometimes	Change "beamformee" to "beamformee or beamformer, depending on the situation," in the cited text	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:20:07Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0080r2 under all headings that include CID 12690	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12691	Mark RISON	230	2	9	56	52	E	Y	56.520000457 76367	52	9		V			648	There are 15 "may"s in Clause 9	Move the mays to later clauses, or make them mights or cans or present simple	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:29:10Z) - Change "may" to "might" in places where may has been used descriptively.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:30:03Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12692	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	172	23	E	Y	172.22999572 753906	23	9.7.3		A			648	"multiple-TID A-MPDU" is not defined	Change to "multi-TID A-MPDU"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:19:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:19:42Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12693	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.3	238		E	Y	238		27.4.3		V			447	"is within [$x, $y]" terminology is not defined	Change each of the six instances to "is from $x to $y" (see 1.4 of the baseline)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:23:28Z) - Convert the list to a table with rows for negoriation buffer size 1-64, 65-128 and 129-256 and columns for Bl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:24:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12694	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	59	T	Y	81.589996337 89062	59	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"The responding STA determines that all the MPDUs carried in the eliciting A-MPDU are successfully received if the all the MPDUs that pr	Change the cited text to "The responding STA determines that all the MPDUs carried in the eliciting A-MPDU are successfully received if	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:16:12Z) Rejected. When EOF is equal to 1 and the MPDU Length field is equal to 0, the remainder will be EOF Padding fie	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR
12695	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	It's sometimes "STAID", sometimes "STA_ID" but mostly "STA-ID"	Change "STAID" and "STA ID" to "STA-ID" (2x each)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:50:52Z) - Consistenly use STA-ID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:53:07Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 650 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12696	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	22	T	Y	81.22000122070312	22	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"Sent as a response to an MPDU or S-MPDU that solicits an immediate acknowledgment." is imprecise	Changed cited text to "Sent as a response to a QoS Data MPDU that solicits an immediate non-block acknowledgment."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:02:33Z) Revised. Agree in principal with the comment. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. No	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:22:16Z	3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12697	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.3	266	5	T	Y	266.04998779296875	5	27.6.3		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"An HE beamformer that transmits an HE NDP Announcement frame and sets the Feedback Type And Ng subfield of the STA Info field to indicate MU shall in	Deleted cited text	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:47:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 651 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12698	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.3	267	58	T	Y	267.57998657 22656	58	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"A non-AP HE beamformee that receives a broadcast HE NDP Announcement frame from the HE beam-former with which it is associated and that contains the	Change the cited text to "A non-AP HE beamformee that receives an HE NDP Announcement frame from the HE beam- former with which it is associated, that	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:47:33Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 12698.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12699	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.3	267	6	T	Y	267.05999755 859375	6	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0446r3	567	"The HE beamformee that is the intended receiver of an HE NDP Announcement frame that has only one STA Info field shall ignore the values of the Nc su	Change the cited text to "The HE beamformee that is the intended receiver of an HE NDP Announcement frame that has only one STA Info field shall ignor	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 17:50:32Z) - CQI-only feedback should be allowed for non-TB sounding sequence as discussed in the discussion section. TG	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 17:50:44Z - The resolution document has this comment resolved as REJECTED. However, the resolution has instructions for text change	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12700	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	10	E	Y	135.10000610 351562	10	9.4.2.237.2		A			447	"Indicates the number of TIDs minus 1" -- the minus 1 should be in the encoding not the definition	Delete "minus 1" from the cited text	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:50:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:50:41Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 652 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12701	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	113	37	E	Y	113.37000274658203	37	9.4.1.63		A			447	Ng not always italicised	Italicise in Table 9-76e	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:38:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:38:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12702	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	114	3	E	Y	114.02999877929688	3	9.4.1.63		A			447	"Ng = 16 For SU/MU" -- no such field	Change to "Ng = 16 SU Feedback" and "Ng = 16 MU Feedback"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:40:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:40:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12703	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	39	T	Y	136.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793r1	603	Missing A-MPDU length exponent definition and encoding	Fill in the middle and rightmost cells (based on the 11ac equivalent)	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:53:36Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12704	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	It is confusing that sometimes psi is given before phi and sometimes after. psi is last in T9-25a and 9.4.1.63 body and T9-589cl and T9-262aa and 27.	Put psi last everywhere	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:26:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:26:29Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12705	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	The character for phi is sometimes U+03D5 (as it should be) and sometimes U+F066 (as it should not be, as makes it hard to find; appears to be some Ad	Use non-proprietary Unicode code points	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:35:04Z) - Reviewed use. In some cases the Symbol font was used. Changed all use to New Times Roman.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:35:40Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12706	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	"OBSS PD MIN" has the wrong case	Change to "OBSS PD Min" throughout	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:57:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:57:34Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12707	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	"OBSS PD MAX" has the wrong case	Change to "OBSS PD Max" throughout (2x)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:56:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:56:10Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12708	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	Is it "OBSS PD" or "OBSS-PD" or "OBSS_PD"	Pick one and use it throughout (note SRG OBSS PD Min/Max Offset fields, Equation (27-3), Figure 27-9)	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Passing to SR ad-hoc. Clean up terminology.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 654 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12709	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	427	17	T	Y	427.17001342 77344	17	28.3.10.8.5		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Table 28-24 specifies the spatial configuration per each number of users. This configuration is monotonic decreasing, maximum number of spatial stream	Add the 2 2 2 1 1 configuration (from the reserved values)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:02:00Z) The comment was already adressed	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:52:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12710	Mark RISON	230	2	3.4	35		E	Y	35		3.4		A			447	In general the term is "packet extension" but there's PPE which is "PHY padding extension"	Change the two expansions to say "packet" rather than "padding"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:55:08Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:55:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12711	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.6.10	386	35	E	Y	386.35000610 35156	35	28.3.6.10		A			648	There are 2 "packet extension field"	Change each to "Packet Extension field"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:50:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:51:40Z	2.2	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12712	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	"left" and "right" are not well-defined for frequencies	At 110.1 change "For the left of" to "Below" At 110.4 change "For the right of" to "Above" On page 364 change "leftmost" to "lowest-frequency" and "ri	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 655 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12713	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	"left" and "right" are not well-defined for frequencies	Fix "NGuard,Left", "NGuard,Right", "LTF80MHz_left_1x", "LTF80MHz_right_1x", "LTF80MHz_left_4x", "LTF80MHz_right_4x"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12714	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	"right after" is rather casual	Change all 3 instances to "immediately after"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:51:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:51:06Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12715	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	90	26	E	Y	90.26000213623047	26	9.3.1.23		A			447	The last column and penultimate row of Table 9-25h---The encoding of B19--B13 of the RU Allocation subfield are useless	Delete the last column and penultimate row	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:09:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:09:58Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12716	Mark RISON	230	2	27.9			T	Y			27.9		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"legacy portion of the PPDU" is not a defined concept, nor is "legacy portion of the DSRP_PPDU"	Define these portions as the L-STF, L-LTF and L-SIG fields	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:27:57Z) TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-17/1852r8 that are marked with CID 12716	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 656 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12717	Mark RISON	230	2	9.2.5.2	78	58	E	Y	72.580001831 05469	58	9.2.5.2		A			447	"BRP Trigger frame" should be plural	Add "s" at the end of the cited text	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:36:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:36:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12718	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	170	3	T	Y	170.02999877 929688	3	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	462r6	656	"All of the MPDUs within an A-MPDU have the same TA." -- either this is a new requirement that can't apply to legacy devices, or it's already requir	Delete the cited text	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:48:51Z) Rejected Discussion: This avoids that in a broadcast RU, frames from multiple virtual APs are aggregated in one	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12719	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	15	T	Y	88.150001525 8789	15	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	"is defined in Table 21-13" -- broken link	Put in a real cross-reference	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:21:19Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 12719	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 657 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12720	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	8	T	Y	88.08000183105469	8	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	"B25 of the Number OF HE-LTF Symbols And Midamble Periodicity subfield indicates midamble periodicity in the same HE TB PPDU" -- indicates it how?	Add ": 0 for a period of 10 symbols and 1 for a period of 20 symbols"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:14:34Z) Agree with the comment. Added a sentence to cover the two values and their representation. TGax editor, please ma	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 22:29:14Z - Underlying problem dixed with resolution to #11539. No change.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12721	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Responder should not use M-BA if it could use C-BA or Ack	Specify that if a STA can ack using just an Ack frame, it shall do so, otherwise if it can ack using just a C-BA frame it shall do so, otherwise it us	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:25:21Z) Rejected - This is already the case. Commenter may come back with specific sections that doesn't allow this.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12722	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	16	T	Y	475.16000366 21094	16	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"An HE PPDU" is vague, compared with the previous paras, which are specific to HE SU PPDUs, HE ER PPDUs and HE MU PPDUs	Change the cited text to "An HE SU PPDU, HE ER PPDU or HE MU PPDU"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:29:48Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:59:29Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 658 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12723	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	21	T	Y	475.20999145 50781	21	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"An HE PPDU" is vague, compared with the previous paras, which are specific to HE SU PPDUs, HE ER PPDUs and HE MU PPDUs	Change the cited text to "An HE SU PPDU, HE ER PPDU or HE MU PPDU"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:29:57Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:59:38Z - see #12722	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12724	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	475		E	Y	475		28.3.11.16		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	Three instances of "Midamble Rx 2x and 1x HE-LTF subfield"	Change "and" to "And" in each of the instances	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:53:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:08:54Z - 28.3.11.16 contain st MAC protocol descriptions that belong in Clause 27 (e.g., recipient capability restrictions for tr	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:02:34Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12725	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	6	E	Y	475.05999755 859375	6	28.3.11.16		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	" and the HE SU PPDU With 1x HE-LTF And 0.8 us GI subfield to 1" is in the wrong place	Move to before the " in the HE Capabilities fields" [sic]	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:54:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:08:54Z - 28.3.11.16 contain st MAC protocol descriptions that belong in Clause 27 (e.g., recipient capability restrictions for tr	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:14:09Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12726	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	12	E	Y	475.11999511 71875	12	28.3.11.16		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	" and the HE ER SU PPDU With 1x HE-LTF And 0.8 us GI subfield to 1" is in the wrong place	Move to before the " in the HE Capabilities fields" [sic]	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:54:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:08:54Z - 28.3.11.16 contain st MAC protocol descriptions that belong in Clause 27 (e.g., recipient capability restrictions for tr	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:14:16Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12727	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	There are 9 instances of "HE Capabilities field"(s)	Change each to "HE Capabilities element" and add "the" before the one in 28.3.11.5	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:53:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:53:32Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12728	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	32	T	Y	475.32000732 421875	32	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"an HE PPDU" is vague, compared with the previous paras, which are specific to HE SU PPDUs, HE ER PPDUs, HE MU PPDUs and HE TB PPDUs	Change the cited text to "an HE SU PPDU, HE ER PPDU, HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:30:30Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:00:24Z- see #12722	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12729	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	There are 8 instances of "us GI"	Change each to "<micro>s GI"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:54:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:54:54Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 660 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12730	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	There are instances of "x" as a multiplication symbol	Change to the multiplication glyph in B.4.27.2, T28-23, 28.1.1, 10.3.2.4	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12731	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			648	"1x", "2x", "4x" are arguably forms of multiplication	Change the "x" to the multiplication glyph in each case	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:56:25Z) - It is better to use plain text in field names and enumerated types.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:56:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12732	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	46	E	Y	244.46000671 38672	46	27.5.3.1		A			447	Spurious parenthesis	Delete the "(" in "PPDU("	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 21:50:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 21:50:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12733	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.5	324	53	T	Y	324.52999877 92969	53	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	"An HEAP may operate an ER BSS in addition to a non-HT BSS. An ER BSS, when present, shall operate independent of the non-HT BSS and shall have a BSS	Change the cited text to "An HEAP may operate an ER BSS collocated with an AP operating a non-HT BSS. An ER BSS shall operate independently of any co	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 661 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12734	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.5	324	53	T	Y	324.52999877 92969	53	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	105r3	657	"An HE AP may operate an ER BSS in addition to a non-HT BSS. An ER BSS, when present, shall operate independent of the non-HT BSS and shall have a BSS	Change "non-HT BSS" to "non-ER BSS" in the cited text (2x)	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:02:53Z) - Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:03:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12735	Mark RISON	230	2	27.16.5	324	56	T	Y	324.55999755 859375	56	27.16.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	"An ER BSS may have larger coverage area." -- this is not an implementation option	Change the cited text to a "NOTE---An ER BSS is expected to have a larger coverage area than a non-ER BSS."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12736	Mark RISON	230	2	27	221	4	T	Y	221.03999328 61328	4	27		J	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	The protection rules for HE ER PPDUs are not specified	Add a subclause "Protection" stating "A TXOP holder that transmits an HE ER PPDU in a TXOP shall transmit an RTS frame or MU-RTS Trigger frame at the	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:42:11Z) Rejected – It is generally up to the TXOP holder to decide if RTS frame or MU-RTS Trigger frame will be used fo	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:10:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 662 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12737	Mark RISON	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	182	60	T	Y	182.60000610351562	60	10.3.2.10.2		J	George Cherian		657	The rules for HE MU PPDUs related to HTP Ack (i.e. only ack if received with Trigger or UMRS) don't apply to UL or direct links	Add "A non-AP STA shall not set the ack policy to HTP Ack."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12738	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4	300	23	E	Y	300.23001098 63281	23	27.10.4		A			447	Need uppercase at start of sentence/heading	Change "multi-" to "Multi-" at the referenced location	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:01:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:01:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12739	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.2	236	63	T	Y	236.63000488 28125	63	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" the Ack-Enabled A-MPDU Support subfield" -- there is no such subfield	Refer to a subfield that exists (I think it's the Ack-Enabled Aggregation Support subfield)	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:26:00Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12740	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J	Liwen Chu		657	There are multiple instances of "ack-enabled A-MPDU"	Change each of them to "ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 663 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12741	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	175	15	T	Y	175.14999389648438	15	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"One Ack and Block Ack frame is present at the start of the A-MPDU" -- no, only one is present	Change "and" to "or" in the citex text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 03:01:16Z) Revised TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12741	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12742	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	27	T	Y	242.27000427246094	27	27.5.1.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	It is not clear whether it is permissible to have a DL OFDMA transmission where each RU gets a different Trigger frame	In 27.5.1.1 add "An AP may send different Trigger frames to different STAs in a DL OFDMA PPDU as long as the elicited HE TB PPDUs are compatible."	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:23:27Z) The spec permits this operation. This covered in 27.5.3.2.3 (see D2.3 P277L1). TGax editor: No further changes are	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:02:36Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12743	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	174	38	T	Y	174.38000488 28125	38	9.7.3		J	Hongyuan Zhang	426r6	656	"one or more Trigger frames where the Trigger Type field is Basic Trigger, MU-BAR, or BSRP." -- why would you want to include more than one of each of	Change the cited text to "a Basic, MU-BAR, or BSRP Trigger frame"	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:56:19Z) Rejected Discussion: more than one Trigger frames with same content is allowed in subclause 27. The group belie	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 664 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12744	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	Y	81.45999908447266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"Pre-association ack context: A recipient receiving a single MMPDU from the unassociated STA, that requires an acknowledgment, shall set the Ack Type wh	See comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:12:56Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Note that Table 9-24b is for the case wh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12745	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.2	236	58	T	Y	236.58000018310547	58	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"A recipient receiving a single MMPDU from the unassociated STA, " -- it can't receive more than one at a time anyway, and there is no antecedent for "	Change "a single" to "an" and "the" to "an" in the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:26:40Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 665 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12746	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	109	62	T	Y	109.62000274658203	62	9.4.1.63		J	Kome Oteri		657	"For 40 MHz and 80 MHz, [...] when the S-tone and E-tone indices lie on different sides of DC, the following relationships hold separately for the two	Describe how scidx(i) is derived from scidx(i-1) (or otherwise) for 160 and for 80+80, covering both the "S-tone and E-tone indices lie on different s	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12747	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.1	287	18	E	Y	287.17999267578125	18	27.8.1		J	Jarkko Kneckt		657	"RX NSS" should be "Rx NSS"	Change "RX NSS" to "Rx NSS"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Rx (or RX) NSS is a field name being substituted for a technical term. Spell out the technical term (e.g., maximum number of spatial steams)	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12748	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2			E	Y			9.4.2		J			648	"(0, 1 or 2 for MCS 0-7, 1 or 2 for MCS 8, 2 for MCS 9)" and "(0, 1, or 2 for MCS 0-7, 1 or 2 for MCS 8-9, 2 for MCS 10-11)" is duplication	Delete in 9.4.2.158.3 and 9.4.2.237.4 (2x)	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:45:46Z) - The commenter is not clear on the problem.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:46:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 666 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12749	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					V			648	"(A-)MPDU" is wrong because an A-MPDU and an MPDU are quite different things (one contains the other)	Delete the "(A-)" in 9.2.4.5.6, 9.2.4.6.4.5, Table 9-262z (2x), 27.5.3.4 . Delete the parentheses in 10.9	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:05:20Z) - In Table 9-262z for BSR Support, change the two occurances of (A-)MPDU to MPDU. Change the statement in 9.2.4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:14:15Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12750	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.5	241	51	T	Y	241.50999450683594	51	27.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"An HESTA that receives a single-TID A-MPDU in an HE SU PPDU that solicits an immediate response shall send the acknowledgement using a Compressed Bl	Append "except if the A-MPDU only contains one MPDU that solicits an immediate response, and that MPDU is in an A-MPDU subframe with EOF = 1, in which	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:27:21Z) Revised.- Since the ack rules are already captured in 27.4.4, deleting the two sentences TGax editor shall inco	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 667 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12751	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	In a few places DCM is referred to as dual subcarrier (or sub-carrier) modulation	Change to "carrier" in each of the 3 instances	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:47:54Z) - Change remaining instances of "dual sub-carrier modulation" to "DCM". Other instances fixed with resolution to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:48:18Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12752	Mark RISON	230	2	28.1.1	327	61	E	Y	327.60998535 15625	61	28.1.1		V			648	In a few places "dual-carrier" is used instead of "dual carrier"	Change to "dual carrier"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:24:24Z) - Remove and keep acronym - see #13984	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:24:41Z - see #13984	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12753	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	"DCM" is used most of the time but sometimes "dual carrier modulation" (or variants) is used	Say "dual carrier modulation (DCM)" the first time then just "DCM" thereafter	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:53:04Z) - DCM is defined in 3.4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:53:34Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 668 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12754	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	The baseline definition "aggregate medium access control (MAC) service data unit (A-MSDU): A structure that contains one or more MSDUs and is tran	Extend the definition to allow for dynamic fragmentation	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12755	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	46	T	Y	142.46000671 38672	46	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	N_{STS,total} is not defined (2x in this table)	Define this as a NOTE in Table 9-262aa	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:50:35Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID12755 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed			I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:50:06Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12756	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	"long GI" from the baseline needs to be changed since it is now the shortest of the three GIs for ax	In the baseline, change "short GI" to "400 ns GI" and "long GI" to "800 ns GI" throughout	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 669 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12757	Mark RISON	230	2	10.5	186	7	T	Y	186.07000732421875	7	10.5		A	Ming Gan	98r2	477	The 4th para of the baseline must not be changed as it loses the it loses the security, MAC header and FCS components	Do not change the 4th para of the baseline	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:07:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-08 14:57:39Z - Ming Gan indicates that this resolution was approved in error and should have been REVISED with changes shown in 18/009	2.2	2018-02-14	EDITOR
12758	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.1	263	14	T	Y	263.14001464375	14	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	The concepts "SU-type" and "MU-type" are never defined	Define these concepts; also have a NOTE that the way in which the feedback is obtained (trigger-based, i.e. UL MU or non-trigger-based, i.e. UL SU) is	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:04:12Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0043r0 under all headings that include CID 12758.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 19:26:13Z - Some convergence with resolution for #12775	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 670 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12759	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	49	T	Y	134.49000549316406	49	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	"Indicates the minimum payload size in octets of the first fragment of an MSDU that is supported by the STA." -- is not clear: what exactly is " payloa	Define these terms and specify in a non-self-contradictory way whether this is just about MSDUs or also about A-MSDUs and MMPDUs	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:44:26Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. The payload size refers to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12760	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	368	46	T	Y	368.45999145 50781	46	28.3.3.9.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	"A full bandwidth MU-MIMO transmission using the HE MU PPDU format has a value of 1 for the SIGB Compression field in HE-SIG-A" is not strong enough	Change "has" to "shall have"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:44:24Z) Instruction to Editor: Change “has” to “shall have” at D2.2 P386 L32.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:04:35Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12761	Mark RISON	230	2	11.23.1	214	48	T	Y	214.47999572 753906	48	11.23.1		J	Liwen Chu		657	The set of features that TDLS STAs may and shall not use needs to be specified	In the referenced subclause add "A TDLS STA shall not transmit an HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU to a peer TDLS STA."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12762	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.65	116	55	T	Y	116.55000305175781	55	9.4.1.65		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	" The RU indices ruidx(0) and ruidx(Ncqi - 1) correspond to the RU Start Index and RU End Index subfields, respectively." -- "correspond" is too vagu	Change "correspond" to "are equal" in the cited text	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-05-15 04:55:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12763	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.65	116	57	T	Y	116.56999969482422	57	9.4.1.65		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	"The RU index ruidx(i) = ruidx(i - 1) + 1, where 1 <= i <= Ncqi - 2." -- the case i = Ncqi - 1 is missing	Change "2" to "1" in the cited text	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 04:56:20Z) The RU indices ruidx(0) and ruidx(Ncqi - 1) are equal to the RU Start Index and RU End Index subfields, resp ectiv	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12764	Mark RISON	230	2	27.13	310	53	E	Y	310.52999877 92969	53	27.13		A			447	"TxBF" -- no such field	Change to "TxBF"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:11:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:11:35Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 672 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12765	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	Unfortunately "BRP" already stands for "Beam Refinement Protocol" (11ad)	Change all instances of "BRP" to "Beamforming Report Poll" throughout and delete the definition in 3.4 and all "(BRP)"s	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:36:12Z) - Changed to BFRP with #11432	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:37:54Z - see #11432	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12766	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.65	116	53	T	Y	116.52999877929688	53	9.4.1.65		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	"Ncqi is a function of the RU Start Index and RU End Index subfields in the HE MIMO Control field." -- the function needs to be specified	State that Ncqi = RU End - RU Start + 1	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 04:57:37Z) Agree with the comment. Necessary text changes are made. TGax Editor to make the changes for CID12766 as suggested	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 673 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12767	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0378r1	533	The base of the RU Start Index is not specified (FORTRAN v. C conventions)	Specify that the lowest RU index is 0	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:50:16Z) Agree with the comment (there was no Page/Line or subclause number but with some deduction seems this is the right	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12768	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	18	E	Y	108.18000030517578	18	9.4.1.62		A			447	"RU26" is undefined	Change the cited text to "26-tone RU"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 18:00:18Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 18:00:21Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12769	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	109	52	T	Y	109.51999664 30664	52	9.4.1.63		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0080r2	457	"A beamformee may choose to reduce Ns by using a method referred to as grouping" -- it's not a "may" since Ng is not allowed to be 1 in HE	Change "may choose to reduce" to "reduces" in the cited text	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:23:55Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0080r2 under all headings that include CID 12769	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12770	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.62	107	20	T	Y	107.19999694824219	20	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	"Set to 0 for Nr = 1" is not a valid setting for CBR	Change to "0 is reserved"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 674 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12771	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	110	1	T	Y	110.01000213623047	1	9.4.1.63		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0080r2	457	"For the left of DC, sci dx(i) = scidx(i-1) + Ng, where 1 <= i <= L and scidx(L) = -4. For the right of DC, sci dx(i) = scidx(i-1) + Ng, where L +	Extend the equations to cover these two cases	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:24:30Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0080r2 under all headings that include CID 12771	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:46:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12772	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	109	51	E	Y	109.51000213623047	51	9.4.1.63		V	Kome Oteri	18/0080r2	457	There are references to a "Compressed Beamforming Feedback Matrix subfield" but no such subfield is defined	Refer to an defined subfield in 9.3.1.20, 9.4.1.63,	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 21:57:34Z) - It is appropriate to refer to the Feedback field only and not the NDP request (not 9.3.1.20) so only made a r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:44:37Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 675 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12773	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6	263	1	T	Y	263.01000976 5625	1	27.6		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	There are 5 references to 11454 octets, but an HE STA is not required to support 11k MPDUs (see Table 9-19)	Refer to the maximum MPDU length supported by the beamformer rather than 11454 octets	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:04:50Z) The requirements in Table 9-19 refer to the MPDU size that a STA supports in receive. The rules in this subclause	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 16:43:27Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12774	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.64	114	41	T	Y	114.41000366 210938	41	9.4.1.64		V	Lochan Verma	11-17/1826r0	448	"HE Compressed Beamforming Report information and HEMU Exclusive Beamforming Report information are included in the HE compressed beamform	Delete "SU or" in the cited text, and add a xref to 27.6.1, which states which fields are present in the HE CBF. Also add a similar xref from 11 5.54	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 00:34:30Z) TGax Editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 802.11-17/1826r0 under all headings that include CID 12774.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 676 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12775	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1	108	30	E	Y	108.30000030517578125	30	9.4.1		V			447	There are 6 references to "HE compressed beamforming and CQI feedback"	Replace each of these with "HE compressed beamforming feedback", which is the term used everywhere else	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:29:00Z) - The term HE compressed beamforming feedback is used in 28.3.15.2 to mean something different from the term us	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:31:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12776	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					V	Zhou Lan	11-17/1826r0	448	Need to define when each subfield is present in HE CBR (cf. 11ac "The MU Exclusive Beamforming Report information is included in the VHT Compressed Be	As it says in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 00:36:12Z) TGax Editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 802.11-17/1826r0 under all headings that include CID 12774	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 677 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12777	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	43	T	Y	136.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	It's not clear whether A-MSDU Fragmentation Support applies only for dynamic fragmentation or also for static fragmentation	State that this only applies to dynamic fragmentation (and hence also state that this field is reserved if the STA indicates that it does not support	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 22:47:24Z) Revised-A-MSDU Fragmentation Support applies only for dynamic fragmentation. Proposed resolution accounts for t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 21:56:16Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12778	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	"dynamic fragmentation" is poorly named	Rename it to "variable-length fragmentation"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12779	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.3	266	34	T	Y	266.33999633978906	34	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	" For example, the HE beam- former can request full 80 MHz bandwidth feedback for Ng = 4 by setting the RU Start Index and RU End Index subfields i	Spell it out in a table for all the combinations of Ng (2 options) and BW (4 options)	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:50:03Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 12779.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 678 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12780	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.65	116	53	T	Y	116.52999877929688	53	9.4.1.65		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	The rules for Ncqi do not cover the 80+80/160 case (unlike the rules for Ns for non-CQI-only feedback)	Give the rules for Ncqi for 80+80 and 160	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 04:58:40Z) RU Start Index and RU End Index subfield values for 160/80+80 MHz are defined (see Partial BW Info subfield in ND	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12781	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.3	119	9	T	Y	119.08999633789062	9	9.4.2.3		J			657	It should be made clear with a NOTE that you must not include the 126 membership selector (VHT) if you want to allow 20-MHz-only HE STAs, only 125 (HE	As it says in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 679 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12782	Mark RISON	230	2	27.11.5	306	41	T	Y	306.41000036621094	41	27.11.5		A	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	"A STA that is not a TXOP responder and the transmits an HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, or HE MU PPDU that carries a PS-Poll frame shall set the TXVECTOR	Change to "... and that transmits a PS-Poll frame in an HE SU PPDU, HE ER PPDU or HE MU PPDU shall..."	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:47:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:31:41Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12783	Mark RISON	230	2	27.11.5	306	41	T	Y	306.41000036621094	41	27.11.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	"A STA that is not a TXOP responder and the transmits an HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, or HE MU PPDU that carries a PS-Poll frame shall set the TXVECTOR	Delete " that is not a TXOP responder and"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:47:51Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. Note that a TXOP responder can send a PS-Poll in HE TB PPDU. Ho	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:30:32Z - Corrected references to PPDU type. There are two different PPDU types here: HE TB NDP feedback PPDU and HE TB PPDU. Se	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12784	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	82	56	E	Y	82.55999755859375	56	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	It says " Block Ack frame"	Change to "BlockAck frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 18:02:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 18:02:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 680 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12785	Mark RISON	230	2	28.1.1			T	Y			28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	28.1.1 Introduction to the HE PHY seems to be not just an intro but also a list of requirements, some of which don't appear to be specified elsewhere	Move the normative requirements into a new Subclause 28.1.1b, and keep only general introductory material in 28.1.1	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:35:15Z) The 28.1.1 serves as an introduction to 11ax PHY specification. It is typical in .11 specification to mention ma	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12786	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	110	21	T	Y	110.20999908447266	21	9.4.1.63		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	"(S, E) for 80 MHz" is unclear, especially when the RU index is different (e.g. at 110.62)	Just give the value directly	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 04:59:13Z) Formulation rather than exact values was used to reduce chances of error while writing the specification and whil	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 681 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12787	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	112	1	T	Y	112.01000213623047	1	9.4.1.63		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	"(S, E) for 80 MHz" is unclear, especially when the RU index is different (e.g. at 112.41)	Just give the value directly	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 05:00:00Z) Formulation rather than exact values was used to reduce chances of error while writing the specification and whil	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12788	Mark RISON	230	2	10.22.2.8	200	36	T	Y	200.36000061035156	36	10.22.2.8		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0040r2	504	It should be made clear a Trigger frame cannot cause the TXOP limit to be exceeded, except for BRP	At the end of the "NOTE---The TXOP limit is not exceeded for the following situations:" list add a bullet "Transmission of a Trigger frame, other than	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:09:34Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor to ma	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12789	Mark RISON	230	2	10.22.2.8	199	52	T	Y	199.52000427246094	52	10.22.2.8		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0040r2	504	There should be no exception for A-MSDUs re TXOP limit, as the STA should not aggregate if it will exceed the TXOP limit	Delete " or A-MSDU" at 199.53, 199.55, 199.58 and "/A-MSDU" at 200.29, 200.30	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:10:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 682 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12790	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.3	250	49	T	Y	250.49000549316406	49	27.5.3.3		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	"The DEFAULT_PE_DURATION parameter is set to the default PE duration value for UL MU response scheduling, which is indicated by the AP in	Delete " and the pre-FEC padding factor is set to 4 (see 28.3.12)" from the cited text	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:32:43Z) The text cited by the comment is required as the receiver needs to know the precoding factor to correctly decode	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12791	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.12	478	34	E	Y	478.33999633978906	34	28.3.12		A			648	"PE_duration" is undefined	Change to "T_PE"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:28:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:28:34Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12792	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.17	485	21	E	Y	485.20999145 50781	21	28.3.17		V			648	"PE_duration" is undefined	Change to "T_PE"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:16:22Z) - It would be clearer to say the the PE field is not present. Change to read "Uses the HE TB PPDU format but wi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:17:03Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12793	Mark RISON	230	2	28.2.2	346	43	T	Y	346.42999267578125	43	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	PE_DURATION is an enumerated type with enumeration values not used anywhere	Change to an integer type, with allowed values 0, 4, 8, 12, 16 us	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:29:45Z) Reason: The PE_DURATION is a TXVECTOR/RXVECTOR parameter and should be Enumerated type instead of an absolute va	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:03:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12794	Mark RISON	230	2	28.2.2	346	29	T	Y	346.29000854 49219	29	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	DEFAULT_PE_DURATION has no defined values	Define it as an integer type, with allowed values 0, 4, 8, 12, 16 us	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:29:30Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:03:48Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 684 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12795	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.3	299	63	T	Y	299.63000048828125	63	27.10.3		V	Liwen Chu	428r0	629	A-MPDU_Length is undefined (in the baseline, for VHT it's initialised from the length of the resulting A-MPDU pre-EOF padding)	Describe how A-MPDU_Length is initialised	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:25:36Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0428r0 under CID 12795	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 23:03:21Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12796	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0934r1	596	Preamble puncturing is inadequately defined and described. Needs to be clearer that it's basically about using OFDMA and restricting the allocated RU	Define the terms "subchannel is punctured", "[RU is] zeroed out", "channels removed". Clarify whether tx is restricted to APs (as suggested by 28.1.1	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:52:20Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11418, 12580, 12796 and 13764 in 11-18/0934r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12797	Mark RISON	230	2	27.11.2	304	40	E	Y	304.39999938964844	40	27.11.2		A			447	"IBSS member STA" (2x) should be just "IBSS STA"	As it says in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:51:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:51:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 685 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12798	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					V	Alfred Asterjadhi		648	Sending an ULMU PPDU has no value	Delete all references to this (e.g. the NOTE at 315.5 and the ref in 27.10.2)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:54:50Z) - Agree in principle. All references have been removed with resolutions to other comments. No further change re	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:55:23Z- EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:55:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12799	Mark RISON	230	2	27.11.2	304	50	T	Y	304.5	50	27.11.2		A	Yongho Seok	11-18/0629r1	613	"A STA transmitting an HE PPDU to a DLS or TDLS peer STA, IBSS member STA, mesh STA, or another non-AP STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter UPLINK_FLA	Change the cited text to "Otherwise, a STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter UPLINK_FLAG to 0"	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:37:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 686 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12800	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.20	506	40	T	Y	506.39999938964844	40	28.3.20		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	"When a packet extension and/or a signal extension present, the PHY-TXEND.confirm primitive is generated at the end of the packet extension or signal	Change the para at the referenced location to "A packet extension and/or a signal extension may be present in the PPDU. The PHY-TXEND.confirm primitiv	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:17:10Z) Read like the same thing expressed in different ways.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12801	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.7.1	408	9	T	Y	408.08999633978906	9	28.3.10.7.1		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	No behaviour is associated with the "TxBF" field in HE-SIG-A	Make this field reserved	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:57:02Z) This field enables the receiver to make decisions about smoothing	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:36:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12802	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	431	8	T	Y	431.07998657722656	8	28.3.10.8.6		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	No behaviour is associated with the "Tx Beamforming" field in HE-SIG-B	Make this field reserved	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:04:34Z) This field enables the receiver to make decisions about smoothing	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:00:57Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 687 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12803	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.7.1	408	9	E	Y	408.08999633 78906	9	28.3.10.7.1		J			648	The field should not be called "TxBF" in one place and "Tx Beamforming" in another	Change "TxBF" to "Tx Beamforming"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:07:58Z) - It is not clear from the comment where it is called anything other than TxBF	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:08:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12804	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	"Length" should be "LENGTH" in "L-SIG Length field", "Length field of the L-SIG" (2x), "Length field in L-SIG", "Length, Parity, and Tail bits"	As it says in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:03:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:03:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12805	Mark RISON	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	59	5	E	Y	59.049999237 06055	5	9.2.4.6.4.1		V			447	Some of the "Meaning" entries in Table 9-18a need to be initial-capitalised. Also 6 has a meaning of CCI but a content of CAS; needs to be "Command A	As it says in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:26:16Z) - Change "Command Control Indication" to "Command and status (CAS)" for consistency with other entries. The "Me	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 00:28:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12806	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	15	E	Y	88.150001525 8789	15	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	Broken reference	Change Table 21-13 to Table 28-19	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:15:58Z) Agree with the comment. The incorrect reference is fixed in D2.2 Tgax editor: No further changes are needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change		It is not clear how Table 21-13 defines the encoding of this field, however, this would be a technical change.	N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:13:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12807	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.2	288	19	T	Y	288.19000244 140625	19	27.8.2		J	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"An OMI initiator that is an HE AP should be capable of receiving within an operating channel width and with NSS that are up to the values of the most	Change "should" to "shall" in the cited text	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:06:00Z) Rejected. Many parts of the OMI parameters handling is written with should statements. For instance, OMI paramet	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 689 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12808	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.3	289	24	T	Y	289.23999902343 75	24	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"NOTE 1---The STA sets the UL MU Disable subfield to 1 to indicate that it will not respond to any variant of the Trigger frame and will not respond t	Deleted cited text	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:06:44Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:10:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12809	Mark RISON	230	2	27.2.2	222	1	T	Y	222.00999450683594	1	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"PARTIAL_AID[5:8] not equal to the partial BSS color announced by the BSS" -- partial BSS colour is not announced, the full colour is, with an extra i	Reword as "PARTIAL_AID[5:8] is not compatible with the BSS color announced by the BSS"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 690 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12810	Mark RISON	230	2	27.11.4	306	24	T	Y	306.23999023 4375	24	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	"PARTIAL_AID [5:8] in the transmitting VHT PPDU with the TXVECTOR parameter GROUP_ID equal to 63 is not the same as the partial BSS color announced by	Reword as "PARTIAL_AID [5:8] for VHT PPDUs transmitted by an HE AP with the TXVECTOR parameter GROUP_ID equal to 63 is not compatible with the BSS col	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:57:16Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0456r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:11:39Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12811	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	"a frame with the duration information indicated by a Duration field in the PSDU of the PPDU with the RXVECTOR parameter TXOP_DURATION" (4 instances:	Change the sentence for each of the 4 instances to "An MPDU with duration information is not received"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 691 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12812	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	37	T	Y	144.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	There are several issues with the "20 MHz In 40 MHz HE PPDU In 2.4 GHz Band" subfield: "Band" is missing in the 2 instances on p. 140; NOTE 2 on p. 14	As it says in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:26:28Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID12812 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0725r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12813	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	45	T	Y	144.44999694 82422	45	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	There are several issues with the "20 MHz In 160/80+80 MHz HE PPDU" subfield: 366.56 is missing "/80+80"; NOTE 3 on p. 140 duplicates the cell to the	As it says in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:26:49Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID12813 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0725r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12814	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	53	T	Y	144.52999877929688	53	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	It's not just 160 MHz OFDMA	Change "160 MHz" to "160/80+80 MHz" at the referenced location	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:54:42Z) 160/80+80 MHz refers to HE PPDU bandwidth. In both cases, the field indicates 160 MHz OFDMA support	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12815	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.1	168	47	T	Y	168.47000122070312	47	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	The EOF bit no longer indicates EOF in HE PPDUs	In Table 9-422 delete "End of frame indication." and add a NOTE at the end of the cell containing this saying "NOTE---The EOF field indicates EOF in a	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:48:20Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0425r4 under 12815	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 693 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12816	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.1	168	52	T	Y	168.52000427246094	52	9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	"a QoS Data frame or Action frame soliciting an Ack frame" is confusing because an Action frame always solicits an Ack	Change " set to 1 in a MPDU delimiter preceding a QoS Data frame or Action frame soliciting an Ack frame in response that are contained in an ack-enab	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:49:06Z) Rejected Discussion: The commenter is right that Action frame is always soliciting Ack. However Action frame in	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12817	Mark RISON	230	2	10.3.2.10.1	182	45	E	Y	182.44999694 82422	45	10.3.2.10.1		A			447	"the BlockAckReq frame with multi-TID BAR variant" is odd	Change to "a Multi-TID BlockAckReq frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:27:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:27:59Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12818	Mark RISON	230	2	10.3.2.10.1	182	41	T	Y	182.41000366210938	41	10.3.2.10.1		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	The "carried in SU format" is not clear. Does it refer to HE SU PPDUs only or also to HE TB PPDUs? What is the point of this insertion anyway?	Delete the cited insertion	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:22:26Z) Rejected - The purpose of " carried in SU format" is to differentiate with the next sentence of MU format	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 694 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12819	Mark RISON	230	2	27.3.1	230	1	T	Y	230.00999450683594	1	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	" a S-MPDU, A-MPDU or multi-TID A-MPDUs" -- an S-MPDU is in an A-MPDU and a multi-TID A-MPDU is an A-MPDU	Changed cited text to "an A-MPDU containing one or more MPDUs sent"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:20:01Z) Revised- Agree with comment in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor pl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:10:11Z - change which to that	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12820	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.2	236	25	T	Y	236.25	25	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"an S-MPDU, or A-MPDU, or a multi-TID A-MPDU" -- an S-MPDU is in an A-MPDU and a multi-TID A-MPDU is an A-MPDU	Change the first para of the referenced subclause to "A STA that transmits a Multi-STA BlockAck frame in response to an A-MPDU sets the Ack Type and T	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:06:45Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 695 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12821	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.2	236	29	T	Y	236.28999328 61328	29	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"may generate a Multi-STA BlockAck frame using the procedure described in pre-association ack context." is not clear: what does it do if it chose	Add a xref to this description, add "the" before "pre" and state what the STA does if it does not use the procedure	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:07:39Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12822	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4	236	31	T	Y	236.30999755 859375	31	27.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Multi-TID A-MPDUs are defined, but single-TID A-MPDUs are not (presumably everything that is not a MTAM is a STAM -- even if it doesn't have any QoS D	State where multi-TID A-MPDUs are defined that an A-MPDU that is not a multi-TID A-MPDU is a single-TID A-MPDU	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:08:39Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 696 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12823	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.2	236	33	T	Y	236.33000018310547	33	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If all MPDUs in the AMPDU are received successfully, then the recipient may follow the proce- dure described in the All Ack context. Otherwise	State what the STA does if it does not do either of these	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:09:36Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Otherwise clause is changed from 'may' to 'shall'. TGax editor shall incorporate	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12824	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					A			648	"AMPDU" is used	Change to "A-MPDU" in the 4 occurrences not in a word starting "dot11"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:10:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 20:10:53Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12825	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	46	E	Y	239.46000671 38672	46	27.4.4.3		A			447	"addressed to it" need not be specified multiple times. 239.46 is sufficient	Delete at 239.49, 239.59,	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:51:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:51:24Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12826	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	13	T	Y	239.13000488 28125	13	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The A-MPDU might contain Action frames rather than QoS Data/Null frames	Add "Action," before QoS Data at 239.13	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:21:25Z) Revised - Agree in principle. No need to explictly mention Action/Action No Ack, since it is a type of maangemen	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 697 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12827	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	22	T	Y	240.22 000122 070312	22	27.4.4.4		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	It doesn't have to be an UMRS, it can be a Trigger frame	Change " if a UMRS Control field is present" to "either a Trigger frame or a frame with a UMRS Control field is present" (as under 3))	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:22:52Z) Rejected - Since this paragraph is about S-MPDU, it cannot carry both the trigger-frame MPDU and QoS-Data. Only	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12828	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	32	T	Y	240.32 000732 421875	32	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"carries a multi-TID A-MPDU" is known by the transmitter but not by the receiver	Reword in terms of "receives QoS Data or QoS Null frames with ack policy HTP Ack and with more than one TID, or receives a QoS Data or QoS Null frame	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:24:01Z) Revised - Agree in principle. No need to explictly mention Action/Action No Ack, since it is a type of maangemen	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 698 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12829	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	39	T	Y	240.38 999938 964844	39	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	It is not clear whether an HE TB PPDU is the transmission by a given STA or the union of the transmissions by a set of STAs (as specified in the Trigg	State in 28.3.4 that an HE TB PPDU is the waveform generated by a given STA, and that an UL MU PPDU consists of one or more HE TB PPDUs Change the las	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:25:16Z) Revised - The current text already captures the idea that the HE-TB PPDU is a union of transmissions from multip	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12830	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	14	E	Y	241.13 999938 964844	14	27.4.4.6		A			447	There is no b)	Delete "a)" and deindent. Also make both bullets start "The AP responds" (no shall, no may)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:56:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:57:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12831	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	26	T	Y	241.25 999450 683594	26	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Issues with "Group Addressed Multi-STA BlockAck In DL MU Support": should be hyphen not space at 136.19, 187.15, 241.27; should be specified to be res	As it says in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:37:23Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 699 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12832	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	16	T	Y	239.16000366210938	16	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The usage of the term "S-MPDU" is incorrect. An S-MPDU, from the baseline, is "An MPDU that is the ***only*** MPDU in an aggregate MPDU (A-MPDU) carr	Review all uses of the term "S-MPDU" and change those that need to be (e.g. the one at the referenced location) to "MPDU in a delimiter with EOF=1"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:39:07Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Usage of S-MPDU is consistent with the definition. Removed QoS Null (which was als	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12833	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	28	T	Y	173.27999877929688	28	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Only ack policy No Ack is allowed for QoS Nulls in the A-MPDU case, except for S-MPDU. It would be desirable for a STA to be able to know the peer has	Allow ack policy Normal Ack for QoS Null frames sent in A-MPDUs between HE STAs	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:41:37Z) Rejected Discussion: The group believe that QoS Null with No Ack Policy is good enough.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12834	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	174	43	E	Y	174.42999267578125	43	9.7.3		A			648	There is no "No Acknowledgment" ack policy	Change to "No Ack" (2x)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:25:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:25:23Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 700 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12835	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	171	11	T	Y	171.11000061035156	11	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	The insertions of ", TXOP responder" break existing implementations	Restrict the use by a TXOP Responder to exchanges between HE STAs	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:56:01Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12835	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12836	Mark RISON	230	2	28.2.2	336	44	T	Y	336.44000244140625	44	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Table 28-1 is not clear on when the STBC parameter shall be 0	Express as "Set to 0 for:" and then list all the conditions under which it shall be 0	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:24:00Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:00:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 701 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12837	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.240	152	33	E	Y	152.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.240		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0684r2	599	"a value 0 of the AIFSN field indicates that the AIFSN is equal to the value of the MU EDCA Timer, i.e., EDCA is disabled for the duration specified b	Change the cited text to "the value 0 in the AIFSN field indicates that EDCA is disabled for the duration specified by the MUEDCATimer for the corresp	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:28:40Z) - Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes. TGax editor to make the chan	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0		Threre are technical issues with the description: AIFSN equal to MU EDCA Timer is not the same as EDCA is disabled for the duration specified by the M	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:31:57Z-	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12838	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.1	286	64	T	Y	286.64001464 84375	64	27.8.1		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"An HESTA that receives a frame including an OM Control subfield is defined as an OMI responder." [...] "the OMI responder shall [...]". This makes	Change "An HESTA that receives a frame including an OM Control subfield is defined as an OMI responder." to "An HESTA with dot11OMIOptionImplemented	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:07:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:56:37Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 702 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12839	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.1	286	58	T	Y	286.57998657 22656	58	27.8.1		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"When a first STA transmit both OM Control field and Operating Mode field in different PPDUs to a second STA, the second STA shall use the most recent	Add to the end of the para " When a first STA transmits both an OM Control field and an Operating Mode field in the same PPDU to a second STA, the seco	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:08:29Z) Revised. Disagree in principle. The standard denies the use of OM Control and OMI fields in the same MPDU to avoi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:49:58Z- The resolution doc shows edits associated with this CID.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12840	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.1	287	17	T	Y	287.17001342 77344	17	27.8.1		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"When a STA transmits both an OM Control field and Operating Mode field, then the OMI responder shall use the channel width and the RXNSS of the most	Delete the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:09:25Z) Revised. Agree in principle, the cited text is not needed. Make the changes shown in this 11-17-0035r5 submissio	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	returned		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:50:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 703 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12841	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.2	288	1	E	Y	288.01000976 5625	1	27.8.2		V			447	Heading does not match next subclause	Change "eceive" to "ules for r" at the referenced location	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:32:07Z) - Change the title of the subsequent subclause to "Transmit operating mode (TOM) indication"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:32:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12842	Mark RISON	230	2	27.8.3	288	42	T	Y	288.42001342 77344	42	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	It is not immediately obvious that TOMI is not a general indication like ROMI is, but is specific to HE TB PPDUs	After the first para add a "NOTE---TOM indication does not relate to transmissions in PPDUs other than HE TB PPDUs. An AP does not perform TOM indica	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:10:08Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:03:53Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12843	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3	484	48	T	Y	484.48001098 63281	48	28.3		V	Yongho Seok		614	28.3.4 is fairly clear that the only HE PPDU formats are SU, MU, ER and TB, but some other parts of the spec seem to think HE NDP and HE NDP short fee	Change F28-43, F28-44 to not refer to an HE (TB) NDP (feedback) PPDU format	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:28:53Z) - Agree in principle. TGax editor remove "PPDU" from titles of Figure 28-43 (HE NDP PPDU format) and Figure 28	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:33:36Z - Kept PPDU in the title since the subclause (including sentence that references the figure) refers to "HE NDP PPDU". The		2018-05-31	EDITOR
12844	Mark RISON	230	2	28.1.1	327	26	E	Y	327.26000976 5625	26	28.1.1		V			648	"The HE PHY with greater than or equal to 80 MHz capability" is odd	Change the cited text to "The aspects of the HE PHY other than 20 MHz-only capability"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:18:07Z) - statement modified with resolutions to other comments and no furhter changes are needed	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:18:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 705 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12845	Mark RISON	230	2	27.17	325	15	E	Y	325.14999938964844	15	27.17		V			648	"NOTE---After associated with a VHT AP, a 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA can transmit an Operating Mode Notification frame with the Channel Bandwidth subfi	Changed cited text to "NOTE---After associating with a VHT AP, a 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA can transmit an Operating Mode Notification frame with t	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:42:33Z) - 27.17 removed with resolutions to other comments. No furhter change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:42:37Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12846	Mark RISON	230	2	27.17	325	15	T	Y	325.14999938964844	15	27.17		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	15r0	501	"NOTE---After associated with a VHT AP, a 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA can transmit an Operating Mode Notification frame with the Channel Bandwidth subfi	Delete the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 05:53:12Z) Revised – The subclause is deleted as suggested by CID 13301. Tgax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/00	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:11:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 706 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12847	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4	234	39	T	Y	234.38999938964844	39	27.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The rules for acknowledgment should be simplified. Irrespective of PPDU format, role, direction, etc., for a given RU+set of spatial streams: - if th	As it says in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:10:18Z) Revised - The section has been re-written to simplify the rules. Commentor to see if the changes satisfy the com	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12848	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.1.63	109	62	T	Y	109.62000274658203	62	9.4.1.63		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	The rules for which subcarriers are in HE CBR is grotesquely complex (e.g. different rules for 20M and 40M+, outside subcarriers not necessarily Ng-se	As it says in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 05:01:02Z) Partial BW Info field in NDPA indicates the Start 26-tone RU Index and End 26-tone RU Index. Tables 28-6, 28-7, a	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 707 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12849	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			447	"all ack" has about 16 different forms: with space or with hyphen, ack or Ack or ACK, etc.	Use "all-ack" (or "All-ack" at the start of a sentence etc.) throughout	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:27:22Z) Replace all instances of "all-ack" with "all ack". Replace instances of "All Ack" with lower case "all ack". Re	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:28:46Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12850	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	55	E	Y	173.55000030517578	55	9.7.3		A			648	"Implicit BAR" -- no such ack policy	Change to "Implicit Block Ack Request"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:21:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:21:57Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12851	Mark RISON	230	2	10.24.10.3	205	18	E	Y	205.17999267578125	18	10.24.10.3		A			447	"BAR" is undefined	Change to "Block Ack Req"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 22:01:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 22:01:28Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12852	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	7	E	Y	239.07000732421875	7	27.4.4.1		A			447	"(e.g., Action, (multi-TID) BAR, MU-BAR Trigger frame, GCR MU-BAR Trigger frame, etc.)" is grammatically poor and "BAR" is undefined	Delete the cited text	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:48:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:48:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12853	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.5	241	46	E	Y	241.46000671138672	46	27.4.5		A			447	"BAR" is undefined	Change to "BlockAckReq"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:17:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:18:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 708 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12854	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	12	E	Y	252.11999511 71875	12	27.5.3.4		A			447	"BAR" is undefined	Change to "BlockAckReq"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:38:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:38:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12855	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	47	E	Y	252.47000122 070312	47	27.5.3.4		A			447	"MU BAR" is undefined	Change to "MU-BAR"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:22:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:23:04Z - see #13314	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12856	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	53	E	Y	252.52999877 929688	53	27.5.3.4		A			447	"MU BAR" is undefined	Change to "MU-BAR"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:23:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:23:18Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12857	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	133	61	T	Y	133.61000061 035156	61	9.4.2.237.2		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	Should be clearer that +HTC-HE Support, OM Control Support are mandatory for APs	Add "Set to 1 when transmitted by an AP" to the end of the rightmost cell for each of these	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:16:02Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Need some text for the +HTC-HE Support. For the OM Control support, D2.2 already	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12858	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	137	16	E	Y	137.16000366 210938	16	9.4.2.237.2		A			447	Formatting broken	Fix formatting to match other similar cells	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:56:13Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:56:15Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12859	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	133	61	T	Y	133.61000061035156	61	9.4.2.237.2		V	Abhishek Patil	369r4	541	Should be clearer that UMRS Support, Trigger Frame MAC Padding Duration, Group Addressed Multi-STA BlockAck In DL MU Support, Rx Control Frame to Mult	Add "Reserved when transmitted by an AP" to the end of the rightmost cell for each of these	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 02:46:42Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The rows cited by the comment are updated to indicate that the subfield applies	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:12:34Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12860	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	6	T	Y	134.05999755859375	6	9.4.2.237.2		A	Abhishek Patil	740r1	639	"carried in a QoS Data, QoS Null, or Management frame" -- can't be in anything else!	Delete the cited text	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:41:32Z) Accept TGax editor, please delete the text cited by the comment.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:00:34Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12861	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	10	T	Y	135.10000610351562	10	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793r1	603	"Multi-TID Aggregation Support" is not defined clearly	At the referenced location change "Indicates the number of TIDs minus 1 of QoS Data frames that an HE STA can aggregate in a multi-TID A-MPDU as desc	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:54:33Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 12379.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 710 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12862	Mark RISON	230	2	C.3	572	28	T	Y	572.28002929 6875	28	C.3		A	Edward Au	17/781r1	646	dot11AMPDUwithMultipleTIDOptionImplemented should be about rx, not tx, because that's what others need to know	At 302.1 change "For an HE STA with dot11AMPDUwithMultipleTIDOptionImplemented set to true and having a single A-MPDU containing MPDUs with diffe	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 15:56:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:04:48Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12863	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.5	241	50	E	Y	241.5	50	27.4.5		A			447	"Multi-TID A-MPDU" has wrong case	Lowercase the first M	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:18:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:18:38Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12864	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	Various places that explicitly refer to HE SU PPDUs need to also refer to HE ER PPDUs	Add references to HE ER PPDUs after the reference to HE SU PPDUs in 27.4.5, 27.15.3, 28.3.11.2, 27.4.4.2, Table 28-15, 28.3.11.5.1	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 711 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12865	Mark RISON	230	2	27.15.2	314	48	T	Y	314.4800109863281	48	27.15.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"An HESTA may transmit an HE SU PPDU to a peer HE STA." -- really? I'd never have guessed	Deleted cited text	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:59:13Z) The comment fails to identify a technical issue. The statement simply indicates that an HE STA may generate an HE	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12866	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.5	241	50	T	Y	241.5	50	27.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"a Multi-TID A-MPDU that solicits an immediate response" is known by the transmitter but not by the receiver	Reword in terms of "receives QoS Data or QoS Null frames with ack policy other than No Ack or Block Ack and with more than one TID, or receives a QoS	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:11:03Z) Revised.- Since the ack rules are already captured in 27.4.4, deleting the two sentences TGax editor shall inco	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 712 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12867	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.5	241	50	T	Y	241.5	50	27.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" An HESTA that receives a Multi-TID A-MPDU that solicits an immediate response shall send the acknowledgement using a Multi-STA BlockAck frame. An H	Deleted the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:37:09Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	see #12379	2.2	2018-04-06	EDITOR
12868	Mark RISON	230	2				G	Y					A			648	Some of the cross-references (to subclauses/tables/figures/equations) are not hyperlinks so will rot	Make sure all cross-references to things within the document are hyperlinks	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:55:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:55:51Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12869	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			648	Need to be clearer the packet extension is completely distinct and independent from the signal extension (also need to make sure the HE PHY is mention	As it says in the comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:56:15Z) - The comment does not identify a problem with the draft.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:56:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 713 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12870	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	Sometimes the spec wording indicates that an RU is necessarily less than the full PPDU bandwidth, sometimes it indicates that a non-OFDMA transmission	State that a full-width transmission is an RU, and then simplify things like "HE-MCSs for 242-tone RU and non-OFDMA 20 MHz, NSS = 1" to "HE-MCSs for 2	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12871	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.11.5.4	458	1	T	Y	458.010009765625	1	28.3.11.5.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	An argmax vector operator is used but not defined	Define the argmax operator	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:13:31Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID12871 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:20:15Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12872	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.12	477	1	T	Y	477.010009765625	1	28.3.12		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	An max_u vector operator is used but not defined	Define the max_u operator	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:38:24Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12561 and 12872 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:41Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 714 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12873	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	45	T	Y	88.449996948 24219	45	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	"Values 0 to 60 map to -20 dBm to 40 dBm" is not clear	Delete Table 9-25f and change "The AP Tx Power subfield encoding is defined in Table 9-25f (AP Tx Power subfield encoding)." to "The AP Tx Power subfi	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:17:23Z) Since the range extends from -20dBm to +40 dBm, it is better to keep the table to clearly show the mapping for the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:13:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12874	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	4 instances of "HE_PREAMBLE" (after "T")	Change each to "HE-PREAMBLE"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:43:39Z) - Fixed with resolutions to other comments. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 19:43:57Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12875	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	60	E	Y	88.599998474 1211	60	9.3.1.23		V			648	There is no value, just confusion/verbosity, in having a Packet Extension subfield itself containing two subfields	Just show the two subfields directly in the Figure and remove references to a Packet Extension subfield	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:22:18Z) - Change to "No More RA-RU" for consistency with the other "More" fields (More Data, More PPDU, More Fragments	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:25:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12876	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.12	479	26	T	Y	479.26000976 5625	26	28.3.12		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	"The PE Disambiguity subfield of the Packet Extension subfield for an HE TB PPDU" -- there are no such subfields	Change the cited text to "The PE Disambiguity subfield in the Packet Extension subfield of the Common Info field in a Trigger frame". At 480.12 chang	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:39:46Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 12867 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:19:07Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 716 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12877	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.21	514	17	T	Y	514.16998291562	17	28.3.21		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	"THE_PREAMBLE, NSYM, TPE and NMA are defined in Equation (28-114), Equation (28-115) and Equation (28-116), respectively." -- 4 parameters b	Number the T_HE_PREAMBLE equation and add it to the start of the list of equations cited	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:21:08Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 12877.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:09:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12878	Mark RISON	230	2	28.4.3	520	12	T	Y	520.11999511871875	12	28.4.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r1	464	"T_HE_PREAMBLE is defined as in Equation (28-114) and Equation (28-115)" -- neither of those equations defines T_HE_PREAMBLE	Number the T_HE_PREAMBLE equation and refer to this instead	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:18:25Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text changes in 11-18/0057r1 under CID 12878.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:55:19Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12879	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	The L-SIG field is called LENGTH not Length	Change Length to LENGTH at 333.5, 333.11, 382.47, 383.24, 402.52, 403.1, 452.36	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 717 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12880	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.5	403	1	T	Y	403.01000976 5625	1	28.3.10.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"The LSB of the binary expression of the Length value shall be mapped to B5." is confusing (why is this being stated?) duplication of the baseline	Delete the cited text	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:00:09Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID12880 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:46:25Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12881	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.2	263	51	E	Y	263.51000976 5625	51	27.6.2		A			447	Missing space in ">80"	Add a space after ">"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:23:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:23:18Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12882	Mark RISON	230	2	C.3	569	1	T	Y	569.01000976 5625	1	C.3		V	Edward Au	17/781r1	646	The non-generic part of the description of many of the MIB variables is missing (e.g. dot11HEBeamformeeSTSSupportLessThanOrEqualTo80)	Make sure each MIB variable has a specific description	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 15:55:29Z) - Agree in principle. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0781r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 16:53:58Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 718 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12883	Mark RISON	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	247	43	T	Y	247.42999267578125	43	27.5.3.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0794r1	604	"The AP shall set the value in the TID Aggregation Limit subfield in the Trigger Dependent User Info field to 0 or 1 for an HE STA that has 0 in the M	Delete " or 1" in the first sentence cited	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 07:47:51Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-18/0794r1 under 12883	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12884	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	408	4	T	Y	408.04000854 49219	4	28.3.10.7.2		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	"Set to 1 if space time block coding is used. Neither DCM nor STBC shall be applied when both the DCM and STBC are set to 1." -- the second sentence c	Change to "Set to 1 if space time block coding is used, if DCM is set to 0. Neither DCM nor STBC shall be applied when both the DCM and STBC are set t	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:56:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:19:43Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12885	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	56	E	Y	239.55999755859375	56	27.4.4.3		A			447	"as defi ne in" typo	Change to "as defined in"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:51:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:51:54Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 719 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12886	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					V			648	" includes one or more QoS Data frame or QoS Null frame" -- the grammar is wrong and it's slighly ambiguous as to whether there can be a mix	Change each instance (3 in total) to "includes one or more QoS Data or QoS Null frames". Similarly change each instance (2 in total) of " more than o	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:58:38Z) - All instances appear ot have been dixed with resolutions to other comments. A search for "one or more QoS Dat	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:00:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12887	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	26	T	Y	239.25999450683594	26	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE SU PPDU carries a multi-TID A-MPDU that includes more than one QoS Data frame or QoS Null frame with the Ack Policy field equal to Implicit	Include the case 1xQoS+1xAction in addition to the case >1xQoS already described	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:39:56Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Revised the text to add MMPDU + QoS Data TGax editor shall incorporate changes in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 720 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12888	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	20	T	Y	239.19999969482422	20	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	A QoS Null cannot be sent under a BA and so cannot have ack policy Implicit BAR. Ditto in 27.4.4.3	Change " includes one or more QoS Data frame or QoS Null frame with EOF = 0, and with the Ack Policy field equal to Implicit Block Ack Request for at	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:40:44Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12889	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	17	T	Y	239.16999816989453	17	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	What if it's a Management frame other than an Action or Action No Ack? Those need to be acked too	Change "an Action Ack frame" to "a Management frame other than an Action No Ack frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:45:42Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	see #12379	2.2	2018-04-06	EDITOR
12890	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	6	T	Y	239.05999755859375	6	27.4.4.1		J	Ross		657	"A STA that sends a PPDU to an intended recipient " -- the STA is not going to send the PPDU to an unintended recipient	Delete " to an intended recipient" in the cited text	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 721 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12891	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	6	T	Y	239.05999755859375	6	27.4.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The TID is also important (distinguishes single-TID from multi-TID A-MPDUs)	Add "TID and" before "Ack Policy" at the referenced location	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:42:37Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:50:53Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12892	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	6	T	Y	239.05999755859375	6	27.4.4.1		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The PPDU type is also important	Add "PPDU format" to the list of deciding factors	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:43:20Z) Rejected - Though it is true that that there are some special rules based on PPDU format (like HE TB PPDU), the	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12893	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	36	T	Y	239.36000061035156	36	27.4.4.3		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This subclause is about responding, so rules on what the AP may or may not do are not appropriate	Move the first para (inc. bullets) to a different subclause	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:44:13Z) Rejected - The rules for response is in the first paragraph. Removing this paragraph will bring incompleteness	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12894	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	3	T	Y	240.02999877929688	3	27.4.4.4		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This subclause is about responding, so rules on what the AP may or may not do are not appropriate	Move the first sentence to a different subclause	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:44:55Z) Rejected - The rules for response is part of the sentence Removing this sentence will bring incompleteness	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12895	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	41	T	Y	240.41000366210938	41	27.4.4.5		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This subclause is about responding, so rules on what the non-AP STA may or may not do are not appropriate	Move the first sentence to a different subclause	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:45:35Z) Rejected - The rules for response is part of the sentence Removing this sentence will bring incompleteness	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 723 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12896	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	4	T	Y	240.03999328 61328	4	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"shall set the Ack Policy to HTP Ack for each of the MPDUs for which it intends to solicit an immediate response" -- not all MPDUs have an Ack Policy	Change "MPDUs" to "QoS Data or QoS Null frames"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:46:21Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Changed MPDU to QoS Data frames. QoS Nulls are not allowed. Updated the text TGax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12897	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	10	T	Y	240.10000610 351562	10	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	What if it's a Management frame other than an Action or Action No Ack? Those need to be acked too	Change "an Action-Ack frame" to "a Management frame other than an Action No Ack frame" at the referenced location and at line 17. Also put a para bre	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:47:08Z) Revised - Agree in principle. No need to explictly mention Action/Action No Ack, since it is a type of maangemen	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 724 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12898	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	33	T	Y	240.33000018310547	33	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU carries a multi-TID A-MPDU that includes QoS Data frames or QoS Null frames with the Ack Policy field equal to HTP Ac	Include the cases 1xQoS+1xAction and 2x QoS-different-TIDs in addition to the case >1xQoS+1xAction already described	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:48:00Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12899	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	42	T	Y	240.41999816894533	42	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" shall set the Ack Policy to Normal Ack/Implicit Block Ack Request " -- can only do so for QoS Data/Null (not e.g. MMPDUs)	add "of QoS Data and QoS Null frames" after "Ack Policy"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:48:53Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. QoS Nulls are not allowed TGax editor shall incorporate changes	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 725 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12900	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	44	T	Y	240.44 000244 140625	44	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE AP intends to send the response in a DL SU PPDU format" -- the AP doesn't need to "intend", it just needs to do"	Change the cited text to "If the HE AP sends the response in a DL SU PPDU format"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:50:01Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12901	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	37	T	Y	81.370 0027465 8203	37	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"an Action frame carried in an A-MPDU" -- also other MMPDUs, except Action No Ack	Change the cited text to "a Management frame other than an Action No Ack frame, carried in an A-MPDU"	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:06:55Z) Rejected. An Action frame and an Action No Ack frame are clearly differentiated in subclause 9.3.3. It was also	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 726 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12902	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	52	T	Y	240.52 000427 246094	52	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"an S-MPDU from a single STA that solicits an immediate response" where the S-MPDU is a QoS Data/Null is also "a single TID A-MPDU from a single STA t	Mention QoS Data/Null and EOF=0, as in 27.4.4.3/4.2)	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:50:47Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12903	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	53	T	Y	240.52 999877 929688	53	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	If the single-TID A-MPDU has an Action frame too, the M-BA will have to have a mix of Ack Types (if "all-ack" is not used)	Change "a Multi-STA Block-Ack with the Ack Type field set to 1 and the TID field set to 14 or a Multi-STA BlockAck frame with the Ack Type field set	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:24:49Z) Revised - Agree with the comment. However it is already addressed in D2.3. So, no further change is needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:07:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 727 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12904	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	53	T	Y	240.52999877929688	53	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	If the multi-TID A-MPDU has an Action frame too, the M-BA will have to have a mix of Ack Types. Also "all-ack" has been overlooked	Change " Multi-STA BlockAck frame with the Ack Type field set to 0 carried in a DL SU PPDU format" to "a Multi-STA BlockAck with one Per TID AID Info	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:51:26Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Text is made more general by referring to the corresponding section, since there a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12905	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	62	T	Y	240.61999511871875	62	27.4.4.5		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE TB PPDU carries S-MPDUs, A-MPDUs, or multi-TID A-MPDUs from more than one STA, or a combination of S-MPDUs from a subset of STAs, A-MPDUs f	Make this para a "4)" so it is covered by the "If the HE AP intends to send the response in a DL SU PPDU format," above	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:52:07Z) Rejected - This part covers the reception of HE-TB PPDU as a union of multiple STAs. So, the response has to be	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12906	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	62	T	Y	240.61999511 71875	62	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE TB PPDU carries S-MPDUs, A-MPDUs, or multi-TID A-MPDUs from more than one STA, or a combination of S-MPDUs from a subset of STAs, A-MPDUs f	Change the cited text to "If the HE AP needs to acknowledge frames from more than one STA"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:52:48Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12907	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	7	T	Y	241.07000732 421875	7	27.4.4.6		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	This subclause is about responding, so rules on what the non-AP STA may or may not do are not appropriate	Move the first sentence to a different subclause	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:53:32Z) Rejected - The rules for response is part of the sentence Removing this sentence will bring incompleteness	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 729 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12908	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	42	T	Y	241.41999816 89453	42	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" shall set the Ack Policy to Normal Ack/Implicit Block Ack Request " -- can only do so for QoS Data/Null (not e.g. MMPDUs)	add "of QoS Data and QoS Null frames" after "Ack Policy" and delete " for each of the MPDUs carried in the A-MPDU"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:54:15Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12909	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	11	T	Y	241.11000061 035156	11	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE AP intends to send the response in an OFDMA HE MU PPDU format" -- the AP doesn't need to "intend", it just needs to do"	Change the cited text to "If the HE AP sends the response in an OFDMA HE MU PPDU format"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:56:02Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12910	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	11	T	Y	241.11000061 035156	11	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE AP intends to send the response in an OFDMA HE MU PPDU format" -- could use DL MU-MIMO instead	Delete "OFDMA" in the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:12:53Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 730 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12911	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	14	T	Y	241.13999938964844	14	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE TB PPDU carries an S-MPDU from more than one STA, or (multi-TID) A-MPDU from more than one STA, or a combination of an S-MPDU from some STA	Changed cited text to "If the HE AP needs to acknowledge frames from more than one STA"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:56:54Z) Revised.- Text is made more general. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12912	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	12	T	Y	241.11999511871875	12	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"If the HE TB PPDU carries an S-MPDU from more than one STA, or (multi-TID) A-MPDU from more than one STA, or a combination of an S-MPDU from some STA	Delete " the following acknowledgment procedure: a) If the HE TB PPDU carries an S-MPDU from more than one STA, or (multi-TID) A-MPDU from more than o	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:46:01Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 731 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12913	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	20	T	Y	241.19999969482422	20	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" an A-MPDU that solicited an immediate response " is not defined, and the natural interpretation would include an A-MPDU containing an S-MPDU	Change to "only QoS Data frames with EOF=0, the same TID, and the Ack Policy equal to Implicit Block Ack Request"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:47:38Z) Revised.- Text is made more general. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12914	Mark RISON	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	22	T	Y	241.22000122070312	22	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	" a multi-TID A-MPDU that solicited an immediate response was received" is not defined, and anyway this is known by the transmitter but not by the rec	Change to talk about QoS Data frames with Ack Policy equal to Implicit Block Ack Request from more than one TID, or QoS Data frames with Ack Policy eq	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:48:42Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 732 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12915	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	170	32	T	Y	170.32000732421875	32	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"An HEMU PPDU can carry more than one A-MPDU each of which contains one or more MPDUs soliciting an immedi- ate response if it is carried in an HE TB	Change "if" to "that" in the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:50:33Z) Revised Discussion: What the sentence says is that if the response, i.e. acknowledgement, is carried in HE TB PP	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12916	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			648	There are 9 "Multi-STA BA"s	Change each to "Multi-STA BlockAck" and add "frame" after the one in Table 9-424	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:34:40Z) - All instances fixed with resolutions to other comments. No furhter change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:35:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12917	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	171	25	E	Y	171.25	25	9.7.3		A			648	The insertion in "The A-MPDU is transmitted by a STA that is neither a TXOP holder nor an RD responder ***or the A-MPDU is transmitted by AP in an HE	Change the cited text to: "The A-MPDU is transmitted by a STA that is neither a TXOP holder nor an RD responder, or the A-MPDU is transmitted by AP in	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:16:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:17:04Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 733 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12918	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3			T	Y			9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu		657	The A-MPDU context tables, especially Table 9-425, have turned into an incomprehensible mess similar to the multirate rules mess	Restructure the tables so that the per-PHY/per-role (AP/STA) etc. caveats are clearer	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12919	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	43	T	Y	173.42999267578125	43	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"There are at least two different values or TID subfield in this context." has a typo and duplicates the previous sentence anyway	Delete the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:42:47Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12919	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12920	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J	Liwen Chu		657	The rules for multi-TID A-MPDUs should not both be in 9.7.3 and in Clause 27	Delete the stuff that is already covered in Clause 27 from 9.7.3 (making sure e what's left is not wrong/misleading)	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 734 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12921	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	61	E	Y	173.61000061035156	61	9.7.3		V			648	"Basic, MU-BAR, GCR MU-BAR, BQRP, or BSRP Trigger frame only when AP transmits the A-MPDU" is not clear	Change to "When transmitted by an AP, a Basic, MU-BAR, GCR MU-BAR, BQRP, or BSRP Trigger frame". Change at 173.48 too	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:23:33Z) - If transmitted by an AP, …	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:23:47Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12922	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3			T	Y			9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu		657	There are 3 references to "multi-TID A-MPDU context" and 2 to "single-TID A-MPDU context" but these contexts (and their subvariants) are not described	Add a description of these contexts	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 735 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12923	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	An MPDU delimiter with a Length field of 0 indicates that the A-MPDU subframe does not contain an MPDU. Hence most of the discussion of non-zero leng	Change " nonzero length MPDU delimiters" to "MPDUs" in 9.7.3; delete " of the non-zero length MPDU" (2x) and "nonzero length" in 27.4.2; delete "nonzer	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12924	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173	43	T	Y	173.42999267578125	43	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"(if present)" is implicit for all possible MPDUs in an A-MPDU	Delete the cited text	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:44:04Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0426r6 under CID 12924	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 736 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12925	Mark RISON	230	2	9.7.3	173		T	Y	173		9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"at most one of the following is present: x, y, z" is not clear. Does it mean that only what is specified in x or y or z can be present, or can e.g.	Add ", and no other frames" before the colon in each case	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:44:52Z) Rejected Discussion: “at most…” is what is used in IEEE 802.11TM – 2016 and 11md draft. The commenter is welcom	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12926	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	43	T	Y	300.42999267578125	43	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	"An ack-enabled A-MPDU is an A-MPDU that follows the rules in 9.7 (Aggregate MPDU (A-MPDU)) and 10.13 (A-MPDU operation) except that it shall contain:	Change "except that it shall contain" to "and that contains both of the following"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:11:23Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 12926	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 737 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12927	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	46	T	Y	300.45999145 50781	46	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	"---One QoS Data frame with the Ack Policy field set to Normal Ack or HTP Ack each carried in an A- MPDU subframe with the EOF field set to 1, or one	Change the cited text to "---One or more QoS Data frames with the Ack Policy field set to Normal Ack or HTP Ack and/or one Action frame, where each f	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:18:13Z) Rejected Discussion: Ack-enabled A-MPDU is different from ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU. Ack-enabled A-MPDU can'	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12928	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	46	T	Y	300.45999145 50781	46	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	An A-MPDU with two EOF=1 MPDUs is also an ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU, even if there are no EOF=0 MPDUs	As it says in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:18:58Z) Rejected Discussion: Ack-enabled A-MPDU is different from ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU. Ack-enabled A-MPDU can'	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12929	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	46	E	Y	300.45999914550781	46	27.10.4.1		J			648	The definition of an ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU should be in the subclause about this	Move to subclause 27.10.4.3	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:16:47Z) - The definition is a transmit side definition. On the receive side, the term is not applicable since the rece	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:17:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12930	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.2	302	47	T	Y	302.47000012207031	47	27.10.4.2		A	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	"except as defined below" -- it is not clear what the "except" means here. It might mean that it restricts the A-MPDUs to a particular subset of what	Change "except as defined below" to " and that conforms to the rules below"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:35:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 19:54:21Z - the relationship between the verb (shall) and the statement is not clear (shall follow the rules in … and that conforms	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12931	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	58	E	Y	303.57998657226656	58	27.10.4.3		A			447	"227.4.4" -- no such subclause (yet)	Delete one of the "2"s	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:46:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:46:24Z- see #14304	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 739 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12932	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	43	T	Y	300.42999267578125	43	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu		620	We have a definition of ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU in 27.10.4.1 and another in 27.10.4.3	Delete the definition in 27.10.4.1	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:12:23Z) - Rejected Ack-enabled A-MPDU is different from ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU. Ack-enabled A-MPDU can't aggregat	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12933	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	9	T	Y	303.08999633 78906	9	27.10.4.3		A	Liwen Chu	796r3	622	"except as defined below" -- it is not clear what the "except" means here. It might mean that it restricts the A-MPDUs to a particular subset of what	Change "except as defined below" to " and that conforms to the rules below"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:37:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 20:19:30Z - does not work with the verb shall ("a STA shall follow the rules in … and that conforms"). Instead, list as another loc	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 740 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12934	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.3			T	Y			27.10.4.3		J	Liwen Chu	685r0	600	" belonging to one or more block ack agreements" is confusing in that it suggests that some of the QoS Data frames might not belong	Delete the cited text in this subclause (4 instances)	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:07:35Z) Rejected – ULMU PPDU contains SIG-B field which contains the transmit identifier, or the receive identifier (d	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12935	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	24	T	Y	303.23999023 4375	24	27.10.4.3		V	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	"one or more QoS Data frames with the Ack Policy field set to Normal Ack or HTP Ack each with a different TID" -- if there's only one how can it have	Delete "each with a different TID"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:39:32Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter Gax editor to make changes in 11-18/0796r2 under CID 12935.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 20:19:14Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 741 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12936	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	35	T	Y	303.35000610 35156	35	27.10.4.3		J	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	This last bullet is a special case of the second bullet	Delete this last bullet	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:40:24Z) Rejected. Discussion: the last bullet covers the case that has management frame in the A-MPDU. The second bulle	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12937	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J	Liwen Chu		657	The definitions and rules for multi-TID A-MPDUs are not clear	Adopt the proposals in 17/0949	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12938	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	There should be a mechanism to allow an HEBFer to poll for missed segments. It is not clear whether a BRP frame can be used in the SU case, and the	Allow Beamforming Report Poll frames to be used to solicit SU retransmission of missed segments (cf. 10.34.5.3). Define a new Trigger frame variant	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12939	Mark RISON	230	2	9.3.1.23.2			T	Y			9.3.1.23.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0684r2	599	There should be a mechanism to allow an HE BFer to poll for missed segments. It is not clear whether a BRP frame can be used in the SU case, and the	Delete the Feedback Segment Retransmission Bitmap field from the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield for the Beamforming Report Poll variant	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 07:41:03Z) The comment is not clear in its intention. First it states that these should be a mechanism that allows the HE BF	EDITOR	Approved No Change				N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12940	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.3.1			T	Y			28.3.3.1		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	Allocating different transmit powers to different subchannels may violate transmit spectrum flatness requirement	Add a NOTE to state that RU power boosting and beamforming should not be used when measuring spectral flatness.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:32:02Z) Spectral flatness subclause (28.3.18.2) already specifies that RU power boosting and beamforming should not be u	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 743 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12941	Mark RISON	230	2	27.6.2			T	Y			27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0042r1	496	It is not clear how missed segments are requested in the SU PPDU case. The problem is that the only way to do this is to send a BRP variant Trigger,	Add a "NOTE---If an HE beamformer does not successfully receive all feedback segments from the HE beamformee, it cannot use a Beamforming Report Pol	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:37:50Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. Also removed some occ	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:14:39Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12942	Mark RISON	230	2	27.2.2	150	57	E	Y	150.57000732421875	57	27.2.2		V	Kaiying Lv		617	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): "The STA is not solicited an immedia	Change the bullet to "An immediate response is not solicited from the STA by the PPDU carrying the frame".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:39:41Z) - The cited sentence has been revised with the following in D2.3. the PPDU carrying the frame does not solici	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:39:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 744 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12943	Mark RISON	230	2	27.2.2	151	5	E	Y	151.05000030517578	5	27.2.2		V	Kaiying Lv		617	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): "The STA is not solicited an immedia	Change the bullet to " An immediate response is not solicited from the STA by the PPDU carrying the frame".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:41:56Z) -The cited sentence has been replaced with the following condition in D2.3. The RA of the received frame is no	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:42:01Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12944	Mark RISON	230	2	26.1.1	210	11	E	Y	210.11000061035156	11	26.1.1		J			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): Binary Convolutional Coding should b	Change "coding" to " code"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:04:31Z) - There is precedence for "binary convolutional coding" in both Clause 19 and Clause 21. Take to REVmd	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:05:23Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 745 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12945	Mark RISON	230	2	26.1.1	210	27	E	Y	210.27000427246094	27	26.1.1		J			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): LDPC coding should be LDPC code	Change "coding" to "code"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:05:34Z) - Since it is a acrhitectural function is needs to be LDPC coding or LDPC encoding. I'll leave it as coding fo	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:06:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12946	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.3.8.3	239	17	E	Y	239.16999816 89453	17	28.3.3.8.3		V			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): What does "information of each RU" r	Clarify. Also add RU to 3.4	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:46:24Z) - Unable to find "information of each RU", but RU has been added to 3.4. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:48:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 746 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12947	Mark RISON	230	2	28.3.6.11.1	255	31	E	Y	255.30999755859375	31	28.3.6.11.1		J			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): It would be easier for description p	As it says in the comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:47:31Z) - Unable to determine the issue since the cited location appear to be incorrect.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:48:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12948	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4	193	40	E	Y	193.39999389648438	40	27.10.4		V			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): Terminology differs from description	Change "Ack Enabled Multi-TID A-MPDU Support" to "Ack-Enabled Multi-TID Aggregation Support"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:38:57Z) - Field name changed to "Ack-Enabled Aggregation Support" with resolution to other comments. No further change	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:39:16Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 747 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12949	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4	193	44	E	Y	193.44 000244 140625	44	27.10.4		V			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0) : Terminology differs from description	Change "Ack Enabled Multi-TID A-MPDU Support" to "Ack-Enabled Multi-TID Aggregation Support"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:39:29Z) - Field name changed to "Ack-Enabled Aggregation Support" with resolution to other comments. No further changes	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:39:32Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12950	Mark RISON	230	2				G	Y					J			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0) : New amendment style is a bad idea.	Use traditional style, i.e. incorporate 802.11ax into 802.11 baseline text, by merging Clause 27 into Clauses 10 and 11	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:00:56Z) - The membership is becoming comfortable with the new amendment style and the majority believe it is a good id	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:01:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 748 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12951	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					V			447	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0) : The things in an Aggregated Control	Delete "A-" in "UL MU Response Scheduling A-Control subfield", "BQR A-Control subfield", "BSR A-Control subfield" throughout Delete "A-" and add "sub"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:20:26Z) - There is an instance of "a frame carrying an UL MU Response Scheduling A-Control subfield" at P197L40. Change	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:22:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12952	Mark RISON	230	2	9.4.2.3	67	50	T	Y	67.5	50	9.4.2.3		J	Zhou Lan		657	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0) : Should make it clear that an AP must	Add a "NOTE---To allow association of 20 MHz-only STAs, an HE AP omits the VHT PHY BSS membership selector and only includes the HT PHY and HE PHY mem	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 749 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12953	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): Multi-STA BlockAcks are very badly n	Change "Multi-STA BlockAck" to "Extended BlockAck" throughout	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:38:23Z) - As with MU in general, it is multi-user. There is a special case where there is only one user, but the main	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:39:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12954	Mark RISON	230	2				G	Y					J			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected ' in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): UL MU-MIMO should be optional	Make UL MU-MIMO optional rather than mandatory	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:02:12Z) - UL MU-MIMO is optional - see 28.1	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:03:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12955	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4	194	14	T	Y	194.13999938964844	14	27.10.4		J	Liwen Chu		657	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): "An HE STA may aggregate in a multi-	Delete the (first) cited text	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12956	Mark RISON	230	2	27.10.4	194	31	E	Y	194.30999755859375	31	27.10.4		A			648	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): It says "TXOP limit" twice	Add "the" before the cited text at line 31 and line 32	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:54:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:54:45Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12957	Mark RISON	230	2				E	Y					J			657	Resubmitted from D1.0 as spuriously rejected 'in the interest of releasing D2.0' (references and text from D1.0): We don't include representation deta	Delete "M1" throughout (in "Highest NSS Supported M1" and "NSS M1")	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. It is not clear what the statement associated with this use this use is trying to say. The subfield does not exist.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 751 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12958	Mark RISON	230	2				T	Y					J			657	The baseline does not allow EOF=0 MPDUs after EOF=1 MPDUs, but ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDUs can be like that	Soften the baseline to allow this in PPDUs exchanged between HE STAs	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12959	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Abstract	2	1	G	Y	2.009999990463257	1	Abstract		V		18/0397r2	574	11ax PAR covers up to 7.125GHz now. The Abstract should reflect this.	Replace "between 1 GHz and 6 GHz." with "between 1 GHz and 7.125 GHz."	agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 18/0397r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #12302	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12960	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Keywords	2	6	G	Y	2.059999942779541	6	Keywords		J			447	"high density" should be added to the keyword lists. This is one of the primary purposes+A65 of 11ax existence to begin with.	As in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:06:00Z) - The term high density is not used in the draft	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:06:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 752 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12961	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Introduction	4	12	G	N	4.119999885559082	12	Introduction		V		18/0397r2	574	While not a part of 11ax D2.0, the Introduction should reflect the fact that 11ax PAR covers up to 7.125GHz now.	Replace "between 1 GHz and 6 GHz." with "between 1 GHz and 7.125 GHz."	agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 18/0397r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #12302	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12962	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Contents	9		E	Y	9		Contents		A			447	There are line spacing inconsistencies in the table of contents (see difference between page 17 and 18 for instance).	Please use a consistent spacing between lines in the table of contents.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:14:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Removed "feather"	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12963	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Contents	9		E	N	9		Contents		J			648	In the table of contents, when the subclause spans over two lines the page number is not always at the extreme right of the last line (see 9.2.5.2 for	Please ensure that the page number is always set at the extreme right of a line.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:39:33Z) - The TOC is automatically generated. The publication editor can tweak before publication.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:40:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12964	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Figures	19		E	N	19		Figures		J			648	In the list of figures, when the figure caption spans over two lines the page number is not always at the extreme right of the last line (see Figure 9	Please ensure that the page number is always set at the extreme right of a line.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:40:19Z) - The LOF is automatically generated. The publication editor can tweak before publication.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:40:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12965	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	Tables	23		E	N	23		Tables		V			447	In the list of tables, when the table caption spans over two lines the page number is not always at the extreme right of the last line (see Table 28-2	Please ensure that the page number is always set at the extreme right of a line.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:33:53Z) - Not much that can be done about line overflow	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:33:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 754 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12966	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	29	40	E	Y	29.399999618530273	40	3.2		A			447	In bullet points h) and i), the clause name to be put in brackets is missing. See a) and b), respectively. This happens also in the subsequent PPDU	Please in h) replace "A Clause 17 PPDU" with "A Clause 17 (Orthogonal frequency division multiplexing (OFDM) PHY specification) PPDU" and in i) replac	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:01:00Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:01:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12967	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	29	35	T	Y	29.350000381469727	35	3.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	In h) to k), shouldn't the transmitted spectral mask for all these PPDUs be "the 20 MHz transmit spectral mask defined in Clause 28 (High Efficiency (	In each bullet point from h) to k), refer to "the 20 MHz transmit spectral mask defined in Clause 28 (High Efficiency (HE) PHY specification)", e.g. r	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:31:16Z) Please refer to the resolution of CID 12319, 12320, 12321, 12322, 12323.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:01:00Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12968	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	33	6	E	Y	33.060001373291016	6	3.2		A			447	In the broadcast resource unit definition, "STA-ID" and "STAID" are used in the same sentence. Please only use "STA-ID".	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:19:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:19:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 755 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12969	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	33	12	E	Y	33.119998931884766	12	3.2		A			447	Delete the extra "(Delayed SRP PPDU)." added at the end which does not bring any information.	Replace "a PPDU that contains a Trigger frame and that has a value other than SRP_DISALLOW in the Common Info field SPATIAL_REUSE. (Delayed SRP PPDU).	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:22:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:22:26Z - see #12023	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12970	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	33	40	E	Y	33.400001525878906	40	3.2		J			648	Replace "A UL MU-MIMO" with "An UL MU-MIMO" Ditto line 60 on the same page	As in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 22:08:52Z) - Use of a is appropriate for non-vowel sound of UL	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 22:09:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12971	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	34	12	E	Y	34.119998931884766	12	3.2		A			447	Replace "A non-AP HE STA that support" with "A non-AP HE STA that supports"	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:25:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:25:20Z - see #11445	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12972	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	34	16	E	Y	34.159999847412 11	16	3.2		A			447	Replace "An HE AP that support" with "An HE AP that supports"	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:26:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:26:18Z - see #11446	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 756 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12973	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	3.2	34	18	E	N	34.180000030517578	18	3.2		V			447	In the OFDMA definition, replace "An OFDM-based multiple access scheme that different group of subcarriers are allocated" with "An OFDM-based multiple	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:28:09Z) - that different group -> in which groups	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:28:18Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12974	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	4.3.14a	37	12	T	Y	37.119998931884766	12	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	PAR covers up to 7.125 GHz, frequency bands should reflect it.	Replace "The IEEE 802.11 HE STA operates in frequency bands between 1 GHz and 6 GHz." with "The IEEE 802.11 HE STA operates in frequency bands between	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:32:12Z) Revised. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12205	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 757 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12975	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	4.3.14a	37	39	T	Y	37.389999389 64844	39	4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	An HE non-AP STA shall support reception of DL MU-MIMO but may support HE sounding protocol to support beamforming. It seems to me that without beamfo	Either have both "support for DL MU-MIMO reception for an non-AP HE STA" and "support for the HE sounding protocol to support beamforming" mandatory o	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:41:47Z) Reject. The support of sounding protocol and the relationship with BW and # of spatial streams are specific in	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:07:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12976	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	4.3.14a	37	52	E	Y	37.520000457 76367	52	4.3.14a		A			447	Replace "-- Mandatory support for an AP to receive and optional an AP to transmit operating mode indication" with "-- Mandatory support for an AP to r	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:05:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:05:28Z - See #13844	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12977	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	4.3.14a	37		E	N	37		4.3.14a		J			447	In the main MAC features list, "support for an non AP STA/AP" and "support in an non AP STA/AP" are used. Choose only one form and stick with it.	As in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:01:03Z) - The commenter has not clearly identified a problem. If the issue is the article use on "AP" vs "non-AP STA",	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:02:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
12978	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	4.318.8	38	25	T	N	38.25	25	4.318.8		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Is it useful in this particular case to add the HE precision for the BSS color collision event? If the feature is not supported by a non HE STA, then	Replace "A BSS color collision event report enables a non-AP HE STA to signal BSS color collision to its associated AP." with "A BSS color collision e	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:46:11Z) Reject. BSS collision report is only supported by 11ax STAs and not by legacy STAs, and thefore the current tex	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12979	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	49	T	Y	56.490001674668	49	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	For an HE STA, with a QS value being computed as 16xUV and UV being encoded on 6 bits, how can the value 254 be obtained for the que ue size value? SF	Correct the special values 254 and 255 used for HE STA. Either gives the actual queue size value or clarify that the it is not the "queue size value"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
12980	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	50	T	Y	56.5	50	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	How was the value 2147 328 computed? I get that for non-HE STA, 64 768 octets is 256x253, meaning that signaling 254 for the queue size value is tell	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 760 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12981	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	60	56	T	Y	60.560001373291016	56	9.2.4.6.4.3		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	The text around equation (9-ax2) isn't clear. The RxNSS field indicates the maximum number of spatial streams supported in reception. What is the pur	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:10:49Z) Revised. Agree in principle. Make the changes shown in this 11-17-0035r5 submission and identified for the CID 1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:54:27Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
12982	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	63		E	Y	63		9.2.4.6.4.4		V			447	Why an almost blank page here?	Please try to regroup page 63, 64 and 65 to avoid those almost blank pages	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:01:52Z) - Set orphan rows to 1 in Table 9-18c.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:02:17Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12983	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	6	E	Y	65.05999755859375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	Typo in Table 9-18c, "Uosolicited MFB" should be "Unsolicited MFB". Please correct.	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:02:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:02:52Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12984	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	47	E	Y	65.47000122070312	47	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	In Table 9-18c, "as defined in 27.13:" should be "as defined in 27.13 (Link adaptation using the HLA Control field).". Please correct.	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:10:36Z) - Add hyperlink	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:10:41Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12985	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	9	E	Y	66.08999633789062	9	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	In Table 9-18c, "as defined in 27.13." should be "as defined in 27.13 (Link adaptation using the HLA Control field).". Please correct (aka remove the	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:12:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:12:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12986	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	35	E	Y	66.349998474211	35	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	In Table 9-18c, "Figure XXX" should be "Figure 9-15f". Please correct	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:18:55Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:19:00Z - see #14152	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 762 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12987	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.6.4.6	69	42	T	Y	69.419998168 94531	42	9.2.6.4.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	The two last sentences of the UPH Control subclause are a bit redundant "The Minimum Transmit Power Flag subfield indicates that the minimum transmit	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:53:46Z) Agree with the comment. Removed redundant sentence. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0369r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:39:13Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12988	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.6.4.8	70	38	E	Y	70.379997253 41797	38	9.2.6.4.8		A	Matt Fischer	18/0525r1	572	The following two sentences in CAS Control subclause are also a bit redundant: "The SR PPDU Indication subfield indicates whether the PPDU carrying th	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:14:10Z) - TGax Editor: Instruct the editor to change to "The SR PPDU Indication subfield is set to 1 when the PPDU car	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:25:46Z- Since the antecedent is well qualified, we can just refer to it as "the PPDU". Change to read "The SR PPDU Indication is	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12989	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	64	E	Y	79.63999938964844	64	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	Wrong figure reference is used. Please replace "The Per AID TID Info subfield when the AID11 subfield of the AID TID Info subfield is 2045 is shown in	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:01:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:02:21Z - see #12679	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12990	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.2.6.4.8	80	34	E	Y	80.33999633789062	34	9.2.6.4.8		A			447	The sentence "Where Block Ack Starting Sequence Control subfield is set to 0 and RA subfield indicates the MAC address of an unassociated STA for whic	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:12:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:12:44Z - see #12595	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 764 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12991	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	81	46	T	Y	81.45999908447266	46	9.3.1.9.7		V	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	A table similar to Table 9-24b should be produced when the AID subfield is 2045 to clarify the behavior and available combination. Otherwise, the line	Create a table equivalent to Table 9-24b but addressing the case when AID is 2045	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:13:46Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0890r3. Deleted the cited paragraph, as it is a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-29	EDITOR
12992	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.1.23	90	21	E	Y	90.20999908447266	21	9.3.1.23		V			447	"indices" seems out of place. Please replace "The mapping of the subsequent 7 bits, B19-B13, indices to the RU allocation is defined in Table 9-25h (T	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:06:51Z) - delete "indices"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:07:08Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 765 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12993	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	44	E	Y	91.44000244140625	44	9.3.1.23		A			447	"in" is missing. Please replace "The DCM subfield is set to 1 to indicate that DCM is used the HE TB PPDU" with "The DCM subfield is set to 1 to indic	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:14:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 23:14:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12994	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.1.2.3.8	96	62	T	Y	96.62000274658203	62	9.3.1.2.3.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0767r2	621	I don't find the resource allocation information for each scheduled HE non-AP STA in the NDP Feedback Report Poll variant subclause. Apparently, the	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:01:53Z) Apply the changes in document 767r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 22:54:27Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 766 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12995	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.3.3	98	50	T	Y	98.5	50	9.3.3.3		V	Edward Au	17/781r1	646	What is the difference between "dot11HighEfficiencyOptionImplemented" and "ot11HEOptionImplemented"? I think there is none, and "dot11HEOptionImplemen	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 15:57:32Z) - Agree in principle. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0781r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 16:13:32Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
12996	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.3.7	99	42	E	Y	99.41999816894531	42	9.3.3.7		V			447	From Editor's Note, the last element added is 52, but the newest HE element added starts at 55. What happen to 53 and 54?	Please clarify the Editor's Note or renumber correctly the added HE elements in this subclause	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:37:17Z) - Remove editor's note and update numbering from baseline for all management frame tables.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:37:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12997	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.3.7	101	21	E	Y	101.20999908447266	21	9.3.3.7		V			447	From Editor's Note, the last element added is 56, but the newest HE element added starts at 58. What happens to 57?	Please clarify the Editor's Note or renumber correctly the added HE elements in this subclause	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:38:14Z) - Remove editor's note and update numbering from baseline for all management frame tables.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:38:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 767 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
12998	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.3.3.10	101	61	E	Y	101.61000061035156	61	9.3.3.10		V			447	From the Editor's note 11aj adds 31-33. Why does HE Capabilities information element get 32? Shouldn't it be 34? Please check.	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:38:24Z) - Remove editor's note and update numbering from baseline for all management frame tables.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:38:29Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
12999	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.4.2.27	119	39	T	Y	119.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.27		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	When operating in a channel without DFS, why should the bit "OBSS Narrow Bandwidth RU in UL OFDMA Tolerance Support" be set to 0 and not to 1? Narrow	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:46:06Z) Note to Editor: There is no additional text change needed for this CID (text change to be done per CID 13869).	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:32:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13000	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.4.2.200	129		E	Y	129		9.4.2.200		A			447	In Table 9-262k1, remove one extra full stop in row 1 and row 2 (end of column 2) ("transmitted by the TWT Scheduling AP...").	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:39:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:39:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 768 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13001	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	39	T	Y	136.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	793r1	603	In Table 9-262z, Definition and Encoding associated to the sub field "Maximum AMPDU Length Exponent" are empty.	Please provide Definition and Encoding rules for the sub field "Maximum AMPDU Length Exponent". Or add the text explaning its purpose as a NOTE to inte	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:00:01Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. The CID is resolved by CID 11328 in 11-18/425	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13002	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	9.6.30	167	36	E	Y	167.36000061035156	36	9.6.30		A			648	Why Quiet Time Period is subclause 9.6.30 and not 9.6.28.3 (following HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI subclause)?	Move Quiet Time Period from 9.6.30 to 9.6.28.3	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:14:52Z) - Fixed with #11025. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:15:10Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13003	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	10.3.2.4	181	60	E	Y	181.60000610351562	60	10.3.2.4		V			447	End of sentence is missing: "When an RTS frame is used for the most recent NAV update, the "CTS_Time" shall be calculated using the length of the CTS	As in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:25:15Z) - Agree in principle. Undelete "was received".	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:25:38Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 769 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13004	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	10.28.3	206	5	E	Y	206.05000030517578	5	10.28.3		A			447	Typo "resposnse" instead of "response", please correct.	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 22:01:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 22:01:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13005	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.2.2	222	11	E	Y	222.11000061035156	11	27.2.2		A			447	Remove the extra full stop in "as the BSS of which the STA is a member.."	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:51Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13006	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.2.4	224	9	E	Y	224.08999633789062	9	27.2.4		A			447	Remove the extra STA and the extra space before the full sop in " an immediate response from the STA STA or the received frame is a Trigger frame ."	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:37:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:00Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13007	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.2.4	224	8	T	Y	224.08000018310547	8	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	What happens to the intra-BSS NAV of a STA that is not a TXOP holder and that receives a Trigger Frame containing its AID during the TXOP. The conditi	Clarify the conditions an intra-BSS NAV is set be a STA that is not a TXOP holder and that receives a trigger frame that solicits a response from the	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 17:53:39Z) Rejected – The specific case mentioned by the commeter is discussed duraing the comment resolution of D1.0. The	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:42Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13008	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	64	T	Y	249.63999938964844	64	27.5.3.3		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	What is the purpose of "HE_SIGA_RESERVED"? So far it is not clear what benefit(s) setting some reserved bits to a given value in HE-SIG-A2 can help in	As in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:30:54Z) HE SIG_A2 is one of the fields present in the preamble of the HE TB PPDU and it is important that all the respond	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 771 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13009	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.9	289	54	T	Y	289.54000854 49219	54	27.9		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	I don't see any technical reason to support two versions of the spatial reuse (OBSS_PD and SRP), while it is not even clear if one version A58brings a	As in comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:16:49Z) - There is no doubt that the SRP SR mechanism is effective when an opportunity to use it is identified. The SRP me	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13010	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.11.4	305	5	T	Y	305.04998779 296875	5	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	365r1	536	It is not clear in this subclause if an HE AP is allowed to set the BSS_COLOR subfield to 0 (aka no color) and in such case what should be the value o	Add in this specific subclause the case where BSS_COLOR subfield is set to 0 and its implication on other subfields (e.g. BSS Color Disabled).	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:44:28Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Please see resolution for CID 11547 TGax editor, please make changes as shown i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:55:03Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 772 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13011	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.9.	308	45	T	Y	308.45001220703125	45	27.9.		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Given the controversial nature of spatial reuse and its yet to proven gain, I don't think that it is wise to mandate that "if STA has not received a S	Replace "If the HESIGA_Spatial_reuse_value15_allowed subfield of the SR Control field of the most recently received Spatial Reuse Parameter Set elemen	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:06:38Z) - the group has agreed that the default state should be SR enabled on a per-PPDU basis.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13012	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	27.16.2.2.2	322	37	T	Y	322.36999511171875	37	27.16.2.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	1861R1	473	In "NOTE--All APs that are members of a multiple BSSID set use the same BSS color (see 27.11.4 (BSS_COLOR)). A non-AP HE STA should filter such BSSsw	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:23:10Z) Revised A note cannot be normative text – so 'shall' won't be appropriate. Instead, the note was updated to conv	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:34:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13013	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.2.6.2	353	62	E	Y	353.61999511171875	62	28.2.6.2		A	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	Remove the extra blank line.	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:41:28Z) - (approved as "revised", but really an accept)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:41:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 773 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13014	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.3	356		E	N	356		28.3		J			648	Line spacing in page 356 seems higher than the one on the other pages. Please use the same paragraph parameters if they differ	As in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:11:13Z) - Appears to be fixed in D2.2	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:11:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13015	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.3.4	372	55	T	Y	372.54998779296875	55	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	I don't get the color changes in RU lower than 484 in Figure 28-12 (for RU26, 52, 106, 242 for the 80 MHz HE PPDU). Please add clarification in the ab	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:58:29Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13015) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:56:49Z - see #11423	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13016	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.3.10.7	408	25	T	Y	408.25	25	28.3.10.7		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	In Table 28-18, it should be clarified for the first condition (number of OFDM symbol greater than the signaled periodicity) that the Doppler bit B15	Replace B15 description of table 28-18 and Table 28-19 with something like: Set to 1 if the channel Doppler is determined to be high (how high is det	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:56:55Z) The description of B15 in Table 28-18 is clear. The B15 is set to 1 if one of the following applies: — The numb	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 774 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13017	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.3.14.3	482	19	T	Y	482.19000244140625	19	28.3.14.3		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0819r1	588	In Table 28-43, the minimum requirement for absolute transmit power accuracy of class B device being +/- 9dB is extremely loose. I could understand +/	Modify the class B requirement for absolute transmit power accuracy as suggested in the comment.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:03:23Z) Defining Class B device is for low-cost devices which may not be a good choice to group Class B device with Clas	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:20:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13018	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.3.20	505	33	T	Y	505.32998657 22656	33	28.3.20		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	For an non-HT transmission, shouldn't the Clause 18 be also supported in the 2.4 GHz band and not only Clause 17 which is defined for 5 GHz only?	Add support of Clause 18 (leading to six options instead of five) in subclause 28.3.20.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:16:51Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 13018.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:24:30Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 775 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13019	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	28.3.21	507	55	T	Y	507.54998779296875	55	28.3.21		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	For an non-HT reception, shouldn't the Clause 18 be also supported in the 2.4 GHz band and not only Clause 17 which is defined for 5 GHz only?	Add support of Clause 18 in subclause 28.3.21.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:17:44Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 13019.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:24:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13020	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	B.4.27.1	561	52	T	Y	561.52001953125	52	B.4.27.1		V	Edward Au	18/0763r1	645	Some trigger frame variants are missing in HEM 5: - GCR MU-BAR variant with section 9.3.1.23.6 as reference and CFHE: O as status - Bandwidth Query Repo	Add missing trigger frame variants as specified in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:14:02Z) - Agree in principle some trigger frame variants are missing. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicate	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:16:20Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 776 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13021	Massinissa Lalam	230	2	C.3	580	11	T	Y	580.10998535 15625	11	C.3		V	Edward Au	17/1774r1	444	The dot11HEDeviceClass object description is incomplete. No clear mention is made to this object in the document (I'm assuming it maps to the " Device	Correct and complete the description of the dot11HEDeviceClass object.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:03:38Z) - Agree that the syntax type is “TruthValue” rather than “Integer”. The TBD is about whether the non-AP STA is	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	Tagged as #12107	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13022	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	234	55	T	Y	234.55000305 17578	55	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Why are there two separate lists?	Merge the two separate lists into one list	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:56:52Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:22:39Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13023	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	234	47	T	Y	234.47000122 070312	47	27.4.1		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	There is no statement of the mandatory vs optional nature of the support for MBA and MTIDBAR	Clarify the mandatory and optional status of the multi STA and multi TID BA and BAR frames	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:57:44Z) Rejected - This section is intended to give the overview. The mandatory/optional status is discussed where each	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 777 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13024	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	5	T	Y	301.04998779296875	5	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	This statement is nearly identical to the first paragraph of the sub clause.	Delete the cited paragraph because it is redundant.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13025	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	10	T	Y	301.10000610 35156	10	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	This restriction should probably extend to non-HE STA recipients.	Add a restriction against sending a Multi-TID A-MPDU to a non-HE STA.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13026	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	17	E	N	301.17001342 77344	17	27.4.1		A			447	The phrasing is not correct.	Move the direct object closer to the verb	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:29:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:29:54Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13027	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	22	E	N	301.22000122 07031	22	27.4.1		A			447	Wrong article	Change "If the multi" to "If a multi"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:30:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:30:24Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13028	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	26	T	Y	301.26000976 5625	26	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	Which TID Aggregation Limit? The limit specified by the transmitter of the HE TB PPDU or its recipient?	Add text to indicate which TID aggregation limit is the one that applies here - I assume it should be the limit indicated by the recipient of the A-MP	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 778 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13029	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	29	E	Y	301.29000854 49219	29	27.4.1		V			447	Wrong plurality and better wording possible	Change "Null frame with any TID with which" to "Null frames carrying any TID for which" or possibly to "Null frames marked with any TID for which"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:37:03Z) - See #13030	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:37:12Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13030	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	29	E	Y	301.29000854 49219	29	27.4.1		V			447	Wrong preposition	Change "with which" to "for which"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:34:20Z) - As constructed, "with which" or "for which" would be condition on the TID ("any TID for which the Ack Policy	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:36:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13031	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	42	T	Y	301.42001342 77344	42	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	Missing words	Change "When TXOP limit is not zero" to "When the TXOP limit for the primary AC is not zero"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 779 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13032	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	44	T	Y	301.44 000244 140625	44	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	Missing words	Change "transmitted by STA within" to "transmitted by the STA within"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13033	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	45	T	Y	301.45 001220 703125	45	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	Wrong combination of parameters and missing case	Change "or an HE MU PPDU transmitted by a non-AP STA" to "or an HE MU PPDU transmitted by an HE AP or an HE TB PPDU transmitted by a non-AP STA"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13034	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4.1	301	54	T	Y	301.54 000854 49219	54	27.4.1		J	George Cherian		657	Better wording possible	Change "if the TIDs correspond to any AC" to "provided that the TIDs correspond to an AC"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 780 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13035	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.2.5	225	14	T	Y	225.13999938964844	14	27.2.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0353r1	577	Create an option for MU CTS - i.e. for long distance scenarios, the existing MU RTS exchange can fail due to a mismatch in power between the AP and no	Add a mechanism to allow the MU RTS to request HE CTS responses that occupy RU with fewer than 242 tones, possibly with the option of first transmitti	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:08:32Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0353r1 under all headings that include CID 14328.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #14328	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13036	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.4	234	44	T	Y	234.44000244140625	44	27.4		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Block Ack flow control is needed	Add a mechanism for Block Ack flow control, to allow the data frame recipient to indicate receive buffer availability, possibly simply adopt the DMG R	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:58:35Z) Rejected - Benefits are not compelling compared to the changes needed, considering the state of the draft.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 781 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13037	Matthew Fischer	230	2	10.2.4.2	178	26	T	Y	178.25999450683594	26	10.2.4.2		J	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	Add MU EDCA Parameter set element to some other management frame to allow these values to be dynamically modified during an association and to allow t	Add MU EDCA Parameter set element to some management frame that allows an individual RA	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:35:03Z) similarly to EDCA parameters, it is simpler to have MU EDCA parameters that are the same for all STAs in the BSS	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13038	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.8.3	288	54	T	Y	288.54000854 49219	54	27.8.3		J	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	What is the initial state of UL MU Disable?	Specify the initial state of UL MU Disable, for example, at the successful completion of association, UL MU Disable is 0	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:12:15Z) Rejected. The clause 27.15.3 states that: NSS and BW selection is further constrained as defined in 27.8 (Operat	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 782 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13039	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.8.1	286	55	T	Y	286.54998779296875	55	27.8.1		J	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	General comment on Operating Mode notification - at least one parameter, the ULMU Disable, can be signaled, and is only signaled, through the OM mech	Explicitly specify the default initial value of each of the OM parameters.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:13:00Z) Rejected. The clause 27.15.3 states that: NSS and BW selection is further constrained as defined in 27.8 (Operat	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13040	Matthew Fischer	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	52	T	Y	282.51998901 36719	52	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	There is no TBTT Wake Negotiation bit in the TWT Teardown frame, but there is a statement saying that this bit should be set to teardown a previously	Add a TBTT Wake Negotiation bit to the TWT Teardown frame	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:18:27Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 783 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13041	Michael Montemurro	230	2	10.1	177	13	T	Y	177.13000488 28125	13	10.1		V			648	UMTA and UORA suddenly appeared in Clause 10.1 with no definition	Add these to the abreviations and at least add a reference to where these acronyms are defined.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:26:43Z) - Through resolutions to other comments, UMTA and UORA have been removed from 10.1 in favor of a more generic "	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:27:46Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13042	Michael Montemurro	230	2	10.2.6	178	57	T	Y	178.57000732 421875	57	10.2.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0362r1	537	MUUA appears without a definition.	Add this to the abreviations and at least add a reference to where this behavior is defined	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:58:25Z) TGax editor please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0362r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 22:11:44Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13043	Michael Montemurro	230	2	10.3.2.1	179	59	T	Y	179.58999633 789062	59	10.3.2.1		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	What does "information might also be available"	Clarify the behavior here. What does the receiving(?) STA need to do. Presumably the duration is set to "UNSPECIFIED"?	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:49:54Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We add a reference to 27.11.5 (TXOP_DURATION). TGax editor to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:44:33Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 784 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13044	Michael Montemurro	230	2	11.24.7.1	215	50	E	Y	215.5	50	11.24.7.1		A			447	"STAwhose" should be "STA whose"	Change "STAwhose" to "STA whose"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:49:01Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:49:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13045	Ming Gan	230	2	9.4.2	118	1	T	Y	118.01000213623047	1	9.4.2		V			626	BSS load element provides the channel utilization such that the unassociated STA can choose the proper AP, and extended BSS load element further provi	Define a HE BSS load element considering frequency utilization such to help unassociated STA to choose a best AP	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 15:04:02Z) - Agree in principal. The proposed resolution is to provide a spatial/frequency underutilization to solve load	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 15:04:21Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
13046	Ming Gan	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	409	13	T	Y	409.13000488 28125	13	28.3.10.7.2		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	In table 28-17, B1-B3, B4 B22 in HE-SIG-A1 field use SIGB, however, B18-B21 use HE-SIG-B	Please correct SIGB to HE-SIG-B	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:57:47Z) Field name uses “SIGB” while description uses “HE-SIG-B”. B18-21 uses “HE-SIG-B” in lieu of “SIG-B” since it ref	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13047	Ming Gan	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	410	21	T	Y	410.20999145 50781	21	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ming Gan	11-18/0162r3	528	In table 28-17, B18-B21 in HE-SIG-A 1 field only provides 4 bits to indicate the number of SIG B OFDM symbols. That means the maximum of SIGB symbols i	Please correct the bug to allow more STAs to be be scheduled in DL OFDMA or make the receiver know the HE-SIG-B boundary when lots of STAs are schedul	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:03:16Z) TGax editor please make the changes as shown in 11-18/0162r3 Notes, there're several typos in 11-18/0162r3. CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:58:10Z- see #12060	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13048	Ming Gan	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	6	E	Y	65.059997558 59375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	A typoon "Uosolicited"	change "Uosolicited" to "Unsolicited"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:03:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:03:28Z - see #12983	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13049	Naveen Kakani	230	2	9.4.2.139	122	41	T	Y	122.41000366 210938	41	9.4.2.139		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	How would one interpret an ADDBA Request with ABBDA Extension Element, and ADDBA Response without ADDBA Extension Element ?	The clause indicates what setting "HE Fragmentation Operation" field would mean in Request and Response frame. But it is not clear what if one of the	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:36:12Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Add a case when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element TGaxed	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:06:51Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 786 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13050	Naveen Kakani	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	133	18	T	Y	133.17999267578125	18	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	There is Fragmentation Signaling of Fragmentation Support in HE MAC Capabilities Information Field (9.4.2.237.2). How is it tied to ADDBA Extension El	Is there a constraint on the value that can be signaled in HE Fragmentation Operation Field in ADDBA Extension Element in ADDBA Request based on Fragm	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:37:48Z) Revised-Proposed change clarifies if ADDBA Request with ADDBA Extension Element with a different value from tha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13051	Naveen Kakani	230	2	9.4.2.139	122	41	T	Y	122.41000366210938	41	9.4.2.139		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	If the receiver is signaling specific level of support of Fragmentation in its HE-MAC Capabilities field, can the ADDBA Request frame include an ADDBA	Add text to clarify if ADDBA Request with ADDBA Extension Element with a value of Fragmentation different (larger possibly) is allowed or not ? This s	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:18:11Z) Revised-Proposed change clarifies if ADDBA Request with ADDBA Extension Element with a different value from tha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 787 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13052	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.1	221	21	E	Y	221.21000671 38672	21	27.2.1		V			447	the part of the first sentence starting with " management by an AP of RTS usage canhelp mitigate interference since the AP...." is awakward. It needs t	delete or replace with " The AP may have a better knowledge of the interference situation. The AP management of the RTS usage can help metigate interef	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:54:47Z) - Change "In dense environments, management by an AP of RTS usage can help mitigate interference since the AP m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:56:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13053	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.1	221	22	T	Y	221.22000122 070312	22	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	"interference situation" - what does it mean? It is ver vague.	define what does "interference situation" mean.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:26:28Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Initiating a TXOP with the RTS/CTS is more reasonable wording. TGax editor makes	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:23:14Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 788 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13054	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	Annex C	580	19	T	Y	580.19000024414062	19	C		V	Edward Au	17/1774r1	444	"TBD".	replace the TBD with the intended text.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:03:23Z) - Agree that the TBD needs to be resolved. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	Tagged as #12107	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13055	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.1.1	221	43	T	Y	221.42999267578125	43	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	668	"Use of RTS/CTS exchange to obtain the TXOP" needs to be explained. As far as I am concerned HE STA still uses CSMA/CA to obtain access and TXOP. How	clarify the statement highlighted in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:27:56Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Remove an ambiguous wording. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specifi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:23:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 789 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13056	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	10.3.5	185	39	T	Y	185.38999938964844	39	10.3.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	"a STA using the DCF or EDCA shall use an RTS/CTSexchange for individually addressed frames when the length of the PSDU is greater than the length thr	suggest to replace with; "shall use an RTS/CTS exchange to protect the transmission of individually addressed frame"	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:41:06Z) Revised– Agree in principle with the commenter. We change the referred sentence as suggested and the similar s	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 18:49:37Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13057	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.3	223	1	T	Y	223.00999450683594	1	27.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Since the BSS_COLOR value is not unique, what will happen if the same values is used by two or more BSSs and the BSS-COLOR bit map is set to 0 by some	as in comment. Perhaps using BSSID in the MAC header.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:11:18Z) - the bit map is set by the AP or by an entity that is managing the AP. The bit map is not likely to be modified wit	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 790 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13058	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.3	223	34	T	Y	223.33999633789062	34	27.2.3		V	Po-Kai Huang		531	Example give in the second paragraph on page 223 is not cleat, especially the last sentence. What does it mean " NAV set by an inter-BSS can be conside	As is comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-18 19:41:49Z)- Agree in principle with the commenter. The intention is to describe that virtual CS can indicate busy due to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-18 19:41:56Z	2.3	2018-04-18	EDITOR
13059	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.3	223	40	T	Y	223.39999389648438	40	27.2.3		J	Po-Kai Huang		531	how does the requirement that both NAV values are equal to zero to declare the medium is idel affect access to the medium and consequently the through	Comment on how mesium access probability is changed compared to a single NAV value.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-18 19:42:42Z)- The major benefits of two NAVs mechanism is about controlling intra-BSS operation and avoiding interfering i	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-18 19:42:46Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 791 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13060	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.5.3	228	8	T	Y	228.08000183 10547	8	27.2.5.3		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	Figure 27-3 is confusing. The description says that "MU-RTS trigger frame is transmitted in a 40 MHz non-HT duplicate PPDU". Non-HT means legacy which	improve the quality of the Figure	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:33:08Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 13060.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:02:53Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13061	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.2.5.2	227	39	T	Y	227.38999938 964844	39	27.2.5.2		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	what if CTS frames are received from only some STAs and not all of them. Does the AP enter retransmission in this case. Need to make it clear.	as in comment. Perhaps using BSSID in the MAC header.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:33:43Z) We assume that the commenter comments on the paragraph on P226L39. We note that all the CTS response to a MU-RTS	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 792 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13062	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	32	T	Y	290.32000732421875	32	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	The two actions on page 290, it is not clear if it is (a) and (b) as in line 32 or (a) or (b) as in line 60. Need to make it clear.	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:00:35Z) agree with the commenter. Split the sub clause in 2 sub clauses for clarity. Add a sentence to clarify that a STA can	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13063	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	46	T	Y	291.45999145 50781	46	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	This clause provides the rules for adjusting OBSS_PD value. However it doesn't state when this change is requested, i.e. what event does trigger this	as in comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:37:40Z) STA is allowed to apply OBSS_PD SR under specific conditions. If it meets these conditions it can apply this mech	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 793 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13064	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	46	T	Y	292.45999145 50781	46	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	The two terms SRG OBSS_PD and Non-SRG OBSS_PD appear suddenly in the middle of page 292. Need to at least introduce the terms and why two of them are	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:43:44Z) - the terms are actually introduced sooner in the section. For clarity, the general section is now split in 2 subcl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13065	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	27.9.2.3	295	1	T	Y	295.01000976 5625	1	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Figure 27-10 is an enigma to me. It needs some explanation and those S1 and D1.	as in comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:10:14Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13066	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	19	T	Y	366.19000244 140625	19	28.3.3.5		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	The term a "20 MHz-only" and "20 MHz operating" are used to refer to the same entity. My suggestion is to try to harmonize the reference and use a sing	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:41:52Z) A “20 MHz-only non-APHE STA” and a “20 MHz operating non-APHE STA” are two different entities. A “20 MHz-only	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:00:57Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 794 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13067	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	16	T	Y	366.16000036621094	16	28.3.3.5		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	The term "20 MHz operating" need to be defined. So is the "80 MHz operating"	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:41:25Z) Instruction to Editor: Add the following definition in section 3.2. “80 MHz operating non-access-point (non-AP)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:00:54Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13068	Osama Aboulmagd	230	2	28.3..3.5	366	27	T	Y	366.26998901 36719	27	28.3..3.5		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	A statement on P.366 says "A 20 MHz operating non-AP STA shall operate in the primary 20 MHz". On P.367 there are some restriction on RU assignment for	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:53:15Z) A 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA has poor PER performance on certain RUs due to its limitation of RX filters and	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:19:24Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 795 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13069	Pascal VIGER	230	2	27.5.1.2	242	65	T	Y	242.64999389648438	65	27.5.1.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	a broadcast RU is a DL RU intended for multiple STAs (according 27.11.1), so this RU can convey frames addressed to several stations. Typically, unass	Add a NOTE specifying that an unassociated STA may disregard any RU with a STA-ID set to 2045 in a HE MU PPDU received from a HE AP for which this STA	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13070	Pascal VIGER	230	2	10.3.2.10.2	183	27	T	Y	183.27000427246094	27	10.3.2.10.2		J	George Cherian		657	Fast association is somewhere perceived as a good AP quality. HE standard shall offer a complete Multi-User support (UL + DL) for association procedur	The AP should be able to aggregate several unicast response frames, inside a broadcast DL RU with aid=2045, to unassociated STAs that have prior sent	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 796 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13071	Pascal VIGER	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	33	T	Y	92.330001831 05469	33	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0063r1	490	The No Further RA RU subfield is set to 1 to indicate that random access RUs are not allocated in subsequent Trigger frames. As there could have sever	as per comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:49:27Z) TGax editor: No further changes are required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:05:50Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13072	Pascal VIGER	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	66	T	Y	89.660003662 10938	66	9.3.1.23		J	Zhou Lan		657	An AID12 subfield that is 0 or 2045 indicates that the User Info field allocates one or more contiguous RUs for random access An AID12 subfield that i	as per comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 797 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13073	Pascal VIGER	230	2	10.2.6	178	60	T	Y	178.60000610351562	60	10.2.6		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0362r1	537	text specifies that PCF and DCF access methods alternate. In my understanding, PCF was deprecated for HE devices. Can you clarify this point ?	as per comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:00:00Z) Agree with the comment. 802.11-2016 spec (which is baseline for 11ax) already mentions that PCF is deprecated (se	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:56:54Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13074	Pascal VIGER	230	2	27.2.6	229	14	T	Y	229.13999938964844	14	27.2.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	HE STA should only send QoS Data frames in an HE TB PPDU with ACs for which the STA's buffer queues contain frames that are only addressed to its asso	as per comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 798 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13075	Pascal VIGER	230	2	27.2.6	228	44	T	Y	228.44 000244 140625	44	27.2.6		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	MU EDCA is applied for QoS Data frames were transmitted successfully in the HE TB PPDU. Does this also concern when QoS Null frames are transitted due	as per comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:35:40Z) Make the changes as defined in doc 1828r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:41:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13076	Pascal VIGER	230	2	27.2.5	225	16	T	Y	225.16 000366 210938	16	27.2.5		J	Kiseon	11-17/1878r1	479	Please clarify (and state it explicitly in the specification) if MU-RTS/CTS is compliant with the dynamic bandwidth operation supported by VHTSTAs.(e	as per comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:40:45Z) MU-RTS is defined a variant of Trigger frame as described in 9.3.1.23.4 (MU-RTS variant) to ultilize the simultan	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13077	Pascal VIGER	230	2	9.4.2.46	121	55	E	Y	121.55 000305 175781	55	9.4.2.46		A			447	NOTE has twice "the" before element(s)	suppress one "the"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:15:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:15:55Z	2.1	2018-04-17	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 799 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13078	Pascal VIGER	230	2	3.2	33	6	T	Y	33.060001373291016	6	3.2		V	Abhishek Patil	18/0744r1	607	The naming "broadcast RU" in DL is not really appropriate, as this DL RU is intended for multiple STAs (according 27.11.1) and not for all STAs. As ex	Change the naming "broadcast RU" by either "group RU", or "multiple STAs RU" or equivalent	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-22 18:50:23Z) - The term broadcast RU is kept unchanged as the RU is meant for all STAs in a BSS unless they are a recipient	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:41:40Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13079	Pascal VIGER	230	2	9.7.3	170	7	T	Y	170.07000732421875	7	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	a broadcast RU is a DL RU intended for multiple STAs (according 27.11.1), so this RU can convey frames addressed to several stations. This new form of	As indicated per comment, MPDUs aggregated in a AMPDU of an HE PPDU sent in a broadcast RU may have a RA field set to distinct MAC addresses (broadcas	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:49:40Z) Rejected Discussion: a broadcast RU can only carries frames to a single STA or broadcast frames. With this the	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 800 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13080	Pascal VIGER	230	2	27.5.1.2	242	55	T	Y	242.55000305 17578	55	27.5.1.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	a broadcast RU is a DL RU intended for multiple STAs (according 27.11.1), so this RU can convey frames addressed to several stations. This new form of	As indicated per comment, MPDUs aggregated in a AMPDU of an HE PPDU sent in a broadcast RU may have a RA field set to distinct MAC addresses (broadcas	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13081	Pascal VIGER	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	35	T	Y	245.35000610 351562	35	27.5.3.2.1		J	Abhishek Patil		657	a broadcast RU is a DL RU intended for multiple STAs (according 27.11.1), so this RU can convey frames addressed to several stations. This new form of	Broadcast RU is a specific case that should not have such limitation in order to function properly. Please add a procedure allowing the AP to trigger	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13082	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	27	T	Y	91.269966430664	27	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil		657	When the value of the AID12 field is 0 or 2045, then the RU Allocation subfield indicates the first RU of one or more contiguous random access RUs. If	Remove the following words "more contiguous"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13083	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	26	T	Y	92.26000213623047	26	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"The Random Access RU Number subfield indicates the number of contiguous RUs allocated for UORA. The value of the Random Access RU Number subfield is	Remove the feature "Random Access RU Number"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 802 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13084	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	32	T	Y	92.31999969482422	32	9.3.1.23		J	Jeongki Kim		657	"The No Further RA RU subfield is set to 1 to indicate that random access RUs are not allocated in subsequent Trigger frames that are sent before eith	Add another bit to drive the status "No further scheduled RU" and remove the words "before either the end of the current TWT SP or the end of the curr	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13085	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	63	T	Y	89.62999725341797	63	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	An AID12 subfield that is 2046 indicates an unassigned RU (see 27.5.3.2.3 (Allowed settings of the Trigger frame fields and UMRS Control field)). What	Please precise the meaning of AID 2046.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:18:37Z) An AP may be experiencing interference on a particular RU or a narrow band of frequencies and therefore cannot re	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:13:24Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13086	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.3.1.23.5	95	27	T	Y	95.269996643 0664	27	9.3.1.23.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	There is no description for the format of the BSRP.	Add description or at least a cross reference to the corresponding clause.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 803 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13087	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.3.1.23.7	96	27	T	Y	96.2699966430664	27	9.3.1.23.7		J	Zhou Lan		657	There is no description for the format of the BQRP.	Add description or at least a cross reference to the corresponding clause.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13088	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.7.1	170	31	T	Y	170.30999755859375	31	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"A VHT MU PPDU does not carry more than one A-MPDU that contains one or more MPDUs soliciting an immediate response if the immediate response is carri	Please clarify.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:51:22Z) Revised Discussion: HETB PPDU in UL MU transmission is used for acknowledging the DL HE MU PPDU. “VHT MU PPDU”	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13089	Patrice Nezou	230	2	9.7.3	174	10	T	Y	174.10000610351562	10	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"The BSRP and BQRP Trigger frames can be aggregated with other MPDUs in the A-MPDU if the receiver has indicated the support of receiving these trigge	Please clarify.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:57:20Z) Rejected Discussion: the reception of BSRP and BQRP in A-MPDU is optional. Only when a STA announce such capabi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 804 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13090	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.2.6	229	14	T	Y	229.13999938964844	14	27.2.6		J	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	"A non-AP HE STA should only send QoS Data frames in an HE TB PPDU with ACs for which the STA's buffer queues contain frames that are only addressed t	When a TDLS stream is established, we must check that the corresponding AC used by the TDLS transmission must not be in MU EDCA mode.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:36:17Z) there are no needs for any normative text when establishing the TDLS transmission. The STA should be aware of the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13091	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	31	T	Y	242.30999755859375	31	27.5.1.1		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/054r0	499	"A STA shall not transmit an HE MU PPDU of DL MU-MIMO with OFDMA allocated in an RU that is addressed to a STA unless the AP has received from the STA	A non-AP STA cannot send a HE MU PPDU. SO its better to replace "A STA shall not transmit ..." with " An AP shall not transmit ..."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:19:15Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/054r0 that are marked with CID 13091	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:52:40Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 805 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13092	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.1.2	242	64	T	Y	242.63999938964844	64	27.5.1.2		J	Zhou Lan	11-18/0054r0	499	"An MPDU of an HE MU PPDU sent in a broadcast RU shall not include information intended for a STA that is identified as the recipient of another RU in	Please rename broadcast RU as a multi-STA RU and define it as a RU destined to multiple STAs.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:22:26Z) A Broadcast RU is an RU that allows more than one STAs to behaviour as a recipient. Kindly refer to section 3.2	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:55:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13093	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.2	243	47	T	Y	243.47000122070312	47	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	"The STA that receives a BQRP Trigger frame shall follow the rules defined in 27.5.3.3 (STA behavior for UL MU operation) to generate the HE TB PPDU w	It is not possible to to set a RU with AID other than an associated STAs' AID or AID = 0. For instance, a RU with AID= 2045 must be forbidden in a BQR	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 806 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13094	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.4	256	59	T	Y	256.58999633 78906	59	27.5.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	"If the MU Cascading Support field in the HE MAC Capabilities Information field of the HE Capabilities element is set to 0 by a non-AP HE STA, the HE	Do not forbid the AP initiating a MU cascading sequence if only one non-AP STA does not support this feature. Modify the sentence such as: "If the MU	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:50:03Z) Make changes as in doc 11-18/0707r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13095	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	52	T	Y	258.51998901 36719	52	27.5.5.2		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0695r4	624	"After each successful HE TB PPDU transmission, an HE STA shall set the value of OCW to the OCWmin obtained from the most recent OCWmin indicated in t	Modify the text as following: "After each successful HE TB PPDU transmission and upon the first time that a Trigger frame containing random access RUs	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:23:58Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0695r4 that are marked with CID 13095	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:34:10Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 807 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13096	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	29	T	Y	259.29000854 49219	29	27.5.5.2		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	"The eligible random access RUs for a non-AP HE STA are the K contiguous RUs starting from the RU indicated in the RU allocation subfield belonging to	Please remove this sentence. The previous sentence is sufficient :" A non-AP HE STA can determine the number of eligible random access RUs by adding t	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:06:25Z) No change is required	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:23:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13097	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	24	T	Y	259.23999023 4375	24	27.5.5.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0360r2	542	"A non-AP HE STA can determine the number of eligible random access RUs based on the SS Allocation/ Random Access RU Information subfield belonging to	Replace "can" with a " shall" . Moreover define multiple continguous random access Rus is not appropriate because of possible low signal strength level	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:05:08Z) Agree with the comment. Please see resolution for CID 11034 TGax editor, please make changes as showing doc 11-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 15:45:51Z - assume that the doc is 18/0360r2	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 808 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13098	Patrice Nezou	230	2	27.5.5.3	260	18	T	Y	260.17999267578125	18	27.5.5.3		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	"The transmission of the HETB PPDU does not affect QSRC[AC] and QLRC[AC] (see 10.22.2.11 (Retransmit procedures))." This sentence is not only valid	Move the sentence in the clause 27.5.3.3 STA behavior for UL MU operation	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:07:25Z) TGax editor please make change as shown in the 11-18-0694r3 under all headings that include the CID 13098.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13099	Peter Loc	230	2		221	23	E	Y	221.22999572753906	23			J			657	The statement "To improve spectrum utilization, RTS usage should be TXOP duration-based, rather than PSDU length-based" is redundant. RTS usage rule b	Remove the statement	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 809 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13100	Peter Loc	230	2		134	41	T	Y	134.41000366210938	41	9.4.2.237.2		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	In table 9-262z, the Maximum number of F-MPDUs in equation Nmax = 2^Maximum Number Of F-MPDUs is undefined.	Change it to Number of F-MSDUs	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:46:41Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13101	Peter Loc	230	2		230	19	T	Y	230.19000244140625	19	27.3.2.1		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	An HE STA may transmit dynamic fragments of an A-MSDU provided the A-MSDU Fragmentation Support subfield of the HE Capabilities element transmitted by	An HE STA may transmit dynamic fragments of an A-MSDU provided the A-MSDU Fragmentation Support subfield of the HE Capabilities element transmitted by	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:26:05Z) Rejected- This is for A-MSDU, an independent capability	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:58:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 810 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13102	Peter Loc	230	2		143	60	T	Y	143.60000610351562	60			V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	In Table 9-262aa on Partial Bandwidth field, SU RU is not defined.	Add a NOTE in the Encoding column -A SU RU is the a single RU that occupies the entire transmission bandwidth	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:52:41Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13102 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:50:43Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13103	Peter Loc	230	2		258	4	T	Y	258.04000854 49219	4			J	Chitto Ghosh		657	Only unassociated HE STA that intends to support UORA needs to initialize the range of OFDMA contention window (OCW) upon reception of the UORA Parame	Change "An unassociated HE STA ...." to "An unassociated HE STA that includes support for UORA ....."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 811 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13104	Peter Loc	230	2		259	15	T	N	259.14999938964844	15			J	Chitto Ghosh		657	In the example shown in Figure 27-5, HESTA 3, which is unassociated to the AP that transmits a TF for random access, may not support UORA.	Add "that supports UORA" after "HESTA 3"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13105	Peter Loc	230	2		275	15	T	Y	275.14999938964844	15			J	Alfred Asterjadhi	685r0	600	The broadcast TWT operation needs to take into account the presence of STAs that are members of a Broadcast TWT but do not support UORA. These STAs ma	Add the following paragraph after line 36: Within the trig ger-enabled TWT SP, if there are STAs that are members of this broadcast TWT but do not sup	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:08:30Z) Rejected – The Trigger frames sent by the TWT scheduling AP can contain either random RUs or individually addre	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 812 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13106	Peter Loc	230	2		313	5	T	N	313.04998779296875	5			J	Chitto Ghosh		657	For unassociated STA that supports UORA, in order to extract the TWT element and listen for triggering frame at the broadcast TWT SP, it needs to supp	Add "and TWT" to the end of "An unassociated HE STA that supports UORA procedure"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13107	Peter Loc	230	2		313	24	T	Y	328.23999023 4375	24			J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	The statement on lines 24-27 "LDPC coding (transmit and receive) in all supported HE PPDU..." seems to indicate that if the STA supports transmittin	Change this feature statement to: "LDPC coding (transmit and receive) in all supported HE PPDU types with a bandwidth larger than 20 MHz, RU sizes, a	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:45:34Z) ASTA that supports transmit and receive of HE SU PPDU of bandwidths greater than 20 MHz, can use either BCC or	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:55:27Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 813 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13108	Peter Loc	230	2		313	28	T	Y	328.27999877 92969	28			J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	This statement implies that if the STA declares support for transmitting more than 4 spatial streams then LDPC coding (transmit) will be used in all s	Change this feature statement to: "LDPC coding (transmit) in all supported HE PPDU types that occupy more than 4 spatial streams, RU sizes, and number	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:46:49Z) A STA that supports transmit of more than 4 spatial streams, can use either BCC or LDPC for transmit of less tha	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:55:30Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13109	Peter Loc	230	2		313	13	E	N	313.13000488 28125	13			J			648	The statement on lines 13-23 appears to state conditions for not using BCC in both transmit and receive. However, the next 4 bullets seem to create c	Change "Binary convolutional coding is not used for the following:" to "LDPC are used for the following:"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:56:07Z) - Unable to locate the cited problem.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:56:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 814 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13110	Peter Loc	230	2		366	19	T	N	366.19000244140625	19			J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	It appears that there are 2 interchangeable references to a non-AP HE STA that supports 20 MHz bandwidth. One is a 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA, the	Replace 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA by 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA throughout the draft.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:52:58Z) 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA and 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA are not interchangeable as described in the Definit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:19:20Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13111	Peter Loc	230	2		366	19	E	N	366.19000244140625	19			J			657	For clarity, change the first paragraph of this clause as suggested	A 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA is a non-AP HE STA that indicates in the Channel Width Set subfield in the HE PHY Capabilities Information field of t	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 815 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13112	Peter Loc	230	2		33	1	E	N	33.009998321 5332	1			A			447	For clarity, add the word "has" into the definition.	20 MHz operating non-AP high efficiency STA (HE STA): A non-AP HE STA that is operating in 20 MHz channel width mode, such as a 20 MHz-only non-AP HE	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:18:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:18:35Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13113	Peter Loc	230	2		231	8	T	Y	231.08000183 10547	8	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Contradictory statements on requirement for block ack negotiation for Level 2 fragmentation. On lines 50-51 page 229, Level 2 dynamic fragmentation ne	Change the first paragraph of this subclause to: "An originator STA may transmit fragmented MMPDUs or MSDUs that are sent under a block ack agreement	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:11:03Z) Revised- Agree the commenter with that level 2 requires BA agreement, but this paragraph is to say that the STA	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 816 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13114	Peter Loc	230	2		231	44	T	Y	231.44000244140625	44	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Contradictory statements on requirement for block ack for Level 3 fragmentation. On lines 53-55 page 229, Level 3 dynamic fragmentation needs block ac	Change the first paragraph of this subclause to: "An originator STA may transmit fragmented MMPDUs or MSDUs that are sent under a block ack agreement	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 16:59:56Z) Revised- Agree the commenter with that level 3 requires BA agreement, but this paragraph is to say that the STA	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13115	Peter Loc	230	2		209	37	T	Y	209.36999511871875	37			J	Alfred Asterjadhi	685r0	600	To avoid retries from the TWT initiating STA, the TWT responding STA, after receiving a request from the initiating STA, needs to transmit a response	Remove the row from lines 37 to 40.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:09:23Z) Rejected – The TWT responding STA is required to transmit an Ack frame since the TWT Setup frames are Action fr	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 817 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13116	Peter Loc	230	2		301	51	T	N	301.51000976 5625	51			J	Liwen Chu		657	In transmitting HE TB PPDUs, when there is no more MPDUs of the TIDs that belongs to the primary AC that can be added to the A-MPDU, it would be wast	Add the following condition after line 56: - When no more MPDUs can be aggregated in the A-MPDU from any of the TIDs that correspond to the primary AC	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13117	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	29	49	E	N	29.489999771 118164	49	3.2		A			447	item (d) already covers item (k)	Remove item (k)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:05:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:05:45Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13118	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	29	45	E	N	29.450000762 939453	45	3.2		A			447	item (c) already covers item (j)	Remove item (j)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:04:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:04:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13119	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	29	42	E	N	29.420000076 293945	42	3.2		J	Lochan Verma		657	item (b) already covers item (i)	Remove item (i)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:23:50Z) Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	Technical: b) and i) differ in the PPDU type: OFDM PPDU vs any Caluse 18 PPDU	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13120	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	29	39	E	N	29.389999389 648438	39	3.2		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	item (a) already covers item (h)	Remove item (h)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:31:35Z) Please refer to the resolution of CID 12319.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	Technical comment. A) and h) differ in the referenced mask	N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:01:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 818 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13121	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	30	44	E	N	30.440000534057617	44	3.2		J	Lochan Verma		657	For 40 MHz mask physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU), item (a) already covers item (k)	Remove item (k)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:24:41Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	Technical: different mask		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13122	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	30	47	E	N	30.469999313354492	47	3.2		A			447	For 40 MHz mask physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU), item (f) already covers item (l)	Remove item (l)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:07:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:07:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13123	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	30	50	E	N	30.5	50	3.2		J	Lochan Verma		657	For 40 MHz mask physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU), item (b) already covers item (m)	Remove item (m)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:24:50Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	Technical: different STA type	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13124	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	31	21	E	N	31.209999084472656	21	3.2		J	Lochan Verma		657	For 80 MHz mask physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU), item (a) already covers item f) and item b) already covers item g),	Remove item f) and g)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:25:04Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 819 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13125	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	31	64	E	N	31.639999389648438	64	3.2		J	Lochan Verma		657	For 160 MHz mask physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU), item a) already covers item g) and item b) already covers item h).	Remove item g) and h).	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:25:14Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13126	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	32	31	E	N	32.310001373291016	31	3.2		J	Lochan Verma		657	For 80+80 MHz mask physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU), item a) already covers item d) and item b) already covers item e).	Remove item d) and e)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:25:22Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13127	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	33	6	E	N	33.060001373291016	6	3.2		V			648	For broadcast resource unit (RU), missing "-" for "STAID." Also, based on the text in 9.4.2.46, we have 2^n is the maximum number of BSSIDs in the mul	Suggest change below: a resource unit within an HE MU PPDU identified by the STA-ID value 0, 2045, and 2047, and by the STA-ID values 2045, 2047 and 0	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 22:06:21Z) - Hyphen added with #12968. No further change	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 22:06:38Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 820 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13128	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	33	31	E	N	33.310001373291016	31	3.2		J			657	There are two definitions for high efficiency (HE) extended range (ER) single user (SU) physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU).	Remove one.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Both appear to be completely useless as definitions. I would remove both.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13129	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	N	34.56999969482422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	It seems that the defintiion for SRP PPDU is redundant because it is actually a DSRP_PPDU, which is already defined	Remove the definition of SRP PPDU.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:57:04Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13129. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13130	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	34	54	T	N	34.540000915527344	54	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The definition of SR PPDU is limited to SRP operation. Suggest to follow the definition of OBSS PDSR PPDU to define it as SRP SR PPDU.	Change SR_PPDU to SRP SR PPDU. Spell out what SRP stands for.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:54:06Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13130	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 821 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13131	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.2	35	1	T	N	35.009998321 5332	1	3.2		A			648	The definition of UL MU PPDU is redundant because it is just HE TB PPDU. Further, UL MU PPDU can mean HE SU PPDU with UPLINK_FLAG equal to 1.	Remove the definition of UL MU PPDU.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:39:44Z) - With resolutions to other comments, the term is not used in the draft.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:40:04Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13132	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	3.4	35	28	E	N	35.279998779 296875	28	3.4		J			657	Why a undescore is needed for DSRP_PPDU or SRP_PPDU? It seems to be unnecessary.	Remove all the undescore for DSRP_PPDU and SRP_PPDU in the draft.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Passing to SR ad-hoc. Fix terminology.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13133	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	17.3.9.10	217	25	T	N	217.25	25	17.3.9.10		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0688r0	617	Revise the timing requirment of MU-RTS to align with the language in 28.3.14.3 Pre-correction accuracy requirements	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:51:41Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0688r0 under all headings that include CID 13133.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:51:00Z-	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13134	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	53	38	T	N	53.380001068115234	38	9.2.4.1.8		J	Guoqing Li	720r2	642	Why does the AP need to indicate support of setting control response frame with more data field set to 1 to the non-AP STA? The following description	Remove the indication of More Data Ack from AP.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:07:26Z) Reject. The text here is consistent with the text in section 9.4.1.17.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 18:47:41Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13135	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	9.2.4.1.8	53	58	T	N	53.580001831 05469	58	9.2.4.1.8		J	Guoqing Li	720r2	642	Why does the TDLS peer STA need to indicate support of setting control response frame with more data field set to 1 to the other TDLS STA? The fol lowi	Remove the indication of More Data Ack from TDLS peer STA.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:08:09Z) Reject The text here is consistent with the text in section 9.4.1.17.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 18:47:46Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 823 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13136	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	38	T	N	59.380001068115234	38	9.2.4.6.4.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0363r1	560	Can UMRS be carried in other PPDUs except HEMU PPDU? In Table 9-262z, the description does not specific any limitation. In 9.2.4.6.4.2, the descripti	Revise the description in Table 9-262z for UMRS or the description in 9.2.4.6.4.2 for consistency. Either having limiting of carrying UMRS in HEMU PP	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:24:26Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-18/0363r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:00:08Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13137	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	4	T	N	134.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		J	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	There is a capability bit for +HTC-HE support. However, there is also capability for almost every funcitonallity of +HTC-HE like UMRS, OM, HLA, BSR, a	Remove +HTC-HE Support in HE MAC Capabilities Information field. Make sure that there is capability bit for every optional +HTC-HE functionality.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:18:27Z) Rejected- The HE variant HT Control field is used for many purposes. And the future amendment can defined addit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 824 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13138	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	4	T	N	134.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	There is no capability bit for CAS control.	Add a capability bit for CAS control.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:19:24Z) Revised- The CAS Contrl is used for two purposes, RD operation and SRP procedure. For RD operation, the RD Res	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13139	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	11.23	214	36	T	N	214.36000061 035156	36	11.23		J	Po-Kai Huang		657	Efficient D2D scheduling scheme is reuqired in 11ax to address the corresponding D2D use case in 11ax simulation scenario.	Propose to have efficient D2D scheduling scheme similar to the schedui ng scheme introduced in 11ax. Proposed will be uploaded.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 825 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13140	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	40	T	N	211.39999389648438	40	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1847r0	483	HE MU PPDU may have broadcast AID for an AP in the multiple BSSID set (see 27.11.1). An HE STA needs to scan the transmitted BSSID beacon to understsa	Revise the text to emphasize that every HE STA shall scan the transmitted BSSID beacon to understand the broadcast AID assigned to its associated AP.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:14:18Z) Revised While it is correct that STAs need to identify the address of the transmitted BSSID, we don't need a new	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:00:13Z - see #11355	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13141	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	9.4.2.238	149	51	T	N	149.50999450683594	51	9.4.2.238		V	Abhishek Patil	1859r4	543	When Multiple BSSID AP sub field is set to 1, and the TxBSSID subfield is set to 0, the STA is required to scan the transmitted BSSID beacon to underst	Propose to have a mechanism to indicate transmitted BSSID to the STA directly. Alternatively, having indication like BSSID index in multiple BSSID-ind	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 05:13:36Z) Revised Per baseline spec, there is only one beacon per multiple BSSID set. Further, 802.11ax mandates non-AP ST	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11742	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 826 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13142	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	11.1.3.8	211	43	T	N	211.42999267578125	43	11.1.3.8		V	Abhishek Patil	1858r0	481	What is the maximum value n for Max BSSID Indicator? In 11.11.14, it says that the maximum value of n is 46. However, in 9.4.2.74, there is only 8 bits	Propose to add a note to indicate that the maximum value of n is 8. Revise the description in 11.11.14 to specificy that the maximum value of n is 8.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 22:02:33Z) Revised Agree with the comment. Text in 11.11.14 is updated to indicate that maximum value of n is 8 when the d	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:29:21Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13143	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	58	T	N	249.58000183 10547	58	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1861r1	473	It should be clarified that the TA of the Trigger frame must be the associated AP or the AP that sends the transmitted BSSID, when the AID matches.	Calrify that when the AID matches the AID of the STA, the TA of the Trigger frame must be the associated AP or the AP that sends the transmitted BSSID	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:41:16Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17/1861r1 under CID 13143	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:30:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 827 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13144	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	58	T	N	249.58000183 10547	58	27.5.3.3		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0367r1	540	What happened if the RU Allocation field is set to the reserved value for the STA? Ideally, the STA shall not respond.	Add rule saying that the STA shall not respond if the RU allocation field is set to a value that is reserved the STA.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:42:11Z) The AP is not expected to assign a reserved RU. Also, the general rule is to ignore reserved fields. No further c	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:59:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13145	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	58	T	N	249.58000183 10547	58	27.5.3.3		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	How about the condition for NDP feedback response? NDP feedback is also one type of HE TB PPDU as described in 28.3.17.	Add corresonding rule about NDP feedback response.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:35:00Z) Section 27.5.6.2.1 provides the rules	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13146	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.2.4	223	34	E	N	223.33999633 789062	34	27.2.4		A			447	Add "by" before "the UL MU CS mechanism."	Add "by" before "the UL MU CS mechanism."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:36:01Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:36:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13147	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.11.5	306	41	E	N	306.41000366 21094	41	27.11.5		A			447	Change "and the transmits an HE SU ..." to "and that transmits an HE SU ..."	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:56:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:56:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 828 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13148	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.11.5	307	15	E	N	307.14999938964844	15	27.11.5		V			447	To refer to NDP feedback, the correct term is HE TB NDP feedback PPDU as described in 28.3.17.	Suggest to unify the terminology.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:58:39Z) - Change "HE TB PPDU carrying an NDP feedback" to "HE TB NDP feedback PPDU"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:58:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13149	Po-Kai Huang	230	2	27.11.5	307	14	T	N	307.14001464844375	14	27.11.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	Add a note saying that the exact indicaiton will be modified based on the coding rule in table-28-18, table 28-19, and table 28-20. As a result, the r	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:50:40Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We add a note to cite the reference. TGax editor to make the c	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:23:05Z - The editing instruction appears to just change the note number from 3 to 1. However, 802.11 style numbers notes in a su	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13150	Qi Xue	230	2	27.4.5	241	50	T	Y	241.5	50	27.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove the following sentence, since it is out of context: "An HESTA that receives a Multi-TID A-MPDU that solicits an immediate response shall send	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 22:59:16Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	returned		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 829 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13151	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.1	290	21	T	Y	290.20999914550781	21	27.9.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Change this to a 'should' requirement: "A non-AP HESTA that performs spatial reuse operation shall respond to a Beacon request..."	As in the comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 21:59:00Z) The current requirement is reasonable, as it keeps the AP from making multiple requests if a STA does not respond.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13152	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	58	T	Y	290.57998657722656	58	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Change to "An NDP frame"	As in the comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:05:40Z) NDP is consistently used throughout baseline.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13153	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	60	T	Y	290.60000610035156	60	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Conditions (a) & (b) are not defined in the previous paragraph. Suggest rewording. "A STA that takes actions (a) or (b) under the conditions of t	As in the comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:25:37Z) agree with the commenter. Apply the changes as in doc 1852r4 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 830 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13154	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	65	E	Y	290.64999938964844	65	27.9.2.1		J		17/1852r8	474	Change PHY-CCARESET.request to PHY-CCA-RESET.request	As in the comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:25:41Z) - current specuses PHY-CCARESET.request	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13155	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	27	T	Y	294.26998901 36719	27	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Add a normative text to cover the following two notes: NOTE 1--The STA can increase but not decrease the chosen SRG OBSS_PD level or non-SRG OBSS_PD	As in the comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:09:02Z) – this is a note because the normative text above covers these conditions – see in particular, the equation 27-4.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13156	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	37	E	Y	294.36999511 71875	37	27.9.2.3		V		17/1852r8	474	Repeated Note 1 & Note 2 in lines 37-40 and lines 27-31	As in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:31:24Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 831 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13157	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.3	295	63	T	Y	295.63000048828125	63	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Add the exact HE capability below to remove ambiguity of the following sentence: "When the conditions specified in 27.9.3 (SRP-based spatial reuse op	As in the comment	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:21:53Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13157, commenter to note that the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13158	Qi Xue	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	42	T	Y	297.42001342 77344	42	27.9.3.2		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Circular reference. Please fix: "After a STA has identified the start of an SRP Opportunity, and until the SRP Opportunity End point is reached, the t	As in the comment	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:16:56Z) - it is not circular, but self-referential, and there is no problem with that.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13159	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.1	229	36	E	Y	229.36000061035156	36	27.3.1		A			447	Remove ")" at end of subclause and place a reference for 10.2.7.	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:57:26Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:57:30Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 832 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13160	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.1	229	36	T	Y	229.36000061035156	36	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	change "at a time" to "within the same PSDU. Apply the change to all three rows.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:15:13Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. This paragraph is harmonize	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:07:56Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13161	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.1	229	58	E	Y	229.58000018310547	58	27.3.1		J	Ming Gan		657	Please keep consistent terminology "non-uniformly" v.s "dynamic".	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		The group should decide on an appropriate name for the procedure. Is it a "dynamic fragmentation procedure" (P229L34) or a "procedure for generating n	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 833 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13162	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.1	229	64	E	Y	229.63999938964844	64	27.3.1		V			447	Replace "We call dynamic fragments the fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation" with "Fragments that are generated following the dynamic fragme	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:15:00Z) - see #14241	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:15:08Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13163	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	11	T	Y	230.11000061035156	11	27.3.2.1		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	Add a statement as the first paragraph since the negotiations and supports are specified later on. "An originator STA may transmit fragments to a reci	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:23:41Z) Rejected- The last paragraph of subsection 27.3.2.1 expresses the same meaning.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:58:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13164	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	29	E	Y	230.28999328961328	29	27.3.2.1		A			447	Replace "when the all the" with "when all the"	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:01:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:01:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 834 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13165	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	40	E	Y	230.39999389648438	40	27.3.2.1		V			447	Suggest to rephrase.	Rephrase the last two items as: "-- A Multi-STA BlockAck frame that does not contain a BA Information field with TID equal to that of the transmitted	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:10:31Z) - Change the bullets to read: "- A Multi-STA BlockAck frame that does not contain a BA Information field with	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1				I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:11:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13166	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.2	231	2	T	Y	231.02000427246094	2	27.3.2.2		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	What about when the ADDBA Extension element is not present in the ADDBA Response? Same observation for Level 2 and Level 3.	Clarify that the STA inherits the signaling of its Fragmentation Support field setting unless the STA explicitly turns it off with the ADDBA Extension	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:08:21Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Add a rule when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element in subse	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 835 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13167	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	2	T	Y	231.02000427246094	2	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Level 2 needs blockack agreement. Remove its mention from the first paragraph. Also no need to call out HE MAC Capabilities Information. Redundant.	Replace the first paragraph with: " An originator STA may transmit fragmented MMPDUs or MSDUs that are not sent under a blockack agreement to a recipi	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:09:14Z) Revised- Agree in principle. The STA with HE Fragmentation Support subfield in the HE MAC Capabilities Informati	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13168	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	36	T	Y	231.36000061035156	36	27.3.2.3		J	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Suggest to explicitly call out each of the cases as follows: 1) A-MPDU, non-Ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU and ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU. Same observ	Add references to the three clauses, clearly stating that the fragment of an MMPDU can be present in an ack-enabled MT A-MPDU.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 16:58:52Z) Rejected- it is reduadnt if explicitly calling out each of the cases	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 20:04:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 836 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13169	Qi Xue	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	2	T	Y	231.02000427246094	2	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	Level 3 needs blockack agreement. Remove its mention from the first paragraph. Also no need to call out HE MAC Capabilities Information. Redundant.	Replace the first paragraph with: "An originator STA may transmit fragmented MMPDUs or MSDUs that are not sent under a blockack agreement to a recipi	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:10:06Z) Revised- Agree in principle. The STA with HE Fragmentation Support subfield in the HE MAC Capabilities Informati	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13170	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	60	13	T	Y	60.130001068115234	13	9.2.4.6.4.3		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	Use consistent terminology, BW or CW, and so on. Also does this table need to be here? Seems more appropriate to be moved to a normative subclause. A	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:13:46Z) Revised. Agree in principle. The table is moved to clause 27.8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:47:10Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13171	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	6	E	Y	65.05999755859375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	Fix the typo "Uosolicited" to "Unsolicited"	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:03:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:03:37Z - see #12983	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 837 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13172	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	6	T	Y	65.05999755859375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	Better organization: " if Unsolicited MFB is 0 then: 1)..., 2) ... If Unsolicited MFB is 0 then the MRQ field is reserved. Good idea to apply to the o	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 19:59:44Z) Revised. Agree with the comment partially to replace “should” by other wording. However, the definition column i	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:55:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13173	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	46	T	Y	65.45999908447266	46	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	Use same terminology as in other parts " RU Allocation. And also remove HE MCS from this row because it has nothing to do with MCS. Same observation ap	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:00:33Z) Revised. Agree with the comment partially. Proposed resolution synchronizes the terminology as suggested. How eve	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13174	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	15	T	Y	66.150001525 8789	15	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	"For an HE STA". Can it be sent by a non-HE STA? Seems not so please remove statement.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:01:36Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed solution removes “For an HE STA” as suggested. TGax editor to make th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13175	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	15	T	Y	66.150001525 8789	15	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	This row is confusing. Please organize it so that it has a better description. And please fix reference to the Figure XXX.	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:02:24Z) Revised. Agree with the comment partially. Proposed resolution fixes the typo as suggested. However, the row lis	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13176	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.6	69	39	E	Y	69.389999389 64844	39	9.2.4.6.4.6		A			447	Redundant "The resolution for the UL power headroom reported in UL Power Headroom sub field is 1 dB". Remove it.	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:30:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:30:22Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 839 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13177	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.6	69	39	T	Y	69.389999389 64844	39	9.2.4.6.4.6		V	Abhishek Patil	18/0026r10	641	SR PPDU Indication..indicates. Redundant Indication. Replace "SR PPDU Indication" with "SR PPDU". But more in general what is an SR PPDU? Is it SRP PP	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:05:04Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13177	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:05:13Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13178	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.4.7	70	58	T	Y	70.580001831 05469	58	9.2.4.7		J			657	HE classifier is missing in the second column. Please add it. Non-HT non-VHT non-HE non-DMG? Maybe good to have a discussion how to call these STAs/PP	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13179	Qingjiang Tian	230	2	9.2.5.8	74	64	E	Y	74.639999389 64844	64	9.2.5.8		A			447	Replace "the duration of the HE TB PPDU which is defined in" with "the duration of the HE TB PPDU is defined in"	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:34:01Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:34:04Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 840 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13180	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	9.4.2.239	151	35	T	Y	151.35000610351562	35	9.4.2.239		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	Change "minimum value of OCW" to "minimum value of the exponent of OCW"	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13181	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	9.4.2.239	151	43	T	Y	151.42999267578125	43	9.4.2.239		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	Change "maximum value of OCW" to "maximum value of the exponent of OCW"	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13182	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	9.4.2.245	159	39	T	Y	159.38999938964844	39	9.4.2.245		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	66R0	472	The numbers don't add up (0 to 62 =! -100 to -37)	Either change Value to 0-63 (and remove the second row in Table 9-262ag) or change Description to say -100 dBm to -38 dBm	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:13:05Z) Revised Replaced -37 with -38 in Table 9-262ag to make the range consistent TGax editor, please make changes as	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 23:56:57Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 841 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13183	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	9.6.30	167	63	T	Y	167.63000488 28125	63	9.6.30		J	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	There is no need to mention which fields are present the Quiet Time Period element - the details are covered in the section describing the element. Pr	Replace the sentence as: "The Quiet Time Period element (as defined in 9.4.2.242 (Quiet Time Period element)) is always present in the frame."	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:36:04Z) Rejected: The similar statement is also in the 9.6.28.2. Since the change is editorial, it is up to editor to d	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13184	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	9.6.30	167	65	T	Y	167.64999389 648438	65	9.6.30		V	ChaoChun Wang	443r3	534	Add sentence that No Vendor Specific elements are present in this frame	Add sentence at the end of the section as: "No Vendor-Specific elements are present in the Quiet Time Period frame."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:36:42Z) Revised: Text is revised. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0443r3 under CID 11026	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:24:31Z - see #11026	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 842 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13185	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	10.9	191	17	T	Y	191.16999816 89453	17	10.9		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	HE variant HT Control field can carry one or more Control subfields (that are supported by the recepient).	Replace sentence as: "The HE variant HT Control field carried in the frame may contain one or more Control subfields supported by the intended receive	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:23:24Z) Revised- Agree in principle. The HE variant HT Control field can carry one or more Control subfields. TGax edi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	returned		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13186	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	11.2.3.17	213	29	T	Y	213.28999328 61328	29	11.2.3.17		V	Guoqing Li	90r0	486	HE STAs that support OPS would need to set dot11TIMBroadcastImplemented and dot11TIMBroadcastActivated to true. Further, such STAs would need to set t	Add spec text either to section 11.2.3.17 or 27.14.3 to indicate that HE STAs that support OPS set dot11TIMBroadcastImplemented and dot11TIMBroadcastA	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:26:28Z) Revised – See resolution of 11046. Apply the changes in doc 18-0090r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:25:33Z - see #11046	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 843 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13187	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	11.2.3.17	213	29	T	Y	213.28999328 61328	29	11.2.3.17		V	Guoqing Li	90r0	489	What happens if FD or TIM broadcast frames don't align with the TWT SP (with Flow-ID=3)? Add spec text that an AP that sets up B-TWT for OPS shall sen	Add spec text (either in 11.2.3.17 or 27.14.3) to clarifying the exception from OPS STAs.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:27:18Z) Revised - See resolution of 11046. Apply the changes in doc 18-0090r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:25:23Z - see #11046	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13188	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.2.1	221	30	T	Y	221.30000305 17578	30	27.2.1		V	Yongho Seok	455r2	558	Clarify that when TXOP Duration RTS Threshold field is set to 1023, the STA defaults to baseline behavior as specified in 10.3.1	Add a sentence to the end of this paragraph as follows: "The AP may set the TXOP Duration RTS Threshold field to 1023 to not require the use of dot11T	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:31:16Z) Revised- Agree in principle. When TXOP duration-based RTS/CTS exchange is disabled, the associated STAs follow	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 22:23:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 844 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13189	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.4.1	236	1	T	Y	236.00999450683594	1	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	There is a paragraph towards the end of section 27.5.3.3 (P251L1) that already describes some rules for setting the RA when responding to a Trigger fr	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:53:06Z) Revised The rules for responding to MU-BAR are already covered in the spec (RA=TA of the soliciting frame). Ther	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 22:03:53Z - Note that the insertion of "QoS Null frames" in 27.5.3.3 only makes sense if the "Data frames" is changed to "QoS Data	2.2	2018-04-06	EDITOR
13190	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.4.1	236	1	T	Y	236.00999450683594	1	27.4.1		V	Yusuke Tanaka	1857r2	470	Rules for setting the RA when responding to a multi-BSS GCR-MU-BAR are missing. Spec needs to have paragraph similar to the one on P236L1 for GCR-MU-B	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:53:51Z) Revised The rules for responding to GCR MU-BAR are already covered in the spec in 27.5.3.3 (RA=TA of the solicit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	see #13189	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 845 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13191	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.2	243	1	T	Y	243.00999450683594	1	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-17-1857r2	470	Rules for setting the RA when responding to a multi-BSS BQRP Trigger frame need to be specified. The responding STA is allowed to set the RA to either	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:36:33Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17-1857r2 under CID 13191	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #13189	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13192	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.3.3	251	1	T	Y	251.00999450683594	1	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17-1857r2	470	Rules for setting the RA when responding to a multi-BSS Basic Trigger frame need to be specified. The responding STA is required to set the RA to the	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:37:25Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17-1857r2 under CID 13192	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #13189	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13193	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.3.6	254	1	T	Y	254.00999450683594	1	27.5.3.6		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17-1857r2	470	Rules for setting the RA when responding to a multi-BSS BSRP Trigger frame need to be specified. The responding STA is allowed to set the RA to either	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:37:51Z) TGax editor, please make changes as suggested in doc 11-17-1857r2 under CID 13193	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #13189	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13194	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	12	T	Y	246.11999511871875	12	27.5.3.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	MinTrigProcTime suddenly appears in this section without any reference or definition. Provide reference to Table 9-262z (section 9.4.2.237.2) wherever th	Replace the first sentence as follows: "A non-AP STA indicates its MinTrigProcTime via the Trigger Frame MAC Padding Duration subfield in HE Capabilit	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:02:39Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0075r3 under CID 13194	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 847 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13195	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	25	T	Y	246.25	25	27.5.3.2.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0075r3	564	The term MinTrigProcTime is overloaded in the sentence covering the unassociated STA case. Remove reference to the term from this sentence	Replace the sentence as follows: "An AP transmitting a Trigger frame that contains a User Info field for random access should ensure that a time perio	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:03:26Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0075r3 under CID 13195	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13196	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.5	257	15	T	Y	257.14999389 64844	15	27.5.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	An HE STA that supports UORA shall set the dot11OFDMARandomAccessOptionImlemented to true	Add the following sentence at the end of the first paragraph: "An HE STA that sets the ULOFDMARASupportsubfield in the HE Capabilities element to	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:07:49Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 13196	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 848 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13197	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	24	T	Y	259.23999023 4375	24	27.5.5.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0360r2	542	Delete duplicate sentence and use normative language to describe the operation. Also add clarification that all the User Info fields (referred in the	Replace the paragraph as follows (two paragraphs - one each for AP and STA operation): "An HE AP shall indicate the number of contiguous RUs allocated	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:06:14Z) Agree with the comment. Please see resolution for CID 11034 TGax editor, please make changes as showing doc 11-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 15:45:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13198	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.5.2	260	1	T	Y	260.01000976 5625	1	27.5.5.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	Mention that OCW is reset after a successful transmission	Replace sentence as: "Otherwise, the transmission is considered successful and OCW is reset"	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:10:44Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 13198	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13199	Rajesh Kumar	230	2	27.5.6.1	260	34	T	Y	260.33999633 78906	34	27.5.6.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	There is a lot of repetition between the 1st and 2nd paragraph in this section.	Suggest consolidating the two paragraphs and removing redundent sentences	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:16:16Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:30:20Z - There is no such thing as "feedbacks". Feedback is uncountable.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 849 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13200	Richard Van Nee	230	2	28.3.18.1	489	55	T	Y	489.54998779296875	55	28.3.18.1		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0476r1	527	When preamble puncturing is used, the spectral mask stays the same as for the total bandwidth. This effectively means that preamble puncturing is usel	Define some mask requirement for preamble puncturing or remove preamble puncturing completely.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:00:19Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions for CID 13200 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0476r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:39:09Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13201	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.1	263	14	E	N	263.14001464 84375	14	27.6.1		V			447	"HE compressed beamforming feedback" is a cumbersome term. Feedback is not countable - it is not a thing you can refer to with an article ("the feedba	Change the name to "HE beamforming report" or "HE sounding feedback report"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:21:18Z) - See #12775 which changes the term to "HE compressed beamforming and CQI report"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:21:49Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 850 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13202	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.1	263	14	T	Y	263.14001464 84375	14	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-17/1826r0	448	This description for the HE compressed beamforming feedback contradicts that give in 9.4.1.64, P114 L42. Does the SU report include the MU Exclusive Be	Correct the description of the HE compressed beamforming report. If the difference between SU and MU reports is not in the fields present then identify	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 00:41:37Z) TGax Editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 802.11-17/1826r0 under all headings that include CID 12774.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13203	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	29	T	N	263.29000854 49219	29	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	570	All the statements in the sub clause are or should be covered in the frame formats clause. The purpose of the frame formats clause is to assign meaning	Remove subclause 27.6.2. If anything present here is missing in the the HE Capabilities element field descriptions, add it.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:36:30Z) Agree in principle with the commenter. Editor to apply the changes in 18/0527r2. The changes define normative OTA	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13204	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	33	T	N	263.32998657 22656	33	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	What "being an SU beamformer" entails is not defined.	Define what being an SU beamformer entails. If it is initiating a non-TB sounding sequence why do we need to indicate this capability?	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:38:35Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13204. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:02:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13205	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	37	T	N	263.36999511 71875	37	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	What "being an MU beamformer entails is not defined	Define what being an MU beamformer entails.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:46:27Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13205. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:02:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 852 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13206	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	40	T	N	263.39999938964844	40	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	What "being an SU beamformee" entails is not defined	Define what being an SU beamformee entails.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:46:57Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13206. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:02:52Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13207	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	45	T	N	263.45001220703125	45	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0042r1	496	What "being an MU beamformee" entails is not defined	Define what being an MU beamformee entails.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:47:34Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13207.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:02:56Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13208	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	47	T	N	263.47000122007031	47	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0042r1	496	This bullet has nothing to do with "indicating its role in a sounding sequence, the support for sounding sequences or support for feedback types" as s	Move elsewhere	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:48:01Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13208.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:04:20Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 853 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13209	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	50	T	N	263.5	50	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	The first shall statement here makes no sense. A shall statement is not needed on what is supported. A shall statement is needed on what can be transm	Remove the first shall statement. Add a statement to the effect that an HE beamformer shall not send to an HE beamformee and HE NDP PPDU with a band wi	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:48:23Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13209. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13210	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	52	T	N	263.51998901 36719	52	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	Its not the channel width in which it is received (whatever that is) that matters. It is the bandwidth of the HE NDP PPDU (the value indicated in the	Rewrite the statement to apply to the what the STA is capable of receiving (and move it to the appropriate subclause). For example, an HE STA that ind	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:49:09Z) Proposed resolution is to clarify that the BW is that of the HE NDP as obtained from the RXVECTOR parameter CH_BAN	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:18:40Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 854 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13211	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	57	T	N	263.57000732421875	57	27.6.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0042r1	496	This statement is not necessary since it can't be tested. The HE beamformer is just advertising what it is capable or transmitting. The field descript	Remove the statement.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:49:43Z) Agree that it can't be tested, but that is not a technical reason for not having a normative statement for the ST	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 23:16:54Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13212	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	263	64	T	N	263.64001464375	64	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	This statement is not necessary. It is the behavior when the field is set a certain way that is important. For SU-type feedback, the beamformee shall	Remove the statement. Add statements for restrictions on what can be transmitted based on the recipient capability (if necessary).	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:50:22Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13212. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 855 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13213	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	264	4	T	N	264.04000854 49219	4	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	This statement is not necessary. It's the behavior when the field is set a certain way that is important.	Remove the statement. Add a statement to the effect that the STA shall not send an HE Compressed Beamforming Report field with codebook x unless the H	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:50:59Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13213. Revised with mot	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13214	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	264	9	T	N	264.08999633 78906	9	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	This statement is not necessary. An HE beamfomer controls what it receives: it sets the Feedback Type And Ng field in the HE NDP Announcement frame ap	Remove the statement.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:51:29Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13214. Revised with mot	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 856 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13215	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	264	14	T	N	264.14001464 84375	14	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	This statement is not necessary. It's the behavior when the field is set a certain way that is important.	Remove the statement.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:51:58Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13215. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13216	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	264	18	T	N	264.17999267 578125	18	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	This statement is not necessary. The behavior that is important is the restriction on the HE beamformer sending an HE NDP Announcement frame request in	Remove the statement.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:52:25Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13216. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 857 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13217	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.2	264	23	T	N	264.23001098 63281	23	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0527r2	496	This statement is not necessary. The behavior that is important is that the HE beamformer not send the HE beamformee an HE NDP Announcement with certa	Remove the statement.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 05:52:59Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0042r1 under all headings that include CID 13217. Revisited with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	Poorly resolved comments will come back in the next round	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13218	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	32	T	N	264.32000732 421875	32	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	This is a definition for the HE non-TB sounding sequence. Write it as such.	Replace with "An HE non-TB sounding sequence is a sounding sequence where the initiating frame is an individually addressed HE NDP Announcement fra me	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:50:49Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13218.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 858 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13219	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	34	T	Y	264.33999633 78906	34	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	The sounding procudure for STAs with different operating channel widths and for STAs with full bandwidth/partial bandwidth capabilities is not clearly	Clarify the rules for STAs with different operating channel widths and full bandwidth/partial bandwidth capabilities. My take: a 20 MHz operating STA	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:51:21Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13219.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13220	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	37	T	N	264.36999511 71875	37	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0446r3	567	Can an HE non-TB sounding sequence solicit MU-type feedback? CQI feedback? Presumably, since a non-AP STA must support the MU beamformee role but may	Rewrite as: "The HE NDP Announcement frame in an HE non-TB sounding sequence may solicit SU, MU or CQI-only feedback."	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:30:52Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0446r3 under all headings that include CID 13220.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 17:51:45Z - For the changes to 27.6.2 I have added a requirement "An MU beamformer may solicit full bandwidth CQI feedback from an	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13221	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	38	E	N	264.38000488 28125	38	27.6.3		A			447	Abbreviating a single word is silly.	Replace all use of the abbreviation BW wiith bandwidth.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:32:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:32:08Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13222	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	42	T	N	264.42001342 77344	42	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"based on parameters" is too vague.	Add a set of statements that restrict what the HE beamformer can send based on the beamformee capability. For example, "An HE beamformer shall not ini	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:52:23Z) Agree in principle with the comment. A proposed resolution along the lines suggested by the commenter was motioned	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13223	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	42	T	N	264.42001342 77344	42	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"may initiate... only if..." is not the right construct here. Also, "based on parameters supported" is too vague.	Add a set of statements that restrict what the HE beamformer can send based on the beamformee capability: "An HE beamformer shall not send an HE NDP A	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:53:39Z) Agree in principle with the comment. A proposed resolution along the lines suggested by the commenter was motioned	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 860 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13224	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	48	T	N	264.48001098 63281	48	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	This could be more specific	"An HE beamformer shall not initiate a HE non-TB sounding sequence with an HE NDP Announcement frame where the Partial BW field indicates less than fu	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:54:19Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13224.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13225	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	52	T	N	264.51998901 36719	52	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	This is a definition for the HE TB sounding sequence. Write it as such.	"An HE TB sounding sequence is a sounding sequence where the initiating frame is a broadcast HE NDP Annoucment frame that contains two or more STA Inf	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:54:43Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13225.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 861 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13226	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	52	T	N	264.51998901 36719	52	27.6.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Why does the HE TB sounding sequence require two STA Info fields in the HE NDP Announcement frame? Surely the fact that the HE NDP is broadcast is suf	Define an HE TB sounding sequence as one where the HE NDP Announcement is broadcast: "An HE TB sounding sequence is a sounding sequence initiated by a	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:55:21Z) A broadcast NDPA that would be addressed to one STA would be a pathological case since all STAs would be required	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13227	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	57	T	N	264.57000732 421875	57	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Can an HE TB sounding sequence solicit SU-type feedback? CQI feedback? Presumably since we have capability fields for triggered feedback of each of th	Replace with "The HE NDP Annoucement frame in an HE TB sounding sequence shall not solicit MU, SU or CQI feedback unless all the STAs addressed in the	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:56:04Z) Agree in principle with the comment. A proposed resolution along the lines suggested by the commenter was motioned	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 862 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13228	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	61	T	Y	264.60998535 15625	61	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	This statement is extremely vague.	Make individual specific statements such as "shall not solicit feedback with codebook x unless the beamformee supports codebook x".	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:56:46Z) Agree in principle with the comment. A proposed resolution along the lines suggested by the commenter was motioned	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13229	Robert Stacey	230	2	8.3.5.12	49	61	T	Y	49.61000061035156	61	8.3.5.12		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Do not change the definition of a term.	Use "HT STA that is not a VHT STA" or "non-VHT HT STA." Ditto for VHT STA.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:43:57Z) TGax Editor: The issue addressed by this comment has been resolved in D2.3 as resolution to CID 12122. Tgax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 863 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13230	Robert Stacey	230	2	8.3.5.12	49	54	T	Y	49.540000915527344	54	8.3.5.12		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	615	There are two different ways for an HE PHY to issue PHY-CCA.indication. 1. With channel-list {primary}, {secondary}, {secondary40} or {secondary 80}. 2	Remove per20MHzbitmap and enumerate the preamble puncturing modes not already covered by secondary, secondary 40, etc.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:54:18Z) - Agree that current TGax D2.0 is not clearly describing how to use per 20MHz bitmap in the MAC behaviour aspect.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 19:16:20Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
13231	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	N	55.200000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	DL HE MU PPDU is not defined anywhere. Intuitively it is an HE MU PPDU sent by an AP to one or more associated non-AP STAs. However, it could also be	Define DL HE MU PPDU	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:23:09Z) Revised - Agree in principle.The right terminology is HE MU PPDU. So, changed DL HE MU PPDU to HE MU PPDU, which	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 864 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13232	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	N	55.20000076293945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	"DL HEMU PPDU or HE SU PPDU that solicits..." It is not the PPDU that does the soliciting. It's the Trigger frame or frame caring a UMRS field that d	Rewrite the Meaning column so that the enumerated type is defined for the context in which it appears. "- No explicit acknowledgement: bit 6 of the Fr	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:23:46Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:09:21Z - no specific edits associated with this CID. Resolution seems to be attempted with #11258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13233	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	38	T	N	55.38000106811523 4	38	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	A Multi-STA BlockAck frame is a variant of a Block Ack frame.	Remove the redundancy. Change to read " the addressed recipient return an Ack frame or BlockAck frame carried..."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:24:39Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:10:37Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 865 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13234	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	35	G	N	79.349998474 1211	35	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	We have an MU-BAR and MU-RTS but we have a Multi-STA BlockAck. Let's be consistent: is it multi-user or multi-STA?	Change the name of the Multi-STA BlockAck frame to MU BlockAck frame.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:07:40Z) Rejected. It is a Block Ack frame capable of acknowledging multiple STAs. By changing the name to MU BlockAck fr	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 21:15:35Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-29	EDITOR
13235	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.3.1.20	85	4	T	Y	85.040000915 52734	4	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	Can SU feedback be returned using the TB sounding sequence? If so, the Nc field can't be reserved for SU.	Clarify (in 27.6.3) whether or not SU feedback can be returned in a TB sounding sequence. If so, define Nc for SU feedback.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:41:25Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 13235.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13236	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	40	E	N	85.400001525 8789	40	9.3.1.23		V			447	Missing subject	Insert "The RA field" before " is set to the broadcast"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:15:25Z) - Break the sentence up to clarify the conditions for setting the RA field. See #11977	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:16:06Z - see #11977	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 866 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13237	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.4.1.64	114	45	T	Y	114.44999694824219	45	9.4.1.64		V	Lochan Verma	11-17/1826r0	448	Why is the MU Exclusive Beamforming Report field present when the Feedback Type is SU? Isn't it MU exclusive?	Either remove the MU Exclusive Beamforming Report field from SU feedback or combine it with the HE Compressed Beamforming Report field. If the fields	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 00:42:43Z) TGax Editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 802.11-17/1826r0 under all headings that include CID 12774.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13238	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	136	4	T	Y	136.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	The exact requirement for "MU Cascading Supported" are not clear. The requirements are also very different for an AP and non-AP STA.	Clarify the requirements for "MU Cascading Supported" in both non-AP STA and AP. In an AP, cascading support means that the AP is capable of transmitt	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:51:46Z) Make changes as in doc 11-18/0707r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0				I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 867 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13239	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	140	62	T	Y	140.61999511 71875	62	9.4.2.237.3		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	The only difference between class A and class B devices is power control accuracy. The terminology is thus misleading not aligned with other capabilit	Change the field name to "Tx Power/ RSSI Accuracy" (or even "Power Control Accuracy") with enumerated values High and Low. Change the middle column hea	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:51:38Z) Change seems an over kill. The proposed change may cause confusion in the text	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:24:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13240	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.7.3	173	34	T	N	173.33999633 789062	34	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	All SU sequences should be available as triggered sequeces since triggered access is just another way for the non-AP STA to get data to the AP. The SU	Allow an A-MPDU to include a Trigger frame and BlockAckReq frame. Since the PPDU response is ambiguous (SU or TB PPDU), add ack policy HTP Ack to the	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:45:39Z) Rejected Discussion: MU-BAR already includes the functionality with the combination of Trigger and BAR.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 868 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13241	Robert Stacey	230	2	9.7.3	173	52	T	N	173.52000427246094	52	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	With multi-TID operation, the operation for each stream should be largely independent. If one stream needs BlockAckReq to move the recipient window, i	Allow a multi-TID A-MPDU to include a BlockAckReq (either Compressed or Multi-TID) where the TIDs in the BlockAckReq are different from the TIDs in th	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:46:31Z) Rejected Discussion: in multi-TID A-MPDU, the transmitter can move the recipient window of one TID through 1),	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13242	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.1	230	1	T	N	230.00999450683594	1	27.3.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	A fragment is an MPDU (see definition). An S-MPDU is an MPDU (see definition). So a fragment cant be sent in an S-MPDU (it could be sent as an S-MPDU)	Change to "In addition, these procedures allow dynamic fragments to be sent in an A-MPDU."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:20:59Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:11:01Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 869 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13243	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	12	T	N	230.11999511 71875	12	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	MPDUs don't contain fragments. A fragment is an MPDU. See definition ("A fragment is an MPDU, the Frame Body field of which carries all or a portion of	Change to "An originator STA shall solicit an immediate repons e for each dynamic fragment, except..."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:24:26Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 20:58:24Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13244	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	39	T	N	230.38999938 964844	39	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	What is a valid first MPDU? We typically don't need a frame to be "valid" just to be received. If it's received it's valid. If it has an FCS error it	"Valid" and "First" are not important. All that is important is that a frame that is an Ack or a BlockAck frame is received with certain other conditi	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:31:51Z) Revised- Disagree with comment, this bullet is true and can be used to identify if a fragments is explicitly fai	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:05:25Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13245	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	39	T	N	230.38999938964844	39	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	We now allow more than one EOF=1 subframe in an A-MPDU. Receiving an Ack frame is thus not a sufficient condition.	In the multi-TID case, explicitly failed means receiving a block ack bitmap with 0 for that SN. Ack frame is not sufficient.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:32:33Z) Revised-Disagree with comment, this bullet is true and can be used to identify if a fragments is explicitly fai	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:03:28Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13246	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	39	T	N	230.38999938964844	39	27.3.2.1		A	Ming Gan	99r3	478	A Multi-STA BlockAck frame is a variant of a Block Ack frame	Remove the redundant "Multi-STA BlockAck frame". BlockAck frame is the general name for all the variants (Compressed BlockAck, Multi-STA BlockAck, etc	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:33:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:04:01Z - The editing instructions in 18/99r3 fix this problem differently from the proposed change. Keeping the text as modified	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 871 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13247	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	39	T	N	230.38999938964844	39	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	A Multi-STA BlockAck frame is a BlockAck frame. "BlockAck frame" is the generic name for any of the BlockAck frame variants (it does not specifically	Correct this and other uses of "Ack, BlockAck or Multi-STA BlockAck frame" to read "Ack or BlockAck frame".	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:33:53Z) Revised-Agree with comment in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor pl	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:05:16Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13248	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	48	T	N	230.47999572753906	48	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	The conditions referred to by this statement are not clear. This is compunded by the ambiguous used of "MPDU or A-MPDU containting dynamic fragments". A	Explicitly state the conditions or remove statement	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:34:41Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:05:45Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 872 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13249	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.3.3.3	233	40	T	N	233.39999389648438	40	27.3.3.3		A	Ming Gan	764r1	601	A Multi-STA BlockAck frame is a BlockAck frame. "BlockAck frame" is the generic name for any of the BlockAck frame variants (it does not specifically	Change "Block Ack frame or Multi-STA BlockAck frame" to either "BlockAck frame" or "Compressed BlockAck frame or Multi-STA BlockAck frame"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:30:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13250	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4	234	39	E	N	234.38999938964844	39	27.4		A			447	This subclause defines more that the "block ack procedure". It also defines the "acknowledgement procedure". The block ack procedure is used to acknow	Change the subclause title to "HE acknowledgement procedure"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:31:46Z) - Use "acknowledgment" spelling	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:32:04Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 873 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13251	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	234	44	E	N	234.44 000244 140625	44	27.4.1		V			447	Is it the HE-immediate block acknowledgement procedure or HE block acknolwdegement procedure (in title)?	Change to "HE block acknowledgement procedure" throughout	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:37:27Z) - Title changed to "HE acknowledgment procedure". Change two references to HE-immediate block acknweldge/ackno	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:39:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13252	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	234	44	T	N	234.44 000244 140625	44	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	It also adds support for many different bit map lengths	Mention support for different bitmap lengths	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:00:54Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13253	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	234	49	E	N	234.49 000549 316406	49	27.4.1		A			447	There is no such thing as Multi-STA BlockAckReq	Change to MU-BAR Trigger frame	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:41:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:42:00Z - see #11085	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 874 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13254	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	234	55	T	N	234.55000030517578	55	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	It is not the STA that is acknowledged, it is the data from that STA	Change to "Acknowledging data from multiple STAs using..."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:01:45Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:23:05Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13255	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	234	57	T	N	234.57000732421875	57	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	What is "All-Ack"? Also, its not a variant of the Multi-STA BlockAck frame, it's a particular Per AID TID Info field setting.	Change to "All ack context in the Per AID TID Info field of a Multi-STA BlockAck frame to acknowledge all QoS Data frames and Management frames from a	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:02:30Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:26:16Z	2.3	2018-04-13	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 875 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13256	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	234	62	T	N	234.61999511 71875	62	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"Acknowledgement for single MPDUs" is misleading. QoS Data frames in EOF=1 subframes are acknowledged with Ack Type = 1, TID = 0-7 while Action frames	Fix	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:03:15Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. Deleted the cited sentence. Instead, the terminology used in the rest of the docum	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:27:21Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13257	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	235	1	T	N	235.00999450 683594	1	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	It is sufficient to require that a STA respond with a certain frame type when it recieves a frame that solicits that frame type. There is no need for	Remove these two statements. They are already covered by shall statements elsewhere, e.g., P239L23.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:03:56Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:29:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 876 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13258	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	235	11	T	N	235.11000061035156	11	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Why do we need a statement "A non-AP HESTA that is not associated with an AP shall not send a Multi-STA BlockAck frame"? Why would we have this state	Remove statement.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:04:42Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:31:21Z - proposed change is accepted	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13259	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	235	26	T	N	235.25999450683594	26	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	This statement should be a part of 10.7.6. We could probably have a general statement for any control frame with broadcast RA the addresses multiple S	Generalize the statement and move it to 10.7.6	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:25:43Z) Revised. Agree in principle. TGax editor shall add the following sentence to section 10.7.6.1 "An HE STA that	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:05:51Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 877 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13260	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	235	30	T	N	235.30000030517578	30	27.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Establishing (or not establishing) a block ack agreement is not relavant to how the STA parses the Multi-STA BlockAck frame. A STA that has establish	Replace this and the next paragraph with a forward reference: "An HE STA that receives a Multi-STA BlockAck frame as a response to frames requiring ac	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:05:21Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 19:43:27Z - In the second paragraph modified by #13260, it is not the fact that a block ack agreement has been established that is	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13261	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	235	61	T	N	235.61000061035156	61	27.4.1		J	George Cherian	1861R1	473	The state of dot11MultiBSSActivated is not relavant here. Whether or not a Multi-STA BlockAck frame has a "transmitted BSSID" in the TA field should	Correct the requirement here so that it identifies the recipient capabilities and also accounts for STAs on the BSS with the transmitted BSSID (those	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:15:29Z) Reject The previous paragraph in this section (D2.0, pg 235, ln 55) already covers the case for AP to determine	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:12:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 878 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13262	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.1	236	9	T	N	236.08999633789062	9	27.4.1		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Multi-TID blockack operation deserves a separate subclause.	Create a new subclause "Multi-TID blockack procedure" and move this and other multi-TID statements there.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:06:19Z) Rejected - Removed the terminology of Multi-TID from the rx standpoint. Updated text is general, which also inc	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13263	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.2	236	25	T	N	236.25	25	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The recipient of an "S-MPDU" does not always ack it. An S-MPDU could be any MPDU, not necessarily one requiring acknowledgement.The recipient of an A-	Delete intro paragraph and convert each bullet into a standalone statement.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:07:10Z) Revised.-Agree in principle. Section is rewritten to reflects this comment and other comments along the same li	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 879 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13264	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.2	236	29	T	N	236.28999328 61328	29	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Receives an S-MPDU prior to association - what does that mean? Receives a frame with TA from a STA that has not yet completed association? How would d	The criteria must be a frame that requires acknowledgement that is received in an HE TB PPDU on an RU allocated to "AID" 2045. Also, we need a statemе	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:07:53Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. Section is rewritten to reflects the concern. However, didn't create a new section	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13265	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.2	236	32	T	Y	236.32000732 421875	32	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Single TID A-MPDU is not defined. Also, the AP must be "all-ack" capable. And the criteria is more involved that presented by this statement: there ca	Fix	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:08:42Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 20:49:39Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 880 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13266	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.2	236	37	T	Y	236.36999511 71875	37	27.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The term "multi-TID A-MPDU" is defined from the context of the initator and has no meaning in the context of the recipient. "For each TID" is also not	Multi-TID handling is complex and deserves a separate subclause. Create a "Multi-TID acknowledgement procedure" subcause and move this and other state	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:09:29Z) Revised.- Agree in principle with the comment or on the usage of 'multi-TID-AMPDU' wording from receiver standpoi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13267	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	2	E	N	238.02000427 246094	2	27.4.3		V			447	BA session is an undefined term.	Change to: "The Block Ack Bitmap subfield length in bits of a BlockAck frame used for a particular block ack agreement depends on the negotiated buffe	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:14:56Z) - see #12693	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:15:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 881 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13268	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	10	T	N	238.10000610351562	10	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	Suppose a 256-bit WinSizeR has been negotiated. Under what conditions is a 64-bit bitmap sent? Based on the procedure defined in 10.24.7.4 it would se	Update the procedure in 10.24.7.5 to defiine the conditions under which a 64-bit bitmap can be sent when a 256-bit WinSizeR has been negotiated. Defin	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:26:34Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0717-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:06:56Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13269	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	10	T	N	238.10000610351562	10	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The shall statment here (and L7, L14, L17, L20) is meaningless. Worse, some actually contradict later statements, e.g., P238L31. What we need are shal	For example, "A STA shall not transmit a CompressedBlockAck frame with a BlockAck Bitmap field with a length greater than 64 unless the negotiated bu	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:10:13Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:12:08Z- Unable to execute the instructions since the instructions are against text modified with #12693.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 882 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13270	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	28	T	N	238.27999877929688	28	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"The originator sets the Duration field..." In the ADDBA field? What does this have to do with anything?	Remove sentence	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:11:00Z) Revised.- Agree that the sentence seems to be in the wrong place. However, this requirement is still valid for t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:26:10Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13271	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	40	E	N	238.39999389648438	40	27.4.3		A			447	Bracketed (multi-TID) is unnecessary. A multi-TID A-MPDU is an A-MPDU and there is no need to call it out. A Multi-TID BlockAckReq frame is a BlockAck	Remove both instances of "(multi-TID)"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:40:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:41:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13272	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	40	T	N	238.39999389648438	40	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	An A-MPDU does not solicit anything.	Change to "... a QoS Data frame, Management frame, BlockAckReq frame, ..."	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:11:50Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:10:43Z- Does not address the problem - just moves "an A-MPDU" from the beginning to the end of the list	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 883 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13273	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	44	T	N	238.44000244140625	44	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	This statement has nothing to do with BlockAck frame response. WinSizeR is a static value set during the blockack agreement negotiation. We already h	Remove statement	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:27:14Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0717-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13274	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	48	T	N	238.47999572753906	48	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	This statement is not an exception; it is a repeat of a amended statement in 10.2 4.7.5.	Remove statement	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:28:07Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0717-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 884 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13275	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	51	T	N	238.50999450683594	51	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	This statement contradicts other statements that allow bitmap length to be different lenghts (sometimes 32 and sometimes 64 for example). WinStartR an	Remove this statement. Add a more accurate statement on how to derive the bitmap length.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:29:03Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0717-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13276	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	58	T	Y	238.58000183 10547	58	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	A TXOP responder does not necessarily track "the remaining TXOP duration". In general, we do not expect the a TXOP responder to consider NAV or the Du	Remove NOTE	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:12:36Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-06 21:26:28Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13277	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	62	E	N	238.61999511 71875	62	27.4.3		A			447	No such thing as a BA frame	Change to BlockAck frame (twice)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:41:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:41:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 885 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13278	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.3	238	63	T	N	238.63000048828125	63	27.4.3		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Any "remapping: should be defined in the frame formats and not 27.3	Remove statement. Ensure the "remapping" is defined in Clause 9.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:13:22Z) Rejected - The sentence is information which is useful for readability purpose	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13279	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	7	T	N	241.07000732421875	7	27.4.4.6		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	There are numerous problems with this statement and the intent is not clear. 1. "Basic Trigger frame that solicits an immediate response": a Basic Tri	Remove statement	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:14:11Z) Revised - This sentence is useful. So, it is updated to incorporate issues raised by the comment or TGax editor	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13280	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.4.5	241	49	T	Y	241.49000549316406	49	27.4.5		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	The "FN settings" of the BlockAck frame indicate the bitmap length carried. The "FN settings" for the BlockAckReq frame is defined in the baseline (80	Remove statement.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:29:43Z) Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0717-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:59:28Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 886 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13281	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	46	T	N	244.46000671 38672	46	27.5.3.1		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	This statement is inadequate; a STA can't arbitrarily meet class A or class B requirements (per transmission for example). If a STA indicates that it	Change to read "If an HE STA indicates Class A in the Device Class subfield of the HE PHY Capabilities Information field of the HE Capabilities element	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:50:04Z) Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0546r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:16:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13282	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.5.3.2	245	46	T	Y	245.46000671 38672	46	27.5.3.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	A Multi-STA BlockAck frame is a BlockAck frame. "BlockAck frame" is the generic name for any of the BlockAck frame variants (it does not specifically	Correct this and other uses of "Ack, BlockAck or Multi-STA BlockAck frame" to read "Ack or BlockAck frame".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 887 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13283	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	4	T	Y	252.03999328 61328	4	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	The reference here to Table 9-429 is inappropriate and unecessary. Table 9-429 describes the "non-A-MPDU" options. The concept of a "non-A-MPDU" in th	Remove all references to the context tables in 9.7. Provide explicit rules for the A-MPDU formation. In many cases these already exist and this paragr	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:41:39Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 13283.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 22:26:11Z - For the second bullet, the exception is the the content defined in Table 9-426 so moved the exception on the beginning of	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13284	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.5.4	256	3	T	Y	256.02999877 92969	3	27.5.4		V	Abhishek Patil		654	This subclause is very poorly written and the requirements on an implementation are not clear at all. The subclause needs to be rewritten so that the	Write clear guidance to the STA implementor focused on the A-MPDU content. For example, "An AP that supports cascading may transmit to a non-AP STA th	Revised Agree with the commenter that the original rule is too strong. AP can initiate MU cascading including some STA if this STA supports MU cascad	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13285	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.1	263	9	E	N	263.08999633 78906	9	27.6.1		A			447	Missing article "uses explicit feedback mechanism"	Add "an"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:20:36Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:20:39Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 888 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13286	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.1	263	11	T	N	263.10998535 15625	11	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	Identify the training signal as the HE NDP PPDU	Change to "...using a training signal (HE NDP PPDU) transmitted..."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:05:28Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0043r0 under all headings that include CID 13286.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 19:45:20Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13287	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	264	61	T	Y	264.60998535 15625	61	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	It is not clear if there are restrictions on the feedback variants that can be part of a TB sounding sequence. Can SU feedback be return? (If so we wi	Identify the feedback types that can be used with TB sounding	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:57:20Z) Agree in principle with the comment. A proposed resolution along the lines suggested by the commenter was motioned	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 889 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13288	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	265	1	T	N	265.01000976 5625	1	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	The definitions for HE non-TB sounding sequence and HE TB sounding sequence have already been given at P264 L32 and P264 L52. The new requirement here i	Replace the paragraph with "An HE beamformer that initiates an HE non-TB sounding sequence or HE TB sounding sequence shall transmit an HE NDP PPDU a	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:57:56Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13288.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13289	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	265	35	T	N	265.35000610 35156	35	27.6.3		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	The statement at P264 L61 covers the setting of the HE NDP Announcement fields based on the HE beamformee capabilities. The restrictions on the HE beamf	Remove the ability of the HE beamformee to set parameters; let the HE beamformer always decide parameters based on HE beamformee's capabilities.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:58:27Z) The sounding protocol defines two sequences: 1) HE non-TB sounding sequence wherein the HE beamformee is the one	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 890 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13290	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	266	29	T	N	266.29000854 49219	29	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Explicit rules are missing for a STA supporting partial bandwidth and that has an operating channel width less that the sounding channel width.	Add explicit rules such as "The HE beamformer shall not solicit feedback from an HE beamformee with 20 MHz operating channel width that outside the ran	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:59:04Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13290.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13291	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.3	266	29	T	Y	266.29000854 49219	29	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	There are no rules for including a beamformee with operating channel width narrow than the sounding bandwidth.	Define rules	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:59:33Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13291.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 891 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13292	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.6.4	268	39	T	N	268.39001464 84375	39	27.6.4		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0078r4	557	If the HE beamformee decides the parameters in the case of non-triggered sounding then the condition is not what is solicited by the size of the repor	Either have the HE beamformer decide the parameters or make the condition the actual size of the report (based on the parameters chosen bu the HE beam	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:21:12Z) It is described in other subclauses of 27.6 that in SU sounding, the souning parameters are decided by beamformee	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 21:55:27Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13293	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.7.1	270	21	T	Y	270.20999145 50781	21	27.7.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	Surely it allows the AP and only the AP to manage activity. What sort of activity? Jumping jacks? It is not clear how it minimizes contention (minimiz	"TWT operation allows an AP to control when an associated non-AP HE STA that supports TWT has access to the WM. This control allows the AP to reduce W	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:58:11Z) Revised – Proposed resolution adds more clarifications on what sort of activity is managed. Not sure how jacks c	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 892 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13294	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.7.1	270	43	T	Y	270.42999267578125	43	27.7.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	The applicability of the shall statement to an implementation is not clear. dot11TWTOptionActivated is a MIB object managed by an external management	Remove the paragraph. The descriptions in the capability fields themselves are sufficient for an implementer to determine how to set these fields appr	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:58:59Z) Revised – This is supposed to be a capability MIB variable here. Proposed resolution is to specify that it is a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13295	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	50	T	Y	300.5	50	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	"One or more frames in A-MPDU subframes with the EOF field set to 0 that are not under the block ack agreement" QoS Data frames that are not part of a	Remove the statement. (QoS Data frames in EOF = 1 subframes already covered by rpevious bullet)	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:20:05Z) Revised Discussion: the cited bullet is about the MPDU that are neither QoS Data frames nor Management frames.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13296	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.11.2	304	43	T	N	304.42999267578125	43	27.11.2		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0629r1	613	The TXVECTOR parameter UPLINK_FLAG doesn't carry anything -- it's a parameter.	Remove the first sentence and make each bullet a stand-alone statement	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:35:17Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0629r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 893 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13297	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.11.5	306	33	T	N	306.32998657 22656	33	27.11.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	The TX VECTOR parameter TXOP_DURATION does not carry something called TXOP Duration field. It is a parameter and it caries a duration value that presum	Remove statement.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:48:58Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We revise the description accordingly. We also remove the refer	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:11:25Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13298	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.11.5	306	56	T	N	306.55999755 859375	56	27.11.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	It is important that all STAs responding with an HE TB PPDU set all HE-SIG-A fields to the same value. There is a race condition with the statement at	Remove the dependency on HE Operation field settings. Set TXOP_DURATION based on Duration field of Trigger frame or frame carrying UMRS and nothing el	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:52:11Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. The description in R306L56 is a “should” statement, and the se	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:12:27Z - Reworded the sentence since the accumulation of conditions makes it difficult to parse.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13299	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.11.5	306	61	T	N	306.60998535 15625	61	27.11.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	1874r3	468	It is not clear how all STAs receiving a Trigger frame in a non-HE PPDU set the TXOP field in HE-SIG-A to the same value. There is a statement at P306	Remove the statement at P306L61. Add a statement "An HE TB PPDU sent in response to a Trigger frame or frame carrying a UMRS Control frame shall set t	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-27 22:51:26Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. The STA that responds to Trigger frame will set the TXOP field	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 19:32:25Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13300	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.11.5	307	2	T	N	307.01998901 36719	2	27.11.5		V	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	PPDUs don't have MAC headers. Setting TXOP_DURATION should have nothing to do with the received PPDU: PPDUs don't solicit responses; only frames do an	For a HE TB PPDU set the TXVECTOR parameter TXOP_DURATION based on the Duration field of the Trigger frame or frame carrying the UMRS Control field. F	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-12 21:04:08Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We revise the sentence as the following “a frame with a Duratio	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:42:50Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 895 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13301	Robert Stacey	230	2	27.17	325	1	T	Y	325.01000976 5625	1	27.17		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	15r0	501	The subclause does not make sense. An HE STA is only an HE STA if it includes the HE Capabilities element in its Association frame (if it doesn't incl	Clariy the procedure for 20 MHz association in 11.40 (VHT BSS operation) and remove 27.17	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-29 05:54:11Z) Revised – Agree with comment. Proposed resolution is to delete the subclause. The operation for when operating a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:11:28Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13302	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	14	T	Y	367.14001464 84375	14	28.3.3.6		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	Need to specify RU restrictions on STA that reduced its operating BW to 40MHz via OMI	Add the following statements: An AP shall not assign the following RUs to a non-AP HE STA with a 40 MHz operating channel width: -- 26-tone RU 10, 19	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:42:50Z) Supporting STAs operating in 40 MHz bandwidth mode to participate in wider bandwidth OFDMA transmissions require	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 896 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13303	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	27	T	N	367.26998901 36719	27	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	Why only an HE MU PPDU? Surely the restriction applies to HE TB PPDU as well.	This is the only bullet that does not mention both HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU. Change the intro sentence to read "An AP shall not assign to a non-AP HE	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:58:39Z) - Commenter is correct that RU restriction on UL OFDMA portion is omited by mistake, so it is required to add	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13304	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	47	T	N	367.47000122 07031	47	28.3.3.6		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	The optional support for the 242-tone RU in a STA with 20 MHz operating channel width should apply to both transmit (HE TB PPDU) and receive (HE MU PP	Add a new capability bit or at combine with channel widht setting indication.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:43:05Z) 242-tone RUs in HE MU/TB PPDUs of 40 MHz or wider do not have any null subcarriers at the center of the 242-tone	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:02:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 897 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13305	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	405	40	T	N	405.39999938964844	40	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	The description is not accurate -- see 27.11.2. Also, there is nothing in the PHY that links it to UPLINK_FLAG. You don't need any shall statements he	Change the description so that it references TX/RXVECTOR parameter UPLINK_FLAG.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:56:31Z) Editor Instruction: please replace the description of that field with “Indicates whether the PPDU is sent UL or	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:33:18Z - I'm going to save the group some trouble here. The resolution fails to detail the encoding: it refers to the TX/RXVECTO	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13306	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	406	16	T	N	406.16000036621094	16	28.3.10.7.2		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	This field is set by the MAC. The description should link to to TXVECTOR/RXVECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR.	Change the description so that it references TX/RXVECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:56:12Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13306 as suggested here in IEEE 802.11-18/0038r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:12:49Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 898 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13307	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	407	31	T	N	407.30999755859375	31	28.3.10.7.2		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	This is a poorly named field. See 10.22.1 for a definition of TXOP. The entry in this field has little to do with the TXOP. At best it is a duration v	Change the field name to more accurately reflect its purpose.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:56:27Z) There is a reason this field doesn't use the same name "TXOP_Duration" as in TXVECTOR. They have different binar	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13308	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.16	484	32	E	N	484.32000732421875	32	28.3.16		J			648	28.3.16 does not appear in PDF bookmarks	Fix	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:26:13Z) - This does not appear to be the case	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:26:23Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13309	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.16	484	32	T	Y	484.32000732421875	32	28.3.16		J	Yongho Seok		614	Move the HE NDP PPDU format description to 28.3.4.	Technical comment because there may be changes to the technical desciption as a result of the move.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:27:32Z) An HE NDP PPDU is not defining a new HE PPDU format. The HE NDP PPDU uses an HE SU PPDU format.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-31	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 899 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13310	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.16	484	35	T	Y	484.35000610 35156	35	28.3.16		V	Yongho Seok		614	What is a "sounding format"?	Use a consistant term for the PPDU: HE NPD PPDU. Remove the sentence "NDP is the only HE sounding format" since it is meaningless.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:27:54Z) - Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0630r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:32:43Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
13311	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.17	485	1	T	Y	485.01000976 5625	1	28.3.17		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	Move the HE TB NDP feedback PPDU format description to 28.3.4.	Technical comment because there may be changes to the technical description as a result of the move.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:02:28Z) HE TB NDP feedback PPDU can be seen as a special type of HE TB PPDU. Same resolution as for CID 11566. TGax Edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:03:50Z - see #11566	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 900 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13312	Robert Stacey	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	7	E	Y	502.07000732421875	7	28.3.19.6.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	615	Issuing two different forms of PHY-CCA.indication based on device capability is a bad idea. Also, the use of per20MHzbitmap is poorly defined (only issu	Remove per20MHzbitmap and enumerate the preamble puncturing modes not already covered by secondary, secondary 40, etc.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:55:02Z) - Agree that current TGax D2.0 is not clearly describing how to use per 20MHz bitmap in the MAC behaviour aspect.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 19:16:31Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
13313	Roger Marks	230	2				E	N					J			657	The term "Trigger frame" is overloaded, since the same term (in lower case) is used 39 times in IEEE Std 802.11-2016 for (1) what is sometimes called	(1) Change general (i.e., used without a type) references to the MU Trigger frame to "MU Trigger frame". (2) Add a definition of "MU Trigger frame". (	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13314	Roger Marks	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	47	E	N	252.47000122070312	47	27.5.3.4		A			447	"MU BAR Trigger frame" is misspelled, per Table 9-25b	Change "MU BAR Trigger frame" to "MU-BAR Trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:22:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:22:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 901 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13315	Roger Marks	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	53	E	N	252.52999877929688	53	27.5.3.4		A			447	"GCR MU BAR Trigger frame" is misspelled, per Table 9-25b	Change "GCR MU BAR Trigger frame" to "GCR MU-BAR Trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:23:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:23:45Z - see #12856	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13316	Roger Marks	230	2	27.15.2	315	18	E	N	315.17999267578125	18	27.15.2		A			447	"MU RTS Trigger frame" is misspelled, per Table 9-25b	Change "MU RTS Trigger frame" to "MU-RTS Trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-01-02 21:38:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-02 21:38:49Z - see #13317	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13317	Roger Marks	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	24	E	N	251.24000549316406	24	27.5.3.4		V			447	"MU RTS Trigger frame" is misspelled, per Table 9-25b	Change "MU RTS Trigger frame" to "MU-RTS Trigger frame" (twice in the note).	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:37:24Z) - Agree in principle. Replace all usage of "MU RTS" with MU-RTS Trigger frame.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:37:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13318	Roger Marks	230	2	27.5.3.4	252	24	E	N	252.24000549316406	24	27.5.3.4		V			447	"NFRP Trigger frame" is incorrectly named, per Table 9-25b	Change "NFRP Trigger frame" to "NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame" (twice in the note).	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:20:19Z) - Change the frame name to NFRP Trigger frame and update thrpugh out	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:20:43Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 902 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13319	Roger Marks	230	2	27.7.3.3	281	39	E	N	281.39001464 84375	39	27.7.3.3		A			447	"UPSD trigger frame" is incorrectly named, per base standard	Change "UPSD trigger frame" to "U-APSD trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:11:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:11:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13320	Roger Marks	230	2	27.7.3.2	277	41	E	N	277.41000366 21094	41	27.7.3.2		A			447	"APSD trigger frame" is incorrectly named, per base standard	Change "APSD trigger frame" to "U-APSD trigger frame" (six places on pages 277-281)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:04:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:05:01Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13321	Roger Marks	230	2	27.7.4.2	284	33	E	N	284.32998657 22656	33	27.7.4.2		A			447	"U-APSD trigger frame" incorrectly called "U-APSD trigger"	Change "U-APSD trigger" to "U-APSD trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:18:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:18:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13322	Roger Marks	230	2	27.7.4.2	284	38	E	N	284.38000488 28125	38	27.7.4.2		A			447	"U-APSD trigger frame" incorrectly called "U-APSD trigger"	Change "U-APSD trigger" to "U-APSD trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:18:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:18:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13323	Roger Marks	230	2	27.7.4.3	285	7	E	N	285.07000732 421875	7	27.7.4.3		A			447	"U-APSD trigger frame" incorrectly called "U-APSD trigger"	Change "U-APSD trigger" to "U-APSD trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:19:17Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:19:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13324	Roger Marks	230	2	27.7.4.3	285	12	E	N	285.11999511 71875	12	27.7.4.3		A			447	"U-APSD trigger frame" incorrectly called "U-APSD trigger"	Change "U-APSD trigger" to "U-APSD trigger frame"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:19:27Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:19:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13325	Roger Marks	230	2	G.5	595	42	E	N	595.41998291 01562	42	G.5		A			648	"A-MPDU" incorrectly called "A MPDU"	Change "A MPDU" to "A-MPDU" (two places on Line 42)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:20:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:20:52Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 903 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13326	Roger Marks	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	18	E	N	86.180000305 17578	18	9.3.1.23		V			447	The "Trigger Type" subfield should be called the "Trigger Frame Type subfield" because, throughout the draft, the Descriptions of Table 9-25b are used	Change "Trigger Type" to "Trigger Frame Type" (13 places in the draft, including once that is incorrectly in lower case)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:20:47Z) The Trigger Type subfield identifies the Trigger frame variant. Change the sentence that introduces the table t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:24:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13327	Rojan Chitrakar	230	2	B.4.3	557	37	E	N	557.36999511 71875	37	B.4.3		A		17/1775r0	447	Typo: HE should be HT	Replace HE with HT	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:05:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:00:30Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13328	Rojan Chitrakar	230	2	B.4.3	557	40	E	N	557.40002441 40625	40	B.4.3		A		17/1775r0	447	Typo: HE should be HT	Replace HE with HT	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:05:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:00:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13329	ron porat	230	2	9.3.1.23	88	13	T	N	88.129997253 41797	13	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	18/0483r2	513	The text refers to "non-OFDMA". More clear to specify what PPDU type is intended here.	Replace "non-OFDMA" by full bandwidth UL MU-MIMO PPDU.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:48:46Z) - Non-OFDMA has an explicit definition in the definition section. We term can now be used without ambiguity.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:48:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 904 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13330	ron porat	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	3	T	N	89.029998779 29688	3	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Table 28-20 doesn't have a packet extension subfield.	Refer to table 28-18 (the table for HE SU PPDU) instead of 28-20.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:22:21Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 13330	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13331	ron porat	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	30	T	N	89.300003051 75781	30	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Referring to HE-SIG-A field of MU PPDU rather than TB PPDU.	Refer to table 28-20 instead of 28-19.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:24:44Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 13331	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	See #14222	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13332	ron porat	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	55	T	N	89.550003051 75781	55	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	Reference missing to where conditions for presence of Trigger Dependent Common Info are specified.	Add reference to 9.3.1.23.1-9.3.1.23.8	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:17:59Z) Agree with the comment. Added reference to section on various TF variants. TGax editor, please make changes as sh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 22:43:29Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 905 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13333	ron porat	230	2	9.3.1.23	90	19	T	N	90.19000244140625	19	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1878r1	479	Missing explicit specification for bit 12 in case of RU 2x996	Add "and is set to 1 when the allocated RU is a 2x996-tone RU."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:50:20Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/1878r1 under all headings that include CID 12165.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:03:05Z - see #12165	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13334	ron porat	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	59	T	N	92.58999633789062	59	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	Reference missing to where conditions for presence of Trigger Dependent User Info are specified.	Add reference to 9.3.1.23.1-9.3.1.23.8	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:24:07Z) Agree with the comment. Added reference to section on various TF variants. TGax editor, please make changes as sh	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:23:38Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 906 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13335	ron porat	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	17	T	N	141.16999816 89453	17	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	The Note is not complete, since there are also restrictions to NSTS for DCM and STBC. Moreover, the wording 'reserved' suggests that this capability d	Remove note or make it more generic.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:47:29Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13335 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:51:09Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13336	ron porat	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	11	T	N	143.11000061 035156	11	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Wrong reference	Change "SU Beamformee" to "SU Beamformer"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:51:04Z) Resolution of CID 12675 is applicable.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:14:56Z - see #12675	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13337	ron porat	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	18	T	N	143.17999267 578125	18	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Wrong reference	Change "SU Beamformee" to "SU Beamformer"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:51:22Z) Resolution of CID 12676 is applicable.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:09Z- see #12676	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13338	ron porat	230	2	9.4.2.237.5	148	64	T	N	148.63999938964844	64	9.4.2.237.5		A	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	Previously, variable 'm' was used as max index of RU allocation index 'b' ; where b =[x, ..., m]. Variable 'b' is used to represent RU allocation inde	Change RUm to RUb	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:50:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:12:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13339	ron porat	230	2	27.2.2			T	N			27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	This section now starts with clearly defining whether a PPDU is an inter-BSS frame or an intra-BSS frame or neither. Based on that text, it cannot be	Remove the contradicting sentences.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13340	ron porat	230	2	27.12	309		T	N	309		27.12		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	Clarity of the text needs improvement. 'value' is present in middle column but missing in first and third columns. 'm' is introduced only as NSSnRUm	change all columns as .. RU Allocation index m = (b + DCM) to the ...	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:51:52Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0469r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13342	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 908 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13341	ron porat	230	2	27.12	309		T	N	309		27.12		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	The text on RU allocation index selection when using DCM is unclear. Adding an example will prevent interpretation errors.	Add a note with an example for RU 242 + DCM, where the PPE threshold values for RU size 484 are to be used.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:51:42Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0469r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13342	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13342	ron porat	230	2	27.12	309		T	N	309		27.12		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	The text is not explict which PPE threshold values to use for RU 106 + DCM. There are two interpretations: 1) 0, because RU106 falls outside the RU se	Make it more explicit and clear.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:51:29Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0469r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:09:15Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13343	ron porat	230	2	27.12	309		T	N	309		27.12		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	In case of RU 2x996 + DCM, b+1 refers to non-exisiting entry in the PPE threshold table.	Clarify that for RU 2x996 + DCM the PPE threshold values for RU 2x996 are used.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:51:11Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0469r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13342	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13344	ron porat	230	2	27.12	309		T	N	309		27.12		A	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	typo	Change" greater than equal" to " greater than or equal to"	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:51:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:13:41Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13345	ron porat	230	2	28.1	328	23	T	N	328.23001098 63281	23	28.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	Formulation too broad. In MU or TB PPDU, when some users deploy MCS 10/11, it doesn't mean other users cannot use BCC.	For HE MU PPDU or HE TB PPDU, the text should mention that BCC is not used for the users that are allocated MCS 10/11.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:44:38Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13345 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-17/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:53:23Z - Changed "An RU with HE-MCSs 10 or 11 in an HE MU PPDU or an HE TB PPDU" to "An RU in an HE MU PPDU or an HE TB PPDU usi	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13346	ron porat	230	2	28.1	328	36	T	N	328.35998535 15625	36	28.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	Since a non-AP STA is not required to transmit HE-MU-PPDU (optional), it cannot be required to transmit HE-SIG-B for all STA Likewise, since an AP STA	Move the transmit HE-SIG-B requirement to "AP-STA shall" and "Non-AP-STA may" sections. and Move the receive HE-SIG-B requirement to "non-AP STA shall	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:47:05Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13346 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:57:52Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 910 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13347	ron porat	230	2	28.1	329	63	T	N	329.63000048828125	63	28.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	The text requires the non-AP STA to receive > 4 streams per user in DL-MUMIMO if that STA supports > 4 streams in HE SU PPDU. The maximum number	Change "The maximum number of spatial streams per user .. reception of HE SU PPDU." to a sentence specifying the total number of spatial streams in t	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:49:36Z) Max # of spatial streams per user in DL MU MIMO = MIN(4, max # of spatial streams supported for HE SU PPDU RX).	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:13:54Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13348	ron porat	230	2	28.1	330	36	T	N	330.35998535156250	36	28.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	The text requires the non-AP STA to receive > 4 streams per user in DL-MUMIMO (+OFDMA) if that STA supports > 4 streams in HE SU PPDU. The maxim	Change "The maximum number of spatial streams per user .. reception of HE SU PPDU." to a sentence specifying the total number of spatial streams in t	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:51:19Z) Max # of spatial streams per user in DL MU MIMO (+OFDMA) = MIN(4, max # of spatial streams supported for HE SU P	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:17:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 911 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13349	ron porat	230	2	28.3.5	374		T	N	374		28.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	Duplication over multiple 20MHz is subject to conditions when using preamble puncturing (HE MU PPDU). HE TB PPDU has a separate figure (28-15) for hav	Add a note to fig 28-13 for duplication when preamble puncturing in HE MU PPDU or add separate fig for HE MU PPDU with preamble puncturing..	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:15:00Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0024r1 under all headings that include CID 13349. Revisted with m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:00:08Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13350	ron porat	230	2	28.3.5	376	1	T	N	376.010009765625	1	28.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	Mentioning of DCM tone mapper, but not shown in figure 28-16	Remove remark, or mention that DCM tone mapper is part of the constellation mapper and BCC interleaver.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:15:31Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0024r1 under all headings that include CID 13350.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:06:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13351	ron porat	230	2	28.3.5	376	33	T	N	376.32998657 22656	33	28.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	Mentioning of DCM tone mapper, but not shown in figure 28-17	Remove remark, or mention that DCM tone mapper is part of the constellation mapper and BCC interleaver.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:16:39Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0024r1 under all headings that include CID 13351.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:06:29Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 912 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13352	ron porat	230	2	28.3.5	378	1	T	N	378.01000976 5625	1	28.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	Mentioning of DCM tone mapper, but not shown in figure 28-18	Remove remark, or mention that DCM tone mapper is part of the constellation mapper and LDPC tone mapper.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:17:07Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0024r1 under all headings that include CID 13352.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:07:26Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13353	ron porat	230	2	28.3.5			T	N			28.3.5		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	Missing diagram for 160MHz DL-MUMIMO.	Add diagram for 160MHz DL-MUMIMO	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:14:44Z) Don't need to exaust all scenarios. We have 160MHz already for SU. We have the following text in the segment par	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:54:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 913 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13354	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.4	382	63	T	N	382.63000488 28125	63	28.3.6.4		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Duplication over 'each 20 MHz subchannel of the channel bandwidth" is subject to preamble puncturing (HE MU PPDU) and partial preamble (HE TB PPDU).	Add conditions as mentioned in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:20:50Z) Tgax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13354.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:46:38Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13355	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.5	383	40	T	N	383.39999389 64844	40	28.3.6.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Duplication over 'each 20 MHz subchannel of the channel bandwidth" is subject to preamble puncturing (HE MU PPDU) and partial preamble (HE TB PPDU).	Add conditions as mentioned in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:22:09Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13355.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:46:49Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 914 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13356	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	15	T	N	384.14999938964844	15	28.3.6.6		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Duplication over 'each 20 MHz subchannel of the channel bandwidth" is subject to preamble puncturing (HE MU PPDU) and partial preamble (HE TB PPDU).	Add conditions as mentioned in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:23:40Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13356.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:39:00Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13357	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	58	T	N	384.57998657226656	58	28.3.6.6		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Item for duplication and phase rotation missing	Insert item for duplication and phase rotation.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:24:58Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13357.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:39:54Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13358	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.7	385	24	T	N	385.23999023437500	24	28.3.6.7		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Constellation mapper is referring to 17.3.5.8, but this does not have DCM.	Refer to 28.3.1.9	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:26:02Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13358	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:40:42Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 915 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13359	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.10.1	386	58	T	N	386.57998657 22656	58	28.3.6.10.1		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Segment parser is never used when BCC is used in HE PPDU.	remove segment parser	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:28:32Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13359.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:42:36Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13360	ron porat	230	2	28.3.6.10.1	386	64	T	N	386.64001464 84375	64	28.3.6.10.1		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Segment deparser is never used when BCC is used in HE PPDU.	remove segment deparser	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:29:08Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13360	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:44:23Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13361	ron porat	230	2	28.3.9	396		T	N	396		28.3.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0109r3	516	For each field excluding PE, I think even HE-LTF has A involved which might not directly fit here. May be some clarification will help here	Some clarification if HE-LTF mathematical description fits here would help	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-05 22:47:42Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13361 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:27:39Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 916 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13362	ron porat	230	2	28.3.9	396	1124	T	N	407.23999023 4375	1124	28.3.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0109r3	516	The definition of M_{r,u} is missing and a text to be added referring to Table 28-15	Add text to refer M_{r,u}	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-05 22:48:35Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13362 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:28:07Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13363	ron porat	230	2	28.3.9, 28.3.10.9			T	N			28.3.9, 28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	The max to minimum allowed is 2 but in page 435 if sqrt(2)/0.7 is slightly greater than 2. May be better to define it as [1/sqrt2, sqr(2)]	Change line 49 as "A STA shall support aalpha_r in the range [1/sqrt(2),\sqrt(2)]	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:48:55Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13363 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:54:28Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13364	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	411		T	N	411		28.3.10.7.2		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	Typo: Must be "is set to 1" instead of " set to 0". Both the description suggest B10 to be set to 0.	correct the text	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:59:11Z) Resolved as in the resolution to CID 13771 as in 11-18/0038r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:26:54Z - see #13771	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 917 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13365	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	411		T	N	411		28.3.10.7.2		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	Text "STBC is not applied in MU-MIMO RUs" and "STBC is not applied in RUs that are used for MU-MIMO allocations"	seems redundant, can remove one of the them	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:10:34Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0006r4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:50:09Z - see #11406	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13366	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	416		T	N	416		28.3.10.7.2		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	Better to give reference from the fields in trigger frame for the reserved bit setting	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:03:11Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13366 as suggested here in IEEE 802.11-18/0038r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:30:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13367	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	60	T	N	435.60000061035156	60	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Need consistent indexing here for the definition of beta_r.(r=1 to N_{RU}) is not consitent with usage in other places	The indexing should go from r=0 to N_{RU}-1	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:53:34Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13367 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:52:16Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 918 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13368	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423		T	N	423		28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0324r1	520	The notion of "channel 1 occupies the tones" is misleading as HE-SIG-B does not use the tone map. Similar issue exists for the 160MHz part on the same	28.3.10.8.2-28.3.10.8.3 is worth re-structuring to make it more clear and consistent	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:37:45Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0324-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:42:03Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13369	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423		T	N	423		28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0051r1	463	It seems to say: "is carried as the last User field in the User Specific field of an HE-SIG-B content channel"	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:09:27Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0051-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 919 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13370	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	426	31	T	N	426.30999755859375	31	28.3.10.8.5		J	Yujin Noh	11-18/0324r1	520	In the context of HE-SIG-B, "users" most of the time refer to active users plus "dummy" users, while the HE part of the frame interprets "users" alway	Make it more explicit and clear.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:38:31Z) I don't see any technical reason more clarification is needed because it seems not to give more useful informati	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13371	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	428		T	N	428		28.3.10.8.5		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	To cover certain legal allocation in 80, 160 or 80+80 OFDMA cases when for a particular HE-SIG-B content channel, one 996-tone RU Allocation subfield	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:02:22Z) Editor instruction: same resolution as to CID 13407	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:53:06Z - see #13407	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13372	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.10	450		T	N	450		28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	The row subscript for A^k_HELTF is not general enough to cover HE TB PPDU.	Make it right.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:59:49Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13372 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:17:08Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 920 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13373	ron porat	230	2	28.3.10.10	451		T	N	451		28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Mr,u for HE TB PPDU is passed from AP and it cannot be derived on the STA side as suggested in Table 28-15. It is better to explicitly link it to the	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:00:06Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13373 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:44:38Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13374	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.2	455	1	T	N	455.01000976 5625	1	28.3.11.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	NPAD, Pre-FEC,MAC is 8*(PSDU_LENGTH-APEP_LENGTH)	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:11:03Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13374 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:02:34Z - see #11662	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13375	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.1	456		T	N	456		28.3.11.5.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"define" should be "defined"	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:12:46Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13375 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:01:02Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13376	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.4	459	29	T	N	459.29000854 49219	29	28.3.11.5.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"a_init" should have subscript "init" dropped	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:14:10Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13376 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:23:34Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13377	ron porat	230	2	28.3.12	477		T	N	477		28.3.12		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	"PE" should be cast as subscript	Revise as suggested	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:37:38Z) “TPE” at D2.0 P477L2 is a text auto generated by the Framemaker tool, and will not be part of the published stan	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13378	ron porat	230	2	28.3.13	480	46	T	N	480.45999145 50781	46	28.3.13		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Wrong reference. Eqn 28-55 does not specify Data field in 40MHz non-HT Dup.	Replace reference to equation 28-55 by correct reference.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:18:18Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13378 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:34:46Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13379	ron porat	230	2	28.3.15.2	483	61	T	N	483.60998535 15625	61	28.3.15.2		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0079r2	456	"The number of bits for quantization is set by the beamformer, i.e. HE AP." This line is redundant, because the following line gives more accurate de	suggest to remove this line.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:04:46Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0079r2 under all headings that include CID 13379	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 00:05:50Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13380	ron porat	230	2	28.3.20	507		T	N	507		28.3.20		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	HE_EXT_SU should be HE_ER_SU	Change abbreviation for Extended Range PPDU as indicated in comment.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:17:28Z) HE_EXT_SU is used in format indication.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13381	ron porat	230	2	28.3.21	511		T	N	511		28.3.21		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	28.3.21 HE receive procedure, Figure, 28-59 PHY receive state machine, under "End of Wait". Please fix equation number	Change equation number 28-128 and 28-129 to 28-125 and 28.126	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:19:12Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 13381.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:57:40Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 923 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13382	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	518.14001464 84375		28.4		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Punctured Preamble TX is not a capability	Remove from table.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:47:52Z) Punctured Preamble TX is optional so dot11HEPunctureDPreambleRxImplemented should be listed in PHY MIB attribute	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 18:41:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13383	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	Midamble RX MAX NSTS missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:18:31Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 17:40:26Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13384	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	Doppler needs to be split in RX and TX missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:18:09Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 16:23:41Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 924 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13385	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	SRP missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:16:41Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 16:43:10Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13386	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	HE MU PPDU with 4x HELTF and 0.8 GI missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:16:09Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 16:29:01Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13387	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	HE ER PPDU with 4x HELTF and 0.8 GI missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:15:50Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 16:38:40Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 925 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13388	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	HE ER PPDU with 1x HELTF and 0.8 GI missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:15:25Z) Tgax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 16:38:36Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13389	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	20MHz STA missing	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:10:50Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 17:58:19Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13390	ron porat	230	2	28.4			T	N	515.08001708 98438		28.4		V	Edward Au	11-18/0765r2	593	80MHz STA missing.	Add to table as in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:10:23Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0765r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 17:54:15Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 926 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13391	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.1	455	65	T	N	455.64999938964844	65	28.3.11.5.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Wrong section reference - 21.3.10.5.3 (Binary convolutional coding and puncturing)	21.3.10.5.3 to be replaced by 20.3.11.5	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:12:28Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13391 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:04:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13392	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.4			T	N			28.3.11.5.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Wrong section reference - 19.3.11.7.5 (LDPC PPDU encoding process)	19.3.11.7.5 to be replaced by 20.3.11.6.5	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:08:54Z) 19.3.11.7.5 (LDPC PPDU encoding process) is the correct reference in 11REVmd_D0.4.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13393	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.5	459	60	T	N	459.60000061035156	60	28.3.11.5.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"The AP indicates the common NSYM, pre-FEC padding factor, STBC indication and LDPC Extra Symbol Segment fields in the Trigger frame." AP doesn't indi	Change to: "The AP indicates the common LENGTH, pre-FEC padding factor, PE disambiguity, STBC indication and LDPC Extra Symbol Segment fields in the T	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:14:45Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13393 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:47:01Z - see #12652	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 927 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13394	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.5	459	60	T	N	459.60000061035156	60	28.3.11.5.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	The text says that the AP indicates certain common parameters for the HE TB PPDU, but it does not explicitly mention that the AP is free to select the	insert a note: "Note: The AP may at its own discretion select a NOMINAL_PACKET_PADDING (0, 8, 16), pre-FEC padding factor (1,2,3, 4) and a LDPC extra s	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:14:57Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13394 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:46:47Z - see #12652	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13395	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5.5	459	62	T	N	459.61999511871875	62	28.3.11.5.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Missing description how the non-AP STA transmitting the HE TB PPDU derives T_PE and N_SYM.	Insert: "The STA transmitting an HE TB PPDU computes NSYM and TPE as defined in 28.3.12 Packet Extension".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:15:09Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13395 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:47:13Z - see #12652	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13396	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11			T	N			28.3.11		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Definitions are being used across sections.	Define Ntail = 0 for LDPC and 6 for BCC 28.3.11.1 and move the definition for Nsym,init (ac common definition for both LDPC and BCC) after 28-57 .	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:08:25Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13396 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 22:59:55Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 928 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13397	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.5	455		T	N	455		28.3.11.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Mention here also that RU 26/52/106 dont support 1024 QAM	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:10:23Z) "HE-MCS 10 and 11 (1024-QAM) are applicable only to RU sizes equal to or larger than 242 tones." is mentioned in	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13398	ron porat	230	2	28.3.3.6	367		T	N	367		28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	Same conditions repeated for HE MU and HE TB PPDU separately. Merge for brevity.	e.g., for disallowed RU26 allocations for 20 MHz STAs, change to "26-tone RU 5, 10, 14, 19, 24, 28 and 33 of the lower 80 MHz or upper 80 MHz of an 80	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:55:44Z) - Agree in principal to merge the description and the same practice is exercised for all RU restrictions. TGax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13399	ron porat	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	25	T	N	366.25	25	28.3.3.5		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	Minor typo: "20 MHz In 160 MHz PPDU subfield in the HE PHY Capabilities Information field..." should be "20 MHz In 160/80+80 MHz PPDU subfield in the	Revise as suggested	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:42:07Z) Instruction to Editor: Change “20 MHz In 160 MHz HE PPDU” to “20 MHz In 160/80+80 MHz HE PPDU” at D2.2 P388L17.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:01:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13400	ron porat	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	52	T	N	258.51998901 36719	52	27.5.5.2		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0695r4	624	HE STA reinitialize OBO counter only after successful 'random access' HE TB PPDU transmission, not on every HE TB PPDU transmission, according to the	Change to: "After each successful HE TB PPDU transmission in a random access RU,"	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:21:55Z) Modifications in doc 11-18-0360r2 solves this comment. Changes are already incorporated in D2.3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:34:47Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 930 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13401	ron porat	230	2	9.4.2.237.5	149	10	T	N	149.10000610351562	10	9.4.2.237.5		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0469r1	515	Packet extension should be enabled for RU<242 in order to harmonize the design with RU>=242 and limit power consumption	change in the column 'RU allocation size' of table 9-262ad the number 242 to 'less than or equal to 242'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:50:44Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0469r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13342	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13402	ron porat	230	2	28.3.7	388	64	T	N	388.64001464 84375	64	28.3.7		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0359r2	522	1024QAM should be supported for RU less than 242 in order to maximize OFDMA Tput	delete lines 64 and 65.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:42:44Z) Editor: delete lines 10,11 in page 409 of D2.2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13403	ron porat	230	2	28.3.11.9	462	39	T	N	462.39001464 84375	39	28.3.11.9		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0409r1	524	1024QAM should be supported for RU less than 242 in order to maximize OFDMA Tput	delete "for RUs equal to or larger than 242 subcarriers"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:58:11Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13403 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0409r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:20:12Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 931 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13404	ron porat	230	2	28.5	523	45	T	N	523.45001220 70312	45	28.5		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0359r2	522	1024QAM should be supported for RU less than 242 in order to maximize OFDMA Tput	delete "HE-MCS 10 and 11 (1024-QAM) and add 1024QAM to all the relevant tables in this section are applicable only to RU sizes equal to or larger than	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:43:26Z) Editor: Please make the changes shown in document 11-18-0359r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13405	ron porat	230	2	28.3.16	484	44	T	N	484.44000244 140625	44	28.3.16		V	Yongho Seok		614	HE-STF duration is 8uS and some clarification is needed	1. change diagram based on passed motion for document 17/985r4 2. add at the end of line 21 ' and with changes limited to the HE-LTF field only'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:28:37Z) - This comment is for for 28.3.17 (HE TB NDP feedback PPDU). But, in the commnet, the error about the HE-STF d	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-31	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 932 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13406	ron porat	230	2	28.3.18.4.3	492	37	T	N	492.36999511 71875	37	28.3.18.4.3		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	the note for 1024QAM at the bottom of table 28-45 is not clear	add to the NOTE after the words '1024 QAM' : " either, relative constellation error shall be equal to or less than -35 dB when amplitude drift compens	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:37:38Z) Please refer to resolution of CID 13406 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0159r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:51:06Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13407	Rui Cao	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	424	4	T	Y	424.04000854 49219	4	28.3.10.8.3		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	When RU=996 is allocated, the setting of the RU Allocation Bits is not clearly defined. The totally number of users in one 996RU will be split in two	Propose to add the following to the paragraph, "If RU equals 996, the first 8 RU Allocation bits will use entry 11010yyy as in Table 28-24 with yyy in	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:59:08Z) Editor instruction: please make changes shown in document 11-18-0118r6 under comment 13407	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:44:10Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 933 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13408	Sameer Vermani	230	2	28.3.5	376	33	T	Y	376.32998657 22656	33	28.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0024r1	451	The term "DCM tone mapper" is not defined. Moreover, no reference to "DCM" is shown in any of the figures/diagrams but that term repeatedly appears i	Make diagram and text consistent. Define DCM tone-mapper if needed	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:16:07Z) Resolved as in resolution to CID 13350~13352	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 23:08:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13409	Sameer Vermani	230	2	9.3.1.20	85	4	T	Y	85.040000915 52734	4	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	What is the value of Nc when feedback type is CQI	Needs to be specified	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:41:58Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 13409.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 934 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13410	Sameer Vermani	230	2	9.4.2.237	143	6	T	Y	143.05999755859375	6	9.4.2.237		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0380r1	555	This field is applicable to SU Beamformer. Hence the "Reserved if the SU Beamformee field is 0" is incorrect	Replace with "Reserved if the SU Beamformer field is 0"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:15:36Z) Already addressed in another document. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0404r1 under all headings t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 21:08:50Z - see #12675	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13411	Sameer Vermani	230	2	9.4.2.237	143	13	T	Y	143.13000488281250	13	9.4.2.237		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0380r1	555	This field is applicable to SU Beamformer. Hence the "Reserved if the SU Beamformee field is 0" is incorrect	Replace with "Reserved if the SU Beamformer field is 0"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:16:24Z) Already addressed in another document. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0404r1 under all headings t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 21:09:06Z - see #12676	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 935 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13412	Sameer Vermani	230	2	27.5.6	261	5	T	Y	261.04 998779 296875	5	27.5.6		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	"If a STA does not satisfy all of the above conditions, it is not required to respond to the NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame." seems to indicat	Change to "If a STA does not satisfy all of the above conditions, it shall not respond to the NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:18:07Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13413	Sameer Vermani	230	2	28.3.15.1	483	14	T	Y	483.14 001464 84375	14	28.3.15.1		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0079r2	456	K_r is not clearly defined	Might want to add the description of K_r after it, i.e. it is set of the subcarriers in RU r	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:04:29Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0079r2 under all headings that include CID 13413	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 00:11:38Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13414	Sameer Vermani	230	2	28.3.15.3	484	22	T	Y	484.22 000122 07031	22	28.3.15.3		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0079r2	456	We have "The CQI-only feedback CQIs,r,u" but meaning of subscript u is undefined.	Define u	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:05:00Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0079r2 under all headings that include CID 13414	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 00:11:08Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 936 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13415	Shimi Shilo	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	34	T	Y	97.33999633789062	34	9.3.1.23.8		J	Laurent Cariou		657	NDP feedback currently doesn't provide an opportunity for non-associated STAs to request a probe response, which means a large amount of probe reques	Add 1 bit from 'reserved' for 'Request for Probe Response'. Change Eq. 9-ax1 to N_STA=18*2^BW*(Multiplexing_Flag)-2^BW*'Request_for_Probe_Response'	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13416	Shimi Shilo	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	34	T	Y	97.33999633789062	34	9.3.1.23.8		J	Laurent Cariou		657	Currently, STAs who wake-up from doze-mode and intend to receive data from the AP will contend via CSMA/CA and then transmit PS-Poll. This means an in	Add 'Feedback Type' value of 1 for 'PS-Poll Request'. Also add respective Information Element to Beacon Frame to trigger transmission of NDP Feedback	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 937 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13417	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	27.6.1	263	16	T	Y	263.16000036621094	16	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-17/1826r0	448	Section 27.6.1 states that "The HE compressed beamforming feedback is an HE Compressed Beamforming Report field for SU-type feedback, the concatenatio	Correct the text in 27.6.1 to be consistent with 9.4.1.64.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 00:43:24Z) TGax Editor to make the changes shown in IEEE 802.11-17/1826r0 under all headings that include CID 12774.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13418	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	19	T	Y	108.19000024140625	19	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	Definition of "Sounding Dialog Token Number" in Table 9-76a is wrong	Change to "The sounding dialog token from the NDP Announcement frame soliciting feedback"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13419	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	24	T	Y	108.23999786376953	24	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	It is stated that "Channel Width" should be reserved for a frame not carrying the compressed beamforming report. This would include CQI-only feedback.	Clarify	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13420	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	27.9.2.3	295	20	T	Y	295.20001220703125	20	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Figure 27-10, SR S2 detects all inter-BSS packets and resumes its AIFS/BO processing once it has established that SR can be applied. However, in th	Clarify	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:11:46Z) add some text to clarify that S2 does not receive OBSS PPDU from D1' and therefore continues decrementing backoff.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13421	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.2.2	336	8	T	Y	336.07998657 22656	8	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	"0 indicates that a signal extension might be present depending on other TXVECTOR parameters."	Specify which other parameters	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:23:18Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:57:58Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13422	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.2.2	336	26	T	Y	336.26000976 5625	26	28.2.2		A	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	"indicates that an extra OFDM symbol for LDPC is present."	Change "OFDM symbol" to "OFDM Symbol segment" (line 26 and 28)	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:23:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:00:00Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 939 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13423	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.2.2	342	40	T	Y	342.39999938964844	40	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	"or that the channel is with high Doppler". This is not an actionable criterion. Replace with something more generic such as "that preamble is recomme	See comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:28:13Z) Reason: the current spec text follows HE-SIG-A's corresponding explanation.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:02:44Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13424	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.2.2	342	17	T	N	342.17001342 77344	17	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Notation (B1 - B6) can be confusing.	Replace with B1 ... B6	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:26:19Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:02:28Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 940 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13425	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.2.2	342	40	T	Y	342.39999938964844	40	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	The naming "Doppler" bit should be changed to "Midamble". The exact meaning of this bit was not clear in D1.0, but now it corresponds to a specifc fea	Change "Doppler" to "Midamble"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:27:48Z) Reason: Change to name “Midamble” will cause more confusing. The group prefer to keep current naming before a be	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:02:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13426	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.2.2	346	53	T	N	346.52999877792969	53	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Improve English "is spatially mapped not the same way as"	E.g. "uses a spatial mapping that is different from"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:30:00Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:04:08Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 941 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13427	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.2	356	23	T	Y	356.23001098 63281	23	28.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r1	464	The organization of the section looks wrong: - section 28.3.2 (MU transmission) only has one subsection (28.3.2.1 Introduction). - section 28.3.3 (OFD	Reorganize as described	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:15:34Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text changes in 11-18/0057r1 under CID 13427, 13433, 13441.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:25:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13428	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.2	364	55	T	Y	364.54998779 296875	55	28.3.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0934r1	596	"at least N x 4 x 26 subcarriers (contiguous or non-contiguous) shall be occupied". While this is correct, the subcarriers should still consist of ent	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:53:27Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13428, 13952 and 14159 in 11-18/0934r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 19:56:19Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 942 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13429	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.3	364	65	T	Y	364.64999938964844	65	28.3.3.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r0	460	"The null subcarriers are located near the DC or edge tones to protect those tones near the DC or edge tones from the interference of a neighboring RU	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:16:59Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text changes in 11-18/0057r0 under CID 13429.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:36:22Z - with some rewording	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13430	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.2	364	30	T	N	364.29998779296875	30	28.3.3.2		A	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r0	460	"A 2x996-tone RU consists of two 996-tone ..". It looks like this should be a separate paragraph at the same level as the paragraphs starting at line	Strat new paragraph at "A 2x996-ton RU ..."	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:16:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:30:24Z - Did a strat	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 943 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13431	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	14	T	N	367.14001464 84375	14	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	Add reference to Table 28-7 for the numbering of the RUs	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:56:05Z) - Agree in principal to add the reference for clarification. However, Table 28-7 is applied only for 40MHz HEP	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 22:45:23Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13432	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9	368	5	T	N	368.04998779 296875	5	28.3.3.9		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	Change "The AP uses the HE MU PPDU for DL MU transmission." to "The AP uses the HE MU PPDU format for DL MU transmission."	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:43:22Z) While the comment is appropriate, the corresponding sentence has been removed in D2.2 per CIDs 13427, 13433, 1344	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:03:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 944 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13433	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9	368	7	T	Y	368.07000732421875	7	28.3.3.9		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r1	464	Why is DL MU-MIMO a subsection of "OFDMA and SU allocation"?	Reorganize section	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:17:31Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text changes in 11-18/0057r1 under CID 13427, 13433, 13441	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:26:33Z - see #13427	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13434	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.2	368	29	T	Y	368.29000854 49219	29	28.3.3.9.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	"An HE STA shall support reception of DL MU-MIMO transmissions on full bandwidth with the total number of space-time streams (across NUM_USERS) less t	Rewrite as e.g. "For transmissions using bandwidth lower than or equal to 80 MHz, an HE STA shall support reception of DL MU-MIMO transmissions on ful	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:35:04Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CIDs 13434 and 14059 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:17:26Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 945 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13435	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	368	46	T	Y	368.45999914550781	46	28.3.3.9.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	"A full bandwidth MU-MIMO transmission using the HE MU PPDU format has a value of 1 for the SIGB Compression field in HE-SIG-A". This is not entirely	Change "has a value of 1" to " shall have a value of 1"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:44:37Z) Instruction to Editor: Change “has ” to “shall have ” at D2.2 P386 L32.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:04:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13436	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	5	E	N	369.04998779296875	5	28.3.3.9.3		A			648	Change "If there are more than one User fields" to " If there is more than one User field"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:30:38Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:30:42Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13437	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	6	E	N	369.05999755859375	6	28.3.3.9.3		A			648	Change "the number of allocated spatial streams for each user in the RU are indicated" to "the number of allocated spatial streams for each user in th	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:31:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:31:23Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 946 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13438	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	7	E	N	369.07000732421875	7	28.3.3.9.3		V			648	Change "Note that an RU with RU size" to "Note that for an RU with RU size".	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:33:03Z) - "with RU size greater than or equal to 484 subcarriers" is also cumbersome. Change to "Note that for an RU wi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:35:07Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13439	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	10	E	N	369.10000061035156	10	28.3.3.9.3		A			648	Change "may split" to "may be split"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:35:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:35:54Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13440	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	28	T	N	369.27999877 92969	28	28.3.3.9.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	"measure the channel for the interfering space-time streams". Term "intefering streams" is only used in this paragraph.	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:35:44Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CID 13440 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:17:45Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 947 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13441	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.11	369	46	T	Y	369.45999914550781	46	28.3.3.11		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r1	464	Why is "UL MU-MIMO" a subsection of "OFDMA and SU tone allocation"	reorganize section	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:17:43Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text changes in 11-18/0057r1 under CID 13427, 13433, 13441	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:26:48Z - see #13427	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13442	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.11.2	369	64	T	Y	369.64001464843375	64	28.3.3.11.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	"shall support transmission and reception of an HE TB PPDU". An AP should support reception and non-AP should support transmission. Definitely not all	Clarify the requirement	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:45:45Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13592, 13442, 14061 and 13632 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:05:58Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 948 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13443	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.11.4	370	27	T	Y	370.26998901 36719	27	28.3.3.11.4		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	"A STA that supports UL MU-MIMO transmission on full bandwidth supports a total of up to 8 space-time streams" is not clear. Change to e.g. "A STA tha	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:47:38Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11168, 13594, 13443 and 13595 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:56Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13444	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.3.11.4	370	58	E	N	370.57998657 22656	58	28.3.3.11.4		V			648	Change "the STA shall not transmit in the following HE TB PPDU" to "the STA shall not transmit in the subsequent HE TB PPDU"	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:38:18Z) - It is the HE TB PPDU that the STA would be transmitting. Change to "then the STA shall not transmit an HE TB	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:39:02Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13445	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.4	372	43	T	Y	372.42999267578125	43	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	pre-HE preamble is not defined.	Define	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:56:43Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13445) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:57:32Z - see 11423	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13446	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.4	372	20	E	N	372.20001220703125	20	28.3.4		A			648	Should Pre in Pre-HE be capitalized?	use pre-HE instead	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:41:37Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:41:41Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13447	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	5	T	N	384.04998779296875	5	28.3.6.6		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Change "convolution encoder" to "convolutional encoder"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:23:25Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13447.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:38:37Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13448	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.6.6	384	46	T	N	384.45999145 50781	46	28.3.6.6		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Change "convolution encoder" to "convolutional encoder"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:24:43Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13448.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:39:28Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13449	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.6.7	385	17	T	N	385.17001342 77344	17	28.3.6.7		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	"Obtain for the HE-SIG-B field values from the TXVECTOR". Delete "for" or clarify sentence.	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:25:34Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13449	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:40:17Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13450	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.6.7	385	20	T	N	385.20001220 703125	20	28.3.6.7		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	Change "convolution encoder" to "convolutional encoder"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:25:48Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0025r1 under all headings that include CID 13450	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:40:23Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 951 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13451	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.6.10.1	386	38	T	Y	386.38000048828125	38	28.3.6.10.1		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0025r1	459	add a note at the start of this section that BCC is only used for 20 MHz. This will make some of the text below clearer.	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:27:39Z) Resolved as in the resolution to CID 13359, 13360	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:42:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13452	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.7	388	64	T	Y	388.64001464843375	64	28.3.7		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0359r2	522	Change "HE-MCSs with indices 10 and 11 (1024-QAM) are optionally applied to the Data field of an HE PPDU with RUs equal to or larger than 242-tone." t	See comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:42:57Z) We propose to include support of 1024QAM for small RU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:44:25Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13453	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.8	389	42	T	N	389.42001342773440	42	28.3.8		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0109r1	465	pre-HE preamble is not defined.	Define	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:22:24Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13453 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0109r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 21:56:35Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13454	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.9	394	37	E	N	394.36999511718750	37	28.3.9		A			648	Delete "and"		ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:55:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:55:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 952 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13455	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.5	403	22	T	N	403.22000012207031	22	28.3.10.5		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"the time domain waveform of the L-SIG field". Add "on chain i_TX and segment i_Seg"	See also line 10, page 404	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:24:31Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13455 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:48:20Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13456	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	40	T	N	404.39999389964844	40	28.3.10.6		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	"the time domain waveform of the RL-SIG field". Add "on chain i_TX and segment i_Seg"	See also line 53	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:28:31Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13456 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 17:49:24Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13457	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	408	25	T	Y	408.25	25	28.3.10.7.2		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	"Doppler" field should be renamed to "Midamble".	See comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:57:24Z) Midamble is a procedure adopted in 11ax D2.0 to address the situations where wireless medium experiences Doppler	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 953 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13458	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	408	34	T	Y	408.33999633 78906	34	28.3.10.7.2		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0937r0	590	"Channel Doppler is high" is not a meaningful criterion. Replace with more generic "Midamble is recommended in the reverse direction"	See comment or provide objective criterion to establish "high Doppler"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:45:44Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13458 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0937r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:22:01Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13459	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	410	44	T	Y	410.44000244 140625	44	28.3.10.7.2		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0937r0	590	"Channel Doppler is high" is not a meaningful criterion. Replace with more generic "Midamble is recommended in the reverse direction"	See comment or provide objective criterion to establish "high Doppler"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:46:15Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13459 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0937r0.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:22:38Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13460	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	413	10	T	Y	413.10000610 35156	10	28.3.10.7.2		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	"Spatial Reuse field applies to the first 20 MHz subband.". Clarify " first"	See comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:57:20Z) Exact description exists below the table	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:37:14Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13461	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	413	15	T	Y	413.14999389 64844	15	28.3.10.7.2		J	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	"Spatial Reuse field applies to the first 40 MHz subband.". Clarify " first"	See comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:57:33Z) Exact description below the table	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:37:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 954 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13462	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	417	6	T	Y	417.05999755859375	6	28.3.10.7.2		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	"the encoding for the Spatial Reuse 1, Spatial Reuse 2, Spatial Reuse 3 and Spatial Reuse 4 subfields for an HE SU PPDU, HE ER SU PPDU, and HE MU PPDU	Correct	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:57:51Z) Editor please revise as proposed as resolution to CID 13462 as in 11-18/0118r6	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:40:19Z - see #13601	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13463	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	418	10	T	N	418.10000610 35156	10	28.3.10.7.4		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0937r0	590	The term symbol is not correct here ("HE-SIG-A symbols shall be BCC encoded ..."), since symbol is later used to represent the final 52 output symbols	Replace "symbols" with "parts"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:48:11Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13463 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0937r0.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:22:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 955 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13464	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.1	421	40	T	N	421.39999938964844	40	28.3.10.8.1		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	"look up the corresponding resources in the data portion of the frame." to "STAs to look up the corresponding resources that are used in the data port	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:08:31Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:30:19Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13465	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	9	T	N	423.08999633789 06	9	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0051r1	463	Change "betwen" to " in the range of"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:09:46Z) Tgax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0051-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13466	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	25	T	Y	423.25	25	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0051r1	463	Sentence "The same value for the bit signaling presence of the center 26-tone RU is carried in both HE-SIG-B content channels." is absolutely not clea	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:10:04Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0051-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13467	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	29	E	N	423.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.3		V			648	Change "theThe" to "the"	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:16:43Z) - Fixed with resolutions to other comments. No further change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:17:00Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13468	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	29	T	Y	423.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.3		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	Unclear sentence: "... is carried as the last User field in the The User Specific field of an HE-SIG-B content channel consists of one or more HE-SIG-B	Correct	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:34:50Z) Refer to resolution for CID 14077 in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0051r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 957 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13469	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	59	T	Y	423.58999633 78906	59	28.3.10.8.3		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	Convoluted and unclear sentence: "HE-SIG-B content channel 1 and HE-SIG-B content channel 2 carries RU allocation signaling at 242-tone RU granularity	Clarify sentence.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:35:06Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13469) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0352r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:39:56Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13470	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	424	64	T	N	424.64001464 84375	64	28.3.10.8.4		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	Change "added" to "appended"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:11:52Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:51:08Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13471	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	425	29	T	Y	425.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	What is meant by "the sample on the k-th data subcarrier"	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:43:15Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13471 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:16:31Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 958 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13472	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	425	30	T	N	425.29998779296875	30	28.3.10.8.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Add "for transmit chain i_TX and segment i_seg"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:44:27Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13472 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:16:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13473	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	425	30	E	N	425.29998779296875	30	28.3.10.8.4		V			648	Change "the HE-SIG-B" to "HE-SIG-B"	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:40:22Z) - Changed to "the HE-SIG-B field" with resolution to other comments. No change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:40:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13474	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	427	4	T	N	427.04000854492 19	4	28.3.10.8.5		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	Should "indexes" be "indicates"?	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:36:35Z) Instruction to Editor: Please change “indexes” to “indicates”.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13475	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	429	31	E	N	429.30999755859375	31	28.3.10.8.5		A			648	Start new line before "Signaling"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:43:17Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:43:21Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13476	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	430	11	E	N	430.10 998535 15625	11	28.3.10.8.6		A			648	Change "enables STAs to decode its data" to "enables STAs to decode their data"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:44:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:44:26Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13477	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	430	16	E	N	430.16 000366 21094	16	28.3.10.8.6		A			648	Change "an arrangement of 106-tone RU" to "an arrangement of one 106-tone RU"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:45:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:45:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13478	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	431	21	T	N	431.20 999145 50781	21	28.3.10.8.6		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	Use consistent wording. Currently it says "Set to 1 to indicate" (line 21), "Set to 0 indicates" (line 24).	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:37:15Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13478) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0352r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13479	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.9	433	62	T	N	433.61 999511 71875	62	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Add reference to Table 28-12 when using "T_HE-STF-NT"	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:45:45Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13479 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:18:11Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 960 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13480	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.9	434	7	T	Y	434.07000732421875	7	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Unclear sentence: "...at tone indices which are null but shall have the HE-STF coefficients after mapping M sequences to each 20 MHz subchannel.."	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:46:07Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13480 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:21:02Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13481	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	49	T	Y	435.48999023 4375	49	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Note that the power "boost" of alpha_r is still normalized by beta_r. As such, is it correct to state that alpha_r is the value of the power boost? Do	Clarify	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:48:24Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13481 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:23:56Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13482	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.10	436	46	E	N	436.45999145 50781	46	28.3.10.10		A			648	Replace " in the following text" with " below"	see comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:55:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:56:01Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 961 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13483	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.10	436	58	E	N	436.57998657 22656	58	28.3.10.10		V			648	Delete "separately"	see comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:01:10Z) Clarify by changing the sentence to read "In an HE MU PPDU with more than one RU and in an HE TB PPDU, NHE-LTF	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:02:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13484	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.10.10	437	1	T	N	437.01000976 5625	1	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Lines 1-5 are a deplication of lines 24-28	Remove one of the instances	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:57:50Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13484 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:48:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13485	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.1	452	46	T	Y	452.45999145 50781	46	28.3.11.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"the Data field shall consist of the SERVICE field, the PSDU, the pre-FEC PHY padding bits, the tail bits, the post-FEC padding bits and the packet ex	Correct. See also line 49	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:09:31Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13485 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 22:45:06Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 962 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13486	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.2	453	45	E	N	453.45001220703125	45	28.3.11.2		A			648	Add space between "m_STBC" and "is"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:10:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:10:57Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13487	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.5.4	459	7	T	Y	459.07000732421875	7	28.3.11.5.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	"meets the above mentioned condition". Be more specific. Add reference to "condition".	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:13:52Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13487 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:31:21Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13488	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.6	460	37	T	N	460.36999511171875	37	28.3.11.6		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Change "After coding, scrambling, puncturing" to "After scrambling, coding, puncturing" to respect the order of operations.	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:15:25Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13488 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 17:23:52Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13489	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.9	462	39	T	Y	462.39001464843375	39	28.3.11.9		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0359r2	522	Change "1024-QAM is optional for SU and MU for RUs equal to or larger than 242 subcarriers." to "1024-QAM is optional for SU and MU and, when supporte	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:43:10Z) Editor delete the sentence in 486.52 in D2.2: “1024-QAM is optional for SU and MU for RUs equal to or larger than	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 963 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13490	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.9	465	16	T	Y	465.16000036621094	16	28.3.11.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	q(k) = k + N_SD. This doesn't look correct for 160 MHz based on the ranges given above.	Correct is needed	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:15:53Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13490 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 17:30:40Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13491	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.13	471	54	T	Y	471.54000854 49219	54	28.3.11.13		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	How can mapping for 996-tone RU be the same as that for 484-tone RU? Delete " For a 996-tone RU transmission, the pilot mapping for its 16 pilots is th	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:16:19Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13491 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 20:32:19Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13492	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.14	473	12	E	N	473.11999511 71875	12	28.3.11.14		A			648	Change "from" to "for"	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:15:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:15:57Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 964 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13493	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.14	473	30	T	Y	473.29998779296875	30	28.3.11.14		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	Define alpha_r used in (28-105)	See comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:16:43Z) It is already defined in previous subclause. Doc IEEE802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13494	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	38	T	Y	474.38000488 28125	38	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	"Midamble is applied for HE PPDU transmissions in channels with high Doppler, ". This sounds like a statement of fact. Implementers are free to use mid	Remove sentence	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:27:14Z) Editor instruction: change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:31:26Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 965 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13495	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	45	E	N	474.45001220703125	45	28.3.11.16		V			648	Change "midambles are inserted to the HE Data field" to "midambles are inserted into the HE Data field"	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:50:00Z) - They are not inserted, they are present. For clarity, change the sentence to read "If the Doppler field of th	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:51:08Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13496	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	47	E	N	474.47000122 07031	47	28.3.11.16		V			648	Change "midamble periodicity in number of OFDM symbols" to "midamble periodicity expressed in number of OFDM symbols"	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:51:32Z) - "midamble preiodicity" is redundant since periodicity is implied by "every M_MA OFDM symbols. See #13495	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:52:22Z - see #13495	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 966 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13497	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	58	E	Y	474.57998657 22656	58	28.3.11.16		V			648	Change "with the Doppler subfield of the HE-SIG-A field is set to 1" to " with the Doppler subfield of the HE-SIG-A field set to 1"	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:53:27Z) - Use normative verbs instead of "allowed". Change the sentence to read: "An HESTA shall not transmit an HE MU	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:04:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13498	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	42	T	Y	476.42001342 77344	42	28.3.11.16		J	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Delete " indicates that the current channel between the transmitter and the recipient is with high channel Doppler, and". This is a meaningless and non	Delete " indicates that the current channel between the transmitter and the recipient is with high channel Doppler, and"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:32:42Z) Reason for Rejection: the benefits of high Doppler indication in this case was well discussed in Doc 17-1376r0,	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:30:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13499	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.18.4.3	492	35	E	N	492.35000610 35156	35	28.3.18.4.3		V			648	Change "data-carrying subcarriers which EVM test is conducted." to " data-carrying subcarriers for which EVM test is conducted."	See comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:19:46Z) - "for which the EVM test is conducted"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:20:05Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 967 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13500	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	494	22	T	Y	494.22000122 07031	22	28.3.18.4.4		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	"shall meet the relative constellation error staircase mask ". Provide reference.	See comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:36:01Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 13500 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0475r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:00:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13501	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	28.3.21	514	12	T	Y	514.11999511 71875	12	28.3.21		J	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	Two definitions of RXTIME are given in 28.3.21 (equations (28-125) and (28-126)). Probably (28-125) should be removed. (28-125) is TXTIME and uses var	Delete lines 12-24	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:20:48Z) Equation 28-126 is for HE TB PPDU to derive the Tx time and 28-125 is for other HE PPDU type	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:09:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13502	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	B.4.27.1	562	57	T	Y	562.57000732 42188	57	B.4.27.1		A	Edward Au	17/1775r0	445	HEM7.3 shows dependency on HEM6.4. This should be HEM6.3 instead.	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:06:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:01:44Z	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13503	Sigurd Schelstraete	230	2	B.4.27.1	562	60	T	Y	562.59997558 59375	60	B.4.27.1		A	Edward Au	17/1775r0	445	HEM7.3 shows dependency on HEM6.5. This should be HEM6.4 instead.	See comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:06:18Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:02:13Z	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 968 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13504	Simone Merlin	230	2	9.6.30	167	53	E	Y	167.52 999877 929688	53	9.6.30		A			648	Missing section reference	Provide section reference for Quiet Time Period element (9.4.2.242)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:16:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:16:55Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13505	Simone Merlin	230	2	10.43.1	209	1	E	Y	209.00 999450 683594	1	10.43.1		A			447	Incorrect section references	Fix the section reference for Explicit TWT operation and Implicit TWT operation	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:46:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 17:46:12Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13506	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	3	E	Y	227.02 999877 929688	3	27.2.5.3		A			447	Lower case 't' for transmitted BSSID	Change Transmitted BSSID to transmitted BSSID	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:49:17Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:49:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13507	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.1	236	1	E	Y	236.00 999450 683594	1	27.4.1		A			447	Lower case 't' for transmitted BSSID	Change Transmitted BSSID to transmitted BSSID	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:02:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:02:37Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13508	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	12	E	Y	259.11 999511 71875	12	27.5.5.2		J			657	Paragraph 7 & 10 describe Figure 27-5 which provides an example of UORA operation. Consolidate the two paragraph. The content before paragraph 10	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 969 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13509	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	34	E	Y	275.33999633 78906	34	27.7.3.1		A			447	Missing period	Add a period after Trigger frame	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:58:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:58:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13510	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.7.4.1	283	63	E	Y	283.63000488 28125	63	27.7.4.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	Note font size and indentation needs to be fixed	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		The note needs to be written so that it can be placed after the paragraph. At present, the "in such case" prevents this.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13511	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.8.1	286	60	E	Y	286.60000610 35156	60	27.8.1		A			447	Typo - incorrect spelling	Fix spelling 'operating'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:24:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:24:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13512	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.9.3.4	298	31	E	Y	298.30999755 859375	31	27.9.3.4		A			648	Incorrect field name - SR_PPDU Indication	Remove the underscore (_) from the field name. Same correction applies to the variable reference in the next section (P298L36).	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:05:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:05:12Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13513	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.14.3	314	18	E	Y	314.17999267 578125	18	27.14.3		A			447	BC TWT is broadcast TWT	replace BC with broadcast	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:15:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:16:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13514	Simone Merlin	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	21	E	Y	502.20999145 50781	21	28.3.19.6.5		A			648	Incorrect section reference	Change reference to 28.4.4.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:21:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 15:21:24Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13515	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	6	T	Y	240.05999755859375	6	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Incomplete sentence. Fix it. "immediate response (see 10.3.2.10.2 (Acknowledgement procedure for DL MU PPDU in MU format) for an example of this sequ	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:14:59Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13516	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	8	T	Y	240.08000018310547	8	27.4.4.4		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	In the following sentence make it more clear that the responder treats the ack policy as HTP-Ack: "If an Action frame or an MMPDU that solicits an im	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:15:42Z) Rejected - The rule for responding to a management frame is specified in section 27.4.4.4. No further change ne	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 971 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13517	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	16	T	Y	240.16 000366 210938	16	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "A non-AP STA that receives an HE	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:58:09Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13518	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	21	T	Y	240.21 000671 38672	21	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDUc	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:58:49Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 972 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13519	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	26	T	Y	240.25999450683594	26	27.4.4.4		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HEMU PPDU or HE SU PPDUc	As in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 18:59:36Z) Rejected - S-MPDU allows QoS Null with Ack required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13520	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	33	T	Y	240.33000183 10547	33	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Remove QoS Null from the following sentence, since this statement is inconsistent with other sections of the spec: "If the HEMU PPDU or HE SU PPDUc	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:00:16Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 973 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13521	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.5	241	1	T	Y	241.00999450683594	1	27.4.4.5		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	Give more clear references than to say "appropriate settings"..."in previous subclauses": "in a DL SU PPDU format that contains the appropriate setti	As in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:16:32Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13522	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	14	E	Y	241.13999938964844	14	27.4.4.6		A			447	Remove 'a)', since there is only one case covered	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:58:06Z) - Remove as in convert to an unlettered paragraph.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:58:16Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13523	Simone Merlin	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	32	E	Y	241.32000732421875	32	27.4.4.6		A			447	Remove repeated 'DLMU Support' in the sentence: "...the reception of MU Multi-STA BlockAck frame by Group Addressed Multi-STA BlockAck In DLMU Supp	As in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 23:22:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 23:22:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13524	stephane baron	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	32	T	Y	92.31999969482422	32	9.3.1.23		V	Jeongki Kim	11-18/0063r1	490	"The No Further RA RU subfield is set to 1 to indicate that random access RUs are not allocated in subsequent Trigger frames that are sent before eith	Add a recommendation in the standard : "A trigger frame sent in a TWT cascading sequence should schedule in priority RUs intended to stations with the	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:50:11Z) TGax editor: No further changes are required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:05:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13525	Stephen McCann	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	43	T	Y	79.43000030517578	43	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	In the cited sentence "AID11" is not defined.	Either define "AID11" in the definitions clause or insert a forward reference to Figure 9-38d where it is defined.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:11:26Z) Rejected. It is said in the cited sentence that the AID11 subfield is in the Per AID TID Info subfield and it i	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 975 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13526	Stephen McCann	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	19	T	Y	80.190002441 40625	19	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	The title of Figure 9-38b refers to "when the AID11 subfield is not 2045". It's not clear where the AID 11 subfield is.	Either define "AID11" in the definitions clause or re-arrange clause 9.3.1.9.7, so that the definition of AID11 appears in the clause before Figure 9-	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:46:51Z) Rejected. It is clear from the sentence where it refers Figure 9-38b that the AID11 subfield is in the AID TID	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR
13527	Stephen McCann	230	2	9.4.2.242.3	155	37	E	N	155.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.242.3		A			648	The text "The Service Specific Identifier ID field" at the start of the last sentence in the paragraph is duplicating the use of identifier.	Change "The Service Specific Identifier ID field" to "The Service Specific Identifier field"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:11:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:11:51Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13528	Stephen McCann	230	2	27.16.4.2	324	10	T	Y	324.10000610 35156	10	27.16.4.2		A	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	There is no "vendor specific service identifier" in the Quiet Time Period Response, as shown in Figure 9-589db.	Change "vendor specific service identifier" to "Service Specific Identifier field"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 00:03:42Z) Accepted: TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/444r2 under CID 13528	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 19:43:38Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 976 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13529	Stephen McCann	230	2	27.16.4.2	324	38	T	Y	324.38000048828125	38	27.16.4.2		A	ChaoChun Wang	444r2	539	There is no "vendor specific service identifier" in the Quiet Time Period Setup, as shown in Figure 9-589cz.	Change "vendor specific service identifier" to "Service Specific Identifier field"	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 00:04:32Z) Accepted: TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/444r2 under CID 13529	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 20:05:12Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13530	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	3.2	33	60	T	Y	33.599998474121094	60	3.2		V			619	HE single stream pilot mode is used for all HE PPDU types, and special classificaiton is required only for UL MU-MIMO related operation. Therefore, it	Remove 'UL MU-MIMO' from the description text so that HE single stream pilot HE LTF mode description is applicable for other HE PPDU formats.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:32:52Z) - In TGax draft, the HE single stream pilot HE LTF mode definition is used only for indicating the LTF type use	EDITOR	Approved No Change			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:50:23Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 977 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13531	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	Y	34.569999694 82422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Definition is dead-end. There is no description what DSRP_PPDU is for SRP PPDU definition. In addition, underscore should be used on the definition fo	change to 'SRP_PPDU' with underscore and provide the clear description and definition what SRP_PPDU is	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:57:32Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13531. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13532	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	3.2	34	58	T	Y	34.580001831 05469	58	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Introduce the definition of DSRP_PPDU	Introduce the definition of 'DSRP_PPDU' and describe what D represents, i.e., Delayed	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:59:16Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13532. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13533	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.8	70	22	E	Y	70.220001220 70312	22	9.2.4.6.4.8		J	Matt Fischer		657	For consistency with the definition of SR_PPDU, it would have underscore in the field name of B2, i.e., SR_PPDU Indication	Change the field name to 'SR_PPDU Indicaiton' with underscore and change referred text with this subfields over the specification	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 978 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13534	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.8	70	39	T	Y	70.389999389 64844	39	9.2.4.6.4.8		A	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	By definition in Clause 3, SR_PPDU with underscore is the correct description	Change SR PPDU to SR_PPDU, i.e., change to 'Control subfield is an SR_PPDU' and 'when the PPDU is and SR_PPDU'	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:15:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	Inconsistency between SR PPDU and SR_PPDU resolved in favor of former	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13535	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	7	T	Y	84.069999694 82422	7	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	RU1 is not the accurate description (RU 1 with space), and we have different sizes of RUs while baseline is 26-tone. The accurate RU naming is '26-ton	Change RU1 to '26-tone RU 1' and RU9 to '26-tone RU 9'	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:42:36Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 13535.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13536	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	12	T	Y	84.120002746 58203	12	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	RU1 is not the accurate description (RU 1 with space), and we have different sizes of RUs while baseline is 26-tone. The accurate RU naming is '26-ton	Change RU1 to '26-tone RU 1' and RU18 to '26-tone RU 18'	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:43:12Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 13536.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 979 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13537	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	17	T	Y	84.16999816894531	17	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	RU1 is not the accurate description (RU 1 with space), and we have different sizes of RUs while baseline is 26-tone. The accurate RU naming is '26-ton	Change RU1 to '26-tone RU 1' and RU37 to '26-tone RU 37'	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:43:49Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 13537.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13538	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.20	84	22	T	Y	84.22000122070312	22	9.3.1.20		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	RU1 is not the accurate description (RU 1 with space), and we have different sizes of RUs while baseline is 26-tone. The accurate RU naming is '26-ton	Change 'RU1 in the lower' to '26-tone RU 1 in the lower' and 'RU37 in the lower' to '26-tone RU 37 in the lower' and 'RU1 in the upper' to '26-tone	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:44:23Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0008r2 under all headings that include CID 13538.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 980 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13539	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.23	87	46	E	Y	87.459999084 47266	46	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	triggered UL PPDU is not the accurate terminology	Change 'triggered UL PPDU' to 'corresponding HE TB PPDU'	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:13:41Z) Agree with the comment. The incorrect terminology doesn't appear in D2.2 as it was fixed in doc 11-18/0065r2 as a	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:11:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13540	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	17	T	Y	97.169998168 94531	17	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	The number of HE-LTF symbols for NDP Feedback Report is 2, so the indicated value in Common Info field of the Trigger frame should be 1 (minus 1 princ	Change 'is set to 2 for 2 HE-LTF symbols' to ' is set to 1 for two 4x HE-LTF symbols'	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:12:13Z) make the change as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:05:08Z - It is SET to the number of sumbols present minus one but it INDICATES the number of symbols present.	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 981 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13541	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.3.1.23.6	98	2	T	Y	98.0199966430664	2	9.3.1.23.8		J	Laurent Cariou		657	The intended values of Multiplexing Flag in Eq (9-ax1) is 1 or 2, but actual encoded 'value' is 0 or 1 to INDICATE 1 or 2, respectively. BW part value	Change (Multiplexing Flag) to (MultiplexingFlag+1) in Equation (9-ax1). The same formula in P261L15 should be updated together	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13542	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	55	T	Y	141.55000305 17578	55	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Encoding description would be the form of decimal values not the bit order	Change the Encoding description as 'B0-B1 signals' to 'The values indicates' and bit setting part to 'Set to 0 for no DCM support, Set to 1 for upto B	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:48:59Z) Resolution of CID 12617 is applicable.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:06:29Z - see #12617	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13543	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	8	T	Y	142.08000018310547	8	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	Encoding description would be the form of decimal values not the bit order	Change the Encoding description as 'B0-B1 signals' to 'The values indicates' and bit setting part to 'Set to 0 for no DCM support, Set to 1 for upto B	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:49:20Z) Resolution of CID 12617 is applicable.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:10:10Z - see #12617	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 982 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13544	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	144	37	T	Y	144.36999511 71875	37	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	The capability for '20 MHz In 40MHz HE PPDU in 2.4GHz' seems to make too many fragmented combination of 20MHz-only STA capabilities. In addition, if du	Make it as reserved bit and change the tone mapping of 26/52/106-tone in 40MHz as mandatory accordingly. Note 242-tone RU in 40MHz would be still mand	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:54:00Z) Support of 40 MHz in 2.4 GHz band is optional. Hence, support of 26/52/106 RU in 40 MHz in 2.4 GHz for a 20 MHz-	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:17:47Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13545	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.2.4	224	9	E	Y	224.08999633 789062	9	27.2.4		A			447	STA STA is repeated	Delete one STA	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:37:39Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:37:42Z - see #12270	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13546	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	47	E	Y	244.47000122 070312	47	27.5.3.1		A			447	Delete one parenthesis (between TB PPDU and shall	Delete (in 'TB PPDU(shall'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 21:50:36Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 21:50:39Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13547	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.5.6.2	261	15	T	Y	261.14999389 64844	15	27.5.6.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	The intended values of Multiplexing Flag in Eq (9-ax1) is 1 or 2, but actual encoded 'value' is 0 or 1 to INDICATE 1 or 2, respectively. BW part value	Change (Multiplexing Flag) to (MultiplexingFlag+1). The equation (9-ax1) in P98L2 should be updated together	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:19:36Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:34:10Z - Seems that this equation is just a duplicate of the one in Clause 9	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 983 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13548	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	263	64	E	Y	263.64001464 84375	64	27.6.3		J			447	Ng is defined as math format. Change Ng to mathmatical format	Change 'Ng' to mathmatical format of 'N_g'	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:28:25Z) - Cannot find problem at cited location	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:28:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13549	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	263	64	E	Y	265.64001464 84375	64	27.6.3		A			447	Nc is defined as math format. Change Nc to mathmatical format.	Change 'The maximum Nc' to 'The maximum N_c' with mathmatical format of 'N_c'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:26:21Z) - Italics	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:26:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13550	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	264	45	T	Y	264.45001220 703125	45	27.6.3		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Fix the ference for HE beamformee	Change the reference from 27.6.1a to 27.6.2 (Sounding sequences and support) in P802.11ax D2.0	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:00:01Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 984 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13551	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	265	35	E	Y	265.35000610 35156	35	27.6.3		V			447	Remove comma after Ng, and change Ng and Nc to mathematical format with subscript	Change 'Ng,' to mathematical format of 'N_g', anc 'Nc' to 'N_c'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:42:02Z) - Ng and Nc are being used as shorthand for technical terms here. Replace with the actual terms. Change to read	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:43:05Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13552	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	265	37	E	Y	265.36999511 71875	37	27.6.3		V			447	Remove comma after Ng, and change Ng and Nc to mathematical format with subscript	Change 'Ng,' to mathematical format of 'N_g', anc 'Nc' to 'N_c'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:44:22Z) -Ng and Nc are being used as shorthand for technical terms here. Replace with the actual terms. Change to read	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:44:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 985 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13553	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	266	27	T	Y	266.26998901 36719	27	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	HE NDP Announcement frame would be sent as non-HT duplicate PPDU for wider BW, so in order for better clarification, explict description for non-HT dup	add the non-HT duplicate PPDU format so that 'is received in a non-HT PPDU or non-HT duplicate PPDU'	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:00:33Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13553.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13554	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	266	35	E	Y	266.35000610 35156	35	27.6.3		J			447	Ng is defined as math format. Change Ng to mathmatical format	Change 'Ng=4' to mathmatical format of 'N_g=4'	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:46:25Z) - For whatever reason, subscript g was not adopted. For consistency with use elsewhere simply use italics no s	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:47:31Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 986 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13555	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	266	38	E	Y	266.38000488 28125	38	27.6.3		J			447	Ng is defined as math format. Change Ng to mathmatical format	Change 'Ng=4' to mathmatical format of 'N_g=4'	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:47:54Z) - For whatever reason, subscript g was not adopted. For consistency with use elsewhere simply use italics no s	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:47:57Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13556	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.6.3	266	39	T	Y	266.39001464 84375	39	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Total 74 RUs for 26-tone exists for 160MHz or 80+80MHz PPDU, so RU End Index subfield should be 73	Change the RU End Index subfield to 73	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:00:59Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 13556.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 987 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13557	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3	295	64	T	Y	295.64001464 84375	64	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	By definition in Clause 3, SR_PPDU with underscore (not SR PPDU) is the correct description	Change SR PPDU to SR_PPDU, i.e., change to 'transmission of an SR_PPDU' and 'transmit and SR_PPDU' (two places)	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:18:37Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13557, which instruct the editor t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:29:12Z - Use the term SR PPDU (no underscore) following generally observed style of not using underscore in technical terms.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13558	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3	296	10	T	Y	296.10000610 35156	10	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Table 9-262aa is not HE MAC Capabilities, but HE PHY capabilities, so correct Table should be referred. In addition to SR Responder subfield in HE MAC	Describe the condition and clarification of SRP-based SR Support subfield in HE PHY Capabilities for SRP-based SR operation, and update the referred T	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:21:53Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13558	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13559	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3	296	18	E	Y	296.17999267 578125	18	27.9.3		A			648	Not trigger frame but Trigger frame	Change to Trigger frame with capital T (two places in the line)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:45:08Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:45:28Z - see #14290	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 988 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13560	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3	296	18	T	Y	296.17 999267 578125	18	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	No clear description and/or defination is provided what SRP_PPDU is.	Please provide the description and definition of SRP_PPDU	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:23:28Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13560	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13561	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	31	T	Y	296.30 999755 859375	31	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The values currently defined in Table 28-21 is all values for behavior indication, not for SRP power adjuement (values 1-12 are reserved), so the SRP	Either define the values in Table 28-21 or change the description	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:27:16Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13832	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13562	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	33	T	Y	296.32 998657 22656	33	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	RPL definition would be part of bullet 2) not in the subbullet of a) or b)	Add the RPL definition before subbullet a) and b) and delete the description in the sub bullets	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:30:07Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13562, which does something very s	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 989 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13563	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3.1	297	1	T	Y	297.01000976 5625	1	27.9.3.1		A	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	By definition in Clause 3, SR_PPDU with underscore (not SR PPDU) is the correct description	Change SR PPDU to SR_PPDU	ACCEPTED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:35:32Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:30:32Z - Use SR PPDU and not SR_PPDU since we generally do not use underscore in technical terms	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13564	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	37	T	Y	297.36999511 71875	37	27.9.3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Referred equation for OBSS_PD is wrong	Change (25-1) to (27-3) in P802.11ax D2.0	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:16:29Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13564	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13565	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.1.1	327	36	T	Y	327.35998535 15625	36	28.1.1		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	The max number of DL-MU-MIMO as eight is per RU. If you use OFDMA+MU-MIMO, total number of DL-MU-MIMO users will be increased depending on the number	Change 'trnasmissions to eight' to 'transmissions to eight per one resource unit'	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:39:01Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:50:01Z - "to eight per RU" since "one" is unncessary and resource unit has an accronym	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 990 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13566	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.1.1	327	55	T	Y	327.54998779296875	55	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	For crystal clear clarification, specify 3.2us and 12.8us DFT period separately for pre-HE/HE fields.	Change '3.2us and 12.8us for the pre-HE modulated fields and the HE modulated fields in an HE PPDU, respectively.' to '3.2us for the pre-HE modulated	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:41:11Z) Resolved by the resolution to CID 13981 and CID 13982, which alters the text under question by this CID. Please	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:57:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13567	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.1.1	328	14	T	Y	328.14001464843375	14	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	For consistency either change HE MU or HE TB PPDU description to the other way	Change HE MU PPDU description as 'An HE MU PPDU on an RU of size greater than 242 subcarriers'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:43:07Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13567 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:51:21Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 991 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13568	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.1.1	328	18	T	Y	328.17999267578125	18	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	For consistency either change HE MU or HE TB PPDU description to the other way	Change HE MU PPDU description 'An RU allocated to a single user in an HE MU PPDU' to 'An HE MU PPDU on an RU allocated to a single user'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:43:20Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13568 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:51:59Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13569	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.1.1	329	42	T	Y	329.42001342 77344	42	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	For consistency either change MU-MIMO description to the other way	Change MU-MIMO description 'Reception of the payload on an RU in an HE MU PPDU' to 'MU-MIMO reception on an RU in an HE MU PPDU'	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:49:13Z) The sentence under question is not limited to MU-MIMO behaviour. As is, the statement is correct	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:09:04Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13570	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.1.2	331	1	T	Y	331.01000976 5625	1	28.1.2		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	Change 20MHz-only capability to the common terminology	Change 'A non-AP STA with 20 MHz-only capability' to 'A 20 MHz-only HE non-AP STA'	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:52:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:19:09Z - see #14010	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 992 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13571	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.2.1	332	7	T	Y	332.07000732421875	7	28.2.1		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Add TRIGVECTOR on the description	Add TRIGVECTOR as well	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:45:23Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13572	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.2.1	332	13	T	Y	332.13000488 28125	13	28.2.1		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Add the description about TRIGVECTOR	Describe the usage of TRIGVECTOR	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:45:45Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13573	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.2.2	344	45	E	Y	344.45001220703125	45	28.2.2		A			648	mode terminology is not aligned over spec. There are two types of description for pilot modes, i.e., single stream pilot HE-LTF mode and single stream	Recommend to put hyphen between HE and LTF, so change 'HE LTF mode' to 'HE-LTF mode' globally	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:08:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:08:10Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13574	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.2.2	344	47	E	Y	344.47000122 07031	47	28.2.2		A			648	mode terminology is not aligned over spec for HE-LTF, i.e., masked HE LTF sequence mode.	Recommend to put hyphen between HE and LTF and change 'masked HE LTF sequence mode' to 'masked HE-LTF sequence mode' globally.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:08:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:08:24Z - see #13573	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13575	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.5	367	1	E	Y	367.01000976 5625	1	28.3.3.5		A			648	Space between band. and This	Make the space between period and This.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:29:22Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:29:26Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 994 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13576	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	19	T	Y	367.19 000244 140625	19	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	26-tone RU restriction for 20MHz operating non-APHE STA is applied for both lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:56:21Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13577	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	20	T	Y	367.20 001220 703125	20	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	26-tone RU restriction for 20MHz-only STA would be applied for both the lower 80MHz 'and' upper 80 MHz of an 80+80MHz or 160 MHz HE MU PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:56:35Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 995 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13578	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	22	T	Y	367.22000122 07031	22	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Le e	17/1763r1	443	26-tone RU restriction for 20MHz operating non-APHE STA is applied for both lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:56:49Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE TB PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13579	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	23	T	Y	367.23001098 63281	23	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Le e	17/1763r1	443	26-tone RU restriction for 20MHz-only STA would be applied for both the lower 80MHz 'and' upper 80 MHz of an 80+80MHz or 160 MHz HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:57:05Z) -Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE TB PPDU. TGax Editor	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 996 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13580	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	25	T	Y	367.25	25	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	52-tone RU restrction for 20MHz operating non-AP HE STA is applied for both HE MU and HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:57:40Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU, so change it as commenter suggested.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13581	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	25	T	Y	367.25	25	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	52-tone RU restriction is applied for both HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'HE MU PPDU and HE TB PPDU'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:57:24Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 997 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13582	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	27	T	Y	367.26998901 36719	27	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Le	17/1763r1	443	52-tone RU restrction for 20MHz operating non-AP HE STA is applied for both HE MU and HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'lower 80 MHZ and upper 80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:59:00Z) - Agree in principal for the comment that 52-tone RU restriction is missing for HE TB PPDU, but the proposed te	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13583	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	27	T	Y	367.26998901 36719	27	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Le	17/1763r1	443	52-tone RU restriction for 20MHz-only STA would be applied for both the lower 80MHz 'and' upper 80 MHz of an 80+80MHz or 160 MHz HE MU PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:58:06Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 998 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13584	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	29	T	Y	367.29000854 49219	29	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Le	17/1763r1	443	52-tone RU restriction for lower/upper 80MHz of 80+80MHz/160MHz HE TB PPDU is mised by unintended mistake in 11-17/400r3, therefore the 52-tone RU res	Add the bullet with the statement for the consistency; '52-tone RU 5 and 12 of the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz and 160 MHz HE TB PPD	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:59:16Z) - It is true RU restriction is applied as the same in both DL OFDMA and UL OFDMA for 20MHz operating STA except	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13585	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	29	T	Y	367.29000854 49219	29	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Le	17/1763r1	443	The description on 52-tone RU restriction for 80+80MHz and 160MHz HE TB PPDU is omitted by mistake during the D1.0 comment resolution (11-17-400r3 (CR	Please add the new line for 52-tone RU description for HE TB PPDU as '52-tone RU 5 and 12 of the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz and 160	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:59:30Z) - It is true RU restriction is applied as the same in both DL OFDMA and UL OFDMA for 20MHz operating STA except	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 999 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13586	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	32	T	Y	367.32000732421875	32	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	106-tone RU restriction for 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA is applied for both lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:59:50Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13587	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	32	T	Y	367.32000732421875	32	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	106-tone RU restriction for 20 MHz-only STA would be applied for both the lower 80MHz 'and' upper 80 MHz of an 80+80MHz or 160 MHz HE MU PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and' for 106-tone RU HE MU PPDU, i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:00:03Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1000 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13588	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	35	T	Y	367.35000061035156	35	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	106-tone RU restriction for 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA is applied for both lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and', i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:00:16Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE TB PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13589	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	35	T	Y	367.35000061035156	35	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	106-tone RU restriction for 20 MHz-only STA would be applied for both the lower 80MHz 'and' upper 80 MHz of an 80+80MHz or 160 MHz HE TB PPDU	Change 'or' to 'and' for 106-tone RU HE TB PPDU, i.e., 'the lower 80 MHz and upper 80 MHz of an 80+80 MHz'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 22:00:28Z) - Agree that the restriction is applied for both the lower and upper 80 MHz of 80+80 MHz HE TB PPDU. TGax Edito	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1001 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13590	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	44	T	Y	367.44000244140625	44	28.3.3.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	non-primary 20MHz operation for 20MHz operating non-AP HE STAs help for network efficiency and resource management.	Please define the non-primary 20MHz operation, and specify the capability in the clause	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:27:01Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13591	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	44	T	Y	367.44000244140625	44	28.3.3.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	The behavior on secondary channels in 40/80/160 or 80+80 MHz HE MU PPDU is unclear. In terms of AP's scheduling flexibility and resource utilization,	Define the secondary channel operation for 20MHz-only STA with limited behaviors if required (e.g., certain size of RUs) and make it optional not to i	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:49Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13592	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.11.2	369	62	T	Y	369.61999511871875	62	28.3.3.11.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	A STA in IEEE contains both AP STA and non-AP STA. Since UL MU-MIMO Tx is only for a non-AP STA, the clarification is required, e.g., it shall support	There are two approaches either describing one paragraph without specifying transmission or reception (non-AP transmission or AP reception is already	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:45:37Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13592, 13442, 14061 and 13632 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:05:51Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1002 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13593	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.11.3	370	9	T	Y	370.08999633 78906	9	28.3.3.11.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	A STA in IEEE contains both AP STA and non-AP STA. Since UL MU-MIMO Tx is only for a non-AP STA, the clarification is required. In addition, since thi	Change 'A STA' to 'A non-AP STA' and create the new paragraph describing AP STA's reception capability	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:46:24Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13593 in 11-18/0508r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:23Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13594	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.11.4	370	19	T	Y	370.19000244 140625	19	28.3.3.11.4		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	A STA in IEEE contains both AP STA and non-AP STA. Since UL MU-MIMO Tx is only for a non-AP STA, the clarification is required	Change 'A STA' to 'A non-AP STA'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:47:14Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11168, 13594, 13443 and 13595 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:43Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1003 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13595	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.3.11.4	370	27	T	Y	370.26998901 36719	27	28.3.3.11.4		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	A STA in IEEE contains both AP STA and non-AP STA. Since UL MU-MIMO Tx is only for a non-AP STA, the clarification is required	Change 'A STA' to 'A non-AP STA'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:47:30Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11168, 13594, 13443 and 13595 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:50Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13596	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.4	372	38	T	Y	372.38000488 28125	38	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	Figure 28-12 could be mislead the pre-HE preamble could be transmitted as 26-tone RU or 52-tone RU as an example. The description and illustration of	Change the description of the figure as 'and the Figure 28-12 represents the whole channel width of the duplicated pre-HE moduled field for a given HE	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:56:22Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13596) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:57:59Z - see #11423	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1004 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13597	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.4	376	28	T	Y	376.27999987792969	28	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	519	single user HE transmission does not sound accurate. 26/52-tone can be used typically for a portion of a user in HE MU/HE TB PPDU transmission	change 'a single user HE transmission within a 26-' to 'one user portion of HE PPDU transmission of a 26-'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:59:47Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13597) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:59:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13598	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.4	376	30	T	Y	376.29998779296875	30	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	519	SU transmission definition is not crystal clear	Clarify this is one user portion of HE SU/HE ERSU/HEMU/HETB PPDU	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:00:21Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13598) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:00:17Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13599	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.4	376	31	T	Y	376.30999755859375	31	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	519	downlink or uplink HE PPDU could be informal naming	change to 'HEMU PPDU and HE TB PPDU' accordingly	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:00:41Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13599) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:00:22Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13600	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.4	377	27	T	Y	377.26998901 36719	27	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	519	This figure is not for HE SU transmission. The terminology HE SU transmission is confusing with PPDU format namings.0	change 'an HE SU transmisison' to 'one user portion of HE PPDU transmission'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:00:58Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13600) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:02:14Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13601	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	417	6	T	Y	417.05999755 859375	6	28.3.10.7.2		A	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Table 28-21 is SR for HE SU, HE ER SU and HE MU. HE-SIG-A for those PPDUs only have one SR field, i.e., no Spatial Reuse 1, 2, 3 and 4	Change 'Spatial Reuse 1, Spatial Reuse 2, Spatial Reuse 3 and Spetial Reuse 4 subfields' to 'Spatial Reuse subfield'	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:58:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:40:39Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13602	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.10.10	436	50	T	Y	436.5	50	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	N_STS which is the parameter used in 11ax is not defined in 11ac Table 21-13.	Add the sentence 'and replacing N_STS,total by N_STS' at the end of the sentence to reuse 11ac Table 21-13	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:57:05Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13602 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1006 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13603	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.10.10	437	10	E	Y	437.10000610 35156	10	28.3.10.10		A			648	Introduce the section link in 28.3.17 text	Introduce the hyperlink in '28.3.17'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:04:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:04:07Z - see #14180	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13604	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	12	E	Y	451.11999511 71875	12	28.3.10.10		A			648	Make the space between RHE-LTF and is	Make the space between variable R_HE-LTF ans is	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:07:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:08:03Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13605	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	17	E	Y	451.17001342 77344	17	28.3.10.10		A			648	Make the space between PHE-LTF and is	Make the space between variable P_HE-LTF ans is	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:08:08Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:08:12Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13606	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	28	T	Y	451.27999877 92969	28	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Equation number for P matrix is wrong based on IEEE 802.11-2016	Change (22-45) to (21-45)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:00:23Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13606 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 22:34:14Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13607	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.2	515	8	T	Y	515.08001708 98438	8	28.4.2		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1764r0	442	Change the table name as HE PHY MIB attributes	Change 'VHT' to 'HE'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:49:42Z) - The original contribution 11-17/0532r2 correctly put the title as HE PHY MIB, but somehow it is not correctly	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 22:32:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1007 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13608	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.2	516	1	T	Y	516.01000976 5625	1	28.4.2		V	Sung Eun Le	17/1764r0	442	Change the table name as HE PHY MIB attributes	Change 'VHT' to 'HE'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:50:05Z) - The original contribution 11-17/0532r2 correctly put the title as HE PHY MIB, but somehow it is not correctly	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	See #13607	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13609	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.2	517	1	T	Y	517.01000976 5625	1	28.4.2		V	Sung Eun Le	17/1764r0	442	Change the table name as HE PHY MIB attributes	Change 'VHT' to 'HE'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:50:35Z) - The original contribution 11-17/0532r2 correctly put the title as HE PHY MIB, but somehow it is not correctly	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	See #13607	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1008 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13610	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.2	518	1	T	Y	518.01000976 5625	1	28.4.2		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1764r0	442	Change the table name as HE PHY MIB attributes	Change 'VHT' to 'HE'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:50:54Z) - The original contribution 11-17/0532r2 correctly put the title as HE PHY MIB, but somehow it is not correctly	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	See #13607	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13611	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.2	519	1	T	Y	519.01000976 5625	1	28.4.2		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1764r0	442	Change the table name as HE PHY MIB attributes	Change 'VHT' to 'HE'	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:51:06Z) -The original contribution 11-17/0532r2 correctly put the title as HE PHY MIB, but somehow it is not correctly	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	See #13607	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13612	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.3	521	44	T	Y	521.44000244 14062	44	28.4.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r0	460	In Equation (28-133), aRX >0 condition is not exclusive to other condition, and aRX is always positive since it is only one of 1,2,3,4	Change the condition aRX > 0 to either otherwise or aRX \neq 4 in Eq (28-133) of D2.0	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:20:07Z) Instruction to Editor: At D2.1 P523L45 Equation (28-133), change “aRX > 0” to “otherwise”.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:57:22Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1009 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13613	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.4	522	35	T	Y	522.34997558 59375	35	28.4.4		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	In the condition of N_DBPS,last,RX,u in (28-137), u index is missing	Change 'if a_RX = 4' to 'if a_RX,u = 4' in Eq (28-137) of P802.11ax D2.0	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:40:20Z) Instruction to Editor: In the first line of Equation (28-144) (at D2.3 P575L35), change “a_{RX}=4” to “a_{RX,u}=	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:19:19Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13614	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.4	522	37	T	Y	522.36999511 71875	37	28.4.4		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	Parameter is not 100% accurate. Subscript should be lowercase for short in Eq. (28-137) in P802.11ax D2.0	Change the parameter subscript into lowercase for 'short', i.e., change 'N_SD,SHORT,u' to 'N_SD,short,u'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:40:36Z) Instruction to Editor: In the second line of Equation (28-144) (at D2.3 P575L37), change “N_{SD,SHORT,u}” to “N_	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:19:24Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13615	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.4	523	5	T	Y	523.04998779 29688	5	28.4.4		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1764r0	442	Referred Table for HE PHY characteristics is wrong based on IEEE 802.11-2016	Change Table 20-25 to Table 19-25	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-15 21:51:50Z) - Update referred Table correctly. TGax Editor: Please change the refered Table number (marked as CID 13615) a	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1				I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 22:33:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13616	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.4.4	523	24	T	Y	523.23999023 4375	24	28.4.4		J	Yujin Noh	11-18/0904r2	594	Clarify the value of aRxPHYStartDelay for different HE PPDU formats and configuration and justify the reason why one implementation delay value is cho	Clarify the value and the update corresponding text over multiple clauses	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:22:11Z) Since comment or didn't provide the value considering all issues, this comment fails to identify changes in suffi	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 17:59:22Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13617	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.5	523	49	E	Y	523.48999023 4375	49	28.5		A			648	Put the hyphen between non and OFDMA	Change to 'non-OFDMA transmissions'	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 04:04:58Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 04:05:03Z - see #11961	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1011 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13618	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.5	523	49	T	Y	523.48999023 4375	49	28.5		V	Bin Tian	11-18/0806r0	592	Change the text as a normative description	Change 'DCM is an optional modulation scheme for' to 'DCM may be applied for'	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:03:38Z) Tgax editor: please make the changes as shown in 11-18/0806r0 for CID 13618	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:39:51Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13619	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.5	523	57	T	Y	523.57000732 42188	57	28.5		V	Bin Tian	11-18/0806r0	592	Mandatory/optional description is not clear, better to rewrite the whole paragraph as a normative text format and clarify mandatory/optional parts for	Re-clarify the capability for RU sizes on 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STA, 80 MHz capable non-AP HE STA.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:03:54Z) Tgax editor: please make the changes as shown in 11-18/0806r0 for CID 13619	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:39:57Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13620	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.5	523	59	T	Y	523.59002685 54688	59	28.5		V	Bin Tian	11-18/0806r0	592	non-OFDMA 40MHz and 80 MHz is not supported for 20MHz operating STA, so it should not be described as mandatory in general	Change the description as normative text with further clarification as 'An HE STA shall support non-OFDMA 20MHz with Nss=1. An HE STA except 20MHz ope	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:04:07Z) Tgax editor: please make the changes as shown in 11-18/0806r0 for CID 13620	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:40:03Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1012 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13621	SUNG EUN LEE	230	2	28.5	524	1	T	Y	524.01000976 5625	1	28.5		A	Bin Tian	11-18/0806r0	592	Create the sub clauses per RU tone size so that the readerbility for MCS is significantly improved	Create the sub clauses 'HE MCSs for 26-tone RU', 'HE MCSs for 52-tone RU', 'HE MCS for 106-tone RU' and so on	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:06:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 16:05:00Z - Required a fair bit of editorial discretion to implement.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13622	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.1.1	327	65	T	Y	327.64999389 64844	65	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	Midamble is an important new feature included in D2.0. It shall be introduced in the introduction subclause in 28.1.1	Add a paragraph "The HE PHY provides support for midamble to improve the performance for channel suffering from Doppler ..."	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:42:15Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13622 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:01:05Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13623	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.2.6.1	352	18	E	Y	352.17999267 578125	18	28.2.6.1		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	Some sub clause number is wrong in the figure	Change 28.2.5.4, 28.2.5.3, 28.2.5.2 in the figure to 28.2.6.4, 28.2.6.3, 28.2.6.2	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:32:20Z) - As proposed change. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0023r1 under all headings that include CI	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:32:29Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1013 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13624	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.2.6.1	352	42	E	Y	352.42001342 77344	42	28.2.6.1		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	Some sub clause number is wrong in the figure	Change 28.2.5.2, 28.2.5.3, 28.2.5.4 in the figure to 28.2.6.2, 28.2.6.3, 28.2.6.4	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:33:47Z) - As proposed change. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0023r1 under all headings that include CI	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:33:53Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13625	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.2.6.1	353	8	E	Y	353.07998657 22656	8	28.2.6.1		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	Some sub clause number is wrong in the figure	Change 28.2.5.2, 28.2.5.3, 28.2.5.4 in the figure to 28.2.6.2, 28.2.6.3, 28.2.6.4	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:34:22Z) - As proposed change. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0023r1 under all headings that include CI	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:34:35Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13626	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.2	358	1	E	Y	358.01000976 5625	1	28.3.3.2		V			648	There are different text format for 2+■996 tone RU. Some places the spec use 2x996, some place use 2+■996, some place use 2\dot996. It's inconvenient	Unify the text format for 2x996-tone RU.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:17:07Z) - Consistent use 2<multiply symbol>996 has been applied with resolution to other comments. No change need	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:18:07Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13627	Tianyu Wu	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	138	22	E	Y	138.22000122 070312	22	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	B0,B1... are used as bit index for each subfield in following table 9-262aa. It's misleading to use B0-B71 in this figure.	Remove B0-B71 in this figure. Since each subfield has own bit indices, do not need a global bit index here. Alternative resolution is to use global bi	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:46:10Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13627 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0404r	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	Motion #523 but passing back to ad-hoc. 802.11 style uses bit numbering above the figure to identify the field location. This is not the problem here.	N	The issue is that we have entries in a table, particularly Channel Width Set subfield, that reference bits in that field. Instead of referencing bit p		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1015 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13628	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.1.1	327	32	G	Y	327.32000732421875	32	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	In case the 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA is operating in the 5GHz band, it shall support VHT PHY as well.	The HE PHY with 20 MHz-only capability (see 28.3.9 (Mathematical description of signals)) is based on the VHT PHY defined in Clause 21 (Very High Thro	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:37:35Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13628 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:47:54Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13629	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.1.1	327	48	G	Y	327.48001098 63281	48	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	There are many types of resource units. Depending on unit type, may not zero out more than one RU, it can be one 242 tone RU to zero out.	For channel widths greater than or equal to 80 MHz, the HE PHY supports preamble puncturing transmissions where one or more of the non-primary 20 MHz	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:40:07Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13629 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:56:03Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1016 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13630	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.3	365	6	G	Y	365.05999755859375	6	28.3.3.3		J	Junghoon Suh	11-18/0349r2	525	In case of mixed RUs transmissions, for example mixed 26 and 106 tone RUs in 20Mhz, indicating null subcarrier index may bring some confusion. Need s	Add a note: "Unless null sub carrier index is occupied by allocated resource unit, there are zero energy in null subcarrier index."	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 04:57:12Z) The 106 RU does not have any null subcarrier in 20 MHz, but only 26 and/or 52 RU has, according to Table 28-9, s	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:22:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13631	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.7	367	65	G	Y	367.64999389 64844	65	28.3.3.7		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	This sentence is confusing. When non-AP STA supports 80 MHz in 160/80+80, then AP shall not allocate RUs outside of the primary 80MHz?	Please clarify	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:34:14Z) The referred sentence indicates that an AP shall not allocate RUs outside of the Primary 80 MHz to an 80 MHz ope	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1017 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13632	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.11.2	369	65	T	Y	369.64999938964844	65	28.3.3.11.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	Why STA shall support reception of an HE TB PPDU?	A STA that sets the Partial Bandwidth UL MU-MIMO subfield of the HE PHY Capabilities Information field in the HE Capabilities element that it transmit	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:46:02Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13592, 13442, 14061 and 13632 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:09Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13633	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.11.5	370	41	G	Y	370.41000366210938	41	28.3.3.11.5		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	There is no indication of when to transmit in the Common Info field of the trigger frame. "The Common Info field of the Trigger frame indicates to the	Remove "when to transmit, and" in the sentence.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:36:43Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CID 14163 and 13633 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:21Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1018 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13634	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.10.9	436	28	T	Y	436.27999877 92969	28	28.3.10.9		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	For 1x/2x LTF, the transmitter shall be mandate to select spatial mapping matrices to preserve the smoothness of the physical channel otherwise the ch	Add a note to emphasis that for 1x/2x LTF, bad smoothness may lead to significant performance loss.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:55:08Z) Smoothing spatial mapping matrices is a recommendation. It is up to the implementation. There is no metrics to m	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13635	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	426	16	G	Y	426.16000366 21094	16	28.3.10.8.5		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	The HE SIG B resource allocation signaling is sophisticate, suggest to add some examples in the Annex to help people synchronize the understanding.	Add some HE SIG B signaling examples in Annex.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:35:33Z) See resolution for CID 11725 as in 11-18/0352r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13636	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	29	E	Y	423.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.3		V			648	Duplicate "the" in "theThe User Specific ..."	Remove the second "The"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:17:07Z) - Fixed with resolutions to other comments. No further change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:17:24Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1019 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13637	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	30	E	Y	423.29998779296875	30	28.3.10.8.3		J			648	"... of an HE-SIG-B content channel consists of one or more HE-SIG-B content channel 1."	Simplify to "of HE-SIG-B content channel 1"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:08:26Z) - Issue identified has been resolved with resolutions to other comments. No change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:08:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13638	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	424	4	T	Y	424.04000854049219	4	28.3.10.8.3		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Signaling of 996 tone RU in 160/80+80 Mhz PPDU need to be clarified.	Add a paragraph clarifying the 996 tone RU signaling. There will be 4 RU allocation subfields in total, each HE SIGB content channel carries 2 RU all	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 06:59:34Z) Editor instruction: same resolution as to CID 13407	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:48:26Z - see #13407	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13639	Tianyu Wu	230	2	27.15.2	314	61	T	Y	314.60998535156250	61	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	It's not natural to use a combination of two capability bits to indicate support of HE ER SU PPDU.	Add a capability bit for HE ER SU PPDU	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:59:49Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1020 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13640	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.1.1	328	8	T	Y	328.07998657 22656	8	28.1.1		J	Tianyu Wu	18/0012r3	569	The HEER SU feature should not be a mandatory feature. This feature will not be tested and may not be supported in all devices, so there will be inte	Add a capability bit for HEER SU PPDU	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:46:04Z) - Keep HE ER SU PPDU mandatory but allow STA to disable it using OM control field.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13641	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.2	364	45	E	Y	364.45001220 703125	45	28.3.3.2		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	Most places describe subcarriers using lower, upper, but here is using left most and right most.	Change to lowest, highest in this paragraph.	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:51:11Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	Passing to PHY for discussion	I	Editorial override: lowest what? Changing to "lowest frequency" and "highest frequency", respectively	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13642	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	10	T	Y	369.10000610 35156	10	28.3.3.9.3		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	For RU size of 996 subcarriers, there will be 2 RU allocation subfields on each HE-SIG-B content channel, how to split the number of users between the	Add clarification that the second RU allocation subfield for the 996 tone RU on each HE-SIG-B content channel shall set to "01110011" (996-tone RU wit	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:45:13Z) Agree with the commenter in principle. However, the same clarification has already been made in D2.2 in the HE-	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:05:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1021 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13643	Tianyu Wu	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	428	33	T	Y	428.32998657 22656	33	28.3.10.8.5		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	The description is not accurate for "01110011" (996-tone RU with no User fields...) . Since on each HE-SIG-B content channel there are 2 RU allocatio	Change the definition of this entry to "996-tone RU with 0 user indicated in this RU allocation subfield"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:36:52Z) See resolution for CID 13407 in document IEEE802.11-18/0118r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13644	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	48	E	Y	79.480003356 9336	48	9.3.1.9.7		V			447	"A non-AP HESTA that transmits a Multi-STA BlockAck frame with a single AID subfield or with the same values of the AID subfield in Per AID TID Info	Change "... in Per AID TID Info subfields and sets the RA field to ..." to "... in Per AID TID Info subfields sets the RA field to ...".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:39:32Z) - Agree in principle. Also clarify the condition for setting the RA field. Change the sentence to read: "A non-	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:59:14Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13645	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	10.3.7			T	Y			10.3.7		J			657	Table 10-5 (Determination of the EstimatedAckTxTime based on properties of the PPDU causing the EIFS) in the baseline should be considered whether to	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13646	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	98	11	T	Y	98.11000061035156	11	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	Is the Multiplexing Flag subfield really the number of STAs that are multiplexed with P-matrix codes on the same set of tones in the same RU minus 1?	Delete "minus 1".	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:14:11Z) Clarify the sentence. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:24:37Z - see #14197	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13647	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	LoT	26	7	E	Y	26.06999969482422	7	LoT		A			447	Orders of Table 28-59 and 28-58 are reversed.	Change to show first Table 28-58 and then Table 28-59.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:35:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:35:19Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13648	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	LoT	26	17	E	Y	26.17000007629394 5	17	LoT		A			447	Orders of Table 28-67 and 28-66 are reversed.	Change to show first Table 28-66 and then Table 28-67.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:35:22Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 19:35:25Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1023 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13649	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.1.62	106	39	E	Y	106.38999938964844	39	9.4.1.62		A			447	"The HE MIMO Control field is included in every HE Compressed Beamforming frame (see 9.4.1.63 (HE Compressed Beamforming Report field))." There is no	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:57:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:57:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13650	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	24	E	Y	108.23999786376953	24	9.4.1.62		J			447	"In an HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI frame not carrying all or part of an HE compressed beamforming report, the Nc Index, Nr Index, Channel Width,	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 18:02:54Z) - This is not an editorial issue. As described elsewhere the HE compressed beamforming report can be segmented	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 18:04:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1024 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13651	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.5.1	258	5	T	Y	258.04998779296875	5	27.5.5.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0360r2	542	"An unassociated HESTA shall initialize the range of OFDMA contention window (OCW) upon reception of the UORA Parameter Set element from the intended	Remove the following second para in 27.5.5.2: "An HE STA shall maintain an internal OFDMA contention window (OCW) and an internal OBO counter. OCW is	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:03:48Z) TGax editor, please make changes as showing doc 11-18/0360r2	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 15:45:18Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13652	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	18	T	Y	258.17999267578125	18	27.5.5.2		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	The title of the subclause is "UORA procedure" but it's to general. In the contrast to 27.5.5.3 (Retransmission procedure for UORA), it's better to be	As in comment. Also change the first sentence in the first para to "In this subclause, the transmission procedure for UORA is described."	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:08:22Z) TGax editor please make change as shown in the 11-18-0694r3 under all headings that include the CID 13652	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:25:01Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1025 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13653	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.5.3	260	11	T	Y	260.10998535 15625	11	27.5.5.3		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0695r4	624	"If the HE TB PPDU is not successfully transmitted in the selected random access RU, then the STA shall update its OCW to 2 x OCW + 1 when the OCW is	Change to "If the HE TB PPDU is not successfully transmitted in the selected random access RU, then the STA shall update its OCW to 2 x OCW + 1 under	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:22:40Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0695r4 that are marked with CID 13653	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13654	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	430	43	E	Y	430.42999267 578125	43	28.3.10.8.6		V			648	The title of the figure is "Figure 28-30--Illustration for the mapping of the 8-bit RU Allocation subfield and the position of the User field to the S	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:47:30Z) - Change to " An example of the mapping of…"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:47:48Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1026 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13655	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.11.1			T	Y			27.11.1		J			657	All of the description for the STA_ID_LIST is done based on "RU", for example "Each element of the TXVECTOR parameter STA_ID_LIST identifies the STA o	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13656	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.2.4	224	9	E	Y	224.08999633789062	9	27.2.4		A			447	"... not solicit an immediate response from the STA STA or the received frame is a Trigger frame ." Duplicated "STA"s and extra space before the perio	Delete one "STA" and delete extra space before the period.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:06Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1027 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13657	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.2.5.1	225	51	T	Y	225.50999450683594	51	27.2.5.1		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	Figure 27-1 needs to be updated considering two NAVs operation.	As in comment.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:34:28Z) Figure 27-1 simply describes the NAV duration set from MU-RTS and CTS. Hence, there is no need to further describ	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13658	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.2.5.1	226	26	T	Y	226.25999450683594	26	27.2.5.1		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	Figure 27-2 needs to be updated considering two NAVs operation.	As in comment.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:35:13Z) Figure 27-2 simply describes the NAV duration set from MU-RTS and CTS. Hence, there is no need to further describ	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1028 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13659	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.3.1.8.1			T	Y			9.3.1.8.1		V	Tomoko Adachi	733r3	637	In the baseline, the BlockAck frame variant encoding and the BlockAckReq frame variant were aligned. As the BlockAck frame variant encoding has been c	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:36:34Z) Revised. See the instructions to the TGax editor in doc. 11-18/0733r3. Note to the TGax editor: subclause 10.24	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13660	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.7.1			T	Y			9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu		657	The EOF field should be changed to EOF/Ack solicitation field, as it's no more just showing the end of the frame but also showing the presence of a Qo	Change the EOF field to EOF/Ack solicitation field throught the draft.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1029 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13661	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.7.1	168	54	T	Y	168.53 999328 61328	54	9.7.1		V	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	"... and set to 1 in a MPDU delimiter preceding a QoS Data frame or Action frame soliciting an Ack frame in response that are contained in an ack-enab	Delete "10.13.7 (Setting the EOF field of the MPDU delimiter) and " from pp. ll 168.54.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:50:24Z) Revised. Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0425r4 under CID 13661	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13662	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	58	E	Y	303.57 998657 22656	58	27.10.4.3		A			447	"... as defined in 227.4.4 (Per-PPDU acknowledgment selection rules)." Wrong reference. It should be 27.4.4.	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:45:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:45:51Z - see #14304	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13663	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	13	T	Y	239.13 000488 28125	13	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"An HE STA that receives an HE SU PPDU with an A-MPDU that contains QoS Data or QoS Null frames addressed to it shall follow the following acknowledgm	Change as follows: "An HE STA that receives an HE SU PPDU with an A-MPDU that contains MAC frame(s) addressed to it shall follow the following acknowl	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:17:19Z) Revised.- Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1030 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13664	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	16	T	Y	239.16000366210938	16	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	How can a recipient know the received HE SU PPDU is either of 1) to 3) cases? Some MPDUs within an A-MPDU can fail. If there are errors, the recipient	Change as follows: 1) If the HE SU PPDU has no errors and is detected to carry an S-MPDU that is ... an Action frame soliciting an Ack frame, ... 2) I	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:18:11Z) Revised.- Agree in principle with the concern. The section is re-written to address broader comments which also	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13665	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	42	T	Y	239.41999816 89453	42	27.4.4.3		J	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	"The A-MPDUs in the HE MU PPDU shall not contain an Action frame or an MMPDU that solicits a response." There is no problem containing an Action Ackf	Change the two paragraphs in 27.4.4.3 as follows: "If an AP intends to solicit an immediate response in an SU PPDU the following apply: -- An AP shall	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-16 23:19:00Z) Rejected - Since management frame does not have the 'Ack policy' field, the AP cannot indicate the ack policy t	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1031 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13666	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	21	T	Y	240.21000671 38672	21	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	How can a recipient know the received HE SU PPDU is either of 1) to 3) cases? Similar comment to the one in 27.4.4.2, pp.ll 239.16.	Change as follows: 1) If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU has no errors and is detected to carry an S-MPDU that is ... an Action frame soliciting an Ack f	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:30:53Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated text in D2.3 already reflects the requested change. No further change need	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:07:08Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13667	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.4			T	Y			27.4.4.4		J	George Cherian	717r1	635	(Resubmitting the same problem pointed out by CID 9351.) What happens if the AP transmits in an A-MPDU with a Trigger frame, an Action frame solicitin	Add a note at the end of 27.4.4.4 as follows: "NOTE --As an Action frame soliciting an Ack frame does not contain Ack Policy field, the non-AP STA resp	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:31:35Z) Rejected - The usecase raised does not lead to a problem. See explaination below: When management frame that s	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:00:43Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1032 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13668	Tomoko Adachi	230	2				T	Y					V			648	An Action Ack frame is not defined. Neither does an Action-Ack frame. It is just an Action frame, in contrast to an Action No Ack frame.	Change "Action Ack frame", "Action-Ack frame", and "Action frame soliciting an Ack frame" appearing in the draft to just Action frame".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:40:13Z) - As of D2.2 the problem does not exist. Fixed with resolutions to other comments.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:40:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13669	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2			T	Y			9.2.4.6.4.2		J	Yongho Seok	726r0	640	Reading 27.10.4.3, it is not allowed to transmit an A-MPDU which is a Trigger frame + Action frame soliciting an Ack frame. To solicit an HE TB PPDU w	Add a sentence in 9.2.4.6.4.2 as follows: "To solicit an HE TB PPDU with an A-MPDU containing an Action frame but not containing data frames, an AP sh	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:47:41Z) Rejected- Clause 9 can't have any normative sentence.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1033 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13670	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3			T	Y			3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	684r2	599	The discussion may go back to the baseline, but an "HE BSS" is not defined. (Not even HT BSS nor VHT BSS.) There is an implicit understanding that a B	Move the definition of BSS from 3.1 to 3.2 and add an explanation that a BSS with a Beacon or Probe Response frame that includes an HT/VHT/HE Capabili	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 21:04:45Z) Revised – Disagree in the changes to the baseline. Definitions in 3.1 apply to 802.11 concepts, as such there is	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 16:19:20Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13671	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	28.3.10.10	447	2	E	Y	447.01 99890136719	2	28.3.10.10		A			648	There is a redundant page break between "... according to the RU_TONE_SET_INDEX and FED-" and "BACK_STATUS."	Delete the page break.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:06:22Z) -	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:06:37Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13672	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	28.3.17	485	28	E	Y	485.27 99987792969	28	28.3.17		A			648	"The generation of HE-LTF symbols for the HE TB NDP feedback PPDU was defined in 28.3.10.10 (HE-LTF)" It doesn't need to be expressed in the pretext.	Change "was" to "is".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:18:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:18:18Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1034 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13673	Tomoko Adachi	230	2				E	Y					A			648	There are references that don't have hyperlink. Ex. 4 appearances in the first para of 28.3.10.10, one appearance in the third para of 28.3.10.10.	Add hyperlinks to the references.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:42:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 21:42:14Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13674	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.2.237.1	132	56	E	Y	132.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.237.1		A			447	Change Tx Rx HEMCS NSS Support subfield in Figure 9-589cj to Supported HE-MCS And NSS Set subfield.	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:42:55Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:42:59Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13675	Tomoko Adachi	230	2				T	Y					V	Ming Gan	98r2	477	The draft allowed the A-MSDU to be fragmented but there are still expressions in the baseline that it's not allowed.	Search where it is expressed that A-MSDU is not allowed to be fragmented and correct the expression. Ex. 3.1 "aggregate medium access control (MAC) se	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:08:42Z) Revised-Agree with the commenter in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-08 15:26:21Z - The instruction: "Note: TGax editor please make the changes through the whole 802.11-2016 for the case where it is expr	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1035 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13676	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	51	T	Y	56.509998321 5332	51	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	"If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and is not carried in an A-MPDU, ..." The subject of " is not carried in an A-MPDU" part is vague. This sentence se	Change it to "If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and if the fragments are not carried in an A-MPDU, ...".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13677	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	54	T	Y	56.540000915 527344	54	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	"If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and is carried in an A-MPDU, ..." The subject of " is carried in an A-MPDU" part is vague. This sentence seems to b	Change it to "If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and if the fragments are carried in an A-MPDU, ...".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1036 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13678	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	69	12	T	Y	69.12000274658203	12	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	"If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and is not carried in an AMPDU, ..." The subject of " is not carried in an A-MPDU" part is vague. This sentence see	Change it to "If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and if the fragments are not carried in an A-MPDU, ...".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13679	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	69	14	T	Y	69.13999938964844	14	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	"If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and is carried in an A-MPDU, ..." The subject of " is carried in an A-MPDU" part is vague. This sentence seems to b	Change it to "If an MSDU or A-MSDU is fragmented and if the fragments are carried in an A-MPDU, ...".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1037 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13680	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	42	T	Y	301.42001342 77344	42	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	"When TXOP limit is not zero then the STA may aggregate QoS Data frames from one or more TIDs in the A-MPDU under the following conditions:" How about	Allow aggregation of an Action frame.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:26:44Z) Rejected Discusion: Action frame is not under the restriction of primary AC rules.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13681	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2	34	18	T	Y	34.180000305 17578	18	3.2		J			657	The definition of OFDMA should be in 3.1 as the same with MU-MIMO. Also the expression should align with that of MU-MIMO, such as use "STA" instead of	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1038 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13682	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.1			T	Y			3.1		A			648	In the baseline, there is the following note after the definition of MU-MIMO: "NOTE--IEEE Std 802.11 supports only downlink (DL) MU-MIMO. See downlink	Copy and paste the definition of MU-MIMO and its note from the baseline to clause 3.1 of the draft and strike out the not to show its deleted.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:13:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:13:38Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13683	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.1			T	Y			3.1		J			648	In the baseline, PPDU is defined as follows: "The unit of data exchanged between *two peer PHY entities* to provide the PHY data service." This won't	Copy and paste the definition of PPDU from the baseline to clause 3.1 of the draft and strike out the "two peer" part to show its deleted.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:09:48Z) in 802.11-2016, PPDU is defined as "The unit of data exchanged between PHY entities"	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:10:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1039 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13684	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2			T	Y			3.2		V			648	In the baseline, MU PPDU is defined as follows: "A PPDU that carries one or more PHY service data units (PSDUs) for one or more stations (STAs) using	Copy and paste the definition of MU PPDU from the baseline to clause 3.2 of the draft and change the definition to also cover UL and OFDMA.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:18:40Z) - MU PPDU is downlink only. Change the definition to "A PPDU that carries one or more PHY service data units (P	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:19:23Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13685	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2	32	56	E	Y	32.560 001373 291016	56	3.2		A			447	Show the change from the baseline.	Add underline for "," after "(SU-MIMO)" and underline ", or orthogonal frequency division multiple access (OFDMA)".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:14:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:14:12Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13686	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2	33	31	T	Y	33.310 001373 291016	31	3.2		J			657	There are two similar definitions, one is for "high efficiency (HE) extended range (ER) single user (SU) physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU	Delete the second definition starting from pp.ll 33.36.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1040 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13687	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2			T	Y			3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The definition of SR itself should be included.	Add a definition of SR in clause 3.2.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:45:03Z) TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13687	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0				I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13688	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2	34	50	T	Y	34.5	50	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	There are SR PPDU and SR_PPDU. Are they different or same? The expression is not clear enough that a reader cannot judge whether it is a typo or a not	Delete either of the term if they are the same. Change either of the term to be more distinguishable it they are different.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:52:06Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13688	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0				I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13689	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2	34	58	T	Y	34.580001831 05469	58	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"SRP PPDU: a PPDU that is a DSRP_PPDU" Then there is no need to define SRP PPDU but just use DSRP_PPDU. Also, note that there is no period at the end.	Delete the definition or add further explanation why it needs to be defined.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:02:03Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13689. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0				I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1041 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13690	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2			T	Y			3.2		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	The definition of SRP-based SR itself should be included.	Add a definition of SRP-based SR in clause 3.2.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:45:50Z) clause 3 is for the definition of terms that are used later in the document, and there is no term lacking a defini	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13691	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.4			T	Y			3.4		J			657	As there is UL OFDMA, UL MU-MIMO should be also added.	Add an acronym definition of UL MU-MIMO in clause 3.4.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13692	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	4.3.14a	37	12	T	Y	37.119998931884766	12	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	Now the PAR also covers the 6 GHz band.	Change the sentence from "The IEEE 802.11 HE STA operates in frequency bands between 1 GHz and 6 GHz." to "The IEEE 802.11 HE STA operates in frenc	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:32:52Z) Revised. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12205	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1042 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13693	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	3.2	34	24	T	Y	34.240001678 4668	24	3.2		A			648	There is a definition of orthogonal frequency division multiple access (OFDMA)-based random access, but now the terminlogy is unified to "Uplink ortho	Change the term to "Uplink orthogonal frequency division multiple access (OFDMA) based random access (UORA)".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:22:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:22:29Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13694	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.3.1.23	87	45	T	Y	87.449996948 24219	45	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Normative expression should not be used in clause 9.	Change "The AP shall set the MU-MIMO LTF Mode subfield to single stream pilots if the triggered UL PPDU contains partial or full UL OFDMA allocation."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:19:45Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 13694	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1043 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13695	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	22	T	Y	89.22000122070312	22	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	Normative expression should not be used in clause 9.	Change "The PE Disambiguity subfield shall be set to 1 if the condition in Equation (28-113) is met, otherwise it shall be set to 0." to "The PE Disam	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:22:58Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 13695	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13696	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.1.63	114	1	T	Y	114.01000213623047	1	9.4.1.63		V	Kome Oteri	11-18/0080r2	457	Normative expression should not be used in clause 9. Two occurences, may and shall, in the paragraph starting from pp.ll 114.1.	Change the first two sentences starting from pp.ll 114.1 to be a non-normative text.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:25:41Z) Moved to pg 266 line 10 as in comment 12684	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13697	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.1.63	114	4	E	Y	114.04000091552734	4	9.4.1.63		J			447	"... in the Ng = 16 For SU subfield or Ng = 16 For MU subfield, respectively, ..." The two "For" should not start with an upper case.	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:41:01Z) - Since they are part of the subfield name they should be capitilized, A lower case for might be interpreted a	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 20:43:21Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1044 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13698	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.2.1	118	10	E	N	118.09999847 41211	10	9.4.2.1		A			447	Why not asign the sub clause numbers of the new elements in the same order with the that in Table 9-77 to be more readable?	Move Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element to 9.4.2.241, NDP Feedback Report Parameter Set element to 9.4.2.242, BSS Color Change Announcement to 9.4.2.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:00:35Z) - Sure, why not. I'm here to please.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:00:54Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13699	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.2.1	118	49	E	Y	118.48999786 376953	49	9.4.2.1		A			447	The reference is missing for ESS Report.	Add reference subclause after "ESS Report" in Table 9-77.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:10:01Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 21:10:04Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13700	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.7.3	171	33	E	Y	171.33000183 10547	33	9.7.3		V			648	"Multi-STA BlockAck" is the correct terminology.	Change "Multi-STA BA" in the middle column in the row for Control Response in Table 9-424 to "Multi-STA BlockAck".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:18:20Z) - Multi-STA BlockAck frame	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:18:36Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1045 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13701	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.7.3	172	26	E	Y	172.25999450683594	26	9.7.3		A			648	"Multi-STA BlockAck" is the correct terminology.	Change "Multi-STA BA" in the middle column in the row for Multi-STA BlockAck in Table 9-425 to "Multi-STA BlockAck".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:20:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 17:20:18Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13702	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	22	E	Y	294.22000122207031	22	27.9.2.3		V		17/1852r8	474	"(including HE Trigger-Based PPDU)" Use TB.	Change to "(including HE TB PPDU)".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:31:10Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13703	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	10.3.2.10.3	184	1	T	Y	184.00999450683594	1	10.3.2.10.3		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	"BlockAck" is the correct terminology. And not a single BlockAck frame is sent but multiple BlockAck frames are sent.	Change "An example of a DL OFDMA BA is shown in Figure 10-12b ..." to "An example of multiple Block Ack frames sent in DL OFDMA is shown in Figure 10-1	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:25:49Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:01:26Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1046 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13704	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	10.3.2.10.3	184	26	E	Y	184.25999450683594	26	10.3.2.10.3		J	George Cherian		657	The explanation of Figure 10-12b says the BlockAck frames are sent by DL OFDMA, not just DL MU. The title of Figure 10-12b should align with it.	Change the title of Figure 10-12b to "An example of an UL MU transmission with an immediate DL OFDMA transmission containing individually addressed Bl	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. Is this a general example of an UL data sequence? Or are we specifically calling out the OFDMA aspects? I don't see why OFDMA is imporant h	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13705	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	10.3.2.10.3	185	18	E	Y	185.17999267578125	18	10.3.2.10.3		J	George Cherian		657	Figures 10-12a to 10-12c all have n STAs, but only Figure 10-12d has 4. If there is no special intention, the figure should align with others in serie	Change Figure 10-12d to show n STAs are involved in the sequence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. Since the Multi-STA BlockAck frame in the figure is a single frame sent in a non-HT Duplciate PPDU, it should probably be represented by a	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13706	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.5	240	42	E	Y	240.41999816 89453	42	27.4.4.5		A			447	A Trigger frame always solicit an immediate response. The part "that solicits an immediate response" is redundant.	Remove "that solicits an immediate response".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:54:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:54:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1047 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13707	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	31	T	Y	242.30999755859375	31	27.5.1.1		A	Zhou Lan	11-18/054r0	499	"A STA shall not transmit an HE MU PPDU of DL MU-MIMO with OFDMA allocated in an RU that is addressed to ..." The subject "A STA" here is an AP, as tr	Change it to read "An AP shall not transmit an HE MU PPDU of DL MU-MIMO with OFDMA allocated in an RU that is addressed to ...".	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:19:54Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/054r0 that are marked with CID 13707	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:52:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13708	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	31	E	Y	242.30999755859375	31	27.5.1.1		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"... an HE MU PPDU of DL MU-MIMO with OFDMA allocated in an RU that is addressed to a STA unless the AP has received from the STA ..." Here, "a STA" s	Change it to read "... an HE MU PPDU of DL MU-MIMO with OFDMA allocated in an RU that are addressed to STAs unless the AP has received from each of th	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		This is a totally mangled statement. What does "with OFDMA allocated on an RU" mean? OFDMA is an channel access technique. What does "of DL MU-MIMO" m	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1048 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13709	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	246	54	E	Y	246.53999932861328	54	27.5.3.2.3		V		11-18/0076r3	507	The rules described in this paragraph are especially for the trigger frames in the same MU PPDU. The intention will be more clear if "MU" is added bet	Add "MU" between "same" and "PPDU" where they appear in the paragraph starting from pp.ll 246.54. (3 appearances.)	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 17:17:54Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-18/0076r3 under 13709	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:28:43Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13710	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	31	E	Y	258.30999755859375	31	27.5.5.2		A			447	"Multi-STA BlockAck" is the correct terminology.	Change "Multi-STA BA" to "Multi-STA BlockAck" in Figure 27-5. (2 appearances.)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 22:54:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 22:54:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13711	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.6.3	265	29	E	Y	265.29000854492219	29	27.6.3		V			447	"to one or more HE non-AP STA beamformee" It should be said as "to one or more HE beamformee that are non-AP STAs".	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:35:43Z) - Agree in principle. Change to "to one or more HE beamformees that are non-AP STAs"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:36:04Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1049 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13712	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.6.3	265	55	T	Y	265.54998779296875	55	27.6.3		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	"Rx HE-MCS Map For <= 80 MHz and Rx HE-MCS Map For > 80 MHz subfields" There are not such subfields but "Rx HE-MCS Map <= 80 MHz", "Rx HE-MCS	Change to "Rx HE-MCS Map <= 80 MHz, Rx HE-MCS Map 160 MHz, and Rx HE-MCS Map 80+80 MHz subfields".	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:01:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13713	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	9.4.2.237.4	145	28	T	Y	145.27999877929688	28	9.4.2.237.4		A	Ron Porat	18/0118r6	466	"Rx HE-MCS Map 80+80 MHz" are duplicated in Figure 9-589cm. The latter should be "Tx HE-MCS Map 80+80 MHz".	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-02-09 20:54:17Z) Editor please change the last field Rx to Tx	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-09 20:55:00Z	2.2	2018-02-09	EDITOR
13714	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.15.4.1	317	20	E	Y	317.20001220703125	20	27.15.4.1		A			648	"..., The <HE-MCS, NSS> tuple ..." It doesn't need to be an upper case.	Change to "..., the <HE-MCS, NSS> tuple ...".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:11:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:11:08Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13715	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	30	E	Y	241.30000305 17578	30	27.4.4.6		A			447	Need a period after "in the HE MAC Capabilities Information field".	As in comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:00:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:00:07Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1050 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13716	Tomoko Adachi	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	247	31	T	Y	247.30999755859375	31	27.5.3.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0076r3	507	"An AP may indicate an unassigned RU by using value 2046 in the AID12 subfield." How is it used? It's not explained any where in the draft.	Add description how it's used. Or delete the case of including 2046 in the AID12 subfield of the Trigger frame.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:43:30Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0076r3 under 13716.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:28:50Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13717	Tomoko Adachi	230	2				E	Y					V			447	There are "Per User Info" field expressions remaining, which should be "User Info"fields in a Trigger frame. ex. Appears in pp.ll 241.44, 241.45, 243.	Search "Per User Info" and replace with "User Info" throughout the draft.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:39:22Z) - Replace as in comment at cited locations. A search indicates that these are the only locations affected.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-11-17 23:40:30Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13718	Tomoko Adachi	230	2				E	Y					J			648	As the same field name "RU Allocation" appears in the User Info field of the Trigger frame and in the Common Block subfield of the HE-SIG-B field, whe	As in comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:39:13Z) - The comment does not identify specific problems with RU Allocation field/subfield references. There is an R	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:39:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1051 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13719	Vincent Knowles IV Jones	230	2	B.4.4.2	559	54	T	Y	559.53997802 73438	54	B.4.4.2		A	Edward Au	18/0763r1	645	Whether any kind of frame is transmitted by an AP is up to the AP, and shouldn't be mandatory	Change to O	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:12:46Z) - TGax Editor: Change CFHE: M to CFHE: O in 6.15.54 of P802.11ax D2.3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:13:54Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13720	Vincent Knowles IV Jones	230	2	27.2.5.2	226	33	T	Y	226.33000183 10547	33	27.2.5.2		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	A transmitter isn't mandated to do this	change "MU-RTS trigger frame shall request" to "MU-RTS trigger frame requests"	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:35:47Z) We note that similar rule for Trigger frame is defined in 27.5.3.2.3 (Allowed settings of the Trigger frame field	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13721	Vincent Knowles IV Jones	230	2	27	221	1	T	Y	221.00999450 683594	1	27		V			648	There are not enough features	There are not enough features in the 11ax. Add some more	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:23:53Z) - Agree in principle. Between D2.0 and D3.0, the group has added a number of new features. No further changere	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 20:24:45Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1052 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13722	Vincent Knowles IV Jones	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	14	E	Y	241.13999938964844	14	27.4.4.6		A			447	Why is there a sub section (a)	There is no sub section (b). So remove the (a)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:58:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:59:08Z - You voted 'No' for this?	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13723	Vincent Knowles IV Jones	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	5	T	Y	241.05000305 17578	5	27.4.4.6		J	George Cherian		657	Using an ACK mechanism in a non-legacy PHY format will cause EIFS and in general, loss of slotting	Eliminate this way of ACKing a TB PPDU and save the industry a big headache	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13724	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.14.3.3	314	30	T	Y	314.29998779296875	30	27.14.3.3		J	Guoqing Li	90r0	489	If an OPS STA receives a TIM element where its corresponding bit is set to 0, it may not access using EDCA properly if its HEMU EDCATimer is nonzero fo	If an OPS STA receives a TIM element where its corresponding bit is set to 0 may set its HEMU EDCATimer[AC] to 0 for all ACs	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:25:27Z) Rejected – this situation would be an indication that the medium is congested and that the AP will be fully sche	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:25:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1053 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13725	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.5.3.5	254	32	T	Y	254.32000732421875	32	27.5.3.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1837r3	497	The CS required subfield is set to 0 when AP solicits a short response frame in HE TB PPDU from a non-AP STA. In this case, we should not allow the no	Add the following: If the CS required is set to 0, the TID Aggregation Limit subfield in the User Info field of the solicited STA shall be set to 0.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 06:19:40Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-17/1837r3 under 13725	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:32:04Z - Reword to more accurately relate the condition to the the result: "An AP should set the TID Aggregation Limit subfield	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13726	Woojin Ahn	230	2	9.7.3	173	7	T	Y	173.07000732421875	7	9.7.3		J	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	Is it possible to aggregate QoS Data frames with the Ack Policy field set to No Ack in a multi-TID A-MPDU with other Qos Data frames soliciting respon	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:47:14Z) Reject. Discussion: in 11n/11ac, A-MPDU doesn't allow QoS Data with Ack Policy equalto No Ack although Qction	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13727	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.10.4.1	301	30	T	Y	301.29998779296875	30	27.10.4.1		J	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	The TID Aggregation Limit has been proposed to save the reordering buffer of an HE recipient with partial state operation and to reduce the length of	Change to "Any number of QoS Data frame and QoS Null frame with any TID with which the Ack Policy field is set to No Ack may be aggregated in an A-MPD	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:23:43Z) Rejected. Discussion: the QoS Data frame with No Ack in Ack Policy field is not allowed in multi-TID A-MPDU.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13728	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	45	T	Y	300.45001220703125	45	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	797r3	620	It is ambiguos whether an ack-enable A-MPDU shall contain both or either one of: -- One QoS Data frame with the Ack Policy field set to Normal Ack or	Need to clarify	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:17:13Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0797r3 under CID 13728	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1055 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13729	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	50	T	Y	300.5	50	27.10.4.1		V	Liwen Chu	979r3	620	If a QoS Data frame not under the BA agreement is contained in an ack-enabled A-MPDU, the EOF field must be set to 0? If so, what is the expected Ackn	Need to clarify	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:21:01Z) Revised Discussion: the cited bullet is about the MPDU that are neither QoS Data frames nor Management frames.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13730	Woojin Ahn	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	2	T	Y	56.020000457 76367	2	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	If the queue size value is rounded up to the nearest (256, 1024, 32768) octets, even if a non-AP STA transmits all remaining MPDUs in an HE TB PPDU fo	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1056 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13731	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	44	T	Y	257.44000244140625	44	27.5.5.1		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	In a trigger-enabled broadcast TWT, the TWT scheduling AP may want to solicit PS-poll frames or U-APSD trigger frames using UORA only from the TWT sch	As in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13732	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	62	T	Y	303.61999511 71875	62	27.10.4.3		J	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	When a STA receives an Ack frame in response to the immediately preceeding Ack-enabled MT A-MPDU containing more than one EOF:1 MPDUs, it ignores the	As in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:41:13Z) Rejected Discussion: Since the STA doesn't know which frame that the Ack acknowledge, the EDCAF will be treate	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1057 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13733	Woojin Ahn	230	2	10.22.2.8	199	40	T	Y	199.39999938 9648438	40	10.22.2.8		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0040r2	504	A TXOP holder may exceed the TXOP limit for retransmission of an MPDU, not in an A-MPDU consisting of more than one MPDU. However If the retransmitted	A TXOP holder may exceed the TXOP limit for retransmission of an MPDU unless the size of the MPDU is the same as the initially transmitted MPDU	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-06 23:11:40Z) Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies this aspect. TGax editor to make the chang	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13734	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.1	239	1	T	Y	239.00999450 683594	1	27.4.4.1		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	The terms 'S-MPDU', 'single TID A-MPDU' and 'multi-TID A-MPDU' define the ways of constructing an A-MPDU for HE STA as an originator. At the receiver	Delete 'S-MPDU', 'single TID A-MPDU', 'multi-TID A-MPDU' from this subcluase and the subsequent subcluases, and rewrite the rules based on the number	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:01:00Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1058 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13735	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	16	T	Y	239.16000366210938	16	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	A single TID A-MPDU may include the following: One frame with a single TID value with the Ack Policy field equal to Normal Ack or one Action frame, at	If the HE SU PPDU carries an S-MPDU or an A-MPDU that includes only one MPDU with EOF = 1 soliciting an immeidate response, then the STA shall respond	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:02:32Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13736	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	20	T	Y	239.19999694 82422	20	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	In an multi-TID A-MPDU, MPDUs from different TIDs don't have to have the same value of the Ack Policy subfield. Therefore, a non ack-enabled multi-TID	If the HE SU PPDU carries an A-MPDU that includes one or more MPDU, and if one or more MPDU from only one TID solicits an immediate response and the E	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:03:14Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1059 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13737	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	16	T	Y	239.16 000366 210938	16	27.4.4.2		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	An Ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU may contains QoS Data frames from a TID with the Ack Policy subfield set to Block Ack and one Qos Data with the EOF fi	If the HE SU PPDU carries an S-MPDU or an A-MPDU that includes only one MPDU with EOF = 1 soliciting an immeidate response, then the STA shall respond	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:03:57Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13738	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	49	T	Y	239.49 000549 316406	49	27.4.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	A single TID A-MPDU may include the following: One frame with a single TID value with the Ack Policy field equal to Normal Ack or one Action frame, at	If the HE MU PPDU carries an S-MPDU or an A-MPDU that includes only one MPDU with EOF = 1 soliciting an immeidate response, then the STA shall respond	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:04:36Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1060 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13739	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	53	T	Y	239.52999877929688	53	27.4.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	In an multi-TID A-MPDU, MPDUs from different TIDs don't have to have the same Ack Policy value. Therefore, a non ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU may cont	If the HE MU PPDU carries an A-MPDU that includes one or more MPDU, and if one or more MPDU from only one TID solicits an immediate response and the E	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:05:18Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13740	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.3	239	49	T	Y	239.49000549316406	49	27.4.4.3		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	An Ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU may contains QoS Data frames from a TID with the Ack Policy subfield set to Block Ack and one Qos Data with the EOF fi	If the HE MU PPDU carries an S-MPDU or an A-MPDU that includes only one MPDU with EOF = 1 soliciting an imeidate response, then the STA shall respond	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:06:08Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1061 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13741	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	21	T	Y	240.21000067138672	21	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	If a recipient received an EOF:1 MPDU and a Trigger frame, it is better to respond with an Ack frame	If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU carries an S-MPDU or an A-MPDU that includes only one MPDU with EOF = 1 soliciting an immeidate response, and if a UMR	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:06:47Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13742	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	21	T	Y	240.21000067138672	21	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	A single TID A-MPDU may include the following: One frame with a single TID value with the Ack Policy field equal to Normal Ack or one Action frame and	If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU carries an A-MPDU that includes one or more MPDU, and if one or more MPDU from only one TID solicits an immediate resp	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:07:37Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1062 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13743	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	26	T	Y	240.25999450683594	26	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	18/0027r4	554	In an multi-TID A-MPDU, MPDUs from different TIDs don't have to have the same Ack Policy value. Therefore, a non ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU may cont	If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU carries an S-MPDU or an A-MPDU that includes only one MPDU with EOF = 1 soliciting an immeidate response, and if a UMR	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-16 19:08:22Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated the text. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0027-04-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13744	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	64	T	Y	251.63999938964844	64	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0343r0	532	The STA may aggregate QoS data frame as long as the QoS Data frame does not solicit an immediate response (e.g., Ack Policy set to No Ack)	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:42:08Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 13744. Revisited Revis	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:54:00Z-	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1063 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13745	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	62	T	Y	303.61999951171875	62	27.10.4.3		J	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	If the originator transmitted an ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU, the originator would have set the duration field long enough to contain an M-BA frame.	It is better for the recipient to respond with an M-BA frame when the received A-MPDU contains an error, if the given duration or the length in the tr	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:42:00Z) Rejected Discussion: a responder normally doesn't know the duration alloc ated to the solicited acknowledgement	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13746	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	10	T	Y	249.10000610351562	10	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0741r3	616	If the CS required field is set to 0, the AP is soliciting an immediate response from the STA. In this case, the STA shall not transmit any MPDU solic	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 01:28:28Z) D2.3 already covers this. See 27.5.3.2.3 (D2.3 P278L52) TGax editor: No further changes are needed	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:02:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13747	Woojin Ahn	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	80	35	E	Y	80.3499984741211	35	9.3.1.9.7		A			447	Per STA Info	Per AID TID Info	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:14:13Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 17:14:17Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13748	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.1	235	55	E	Y	235.55000305 17578	55	27.4.1		A			447	Per STA Info	Per AID TID Info	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:01:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:01:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1064 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13749	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.2	237	11	E	Y	237.11000061035156	11	27.4.2		A			447	unique AID TID Info fields	unique per AID TID Info fields	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:12:02Z) - Capital P	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:12:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13750	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.2	239	17	E	Y	239.16999816 89453	17	27.4.4.2		A			447	Action Ack frame	Action frame	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:48:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:48:35Z - see #12584	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13751	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	11	E	Y	240.11000061035156	11	27.4.4.4		A			447	Action-Ack frame	Action frame	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:52:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:52:07Z - see #12584	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13752	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	17	E	Y	240.16999816 89453	17	27.4.4.4		A			447	Action-Ack frame	Action frame	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:52:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:52:20Z - see #12584	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13753	Woojin Ahn	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	34	E	Y	240.33999633789062	34	27.4.4.4		A			447	Action Ack frame	Action frame	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:52:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 22:52:35Z - see #12584	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13754	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.1	58	8	T	N	58.080001831 05469	8	9.2.4.6.4.1		V	Yongho Seok	161r7	575	The current A-Control subfield will have problems with future expansion; if a STA encounters an unknown Control ID, effectively, it cannot parse any o	Address this issue so that even if a STA encounters a unknown control ID, it still can parse the remainder of the A Control subfield	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 22:35:30Z) Revised- Per Draft 2.0, the only possible unknown Control IDs are the reserved values. So if a Control subfield	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:18:58Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1065 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13755	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	58	T	N	59.580001831 05469	58	9.2.4.6.4.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0369r4	541	It is not clear to what this "it" refers. Please clarify whether this " it" is the A-MPDU, or the preceeding PPDU.	Change ", and it might additionally" to " which might additionally"	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:53:00Z) Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0369r1 for CID 13755	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:37:17Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13756	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	60	4	T	N	60.040000915 527344	4	9.2.4.6.4.2		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0740r1	639	The note should be removed since discussions on using BCC and LDPC doesn't belong to the format where no coding is mentioned.	Remove the note	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:51:54Z) Agree with the comment. 27.5.3.3 covers this (see D2.3, P281 L50) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in d	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 22:20:27Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1066 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13757	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	61	4	T	N	61.040000915527344	4	9.2.4.6.4.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	The sentence "NOTE--The Rx NSS subfield indicates the maximum number of spatial streams at bandwidths that are same as or narrower than 80 MHz." is w	Change the sentence to "NOTE--The Rx NSS subfield indicates the maximum number of spatial streams at bandwidths that are equal to less than 80 MHz."	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:14:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:54:33Z - bandwidths by itself is meaningless. I assume this is PPDU bandwidths. Why we need to have note when the reader could j	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13758	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	30	E	N	66.300003051 75781	30	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	The word "reponds" is spelled incorrectly	change "reponds" to "respond"?	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:17:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:17:36Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13759	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4.	66	35	T	N	66.349998474 1211	35	9.2.4.6.4.4.		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	The Figure XXXX should not be left without a correct reference	add the correct reference	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:03:15Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution fixes the typo as suggested. TGax editor to make the chang	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1067 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13760	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.5	68	33	T	N	68.33000183105469	33	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	It is not clear how the ACI High field should be set. Please clarify. At least the reference to Figure 9-18d doesn't seem to be correct.	Please clarify how the ACI High field is to be set; correct the reference to the correct ACI setting figure or table.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13761	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	27.5.5.3	260		T	N	260		27.5.5.3		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0695r4	624	"If the HE TB PPDU is not successfully transmitted in the selected random access RU, then the STA shall update its OCW to 2OCW + 1 when the OCW is les	Change the phrase "update its OCW to 2OCW+1" to "update its OCW to min(2OCW+1, OCWmax)."	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:23:24Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0695r4 that are marked with CID 13761	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13762	Xiaofei Wang	230	2	27.5.5	257	10	T	N	257.10000061035156	10	27.5.5		J	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	I disagree with the resolution of CID 9448. Using just one OBO counter, a STA can directly search for the random access RU, though in the case of a se	Using just the OBO counter for selection of random access RU and simplify the UORA process.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:09:06Z) The number of RA-RUs per Trigger frame is not the same. So using the OBO counter for the selection of the RA-RU	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:24:36Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1068 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13763	Xiaogang Chen	230	2	28.3.16	484	64	T	N	484.64001464 84375	64	28.3.16		V	Yongho Seok		614	"If the Beamformed field in HE-SIG-A of an HE NDP PPDU is 1, then the receiver of the HE NDP PPDU shall not perform channel smoothing when generating	should follow the exact name in HE-SIG-A which is TxBF field.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:29:26Z) - Change the Beamformed field to the TxBF field. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:48:02Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
13764	Xiaogang Chen	230	2	28.3.10.7	412	33	T	N	412.32998657 22656	33	28.3.10.7		V	Youhan	11-18/0934r1	596	Since 20MHz channel is not aligned with 242 tone RU in 80MHz, the 20 MHz channel cannot be fully punctured because some RU in adjacent 20 MHz may overla	Add the following clarifications after P.L. 412.33 "If an AP indicate preamble puncture in a HEMU PPDU by setting the Bandwidth field in HE-SIG-A in	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:37:14Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11418, 12580, 12796 and 13764 in 11-18/0934r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1069 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13765	Xiaogang Chen	230	2	28.3.18.1	485	38	T	N	485.38000048828125	38	28.3.18.1		J	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	"The bandwidth of the spectral mask applied to an HE SU PPDU, an HE TB PPDU and an HE MU PPDU with the Bandwidth subfield of the HE-SIG-A field equal	Add the following sentence before the last sentence of P.L. 485.46. "The bandwidth of the spectral mask applied to an 20MHz only STA shall be 20MHz re	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:33:31Z) The 20MHz-only STA can only transmit HE SU PPDU and HE MU PPDU using 20MHz spectral mask. For HE TB PPDU, 20 MHz	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:01:21Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13766	Xiaogang Chen	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	96	62	T	N	96.62000274658203	62	9.3.1.23.8		J	Laurent Cariou		657	The HE TB NDP short feedback trigger frame has only one user inform field and could only address a large group of continuous STAs which may be ineffic	Propose to add more user info field to be able to address distributed clients. The commentor will come up with a contribution.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1070 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13767	Xiaogang Chen	230	2	28.3.17	485	12	T	N	485.11999511 71875	12	28.3.17		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	Figure 28-44--HE TB NDP feedback PPDU format, HE-STF duration should be 8us instead of 4us	change HE-STF duration to be 8us	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:05:25Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 13767) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:04:45Z - see #11892	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13768	Xiaogang Chen	230	2	27.5.6.2.1	261	29	T	N	261.29000854 49219	29	27.5.6.2.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	"PSDU_LENGTH shall be set to 0". PSDU_LENGTH should be APEP_LENGTH because it's in Tx side	change PSDU_LENGTH to APEP_LENGTH	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:21:24Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	No specific instructions in 149 related to this CID. All changes in 18/149r3 carried out in D2.3		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13769	Xiayu Zheng	230	2	9.4.2.245	159	39	E	N	159.38999938 964844	39	9.4.2.245		A			648	In Table 9-262ag, The value "0-62" should have the corresponding Description as "-100 dBm to -38 dBm". The current Description is "-100 dBm to -37 d	As in the comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:13:42Z) - Already fixed with #13182. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:14:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1071 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13770	Xun Yang	230	2	9.2.4.1	53	28	T	Y	53.279998779296875	28	9.2.4.1		J			657	There is no clear statement on the setting of reserved btis in Frame Control of CTS, e.g., power management subfield, Protected Frame subfield, etc. R	Clearly to set the reseved values to 0 when CTS is transmitted in simultaneous CTS mode.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13771	Yan Zhang	230	2	28.3.10.7	411	43	T	N	411.42999267578125	43	28.3.10.7		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	"B10 is set to 0 if the TXVECTOR parameter MIDAMBLE_PERIODICITY is 10 and set to 0 if the TX VECTOR parameter PREAMBLE_PERIODICITY is 20." should be "B	As in comment	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:00:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:27:12Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1072 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13772	Yan Zhang	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	5	E	N	475.04998779296875	5	28.3.11.16		A	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	The statement "An HE SU PPDU with midamble containing 1x HE-LTF may only be sent to STAs that set the Doppler Rx subfield to 1 and the Midamble Rx 2x	Please change to "An HE SU PPDU with midamble containing 1x HE-LTF may only be sent to STAs that set the Doppler Rx subfield to 1, the Midamble Rx 2x	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:53:47Z) Note, resolved in 12725/12726 already	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:08:54Z - 28.3.11.16 contain st MAC protocol descriptions that belong in Clause 27 (e.g., recipient capability restrictions for tr	N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:02:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13773	Yan Zhang	230	2	28.3.10.9	435	49	T	N	435.48999023 4375	49	28.3.10.9		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	The statement "αr is the power boost factor for the r-th RU. A STA shall support αr in the range [0.7, sqrt(2)]. A STA may support	Change to "αr is defined in 28.3.9 (Mathematical description of signals)."	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:49:07Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13377 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6. Notes, "CID 13377" is a typo in 11-18/11	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13774	Yan Zhang	230	2	28.3.10.10	451	47	T	N	451.47000122 07031	47	28.3.10.10		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	THE-LTF in Equations (28-53) and (28-54) should be THE-LTF-SYM	As in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:00:58Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID13774 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 21:52:03Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1073 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13775	Yanchun Li	230	2	27.6	263	1	T	Y	263.01000976 5625	1	27.6		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	11ax adopts UL MU MIMO scheme. However, it is lack of coordination scheme to control non-AP STAs' UL precoding vectors. In such situation, severe inte		REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:05:59Z) Inter-STA interference is an inherent property of the wireless medium, which has been tackled via multiple existi	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 16:43:35Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13776	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.6.3	266	53	T	Y	266.52999877 92969	53	27.6.3		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Fix the field name to OM Control (also appears on P267L1)	Change OMI Control field to OM Control field	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:01:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13777	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.1	270	36	E	Y	270.35998535 15625	36	27.7.1		A			447	Change 'does need not' to ' does not need'	As in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:54:40Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:54:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13778	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.1	271	1	T	Y	271.01000976 5625	1	27.7.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	rr42	598	The note in its current form is misleading. AP can't be unavailable outside TWT SPs. It may have legacy or STAs that don't support TWT STAs associatin	Either remove the note or clarify that the AP employs other mechanisms to signal to STAs not supporting TWT that it is unavailable outside the TWT SP	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:57:27Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution is to clarify that the AP may set the TWT required bit to 1 if	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1074 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13779	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.2	272	45	T	Y	272.45001220703125	45	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	44r2	598	There is no such frame as TWT Request frame or TWT Response frame. The comment applies to several such instances in this section.	Add spec text to clarify that all reference to TWT Request frames indicate a TWT Setup frame carrying a TWT element with Request subfield set to 1. Co	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 20:59:42Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes, clarifying these terms in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13780	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.2	273	37	T	Y	273.36999511 71875	37	27.7.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1861R1	473	The TA of a TF may be transmitted BSSID under certain conditions (e.g., AP belongs to a multiple BSSID set and TF is addressed to STAs belonging to mo	Replace the sentence as: "The Trigger frame can have multiple recipients, each of which is identified by the presence of the 12 LSBs of the recipient'	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:20:45Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The note was updated to capture the single BSSID case where the TA field is set	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:33:04Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1075 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13781	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.1	274	24	T	Y	274.23999023 4375	24	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	739r1	608	The condition needs to include Trigger sub field = 1	Replace the second bullet as: " - The TWT Flow Identifier sub field is set to 2, Trigger subfield is set to 1, and the AP has scheduled transmission of	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:48:44Z) Revised Agree with the comment. TGax editor, please make changes as showing document 11-18/0739r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13782	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.1	274	28	T	Y	274.27999877 92969	28	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	739r1	608	An AP can bind a STA to a particular B-TWT schedule only if the STA has indicated support for Broadcast TWT via HE Cap	Clarify that the statement applies only if the STA has indicated support for Broadcast TWT by setting the Broadcast TWT Supported bit to 1 in HE Capab	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:49:34Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The sentence was revised as suggested by the comment. TGax editor, please make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13783	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.1	274	45	T	Y	274.45001220703125	45	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	662r1	618	Statement related to Wake TBTT should not be included in section Broadcast TWT. The two procedures are different and should be described in separate s	Delete sentence describing TWT Schedule STA setting Wake TBTT.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 03:41:59Z) Revised – The sentence is a cross-reference to a procedure that can be used together with broadcast TWT (reflect	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13784	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	7	T	Y	275.07000732421875	7	27.7.3.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	662r1	618	Keep broadcast TWT operation separate from Wake TBTT negotiation	Remove content related to wake TBTT from figure 27-8. Add a new figure in the section on Wake TBTT to describe the operation related to Wake TBTT. Als	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 03:42:57Z) Revised – The presence of different features in a figure does not necessarily cause confusion, especially when	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1077 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13785	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.2	275	59	T	Y	275.58999633 78906	59	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	The Implicit subfield is overloaded when Broadcast subfield is 1. It is called the 'Last Broadcast Parameter Set' subfield and indicates whether or no	Update the sentence to remove reference to the Implicit subfield. Add a new sentence with makes reference to the overloaded subfield name and describe	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:07:05Z) Revised – Agree with the comment. The Implicit subfield is not present in a broadcast TWT element, as it is used	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13786	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.2	276	4	T	Y	276.04000854 49219	4	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	The procedure to update or terminate a b-TWT schedule doesn't work for STAs in lower power mode that have negotiated a long Wake TBTT schedule (or hav	Increasing the size of the Broadcast TWT Persistence field to at least 1 octet. Define an encoding scheme so the field can represent larger intervals	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:08:03Z) Revised – This was already addressed as part of the comment resolution for CID 11005, which most of the changes	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1078 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13787	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.2	276	8	T	Y	276.07998657 22656	8	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	An AP should indicate the new set of TWT parameters when advertising an upcoming change to the schedule	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:08:46Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested changes. TGax edi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13788	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.2	276	24	T	Y	276.23999023 4375	24	27.7.3.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	663r2	647	It is not clear if Trigger subfield = 0 means AP shall not be transmitting any TFs during the TWT SPs corresponding to that TWT schedule.	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:10:03Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies that the AP does not intend to tran	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:54:57Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13789	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.3	279	37	T	Y	279.36999511 71875	37	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	662r1	618	The 1st sentence of the 1st paragraph in (section 27.7.3.2) defines Broadcast TWT. Move this to the beginning of section 27.7.1 since it applies to th	As in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 03:43:49Z) Revised – The sentence refers to the broadcast TWT section as such the correct section should be 27.7.3.1 (Gener	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13790	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.3	280	62	T	Y	280.61999511 71875	62	27.7.3.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	664r1	625	A TWT Scheduled STA can send a new request if the previous request with TWT Setup Command = Suggest or Demand had failed	Add the following sentence at the end of existing text to row 5 column 'Condition after the completion of the exchange' : "The TWT scheduled STA can se	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:01:42Z) Revised – Agree in principle. The behavior is not with any set of TWT parameters, but with the parameters specif	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1080 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13791	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.3.4	282	8	T	Y	282.07998657 22656	8	27.7.3.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	373r0	551	The procedure and purpose of Wake TBTT TWT is quite different from Broadcast TWT. Therefore, Wake TBTT should be in a section of its own (not under Br	Move the contents under 27.7.3.4 to a section of its own (e.g., 27.7.4 and increment section number of subsequent sections).	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 04:19:24Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13792	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.4.3	282	49	T	Y	282.48999023 4375	49	27.7.4.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	371r2	549	Add text to provide reference to the section where Flexible TWT Schedule Support subfield is described (several occurance in this section)	Provide reference to HE Cap (9.4.2.237.2 and Table 9-262z) where Flexible TWT Schedule Supported subfield is described.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-14 03:43:06Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Proposed resolution adds clarification that the field is obtained from the HE capa	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 20:52:45Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1081 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13793	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.5	284	58	T	Y	284.57998657 22656	58	27.7.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	370r2	548	As described in section 27.7.4, a TWT Information field/frame provides a mechanism to suspend and resume TWT sessions.	Remove or update paragraph starting line 58	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:19:31Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies further this aspect by removing the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13794	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.7.5	286	43	T	Y	286.42999267 578125	43	27.7.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	1861R1	473	The TA of a TF may be transmitted BSSID under certain conditions (e.g., AP belongs to a multiple BSSID set and TF is addressed to STAs belonging to mo	Replace the first sentence in the note 2 as: " A Trigger frame, sent by the TWT scheduling AP, is defined as intended for the TWT scheduled STA when th	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 06:21:28Z) Revised Agree with the comment. The note was updated to capture the single BSSID case where the TA field is set	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 17:33:19Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13795	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.11.2	304	48	T	Y	304.48001098 63281	48	27.11.2		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0629r1	613	Replace all 1s with UNSPECIFIED	As in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:36:29Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0629r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1082 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13796	Yanjun Sun	230	2	27.14.2	313	5	T	Y	313.04998779296875	5	27.14.2		V	Jeongki Kim	1-17/1849r2	482	The paragraph on random access for unassociated STAs is an odd fit in this section as some of the power states do not apply to unassociated STAs. Rand	Define a new section on random access for unassociated STAs and move this paragraph along with other content (e.g., BSS Color & reference channel	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:14:42Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 13796	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 19:28:23Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13797	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2		2	3	T	Y	2.0299999713897705	3			V		18/0397r2	574	"Abstract: This amendment defines modifications to both the IEEE 802.11 physical layer (PHY) and the medium access control (MAC) sublayer for high eff	As in the comment.	agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 18/0397r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #12302	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1083 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13798	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2		4	12	T	Y	4.119999885559082	12			V		18/0397r2	574	"This amendment defines modifications to both the IEEE 802.11 physical layer (PHY) and the medium access control (MAC) sublayer for high efficiency op	As in the comment.	agree with the commenter. Make the changes as in doc 18/0397r2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #12302	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13799	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	3.2	32	55	E	N	32.54999923706055	55	3.2		A			447	"user: An individual station or group of stations (STAs) identified by a single receive address (RA) or a STAID ..." RA is receiver address, not rece	Change "receive address" to "receiver address".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:12:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 22:12:38Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1084 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13800	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	3.2	33	35	G	Y	33.349998474121094	35	3.2		J			657	"high efficiency (HE) extended range (ER) single-user (SU) physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (PPDU): An HE PPDU transmitted with HE ER SU PPDU f	This definition should be deleted.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13801	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	3.2	34	3	T	Y	34.029998779296875	3	3.2		J			657	"high efficiency (HE) trigger-based (TB) physical layer protocol data unit (PPDU): An HE PPDU transmitted with HE TB PPDU format that is capable of ca	The last part of the sentence should be "for one user."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1085 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13802	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	Y	34.569999969482422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"SRP PPDU: a PPDU that is a DSRP_PPDU" We do not need more than one term to mean exactly the same thing. Rather than defing two terms, we should use	Current definition for "SR_PPDU" is more appropriate for "SRP PPDU" since it is a PPDU transmitted during an SRP opportunity by an HE STA when SRP co	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:58:03Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13802. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13803	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	4.3.14a	37	12	T	Y	37.119998931884766	12	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"The IEEE 802.11 HE STA operates in frequency bands between 1 GHz and 6 GHz." 6 GHz should be changed to 7.125 GHz.	As in the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:33:42Z) Revised. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12205	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13804	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	4.3.14a	37	51	G	N	37.509998321 5332	51	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	705r4	643	"Mandatory support for an AP to receive and optional an AP to transmit operating mode indication" This sentence can be improved.	Mandatory support for an AP to receive operating mode indication (OMI). Transmission of OMI is optional for AP.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:43:14Z) Revised. Editorial changes. TGax editor to make changes shown in 11-18/705r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 19:35:11Z - Transmit and receive OMI is not defined. The procedure refers to OMI initiator and responder so using those terms. Also	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1086 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13805	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	4.3.14a	37	54	T	Y	37.540000915527344	54	4.3.14a		J	Guoqing Li	705r4	634	"Mandatory support for a non-AP STA and optional support for an AP for two NAV operation" Two NAV operation should be mandatory for both non-AP STA	As in the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:43:57Z) Reject. The spec does not mandage two NAV for AP, so no changes are needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 19:56:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13806	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	4.3.14a	37	65	G	N	37.650001525878906	65	4.3.14a		V	Guoqing Li	1857r2	470	"Mandatory support in a non-AP STA for Multi-BSSID" The text can be improved.	Mandatory support for non-AP STA to receive Multi-BSSID element.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:50:19Z) Revised The term Multi-BSS or an element by that name doesn't exist. The text in this section was modified to in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:48:21Z - see #11000	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1087 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13807	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	8.3.4.2	43	7	T	Y	43.06999969482422	7	8.3.4.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Table 8-2 should be updated to include PHY-TRIGGER primitive.	As in the comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:12:27Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13808	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	8.3.4.3	43	8	T	Y	43.08000183105469	8	8.3.4.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Table 8-3 should be updated to include TRIGVECTOR.	As in the comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:13:18Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13809	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	8.3.4.4	45	15	T	Y	45.150001525878906	15	8.3.4.4		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	New parameters added to the Table 8-4 is exactly the same as Table 28-2 (TRIGVECTOR parameters). In the base standard, it is written that "Table 8-4 l	As in the comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:13:42Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13810	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	8.3.5.18	50	24	T	Y	50.240001678 4668	24	8.3.5.18		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	The description for PHY-TRIGGER.requesst saying "This primitive is a request by the MAC sublayer to the local PHY entity to provide parameters for the	The description for PHY-TRIGGER.confirm looks reasonable, the text for PHY-TRIGGER.request should, e.g., be changed to: "This primitive is a request b	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:44:51Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13811	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.2.4.6.4	58	3	E	Y	58.029998779296875	3	9.2.4.6.4		J			447	The title for subclause 9.2.4.6.4 should Aggregated Control (A-Control) rather than A-Control.	As in the comment.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:37:53Z) - It is silly to spell out the abbreviation for field names. They are just names.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 23:38:23Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1089 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13812	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	61	7	T	Y	61.06999969482422	7	9.2.4.6.4.3		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"The VHT channel width and the NHT NSS allowed at an HE STA ..." This part of the text including the Table 9-18b (Setttting of the VHT Channel Width a	As in the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:15:12Z) revised. Agree in principle. Make the changes shown in this 11-17-0035r5 submission and identified for the CID 13	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:47:58Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13813	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	62	51	T	Y	62.509998321 5332	51	9.2.4.6.4.4		J	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	Subclause 9.2.4.6.4.4 (HLA Control) needs to be improved.	As in the comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:04:05Z) Rejected. The comment does not identify a technical issue.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:55:09Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13814	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.4.1.17	103	49	T	Y	103.48999786376953	49	9.4.1.17		J			657	"An HEAP sets the More Data Ack subfield to 1 to indicate that it can generate individually addressed Ack, BlockAck, and Multi-STA BlockAck frames wi	As in the comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1090 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13815	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.4.1.53	105	4	T	Y	105.04000091552734	4	9.4.1.53		J			657	"When the STA that transmits the Operating Control field (STA1) and ..." Operating Control field undefined.	It should be Operating Mode field. The same expression appears in other part of the table, e.g., in line 10 and 11.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13816	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.4.2.139	123	25	T	Y	123.25	25	9.4.2.139		V	Ming Gan	432r1	545	"When this sub field set to 0 in the ADDBA Response frame, it indicates that the recipient is not capable of receiving fragmented MSDUs or A-MSDU if su	Clarify, please.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 20:35:39Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Change “is not capable of receiving” to “does not receive”, and change “is capable	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 21:08:39Z - For level 0 it does not matter if the recipient supports fragmented A-MSDUs so the "(if supported)" is unnecessary. Say	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13817	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	9.6.8.36	161		T	Y	161		9.6.8.36		J			657	Vendor Specific element is removed from the Table 9-325a (FILS Discovery frame format).	Add "Vendor Specific element" at the bottom of the table 9-325a.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1091 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13818	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	10.2.1	178	12	T	Y	178.11999511 71875	12	10.2.1		V			648	"The UMTA is present in HE non-AP STAs and absent otherwise." It should not be limited to the HE non-AP STAs since this feature also relates to the H	Change "HE non-AP STAs" to "HE STAs"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:35:00Z) - UMTA removed with resolution to #13042 which introduced a new term TUA. Comment still applies. Change "UMTA	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 21:36:39Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13819	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	10.2.1	178	14	T	Y	178.13999938 964844	14	10.2.1		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	"The UORA is optionally present in HE non-AP STAs and absent otherwise." It should not be limited to the HE non-AP STAs since this feature also relat	Change "HE non-AP STAs" to "HE STAs"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13820	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	10.7.1	186	42	E	N	186.41999816 89453	42	10.7.1		A			447	"Clause 28 for HE" Use of the same expression with the previous items will be preferred.	"Clause 28 for HE" should be "Clause 28 (High Efficiency (HE) PHY specification) for HE"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:55:37Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 18:55:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1092 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13821	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	10.7.5.8	187	15	E	N	187.14999389648438	15	10.7.5.8		A			447	<HE-MCS. NSS> should be <HE-MCS, NSS>	As in the comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:01:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:01:37Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13822	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	10.13.1	192	57	E	Y	192.57000732421875	57	10.13.1		V			447	"When an A-MPDU contains multiple QoS Control fields, bits 4 shall be identical across all MPDUs that contain the QoS Control fields and bits 8-15 of	"When an A-MPDU contains multiple QoS Control fields, bits 4 and bits 8-15 of these QoS Control fields shall be identical across all MPDUs."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:58:38Z) - Change the sentence to read: "If an A-MPDU contains multiple QoS Control fields, then bit 4 of the QoS Contro	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:59:17Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13823	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.2.2	222	11	E	N	222.11000061035156	11	27.2.2		A			447	"The PPDU carries a frame that has a BSSID field, the value of which is not the BSSID of the BSS or any BSS that is a member of the same multiple BSSI	Removed one.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1093 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13824	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.2.3	223	1	T	Y	223.00999450683594	1	27.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"A received HE PPDU that is an inter-BSS PPDU is an SRG PPDU if the bit in the SRG BSS Color Bitmap field which corresponds to the numerical value of	As in the comment,	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:11:50Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13824	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13825	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.2.5.1	225	31	T	Y	225.30999755859375	31	27.2.5.1		A	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	"DL MU PPDU to STA1 and STA2" in figure 27-1 should be "HEMU PPDU to STA1 and STA2" to explicitly show that this frame sequence is for the HE STAs.	As in the comment.	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:36:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 22:01:39Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13826	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.3.1	229	35	E	Y	229.35000610351562	35	27.3.1		A			447	"An HE STA may also support the dynamic fragmentation procedure defined in this subclause), which ..." ")" is not necessary.	Remove the ")".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:57:08Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:57:12Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13827	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.5.2	243	27	T	Y	243.27000427246094	27	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	"A STA may send BQRs to an AP to assist DL MU and UL MU resource allocation in an efficient way." This text is ambiguous compared to the other senten	Improve the text, e.g., "A non-AP HE STA may send BQRs to the AP with which it is associated to assist DL MU and UL MU resource allocation in an effic	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:11:33Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 13827	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:36:48Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13828	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	16	G	Y	246.16000366210938	16	27.5.3.2.2		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/075r3	564	"B_{SYM} is the OFDM symbol of the PPDU that contains either the last bit of SCH when BCC is ..." SCH should be listed in clause 3.4.	As in the comment.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:03:55Z) Discussion: SCH is defined in the same paragraph where it is used, and SCH is not the first letters of three word	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:36:51Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1095 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13829	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	33	T	Y	248.33000183 10547	33	27.5.3.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"A non-AP HESTA operating in an operating class for which the behavior limits set listed in Annex E includes the DFS_50_100_Behavior shall not transm	As in the comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:48:07Z) D2.3 (P279L34) has already re-written the referenced text for better clarity as per resolution to CID 11318 in 11	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:47:41Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13830	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	50	E	Y	248.5	50	27.5.3.3		A			447	"... in either the Common Info field or the User Info field addressed to the STA with values are not recognized or not supported by the STA." shoud b	As in the comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:10:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:11:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13831	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	31	E	Y	290.30999755859375	31	27.9.2.1		V		17/1852r8	474	"... with a value equal to BUSY followed by an RXSTART.indication due to a PPDU reception then ..." "an RXSTART.indication" should be "a PHY-RXSTART.	As in the comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:23:35Z) - agree with the commenter. Apply the proposed changes in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13832	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	30	G	Y	296.29998779296875	30	27.9.3.1		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	RPL should be listed in 3.4.	As in the comment.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:26:12Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13832	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13833	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	38	T	Y	296.38000488281250	38	27.9.3.1		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"The value of the Spatial Reuse information of the SIGA SRP field of the HETB PPDU that ..." This text is ambiguous and should be improved.	Following text will be better. " The value of the Spatial Reuse field in HE-SIG-A of the HETB PPDU that ..."	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:31:20Z) - the value to be used is not actually the value of the field, but a value that is based on the field value after	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1097 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13834	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	45	E	Y	296.45001220703125	45	27.9.3.1		A			648	"... the Trigger frame DUR field value." "DUR" should be "Duration."	As in the comment.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:50:57Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:51:00Z - see #14293	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13835	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.10.2	299	27	G	Y	299.26998901 36719	27	27.10.2		V	Liwen Chu	427r2	630	"ack-enabled A-MPDU" should be listed in clause 3.	As in the comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:28:35Z) Revised TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0427r2 under CID 13835	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 23:00:03Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13836	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	27.16.1	319	35	G	Y	319.35000610 35156	35	27.16.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	338r2	547	"... when the STA is a 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA in which case the Supported Channel Width Set subfield of the VHT Capabilities element is reserved."	Definition of 20 MHz-only non-AP STA may have to be changed if it is supposed to be a VHT STA.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:12:35Z) Rejected – This subclause is related to the HE BSS operation. I.e., the STA is associating to an HE AP, wherein	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 20:35:26Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1098 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13837	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	28.1.1	327	32	G	Y	327.32000732421875	32	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	"The HE PHY with 20 MHz-only capability (see 28.3.9 (Mathematical description of signals)) is based on the HT PHY defined in Clause 19, which in turn	Definition of 21 MHz-only non-AP STA may have to be changed if it is supposed to be a VHT STA.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:37:57Z) Please refer to CID 13628 discussion and resolution of CID 13837 as in 11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:39:09Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13838	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2	Annex G	595	63	T	Y	595.63000488281250	63	Annex G		J			657	There will be more HE frame sequences.	Add relevant HE frame sequences.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13839	Yasuhiko Inoue	230	2				G	Y					V			648	There are inconsistent expression of meaning the same thing such as "HE non-AP STA" and "non-AP HE STA".	with equal value of the TID subfield.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:24:33Z) - Through resolutions to other comments, the draft consistently uses "non-AP HE STA". No further change require	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-17 22:25:18Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1099 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13840	Yonggang Fang	230	2		2	3	G	Y	2.0299999713897705	3			V			648	As the 802.11ax PAR was amended to extend operating frequency beyond 6GHz, the sentence of "This amendment defines modifications to both the IEEE 802.	TBD	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-16 16:08:51Z) - Change 6 to 7.125	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-16 16:09:11Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13841	Yonggang Fang	230	2		2	7	G	Y	2.0699999333242798	7			J			447	Add ULMU-MIMO in the key words as it is a new feature of 11ax.	Add ULMU-MIMO	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:06:55Z) - UL and MU-MIMO are both present	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:07:14Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13842	Yonggang Fang	230	2	3.2	34	24	E	Y	34.2400016784668	24	3.2		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	When multiple STAs perform OFDMA random access, they have to send UL HE PPDU simultaneously over the allocated RUs. It needs to emphasizes "simultaneo	Add "simultaneously" in the definition.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. "participation in uplink OFDMA transmissions" is also problematic. How does a STA participate in a transmission? A STA simply transmits.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1100 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13843	Yonggang Fang	230	2	3.2	34	57	E	Y	34.569999969482422	57	3.2		J	Matt Fischer	18/0525r1	572	SRP needs to be defined when it is used first time	Define SRP	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:15:38Z) - SRP Acronym is defined in Clause 3.4 and SRP Operation is defined in 27.9.3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical issue	N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:21:57Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13844	Yonggang Fang	230	2	4.3.14a	37	51	E	Y	37.509998321 5332	51	4.3.14a		A			447	Add "for" between "optional" and "an AP"	Change to "Mandatory support for an AP to receive and optional for an AP to transmit operating mode indication"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:04:50Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:04:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13845	Yonggang Fang	230	2	6.3.7.4.2	41	10	E	Y	41.099998474121094	10	6.3.7.4.2		J	Jae Seung	17/1766r2	576	It is not clear "parameter" in the sentence of "The parameter is present if it is present in the Association Request frame received from the STA" Doe	Please clarify	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:33:32Z) - Since “the parameter” is in the singular form, it means “HE Capabilities”. Similar sentences are used in the	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical comment	N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 23:33:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1101 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13846	Yonggang Fang	230	2	9.3.1.23	92	26	T	Y	92.26000213623047	26	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	What size of RU is used for random access? 26-tone RU?	Please clarify	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:21:11Z) Agree with the comment that RU allocation for RA-RU case was not clear. Please see resolution to CID 11738. TGax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:15:09Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13847	Yonggang Fang	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	28	E	Y	108.27999877929688	28	9.4.1.62		V			447	What is RU26? 26-tone RU?		REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 18:04:49Z) - Should be "26-tone RU"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 18:05:24Z - see #12768	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13848	Yonggang Fang	230	2	9.4.2.242.1	193	33	G	Y	193.33000183 10547	33	9.4.2.242.1		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	443r3	534	Is the quiet period only for the per stations (i.e. requesting STA and AP) not to transmit, or for all the STAs in the BSS not to transmit?		REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 22:26:30Z) Rejected: It is to give peer stations a cleaner channel to transmit.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1102 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13849	Yonggang Fang	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	35	G	Y	157.35000610351562	35	9.4.2.243		J	Matt Fischer	18/0525r1	572	What is the definition of Spatial Reuse Group (SRG)? It would be better to provide the definition or explanation.		REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:14:41Z) - SRG Acronym is defined in Clause 3.4 and SRG Operation is defined in 27.2.3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:26:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13850	Yonggang Fang	230	2	27.5.2	243	4	G	Y	243.03999328061328	4	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	As a STA supports to send the BQR (Bandwidth Query Report) in unsolicited way via attaching BQR to any frame and in solicited way to respond to BQRP,	as suggested in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13851	Yonggang Fang	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	56	E	Y	257.55999755859375	56	27.5.5.1		A			447	change "Nontransmitted BSSID" to "nontransmitted BSSID"	as suggested in the comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:40:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:40:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1103 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13852	Yonggang Fang	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	39	T	Y	259.39001464 84375	39	27.5.5.2		V	Jeongki Kim	11-18/0063r1	490	How to determine whether a RU is idle or busy based on physical CS or virtual CS if the RU size is less than 20MHz? The CS can only measure the statu		REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:50:55Z) TGax editor: No further changes are required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:05:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13853	Yonggang Fang	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	65	E	Y	259.64999389 64844	65	27.5.5.2		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	The "otherwise" is not clear. If the HE TB PPDU does not solicit the immediate response from AP, should the HE TB PPDU transmission be considered as s		Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1104 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13854	Yonggang Fang	230	2	27.5.5.4	260	22	E	Y	260.22000122 07031	22	27.5.5.4		J			657	According to the text in the clause, suggest to change the title of "Acknowledgement for random access" to "Acknowledgement for unassociated random ac	as suggested in comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13855	Yonggang Fang	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	24	T	Y	293.23999023 4375	24	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Is the value of Non-SRG OBSS PD Max -82 or -62 for the case of OBSS_PD_SR Disallowed = 1?		REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:48:38Z) it's written in the table: -82dBm	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13856	Yongho Seok	230	2	3.2	34	57	T	Y	34.56999969482422	57	3.2		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"SRP PPDU: a PPDU that is a DSRP_PPDU" An SRP PPDU is equal to a DSRP_PPDU. So, a definition of an SRP PPDU is not needed.	Replace "SRP PPDU" with "DSRP_PPDU" throughout D2.0. And remove the definition of the SRP PPDU.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 08:58:39Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13856. Commenter should read the r	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1105 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13857	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	Y	55.200000762 93945	20	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	"When the frame is not carried in a DL HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU:" How about is an HE ER SU PPDU? If an HE SU PPDU can soli	Include an HE ER SU PPDU that solicit an HE TB PPDU. Otherwise, remove an HE SU PPDU.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:27:05Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #12258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13858	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	20	T	Y	55.200000762 93945	20	9.2.4.5.4		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	"When the frame is not carried in a DL HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU:" An HE SU PPDU has to be limited to DL.	Change as the following: "When the frame is not carried in a DL HE MU PPDU or DL HE SU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU:"	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:27:54Z) Rejected – There is no PPDU termed DL HE MU/SU PPDU. Since UL HE SU PPDU cannot solicit HE TB PPDU, from the co	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1106 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13859	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	Y	55.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.4		V	George Cherian	724r1	636	"When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ack, Block Ack, or Multi-STA BlockAck fram	Change as the following: "When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ac	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:28:41Z) Revised - Agree in principle. TGax editor shall incorporate changes in 11-18-0724-01-00ax	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 21:10:19Z - see #11258	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13860	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	30	T	Y	65.300003051 75781	30	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	"The HE-MCS subfield of the MFB subfield of HLA Control field should be set to the highest datarate, for given transmission properties, that results i	Remove the cited sentence. Or, move it to 27.13.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:05:00Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies the issue as suggested. TGax editor to make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:55:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1107 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13861	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.3.1.23	87	45	T	Y	87.449996948 24219	45	9.3.1.23		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	"The AP shall set the MU-MIMO LTF Mode subfield to single stream pilots if the triggered UL PPDU contains partial or full UL OFDMA allocation." Move t	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:20:16Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0065r2 that are marked with CID 13861	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13862	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.3.1.23.1	94	8	T	Y	94.080001831 05469	8	9.3.1.23.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/1105r3	469	"... is the value indicated in the Multi-TID Aggregation Support subfield in the HE MAC Capabilities Information field in the HE Capabilities element	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 06:31:52Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/1105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12379	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13863	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	97	11	T	Y	97.110000610 35156	11	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	"The CS Required subfield of the NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger frame may be set to 0." Clause 9 can't have "may" sentence.	Remove "may".	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:10:30Z) make the change as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	Resolved with #12294		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1108 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13864	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.1.62	106	39	E	Y	106.38999938964844	39	9.4.1.62		A			447	The HE Compressed Beamforming frame does not exist. Change "HE Compressed Beamforming frame" to "HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI frame".	Change "HE Compressed Beamforming frame" to "HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI frame".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:55:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-08 17:55:57Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13865	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.1.62	107	18	T	Y	107.18000030517578	18	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	When the Feedback Type is the CQI feedback, Nr Index shall be reserved. Please add this missing statement.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13866	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.1.62	107	34	T	Y	107.33999633789062	34	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	When the Feedback Type is the CQI feedback, Grouping shall be reserved. Please add this missing statement.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1109 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13867	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.1.62	107	39	T	Y	107.38999938964844	39	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	When the Feedback Type is the CQI feedback, Codebook Information shall be reserved. Please add this missing statement.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13868	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.1.62	108	19	T	Y	108.19000244140625	19	9.4.1.62		J	Liwen Chu		657	"The ending RU index indicates the last RU26 for which the HE beamformer is requesting feedback." Above explantion about the Sounding Dialog Token Num	Change as the following: "The sounding dialog token from the VHT/HE NDP Announcement frame soliciting feedback"	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13869	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.27	120	40	T	Y	120.40000015258789	40	9.4.2.27		A	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"If operating in an operating class for which the behavior limits set listed in Annex E does not include the DFS_50_100_Behavior then a STA sets the O	Remove the followings: "If operating in an operating class for which the behavior limits set listed in Annex E includes the DFS_50_100_Behavior then t	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:46:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:32:18Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1110 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13870	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.168	124	1	T	Y	124.01000213623047	1	9.4.2.168		J			657	Table 9-258 (Format And Bandwidth field) in the Fine Timing Measurement Parameters element have to include the HE PPDU format. Also update the related	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13871	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.174	124	1	T	Y	124.01000213623047	1	9.4.2.174		J			657	The Estimated Air Time Fraction in the Estimated Service Parameters element can only show an available air time for a contention based channel access.	As in comment.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1111 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13872	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	134	4	T	Y	134.03999328 61328	4	9.4.2.237.2		J	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	"+HTC-HE Support - Indicates support for the reception of an HE variant HT Control field carried in a QoS Data, QoS Null, or Management frame." All A-	Remove +HTC-HE Support bit from the HE MAC Capabilities Information field.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:20:45Z) Rejected- The HE variant HT Control field is used for many purposes. And the future amendment can defined addit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13873	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.237.2	135	10	T	Y	135.10000610 351562	10	9.4.2.237.2		V	Liwen Chu	105r3	469	"Multi-TID Aggregation Support - Indicates the number of TIDs minus 1 of QoS Data frames that an HE STA can aggregate in a multi-TID A-MPDU as describ	Please clarify a requirement of this support field.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 05:33:06Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/105r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	see #12379	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1112 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13874	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	6	T	Y	141.05999755859375	6	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"Indicates support for the transmission and reception of LDPC encoded packets." Which LDPC coding is supported? In 28.1.1, An HE STA shall support the	Please clearly specify what is supported. For example, refer 10.16 LDPC operation. 10.16 is how to indicate the LDPC support. Please revise the 10.16	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:46:43Z) Resolution of CID 11903 is applicable	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:05:56Z - see #11903	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13875	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	36	T	Y	141.36000061035156	36	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"For an AP, indicates support for MU-MIMO reception of an HE TB PPDU on an RU that spans the entire PPDU bandwidth (UL MU-MIMO)." The UL MU-MIMO is tr	Remove the cited sentence.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:47:50Z) UL MU-MIMO over full bandwidth is optional feature and hence requires signalling. With respect to AP, the signal	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:06:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1113 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13876	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	141	44	T	Y	141.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	"For an AP, indicates support for the reception of an HETB PPDU on an RU that does not span the entire PPDU bandwidth (UL MU-MIMO with OFDMA)." The U	Remove the cited sentence.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:48:03Z) UL MU-MIMO over partial bandwidth (UL MU-MIMO + UL OFDMA) is optional feature and hence requires signalling. Wit	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:06:15Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13877	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	52	T	Y	143.52000427246094	52	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r2	521	"Indicates support for the transmission and reception of the Data field of the HE ER SU PPDU when transmitted over the high frequency 106-tone RU with	Change as the following: "Indicates support for the reception of the Data field of the HE ER SU PPDU when transmitted over the high frequency 106-tone	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:40:48Z) Advertising transmit and receive support of HE ER SU PPDU over partial bandwidth is helpful for determining whet	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 21:43:19Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1114 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13878	Yongho Seok	230	2	9.7.3	173	29	T	Y	173.28999328 61328	29	9.7.3		V	Liwen Chu	426r6	656	"One frame with a single TID value with the Ack Policy field equal to Normal Ack or one Action frame, at least one of QoS Null frame with Ack Policy s	Change "at least one of" to "zero or more", like the first bullet.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-23 02:48:50Z) Revised Generally agree with the commenter. Additionally Action frame is changed to Management frame except Acti	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13879	Yongho Seok	230	2	10.22.2.5	195	54	T	Y	195.53999328 61328	54	10.22.2.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	Controlling mechanism of the MIB variable for enabling and disabling the per 20MHz bitmap is necessary.	Insert the following sentence: "An STA that sets dot11HEOptionImplemented to true shall set the dot11HECAIndicationMode to 0, except when the STA is	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:25:41Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1115 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13880	Yongho Seok	230	2	10.22.2.7	197	51	E	Y	197.50999450683594	51	10.22.2.7		A			447	The HE Compressed Beamforming frame does not exist. Change "HE Compressed Beamforming frames" to "HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI frames".	Change "HE Compressed Beamforming frames" to "HE Compressed Beamforming And CQI frames".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:01:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 21:01:38Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13881	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.2	222	37	E	Y	222.36999511 71875	37	27.2.2		A			447	Remove ')'.	Remove ')'.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:51Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13882	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.2	222	48	T	Y	222.47999572753906	48	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"If the received frame satisfies both intra-BSS and inter-BSS conditions, the decision made by using the MAC address takes precedence over the decisio	As in discussion and proposed change of 11-17/389r10, remove the following text. "If the received frame satisfies both intra-BSS and inter-BSS conditi	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1116 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13883	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.2	222	48	T	Y	222.47999572753906	48	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"If the received frame satisfies both intra-BSS and inter-BSS conditions, the decision made by using the MAC address takes precedence over the decisio	Insert the following sentence: "If the received frame satisfies both intra-BSS and inter-BSS conditions by using the MAC address, the received frame h	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13884	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.3	222	61	T	Y	222.61000061035156	61	27.2.3		J	Matt Fischer		657	"An HE STA that has received a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element from its associated AP with a value of 1 in the SRG Information Present subfield sh	Change as the following: "An HE STA that has transmitted or received a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element to/from its BSS with a value of 1 in the S	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13885	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.3	223	8	T	Y	223.08000018310547	8	27.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"A received PPDU that is an inter-BSS PPDU is an SRG PPDU if BSSID information from an MPDU of the PPDU is correctly received and the bit in the SRG P	Insert the following sentences: "When the MPDU is a Data or Management frame, the BSSID information is obtained from the BSSID field. When the MPDU is	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:13:33Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13885, noting to the commenter tha	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13886	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.3	223	13	T	Y	223.13000488281250	13	27.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"An HE STA that has not received a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element from its associated AP with a value of 1 in the SRG Information Present subfiel	Change as the following: "An HE STA that has not transmitted and not received a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element to /from its BSS with a value of 1	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:14:08Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13886	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13887	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.2.6	229	14	T	Y	229.13999938964844	14	27.2.6		V	Laurent Cariou	11-17/1828r4	485	"A non-AP HESTA should only send QoS Data frames in an HETB PPDU with ACs for which the STA's buffer queues contain frames that are only addressed t	Remove the cited sentence.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:37:02Z) Make the changes as defined in doc 1828r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:41:18Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13888	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.2	230	62	T	Y	230.61999511 71875	62	27.3.2.2		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"An originator STA may transmit to a recipient STA an MPDU or S-MPDU that contains one dynamic fragment of an MSDU that is sent under a block ack agre	Change "An originator STA may transmit to a recipient STA an MPDU or S-MPDU that contains one dynamic fragment of an MSDU that is sent under a block a	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:05:36Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1119 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13889	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.2	230	58	T	Y	230.58000183 10547	58	27.3.2.2		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"An originator STA may transmit to a recipient STA an MPDU or S-MPDU that contains one dynamic fragment of an A-MSDU if the recipient STA has indicate	Change "An originator STA may transmit to a recipient STA an MPDU or S-MPDU that contains one dynamic fragment of an A-MSDU if the recipient STA has i	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 05:32:48Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13890	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	26	T	Y	230.25999450 683594	26	27.3.2.1		J	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"An originator STA may retransmit a failed fragment when one or more of the previously transmitted fragments of that MSDU, A-MSDU, or MMPDU have expli	Change as the following: "An originator STA may retransmit a failed fragment when one or more of the previously transmitted fragments of that MSDU, A-	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:27:40Z) Rejected- The sentence the commenter referred to is the baseline, but this paragraph mainly focus on the explic	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:01:11Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1120 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13891	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	31	T	Y	230.30999755859375	31	27.3.2.1		V	Ming Gan	99r3	478	"...except when the all the fragments preceding the initial transmitted fragment were successfully received and all the fragments following the initia	Change as the following: "...except when the all the fragments preceding the initial transmitted fragment were successfully received and all the fragm	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 18:28:38Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 21:01:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13892	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.2	231	1	T	Y	231.00999450683594	1	27.3.2.2		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"For the block ack agreement associated with the TID of the MSDU, the ADDBA Extension element is present and the HE Fragmentation Operation subfield i	Change "For the block ack agreement associated with the TID of the MSDU, the ADDBA Extension element is present and the HE Fragmentation Operation sub	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:06:37Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13893	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.2	231	1	T	Y	231.00999450683594	1	27.3.2.2		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"... the ADDBA Extension element is present..." The rules for including the ADDBA Extension element in an ADDBA Request frame and ADDBA Response frame	Sepcify the rules for including the ADDBA Extension element.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 06:07:32Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Add a rule when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element in subse	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13894	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.3	231	20	T	Y	231.19999694 82422	20	27.3.2.3		V	Ming Gan	18/0433r1	544	"... the ADDBA Extension element is present..." The rules for including the ADDBA Extension element in an ADDBA Request frame and ADDBA Response frame	Sepcify the rules for including the ADDBA Extension element.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 16:55:27Z) Agree in principle. Add a rule when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element in subsection 27.3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 03:52:32Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1122 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13895	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	56	T	Y	231.55999755859375	56	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"... the ADDBA Extension element is present..." The rules for including the ADDBA Extension element in an ADDBA Request frame and ADDBA Response frame	Sepcify the rules for including the ADDBA Extension element.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:01:33Z) Revised – Agree in principle. Add a rule when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element in subse	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13896	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.4	231	64	T	Y	231.63999938964844	64	27.3.2.4		J	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"In the level 3 fragmentation, the block acknowledgment record maintains 4 bits per MSDU or A-MSDU (one bit for each fragment of the MSDU) if at least	Change as the following: "In the level 3 fragmentation, the block acknowledgment record maintains 4 bits per MSDU or A-MSDU (one bit for each fragment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:03:28Z) Rejected- In the example listed by the commenter, the STA 1 always regards the first fragmentted MPDU 1 (More F	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1123 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13897	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.4	232	14	T	Y	232.13999938964844	14	27.3.2.4		V	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"The originator STA shall set the Fragment Number subfield of each MPDU to a value less than 4." This constraint have to applied only for the fragment	Change as the following: "The originator STA shall set the Fragment Number sub field of each MPDU that is sent under a block ack agreement using level	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:08:15Z) Revised- Agree in principle. Proposed resolution accounts for the suggested change. TGax editor please make the	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13898	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.2.4	232	10	T	Y	232.10000610351562	10	27.3.2.4		J	Ming Gan	433r1	544	"Up to four dynamic fragments of an MSDU or A-MSDU if supported by the recipient for each MSDU or A-MSDU, and up to one dynamic fragment of an MMPDU i	Change as the following: "Up to four dynamic fragments of an MSDU or A-MSDU if supported by the recipient for each MSDU or A-MSDU under a block ack ag	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 17:07:26Z) Rejected- The case without block ack agreement is in the fisrt bullet where S-MPDU can be carried in an HE TB P	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1124 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13899	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.1	232	51	T	Y	232.50999450683594	51	27.3.3.1		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"The recipient STA shall support the concurrent reception of dynamic fragments of a number of outstanding MSDUs and A-MSDUs when supported from the sa	For a dynamic fragmentation of an MMPDU or of an MSDU that is not sent under a block ack agreement, an originator STA have to negotiate the Level 1 dy	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:18:08Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Add a sentence to account for the issue on dynamic fragment. TGax editor please ma	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13900	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.2	233	13	T	Y	233.13000488 28125	13	27.3.3.2		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"Upon reception of an MPDU or S-MPDU that carries a dynamic fragment, the recipient STA responds with an Ack frame or a Multi-STA BlockAck frame when	For a dynamic fragmentation of an MMPDU or of an MSDU that is not sent under a block ack agreement, an originator STA have to negotiate the Level 1 dy	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:24:44Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Add a sentence to account for the issue on dynamic fragment. TGax editor please ma	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1125 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13901	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.3	233	23	T	Y	233.22999572753906	23	27.3.3.3		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"Upon reception of an MPDU or A-MPDU that carries one or more dynamic fragments, the recipient STA responds with one of the following frames:" The rec	For a dynamic fragmentation of an MMPDU or of an MSDU that is not sent under a block ack agreement, an originator STA have to negotiate the Level 1 dy	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:27:11Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Add a sentence to account for the issue on dynamic fragment. TGax editor please ma	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13902	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.4	233	61	T	Y	233.61000061035156	61	27.3.3.4		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"Upon reception of an MPDU or A-MPDU that carries one or more dynamic fragments, the recipient STA responds with one of the following frames:" The rec	For a dynamic fragmentation of an MMPDU or of an MSDU that is not sent under a block ack agreement, an originator STA have to negotiate the Level 1 dy	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:32:44Z) Revised-Agree in principle. Add a note to account for the issue on dynamic fragment. TGax editor please make t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1126 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13903	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.3	233	31	T	Y	233.30999755859375	31	27.3.3.3		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"The recipient STA shall follow the rules defined in 10.3.2.9 (Ack procedure) for generating the Ack frame and the rules defined in 27.4 (HE block ack	Change as the following: "The recipient STA shall follow the rules defined in 10.3.2.9 (Ack procedure) for generating the Ack frame and the rules defi	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:28:50Z) Revised-Disagree to some extent. Because the M-BA can only be sent by an AP in response to an S-MPDU if the S-M	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13904	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.1	233	6	T	Y	233.05999755859375	6	27.3.3.1		J	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"An HE STA shall set the HE Fragmentation Operation subfield, if present, in the ADDBA Response frame to a value that is less than or equal to the val	Sepcify the rules for including the ADDBA Extension element.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:22:11Z) Rejected – Agree in principle. But the case when ADDBA Request/Response is without ADDBA Extension Element was	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1127 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13905	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.4	234	3	T	Y	234.02999877929688	3	27.3.3.4		V	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"The recipient STA shall follow the rules defined in 10.3.2.9 (Ack procedure) for generating the Ack frame and the rules defined in 27.4 (HE block ack	Changeas the following: "The recipient STA shall follow the rules defined in 10.3.2.9 (Ack procedure) for generating the Ack frame and the rules defi	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:33:28Z) Revised-Disagree to some extent. Because the M-BA can only be sent by an AP in response to an S-MPDU if the S-M	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13906	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.3.3.4	234	12	T	Y	234.11999511871875	12	27.3.3.4		A	Ming Gan	764r1	601	"Set to 1 the LSB of the Fragment Number subfield in the Block Ack Starting Sequence Control subfield of the BlockAck frame or Multi-STA BlockAck fram	Restrict the rule only to a fragmented MPDU that is sent under a block ack agreement.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 22:34:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1128 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13907	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	1	T	Y	240.00999450683594	1	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	"Responding to an HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU with an HE TB PPDU" How about is an HE ER SU PPDU? If an HE SU PPDU can solicit an HE TB PPDU, an HE ER SU	Include an HE ER SU PPDU that solicit an HE TB PPDU. Otherwise, remove an HE SU PPDU.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:33:54Z) Revised - Already resolved in D2.3 draft (see 18-207r4)	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:06:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13908	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	7	T	Y	240.07000732421875	7	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	"If an Action frame or an MMPDU that solicits an immediate acknowledgement is carried in an HE MU PPDU, then the response is carried in an HE TB PPDU.	Please clarify if the response frame of an action frame or an MMPDU carried in an HE SU PPDU can be carried in an HE TB PPDU.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:34:36Z) Revised - Already resolved in D2.3 draft (see 18-207r4)	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:07:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1129 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13909	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.4.4.4	240	33	T	Y	240.33000018310547	33	27.4.4.4		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	"If the HE MU PPDU or HE SU PPDU carries a multi-TID A-MPDU that includes QoS Data frames or QoS Null frames with the Ack Policy field equal to HTP Ac	Add the rule for an ack-enabled A-MPDU.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:35:37Z) Revised - Already resolved in D2.3 draft (see 18-207r4)	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:07:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13910	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.2	243	4	T	Y	243.03999328 61328	4	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/0053r1	498	"A STA may send bandwidth query reports (BQRs) when the peer STA has indicated support by setting the BQR Support field in the HE Capabilities element	Change as the following: "An HE non-AP STA may send bandwidth query reports (BQRs) when its associated AP STA has indicated support by setting the BQR	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 06:26:22Z) Tgax editor makes no changes on CID 13910.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:50:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions. Thi should have been resolved as REJECTED	2.2	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1130 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13911	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.2	243	14	T	Y	243.13999938964844	14	27.5.2		V	Zhou Lan	11-18/053r2	498	"A non-AP STA reports its channel availability information (unsolicited BQR) to the AP to which it is associated using the BQR Control field of frames	Remove the cited paragraph.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:07:22Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in 11-18/053r2 that are marked with CID 13911	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	see #12492	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13912	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	59	T	Y	245.58999633789062	59	27.5.3.2.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"...subfield indicates a 26-tone RU if the AP has received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame in" In a DFS band, an active scanning is	Remove "a Probe Response frame".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:47:35Z) Agree with the commenter. D2.3 has already removed the “a Probe Response frame” as per resolution to CID 13970 i	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:42:36Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1131 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13913	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	59	T	Y	245.58999633789062	59	27.5.3.2.1		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"...subfield indicates a 26-tone RU if the AP has received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame in" What is a behavior of an AP with a do	Change as the following: "...subfield indicates a 26-tone RU if the AP has transmitted or received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame i	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:47:19Z) If there are no OBSS which cannot tolerate 26-tone RU in DFS channels, then there is no reason to prohibit an AP	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13914	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	56	T	Y	245.55999755859375	56	27.5.3.2.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"An AP operating in an operating class for which the behavior limits set listed in Annex E includes the DFS_50_100_Behavior shall not transmit a Trigg	Specify the exception condition to allow an AP triggers a 26-tone RU.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:46:54Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 11311 and 13914 in 11-18/0807r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	There is no "proposed text for 11311 or 13914, so using the text under heading "Proposed Text Updates: CIDs 11418, 12580, 12796, 13764". There are tech	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1132 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13915	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	38	T	Y	248.38000048828125	38	27.5.3.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"...access indicates 26-tone RU and the non-AP HE STA has received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame in which any of the following are	Remove "a Probe Response frame".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:48:55Z) D2.3 (P279 L34) as already removed “a Probe Response frame” as per resolution to CID 11318 in 11-18/0367r1. Note	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:49:56Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13916	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.2.4	248	20	T	Y	248.19999694 82422	20	27.5.3.2.4		V	Jing Ma	11-18/0074r1	484	"If the PPDU contains frames that are not Trigger frames in addition to a Trigger frame, then the AP shall access the medium using the primary AC as d	Rephrase the wording without using a primary AC.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:27:00Z) TGax editor to make changes in 11-18/0074r1under CID 13916	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 00:12:49Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1133 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13917	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	38	T	Y	248.38000488 28125	38	27.5.3.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"...if the RU Allocation subfield allocated to the STA or designated for UL OF DMA-based random access indicates 26-tone RU and..." Is the HE TB NDP fe	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:48:41Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 13917 in 11-18/0807r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:49:50Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13918	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	54	T	Y	251.53999328 61328	54	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	Similar to a NOTE 2 of an previous paragraph, a STA that responds to a DL MU PPDU containing MPDU(s) addressed to it that include a Trigger frame with	Include that a STA that responds to a DL MU PPDU containing MPDU(s) addressed to it that include Trigger frame can be an unassociated STA.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:42:47Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 13918.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 22:45:26Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1134 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13919	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.4	253	27	T	Y	253.27000427246094	27	27.5.3.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0011r2	488	"The STA shall include an HE Control field containing the UPH Control field in MPDUs carried in the A-MPDU of the HE TB PPDU except when:" Does the A-	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 23:43:18Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0011r2 under all headings that include CID 13919.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 23:29:57Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13920	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	61	E	Y	255.61000061035156	61	27.5.3.6		A			447	"An AP may include a BSRP Trigger frame together with other Control, Data and Management frames in one A-MPDU to a STA if the HE Capabilities element	Change "BSRP A-MPDU Aggregation field equal to 1" to "BSRP BQRP A-MPDU Aggregation field equal to 1".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:35:45Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:35:49Z - see #12145	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1135 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13921	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	63	T	Y	255.63000488 28125	63	27.5.3.6		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0108r2	503	"If a STA receives a BSRP Trigger frame aggregated with Control, Data and Management frames that solicits an acknowledgement, the response A-MPDU shal	Change "Table 9-425 (A-MPDU contents in the data enabled immediate response context)" to "Table 9-428--A-MPDU contents MPDUs in the control response c	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:30:35Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 20:43:18Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13922	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.4	256	43	T	Y	256.42999267 578125	43	27.5.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	"-- Zero or more MPDUs and," It should be changed to one or more MPDUs. Otherwise, there is no difference with an HE DL MU operation.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:46:43Z) Make changes as in doc 11-18/0707r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13923	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.4	256	53	T	Y	256.52999877 92969	53	27.5.4		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0707r2	654	"-- Zero or more MPDUs" It should be changed to one or more MPDUs. Otherwise, there is no difference with an HE DL MU operation.	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 07:48:37Z) Make changes as in doc 11-18/0707r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1136 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13924	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	44	T	Y	257.44000244140625	44	27.5.5.1		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	"An HEAP that transmits a Basic Trigger frame should set the TID Aggregation Limit subfield in the User Info field indicating a random access RU to 0	Remove the cited sentence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13925	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.5.5.1	258	15	T	Y	258.14999389 64844	15	27.5.5.1		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0742r3	609	"A non-AP STA with dot11OFDMARandomAccessOptionImlemented set to true shall follow the random access procedure defined in 27.5.5.2 (UORA procedure) to	As in comment.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:06:27Z) Permitting a Trigger-based (random access) between APs to send trigger frames will open doors to a variety of pos	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 19:49:42Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1137 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13926	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.7.5	285	64	T	Y	285.64001464 84375	64	27.7.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	370r2	548	"In addition to a TWT Information frame that terminates a TWT SP, the following events also terminate a TWT SP:" A termination of a TXOP (e.g., a tran	Add a termination of a TXOP into a TWT SP termination.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:20:32Z) Rejected – A TWT SP can consist of multiple TXOPs, the termination of which cannot terminate the TWT SP. The TW	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-05 20:50:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13927	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.7.5	286	35	T	Y	286.35000610 35156	35	27.7.5		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	370r2	548	"A TWT requesting STA or TWT scheduled STA in PS mode that is awake for an unannounced trigger-enabled TWT SP may transition to the doze state after t	Remove the cited paragraph.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-13 23:21:31Z) Revised – Agree in principle to removing the paragraph but not for the reasons in the comment. Removal of the p	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1138 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13928	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.8.3	289	31	T	Y	289.30999755859375	31	27.8.3		J	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	"The OMI responder shall consider the OMI initiator as participating in UL MU operation for subsequent TXOPs when the UL MU Disable subfield is 0 in t	As in comment.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:16:02Z) Rejected. The above two sentences describe the OMI Initiator specific operation and the below two sentences desc	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:10:51Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13929	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	39	T	Y	290.39001464843375	39	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"The received PPDU is an inter-BSS PPDU (see 27.2.2 (Intra-BSS and inter-BSS frame determination)) and the received PPDU is not a non-HT PPDU carrying	Change as the following: "The received PPDU is an inter-BSS PPDU (see 27.2.2 (Intra-BSS and inter-BSS frame determination)) and the received PPDU is n	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:02:54Z) partially agree with the commenter. Only BA can be classified as inter-BSS PPDU. Ack and CTS can not. However, for	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1139 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13930	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	7	T	Y	291.07000732421875	7	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Similar to the NON_SRG-OBSS_PD-based spatial reuse, If an HE STA receives a CTS frame immediately after an RTS (e.g., MU-RTS frame) that is a SRG fram	Insert the following sentence: "The received PPDU contains a CTS and a PHY-CCA.indication transition from BUSY to IDLE occurred within the PIFS time i	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:27:46Z) - current assumption is that for SRG OBSS_PD, it is not possible to ignore RTS/CTS, because the OBSS_PD thresholds	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13931	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	3	T	Y	291.02999877792969	3	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"The received PPDU is an Inter-BSS PPDU (see 27.2.2 (Intra-BSS and inter-BSS frame determination))" Because the prerequisite of an SRG PPDU is an Inte	Remove the cited sentence.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:27:03Z) agree with the commenter. Apply the changes as in doc 1852r4 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1140 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13932	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	32	T	Y	292.32000732421875	32	27.9.2.2		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"If the bandwidth of the received PPDU differs from 20 MHz, then the value of the OBSS_PDlevel is increased by 10 log (bandwidth/20 MHz)." More exactl	As in comment.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:29:18Z) - not certain exactly what the commenter is requesting, but the term bandwidth has no reference, so formalizain	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13933	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	47	T	Y	292.47000122 07031	47	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"An AP may define SRG OBSS PD Min Offset and SRG OBSS PD Max Offset values that are used by its associated STAs and by the AP to derive an SRG OBSS_PD	Sepcify that an AP can include one or more Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:44:06Z) For simplicity, it is better to have a single SR parameter set element.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1141 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13934	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	14	T	Y	294.14001464 84375	14	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	The TX PWR_max that calculated with the chosen non-SRG SRG OBSS_PD level have to also limit the maximum transmit power of the UPH calculation, depend in	Insert the following sentence: "If a Trigger frame is received within an ongoing OBSS_PD SR transmit power restriction period, the maximum UL transmit	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:55:04Z) – It is considered that the UL Power Headroom calculation should be done independently from whether spatial reuse	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13935	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	22	T	Y	294.22000122 07031	22	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"...for the transmissions of any PPDU (including HE Trigger-Based PPDU) until the end of the OBSS_PD SR transmit power restriction period." Asame wi	Change as the following: "...for the transmissions of any PPDU (including HE Trigger-Based PPDU, except when the HE TB PPDU is triggered by a Trigger	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:55:48Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1142 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13936	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.3	295	65	T	Y	295.64999938964844	65	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"When the conditions specified in 27.9.3 (SRP-based spatial reuse operation) are met that allow the transmission of an SR PPDU, an HE STA may transmit	Replace "SR Responder" with "SRP Responder" throughout D2.0.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:19:11Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13936, which instruct the editor t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 21:28:49Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13937	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.9.3	296	18	T	Y	296.17999267578125	18	27.9.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"...from performing SRP-based SR transmission during the ensuing uplink SRP_PPDU duration." Definition of the SRP_PPDU is missed.	Include the definition of the SRP_PPDU in clause 3.2.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:24:12Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13937	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1143 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13938	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	64	T	Y	303.64001464 84375	64	27.10.4.3		J	Liwen Chu	796r2	622	"A STA that transmits an ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU that contains at least two MPDUs with different TIDs carried in A-MPDU subframes that have the E	Change as the following: "A STA that transmits an ack-enabled multi-TID A-MPDU that contains at least first QoS Data frame and either second Qos Data	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 04:42:51Z) Rejected Discussion: the proposed change is not right: more than one QoS Data frame soliciting Ack in an ack-en	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13939	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.1	304	10	T	Y	304.10000610 35156	10	27.11.1		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0628r1	612	"If an RU is intended for a single non-AP STA, then the STA_ID_LIST element for that RU is set to the 11 LSBs of the AID of the STA receiving the PSDU	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:31:11Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0628r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:00:01Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1144 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13940	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.1	304	8	T	Y	304.07998657 22656	8	27.11.1		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0628r1	612	"If an RU is intended for a single non-AP STA, then the STA_ID_LIST element for that RU is set to the 11 LSBs of the AID of the STA receiving the PSDU	Change as the following: "If an RU is intended for one associated non-AP STA, then the STA_ID_LIST element for that RU is set to the 11 LSBs of the AI	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:24:02Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0628r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 20:59:53Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13941	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.1	304	32	T	Y	304.32000732 421875	32	27.11.1		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0628r1	612	"For an AP with dot11MultiBSSIDActivated equal to false, if the RU is intended for more than one unassociated STA, the STA_ID_LIST element is set to 2	As in comment.	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 08:32:43Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0628r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:01:09Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13942	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.4	305	39	T	Y	305.39001464 84375	39	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	A mesh BSS is missed.	Define the TX VECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR for an HE PPDU in a mesh BSS.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:55:45Z) Revised- Based on TGax D2.0, the TX VECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR for an HE PPDU in a mesh BSS is set to a value ind	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13943	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.4	305	26	T	Y	305.26000976 5625	26	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	"An HE STA that transmitted an HE Operation element shall set the TXVECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR of an HE PPDU to the value indicated in the BSS Colors	Define the TX VECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR for an HE PPDU in a mesh BSS.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:54:14Z) Revised- Based on TGax D2.0, the TX VECTOR parameter BSS_COLOR for an HE PPDU in a mesh BSS is set to a value ind	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1146 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13944	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.4	305	53	T	Y	305.52999987792969	53	27.11.4		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	456r1	644	"An HE STA transmitting an HE SU PPDU or an HE ER SU PPDU for which one or more of the intended recipient STAs is not a member of the transmitting STA	As in comment.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:56:36Z) Revised- Agree in principle. As suggested by the commenter, add the following sentence. "…Otherwise, the HE ST	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13945	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.6	308	12	T	Y	308.11999511171875	12	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"An HE STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_REUSE to SRP_AND_NON-SRG_OBSSPD_PROHIBITED for a PPDU containing an FTM or NDP Announcement frame.	As in comment.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:03:04Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13945	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1147 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13946	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.11.6	308	36	T	Y	308.35998535 15625	36	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	"...for any PPDU that is not an HE TB PPDU or an NDP PPDU or a PPDU containing an FTM or NDP Announcement frame." The ACK frame of an FTM frame is mis	As in comment.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:04:43Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 13946	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13947	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"An HE STA may transmit a 242-tone HE ER SU PPDU to a peer HE STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the DCM Rx fiel	Because all HE STA shall support a transmission and reception of an HE ER SU PPDU that consists of a 242-tone RU, remove "otherwise the STA shall not	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 22:00:31Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1148 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13948	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.15.2	314	59	T	Y	314.58999633 78906	59	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"An HE STA may transmit a 242-tone HE ER SU PPDU to a peer HE STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the DCM Rx fiel	Remove the cited sentence.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 22:01:24Z) Revised – Multiple comments are targeting this portion of the paragraph; with different preferences, optional, m	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	1264r2		I	see #11261	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13949	Yongho Seok	230	2	27.15.3	316	35	T	Y	316.35000610 35156	35	27.15.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	13r0	492	"An HE STA may transmit an HE PPDU with DCM to a peer STA if it has received from the peer STA an HE Capabilities element with the DCM Rx subfield in	Change the ECM Rx field with an appropriate field name.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 23:57:22Z) Revised – Agree with comment. See resolutions for CID 12536 and CID 12657 TGax editor to make the changes shown	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-30 16:50:51Z - see #12536	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1149 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13950	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.2.2	337	26	T	Y	337.26000976 5625	26	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	The allowed values for the RSSI_LEGACY parameter are in "... RSSI_LEGACY is intended to be used in a relative manner, and it is a monotonically increa	As in comment.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:24:13Z) Reason: the parameter RSSI_LEGACY is not used as the CCA measurement result.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:00:37Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13951	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.3.2	357	60	T	Y	357.60000610 35156	60	28.3.3.2		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0807r1	586	"except when a STA is operating in an operating class for which the behavior limits set listed in Annex E includes the DFS_50_100_Behavior (see 27.5.3	Update Annex E.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:49:09Z) Operating class is indicated in the Country element. To support 20 and 40 MHz devices in the BSS, the Country e	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1150 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13952	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.3.2	364	55	T	Y	364.54998779296875	55	28.3.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0934r1	596	"In an HE MU PPDU, at least Nx4x26 subcarriers (contiguous or non-contiguous) shall be occupied throughout the signaled BW, where N is the number of 2	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:53:02Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13428, 13952 and 14159 in 11-18/0934r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 19:56:45Z- see #13428	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13953	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	411	46	E	Y	411.45999145 50781	46	28.3.10.7.2		A			648	Change "LPDC" to "LDPC" throughout the D2.0. (Same errorta exist in Annex C.)	Change "LPDC" to "LDPC" throughout the D2.0. (Same errorta exist in Annex C.)	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:12:22Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:12:26Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13954	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.4	501	21	T	Y	501.20999145 50781	21	28.3.19.6.4		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:13:21Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:48:12Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1151 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13955	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.4	501	38	T	Y	501.38000048828125	38	28.3.19.6.4		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:13:56Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13956	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.4	501	42	T	Y	501.42001342 77344	42	28.3.19.6.4		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:14:08Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1152 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13957	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.4	501	55	T	Y	501.54998779296875	55	28.3.19.6.4		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:14:16Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13958	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.4	501	59	T	Y	501.58999633 78906	59	28.3.19.6.4		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:14:26Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1153 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13959	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.4	501	63	T	Y	501.63000488 28125	63	28.3.19.6.4		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:14:39Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13960	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	23	T	Y	502.23001098 63281	23	28.3.19.6.5		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	"A 40 MHz non-HT duplicate, HT_MF, HT_GF, VHT or HE PPDU detected in any 40 MHz subchannel of the secondary 80 MHz channel at or above max(-72 dBm, OB	Change as the following: "A 40 MHz non-HT duplicate, HT_MF, HT_GF, VHT or HE PPDU detected in any 40 MHz subchannel of the secondary 40 MHz or the sec	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:15:17Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:48:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13961	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	28	E	Y	502.27999877 92969	28	28.3.19.6.5		V		18/0106r1	573	"A 20 MHz NON_HT, HT_MF, HT_GF, VHT, or HE PPDU detected in the any 20 MHz subchannel of secondary 20 MHz, secondary 40 MHz or secondary 80 MHz at or	Change as the following: "A 20 MHz NON_HT, HT_MF, HT_GF, VHT, or HE PPDU detected in the any 20 MHz subchannel of secondary 20 MHz, secondary 40 MHz o	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:47:25Z) - Agree in principle. "channel" is missed accidently. Fix the incorrect sentence as as suggested by the comme	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:47:54Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13962	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	20	T	Y	502.20001220 703125	20	28.3.19.6.5		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:14:59Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1155 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13963	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	24	T	Y	502.23999902343375	24	28.3.19.6.5		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:15:31Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13964	Yongho Seok	230	2	28.3.19.6.5	502	29	T	Y	502.29000854 49219	29	28.3.19.6.5		V	Yongho	11-18/0106r1	573	How is the OBSS_PD determined if there is no signals occupying the primary 20 MHz channel? Is adjustment of OBSS_PD and transmit power possbile? How c	As in comment.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-23 02:15:39Z) TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/106r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #13954	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1156 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13965	Yongho Seok	230	2	C.3	572	4	T	Y	572.03997802 73438	4	C.3		A	Edward Au	17/781r1	646	"HEDynamicFragmentationLevel1 indicates that the STA allows transmission or reception of one fragment at a time and does not need block ack agreement	Change as the following: "HE DynamicFragmentationLevel1 indicates that the STA allows a reception of one fragment at a time and does not need block ack	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 15:57:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	Conflicts with resolution to #12463. I'll leave #12463 resolution in place.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13966	Yongho Seok	230	2	G.5	595	52	T	Y	595.52001953 125	52	G.5		J			657	"dl-mu-sequence | ul-mu-sequence | cascading-mu-sequence" And dl-mu-sequence, ul-mu-sequence and cascading-mu-sequence are not defined.	An dl-mu-sequence, ul-mu-sequence and cascading-mu-sequence have to be defined in Annex G.5.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13967	Yongho Seok	230	2	G.5	595	46	T	Y	595.46002197 26562	46	G.5		J			657	The usage case of the He-mu-sequence is not incluued in the basic sequence.	Include the He-mu-sequence to the basic sequence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1157 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13968	Yongho Seok	230	2	G.5	595	56	T	Y	595.55999975585938	56	G.5		J			657	"(Trigger) | (Trigger +a-mpdu + mu-user-respond + a-mpdu-end) 1{Data[+HTC]+QoS+(no-ack | block-ack)+a-mpdu} + a-mpdu-end; [+mu-user-respond other-user	Fix any syntax error in Annex G.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
13969	Youhan Kim	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	143	20	T	Y	143.19999694824 22	20	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma		657	In case of Ng=16 and codebook size={4,2}, we need a capability bit for the Beamformer side as well, so that beamformer can tell beamformee to not use	Add a capability bit to indicate whether an HE beamformer supports Ng=16 for SU-type feedback in non-triggered sounding sequence. Also add another ca	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:19:48Z) Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1158 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13970	Youhan Kim	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	59	T	Y	245.58999633789062	59	27.5.3.2.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	If the AP has not seen an OBSS which cannot tolerate 26-tone RU within certain amount of time, then the AP should be allowed to use 26-tone RU again.	Change "if the AP has received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame in which" to "if the AP has received at least one Beacon frame or Pro	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:51:01Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document 11-18/0546r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:12:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13971	Youhan Kim	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	9	T	Y	246.08999633789062	9	27.5.3.2.2		J	Youhan Kim		564	Adding MAC level padding to Trigger frames unnecessarily increases the overhead and reduces the efficiency of UL MU operation.	Delete section 27.5.3.2.2. Or at least add to P246L15: "Non-AP HE STAs should set the Trigger Frame MAC Padding Duration subfield in the HE MAC Capab	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:08:13Z) - The group believe that SIFS after the PPDU which carries Trigger frame may not be enough for a STA to prepar	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 02:08:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1159 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13972	Youhan Kim	230	2	27.5.3.3	248	38	T	Y	248.38000048828125	38	27.5.3.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	If the non-AP STA has not seen an OBSS which cannot tolerate 26-tone RU within certain amount of time, then the STA should be allowed to use 26-tone R	Change "received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame in which" to "received at least one Beacon frame or Probe Response frame within the	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:52:10Z) Agree with the comment. Please see resolution to CID 13970 TGax editor, please make changes as shown in document	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:13:19Z - see #13970	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
13973	Youhan Kim	230	2	27.6.3	268	16	T	Y	268.16000366210 94	16	27.6.3		J	Youhan Kim		657	HE Beamformers are required to support receiving HE Compressed beamforming feedback w/o segmentation up to 11,454 bytes (see D2.0 P268 L16-25.) Then,	Add 10.34.5.3 to Tgax draft, with text changes to indicate that when an HE beamformee is sending back a VHT CBF to an HE beamformer, then the VHT CBF	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:17Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1160 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13974	Youhan Kim	230	2	27.6.5	269	62	T	Y	269.61999511 71875	62	27.6.5		V	Yongho Seok	11-18/0935r0	591	HE PHY Capabilities allows beamformees to declare different capability on the Beeamformee STS for NDPs w/ <= 80 MHz and NDPs w/ > 80 MHz (see D2	Add 10.34.6 to TGax draft, with the following content: "10.34.6 (Insert the following after the second paragrah) This paragraph applies when a STA wi	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 05:57:04Z) Agree with the commenter in principle. Proposed text update in 11-18/0935r0 implements the proposed text update w	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 15:37:23Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13975	Youhan Kim	230	2	9.4.2.237.1	132	50	T	Y	132.5	50	9.4.2.237.1		J	Abhishek Patil	369r5	559	The HE Capabilities indicates the capabilities of the STA in the current channel it is operating in.	Change "The HE Capabilities element contains a number of fields that are used to advertise the HE capabilities of an HE STA." to "The HE Capabilities	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 17:35:55Z) Reject The HE Capabilities applies to each instance of a STA and since there is a MAC/PHY instance of a STA for	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-04 21:40:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1161 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13976	Youhan Kim	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	139	44	T	Y	139.44000244140625	44	9.4.2.237.3		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0046r0	453	What is the usage of the "Dual Band Support" subfield?	Clarify the usage of the "Dual Band Support" subfield".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:35:56Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13976 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0046r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-07 22:50:12Z - see #11466	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13977	Youhan Kim	230	2	28	327	2	T	Y	327.01998901 36719	2	28		J			648	There are numerous instances in Clause 28 saying "if X is set to Y in the HE PHY Capabilities, then Z". A more appropriate phrasing would be defi ne r	Change all instances of "if X is set to Y in the HE PHY Capabilities, then Z" to " if dot11X is Y, then Z", and define MIB variable dot11X.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:34:31Z) - It is more better to reference over the air behavior since this can be tested	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:35:01Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
13978	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	35	E	Y	327.35000610 35156	35	28.1.1		V			648	MU-MIMO is already defined in 3.X.	Change "downlink multi-user MIMO (MU-MIMO)" to "MU-MIMO".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:20:42Z) - Change to " DL MU-MIMO"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:21:01Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1162 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13979	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	46	T	Y	327.45999145 50781	46	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	Whether preamble puncturing can be applied is a function of PPDU BW, not channel BW. For example, a 40 MHz PPDU transmitted within an 80 MHz channel	Change "For channel widths greater than or equal to 80 MHz" to "For PPDU bandwidths greater than or equal to 80 MHz".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:39:20Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13979 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:55:14Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13980	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	47	T	Y	327.47000122 07031	47	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	This sentence does not allow puncturing only one RU.	Change "with more than one resource unit (RU) are zeroed out" to "with at least one resource unit (RU) zeroed out".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:39:33Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13980 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:55:26Z - No need to spell out the acronym -- it is defined in 3.4	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1163 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13981	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	54	T	Y	327.54000854 49219	54	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	HE-LTF duration includes GI duration as well	Change "provides support for 3.2" to "supports DFT periods of 3.2".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:40:30Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13981 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:57:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13982	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	55	T	Y	327.54998779 296875	55	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	HE modulated fields includes HE-LTF, which supports 6.4us DFT period as well.	Change "The HE PHY supports a DFT period of 3.2 ++s and 12.8 ++s for the pre-HE modulated fields and the HE modulated fields in an HE PPDU, respective	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:40:46Z) Tgax Editor to make the changes for CID13982 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 17:58:20Z - see #13981	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13983	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	61	E	Y	327.60998535 15625	61	28.1.1		A			648	BPSK is defined in 3.4	Change "binary phase shift keying (BPSK)" to "BPSK.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:22:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:22:27Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1164 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13984	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	61	E	Y	327.60998535 15625	61	28.1.1		V			648	3.4 says "Dual carrier modulation".	Change "dual-carrier modulation" to dual carrier modulation	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:23:38Z) - Remove "Dual-carrier modulation" and just keep the acronym which is defined in 3.4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:24:09Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13985	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	62	E	Y	327.61999511 71875	62	28.1.1		A			648	QPSK is defined in 3.4	Change "quadrature phase shift keying (QPSK)" to "QPSK"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:25:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:25:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13986	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	327	62	E	Y	327.61999511 71875	62	28.1.1		A			648	QAM is defined in 3.4	Change "16-quadrature amplitude modulation (16-QAM)" to "16-QAM"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:25:52Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:25:55Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13987	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	1	T	Y	328.01000976 5625	1	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	Why are we referring to the regulatory requirements of VHT?	Create a separate section for regulatory requirements under Clause 28.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:27:14Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13987 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0725r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1165 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13988	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	10	E	Y	328.10000061035156	10	28.1.1		A			648	"for the following" -> "in the following cases"	Change "not used for the following:" to "not used in the following cases:"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:32:29Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:32:34Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
13989	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	14	T	Y	328.14001464 84375	14	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	An RU with less than or equal to 242-tones in an HE TB PPDU can use BCC even if there are other RUs in the same HE TB PPDU with more than 242-tones.	Change "* An RU of size greater than 242 subcarriers in an HE MU PPDU. * An HE TB PPDU on an RU of size greater than 242 subcarriers" to "* An RU of s	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:42:47Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13989 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:51:52Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13990	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	18	T	Y	328.17999267578125	18	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	An RU with less than or equal to 242-tones in an HE TB PPDU can use BCC even if there are other RUs in the same HE TB PPDU with more than 242-tones.	Change "* An RU allocated to a single user in an HE MU PPDU with number of spatial streams greater than 4. * An HE TB PPDU on an RU allocated to a sin	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:43:36Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13990 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:52:07Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1166 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13991	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	23	T	Y	328.23001098 63281	23	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	An RU using MCS 9 or lower can use BCC even if there are other RUs in the same PPDU using MCS 10 or 11.	Change "* An HE PPDU using HE-MCSs 10 or 11" to "* An HE SU PPDU using HE-MCSs 10 or 11 * An RU in an HE MU or HE TB PPDU using HE-MCSs 10 or 11"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:45:03Z) CID 13345 is similar in nature to CID13991. Please refer to resolution of CID13345 for resolution of CID 13991	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:52:56Z - see #13345	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13992	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	25	T	Y	328.25	25	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	A STA does not declare the BW of the HE SU PPDUs it can support. Rather it declares the supported channel bandwidths.	Change "if the STA supports transmitting and receiving HE SU PPDUs of bandwidths greater than 20 MHz" to "if the STA supports operating in channel ban	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:46:00Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13992 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:18:16Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1167 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13993	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	28	T	Y	328.27999987792969	28	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	As is written, it looks as if one could build an HE PHY which supports LDPC TX but not LDPC RX. But HE PHY Capabilities has one bit to indicate LDPC	Change P328L28-32 to "LDPC coding (transmit and receive) in all supported HE PPDU types, RU sizes, and number of spatial streams if the STA declares s	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:46:22Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13993 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:20:38Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13994	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	36	T	Y	328.35998535156250	36	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	It is optional for an HE AP STA to receive HE MU PPDUs, and for an non-AP HE STA to transmit HE MU PPDUs.	Delete "Transmit and receive of HE-SIG-B field in HE MU PPDUs at HE-MCSs 0 to 5" from P328L36. Add at P329L8 "- HE MU PPDUs with a single RU either s	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:47:31Z) CID 13346 and CID 13994 are similar in nature. Please refer to discussion and resolution of CID 13346 for resolut	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:57:37Z - see #13346	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13995	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	38	T	Y	328.38000048828125	38	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	It is optional for an HE AP STA to receive HE MU PPDUs, and for an non-AP HE STA to transmit HE MU PPDUs. HE AP STA does not transmit HE TB PPDUs, an	Change "Single spatial stream HE-MCSs 0 to 7 (transmit and receive) in all supported channel widths and RU sizes for HE SU PPDUs, HE MU PPDUs, and HE	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:47:45Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13995 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:07:02Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13996	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	40	T	Y	328.39999938964844	40	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	HE TB PPDU does not support 0.8us GI	Change "0.8++s and 1.6++s GI duration on both HE-LTF and data symbols when the 2x HE-LTF is used (transmit and receive)" to "0.8++s and 1.6++s GI	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:27:40Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13996 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0725r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13997	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	43	T	Y	328.42999267578125	43	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	AP does not transmit HE TB PPDU. Non-AP STA does not receive HE TB PPDU.	Delete "(transmit and receive)"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:47:59Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13997 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:07:08Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
13998	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	46	T	Y	328.45999145 50781	46	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	It is optional for an HE AP STA to receive HE MU PPDUs, and for an non-AP HE STA to transmit HE MU PPDUs. HE AP STA does not transmit HE TB PPDUs, an	Change "3.2++s GI duration on both HE-LTF and data symbols when the 4x HE-LTF is used (transmit and receive)" to "3.2++s GI duration on both HE-LTF	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:27:54Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13998 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0725r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1170 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
13999	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	328	49	T	Y	328.48999023 4375	49	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	It is optional for an HE AP STA to receive HE MU PPDUs, and for an non-AP HE STA to transmit HE MU PPDUs.	Change "HE SU PPDUs and HE MU PPDUs" to "HE SU PPDUs" at P328L 49. Add at P329L28 " HE MU PPDUs with 0.8 ++sGI duration on both the HE-LTF and Data fi	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:48:12Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID13999 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:08:54Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14000	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	329	1	T	Y	329.01000976 5625	1	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	It is optional for an HE AP STA to receive HE MU PPDUs, and for an non-AP HE STA to transmit HE MU PPDUs.	Change "HE SU PPDUs and HE MU PPDUs"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:48:27Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID14000 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:09:00Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1171 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14001	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	329	20	T	Y	329.20001220703125	20	28.1.1		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	Language (style) of mandatory/optional features for AP and non-AP STAs are vastly different. E.g. AP section generally says "feature X (transmit)", w	Fix the language/style of section 28.1.1	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:28:08Z) D2.3 has improved has ameliorated language consistency issues. While one may say further improvements can be mad	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14002	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	329	9	T	Y	329.08999633378906	9	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	As is written, it looks as if one could build an HE PHY which supports LDPC TX but not LDPC RX. But HE PHY Capabilities has one bit to indicate LDPC	Change "- LDPC coding (transmit) if the maximum number of spatial streams the STA is capable of transmitting in an HE SU PPDU is less than or equal to	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:48:48Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID14002 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:20:44Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1172 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14003	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	330	13	T	Y	330.13000048828125	13	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0036r1	454	20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA supporting RUs in 40 MHz is optional.	Move P330L13-16 to P330L52.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:50:13Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID14003 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0036r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 19:16:46Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14004	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	330	20	T	Y	330.20001220703125	20	28.1.1		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	A non-AP HE STA cannot transmit any HE MU PPDU. It can transmit only a single RU - full BW or 106 tones.	Change "Transmission of HE MU PPDU" to "Transmission of HE MU PPDUs with a single RU spanning the entire PPDU bandwidth, or 20 MHz HE MU PPDUs with a	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:28:16Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1173 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14005	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	330	25	T	Y	330.25	25	28.1.1		V	Lochan Verma	18/0107r3	566	20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA operates in the Primary 20 MHz channel	Change "in 40 MHz channel width" to "in the Primary 20 MHz channel within 40 MHz channel width" at P330 L25. Change "in 160 MHz and 80+80 MHz channel	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 14:02:18Z) - As a resolution of CID 14339, 11834, 11837, the HE Subchannel Selective Transmission operation is proposed in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14006	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	330	36	E	Y	330.35998535 15625	36	28.1.1		V			648	DL MU-MIMO "with" OFDMA?	Change "DL MU-MIMO with OFDMA" to DL MU-MIMO within OFDMA" at P330 L36, 37, 40.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:44:20Z) - Change all occurances of "MU-MIMO with OFDMA" to "MU-MIMO within OFDMA"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:44:45Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1174 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14007	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	330	44	T	Y	330.44000244140625	44	28.1.1		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	"total of up to 8 space-time streams" could be mistaken to mean that a non-AP STA need to transmit 8SS.	Change "If it is supported ... are supported" to "If supported, then the non-AP STA shall support transmitting UL MU-MIMO in which the total space-tim	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:51:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:26:34Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14008	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.1	330	52	T	Y	330.51998901 36719	52	28.1.1		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0725r1	579	The assigned RU is in the Primary 80 MHz.	Add ", where the assigned RU is within the Primary 80 MHz channel" at the end of P330L52.	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:28:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14009	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.2	330	65	T	Y	330.64999389 64844	65	28.1.2		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	What about Clauses 15, 16 and 18?	Add clauses 15, 16 and 18 to the list.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:51:46Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID14009 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:29:30Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1175 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14010	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.2	331	1	T	Y	331.01000976 5625	1	28.1.2		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	20 MHz-only non-AP STA also supports transmission and reception of 20 MHz VHT PPDUs.	Change "A non-AP STA with 20 MHz-only capability supports a mixture of HE, Clause 19 and Clause 17 PHYs" to "A 20 MHz-only non-AP HE STA supports a mi	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:52:17Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:30:55Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14011	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.3.1	331	11	E	Y	331.10998535 15625	11	28.1.3.1		A			648	One is described in 28.3, and the other in 28.4.	Change "Both of these functions are described in detail in 28.3 and 28.4." to "These functions are described in 28.3 and 28.4."	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:45:54Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:45:59Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14012	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.4	331	44	T	Y	331.44000244 140625	44	28.1.4		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	NON_HT in 2.4 GHz is Clause 18.	Change "Clause 17 and including non-HT duplicate format" to "Clause 17 or Clause 18, and including non-HT duplicate format"	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:52:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:33:09Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1176 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14013	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.1.4	331	53	T	Y	331.52999987792969	53	28.1.4		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0037r1	455	All the HE PPDU for mats are listed as mandatory here, and yet, it is not that simple according to 28.1.1 - there are many conditions. It is not going	Delete "Support for HEXYZ PPDU format is mandatory" (where XYZ = SU, ERSU, MU, TB) from P331 L54, 57, 60, 65.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:52:31Z) TGax Editor to make the changes for CID14013 as suggested in proposed resolution in IEEE 802.11-18/0037r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 18:35:02Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14014	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	332	44	T	Y	332.44000244140625	44	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	HE extended range SU changed name to HER SU. Also, HE triger based changed to HE TB PPDU. So, it may be cleaner to change the FORMATs HE_EXT_SU a	To a global replacement of HE_EXT_SU to HE_ER_SU, and HE_TRIG to HE_TB.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:20:03Z) The terms used across the spec have been defined in 28.1.4 PPDU formats clause.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:05:57Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14015	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	333	1	E	Y	333.01000976625	1	28.2.2		A			648	It is hard to remember which column indicates what, especially when Table 28-1 is 17 pages long	Repeat the first row of the table at the top of each page for Table 28-1.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:47:25Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 18:47:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14016	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	333	13	T	Y	333.13000048828125	13	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Trigger frame or a frame with a UMRS Control subfield.	Change "from the Trigger frame" to "from the Trigger frame or the frame containing the UMRS Control subfield". Or, consider defining a term referring	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:20:19Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:06:05Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14017	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	333	16	T	Y	333.16000036621094	16	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	In case of 2.4 GHz, Table 21-1 is not applicable.	Change "Table 21-1" to "Table 19-1 or 21-1". Make similar changes to other cases referring to "Table 21-1" in Table 28-1.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:20:40Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:06:19Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1178 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14018	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	333	28	T	Y	333.27999987792969	28	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Why do we have to list out all TX/RX VECTOR parameters of Clause 15, 16, 17, 18, 19 and 21 here?	Remove all parameters of Table 28-1 which is "Not present" for HE_SU, HE_MU, HE_EXT_SU and HE_TRIG, and points to Table 21-1 for the "otherwise" case.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:21:03Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:53:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14019	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	334	12	T	Y	334.11999511171875	12	28.2.2		A	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	N_TX is present in TXVECTOR	Change "N" to "Y" for TXVECTOR for N_TX.	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:21:20Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:54:51Z - see #11696	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14020	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	334	19	T	Y	334.19000244140625	19	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	EXPANSION_MAT_TYPE is not needed for HE because there is only one option for HE. For example, if you search for EXPANSION_MAT_TYPE in D2.0, it is not	Change "Set to COMPRESS_SV." to "Not present". Change "Y" to "N" for the TXVECTOR column.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:21:29Z) TGax Editor, please remove the EXPANSION_MAT_TYPE item from table 28-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:56:04Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14021	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	334	47	T	Y	334.47000122207031	47	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	CHAN_MAT_TYPE is not needed for HE because there is only one option for HE. For example, if you search for CHAN_MAT_TYPE in D2.0, it is not used anyw	Remove the row for "FORMAT is HE_SU and PSDU_LENGTH is 0" at P334L47. Change "FORMAT is HE_MU, HE_EXT_SU or HE_TRIG. FORMAT is HE_SU and PSDU_LENGTH	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:21:53Z) TGax Editor, please remove the CHAN_MAT_TYPE item from table 28-1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:56:30Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14022	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	335	18	T	Y	335.17999267578125	18	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	DELTA_SNR is used for DL MU-MIMO.	Add a row at P335L18 with Condition = "Format is HE_SU and PSDU_LENGTH is 0", Value = "Contains an array of delta SNR values as defined in 9.4.1.64 (H	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:22:23Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:56:50Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1180 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14023	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	335	33	T	Y	335.32998657 22656	33	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	SNR is measured using NDP.	Change the condition column to "FORMAT is HE_SU and PSDU_LENGTH is 0". Change the value column to "Contains an array of average values of received SN	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:22:40Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:57:04Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14024	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	336	6	T	Y	336.05999755 859375	6	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	NO_SIG_EXTN is a boolean type in Clause 19.	Change "Integer" to "Boolean values" at P336L6. Change "1" to "true" at P336L7. Change "0" to "false" at P336L8.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:23:02Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:57:28Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1181 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14025	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	336	23	T	Y	336.23001098 63281	23	28.2.2		A	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	LDPC_EXTRA_SYMBOL is present for HE TB PPDUs even when an RU does not use LDPC coding. This is because another RU may be using LDPC, and hence all RU	Change "FORMAT is HE_TRIG and FEC_CODING is LDPC_CODING" to "FORMAT is HE_TRIG"	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:23:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 00:59:17Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14026	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	336	35	T	Y	336.35000610 35156	35	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	STBC is not applied to MU-MIMO RUs in both HE MU and HE TB PPDUs.	Change P336L35 "In an HE MU PPDU where each RU includes no more than 1 user:" to "In an HE MU or HE TB PPDU where each RU is allocated to only 1 user:	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:23:45Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:00:23Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14027	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	338	8	T	Y	338.07998657 22656	8	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	In the draft, there is a mixed usage of "HE-SIG-B", "SIG_B" and "SIGB" (e.g. SIGB MCS, SIGB DCM, SIGB Compression in HE-SIG-A). Harmonize the termino	Harmonize the phrasing between "HE-SIG-B", "SIG_B" and "SIGB" (and perhaps other variations) in the draft.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:24:37Z) Reason: The issue addressed in the comment doesn't exist.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:00:44Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14028	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	338	25	T	Y	338.25	25	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	SIGB compression does not necessarily mean that MU-MIMO is used (e.g. 1 user transmission). What SIGB compression mode really says is whether HE-SIG-	Change the Value column to "Indicates the presense of the Common field in HE-SIG-B. Integer: 1 indicates that HE-SIG-B does not have a Common field.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:24:51Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:01:07Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1183 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14029	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	339	4	T	Y	339.04000854 49219	4	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	What about receive?	Change "transmitted PPDU" to "PPDU"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:25:12Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:01:30Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14030	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	339	12	T	Y	339.11999511 71875	12	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	What about receive?	Change "transmitted PPDU" to "PPDU"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:25:34Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:01:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1184 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14031	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	339	27	T	Y	339.26998901 36719	27	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	What about when preamble puncturing is not supported?	Change "Indicates the channel width occupied by the preamble supporting preamble puncturing" to "Indicates the channel width occupied by the PPDU."	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:25:46Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:01:43Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14032	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	340	26	T	Y	340.26000976 5625	26	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	How was 6,500,531 bytes computed?	Verify that 6,500,531 is correct.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:26:04Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:01:52Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14033	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	342	39	T	Y	342.39001464 84375	39	28.2.2		J	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Can you set DOPPLER to 1 when the channel is with high Doppler but does not have midambles (when the number of data symbols is greater than the midamb	Clarify whether one can set DOPPLER to 1 when the channel is with high Doppler but does not have midambles (when the number of data symbols is greater	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:26:55Z) Reason: the current spec text follows HE-SIG-A's corresponding explanation.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:02:36Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14034	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	343	13	T	Y	343.13000488 28125	13	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Table 9-25h has only 7 bits, and it not sufficient to define the allocated RU in case of 160/80+80 MHz PPDUs	Clarify how the RU allocation is defined in the RX VECTOR.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:28:35Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:02:58Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1186 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14035	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	343	20	T	Y	343.20001220703125	20	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Table 9-25h has only 7 bits, and it not sufficient to define the allocated RU in case of 160/80+80 MHz PPDUs	Clarify how the RU allocation is defined.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:28:48Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:03:05Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14036	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	344	33	T	Y	344.32998657022656	33	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	The enumerated types here talks about GI duration as well, but 28.3.10.10 which is referenced for further details does not describe GI durations.	Either remove the GI durations from the enumeration description, or add GI duration to 28.3.10.10.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:29:02Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:03:19Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1187 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14037	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	344	56	T	Y	344.55999755859375	56	28.2.2		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0136r4	511	Number of HE-LTF symbols is needed for HE MU PPDUs as well	Change "FORMAT is HE_TRIG" to "FORMAT is HE_MU or HE_TRIG"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:29:15Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.1 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-16 01:03:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14038	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.2	347	23	T	Y	347.23001098 63281	23	28.2.2		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0754r0	581	Why is the SCRAMBLER_INITIAL_STATE 'not present' for HE_MU and HE_TRIG formats, but present for HE_SU and HE_EXT_SU formats?	Clarify why the SCRAMBLER_INITIAL_STATE is 'not present' for HE_MU and HE_TRIG formats, but is present for HE_SU and HE_EXT_SU formats?	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:22:15Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:20:31Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14039	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.3	349	3	E	Y	349.02999877 92969	3	28.2.3		A			648	Fix grammar	Change "The TRIGVECTOR carried" to "The TRIGVECTOR is carried".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:09:33Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:09:36Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1188 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14040	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.3	349	59	T	Y	349.58999633 78906	59	28.2.3		A	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	TRIGVECTOR is used to configure the AP to receive the HE TB PPDU it has triggered. Then why does the AP PHY need to know the Spatial Reuse field cont	Remove the row for SPATIAL_REUSE from Table 28-2.	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:46:27Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 18:44:34Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14041	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.3	350	17	T	Y	350.17001342 77344	17	28.2.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Table 9-25h has only 7 bits, and it not sufficient to define the allocated RU in case of 160/80+80 MHz PPDUs	Fix how MAC informs PHY on the RU allocation to use to receive HE TB PPDUs.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:47:02Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1189 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14042	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.3	350	38	T	Y	350.38000048828125	38	28.2.3		V	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	DCM is missing in TRIGVECTOR.	Add a row to Table 28-2 to add DCM to TRIGVECTOR.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:47:17Z) TGax Editor: please make changes to IEEE P802.11ax D2.3 according to the proposed text changes as resolution to C	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14043	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.4	350	43	T	Y	350.42999267578125	43	28.2.4		A	Bo Sun	11-18/0823r3	595	Why are we describing configuration for VHT PHY here?	Change "VHT PHY" to "HE PHY" at P350L 43, 49, 55 and 60.	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:47:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 18:44:19Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14044	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.5	351	4	E	Y	351.04000854049219	4	28.2.5		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	Incorrect reference	Change "Table 28-2" to "Table 28-3"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:35:15Z) - As proposed change TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0023r1 under all headings that include CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:35:22Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1190 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14045	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.5	351	14	T	Y	351.14001464 84375	14	28.2.5		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0023r1	450	Table 28-3 indicates how to transmit various different PPDU BWs as indicated by the CH_BANDWIDTH TXVECTOR parameter. However, HE MU PPDU has other CH	Add rows in Table 28-3 for CH_BANDWIDTH of HE-CBW-PUNC80-PRI, HE-CBW-PUNC80-SEC, HE-CBW-PUNC160-PRI20, HE-CBW-PUNC160-SEC40.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-18 22:03:46Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-17/0023r1 under all headings that include CID 14045.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:37:16Z - Did not add "HE-" prefix as this is inconsistent with other entries.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14046	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.2.6.3	354	60	T	Y	354.60000610 35156	60	28.2.6.3		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	The additional requirements on HT format (coming from VHT) should be applicable only for 5 GHz operation.	Add "when operating in the 5 GHz band" at the end of P354L60 and 62.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:10:42Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 14046	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:36:26Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14047	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.1	356	59	E	Y	356.58999633 78906	59	28.3.3.1		A			648	This is not the first place where OFDMA is used in Clause 28. Also, OFDMA is defined in 3.4.	Change "Orthogonal Frequency Division Multiple Access (OFDMA)" to "OFDMA".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:13:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:13:52Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1191 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14048	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.1	357	1	E	Y	357.01000976 5625	1	28.3.3.1		A			648	This is not the first place where RU is used in Clause 28. Also, RU is defined in 3.4.	Change "resource unit (RU)" to "RU". Also at P357 L50.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:14:42Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:14:45Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14049	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.3	365	3	T	Y	365.02999877 92969	3	28.3.3.3		J	Youhan Kim		657	Location for null sub carriers for 160/80+80 MHz PPDUs are missing.	Add a sentence saying that the null subcarrier locations in each 80 MHz segments of an 160/80+80 MHz PPDUs follow that of the 80 MHz PPDU.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:41Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14050	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.4	365	36	T	Y	365.35998535 15625	36	28.3.3.4		A	Youhan Kim	11-18/0057r0	460	There are only three LTF types - 1x, 2x and 4x. "Except 1x and 2x" is just 4x.	Change "same, except for the 1x HE-LTF and 2x HE-LTF." to "same for the 4x HE-LTF."	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:17:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 20:38:06Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14051	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	37	T	Y	366.36999511 71875	37	28.3.3.5		J	Junghoon Suh	11-18/0349r2	525	Why are we calling out "in the 2.4 GHz and 5 GHz frequency bands" here?	Delete " in the 2.4 GHz and 5 GHz frequency bands".	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 04:57:57Z) We need to keep it for clarification.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:22:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14052	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	42	E	Y	366.42001342 77344	42	28.3.3.5		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0771r1	587	"in" -> "using"	Change "in the" to "using the"	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:51:25Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0771r1 under all headings that include CID 14052.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed	The editor is unclear in what sense the 2.4 GHz band is relavant here. The editor is also unclear on exactly what tone mapping entails. Is there somet	I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 23:25:38Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14053	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	49	E	Y	366.48999023 4375	49	28.3.3.5		A			648	Remove comma	Remove comma after "RU,"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:27:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:27:26Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14054	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	59	T	Y	366.58999633 78906	59	28.3.3.5		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	Missing the exception for RUs specified in 28.3.3.6	Add language that RUs restricted by the list in 28.3.3.6 are not supported	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:42:30Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text updates for CID 14054 in 11-18/0508r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:02:40Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14055	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.5	366	61	E	Y	366.60998535 15625	61	28.3.3.5		A			648	Remove comma	Remove comma after "RU,"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:28:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:28:13Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14056	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	37	T	Y	367.36999511 71875	37	28.3.3.6		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	28.3.3.5 requires that 20 MHz operating non-AP HE STAs operate in the Primary 20 MHz channel.	Add "-RUs in which any of the sub carriers falls outside the Primary 20 MHz channel"	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:33:14Z) A 20 MHz operating STA with dot11HESubchannelSelectiveTransmissionImplemented equal to true may now operate in a	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14057	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.6	367	37	T	Y	367.36999511 71875	37	28.3.3.6		V	Sung Eun Lee	17/1763r1	443	Where are the "RU <N>" defined?	Add "where the subcarrier indices of RU N are defined in Table 28-6, Table 28-7 and Table 28-8."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-11-16 23:06:25Z) - Agree in principal to add the reference for clarification. However, Table 28-6 does not require to be referred	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	Edtis tagged with #13431	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1194 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14058	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.9.1	368	13	T	Y	368.13000048828125	13	28.3.3.9.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	STAs are required to receive HE MU PPDUs of RU sizes greater or equal to 106 subcarriers even if they do not support partial bandwidth DL MU-MIMO with	Change "shall support reception of an HE MU PPDU with RU sizes greater than or equal to 106 subcarriers." to "shall support receiving RU sizes greater	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:43:46Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 14058 and 14160 in 11-18/0508r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:04:01Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14059	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.9.1	368	28	T	Y	368.27999877 92969	28	28.3.3.9.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	For example, suppose NUM_USERS = 2. Then, what does "across 2" mean?	Change "across NUM_USERS" to "across all users".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:34:45Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CIDs 13434 and 14059 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:17:19Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14060	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	368	49	T	Y	368.48999023 4375	49	28.3.3.9.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	What about the case in which the PPDU bandwidth indicated by HE-SIG-A of HE MU PPDU uses preamble puncturing?	Clarify that a full bandwidth MU-MIMO is not applicable when preamble puncturing is employed.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:35:25Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CID 14060 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:17:32Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1195 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14061	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.11.2	369	64	T	Y	369.64001464 84375	64	28.3.3.11.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	STAs are required to transmit HE TB PPDUs of RU sizes greater or equal to 106 subcarriers even if they do not support partial bandwidth UL MU-MIMO wit	Change "shall support transmission and of an HE MU PPDU with RU sizes greater than or equal to 106 subcarriers." to " shall support receiving RU sizes	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:45:54Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13592, 13442, 14061 and 13632 in 11-18/0508r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:06:03Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14062	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.11.9	465	1	E	Y	465.01000976 5625	1	28.3.11.9		V			648	3.4 says "Dual carrier modulation".	Change "Dual subcarrier modulation (DCM)" to "Dual carrier modulation (DCM)"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:11:55Z) - Just use the acronym. There is plenty of use of the acronym before this instance and it is defined in 3.4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:12:28Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1196 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14063	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.12	477	25	T	Y	477.25	25	28.3.12		J	Youhan Kim		657	There is no need to have a non-normative requirement on top of a normative requirement as the normative requirement takes precedence.	Delete "TPE for an HESU, HEER SU or HEMU PPDU should be equal to TPE, nominal to minimize the packet extension overhead."	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:27:24Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14064	Youhan Kim	230	2	28	327	2	T	Y	327.01998901 36719	2	28		J	Lochan Verma		657	Throughout the draft, especially Clause 28, there are multiple terminologies referring to the same thing - (20 MHz) channel, subchannel, band, subband	Throughout the draft, especially Clause 28, there are multiple terminologies referring to the same thing - (20 MHz) channel, subchannel, band, subband	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:24Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14065	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.4	373	9	T	Y	373.08999633 78906	9	28.3.4		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	Signal Extension is needed for HT PPDUs as well, as well as 20 MHz 11g.	Add HT and NON_HT (11g) in the cases requiring Signal Extension. Same for P373L20.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:59:19Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 14065) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0151r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 21:58:25Z - with editorial changes	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1197 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14066	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.3	401	23	T	Y	401.23001098 63281	23	28.3.10.3		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Nsts is undefined.	Define Nsts used in Equation (28-8)	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:52:34Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID14066 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	see #11634	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14067	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.4	402	20	T	Y	402.20001220 703125	20	28.3.10.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Nsts is undefined.	Define Nsts used in Equation (28-10)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 01:58:23Z) It is defined under Equation (28-8). Doc IEEE 802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable definiti	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14068	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.5	404	17	T	Y	404.17001342 77344	17	28.3.10.5		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Nsts is undefined.	Define Nsts used in Equation (28-13)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:28:10Z) t is defined under Equation (28-8). Doc IEEE 802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable definitio	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1198 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14069	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.6	404	60	T	Y	404.60000061035156	60	28.3.10.6		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Nsts is undefined.	Define Nsts used in Equation (28-15)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:32:09Z) It is defined under Equation (28-8). Doc IEEE 802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable definiti	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14070	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	411	57	T	Y	411.57000732421875	57	28.3.10.7.2		V	Lochan Verma	11-18/0038r1	452	There are multiple lines saying the same thing.	Change "STBC is not applied in MU-MIMO RUs. STBC does not apply to HE-SIG-B. STBC is not applied in RUs that are used for MUMIMO allocation." to "ST	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:02:17Z) Resolved as in the resolution to CID 11406 in doc 11-18/0006r4.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 23:27:24Z - see #11406	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14071	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	412	28	E	Y	412.27999877 92969	28	28.3.10.7.2		A	Ross	17/00006r4	449	range " of"	Change "range 4 to 7" to "range of 4 to 7". Also on line 30.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-01-22 21:51:19Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:50:32Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1199 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14072	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	416	45	T	Y	416.45001220703125	45	28.3.10.7.2		J	Ron Porat		657	What does "The Spatial Reuse fields only apply to 20 Mhz used in the transmission" mean?	Clarify what "The Spatial Reuse fields only apply to 20 Mhz used in the transmission" means.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:27:09Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14073	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	420	4	T	Y	420.04000854 49219	4	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Nsts is undefined.	Define Nsts used in Equation (28-17)	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:41:06Z) It is defined under Equation (28-8). Doc IEEE 802.11-18/0201r1 provides guidelines for Equation variable definiti	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14074	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.2	421	48	T	Y	421.48001098 63281	48	28.3.10.8.2		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	Common field is not always present	Clarify that Common field is not always present	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:42:54Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID14074 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0110r6.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 18:08:19Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14075	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	1	T	Y	423.01000976 5625	1	28.3.10.8.3		V	Sigurd Schelstraete	11-18/0815r1	585	HE-SIG-B of an 80 MHz PPDU has total 256 tones including DC and guard tones. So, saying that HE-SIG-B occupies tones [-500:-259] and duplicated on [1	Either fix the tone indices used by HE-SIG-B content channels.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:28:21Z) No more modification is needed. This comment has been resolved by changes in D2.3. See resolution of CIDs 13368	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:15:08Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14076	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	25	T	Y	423.25	25	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0051r1	463	This paragraph is still referring to 80 MHz HE PPDU, but that is not clear because this is a new paragraph.	Clarify that this paragraph is still specific to 80 MHz HE MU PPDU only.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:10:23Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0051-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14077	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	29	T	Y	423.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.3		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0051r1	463	What does "is carried as the last User field in theThe User Specific field of an HE-SIG-B content channel consists of one or more HE-SIG-B contentcha	Clarify the meaning of "is carried as the last User field in theThe User Specific field of an HE-SIG-B content channel consists of one or more HE-SIG-	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:10:34Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0051-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 2.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14078	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	424	5	T	Y	424.04998779 296875	5	28.3.10.8.3		V	Sigurd Schelstraete	11-18/0936r0	589	What is "signaling"?	Clarify the meaning of "the signaling is carried in both HE-SIG-B content channels placed in the order of the absolute subcarrier index."	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:39:06Z) Tgax Editor: Make text modifications as shown in 802.11-18/0936r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 14:28:18Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1202 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14079	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	424	46	T	Y	424.45999145 50781	46	28.3.10.8.3		V	Sigurd Schelstraete	11-18/0815r1	585	What does "punctured 20 MHz channels removed" mean? For example, in case of BW field = 4 in HE-SIGA for HE MU PPDU, do the two HE-SIG-B content chann	Clarify what "punctured 20 MHz channels removed" means.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:29:21Z) Tgax Editor: please make text modifications as shown in 802.11-18/0815r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:26:37Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14080	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	424	54	T	Y	424.54000854 49219	54	28.3.10.8.3		V	Ron Porat	11-18/0118r6	466	Consider a 996-tones RU. There are four RU Allocation tables in which one or more User field(s) could be signalled, with two RU Allocation tables in	Add rule indicating that in case of 996-tone or 2x996-tone RUs, only the first RU Allocation table in each HE-SIG-B content channel may have non-zero	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 07:00:15Z) Editor instruction: same resolution as to CID 13407	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-26 22:48:39Z - see #13407	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14081	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	426	37	T	Y	426.36999511 71875	37	28.3.10.8.5		J	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	What about preamble punctured cases?	Clarify that N=2 even for preamble punctured 80 MHz PPDU, and N=4 for preamble punctured 160/80+80 MHz PPDU.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:36:13Z) As specified in PP489 Ln55, “When preamble puncturing happens in an HE MU PPDU, the HE MU PPDU is still treated a	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:40:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14082	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	431	25	T	Y	431.25	25	28.3.10.8.6		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	As written, if any User field indicated DCM=0, then the entire PPDU (all RUs) do not use DCM.	Clarify whether the DCM bit in User field is applicable only to a particular RU only, or to the entire PPDU.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:37:34Z) TGax Editor: Please change the text (marked as CID 14082) as indicated in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0352r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1204 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14083	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	432	32	T	Y	432.32000732421875	32	28.3.10.8.6		V	Sigurd Schelstraete	11-18/0815r1	585	What does "load balacing for RUs" mean?	Clarify what "load balancing" is.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-15 11:30:21Z) No more modification is needed. The issue addressed by this comment has been resolved by CID 11496	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 22:27:00Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14084	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.11.9	463	6	T	Y	463.05999755859375	6	28.3.11.9		V	Ross	11-18/0006r4	449	Is "b0 b1 b2 b3 b4 b5 b6 b7 b8 b9" in Figures 28-35 ~ 38 defined?	Define "b0 b1 b2 b3 b4 b5 b6 b7 b8 b9".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:13:01Z) Please make the changes according to the changes in doc 18-0006r4	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-22 22:51:41Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14085	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	38	T	Y	474.38000488281250	38	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Midamble 'may' be applied	Change "Midamble is applied" to "Midamble may be applied".	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:28:15Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:31:13Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1205 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14086	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	39	E	Y	474.39001464 84375	39	28.3.11.16		V			648	Only 'for'.	Change "defined only when" to defined only for"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:30:10Z) - For consistency, use "midamble" as a noun. Change to "Midambles are only inserted if N_STS <= 4". Change t	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:33:14Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14087	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.11.6	474	43	T	Y	474.42999267 578125	43	28.3.11.6		J	Hongyuan Zhang		657	PHY does not know the destination STA's capability. MAC does. Hence, P474L43 ~ P475L30 need to be moved to Clause 27.	Create a section for Midamble operation in Clause 27, and move this portion to Clause 27.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:27:16Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1206 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14088	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.18.3	491	11	T	Y	491.10998535 15625	11	28.3.18.3		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	Transceivers for HE160/80+80 MHz PPDUs may use two RF LOs, one for each 80 MHz portions.	Add to the end of 28.3.18.3: "Transmit signals with TXVECTOR parameter CH_BANDWIDTH set to CBW160 or CBW80+80 may be generated using two separate RF L	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:35:10Z) Already Resolved in D2.2, see comment resolution for CID 11890 (11-17/1730r2).	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:00:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14089	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.21	512	21	T	Y	512.21002197 26562	21	28.3.21		V	Xiaogang Chen	11-18/0463r2	529	Is there an "MCS0" in non-HT?	Change "MCS0" to "6 Mbps" on lines 21 and 22.	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:20:33Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0463r2 under all headings that include CID 14089.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:10:54Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1207 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14090	Youhan Kim	230	2	28.3.3.2	364	58	T	Y	364.57998657 22656	58	28.3.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	An AP should utilize the different RU sizes to increase the OFDMA efficiency.	Add to the end of 28.3.3.2 "An HE AP should make use of all RU sizes in HE MU and HE TB PPDUs to maximize the OFDMA efficiency."	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:40:59Z) Instruction to Editor: Add the following sentence at D2.2 P385L38. “The null subcarriers locations for 160 MHz	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 22:58:53Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14091	Yuchen Guo	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	31	T	Y	290.30999755 859375	31	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	There is no "RXSTART.indication" defined in the SPEC	change "RXSTART.indication" to "PHY-RXSTART.indication"	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 21:59:43Z) agree with the commenter. Apply the proposed changes in doc 1852r4 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14092	Yuchen Guo	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	44	T	Y	242.44000244 140625	44	27.5.1.1		J	Zhou Lan		657	An HE MU PPDU can only carry one Association response frame, which is not enough in the dense scenario.	Devise a scheme that allows multiple association response frames to be carried in an HE MU PPDU	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14093	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	9.3.1.23	86	40	T	Y	86.400001525 8789	40	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0740r1	639	HE AP should be allowed to trigger CF_End frame transmission from multiple HE STAs, to cancel over-reserved NAV set by MU-RTS/CTS. This is new but ne	Replace "8-15 Reserved" with "8 MU-CF_End" and add in the next line "9-15 Reserved" . Alternatively, define how an HE AP is restricted to over reserv	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:52:45Z) AP should not be over-allocating – it is expected to be cognizant of the requirement to estimate the size of the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14094	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.1	221	21	T	Y	221.21000671 38672	21	27.2.1		J	Yongho Seok	726r0	640	The commenter agrees with the principles of this subclause. Furthermore, the transmission power used within the TXOP will have effect on the interfer	Further define a way to turn RTS/CTS on/off based on the transmission power.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:00:53Z) Rejected- The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the change	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1209 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14095	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.2	221	52	T	Y	221.52000427246094	52	27.2.2		V	Kaiying Lv	964r1	655	Shouldn't the PPDU be classified as inter-BSS "PPDU" instead of inter-BSS "frame"?	If the Inter/Intra is an attribute of the PPDU, then, change all occurrence of "inter/intra-BSS frame" to "inter/intra-BSS PPDU".	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 23:39:32Z) Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. We have revised the sentence to avoid ambiguity. TGax editor p	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14096	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.2	221	64	E	N	221.63999938964844	64	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"the BSS ID of any BSS that is a member of the same multiple BSSID set..." I am not quite sure how but could this part be reworded so it is easier to	Reword the sentence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical: the condition is not clear. Must all the following be true: GROUP_ID = 0 and PARTIAL_AID not BSSID[39:47] of BSS or any BSS in set?	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14097	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.2	222	12	E	N	222.11999511171875	12	27.2.2		A			447	Extra period.	Remove second period.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:55Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:08:58Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1210 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14098	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.2	222	43	T	Y	222.42999267578125	43	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	Any response frame (such as ACK/BA/CTS) sent by associated AP in non-HT PPDU will not meet this condition, therefore third party STAs which can't rece	Define a way to convey BSS Color information for legacy PPDUs. The commenter is willing to provide details of the proposal.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14099	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.2	222	51	T	N	222.50999450683594	51	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"If the receive frame does not..." this sentence seems to be a duplicate of line 45 which says "Otherwise, the PPDU can not be..."	Remove the sentence that reads " If the received frame does not..."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14100	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.2	222	55	T	N	222.55000305 17578	55	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"A PPDU carrying at least..." What if a PPDU carries a mixture of inter/intra/non determinant frames?	If the intent of this sentence is to clarify an error case where there is a mixture of inter/intra/non determinant frames in a PPDU, then define what	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1211 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14101	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.3	222	59	T	N	222.58999633789062	59	27.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	What is the definition of a "non-SRG frame"? All frames that are not SRG frame?	Add definition of a non-SRG frame. Page 223 line 13 "Otherwise, the PPDU is not..." is probably the right place to do so.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:03:05Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14101.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14102	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.4	223	40	T	Y	223.39999389648438	40	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	OBSS-PD and SRP based SR allows for SR transmission if the received PPDU is an inter-BSS PPDU. Similarly an HE STA should be allowed to transmit at l	Replace "if one of the two NAV timers is nonzero, the virtual CS indication is that the medium is busy." with "if intra-BSS NAV timer is nonzero, the	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 20:59:45Z) Rejected – If a STA does spatial reuse, then the basic NAV is not even updated. As a result, there is no need t	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14103	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.4	223	55	T	Y	223.55000030517578	55	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	If an HE STA can indicate that the NAV set by the Duration field of the transmitted frame will not be cancelled or updated up until a certain point, t	Add signaling and rule to enable NAV level power saving for HE STAs by indication of static NAV. The commenter is willing to provide a detailed propo	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 21:01:05Z) Rejected – 11ax has already developed intra-PPDU PS that utilizes similar concept. See 27.14.1.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:34Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14104	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.4	225	13	T	Y	225.13000488281250	13	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	In highly dense environments, there will be cases where there are more than one OBSS that is visible to the STA. The spec should leave the option for	Define an optional mechanism where the STA can maintain NAV per OBSS.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 21:02:13Z) Rejected – The proposed mechanism is discussed offline when the two NAV mechanism is introduced. The general op	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:09:50Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14105	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.5.2	226	55	T	Y	226.55000305 17578	55	27.2.5.2		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	Why is the MU-RTS trigger frame restricted not to be sent in VHT/HE MU PPDU? Should it be restricted to be sent in non-HT PPDU to provide protection?	Remove sentence and add "An MU-RTS Trigger frame shall be carried in non-HT PPDU"	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:37:33Z) MU-RTS Trigger frame is restricted not to be sent in VHT/HE MU PPDU due to the following reasons. First, sending	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14106	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	19	T	N	227.19000244 140625	19	27.2.5.3		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	"...non-HT duplicate PPDU." Is there a definition of non-HT PDDUs that are sent across 80, 80+80, 160MHz channels?	Clarify that a non-HT duplicate PPDU can be sent across channels wider than 40 MHz.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:38:20Z) We note that “non-HT duplicate” is deifned officially in 3.1 Definitions as shown below. non-high-throughput (no	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14107	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	28	T	Y	227.27999877929688	28	27.2.5.3		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	The spec should allow for HE STAs to send the CTS frame in subset of channels that are not busy to the HE STA of the channels indicated in the RU allo	Allow the option for HE STA to send the CTS frame in subset of the channels indicated in the RU Allocation subfield of the trigger frame.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:38:57Z) We reject this comment based on the following reasons. First, responding to bandwidth allocated by AP is the requ	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14108	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.2.5.3	227	42	T	Y	227.41999816 89453	42	27.2.5.3		J	Po-Kai Huang	11-17/1878r1	479	Why would the HE AP require STA1 to send CTS only in primary 20MHz?	Add description as to why the AP requested for CTS transmission in only primary 20MHz to STA 1.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-23 07:40:02Z) AP can do RU allocation in MU-RTS for CTS responses for any implementation specific reasons. One reason can be th	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14109	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	31	T	Y	244.30999755859375	31	27.5.3.1		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0546r0	561	Trigger frame and UMRS Control field; why define two mechanism that does the same thing?	Remove mention of UMRS Control field as it achieves the same goal as a trigger frame.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:49:27Z) Each mechanism has its own purpose and are needed. UMRS mechanism enables an AP to solicit immediate response to	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 23:17:40Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14110	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.5.3.1	244	53	E	N	244.52999877929688	53	27.5.3.1		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"An HE AP shall finish configuration.." Terminologies used in this sentence is not aligned with other parts of the spec.	Reword the sentence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical. This is not a testable requirement and therefore shouldn't even be here. The statement, at best, informs the reader that PHY-TRIGGER.requires	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14111	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.5.3.2.1	245	51	T	N	245.50999450683594	51	27.5.3.2.1		J	George Cherian	717r1	635	Should the trigger frame immediately follow the ACKs?	Add the word "immediately" before "follow the Ack, ..."	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:36:22Z) Rejected - Comment is not clear.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:07:27Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14112	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.5.3.3	249	15	E	N	249.14999938 9648438	15	27.5.3.3		V			447	"If the either condition is not met,..." The sentence is unclear, what is the either condition?	Reword the sentence.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:13:49Z) - see #11990 which improves the logic	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:14:12Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14113	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.1	290	22	T	N	290.22000122 07031	22	27.9.1		J	Matt Fischer		657	The spec should allow the option for HESTAs to report the utilization of the medium where the HESTAs cannot hear the beacon from the OBSS AP.	The commenter is willing to provide further details if the group is willing to go in this direction.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14114	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	40	T	Y	290.39999389 64844	40	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"the received PPDU is not a non HT PPDU carrying a response frame...". The recipient only knows the content of the PPDU at the end of the PPDU, which	Remove part that reads "carrying a response frame"	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:04:02Z) there is no contradiction. a) can be done only before the end of the PPDU as it is CCA reset, b) can be done after	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1217 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14115	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	17	T	Y	291.17001342 77344	17	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	There is no way for HE STA to know that the non-HT PPDU does not carry a certain frame before the end of the PPDU.	Remove conditions that will not be known to the receiving STA until the end of the PPDU.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:29:46Z) The comment is correct, but this is not so important here, as it is possible to ignore the PPDU (by only ignoring	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14116	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	33	T	Y	291.32998657 22656	33	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In order to allow efficient use of SR resource, STA should be allowed to subtract the time it took to determine that the received PPDU is an inter-BSS	Add "If the PHYCCARESET.request primitive is issued before the end of the PPDU, the Backoff counter of the STA may be decremented by the time it took	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:32:54Z) the concept is interesting, but the proposed resolution is incomplete because it creates a new problem – i.e. the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14117	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	34	T	Y	291.33999633 78906	34	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Even if the TXOP is limited to the duration of the PPDU, the STA is allowed to send an SR PPDU that extends beyond the end of the TXOP. This SR PPDU	Add description as to how the SR PPDU will not collide with response to MU transmission.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:33:20Z) see resolution for CID 14278 which adds further restriction.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14118	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	3	T	Y	294.02999877 92969	3	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	What happens to the case where the HE STA ignores an inter-BSS PPDU but does not initiate countdown because it has nothing to send? The power restric	Add description that the power restriction period only starts when the STA starts countdown.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:51:22Z) the power restriction is needed even if the count is already zero with an empty queue because the STA might be tri	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1219 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14119	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.2.4	295	58	T	Y	295.57998657 22656	58	27.9.2.4		J	Matt Fischer		657	There is no requirement on when the STA that issued the CCARESET.request primitive during the inter-BSS PPDU re-issues the BUSY indication. If there	Define requirement on how the HESTA issues the BUSY indication when a) the inter-BSS is still being sent and b) another HE STA starts an SR PPDU trans	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14120	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.3.4	298	26	T	N	298.26000976 5625	26	27.9.3.4		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Any reason why this is "PPDU" instead of "MPDU" as in line 30?	change PPDU to MPDU	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:18:12Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14120	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1220 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14121	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.9.3.5	298	36	T	Y	298.35998535 15625	36	27.9.3.5		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	SRP and OBSS_PD transmit power requirements only apply if the STA has started countdown during an inter-BSS PPDU, i.e. has some PPDU to transmit in th	Remove this sentence and add description on how the responder effectively selection transmission power.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:20:15Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14121	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14122	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	58	E	N	303.57998657 22656	58	27.10.4.3		A			447	227.4.4, the spec isn't that long.	change 227 to 27.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:46:12Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:46:07Z- see #14304	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14123	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.15.2	314	51	T	N	314.51000976 5625	51	27.15.2		A	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"A STA may transmit a Control frame in a non-HT PPDU." This sentence is adding not adding any behavior.	Remove the sentence.	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 22:02:00Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1221 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14124	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.15.2	314	51	E	N	314.51000976 5625	51	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	The "first" and "second" notion is not adding anything.	Remove the words "first" and "second"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:45:17Z) - Agree with the comment. Removed “first” and replaced “second” with “receiving” TGax editor to make the chang	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Points a technical problem. What does "indicates the reception of HE ER SU PPDU" mean?	I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14125	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.15.2	314	51	E	N	314.58999633 78906	51	27.15.2		V			447	Define what peer HE STA is.	Define as suggested or remove the word peer.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:19:43Z) - Remove peer	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:19:55Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14126	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.15.2	314	55	E	N	314.54998779 296875	55	27.15.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"An HE AP transmits..." should be reworded as "An HE may transmit" as in other sentences in this subclause.	As suggested.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:45:35Z) - Agree with the comment. Accounted for the suggested changes. TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		These statements should be modified or deleted. As written they are meaningless -- they make obvious references.	I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:49:48Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1222 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14127	Yuichi Morioka	230	2	27.16.2.1	321	33	T	Y	321.32998657 22656	33	27.16.2.1		V	Abhishek Patil		606	Because the non-AP STA may have better knowledge about OBSSs the spec should define a way for STAs to request change of BSS Color.	Define a way for non-AP STAs to request change of BSS Color.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:34:31Z) Revised The spec does provide mechanism for non-AP STAs to determine whether there is a color collision and if s	EDITOR	Approved No Change	743r2		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-22 18:46:29Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14128	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	493	54	T	Y	493.54000854 49219	54	28.3.18.4.4		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	"i_f =1" of index of summation and its first value is missing in Equation (28-120)	add i_f =1 in Equation (28-120) to indicate frame i_f	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:38:23Z) Please refer to the resolution of CID 11387.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:54:28Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14129	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	495	3	T	Y	495.02999877 92969	3	28.3.18.4.4		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0159r3	462	"N_ST" needs to be replaced with "N_SD" in Equation (28-122)	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:39:14Z) Please refer to the resolution of CID 11391	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:56:18Z - see #11391	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1223 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14130	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.6.1	260	42	E	Y	260.42 00134277344	42	27.5.6.1		V			565	add the reference with "28.3.17 HE TB NDP feedback PPDU" at the end of the sentence. For example, "... is an HE TB PPDU without data payloads as defin	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:19:03Z) - Change "is an HE TB PPDU without data payloads" to "is an HE TB NDP feedback PPDU (see 28.3.17 (HE TB NDP fee	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:19:43Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14131	yujin noh	230	2	27.6.3	264	45	E	Y	264.45 00122070 3125	45	27.6.3		A			447	wrong reference is shown	"27.6.1a" needs to be replaced with "27.6.2"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:33:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:33:33Z - see #12514	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14132	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.6.4.1	262	47	T	Y	262.47 00012207031	47	27.5.6.4.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	Table 27-1 shows resource request with buffered bytes for transission from 1 to beyond the resource request butter threshold. To make a STA's behavior	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:27:04Z) agree with the comment. Clarify the behavior in such case. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:41:59Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1224 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14133	yujin noh	230	2	27.8.1	286	57	E	Y	286.57000732421875	57	27.8.1		A			447	"When a first STA transmit" needs to be replaced with "When a first STA transmits".	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:23:53Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:23:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14134	yujin noh	230	2	27.8.1	287	19	E	Y	287.19000244140625	19	27.8.1		V			648	"RX NSS" needs to be replaced with "Rx NSS" to be consistent with the same term through the spec.	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:31:01Z) - RX NSS is not a defined term. It presumably refers to what is indicated by the Rx NSS field. Rewrord to "chann	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:31:46Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14135	yujin noh	230	2	27.8.2	288	1	T	Y	288.01000976 5625	1	27.8.2		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	The titles of 27.8.2 and 27.8.3 seems to be better to have matched each other to be consistent. For example, Receive operating mode (ROM) indication =	as in comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:17:16Z) Accepted. (Change the title of 27.8.2 to: " Rules for receive operating mode (ROM) indication ")	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 20:46:39Z- The resolution to #12841 achieves the same result in a different manner. Making this change would recreate the identifie		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1225 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14136	yujin noh	230	2	27.8.3	289	2	T	Y	289.01 99890136719	2	27.8.3		A	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	UL MU Disallow is not a right term. It should be "UL MU Disable" defined in Figure 9-15d	as in comment	ACCEPTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:17:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:07:51Z - see #12187	2.1	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14137	yujin noh	230	2	27.8.3	289	21	T	Y	289.20 99914550781	21	27.8.3		V	Jarkko Kneckt	35R5	476	UMRS Control subfield? Or UMRS Control field? Two are mixed in use in 27.8.3. Use one consistent term.	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 07:18:55Z) Revised. Agree in principle. Change all UMRS Control fields to UMRS Control subfield. Make the changes shown in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-02-01 21:10:06Z - Global change	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14138	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	15	T	Y	257.14 99938964844	15	27.5.5.1		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	the name of subfield with "UL OFDMA RA Supports" subfield is not existed in HE MAC Capabilities Information field. "UL OFDMA RA Supports" => "OFDMA	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:09:43Z) TGax editor please make change as shown in the 11-18-0694r3 under all headings that include the CID 14138.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:24:49Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1226 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14139	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.5.1	257	17	T	Y	257.17001342 77344	17	27.5.5.1		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	the name of subfield with "UL OF DMA RA Supports" subfield is not existed in HE MAC Capabilities Information field. "UL OF DMA RA Supports" => "OF DMA	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:10:18Z) TGax editor please make change as shown in the 11-18-0694r3 under all headings that include the CID 14139.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:24:54Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14140	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	30	T	Y	259.29998779296875	30	27.5.5.2		J	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	RU Allocatoin/ Random Access RU Information subfield is the correct name in User Info field of the Trigger frame. RU allocation subfield -> RU Alloc	as in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:10:56Z) “RU Allocation” is the correct name of the subfield.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:24:28Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1227 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14141	yujin noh	230	2	9.3.1.23	91	27	T	Y	91.2699966430664	27	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0431r0	535	RU Allocatoin/ Random Access RU Information sub field is the correct name in User Info field of the Trigger frame. RU Allocation subfield -> RU Alloc	as in comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 05:55:03Z) The “Random Access RU Information” reuses the 6 bits of the “SS Allocation” when the AID12 sub-field is 0 or 2045	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 21:25:06Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14142	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	8	T	Y	259.07998657 22656	8	27.5.5.2		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	Looking at the part of sentense with " the number of eligible random accress RUs in the Trigger frame", " the number of eligible random access" seems t	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:11:50Z) Same resolution as CID 13096. No change is required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:25:05Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14143	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.1	57	38	T	Y	57.380001068115234	38	9.2.4.6.1		V	Yongho Seok	627r1	605	combine two sentences from L34 to L38. I don't see any reasons for HE variant left behind alone.	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 00:10:47Z) Revised- Agree in principle. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-18/0627r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1228 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14144	yujin noh	230	2	27.13	310	47	T	Y	310.47 000122 07031	47	27.13		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	"the MSI value that matches the MSI value" is ambiguous because two MSI values positioned in the different PPDU. To make it clear for exampe, the te	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:05:47Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution clarifies the ambiguity as suggested. TGax editor to make	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14145	yujin noh	230	2	27.13	310	57	T	Y	310.57 000732 421875	57	27.13		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	the sub field name is Packet Format defined in Figure 9-15f. "PPDU formats" => "Packet Format"	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:06:30Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution fixes the typo as suggested. TGax editor to make the chang	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	returned		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14146	yujin noh	230	2	27.13	310	57	T	Y	310.57 000732 421875	57	27.13		J	Frank Hsu	81r3	657	Tx BF subfield needs to be added in addition to " Packet Format, Coding Type, and Tx BF subfields"	as in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:08:30Z) - Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 22:08:44Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1229 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14147	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	65	45	T	Y	65.449996948 24219	45	9.2.4.6.4.4		J	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	make the meaning of the RU subfield simple like "Recommended RU" because all the detail is shown in Definition of colum of the same table.	as in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:13:16Z) Rejected. RU has two different meanings, as recommended in unsolicited MFB or as requested in solicited MFB. Sp	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:54:55Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14148	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	6	T	Y	66.059997558 59375	6	9.2.4.6.4.4		J	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	make the meaning of the BW subfield simple like "Recommended BW" because all the detail is shown in Definition of colum of the same table.	as in comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:14:05Z) Rejected. BW has two different meanings, as recommended in unsolicited MFB or as requested in solicited MFB. Sp	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-01-31 22:55:00Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14149	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	23	T	Y	66.2300033569336	23	9.2.4.6.4.4		V	Frank Hsu	81r3	480	PPDU type seems to have nothing to do with Coding Type information. The meaning of the MSI/PPDU type subfield does not represent its meaning well enou	as in comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-01-28 20:14:48Z) Revised. Agree with the comment. Proposed resolution changes the namings of “PPDU Type” to “Partial PPDU Paramet	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14150	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	23	E	Y	66.2300033569336	23	9.2.4.6.4.4		V			447	PPDU type or PPDU-Type? Term needs to be consistent through the spec	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:16:29Z) - Use "MSI/PPDU Type" as the sub field name	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:16:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14151	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	33	E	Y	66.3300018310469	33	9.2.4.6.4.4		V			447	the PPDU-Type subfield needs to be replaced with MSI/PPDU(-)Type sub field	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:17:42Z) - Use "MSI/PPDU Type" as the sub field name.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:18:00Z - see #14150	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14152	yujin noh	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.4	66	34	E	Y	66.33999633789062	34	9.2.4.6.4.4		A			447	wrong reference is shown. xxx needs to be replaced with Figure 15-f	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:18:48Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 16:18:51Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14153	yujin noh	230	2	27.14.1	311	42	E	Y	311.42001342 77344	42	27.14.1		A			447	UPLINK_FLAG is the correct name of UL_FLAG	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:12:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:12:33Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14154	yujin noh	230	2	27.14.1	311	56	E	Y	311.55999755859375	56	27.14.1		A			447	UPLINK_FLAG is the correct name of UL_FLAG	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:13:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:13:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14155	yujin noh	230	2	27.14.1	312	8	E	Y	312.07998657 22656	8	27.14.1		A			447	UPLINK_FLAG is the correct name of UL_FLAG	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:14:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:14:06Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14156	yujin noh	230	2	10.7.5.8	187	19	E	Y	187.19000244140625	19	10.7.5.8		A			447	HE_ER_SU PPDU needs to be replaced with HE ER SU PPDU as shown in Table 28-1	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:03:37Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-13 19:03:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14157	yujin noh	230	2	27.16.1	320	65	E	Y	320.64999389 64844	65	27.16.1		V			648	HE_ER_SU PPDU needs to be replaced with HE ER SU PPDU as shown in Table 28-1	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:18:39Z) - Fixed with resolutions to other comments. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 19:19:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1232 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14158	yujin noh	230	2	27.16.5	324	61	E	Y	324.60998535 15625	61	27.16.5		V			648	HE_ER_SU PPDU needs to be replaced with HE ER SU PPDU as shown in Table 28-1	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:46:47Z) - Fixed with resolution to #12599. No further change needed.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 18:47:12Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14159	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.3.2	364	55	T	Y	364.54998779 296875	55	28.3.3.2		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0934r1	596	make it clear whether the sentence "In an HE MU PPDU, at least N x 4 x 26 subcarriers (contiguous or non-contiguous) shall be occupiedthroughout the s	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 02:53:41Z) Instruction Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CIDs 13428, 13952 and 14159 in 11-18/0934r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 19:56:25Z - see #13428	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14160	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.3.9.1	368	15	T	Y	368.14999389 64844	15	28.3.3.9.1		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0508r1	514	"RU size greater than or equal to 106 subcarriers" does not exclude 242 subcarriers even on 20MHz operating channel though its name (Partial Bandwidth	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:43:57Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the proposed text update for CID 14058 and 14160 in 11-18/0508r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-27 23:04:08Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1233 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14161	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.3.9.3	369	33	T	Y	369.32998657 22656	33	28.3.3.9.3		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	define u in NSTS,r,u. For example, " If a STA u is included as a ...." at L33 or " If a STA u finds" at L34 could be possible.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:36:00Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CID 14161 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:17:51Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14162	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.3.10	369	42	T	Y	369.42001342 77344	42	28.3.3.10		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	add "a UMRS Control field" after a Trigger frame	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:36:13Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CID 14162 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:01Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14163	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.3.11.5	370	40	T	Y	370.39999389 64844	40	28.3.3.11.5		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	add both "a UMRS Control field" after a Trigger frame and corresponding description in 28.3.3.11.5.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:36:28Z) Instruction to Editor: Implement the text update for CID 14163 and 13633 in 11-18/0779r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:15Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14164	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.9	397	10	E	Y	397.10000610 35156	10	28.3.9		V			648	"Power Boost Factor" subfield is the correct. "Power Boost Factor +a_r Support" subfield is defined at Table 9-262aa (Subfields of the HE PHY Capabili	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:57:10Z) - Change to "Power Boost Factor Support subfield"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 22:57:31Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14165	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	407	15	E	Y	407.14999389 64844	15	28.3.10.7.2		V			648	Doppler subfeld ==> Doppler field. Looking the first row of the Table 28-18, HE-SIG-A consists of many "fields" (not subfields)	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:05:42Z) - Change made with resolution to #14186. No further change required.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:06:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14166	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	407	27	E	Y	407.26998901 36719	27	28.3.10.7.2		A			648	"B25 is set 0" needs to be replaced with "B25 is set to 0". Add "to" between set and 0.	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:06:14Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:06:17Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1235 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14167	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	417	6	E	Y	417.05999755859375	6	28.3.10.7.2		A			648	in the text as " Spatial Reuse 1, Spatial Reuse 2, Spatial Reuse 3 and Spatial Reuse 4 subfields", "subfield" needs to be replaced with "field" to be c	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:14:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:14:44Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14168	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	417	10	E	Y	417.10000610 35156	10	28.3.10.7.2		A			648	"Spatial Reuse subfield" in Table 28-21 needs to be replaced with "Spatial Reuse field" to be consistent through this chapter	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:15:00Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:15:03Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14169	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	417	31	E	Y	417.30999755859375	31	28.3.10.7.2		A			648	in the text as " Spatial Reuse 1, Spatial Reuse 2, Spatial Reuse 3 and Spatial Reuse 4 subfields", "subfield" needs to be replaced with "field" to be c	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:15:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:15:10Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1236 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14170	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.2	417	34	E	Y	417.33999963378906	34	28.3.10.7.2		A			648	"Spatial Reuse subfield" in Table 28-22 needs to be replaced with "Spatial Reuse field" to be consistent through this chapter	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:15:30Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:15:33Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14171	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	28	T	Y	423.27999877792969	28	28.3.10.8.3		V	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0352r1	512	Looking at "When assigned, the User field corresponding to the center 26-tone RU that spans subcarriers [-16:-4, 4:16] is carried as the last User fie	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:34:22Z) Refer to resolution for CID 14077 in doc.: IEEE 802.11-18/0051r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	See #13469	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14172	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.3	423	64	E	Y	423.64001464843375	64	28.3.10.8.3		J			648	"the center 26-tone RU" ==> "a center 26-tone RU"	as in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:16:49Z) - "the" is appropriate - there is only one.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 16:17:03Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1237 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14173	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.4	423	29	E	Y	423.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.4		A			648	For the c-th content channel (c=1 or 2), there is no 1-th or 2-th. It could be modified below as an example, For the HE-SIG-B content channel c (c=1	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:18:51Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-11 23:18:55Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14174	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	419	24	T	Y	419.23999023 4375	24	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	wTSYML needs to be modified with wHE-SIG-A	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:33:10Z) T_HE-SIG-A is defined in Table 28-12 as the duration of entire HE-SIG-A field, which consists of two OFDM symbol	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1238 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14175	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.7.4	420	3	T	Y	420.02999877 92969	3	28.3.10.7.4		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0110r6	517	wTSYML needs to be modified with wHE-SIG-A	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 02:39:30Z) T_HE-SIG-A is defined in Table 28-12 as the duration of entire HE-SIG-A field, which consists of two OFDM symbol	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14176	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	427	13	T	Y	427.13000488 28125	13	28.3.10.8.5		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	Looking at "In the table, the number of entries column refers ... . Here number of entries is the name of column such that "the number of entries" nee	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:12:08Z) Tgax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:52:35Z - No need to capitalize "number" (its descriptive, not a name)	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1239 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14177	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.5	429	29	T	Y	429.29000854 49219	29	28.3.10.8.5		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	Looking at "number of 8-bit indices that ... . Here 8-bit indices is the name of column such that "8-bit indices" needs to be modified with "8 bits in	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:12:26Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 21:57:28Z - Well, um, yes. The editor is confused by the terminology being used here.	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14178	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	430	52	T	Y	430.51998901 36719	52	28.3.10.8.6		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	Considering the first row of Table 28-25, User field consists of many field. So" subfields" needs to be modified with "fields."	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:12:40Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:05:17Z - I've made some editorial changes here. Tables 28-25 and 28-26 define field formats and thus should be identified as suc	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14179	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	431	37	T	Y	431.36999511 71875	37	28.3.10.8.6		V	Yujin Noh	11-18/0050r1	458	Considering the first row of Table 28-26, User field consists of many field. So" subfields" needs to be modified with "fields."	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:13:07Z) TGax Editor: make changes according to this document 11-18-0050-01-00ax CR on HE-SIG-B part 1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:16:57Z - Editorial changes. See #14178	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1240 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14180	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.10.10	437	9	E	Y	437.08999633 78906	9	28.3.10.10		A			648	add the reference 28.3.17 properly lik 28.3.17 (HE TB ND P feedback PP DU)	as in comment	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:03:56Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 17:03:59Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14181	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.5.1	455	63	T	Y	455.63000488 28125	63	28.3.11.5.1		J	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	wrong reference. It shouyld be "After encoding, the encoded data is punctured by the method defined in 17.3.5.7 (Data interleaving)"	as in comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:11:40Z) The reference is correct. Statements “Higher rates are derived from it by employing “puncturing.” Puncturing is	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14182	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.5.1	455	65	T	Y	455.64999389 64844	65	28.3.11.5.1		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	worng reference. It should be "In the case that rate 5/6 coding is selected, the puncturing scheme will be the same as described in 19.3.11.6 (Binary	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:12:13Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID14182 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:04:46Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1241 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14183	yujin noh	230	2	3.2	33	60	T	Y	33.599998474121094	60	3.2		V			619	Looking at the definition on "high efficiency (HE) single stream pilot HE LTF mode: A UL MU-MIMO LTF mode that uses single stream pilots", it seem to	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:33:31Z) - In TGax draft, the HE single stream pilot HE LTF mode definition is used only for indicating the LTF type use	EDITOR	Approved No Change			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 18:50:28Z - see #13530	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
14184	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.5.4	458	1	T	Y	458.010009765625	1	28.3.11.5.4		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	add the defintion of N_u in Equation (28-72)	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:13:13Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID14184 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-28 23:21:37Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14185	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.8	462	3	T	Y	462.02999877792969	3	28.3.11.8		V	Yan Zhang	11-18/0111r1	518	It missed the bracket to close in the sentence. For example, it could be below (The interleaver parameters, NCOL, NROW, and NROT, for the Data field	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:15:36Z) Change to as in the resolution of CID14185 in doc IEEE802.11-18/0111r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 17:25:59Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1242 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14186	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	43	T	Y	474.42999267578125	43	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Doppler subfeld of the HE-SIG-A field ==> Doppler field of the HE-SIG-A field through 28.3.11.16 (Midamble). Looking the first row of the Table 28-	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:28:59Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:57:33Z - Some of these changes are incorrect. It is Doppler subfield in the Common field of the Trigger frame, but Doppler field	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14187	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	51	T	Y	474.51000976 5625	51	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Doppler subfeld of the HE-SIG-A field ==> Doppler field of the HE-SIG-A field through 28.3.11.16 (Midamble). Looking the first row of the Table 28-	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:29:07Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:58:24Z - see #14186	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1243 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14188	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	474	58	T	Y	474.57998657 22656	58	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Doppler subfeld of the HE-SIG-A field ==> Doppler field of the HE-SIG-A field through 28.3.11.16 (Midamble). Looking the first row of the Table 28-	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:29:35Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:58:49Z - see #14186	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14189	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	40	T	Y	476.39999389 64844	40	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Doppler subfeld of the HE-SIG-A field ==> Doppler field of the HE-SIG-A field through 28.3.11.16 (Midamble). Looking the first row of the Table 28-	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:32:14Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:59:04Z - see #14186	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14190	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	41	T	Y	476.41000366 21094	41	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Doppler subfeld of the HE-SIG-A field ==> Doppler field of the HE-SIG-A field through 28.3.11.16 (Midamble). Looking the first row of the Table 28-	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:32:23Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:59:13Z - see #14186	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1244 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14191	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	26	T	Y	475.26000976 5625	26	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Doppler Tx field ==> Doppler Tx sub field. HE PHY Capabilities Information field contains Doppler Tx subfield and Doppler Rx subfield as shown in Ta	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:30:09Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:00:02Z- see #12722	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14192	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	30	T	Y	475.29998779 296875	30	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Full Bandwidth UL MU-MIMO field ==> Full Bandwidth UL MU-MIMO subfield. HE PHY Capabilities Information field contains Full Bandwidth UL MU-MIMO su	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:30:17Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:00:12Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14193	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	475	34	T	Y	475.33999633 78906	34	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Midamble Rx Max NSTS field ==>Midamble Rx Max NSTS subfield. HE PHY Capabilities Information field contains Midamble Rx Max NSTS subfield as shown	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:30:44Z) Editor instruction: Change as in doc IEEE802.11-18/0058r1.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:00:32Z- see #12722	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14194	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.11.16	476	19	T	Y	476.19000244 140625	19	28.3.11.16		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0058r1	461	Where does "M_MA Data Symbols" indicate in Figure 28-39 and Figure 28-39? make it clear like HE-LTFs with arrows	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 01:31:45Z) Resolved as in resolution to CID 12064	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 23:30:32Z - see #12064	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14195	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.12	476	64	E	Y	476.64001464 84375	64	28.3.12		J			648	TPE => T_PE at P476 L64, P477L3 and P477L4 as shown in Table 28-42	as in comment	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:30:40Z) - The bracketed title is there to help check the accuracy of the references.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-12 18:31:04Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1246 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14196	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.12	478	34	T	Y	478.33999633 78906	34	28.3.12		V	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	PE_duration seems to indicate "TXVECTOR parameter PE_DURATION". Make it clear with proper term.	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:39:15Z) Agree with the commenter in principle. However, the relevant text has already been fixed in D2.3 (see P529L3).	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:18:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14197	yujin noh	230	2	9.3.1.23.8	98	2	T	Y	98.019996643 0664	2	9.3.1.23.8		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	Given the "encoded value" and "its definition" of Multiplexing Flag as shown in "The Multiplexing Flag subfield indicates the number of STAs that are	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:13:34Z) Clarify the sentence. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:23:02Z - Moved the description of the Multiplexing Flag subfield to before the equation. What a field "indicates" is meaning. Th	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1247 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14198	yujin noh	230	2	27.5.6.2	261	15	T	Y	261.14999938964844	15	27.5.6.2		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	Given the "encoded value" and "its definition" of Multiplexing Flag as shown in "The Multiplexing Flag subfield indicates the number of STAs that are	as in comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:20:08Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:34:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14199	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.16	484	35	T	Y	484.35000610 35156	35	28.3.16		V	Yongho Seok		614	Considering entire 11 specs, NDP is not defined only for HE sounding procedure. Add HE before NDP to make it clear. NDP => HE NDP	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:28:13Z) - Because this sentence is meaningless, it is removed. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:32:49Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1248 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14200	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.16	484	64	T	Y	484.64 00146484375	64	28.3.16		V	Yongho Seok		614	Incorrect field name with Beamformed field. Beamformed field should be modified with TxBF field.	as in comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:29:09Z) - Change the Beamformed field to the TxBF field. TGax editor makes changes as shown in the as specified in 11-	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-31 17:47:49Z	3	2018-05-31	EDITOR
14201	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.17	485	21	T	Y	485.20 99914550781	21	28.3.17		A	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	PE_duraton is not defined in the spec. it should be PE_DURATION.	as in comment	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 14:05:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:00:47Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14202	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.18.1	485	39	T	Y	485.39 00146484375	39	28.3.18.1		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	HE-SIG-A field consists of many fields as shown in Table 28-18. Bandwidth sub field should be modified with Bandwidth field	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:33:47Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CIDs 13765, 14202, 14203, 14204 and 14205 in doc IEEE	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:57:00Z - Did not remove "field" from "HE-SIG-A field" (the PPDU is divided into fields with the HE-SIG-A field one of them -- se	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1249 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14203	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.18.1	485	40	T	Y	485.39999938964844	40	28.3.18.1		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	HE-SIG-A field consists of many fields as shown in Table 28-18. Bandwidth sub field should be modified with Bandwidth field	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:33:59Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CIDs 13765, 14202, 14203, 14204 and 14205 in doc IEEE	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 17:59:50Z- Did not remove "field" from "HE-SIG-A field" (the PPDU is divided into fields with the HE-SIG-A field one of them -- see	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14204	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.18.1	485	43	T	Y	485.42999267578125	43	28.3.18.1		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	HE-SIG-A field consists of many fields as shown in Table 28-18. Bandwidth sub field should be modified with Bandwidth field	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:34:10Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CIDs 13765, 14202, 14203, 14204 and 14205 in doc IEEE	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:00:02Z- Did not remove "field" from "HE-SIG-A field" (the PPDU is divided into fields with the HE-SIG-A field one of them -- see	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14205	yujin noh	230	2	28.3.18.1	485	44	T	Y	485.44000244140625	44	28.3.18.1		V	Jianhan Liu	11-18/0475r2	530	HE-SIG-A field consists of many fields as shown in Table 28-18. Bandwidth sub field should be modified with Bandwidth field	as in comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-03-13 05:34:48Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CIDs 13765, 14202, 14203, 14204 and 14205 in doc IEEE	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 18:00:07Z - Did not remove "field" from "HE-SIG-A field" (the PPDU is divided into fields with the HE-SIG-A field one of them -- se	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14206	Yunbo Li	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	23	T	Y	85.230003569336	23	9.3.1.23		A	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0065r2	491	In the exsiting standard draft, the MAC header of each frame is indicated in the figure of the frames. But in 11ax draft 2.0, the MAC header of Trigge	Add the MAC header indication in Figure 9-52c-Trigger frame	ACCEPTED (MU: 2018-01-24 00:17:49Z) TGax editor, please indicate MAC header in the figure showing Trigger frame format and VHT/HE NDP Announcement fr	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-14 17:53:29Z - Note that there is now an inconsistency with the VHT NDP Announcement figure	2.2	2018-02-14	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14207	Yunbo Li	230	2	10.28.2	206	55	T	Y	206.55000305 17578	55	10.28.2		V	Yunbo Li	512r4	568	When STA with less antennas than AP, after the STA obtain the channel, and do UL SU transmission, it is a kind of waste of antennas at AP side. If the	After STA grant the channel to AP, allows the AP to shechle UL MU-MIMO transmission. In order to guarantee the throughput of initiator STA, the AP sho	REVISED (MAC: 2018-03-17 21:35:56Z) Revised – agree in pricple The DL MU-MIMO already adopted in RDG in 11ax draft 1.3 (see CR of CID 3160). The U	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 18:17:59Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14208	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.5.5.1	258	8	T	Y	258.07998657 22656	8	27.5.5.1		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	Why AID12 equal to 0 applies to a unassociated HE STA?	delete "0 or" in the sentence "... to be used reception of a Trigger frame containing RU with an AID12 subfield equal to 0 or 2045."	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:08:59Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 14208 Also, please see CID	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1252 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14209	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	50	T	Y	258.5	50	27.5.5.2		J	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	OCW can not be any integer in the range [OCWmin, OCWmax]	change to wording to make it more accurate	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:12:51Z) OCW is an integer between OCWmin and OCWmax. The only way to update it is by using the formula OCW=2xOCW+1 in cas	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:24:13Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions. EDITOR: 2018-05-17 21:24:04Z- The resolution contains no editing instru		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14210	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	58	T	Y	258.57998657 22656	58	27.5.5.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1849r2	482	The value of AID12 subfleld is better here.	change "AID value 0" to "the value of AID12 subfield equal to 0"	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-23 08:10:11Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-17/1849r2 that are marked with CID 14210	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1253 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14211	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.5.5.2	259	49	T	Y	259.48999902343375	49	27.5.5.2		V	Stephane Baron	11-18/0694r3	623	The sentence " If the OBO counter is greater than the number of eligible random access Rus, then the STA resumes with its OBO counter in the next Trigg	change "If the OBO counter is greater than the number of eligible random access Rus" to "If the OBO counter doesn't decrements to 0"	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:13:24Z) TGax editor please make change as shown in the 11-18-0694r3 under all headings that include the CID 14211.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14212	Yunbo Li	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	140	56	T	Y	140.55999755859375	56	9.4.2.237.3		A	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	The word "only" is missed before "the secondary 20 MHz"	add "only" before "the secondary 20 MHz".	ACCEPTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:46:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:05:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14213	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	53	T	Y	290.52999877 92969	53	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	HE PPDU should not be excluded in the first three sub bullets.	delete "non-HE" in all the sub bullets.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:05:08Z) this would be redundant as the if carried in an HE PPDU, these frames can not be classified as inter-BSS PPDU, whi	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1254 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14214	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	18	T	Y	291.17999267578125	18	27.9.2.1		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	HE PPDU should not be excluded in the first three sub bullets.	delete "non-HE" in all the sub bullets.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:30:23Z) non-HE is needed here, as the problem is already solved for HE PPDUs, where the BSS_color is set accordingly.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14215	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.2.3	222	59	T	Y	222.58999633789062	59	27.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Please add the purpose and scenario to introduce SRG.	Please add the purpose and scenario to introduce SRG.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 09:10:02Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14215	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14216	Yunbo Li	230	2	27.9.2.3	295	1	T	Y	295.01000976 5625	1	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	Since restriction period 1, 2 and 3 terminated at the same time, why do we need to introduce multiple restriction periods in the mechanism?	Can we keep only single restriction period during the OBSS_PD_SR?	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:10:44Z) it is one way of representing the normative rules in the specification.	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1255 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14217	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	1	1	1	E	N	1.0099999904632568	1	1		V			447	"HE non-AP STA" and "non-AP HE STA" are mixed through this document.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:04:53Z) - Globally replace HE non-AP STA with non-AP HE STA.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 21:05:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14218	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	1	1	1	E	N	1.0099999904632568	1	1		V			447	"a HE" should be "an HE".	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:54:25Z) - Perform a global search and replace occurances of "a HE" with "an HE"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-06 20:54:56Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14219	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	3	29	2	E	N	29.020000457763672	2	3		J			657	There is a note "IEEE Std 802.11 supports only downlink (DL) MU-MIMO" in 802.11-2016 baseline document.	Add instruction to edit this note or delete it.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1256 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14220	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	3.2	33	11	E	N	33.110000610 35156	11	3.2		A	Matt Fischer	18/0525r1	572	Common Info field SPATIAL_REUSE of DSRP_PPDU also should not be SRP_AND_NONSRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED.	Change "SRP_DISALLOW" to "SRP_DISALLOW or SRP_AND_NONSRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:15:26Z) - TGax Editor: Instruct the editor to change the statement to "DSRP_PPDU (Delayed SRP_PPDU): a PPDU that conta	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Technical	I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:29:42Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14221	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	3.2	34	57	E	N	34.569999694 82422	57	3.2		J			657	SRP_PPDU is now just DSRP_PPDU only .	Delete this definition and change "SRP_PPDU" to "DSRP_PPDU" in the specification.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Passing to SR ad-hoc. Clean up terminology around SRP_PPDU, SRP PPDU, DSRP_PPDU. If an SRP_PPDU is a DSRP_PPDU why does the term exist?	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14222	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	30	E	N	89.300003051 75781	30	9.3.1.23		A			447	Table number is not correct.	Change to "Table 28-20 HE-SIG-A field of an HE TB PPDU".	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:51:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:51:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14223	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	29	E	N	89.290000915 52734	29	9.3.1.23		A			447	"TB PPDU" should be "HE TB PPDU".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:50:00Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:50:03Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1257 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14224	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	9.3.1.23	89	40	E	N	89.400001525 8789	40	9.3.1.23		A			447	"Spatial Reuse field" should be "Spatial Reuse subfield".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:52:34Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-07 22:52:37Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14225	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	9.4.2.237.3	142	25	T	Y	142.25	25	9.4.2.237.3		J	Lochan Verma	11-18/0404r1	523	The conditions if SU Beamformer is mandatory (pp142L25) and if MU Beamformer is mandatory(pp142L36, pp263L34, pp263L38) cross-refer and are not clear.	Restructure and clarify these conditions according to following structure: If Nss => 4 is supported, SU beamformer subfield and MU beamformer subfi	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-13 03:49:53Z) An AP that supports MU beamformer function automatically supports SU beamformer function because the sounding pr	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-29 22:10:59Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14226	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	9.4.2.243	156	46	E	N	156.46000671 38672	46	9.4.2.243		V		17/1852r8	474	This element also provides information needed by STAs when performing SRP-based spatial reuse.	Add SRP-based spatial reuse.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:17:59Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14227	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	9.4.2.243	157	46	E	N	157.46000671 38672	46	9.4.2.243		V		17/1852r8	474	Delete "SRP-based SR transmissions".	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:20:37Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1258 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14228	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.1	221	36	E	N	221.36000061035156	36	27.2.1		J	Yongho Seok		657	Features described in this subclause are for HE devises, so it is not needed to mention that legacy devises do not support them.	Delete "The dot11TXOPDurationRTSThreshold is not present at a non-HE non-AP STA."	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		We typically don't mention that HE features are not present in previous generations or other types of STA.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14229	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.2	222	11	E	N	222.11000061035156	11	27.2.2		V			447	Extra period.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:07:10Z) - Remove extra period	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:07:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14230	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.2	222	27	E	N	222.27000427246094	27	27.2.2		A			447	No period.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:24Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:09:27Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14231	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.2	222	37	E	N	222.36999511 71875	37	27.2.2		A			447	A part of brackets is left.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:10:05Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:10:08Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14232	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.2	222	49	T	Y	222.49000549316406	49	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	"the decision made by using the MAC address takes precedence", but no specific decision rule is defined in aboves.	Define it or prioritize the rules in aboves.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1259 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14233	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.2	222	51	T	Y	222.50999450683594	51	27.2.2		J	Kaiying Lv		657	What this sentence define is already covered by L45 and it is duplicated.	Delete this sentence.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14234	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.3	222	59	E	N	222.58999633789062	59	27.2.3		V			447	There is no definition of "non-SRG frame."	Remove "and non-SRG"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:12:23Z) - Agree in principle. Also, the object identified is not a frame but a PPDU. And the action is "identification"	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:14:47Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14235	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.3	223	2	E	N	223.02000427246094	2	27.2.3		V			447	"Numerical value" is not common expression in IEEE802.11-2016. Same comments on L6, L11 and pp297L52.	Delete "Numerical".	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:19:38Z) - Agree in principe. Also "bit which corresponds" is not as acurate as "bit indexed by". Change "if the bit in	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:21:34Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1260 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14236	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.4	223	65	T	Y	223.64999389648438	65	27.2.4		J	Po-Kai Huang	353r1	531	What if the RA is broadcast or multicast address? Same comments on the conditions defined in pp223.	Add "broadcast address or multicast address intended for the STA."	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-12 21:03:11Z) Rejected – For broadcast or multicast address, the intention is to set the NAV. Note that in 10.3.2.4, the base	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-04-02 20:08:38Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14237	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.2.4	224	9	E	N	224.08999633789062	9	27.2.4		A			447	"STA STA" should "STA".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:12Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:38:16Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14238	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.5.2	226	55	E	N	226.55000305 17578	55	27.4.5.2		J			447	It is clearer to address a list of PPDU format which can carry an MU-RTS.	As commented.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:46:49Z) - Not necessarily. A "may" statement could be added for the PPDU formats allowed, but we still need a "shall n	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 18:47:52Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14239	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.6.2	229	17	T	Y	229.16999816 89453	17	27.6.2		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0684r2	599	The operation when the HEMUEDCA Timer[AC] reaches zero should consider the retry counters. The retry counters should be reset to 0 at updating of EDCA	Two suggestion. 1. Provide technical reason not to reset retry count. 2. Add the following texts at the end. "When the STA update the CWmin[AC], CWmax	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-15 07:39:10Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0684r2 under all headings that include CID 14239.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 21:42:32Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14240	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.6.2	229	17	T	Y	229.16999816 89453	17	27.6.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0684r2	599	Once the HEMUEDCA Timer is set, there is no way to reset or terminate it even if there is no buffered data which should be triggered. The specificatio	Define a way to reset or terminate HEMUEDCA for AP.	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-15 07:39:46Z) The reception of an UL MU Disable bit set to 1 is an indication to the AP that the STA is terminating its HE MUE	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14241	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.3.1	229	63	E	N	229.63000048828125	63	27.3.1		V			447	"We call" is not appropriate expression in the spec.	Replace the last sentence with "Dynamic fragments is the fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation."	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:13:49Z) - Change to " The fragments generated with dynamic fragmentation are referred to as dynamic fragments."	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:14:04Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14242	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.3.2.1	230	14	E	N	230.13999938964844	14	27.3.2.1		V			447	"under level 3 dynamic fragmentation" is unclear indirect expression.	Replace it with "with level 1 or 2 dynamic fragmentation"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 19:58:16Z) - Agree in principle. Replace the paragraph with the following: " With level 1 and level 2 dynamic fragmentation	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:00:25Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14243	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.3.3.4	234	14	E	N	234.13999938964844	14	27.3.3.4		V			447	No period in L14, L19, L24, L25.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:30:50Z) - Add period at cited locations	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:30:48Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1263 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14244	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.1	235	8	E	N	235.08000018310547	8	27.4.1		J			447	"an AP" should be "an HE AP" in this paragraph.	As commented.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:48:35Z) - That would be a technical change. A non-AP HE STA might use the Multi-STA BlockAck frame with a TDLS peer wh	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:49:50Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14245	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.1	235	11	E	N	235.11000061035156	11	27.4.1		A			447	Need space between "recipient." and "A non-AP".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:50:09Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 20:50:12Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14246	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.1	236	6	E	N	236.05999755859375	6	27.4.1		A			447	Brackets are not needed.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:05:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:05:31Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14247	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.1	236	9	E	N	236.08999633789062	9	27.4.1		A			447	"shall contains" should be "shall contain"	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:06:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 21:06:08Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14248	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.2	237	45	E	N	237.44999694 82422	45	27.4.2		J	George Cherian		657	The condition says "as defined below" but there may not be more definition below.	Remove ", and as defined below".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical: what is being referred to here?	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1264 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14249	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.2	237	53	E	N	237.52999877929688	53	27.4.2		J	George Cherian		657	"single MPUD" looks similar with "S-MPDU". Use other expression.	As commented.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Technical: this is ambiguous. Does it mean "one MPDU" or "an MPDU in an A-MPDU subframe with the EOF subfield in the MPDU delimiter equal to 1"? Repl	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14250	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.3	237	61	T	Y	237.61000061035156	61	27.4.3		V	George Cherian	717r1	635	The rules in this subclause need to be limited in HE devises but no description like "an HE STA shall"	As commented.	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:37:40Z) Revised - Agree in principle. Updated text in D2.3 already reflects the requested change. No further change needed	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:05:58Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1265 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14251	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.3	237	63	T	Y	237.63000048828125	63	27.4.3		J	George Cherian	717r1	635	What is it "different" from?	Clarify.	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 16:38:24Z) Rejected - The intention is to imply different BA bitmap length, since a variable bitmap is allowed in 11ax	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 22:06:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14252	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.4.4.6	241	37	E	N	241.36999511871875	37	27.4.4.6		A			447	Here is only one first indent list so "a)" should be just "--".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:17:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-14 23:17:09Z - see #12830	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14253	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.2	243	60	E	N	243.60000610351562	60	27.5.2		J			447	"include" should be "aggregate"	As commented.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:03:38Z) - include in an A-MPDU is used elsewhere	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:06:26Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14254	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.2	244	46	E	N	244.46000671138672	46	27.5.2		V			447	A part of brackets is left.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 18:07:07Z) - Remove	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 21:50:20Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14255	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.2.2	246	19	E	N	246.19000244140625	19	27.5.3.2.2		A			447	Brackets are not needed in L19 and L20.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 22:12:21Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 22:12:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1266 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14256	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	246	45	E	N	246.44999969482422	45	27.5.3.2.3		V			447	"An AP" should "An HE AP" in this subclause.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-15 23:43:42Z) - The "HE" modifier is not pertinent in most instances here. It is true that only HEAPs will do these things,	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-15 23:58:26Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14257	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	246	54	T	Y	246.53999328061328	54	27.5.3.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0076r3	507	pp245L31 says "If more than one Trigger frame is aggregated in an A-MPDU, all of them shall have the same content." but here says "An AP shall set all	Two suggestion. 1. Add notes which refers pp245 L31. 2. Modify last part as follows: any other Trigger frame that is not carried in the same A-MPDU and	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 07:44:03Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-18/0076r3 under 14257	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-06 18:28:36Z	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14258	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	247	34	E	N	247.33999633789062	34	27.5.3.2.3		A			447	Need space between "2007." and "When a Trigger"	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:07:23Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:07:28Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1267 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14259	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.3	250	24	E	N	250.24000549316406	24	27.5.3.3		V			447	AP cannot transmit HE TB PPDU.	Change "A STA" to "A non-AP HE STA"	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:28:25Z) - This is true but not necessarily pertinent to the requirements. For consistency with other statements that do	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:33:09Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14260	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.4	251	20	E	N	251.19999694 82422	20	27.5.3.4		J			447	"A STA" should be "An HE STA" in this subclause.	As commented.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:33:50Z) - The commenter has not identified a problem with the draft. The HE modifier is not pertinent to the requireme	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2017-12-16 00:35:02Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14261	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.5	253	41	T	Y	253.41000366 210938	41	27.5.3.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1837r3	497	Intended ED-based CCA in this subclause may not be defined in 28.3.19.6.2 but 28.3.19.6.4 as same as pp254L15	Refer 28.3.19.6.4.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 06:20:29Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-17/1837r3 under 14261	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:37:16Z (accepted would have been less cryptic)	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14262	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.5	253	55	E	N	253.55000030517578	55	27.5.3.5		J	Po-Kai Huang		617	The NAV set by an intra-BSS frame is intra-NAV so just simplify by saying "The intra-NAV was set"	As commented.	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:42:20Z) - The condition is written in a general way such that both intra-BSS NAV and basic NAV can be covered by condi	EDITOR	Approved No Change		This points to a technical problem. Essentially, only the basic NAV is "considered" so the text here should simply refer to the basic NAV.	N	EDITOR: 2018-05-21 16:42:26Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14263	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.5	254	9	E	N	254.08999633789062	9	27.5.3.5		J			657	"A STA" should be "An HE STA".	As commented.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14264	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.5	254	15	T	Y	254.14999389648438	15	27.5.3.5		V	Abhishek Patil	11-17/1837r3	497	It says "Energy Detect defined in 28.3.19.6.5", but the terminology "Energy Detect" is not used in 28.3.19.6.5.	Use correct terminology.	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 06:23:24Z) TGax editor to make change in 11-17/1837r3 under 14264	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-05 21:37:52Z - see #14261	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14265	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.3.6	255	13	E	N	255.13000048828125	13	27.5.3.6		A			447	No period in L13 and L17.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:31:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 17:31:32Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1269 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14266	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.5.2	258	62	E	N	258.61999951171875	62	27.5.5.2		A			447	"A STA" should be "An HE STA".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 22:58:19Z) - for consistency with other statements in subclause	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 22:58:35Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14267	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.5.3	260	22	T	Y	260.22000012207031	22	27.5.5.3		J	Chitto Ghosh		657	This subclause is not sufficient and need more definition for associated STA and other frame types than management frame.	As commented.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14268	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.6	260	29	T	Y	260.29000085449219	29	27.5.6		J	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	The short feedbacks mechanism is suitable for collecting information from the STAs like BSS color information the STAs detect in PPDUs from OBSS. This	Define specification of short feedback to collect BSS color information the STAs detect in OBSS PPDUs. By allocating keys (indexes) on each RU and the	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:15:43Z) This seems to require to be able to have multiple RU_TONE_SET per users, which is currently not supported by the	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:46:38Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1270 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14269	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.6	260	29	T	Y	260.29000854 49219	29	27.5.6		J	Laurent Cariou		657	The short feedbacks mechanism is suitable for collecting information from the STAs like PS-Poll information. This comment was submitted during D1.0 c	Define specification of short feedback to collect PS-Poll information.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14270	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.5.6.3.1	262	12	T	Y	262.11999511 71875	12	27.5.6.3.1		V	Laurent Cariou	11-18/0149r3	565	NDP Feedback Report Poll Trigger can be aggregated with other frame?	Clarify if needed.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 08:25:10Z) no reasons to aggregate with other frames. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 149r3.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 03:40:33Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14271	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.6.2	263	33	E	N	263.32998657 22656	33	27.6.2		A		18/0527r2	570	"a STA" and "an HE STA" are mixed in this list. This subclause describe HE sounding so attribute should "an HE STA".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 19:27:04Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1271 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14272	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.6.3	264	59	E	N	264.58999633 78906	59	27.6.3		A			447	No period.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:33:55Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:33:58Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14273	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.6.3	265	56	E	N	265.55999755 859375	56	27.6.3		A			447	No period in L56 and L61.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:45:59Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:46:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14274	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.6.3	266	48	E	N	266.48001098 63281	48	27.6.3		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0312r1	571	Brackets are not needed in L48 and L61.	As commented.	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:02:29Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0312r1 under all headings that include CID 14274.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Technical. The condition is unclear. The channel width can't be "in" VHT Operation Information field. Indicated by the VHT Operating Information field	I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14275	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.8.1	286	55	E	N	286.54998779 296875	55	27.8.1		V			447	OMN is not used in other texts. The abbreviation is not needed.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:22:31Z) - Agree in principle. Only used here, where it is defined. Also remove from acronym list.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-19 00:23:02Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1272 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14276	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	31	E	N	290.30999975585937 5	31	27.9.2.1		V		17/1852r8	474	"an RX START.indication" should be "a PHY-RXSTART.indication".	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:24:00Z) – agree with the commenter. Apply the proposed changes in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2					I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14277	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.1	290	61	E	N	290.60998535156 25	61	27.9.2.1		V		17/1852r8	474	NON_SRG-OBSS_PD-based spatial reuse operation is not written in 27.11.6 (SPATIAL_REUSE).	Delete(see 27.11.6 (SPATIAL_REUSE)).	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:25:26Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2					I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14278	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.1	291	34	T	Y	291.33999633789 06	34	27.9.2.1		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	This rule limits the TXOP obtained by the OBSS_PD mechanism to the duration of the HEMU PPDU to prevent interfering. According to IEEE802.11 2016, st	Add "and the duration of transmitting PPDU shall not exceed the end of the PPDU" after "the TXOP shall be limited to the duration of the PPDU"	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:33:53Z) agree with the commenter. Apply the changes as proposed in doc 1852r41852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2					I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1273 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14279	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	39	T	Y	291.39001464 84375	39	27.9.2.2		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	When a HE STA lowers the transmission power based on OBSS-PD, the transmission may not be heard by another STA in the BSS and it could cause inter-BSS	Define a mechanism to adjust RTS threshold based on modified transmission power or OBSS-PD levels.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:36:08Z) if HE STAs decides to lower its TxPower, it takes such risk and need to take that into account in its algorithm to	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14280	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	41	291	41	T	Y	291.41000366 21094	41	27.9.2.2		V	Laurent Cariou	17/1852r8	474	First sentence describes advantages of adjusting the OBSS_PD level and transmit power from the view of system level. However a STA itself can't be awa	Add description about advantage from the view of the STA like follows; The STA which adjusts the OBSS_PD level and transmit power can ignore transmitt	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:15:07Z) This sentence is removed as part of resolution of comment 11774.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14281	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.2	291	46	E	N	291.45999145 50781	46	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	"OBSS PD" and "OBSS PD" should be unified to "OBSS_PD"	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:27:23Z) - – agree with the comment. Make the changes as proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14282	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.2	292	5	E	N	292.04 998779 296875	5	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	"TX_PWR" should be "TXPWR"	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:28:57Z) - – agree with the comment on the harmonization issue, but propose to do the contrary. Make the changes as prop	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14283	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	9	E	N	293.08 999633 78906	9	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	"OBSS_PD SR Disallowed" should be "Non-SRG OBSS_PD Disallowed"	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:29:45Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14284	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.2	293	55	E	N	293.54 998779 296875	55	27.9.2.2		V		17/1852r8	474	This sentence should be in 27.9.3 SRP-based spatial reuse operation	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:30:09Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2				I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1275 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14285	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	4	T	Y	294.04000854 49219	4	27.9.2.3		J	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	We should consider the case a STA whose queue is empty ignored an inter-BSS PPDU for receiving opportunity. The STA does not intend transmission which	Two suggestion. 1. OBSS_PD SR transmit power restriction period shall be applied to only a STA which starts count down of backoff. 2. Define upper limi	REJECTED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:52:53Z) commenter does not state how the STA would know that it will not cause interference, without this, the proposed ch	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14286	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	16	E	N	294.16000366 21094	16	27.9.2.3		V		17/1852r8	474	It is better for readability to separate this paragraph into 2 by adding line break between n "period." and "If a STA".	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-02-08 17:30:49Z) - agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14287	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.3	294	22	T	Y	294.22000122 07031	22	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	"(including HE Trigger-Based PPDU)" should be "(including an HE TB PPDU, expect when the HE TB PPDU is triggered by a Trigger frame having the CS Requ	As commented.	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 22:56:19Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14288	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.3	295	46	T	Y	295.45999914550781	46	27.9.2.3		V	Matt Fischer	17/1852r8	474	In Figure 27-10, S2 max TXPWR should be equal or lower than the minimum TXPWERmax among all TXPWRmax from ongoing OBSS_PDSR transmit power restrictio	Change "S2 max TXPWR is equal to max" to "S2 max TXPWR is equal to min" in Figure 27-10	REVISED (SR: 2018-01-22 23:13:28Z) agree with the comment. Apply the changes proposed in doc 1852r8.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I		2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14289	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.2.4	295	55	T	Y	295.54998779296875	55	27.9.2.4		J	Matt Fischer		657	The specification needs to define a way for a STA to detect other PPDUs under receiving ongoing PPDU after PHYCCARESET.request is issued before the en	Define a threshold at which a STA's PHY will issue PHY-CCA.indication with a value equal to BUSY upon detection of energy above the threshold during t	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14290	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3	295	60	E	N	295.60000061035156	60	27.9.3		A			648	"trigger frame" should be "Trigger frame" in this subclause	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:38:15Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:38:19Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1277 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14291	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.0	296	24	T	Y	296.23999902343 75	24	27.9.3.0		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	If the STA received a Trigger frame carried in HEMU PPDU with SR_RESTRICTED indication, DSRP_PPDU-based spatial reuse can not initiate?	Clarify. If so add a exception rule into the conditions below.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 12:24:44Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14291	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14292	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	43	E	N	296.42999267578125	43	27.9.3.1		A			648	"A STA" should be "An HE STA"	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:50:03Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:50:07Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14293	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.1	296	45	E	N	296.45001220703125	45	27.9.3.1		A			648	DUR field should be Duration field.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:50:49Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:50:52Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14294	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.1	297	15	E	N	297.14999389 64844	15	27.9.3.1		J			657	Figure name should be DSRP_PPDU-based spatial reuse	As commented.	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change		Passing to SR ad-hoc. Fix terminology.	N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14295	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	37	E	N	297.36999511 71875	37	27.9.3.2		V			648	Equation number is wrong, it may be 27-3.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:55:22Z) - Probably 27-5	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:55:36Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14296	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.2	297	39	E	N	297.39001464 84375	39	27.9.3.2		V			648	"SRP Opportunity Endpoint" should be "SRP Opportunity endpoint"	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:57:28Z) - "SRP oportunity endpoint" (remove capitalization)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:57:47Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14297	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.3	297	48	E	N	297.48001098 63281	48	27.9.3.3		A			648	"value of the Spatial Reuse field value" should be "value of the Spatial Reuse subfield".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:59:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:59:36Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14298	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.3	297	51	E	N	297.51000976 5625	51	27.9.3.3		J			648	Table number is not correct.	Change to "Table 28-20 HE-SIG-A field of an HE TB PPDU"	REJECTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:02:45Z) - Seems consistent	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:02:53Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14299	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.3	298	13	E	N	298.13000488 28125	13	27.9.3.3		A			648	Need space before MHz	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:04:28Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 21:04:31Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14300	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.3.5	298	33	T	Y	298.32998657 22656	33	27.9.3.5		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	SR_PPDU reception and response transmission requirements are sufficient. If the responder holds no SR_PPDU in the queue, the responder will not identi	Define SR_PPDU reception and response transmission requirements to prevent the commented issue.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 13:19:24Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14300	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14301	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.4	298	43	E	N	298.42999267 578125	43	27.9.4		J			657	PPDU should not be SRP_AND_NON_SRG_OBSS_PD_PROHIBITED.	Change "SRP_DISALLOW" to "SRP_DISALLOW or SRP_AND_NONSRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED".	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	Technical		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14302	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.9.4	298	65	E	N	298.64999389 64844	65	27.9.4		A			648	"Inter-BSS PPDU" should be "inter-BSS PPDU"	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:16:02Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-13 20:16:07Z	2.3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14303	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.10.4.1	300	28	E	N	300.27999877 92969	28	27.10.4.1		V			447	Simplify this paragraph by using "otherwise".	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:10:16Z) - Keep the condition in the second sentence (using otherwise would not be clear). Reduce verbage by just referr	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:11:42Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14304	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.10.4.3	303	58	E	N	303.57998657 22656	58	27.10.4.3		A			447	227.4.4 should be 27.4.4	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:45:41Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:45:44Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14305	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.5	306	58	E	N	306.57998657 22656	58	27.11.5		A			447	Need space between "is" and "1"	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:57:07Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 20:57:10Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14306	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	307	32	E	N	307.32000732 421875	32	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0525r1	572	It is unclear if this subclause covers setting of TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_REUSE for all conditions.	As commented.	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:15:01Z) - It appears that the TXVECTOR setting of AP for SRP_AND_NONSRG_OBSS-PD_PROHIBITED" is not specified. TGax Edit	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3		Technical comment	I	EDITOR: 2018-04-10 22:29:27Z	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1281 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14307	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	307	53	E	N	307.52999987792969	53	27.11.6		A			447	"HE ER PPDU" should be "HE ER SU PPDU" in L53 and L57.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:00:36Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:00:40Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14308	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	307	60	T	Y	307.60000610 35156	60	27.11.6		V	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	Need to clarify " other conditions".	As commented.	REVISED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:01:55Z) - TGax editor to make changes as shown in 11-18/0026r10 that are marked with CID 14308	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I		3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14309	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	308	15	E	N	308.14999389 64844	15	27.11.6		A			447	non-AP STA cannot transmit an HE PPDU that contains a Trigger frame	Change "HE STA" to "HE AP"	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:01:46Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:01:50Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14310	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	308	50	T	Y	308.5	50	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	This paragraph defines rules for only non-AP STA, but rules for AP should be defined.	Add the following condition at the end. "if the STA is an HE AP and the SR Disallowed subfield of the SR Control field of the most recently transmitte	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:09:15Z) - the sixth paragraph of the subclause already gives the AP permission to make this setting. There is not and does	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1282 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14311	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	308	50	T	Y	308.5	50	27.11.6		J	Matt Fischer	18/0026r10	641	If non-AP STA has not received a Spatial Reuse Parameter Set element from its associated AP, the non-AP STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter SPATIAL_R	As commented.	REJECTED (SR: 2018-05-10 18:09:49Z) - the default condition is that the STA has a choice on the setting, and is only restricted in its choice if the A	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14312	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.11.6	308	53	E	N	308.52999877792969	53	27.11.6		A			447	"SR Disallowed" should be "SRP Disallowed"	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:09:10Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:09:13Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14313	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.14.1	312	6	E	N	312.05999755859375	6	27.14.1		A			447	No period.	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:13:31Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:13:35Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14314	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	27.14.2	313	43	E	N	313.42999267578125	43	27.14.2		A			447	Need space between "awake." and "If".	As commented.	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:15:18Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-22 21:15:21Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14315	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	28.3.3.9.2	368	21	T	Y	368.20999145 50781	21	28.3.3.9.2		J	Youhan Kim	11-18/0779r3	583	"space-time stream" and "spatial stream" are mixed in subclause 28.3.3.9 and 28.3.3.11.	Same rules shall be applied to conditions in these subclause.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:34:27Z) The cited sections are related to DL and UL MU-MIMO. Note that 11ax does not allow STBC to be used in conjunct i	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14316	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	28.4.4	523	18	T	Y	523.17999267 57812	18	28.4.4		J	Yujin Noh	11-18/0904r2	594	aCCAMidTime is defined as 25us for 11ax devices and it is same value of aCCAMidTime for 11ac devises. 11ax defines many types of OFDM symbol and the n	Ensure detection capability of 11ax device is same as that of 11ac devices even with smaller OFDM symbol.	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-15 12:21:35Z) Since comment or didn't provide the value to be specified in the spec, this comment fails to identify changes in	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-17 17:59:17Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14317	Yusuke Tanaka	230	2	B4.27.1	562	20	T	Y	562.20001220 70312	20	B4.27.1		V	Edward Au	18/0763r1	645	According to the description of Status, SU beamformer capable is optional without any conditions. However SU beamformer is mandatory for AP which sup	Resolve this conflict. One proposed resolution is to add 4SS capability in this table and add condition of 4SS capability in the Status of SU and MU b	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:16:31Z) - Agree in principle that there is a conflict. TGax Editor: Please change the text as indicated in doc.: IEEE	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 17:57:27Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14318	Zhigang Rong	230	2	27.5.3.2.3	247	1	T	Y	247.00999450 683594	1	27.5.3.2.3		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0423r1	556	The statement "HE_LTF_TYPE is 4x LTF for 3.2 ++s or 2x LTF for 1.6 ++s" is not valid. The values of "3.2 ++s" and "1.6 ++s" are for "GI_TYPE".	Change the sentence to the following: "GI and LTF Type is set to 2 if the carrying PPDU TXVECTOR parameters HE_LTF_TYPE and GI_TYPE are either 4x LTF	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 07:17:47Z) Generally agree with the commenter: HE_LTF_ TYPE in TXVECTOR/RXVECTOR has no value of 4x LTF for 3.2 µs. TGax edi	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	EDITOR: 2018-04-09 21:51:11Z - Some editorial changes here. It is better to use enumerated types than integers for the TX/RXVECTOR parameters. This is	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1285 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14319	Zhigang Rong	230	2	27.7.3.1	275	34	E	Y	275.33999633 78906	34	27.7.3.1		A			447	A period "." is missing at the end of the sentence " ... in response to the Trigger frame".	Add a period "." in between "... in response to the Trigger frame" and "STA 1 and STA 2 receive their DL BUs in a subsequent exchange ...". So the te	ACCEPTED (EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:58:47Z)	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.1			I	EDITOR: 2017-12-18 23:58:51Z	2.1	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14320	Zhiyong Huang	230	2	28.3.18.4.4	494	12	T	N	494.11999511 71875	12	28.3.18.4.4		V	Hongyuan Zhang	11-18/0753r0	580	In draft 2.0, 28.3.11.16 Midamble is added to support long packets in fast fading environment, i.e. insert midamble every 10 or 20 OFDM symbol. Howeve	Please evaluate and suggested a reasonable long packets for EVM test, which eventually will guarantee a good throughput in real operation. Maybe wesh	REVISED (PHY: 2018-05-16 01:30:05Z) 11ax editor, please see the discussion for instructions of CID 11897 in doc IEEE 802.11-18/0753r0	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-16 17:21:02Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1286 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14321	Zhou Lan	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	432	32	T	Y	432.32000732421875	32	28.3.10.8.6		V	Ross	11-18/0230r0	467	There is no clear definition of load balancing. Please define it before using it in the text of behavior description. Also there is a seperated sectio	as in the comment	REVISED (PHY: 2018-01-19 00:11:25Z) Please refer to CID 11496 in doc 11-18/0118r6. Same resolution.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-01-29 22:33:53Z - see #11496 and #12639	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14322	Zhou Lan	230	2	28.3.10.8.6	67	17	T	Y	67.16999816894531	17	9.2.4.6.4.5		J	Zhou Lan		657	The Queue size High and Queue Size All in the BSR Control is poorly designed. It doesn't provide sufficient information of UL OFDMA/MIMO scheduling. N	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14323	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.3.1.8	75	54	T	Y	75.540000915 52734	54	9.3.1.8		J	Tomoko Adachi	733r3	637	A transmitter-commanded RX buffer flushing mechanism is needed. It is selective in that the receipient only flushes incomplete MSDUs up to and includi	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:35:39Z) Rejected. To make the receipient flush the imcomplete MSDUs up to the intended sequence number, the originator	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-05-23 23:44:33Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR
14324	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.5.3.6	254	49	T	Y	254.49000549 316406	49	27.5.3.6		J	Abhishek Patil		657	The Queue size High and Queue Size All in the BSR Control is poorly designed. It doesn't provide sufficient information of UL OFDMA/MIMO scheduling. N	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1288 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14325	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.3.1.23.3	95	25	T	Y	95.25	25	9.3.1.23.3		J	George Cherian	724r1	636	A transmitter-commanded RX buffer flushing mechanism is needed for MU-BAR. It is selective in that the receipient only flushes in complete MSDUs up to	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 17:29:21Z) Rejected - This is a new feature that requires significant change to the draft with minimal gains in broad scen	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14326	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.2.2	221	52	T	Y	221.52000427246094	52	27.2.2		J	Po-Kai Huang	726r0	640	TXOP duration-based RTS/CTS is not a well designed mechanism. The threshhold should be in PSDU length rather than the TXOP duration.	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 18:02:45Z) Rejected- The comment fails to identify changes in sufficient detail so that the specific wording of the change	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14327	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.7.1	168	42	T	Y	168.41999816 89453	42	9.7.1		J	Liwen Chu	425r4	602	It is highly possible that multiple MPDU delimiter may be inserted between MPDUs. Usefull information such as color, can be inserted into HE MP DU deli	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-21 23:45:43Z) Rejected. Discussion: Changing MP DU Delimiter may provide some benefit. However the complexity introduced can't	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14328	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.2.5.2	226	30	T	Y	226.30000305 17578	30	27.2.5.2		V	Po-Kai Huang	11-18/0353r1	577	MU-RTS procedure doesn't provide sufficient support for range extension mode operation. A near edge STA after receive MU-RTS frame from AP may not be	as in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-03-13 09:06:53Z) TGax editor to make the changes shown in 11-18/0353r1 under all headings that include CID 14328.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I	see #14328	2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1290 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14329	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.15.2	315	32	T	Y	315.32000732421875	32	27.15.2		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	18/0012r3	569	"If a Control frame is sent as a response to a soliciting HE ER SU PPDU the frame shall be carried in an HE ER SU PPDU except when the most recent suc	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-03-17 22:03:01Z) Rejected – An HE TB PPDU cannot be solicited with an HE ER SU PPDU (please refer to the multiple subclauses tha	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14330	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.5.1.1	242	17	T	Y	242.16999816 89453	17	27.5.1.1		J	Zhou Lan		657	80MHz TX/RX is mandatory for 11ax AP and STA while 160 MHz TX/RX is optional. The spec should allow 80MHz only capable STA to be scheduled on secondary	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1291 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14331	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.8	287	42	T	Y	287.42001342 77344	42	27.8		V	Zhou Lan	522r5	633	The UL MU Disable bit in the OM Control field is a bad design to lower down the whole network performance. Remove this bit and corresponding behavior	as in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:38:19Z) Revised – Also, please refer to this document for the benefits of this bit: https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	EDITOR: 2018-05-24 20:40:08Z	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR
14332	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	60	38	T	Y	60.380001068 115234	38	9.2.4.6.4.3		V	Zhou Lan	522r5	633	The UL MU Disable bit in the OM Control field is a bad design to lower down the whole network performance. Remove this bit and corresponding behavior	as in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:39:29Z) Revised – Also, please refer to this document for the benefits of this bit: https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #14331	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1292 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14333	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.5.3.2	245	53	T	Y	245.52999877929688	53	27.5.3.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	"A non-AP STA shall not send a Trigger frame or a frame with a UMRS Control field." is too restrictive. A non-AP STA should be given the flexiblity of	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14334	Zhou Lan	230	2	10.22.2.5	195	56	T	Y	195.55999755859375	56	10.22.2.5		J	Alfred Asterjadhi		657	per20MHzbitmap is too restrictive. In many case the interference appear as a narrow band signal. Small granularity is more useful for the AP to make c	as in the comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-05-22 14:26:00Z) - Lack of submission or consensus.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14335	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.5.2	243	1	T	Y	243.00999450683594	1	27.5.2		J	Zhou Lan		657	per20MHzbitmap is too restrictive. In many case the interference appear as a narrow band signal. Small granularity is more useful for the AP to make c	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14336	Zhou Lan	230	2	28.3.4	372	36	T	Y	372.35998535156 25	36	28.3.4		J	Tianyu Wu	11-18/0151r1	510	"When the HE modulated fields are located in more than one 20 MHz channel, the pre-HE modulated fields are duplicated over the multiple 20 MHz channel	as in the comment	REJECTED (PHY: 2018-03-12 13:56:01Z) The spec is for interoperability, no need to make recommendations on designs.	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N	EDITOR: 2018-03-15 22:01:39Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1294 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14337	Zhou Lan	230	2	27.6.1	263	8	T	Y	263.07998657 22656	8	27.6.1		V	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0043r0	495	"As with the VHT sounding protocol," doesn't provide much technical vlaue here. Clarify otherwise remove it.	as in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-01-24 04:06:37Z) Duplicate CID of 11508. The proposed resolution is the same as for CID 11508. See CID 11508.	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.2			I	EDITOR: 2018-02-02 16:50:14Z - see #11508	2.2	2018-02-08	EDITOR
14338	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.3.1.20	83	39	T	Y	83.389999389 64844	39	9.3.1.20		J	Alfred Asterjadhi	11-18/0008r2	494	When RA is set to broadcast address, the only way to differentiate the HE trigger based sounding procedure from VHT sounding procedure is the Dis ambig	as in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-01-24 02:45:00Z) It is not clear what error probability the commenter is pointing out. Any frame (including its contents) are subj	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14339	Zhou Lan	230	2	28.3.3.5 20	366	19	T	Y	366.19 000244 140625	19	28.3.3.5 20		V	Zhou Lan	18/0107r3	566	limiting 20MHz only STA on the primary 20MHz may cause the poor network performance. Enable 20MHz only STA on secondary channel.	as in the comment	REVISED (EDITOR: 2018-04-10 14:02:59Z) - Agree in principle. The baseline TWT mechanism defined in 802.11ah already supports a secondary channel oper	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D2.3			I		2.3	2018-04-11	EDITOR
14340	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.3.1.9.7	79	43	T	Y	79.430 000305 17578	43	9.3.1.9.7		J	Tomoko Adachi	18/0890r3	627	"An HEAP that transmits a Multi-STA BlockAck frame with different values of the AID11 subfield in Per AID TID Info subfields sets the RA field to the	as in the comment	REJECTED (MAC: 2018-05-22 05:33:37Z) Rejected. Please see NOTE 1 after the 8th paragraph in this subclause. Different values of the AID11 subfield m	EDITOR	Approved No Change	motion passed		N			2018-05-29	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14341	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.5.4	55	37	T	Y	55.369998931884766	37	9.2.4.5.4		J	George Cherian		657	"When the frame is carried in a DL HE MU PPDU that solicits an HE TB PPDU the addressed recipient returns an Ack, Block Ack, or Multi-STA BlockAck fram	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14342	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	55	60	T	Y	55.599998474121094	60	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	"the non-HE STA sending this frame the frame that contains this subfield. A non-AP HE STA uses the Queue Size subfield to indicate the amount of buffe	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1297 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14343	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.5.6	56	16	T	Y	56.159999847412 11	16	9.2.4.5.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	By adoping the current scaling factor, during the range of 17408 to 148480, the granularity is bigger than 2K bytes, meaning under most of pratcialus	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14344	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	57	T	Y	59.569999694824 22	57	9.2.4.6.4.2		V	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0740r1	639	"NOTE--The A-MPDU contained in the HE TB PPDU carries one immediate acknowledgment, if the preceding PPDU solicits an acknowledgment, and it might add	as in the comment	REVISED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:49:15Z) TGax editor, please make changes as shown in doc 11-18/0740r1	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0			I	EDITOR: 2018-05-18 22:19:22Z - It dopes not make sense to have a note that is simply a reference. Add the reference at the place where it is relavant.	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14345	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	62	T	Y	59.619998931884766	62	9.2.4.6.4.2		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0740r1	639	The setting of HE TB PPDU Length subfield is inconsistent with the length field setting in the trigger frame, which will result in different set of ha	as in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-05-16 02:50:42Z) The current design is due to the limited number of bits available in TRS-Control subfield. TRS-Control subfield s	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14346	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.2	59	46	T	Y	59.459999084472656	46	9.2.4.6.4.2		J	Abhishek Patil		657	If the DL data is sent in ERSU PPDU soliciting TB PPDU for ACK. DCM should be allowed on ACK/BA/M-BA.	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14347	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.2.4.6.4.3	60	38	T	Y	60.380001068115234	38	9.2.4.6.4.3		V	Zhou Lan	522r5	633	Remove UL MU Disable bit. It gives a back door for HE STA not to follow the scheduling instruction from AP and will affect the network performance.	as in the comment	REVISED (MAC: 2018-05-22 06:40:18Z) Revised – Also, please refer to this document for the benefits of this bit: https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/	EDITOR	Approved Edits in D3.0	motion passed		I	see #14331	3	2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1299 of 1300

CID	Commenter	LB	Draft	Clause Number(C)	Page(C)	Line(C)	Type of Comment	Part of No Vote	Page	Line	Clause	Duplicate of CID	Resn Status	Assignee	Submission	Motion Number	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution	Owning Ad-hoc	Comment Group	Ad-hoc Status	Ad-hoc Notes	Edit Status	Edit Notes	Edited in Draft	Last Updated	Last Updated By
14348	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.6	160	1	T	Y	160.00999450683594	1	9.6		J	Zhou Lan		657	80MHz TX/RX is mandatory for 11ax AP and STA while 160 MHz TX/RX is optional. The spec should allow 80MHz only capable STA to be schedule on secondary	as in the comment	Due to lack of submission or consensus	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N			2018-05-25	EDITOR
14349	Zhou Lan	230	2	9.3.1.23	85	22	T	Y	85.22000122070312	22	9.3.1.23		J	Abhishek Patil	11-18/0366r2	538	In the basic trigger there should be option to limit the type of frame that can be contained in the TB PPDU. For example, limiting the response TB PPD	as in the comment	REJECTED (MU: 2018-03-13 06:10:16Z) The Trigger Dependent User Info field of Basic Trigger carries TID Aggregation Limit subfield which already provi	EDITOR	Approved No Change			N	EDITOR: 2018-04-03 18:10:48Z- The resolution contains no editing instructions.		2018-05-25	EDITOR

Wilus Institute, Ex. 2024
IPR2025-01165
Page 1300 of 1300